

## INTRODUCTION

The world has witnessed a technological revolution in Twenty First century. Cultures, countries, and social groups have been bridged and bound together, making world a global village. Identity of values and ethics have brought inter-faith harmony, disturbed only through occasional ripples like the 9/11 or incidents like Christchurch genocide. These ripples do agitate people sitting on the fence but generally the educated class stays unprovoked. Cultures have merged, bringing people together from far and wide, evoking value for freedom and importance of self-realisation and goodness. This novelty in thinking, has seriously endangered the traditional masters turned politicians and the new paradigm fits Balochistan very well, where this wind of change has been a nemesis for the feudal system. The feudals of Balochistan have left no stone unturned to prevent this change in status quo.

The choices are very limited for the people of Balochistan and time fast flying away; should they change like the rest or stick to their centuries old culture of subjugation and exploitation through the so-called tribal lords. Their free thinking and decision-making are being confounded; feudal rally their support for the culture, courting its richness and antiquity, foreign powers with their hostile media exaggerate their deprivations and federal government offers optimism through mega projects like CPEC (China Pakistan Economic Corridor). Feudals and foreign powers share a common agenda of inhibiting change, subverting development and promoting a feeling of despondency. They have been successful in misguiding some youth, which are made to perish in the name of freedom. They tend to present Balochistan as a victim of state's exploitation and wilful denial of political, economic, cultural and social rights to its people. Punjab and Army (called Punjabi Army as if it has only Punjabi's manning it) are portrayed as spearheading this war against the people of Balochistan. Given a choice, even the natural calamities, which the region is highly prone to, would be attributed to some conspiracy by the state. This perception has been built purposely and the deprivations accentuated by the vested interests, keen only in the longevity of their hold and exclusive right on lives of its people. These vested feudal interests have been responsible in misguiding and coercing its people to take up arms against the state, desert cities in favour of mountains, destroy railway lines, uproot electric pylons, attack labourers involved in road construction, kill Chinese workers for their investment and involvement, politicise educational institutions promoting hate and fuelling militancy through student organisations like BSO (Balochistan Student Organisation) and all this to perpetuate the

status quo – a state of anarchy which has existed for over 250 years now. Ironically, state found expediency in supporting the sardars for temporary relief, instead of some long-lasting solution for the good of the downtrodden, pushing the region deeper into quagmire.

A destabilised region and greedy Sardars were a godsend opportunity for the alien countries to further their anti- Pakistan agenda. A pre and post- Taliban Afghanistan, lent all possible support to such powers, whether it was Soviet Union, post-Taliban US, Iran or India, hosting their consulates close to the border, providing safe haven to Baloch dissidents and even abetting terrorism within Pakistan. Geo-strategic importance of Balochistan, owing deep sea Gwadar Port and CPEC has brought Balochistan further into the international limelight, invoking interests and rivalries. The opportunities offered to China, the land locked Central Asian States and most importantly the economic good to the people of Pakistan in general and Balochistan in particular are anathema for these vested local and foreign interests. Unfriendly international efforts have hastened in the wake of CPEC, to impede development through militancy, media onslaught and strangulation of our economy through its monetary organisations.

There can be no quick fixes with the gravity of problems like this. Denial of royalty over its mineral resources, lack of development and centralised state control are some issues which irk a common Baloch. Although, passing of Eighteenth Amendment has alleviated situation a lot, the scars are too deep to heal any time soon. The situation has been compounded at provincial level, owing grumbling feudalism, unprecedented corruption in state institutions, little spent in its huge land mass leading to dilution in space and intermittent periods of insurgency.

Analysis of Balochistan's history, its intermittent insurgencies, and deplorable socio-economic state was needed to fix the cause and find a way forward. Research also revealed that even if the seeds of dissent were home grown, namely Federal government and Sardars, the conditions were accentuated by hostile foreign powers for their geo-strategic reasons. Research helped quell many myths being bandied about by vested internal and external players, regarding wilful exploitation of the province by Federation. With this backdrop, an endeavour was made to suggest macro and micro level reforms hastening the process of development and national integration.

## **Research Problem**

Mired in myths and realities and perpetuated by the local and international players, Balochistan offered an ideal model to unravel the mysteries. This was done studying its history, culture and current political dispensation. While the political situation has improved a lot in last four years, disgruntled Sardars and their pay masters continue to challenge the developments and peace efforts, exaggerating the situation. They use media, international human rights organisations and militancy to stop, impede or reverse this pace of development. The research established that the social deprivation has been created and accentuated mainly by Sardars and foreign elements.

## **Significance of Study**

Various facets of Balochistan's history, politics, social life and economy have been widely studied and researched by the national and international academia, bureaucracy and Non-government Organisations. Unluckily, except for some books on Balochistan's history written by foreign writers, most of the literature is tinted with biases, showing visible tilts of judgement. Our media is flooded with so called scholarly articles and reviews, giving a highly prejudiced picture of the state of affairs in Balochistan. Balochistan is projected as a region, forcibly annexed to Pakistan, subjected to repeated unprovoked military operations to suppress the popular uprisings, socially marginalised and economically exploited by the federation. Most of these sites are hosted by CIA and from servers in India. According to EU Disinfo Lab, a Brussel based NGO, India operates 265 websites from 65 countries to defame Pakistan.<sup>1</sup> Different militant organisations, with head offices abroad have hosted their own web pages, targeting younger generations, and spreading hate, militancy and crime against the state.

A favourable government in Balochistan is more important to Centre than the treatment meted out to masses, unbridled corruption, bad governance and lack of development. It is in this wake that a rebuttal was needed to separate myths from reality, expose the real faces behind this deprivation hype, and suggest measures to overcome this imbroglio. An in-depth analysis was carried out regarding Baloch history specially events leading to creation of Pakistan, the insurgencies, ethnic division of Balochistan and its impact on social conditions. The research exposed elements responsible for perceived and actual deprivation of the province, impact of

---

<sup>1</sup> 'Pro-Indian fake websites targeted decision makers in Europe', BBC News, accessed January 8, 2020, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-50749764>

macro-economic projects like Gwadar Port and CPEC on the local sentiments and social conditions and the foreign hand in accentuating these perceptions. The research would hopefully ascertain the real magnitude of this problem and serve as a basic study for researchers and NGO's to focus on areas hitherto fore left unattended. While the state of Pakistan is equally responsible for the woes of Balochistan, it certainly is not the only factor. Intermittent military governments, democrats with feudalistic mindsets and lacking vision thrust the country into repeated periods of turmoil in which all the provinces suffered equally but interestingly it was only in Balochistan that armed insurgencies were experienced in the wake of each national disorder. This clearly points to the existence of unique dynamics in Balochistan. Each national disorder presented a *casus-belli* to sardars for waging war against the state. Sardars for their personal aggrandizement, presented Balochistan as highly deprived by the federation and how the people were mistreated by the establishment unprovoked. Distrust of the national government by the sardars and people presented an ideal opportunity to vested foreign interests to fuel this fire.

### **Delimitations**

Ancient history of Balochistan, which has little significance on the current socio-political environment, was not touched. Similarly, the research focused on the macro internal issues and foreign hand, causing instability of Balochistan, without going into micro-management. While there is ample circumstantial evidence to prove foreign hand in Balochistan, it was not possible to lay hand on classified hard-core evidence. Therefore, research focused on primary sources of information, Gazetteer of each District of Balochistan written and compiled by British, some authentic books of history written by foreign writers and random articles written by vested interests, though prejudiced at times.

Prevailing security situation did not permit free access to different parts of Balochistan for collection of data, therefore the personal knowledge of once serving in this area, continued acquaintances and electronic communication medium was heavily relied upon. Sectarian violence is on the increase, with targeting of Shia/ Hazara community. This relatively new phenomenon initiated by Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and its off shoots has now been reinforced by ISIS / Daesh. While it proved that master minds are same for both nationalism-based militancy and

sectarian/ ethnic militancy, the research avoided going into genesis of sectarian issue and its implication for socio-cultural landscape of the province.

### **Objectives of Study**

The objectives of the study are given below;

1. To understand the role of federation, sardars and people of Balochistan in the current security, and socio-economic landscape of the province.
2. To determine foreign involvement in the affairs of Balochistan.
3. To analyse policy decisions and steps taken for integration of the Baloch people.

### **Research Questions**

Research would focus answering following key questions;

1. Who to hold responsible for the socio-economic deprivation of the Province?
2. How are foreign actors involved in Balochistan?
3. How can people be better integrated in the mainstream politics of Pakistan and their socio-economic condition improved?

### **Theoretical Framework**

Balochistan has been widely studied and imbroglia explained using different theoretical precepts. Abdul Rauf Iqbal in his article “Social Mobilization Theory and Balochistan Crisis”, states that the “phenomenon of Balochistan has been explained in a variety of ways, ‘Alok Bansal considers the Baloch movement as a result of perceived Punjabi hegemony. Adeel Khan argues that Baloch nationalism results from the struggle for power between the Pakistani state and the Baloch people. Robert G. Wirsing concludes the context of today’s Baloch insurgency in terms of energy resource developments. Frederic Grare relates the uprising to revival of nationalistic sentiments whereas Mir Ghaus Bizenjo attributes the current violent outburst as an outcome of military operations of 1973. Feyyaz defines the insurgency as greed phenomena while Surendra discusses it in terms of opportunity-based motives”.<sup>2</sup>

Abdul Rauf Iqbal, partially disagrees with Surendra for application of Social Mobilization theory to explain the phenomenon of Balochistan. Shanna Dietz Surendra in her article, ‘Explaining Social Mobilization in Pakistan: A Comparative Case Study of Balochistan and Azad Kashmir’

---

<sup>2</sup> Abdul Rauf Iqbal, “ Social Mobilization Theory and Balochistan Crisis”, ISSRA Papers 2009, accessed January 12, 2020, [https://www.ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra\\_pub/articles/issra-paper/ISSRA-Paper-Vol-I-2009/05-BALUCHISTAN-CRISIS.pdf](https://www.ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra_pub/articles/issra-paper/ISSRA-Paper-Vol-I-2009/05-BALUCHISTAN-CRISIS.pdf)

considers that current rebellion in Balochistan can be best explained as an inter play of two main factors, namely, the economic and organisational factors. Economic factor constitutes the financial or material advantage accrued by the rebels, like unquestioned use of Balochistan's minerals, lavish support by the outside powers, availability of free porous border with Afghanistan and safe havens there. In terms of organisational support, insurgency survives because of large inhospitable terrain, close tribal affinities and history of militancy. Balochistan hosts diverse ethnicities and varying cultures, the Pashtuns which form the second largest section of population to totally aligned with the central government and are relatively free in exercising their political choice. Within the Baloch and Brahui belts also, we find distinct cultures and political dynamics. From contextual point of view, Balochistan imbroglio is mainly caused by the three sardars of major three tribes, the Bugtis, Marris and Mengals with some middle-class groups making their own social groups. Believing that all the people of Balochistan have turned against the state is highly exaggerated. It is social mobilisation of few thousand people at best which has had cascading effects, restricting writ of Government and impeding development. In a nutshell, the imbroglio can be better explained through partial application of the Social Mobilization Theory.

### **Literature Review**

The challenge of digging out the facts from embers of history is gigantic, with the authentic sources of information neither available in national archives, nor documented adequately by the researchers and academicians. Moreover, the data available on net is mostly sourced by Indian and CIA websites, seriously questioning its veracity. The research, therefore, was carried out depending on both the primary and secondary sources of information. It will be a deductive study, beginning with myths that we know a lot about and proving or disproving these after a thorough analysis.

Dr Nematullah Gichki, a former bureaucrat in his book, '*Baloch – In search of Identity*' published in 2015, covers the origin of Baloch, various phases of early history up to the ongoing insurgency and unravels the rich traditions of the area. He has broadly divided the history into four parts, ancient Balochistan led by khanates including the khanate of Kalat, advent of British to Balochistan in the Great Game period and signing of Durand Line Agreement, partition of India and various phases of unrest in Balochistan including the current phase. The writer has

linked the various periods of uprisings to bad policies of Federal government, which imposed its writ, contrary to the wishes of people, values and culture of area. In holding Centre and Army responsible for all prevailing ills, the writer has not given enough consideration to fact that rule by few in tribal way is no more acceptable to the society which is always evolving and dynamic. The values so talked about, benefit only the gifted few, offering no justice to have nots. One wonders how one can align to wishes of Haves and Have Nots in this simplistic manner. The book however has uncovered a major part of history which was not narrated before like this, re-producing some important documents and deeds, including the Durand Line Agreement.<sup>3</sup>

Another useful book I found relevant to my thesis has been written by Siddiq Baloch. Siddiq Baloch who has been editor of Balochistan Express and Daily Azad, in his book, '*Balochistan - its Politics and Economics*', published in 2014, has painstakingly highlighted the prevailing issues confronting Balochistan. The book is divided into thirteen parts and gives complete anatomy of its physical infrastructure, politics related to mega projects, administrative pitfalls, law and order situation and role of regional powers. The writer has been very forthright indicating the foreign meddling, faulty policies of the state,<sup>4</sup> mandate of people hijacked by the elected feudals and how a sigh of relief can be given to people of Balochistan.

Maryam Sakeenah in her paper, 'Balochistan crisis and the International Dimension', published online (7 February 2012), has highlighted the strategic importance of Balochistan, which she says evoked international response both positive and negative. While Iran, China and Central Asian countries want to benefit from the Gwadar Port and ensuing communication infrastructure, many ex foes like India, Russia and Afghanistan want to sabotage the project fanning militancy. The writer has quoted conflicting viewpoints and interests, without clearly spelling out an analytical viewpoint and conclusion. Nevertheless, it does lay finger on some foreign interests, providing support to militants and negatively viewing the mega projects in Balochistan.<sup>5</sup>

Rehana Saeed Hashmi, Assistant Professor, Department of Political Science, University of the Punjab, Lahore, has written a very detailed article on, 'Baloch Ethnicity: An analysis of the issue and conflict with state', Published in Journal of Research Society of Pakistan (2015). She has given a detailed account of the Baloch history, culture, various phases of insurgency, causes of

---

<sup>3</sup> Niamatullah Gitchki, *Baloch in Search of Identity* (Washington: Wrigley's, 2015), 289-308.

<sup>4</sup> Siddiq Baloch, *Balochistan its Politics and Economics* (Quetta: Gosha-e-Adeb, 2014), 147-166.

<sup>5</sup> Sakeenah Maryam, "Balochistan crisis and the International Dimension," *Home (2012): accessed December 15, 2018*, <http://maryamsakeenah.blogspot.com/2012/02/normal-0-false-false-false-en-gb-x-none.html>

deprivation of Balochistan and way forward. She has proposed a very interesting threat matrix to national integration, correlating 'Threat, Response and Strategy'. However, writer's assertion is questionable as she holds state of Pakistan responsible for the forceful annexation of Balochistan and as per her, this being the start point for the state of turmoil in the province.

Aurangzeb Alamgir who was a Ph.D. student at the Asia-Europe Institute at the University of Malaya in Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia, had his paper, "Pakistan's Balochistan Problem: An Insurgency Rebirth' published in the World Affairs Institute" (November/ December 2012). This is a highly biased article in which the writer has tried to justify the militancy as a just struggle against the tyranny of the Federal government. He has urged the United States (US) to support secession of Balochistan, saying 'US advocates for an independent Balochistan have yet to receive wide support, but their campaign, which now centres around secession, is receiving more attention among policy makers particularly because of three recent high-profile events: the congressional hearing on Balochistan; the introduction of a Baloch self-determination bill in Congress; and a highly publicized meeting of the Balochistan National Front in Berlin earlier this year'.<sup>6</sup> The article is based on hearsay and is wishful rather than based on tangible facts and figures. Writer has quoted that there are thousands of missing people in Balochistan, an allegation, which has been thoroughly probed and rubbished through independent inquiries. Seeing the contents and approach one cannot but think that these words are somebody else's uttered by the writer.

Pakistan Institute for Peace Studies published a report in 2010 "Conflict and Insecurity in Balochistan: Assessing Strategic Policy Options for Peace and Security", authored by Safdar Sial and Abdul Basit. The paper gives a fairly reasonable understanding of the political, economic and social issues confronting the province. It also gives in detail the initiatives by Federal government to improve the situation, like the 7<sup>th</sup> National Finance Commission (NFC) Award, Aghaz-e-Haqooq Balochistan Package, and the 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional amendment. The study is based on collection of rich data over literacy state, governance, social factors, political parties and their mandates etc. Seeing the current state of affairs, the study presents different possible scenarios which can emerge if things are not handled maturely. This by far was a very good basis for further investigation and research.

---

<sup>6</sup> Aurangzeb Alamgir, "Pakistan's Balochistan Problem: An Insurgency's Rebirth," *World Affairs*, vol 175, Issue 4 (Nov/Dec 2012): 33-38.



“Balochistan Case Study” by Michael Brown, Mohammad Dawod, Arash Irantalab, and Mahmud Naqi and published in CiteSeer (Scientific Literature Digital Library) in June 2012, narrates the causes of insurgency in Balochistan, starting 2006. They attribute the violence in Balochistan to Baloch grievances, militant organisation functioning in the province and cross border smuggling operations. The study has very elaborately listed the major militant organisations functioning in the province giving their aim, objectives and leadership. They have proposed three options for the Canadian policymakers, “encouraging Baloch economic empowerment, encouraging inter-Baloch dialogue by strengthening Baloch moderates, and finally cooperating with the Pakistani state to improve Baloch-federal relations.”<sup>7</sup>

Nasreen Akhtar in her article, ‘Ethnic Politics and Political Process in Pakistan’ published in *Pakistaniat: A Journal of Pakistan Studies* (2013) asserts that democracy provides the best framework under which various ethnic groups have found political space. She has proposed that military rulers have been encouraging politics of ethnicity to draw support against the mainstream political parties. Analysing theoretical framework, she compared the origin of ethnicity by quoting Primordialists who maintain that ethnic values are ingrained in people since birth with Social Constructivists who propose that these values are constructed specially by the powerful elite to draw advantages. She asserts that during the last democratic regime, all ethnic groups became active and their demand for separate units in Pakistan has been accelerated. She feels that Pakistan needs more provinces to bring peace and stability in Pakistan. This idea of more provinces has been researched thoroughly and some practically viable divisions of Balochistan to create more provinces has been suggested in this research.

‘Balochistan, The State Versus the Nation’ by Frederic Grare and published in *Carnegie Endowment for International Peace in South Asia*, April 2013, highlights that Balochistan, the largest but least populous province of Pakistan, is slowly descending into anarchy since 2005. The writer is known to be an expert on South Asia, but has presented a very dismal picture of Balochistan, focussing more on the alleged atrocities by Pakistan military and kind of justifying the brutal acts of terrorism by the foreign funded militant groups. He goes to an extent of suggesting that UN need to send a mission to Pakistan to assess the human right violations by the military. The article is good to understand how vested interests tend to project the issue of Balochistan.

---

<sup>7</sup> Michael Brown et al.,” *Balochistan Case Study*”, INAF 54935(2012). Accessed August 20, 2017.

The history of Balochistan was best explained by Martin Axmann in his book, '*Back to Future*' in which he has dwelt on the Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism from 1915-1955. The author painstakingly searched the Provincial Archives Department of Balochistan, travelled extensively throughout the length and breadth of the province and met people from all walks of life to pen this book. This research was funded by German government and University of Freiburg in author's pursuit for the post graduate scholarship. He has extensively quoted all national leaders and eminent authors in supporting his thesis. His work was of immense use in completing chapter 1, regarding the history of Balochistan and birth of nationalism. The author has however, not touched the foreign meddling in the affairs of Balochistan and how nationalism slogan has been construed to serve the Sardars more than the common man.

Last Khan of Kalat, Mir Ahmad Yar Khan, in his book, '*Baloch, Inside Balochistan : Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam*' (Published 2009) is a wonderful book, in which he has covered the history of Kalat State, his personal efforts in supporting Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah in winning Pakistan and turn of events before and after the division of India, which made it indispensable for him to join the new state of Pakistan willingly without any duress. This autobiography by no less a person than the Khan of Kalat himself, disproves many assertions of nationalists regarding Balochistan. Many of us wrongfully believe that probably Khan of Kalat enjoyed sovereignty over entire Balochistan, before independence and his decisions alone mattered most. Khan himself states that his writ was limited to few areas around Kalat (the Jhalawan Area), with other states joining Pakistan freely and Loya Jirga supporting merger with Pakistan, he had no option to remain separate and sovereign and therefore willingly decided to merge with Pakistan. His change of mind after the merger with Pakistan was a reaction to the political dispensation of Pakistan as a whole, Balochistan in particular and loss of his personal space in the bigger picture of Pakistan.

One other source of knowing the history and socio-political profile of Balochistan was the Gazetteers for each District of Balochistan painstakingly penned down and improved by all succeeding British officers in the Districts. They have covered the traditions, the people, flora, fauna, trade and social profile of each District. This helped unearth how, areas led by strong tribal lords (purely Baloch) are till today bereft of development and how the Pathan dominated areas with no tribal lords, have shown better management, literacy and health profiles. This input

has been of immense use, while completing Chapter 3, covering the political, social, economic profile of different areas of Balochistan.

Gregory D Pipes, a scholar of Naval Postgraduate School Monterey California in year 2010 has very aptly analysed the relationship of Baloch with the Federation and highlighted interests of foreign powers in this region vide his research titled, “The Baloch – Islamabad Tensions: Problems of National Integration”. He has attributed the problems in Balochistan to existing tribal turmoil, drug smuggling, wrong policies of the Pakistan’s federal government and some foreign abetment. While he has downplayed role of India and US, he has openly cited Afghanistan as a safe haven for miscreants in Balochistan.

One of the most relevant books on evolution of ethno-nationalism in Pakistan showing influence of internal and external factors has been written by Tahir Amin, the ‘Ethno-national movements of Pakistan: Domestic and International Factors’. The author has very candidly highlighted the role of state, tribal heads and foreign powers in the perpetuation of instability in Pakistan.

The scholar spent over six years in Balochistan while serving in Pakistan Army, has travelled extensively throughout the length and breadth of the province and interacted with people of different social strata. During this stint of two years, commanded an infantry brigade, responsible for internal security duties, from Kalat to Makran, undertook counter insurgency operations in Kalat and Makran Divisions, monitored construction of Gwadar Port, Coastal Highway and Mirani Dam in Turbat and organised flood relief efforts in year 2006 after the massive floods in Makran Division. Has been a keen student of Baloch history, culture and traditions and authored research paper over the ‘Strategic Management of Balochistan’ while doing MSc in Defence and Strategic Studies at National Defence University in 2007. In this paper, Balochistan has been portrayed as the most fascinating province with loveable people and some macro-political changes have been suggested to make it part of mainstream. Carving out of more provinces from Balochistan to hasten development has been quoted in this paper also.

Study of Constitution of Pakistan, to determine Federation – Provinces share was important to know the veracity in claim that rights of Balochistan were being usurped. Besides, National Finance Commission Awards were studied to see how the share of Balochistan was increased gradually. Genesis of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment was studied in detail as it addressed almost all the demands of nationalists from all provinces and left them with no excuse to hold federation responsible for their failures and mismanagement.

Most of the literature written both by local and international authors have one thing in common that the woes of Balochistan were/are the act of state. They maintain that the State is responsible for the wilful deprivation of Balochistan and insurgency was triggered and evoked by inappropriate political decisions and use of disproportionate force by establishment respectively. This perception has been built by lack of intimate knowledge of the ground situation or as part of well-planned media campaign to fail the state and fuel insurgency. On the contrary this study reveals that while the state is responsible for many wrong political decisions, which have negatively impacted the country since demise of forefathers, it was never intended to alienate the Baloch people in particular or wilfully deprive them in comparison to other provinces. Besides state, the study underlines the hitherto untouched other players, namely, the feudals and foreign powers which are equally if not mainly responsible for the initiation and instigation of the current quagmire respectively.

### **Research Methodology**

Personal experience in Balochistan notwithstanding, a qualitative approach was followed, collecting, collating and analysing maximum material available to prove or disprove the research questions. Research was carried out through an in-depth analysis of the behaviour of the targeted group, namely the people and their tribal masters. It was made possible through direct observation, in-depth interviews, analysis of the oral and written history and participatory observations made possible through a prolonged stay in the area. In view of the media onslaught by vested interests, hiring pseudo intellectuals and self-acclaimed experts on South Asia, it was a challenging task to separate half-truth from truth. It was found that electronic media is largely plagued, and majority of web sites are hosted by India or CIA. According to EU Disinfo Lab, a Brussel based NGO, India operates 265 websites from 65 countries to defame Pakistan.<sup>8</sup> The most popular propaganda themes are forceful annexation of Balochistan by Pakistan Army, wilful exploitation of its people, atrocities by military against peace loving innocent citizens of the province and making people hostage through mega economic projects. It was a painstaking effort to collect actual history from national archives and various books on the subject. The current negative propaganda was answered through study and analysis of contemporary material

---

<sup>8</sup> "Pro-Indian fake websites targeted decision makers in Europe", BBC News, accessed January 8, 2020, <https://www.bbc.com/news/world-asia-india-50749764>

against facts on ground. Unravelling of the foreign hand entailed security risks, but for this maximum reliance was placed on collection of circumstantial evidence through primary and secondary sources of information. Primary sources have been used taking advantage of personal rapport with people from all walks of life in Balochistan, namely, politicians, military, civil bureaucracy, academicians, heads of some militant organisations and men in street. In a nutshell, qualitative approach was followed in order to prove arguments, hence, relevant books, articles of journals, useful websites and newspaper sources have been consulted.

### **Chapter Breakdown**

The study has been divided into following chapters:

1. **Chapter I: History of Balochistan: Accession to Pakistan and the Aftermath.** This chapter covers, the genesis of Baloch nationalism and how the region was divided into different khanates. This chapter highlights if Balochistan was forcibly annexed by Pakistan as contended by maximum writers or was it a popular decision of the people.
2. **Chapter II: Insurgencies in Balochistan and the Role of Feudals.** This chapter shows different insurgencies planned by feudals and their outcomes. The chapter reveals circumstances under which federal government was compelled to use armed forces for national security. This gives genesis of different militant groups, their areas of influence and foreign alliances. The chapter covers the latest insurgency, beginning before the killing of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti to date.
3. **Chapter III: Political, Ethnic and Social Contours of Balochistan.** This chapter highlights the political, demographical divisions of the province district wise. It shows that the devastated areas are mostly in the control of Sardars marked as 'B' area. Miseries are fostered by militancy, economic decay, social deprivation and foreign intervention. The chapter also covers the political dispensation in last one decade and impact of mega projects like Gwadar Port, CPEC and Reko Diq on the socio-economic profile of province.
4. **Chapter IV: Role of Foreign Powers in Balochistan.** This chapter focuses on the role of regional countries and international powers in Balochistan especially in the wake of CPEC. It also unravels their role in perpetrating negative propaganda about Pakistan and their support to militant groups and dissident nationalists. In the absence of real hard evidence, which is difficult

to lay hands on to, maximum reliance was placed on circumstantial evidence and opinion of the local population.

5. **Chapter V: Constitutional and Administrative Reforms.** This chapter explains the administrative division of Province into more units for efficient management and bringing development to the doorstep of people stretched all over, denuding the feudal influence and foreign intervention. It also highlights the genesis and effects of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment in addressing the heretofore deprivation of the people besides economic and social reforms to make it more peaceful, economically independent and strengthen integrity with the state of Pakistan.

### **Conclusion/ Recommendations**

This section concludes the study and it presents way forward to improve governance, socio-economic state of the people and foster national integration of the province. Overall, findings and recommendations are given in this section.

## **CHAPTER – 1**

### **HISTORY OF BALOCHISTAN: ACCESSION TO PAKISTAN AND THE AFTERMATH**

Most of us, quote history selectively to suit a given viewpoint or mindset. We discard history which is averse to our cause or motivation and create history where needed through hearsay and passionate media campaigns. Besides, we judge events and decisions in a given region to the dynamics prevailing in that region alone, without giving due cognizance to the national, regional and global environment prevalent at that time. Balochistan's history has been written both dispassionately and passionately by locals and foreigners respectively. While no account can be considered unbiased totally, a comparative analysis of secondary sources and primary sources of information can help in explaining the near truth. The worst accounts of history and current political situation are noticed on internet, where local and foreign media desperately attempt to propagate anti state mindset. Balochistan Gazetteer and some foreign writers have however painstakingly etched the history with relative authenticity. This chapter shall unravel the history of Balochistan from the advent of British Empire to its accession with Pakistan describing the division of power in different parts of Balochistan, the role of British empire in genesis of Baloch culture, the role of Khans and Sardars in the plight of its people and political process followed in its accession to state of Pakistan. This will help determine root cause of the current imbroglio from its historical perspective and answer myths or reality if Pakistan annexed Balochistan against the wishes of its people as propagated by current Sardars and foreign media or was it and continues to be a popular decision of its people.

#### **1.1 Early History**

The early history of Balochistan is shrouded in mysteries, projecting the greatness of its culture and values. While not much of it is substantiated by ethnic records, it is generally known that Alexander the Great traversed Balochistan around 330 BC. While returning from India, Changez Khan and his successors are known to have invaded Balochistan from 1150-1370 AD specially parts of Makran. The Timurids followed ruling this part of sub-continent from 1370-1506 AD.

Timurids were succeeded by Safavids of Iran or Mughals of India from 1506-1747. Mughals then placed a Governor at Kalat in the sixteenth century<sup>9</sup>.

Because of various invasions, different tribes got settled around few agricultural settlements, many coming from as far away as Central Asia. The Khanate of Kalat was established in 1666, consolidating the few Brahui tribes. The Baloch tribes are known to have originated from South-western Persia, settling down finally in the greener Kacchi plains. This was followed by a series of Battles between the Brahui and Baloch tribes, over the grazing grounds, which belonged to Brahui's until then. Eventually the Brahui Ahmedzai tribe established its rule in 1666 with Ahmad Khan being the first rule of the Khanate<sup>10</sup>.

The loyalties of chiefs of other tribes were won by giving them control of specific territories in return for their loyalty and availability of warriors from these tribes when needed. They paid no revenues to Khan and were autonomous internally and externally. At the request of Khan, however, the sardars were obliged to offer soldiers for the service of Khan. From 1666-1740, the Khanate was a loose confederacy of tribes. Nasir Khan's reign (1750-1794) is remembered as golden period of Khanate as he struck a deal with Ahmed Shah Durrani (Abdali) of Afghanistan and conquered areas of Makran, Las Bela, Kharan including some parts along Indian Ocean. The biggest credit to his reign is enforcement of Sharia in the entire Khanate, in which he prohibited dancing of women on occasions of marriage, forbid use of Bhang, charas and liquor, finished custom of slavery, enforced collective Friday prayers, laid strict punishment for false accusations of adultery, enforced charity and abolished interest on loans<sup>11</sup>. The decline of Khanate of Kalat started with the death of Nasir Khan. His sons and grandsons failed to keep the confederacy united and Sardars who owned most of the fighting force became more and more independent. Combined with the internal conflicts of the state was the Russian expansion to Central Asia which prompted British to intervene.

British were concerned about the advent of Russia into India via Central Asia, Afghanistan and Khyber or Bolan Pass. Besides Russia, British were also concerned of expanding French influence in Iran and possible invasion of Makran from Persia. British Officers were sent to study the area in early part of 19<sup>th</sup> century, and they furnished a detailed report of this area

---

<sup>9</sup> Martin Azmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 18.

<sup>10</sup> Government of India, *Imperial Gazetteer of India, Balochistan District Series, Jhalawan District*. Directorate of Archives, Government of Balochistan (Quetta: Spinzer, 2004), 38.

<sup>11</sup> *Ibid*, 39-41.



covering its culture, threats and opportunities. In order to avoid a two front war, British secured an Anglo-Persian alliance in 1809, through treaty of Tehran and now the only hurdle left for the British was Russia<sup>12</sup>.

Balochistan, a dry barren mountainous area was not attractive to British but held significance because it offered them a transit route to Afghanistan and vice versa for the Russian Czars. Interestingly British were the first to name this area as Balochistan in early nineteenth century despite fact that it was ruled and inhabited by Brahuis and could even be called Brahuistan<sup>13</sup>. It may also be noted that name Balochistan, did not in any way mean that only Baloch/Brahui lived here, many other tribes including Jats lived here. Mir Ahmad Yar Khan, ex Khan of Kalat however, has given a different account, he states that old name of this area was ‘Turan’ and his fore father, Mir Nasir Khan named this area as Balochistan<sup>14</sup>. More research probably is needed to establish this fact.

British interference in Balochistan increased fast prior to First Afghan War (1839-1842), as they wanted to install Shah Shuja an exiled leader as ruler of Afghanistan. For this they needed access rights and logistic support from Khan of Kalat, Mehrab Khan. Combined force of Shah Shuja and British were defeated in First Afghan War and British held Khan of Kalat responsible for his reluctance or inability to support. On way back they invaded Kalat and killed Mehrab Khan for this resistance<sup>15</sup>. His son was appointed the new Khan and a treaty was negotiated between the two parties in 1841. State of Kalat was being treated as a tool for dealing with Afghanistan.

However, after another Treaty with Khan of Kalat in 1854, It was given independent status and treated at par with Afghanistan. ‘The Khan could make peace or war on behalf of the state. He could call out any or all of the tribal levies and use them for war or maintenance of order. He could make treaties binding on the state. As regards internal authority, the Khan had apparently power to a certain extent to make general laws for the whole State. The administration of those laws, however, was not his affair, subject to the reservation that sentence of death required his

---

<sup>12</sup> Martin Azmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 25.

<sup>13</sup> Ibid, 26.

<sup>14</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan *Baloch, Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009), 84.

<sup>15</sup> Naimatullah Gitchki, *Baloch in Search of Identity* (Washington: Wrigley’s, 2015), 69-70.

confirmation. He was the final arbitrator in disputes between chiefs, especially in regard to boundary questions.<sup>16</sup>

In the meantime, British conquered Sindh and Punjab in 1843 and 1846 respectively and needed Khan with his small mercenary force to protect British convoys/ Garrisons from raiding of Bugti and Marri tribes. Khan was legally accountable to British for all such services but at the same time British established independent and direct relationship with the Sardars of Jhalawan and Sarawan to exploit Khan if he ever dared to challenge British writ in this area. To further their hold in Balochistan, British placed Major Robert Sandeman here who introduced reforms to consolidate the hold, secure movement on roads and passes for trade and military, ensure writ without employment of sizeable military force and enhance control over the areas not currently under indirect rule. He introduced three different measures to achieve the above-mentioned objectives; Sardars will be supported financially and facilitated administratively honouring them with different decorations, inter – tribal council of elders or jirga system was instituted for dispute resolutions and collective decision making and introduced concept of local police or levies employing warriors from tribes. They were employed from local tribes and served in their own area and were answerable both to sardars and British rulers / Political Agent. Sandeman reforms ensured a direct relationship of British administration with Sardars, bypassing Khan of Kalat and regardless of the opinion of people. This new paradigm rid sardars of little regard they held for the people and increased their powers to treat their subjects at will. This type of feudal system was not in vogue before these reforms, and this new Sandeman system completely changed the relationship of Sardars with the Khan and the people that they ruled. ‘Sandeman’s policy produced a politically fragmented Balochistan with many centres of power, the Khan just one. British subsidies to Khudadad Khan were increased and provided him with a stable income that he used (unsuccessfully) to strengthen his position within Khanate’.<sup>17</sup> Sandeman reforms prove that the most of what today is claimed as part and parcel of Baloch culture (as claimed by sardars nationalists) were measures introduced by British to maintain writ in the area. As can be seen from the objectives and cardinal points of these reforms, the welfare of local people and development of the area was totally relegated and

---

<sup>16</sup> Martin Azmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2012), 29

<sup>17</sup> *Ibid.*, 33.

ignored. Ironically, all successive Govts of Pakistan continued supporting the Sardars, at the cost of socio-development of its people.

Importance of Quetta was attributed to its proximity to Bolan Pass and Afghanistan. After the Second Afghan War (1878-80) British convinced Khan of Kalat (Khudadad Khan) to cede control of Quetta city to British Administration. This area was then called British Balochistan. 'An Agreement was reached that ceded to the British full civil and criminal jurisdiction and all other powers of administration and entitled them to collect taxes on all trade travelling through the Bolan Pass to and from British India and Afghanistan. In return, a lump sum of Rs 80,000 was to be paid to Khan annually. In 1877, the British administered Balochistan Agency was formed with Quetta as headquarters and with Robert Sandeman serving as Agent to the Governor General (AGG)'.<sup>18</sup> British developed this part of Balochistan very rapidly, developing road, railways, telegraph and one of the largest military garrison and hub of business. Many people moved from Kalat state to get settled in new British Balochistan for economic and social reasons, avoiding tyranny of sardars. As a result of all this the centre of gravity (politically, economically and militarily) passed to Quetta from Kalat, further denuding powers of Khan of Kalat. The new centres of power as a result of British pressure and uprising of sardars can be seen on Map attached as Annex-I.<sup>19</sup>This also shows dates when these areas were created or carved out.

The beginning of 20<sup>th</sup> century was marked by uprising in the rest of India, due to dynamics of the world war and Khilafat Movement, opposing role of British in India and internationally. Balochistan however remained impervious to these changes taking place all over India. British Balochistan was thriving because of newfound political freedom and trade which Khanate and the remaining fiefdoms were least concerned, focusing merely on personal advantages accrued from the British Masters. The real reason British accorded some priority to this area owed its neighbourhood to Russian Czars. Agent to the Governor General (AGG) Dew wrote extensively about the affairs of Balochistan in government of India, Administration report of the Balochistan Agency for the year 1919-1920. He appreciated greatly the indirect rule initiated by Sir Robert Sandeman in which the population was happy for enforcement of law through the levies force, resolution of disputes through the jirgas held by Sardars, and both the sardars and Khan of Kalat were happy to receive monetary concessions from the British empire. For the people of Quetta,

---

<sup>18</sup> Ibid, 34.

<sup>19</sup> Scholz Fred, *Nomadism & Colonialism: A Hundred Years of Balochistan 1872-1972* (Karachi: Oxford University Press, 2002), 103.

he stated that they came from all corners of the province and Indian states and were over awed by the presence of a strong military contingent in Quetta Garrison and were happy in their leisure, carefree life and business. Above all almost absence of print media, fully insulated them from the rest of country and international politics and this was one of the main reasons that they were not influenced by Khilafat movement and general politics of India and political lethargy dominated them. Balochistan Gazette, which was published in English for the information of military personnel was the only newspaper in Balochistan.<sup>20</sup>

While the British were happy with an apolitical Balochistan, the Khanate of Kalat continued to erode due to incompetent rulers, their little freedom of action, rebellious sardars and conspiracies hatched by Sardars and the British. British enjoyed the eras of Khudadad Khan (1857-93), Mahmud Khan II (1893-1931) and Azam Jan Khan (1931-1933). Each one of these rulers had his idiosyncrasies, Khudadad Khan was highly cruel person and while the rulers of other princely states boasted of tigers they had killed, Khudadad Khan confessed to Agent of Governor General that he had killed 3, 500 men and women. He was succeeded by his eldest son, Mahmud Khan, who was too busy enjoying his harem. He would lock himself in his fortress and had a mania for collecting things. He is known to have collected thousands of pairs of shoes, silk for turbans, dozens of horses and motor cars. Azam Khan was too old and worn down by years of dispute with the sardars. British appointed Edward Wakefield as Wazir to look after affairs of the state of Kalat further denuding the sovereignty of the Khan in 1934. The wazir too controlled only one third of the state because the remaining territory was being controlled by tribal chiefs. State was divided into five provinces, namely, Jhalawan, Sarawan, Kharan, Kacchi and Makran. While Kharan was being exclusively ruled by Nawab, the other four provinces led by their own sardars consisted of some territories called Niabats, which were being administered by Khan through his Wazir. All these Sardars resented any interference in their fiefdoms by Khan or his Wazir.<sup>21</sup>

When Ahmad Yar Khan was appointed the Khan of Kalat in 1934, he realised that he was just a ceremonial head while the seat of power rested with British. Moreover, as per Government of India Act of 1935, sub-continent was divided into a federation having provinces, Chief Commissionerships and agency of British Balochistan. Kalat was treated at par with rest of princely states and planned to be merged with India. This completely jolted the Khan

---

<sup>20</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 70-76.

<sup>21</sup> *Ibid*, 79-80.

and torpedoed his ambitions of winning back sovereignty for the state of Kalat following the withdrawal of British from Sub-Continent. As per this act British Balochistan was merged with India and Kalat was classified as an ordinary Indian state. With no adult franchise allowed or practiced in Balochistan, British depended on Shahi Jirga, represented by all tribes for collective decisions making. To give Shahi Jirga a legal constitutional status, British contemplated that Shahi Jirga may be represented in the Central Indian legislature by nominating members to take part in the legislative assembly.

## 1.2 Political Movements in Balochistan

It was in 1939 that All India Muslim League for the first time proposed in Central Legislative Assembly to give Balochistan constitutional status equivalent to other provinces of India. This request was repeated by Muslim League later in 1941. In 1944 it reiterated again and ‘Deputy leader of Muslim league ,Nawab-Zada Liaqat Ali Khan dealt at length with the feudal system of administration that prevailed in the province, the strange method of dispensing justice through jirgas, the ignorance and illiteracy of the population, and the utter absence of even the most elementary form of local self-government. He brought to public attention that British Balochistan was the only Indian province yet without representation in the Federal Legislative Assembly and once again raised the question of Balochistan taking its due place.<sup>22</sup>

Despite these assertions, Muslim League had a very open and liberal view of Balochistan unlike congress. When British decided to grant independence to Sub-Continent in February 1947, it asserted that the paramountcy would lapse, and princely states and tribal regions will become sovereign. Jinnah declared as late as 18 June 1947 that states would be independent and sovereign to choose any course they wished. However, Congress objected vehemently to this proposal and Nehru in his speech to all India States People’s Congress declared that claiming of independence by princely states will be declared an act of war.<sup>23</sup> Viceroy Lord Mountbatten also strongly advised the princely states to join either India or Pakistan based on contiguity of territory.

1940’s saw increased political activity in Balochistan. Kalat State National Party (KSNP) was raised by young sardars as a revolt to colonial system and Sardars, envisioning Khan of Kalat to

---

<sup>22</sup> Ibid, 112.

<sup>23</sup> Chaudhri Muhammad Ali, *The Emergence of Pakistan* (Lahore: Research Society of Pakistan, 1998) 227.

be a completely sovereign ruler. Since it appealed to Khan Ahmad Yar Khan, he encouraged them and gave them high places in his court. However, later when Khan realised that nationalists evoked wrath of Sardars and British, he turned against them and declared the party illegal on 20 July 1939. KSNP drew closer to congress and opposed the creation of Pakistan or Balochistan joining new state of Pakistan. They supported granting Balochistan a provincial status being part of Indian federation.<sup>24</sup>

In Pathan dominated British Balochistan, Anjuman-e-Watan party was created in 1937 by Abdus Samad Khan Achakzai.<sup>25</sup> It catered for Pashtun nationalist sentiments. He supported the Khan of Kalat and was also called Gandhi of Balochistan for his love for Congress. This honour was strongly criticized by many like Sardar Khan Baloch, who said, 'He (Achakzai) named his movement 'Anjuman-e-Watan' but it was a wolf in a sheepskin. Primarily he misguided the people as regards his movement to be purely a local movement designed to serve the country; but true to its salt the movement drifted towards its premeditated and hidden source pernicious branch of the All India Congress which acted behind the scenes like a wire-puller.'<sup>26</sup>

The third political force active in Balochistan was the All India Muslim League which for the first time in 1927 proposed constitutional reforms in Balochistan requesting that British Balochistan and tribal areas of NWFP be accorded provincial status. Qazi Muhammad Issa founded the Balochistan branch of Muslim League in 1939. The movement which started in Quetta by mostly non-local youth picked up momentum fast. First annual session of Balochistan Muslim League was presided over by Nawab Liaqat Ali Khan, who lamented over the backwardness of this area and supported provincial status and social reforms.<sup>27</sup>

It is rarely written in literature that Khan of Kalat, Mir Ahmad Yar Khan Baluch availed services of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah as legal advisor to the state of Kalat in 1936 to help create a sovereign state after the departure of British. They both shared common concerns for the deprived people of India and Balochistan. Khan helped establishment of 'All India Muslim League in Balochistan', funding their meetings and hosting Quaid always on his visit to

---

<sup>24</sup> Mohammad Sardar Khan Baloch, *Baloch: a Nation* (Lahore: M Sanaullah Khan, 1947), 127-132.

<sup>25</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 160.

<sup>26</sup> Mohammad Sardar Khan Baloch, *Baloch a Nation* (Lahore: M Sanaullah Khan, 1947), 132-141.

<sup>27</sup> Syed Abdul Quddus, *The Tribal Balochistan* (Lahore: Ferozesons, 1990), 121.

Balochistan.<sup>28</sup> Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah visited Balochistan in June 1943 and stayed for two months, mobilizing the people for joining Pakistan. He again visited Balochistan in 1945 and stayed for a prolonged time, making people realise that their political and social salvation from exploitative feudal system lied in an independent Pakistan with Balochistan as a province equal to others. He infused new life in the people of Balochistan and they awoke to the cause of creation of a Muslim state<sup>29</sup>. It is ironical that current nationalist leaders miss to mention this glorious period in the history of Balochistan and much record has been tarnished in the archives maintained.

Muslim League gradually emerged as strongest political force in this part of India and people supported its ideology of a separate state for the Muslims of India. This was also evident when it came to electing representative for the Constituent Assembly of India. British delegated this honour to Shahi Jirga to select it which until then was considered the sole political representation of both British Balochistan and the remaining Balochistan. Qazi Isa could have been an obvious choice for Muslim League being President of Balochistan Chapter of Muslim League, but his strong opposition to sardars side-lined him and Muslim League nominated Nawab Jomezai as its nominee against congress and the Anjuman-e-Watan party. Nawab Jomezai won with thundering majority against the congress nominee Abdus Samad Khan Achakzai. In a house of 65, Muslim League secured 40 votes, against 10 of congress<sup>30</sup>. This also proved greatly the ideological alignment of sardars with cause of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah against the self-centric approach of Khan of Kalat and the Congress. This loss of election, greatly demoralized Congress in Balochistan and its ideological struggle. This win of Muslim League candidate in Shahi Jirga elections acted as referendum and subsequently paved way for joining Balochistan with the state of Pakistan with free will of its people.

### 1.3 Demise of the State of Kalat and Road to Accession with Pakistan

Efforts of All India Muslim League bore fruit when on 23<sup>rd</sup> March 1940, the famous Lahore Resolution was passed to carve out a Muslim majority state from the united India comprising

---

<sup>28</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan Baloch, *Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009), 130.

<sup>29</sup> Syed Abdul Quddus, *The Tribal Balochistan* (Lahore: Ferozsons, 1990), 124.

<sup>30</sup> Martin Azmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 171-172.

parts of districts/ provinces having Muslim majority. During the third annual session of Muslim League held at Quetta on July 1943, strong support was garnered for the Lahore Resolution. The session assured Quaid-e-Azam that Muslims of Balochistan are willing to join Pakistan. This set Balochistan on a new path which determined its ultimate destiny.

Critics of Pakistan propagate that Pakistan forcibly annexed the state of Kalat and the remaining parts of Balochistan immediately after withdrawal of British, misguiding people that Balochistan was a sovereign state with full authority over its people before this. They eulogize the Khans of Kalat without wanting to know their character traits, powers they misused and how the people were exploited under the Sandeman culture. It's a fact that Balochistan was never ever one unit under rule of a single ruler, it was a conglomerate of tribes, which was controlled by British through adroit use of 'Carrot and Stick' until its merger with Pakistan. The various milestones of its chequered history from colonization to independence are listed in succeeding paragraphs.

### 1.3.1 First Afghan War

It was in 1838 that British established relations with Khan of Kalat, Mehrab Khan I (1817-1839) for obtaining right of way to Afghanistan and necessary logistic support. Mehrab Khan and British concluded a treaty in 1839, in which sovereign right of Khan was accepted over the entire state of Kalat which included Kacchi, Makran and Las Bela. British agreed not to interfere with Khan and his subjects. However, Khan lacked the writ to guarantee conditions promised to British for their invasion of Afghanistan and defeated British forces on way back attacked Kalat and killed Mehrab Khan<sup>31</sup>. This was followed by a tribal war between the British and local tribal leaders, until son of Khan, Nasir Khan II was installed the ruler.

### 1.3.2 Between the Two Afghan Wars

Two years later, 1841, British changed their position and instructed Nasir Khan II, son of Mehrab Khan to consider him and his subjects the vassals of King of Kabul. He was also forbidden to make any commitments to any other state / ruler without the consent of British. In 1854, Nasir Khan II was made to sign another agreement which completely annulled the one signed in 1841 and now he was to consider friends and foes as per British interests and no

---

<sup>31</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan Baloch, *Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009), 101.



agreement with any outside power was to be made. The Khan in other words was to act in subordination to British government in India.<sup>32</sup>

### 1.3.3 Sandeman Reforms and the Second Afghan War

In 1876 another agreement was signed between Mir Khudadad Khan and Col Robert Groves Sandeman. Now British renewed the bindings on Khan stated in the treaty of 1854. In return British government would help Khan in execution of his authority over his subjects. Col Sandeman became Agent to the Governor General, an appointed he held until his death in 1892 at Las Bela. In second Afghan war in 1878, he controlled the tribes needed to provide logistics support to Kandahar. In 1889 he captured Zhob and opened link of Gomal Pass to Waziristan. He introduced reforms commonly called Sandeman Reforms to strengthen colonial hold in this area. Mir Ahmad Yar Khan, the last Khan of Kalat himself admits that British hold in current province of Balochistan was so complete that they arrested Mir Khudadad Khan in Quetta in 1893 and replaced him with his son Mir Mahmood Khan II. As per him, Sir Robert Sandeman was the real conqueror of Balochistan as after this arrest and change of figure head, Sandeman was the real ruler of Balochistan<sup>33</sup>. He primarily exploited the differences between Khan and his Sardars to weaken both, and serve British interests.

### 1.3.4 First World War and Demise of Khanate

The central authority of Khan declined sharply from 1893 – 1931, during the rule of Mahmud Khan II. British started interfering in the internal affairs of state and started supporting Sardars directly. This seriously undermined the writ of Khan and the status of Kalat was reduced to the status of Indian princely states, de facto if not de jure. According to the census of 1911, the area under Kalat State was 73,278 square miles having a population of 354,095. Khan received circa eight lac rupees as revenue from its leased land and what was paid by the British. In comparison to this, the British administered territory was 46,960 square miles with a population of 414,000. As can be seen, Khan had more area under him but less of population, as people shifted to British Balochistan for better security and trade. Chief Commissioner and Agent to the Governor-

---

<sup>32</sup> Martin Azmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 174.

<sup>33</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan Baloch, *Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009), 108.

General were the heads of civil administration. British had established six districts, namely, Quetta-Pishin, Sibi, Zhob, Loralai, Bolan Pass, and Chagai. Political agent was in charge of each district and he was given all powers for collection of taxes, executive and judiciary. They were all British officers and assisted by British or local Assistant Political Agents. The Political Agent of Bolan Pass was given additional charge of Kalat and Las Bela.<sup>34</sup>

### 1.3.5 Second World War and The Last of Khans

Ahmad Yar Khan (the last Khan) ascended to throne in 1933, and by this time the writ of British through AGG (Agent to Governor General) placed at Quetta extended to whole of present day Balochistan. This was formalized through Government of India Act of 1935, in which Kalat was to be treated at par with the rest of princely states in India<sup>35</sup>. This subjected Kalat to the federal legislature of British India. This was done without the knowledge or consent of Khan. The legal status of Kalat was formally changed. As a result of above all, the writ of Khan had largely diminished, smaller states sprung up and claimed independence from Kalat. Those clearly alienating Khan of Kalat were the Jams of Las Bela, Nawab of Kharan and Gitchkis of Makran. In fact, writ of Khan was reduced to town of Kalat and some areas around it.<sup>36</sup> In fact, it was long before independence, and surely since 1930 that Las Bela and Kharan had separated from Kalat. For this they were rewarded by British with greater favours and came closer to the British. Khan continued to strive for an independent status of Kalat refusing to participate in legislative changes taking place. After the 2<sup>nd</sup> World War, however, it became increasingly obvious that the entire India would be divided into a Hindu and Muslim majority states. Khan remained indecisive which state he would join. He probably aspired to have India divided into multiple sovereign states under a federation. This view was also supported by Abdul Ghaffar Khan of Khudai Khidmatgar Movement and Abdus Samad Achakzai of Anjuman-e-Watan Party.

### 1.3.6 The Two Nation Theory and the Shahi Jirga

The Two Nation Theory propounded by Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, however, finally became most popular. British government prepared two drafts on 3 June 1947, a draft for Stand

---

<sup>34</sup> GlobalSecurity.org. <https://www.globalsecurity.org/military/world/pakistan/baloch-brits.htm>

<sup>35</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 177.

<sup>36</sup> Ibid, 178.

Still Agreement and another for Instrument of Accession. Stand Still Agreement pronounced that the two new states will inherit all the administrative functions carried out by British Empire for states signing the Stand Still Agreement until new arrangements are made mutually. Instrument for Accession on the other hand was willingly handing over complete sovereignty to the two states, by Princely states signing this agreement. India on its part clearly stated that it will only sign Stand Still Agreement with states which also sign the Instrument of Accession, this coercion worked and except for states of Hyderabad, Junagarh and its two subsidiaries (Mangrol and Babariawad) all other 560 states signed both agreements. Kalat signed only the Stand Still Agreement with Pakistan, Junagarh signed both agreements with Pakistan, Hyderabad wanted more time to deliberate over the issue and State of Jammu and Kashmir agreed to sign the Stand Still Agreement with Government of Pakistan but actually did not sign owing conspiracies of Congress and British<sup>37</sup>. Khan's effort to restore independence of Kalat state continued despite deep fissures drawn by the quasi-independent status of Makran, Las Bela and Kharan. However, when it came to deciding the future of British Balochistan, leased areas and tribal areas of Marri and Bugti Tribes, the Agent to Governor General (AGG) Sir Geoffrey Prior was of view that Sandeman System of governance was still effective and Shahi Jirga, constituting Sardars/ Maliks of these areas should be allowed to decide fate of the area. Quaid-e-Azam however never expected anything good from the British sensing their close alliance with Congress and supported a general referendum with maximum participation of the people to make this decision instead of hereditary sardars<sup>38</sup>. As a compromise it was decided to enlarge the Shahi Jirga with 12 members of the Quetta Municipal Committee (QMC)<sup>39</sup>. The referendum was held on 29 June 1947, a day prior. This may have been as part of some British conspiracy to manipulate the decision. Sub nationalists however contend that it was a result of Muslim League effort to have referendum advanced to get favourable votes. Seeing things, in retrospect, little credence can be given to this theory seeing aversion of British to Muslim League. Video recording of the event and other accounts available support that Jirga decided almost unanimously to join these areas with Pakistan. AGG, announced the merger with Pakistan in the same Jirga proceedings. Giving account of the proceedings, Syed Abdul Quddus, in his book 'Tribal Balochistan' states,

---

<sup>37</sup> Stand Still Agreement India, accessed January 25, 2019. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Standstill\\_agreement\\_\(India\)](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Standstill_agreement_(India))

<sup>38</sup> Inayatullah Baloch, *The Emergence of Baloch Nationalism 1931-1947* (Pakistan Progressive: 1980) 8-24.

<sup>39</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 196.

“Against the conspiracy of the British rulers and the Hindu Congress, the patriotic elements and the freedom fighters rose to the occasion and stood like the rock of Gibraltar to destroy the evil designs of the conspirators. It was decided that as soon as the AGG would finish his speech, Nawab Muhammad Khan Jomezai would stand up and declare that all the Sardars had decided to join Pakistan. Thus, when the time came, Nawab Muhammad Jomezai stood up and with great confidence and with power addressed Sir Geoffrey Prior, ‘We have read this statement earlier. We do not want more time to make a final decision in this matter because the members of the Shahi Jirga have decided to support Pakistan and declare solemnly that our representatives will sit in the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan’. Sir Geoffrey Prior, AGG, smiled and said in Urdu, Well, I will send a telegram to the Viceroy informing him that Shahi Jirga’s votes have gone in favour of Pakistan. At this announcement, the town hall of Quetta was the scene of emotional outbursts, thunderous clapping and slogans raised by thousands of people inside and outside the hall. They raised the full-throated slogans of Pakistan Zindabad<sup>40</sup>. So, this clearly explains how the British Balochistan and tribal areas joined Pakistan. It was now to be called the Chief Commissioner’s province and administered through a Chief Commissioner appointed by the Governor General.

### 1.3.7 Stand Still Agreement Signed

Quaid-e-Azam and Mir Ahmad Yar Khan enjoyed friendly relations ever since 1936<sup>41</sup> and Muslim League supported freedom of choice given to all Indian States to join either of the two new countries or stay independent. This freedom of action was not accorded to states likely to join India. As a result of this, a Stand Still agreement was signed on 4 August 1947 between Liaquat Ali Khan and Sir Sultan Ahmad, the legal advisor to State of Kalat. The agreement declared that state of Kalat will be independent on 5 August 1947, enjoying status it had in 1838, The agreement enunciated;

- The Government of Pakistan agrees that Kalat is an independent state, being quite different in status from other states of India and commits to its relationship with the British government as manifested in several agreements.

---

<sup>40</sup> Syed Abdul Quddus, *The Tribal Balochistan* (Lahore: Ferozsons, 1990) 125-127.

<sup>41</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 222.

- Legal opinion will be obtained to find out whether Pakistan government is legally bound by the agreements and treaties that already exist between Kalat and the British government.
- Further talks will be held between the nominees of Pakistan and the Khan-e-Azam of Kalat after obtaining the legal opinion on the above points.
- In the meantime, a Standstill Agreement will be made between Pakistan and Kalat by which Pakistan shall stand committed to all responsibilities and agreements signed by Kalat and British government from 1839 to 1947 and by this Pakistan shall be the legal, constitutional and political successor of the British.
- In order to discuss finally the relations between Kalat and Pakistan on matters of Defence, Foreign Relations and Communications, deliberations will be held in the near future in Karachi<sup>42</sup>.

Analysis of the agreement reveals that the agreement accorded Pakistan the same status as enjoyed by British since 1939 as per article 4. Meaning thereby that legally Khan had handed over Kalat to Pakistan 10 days before the independence of Pakistan.

### 1.3.8 Declaration of Independence and Khan's final Reconciliation

Continuing to claim sovereignty of Kalat, Khan declared independence on 15 August 1947. This was contrary to the spirit of Stand Still Agreement signed and understanding between the two parties and even Quaid-e-Azam was perturbed over it<sup>43</sup>. He established a legislature with an upper and lower house and asserted that all major decisions in future will be taken by the Shura. The new state of Kalat made no mention of the status of Las Bela, Kharan and Makran. Immediately after creation of Pakistan, several political efforts were made to convince Khan for joining Pakistan, but he remained adamant taking refuge behind his self-created Shura. In the meantime, whether as result of political parleys by Pakistan or through conviction, the states of Las Bela, Kharan and Makran declared to join Pakistan. Khan was not only politically isolated but was geographically land locked losing connection to Arabian Sea. Lamenting over the new

---

<sup>42</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan Baloch, *Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009), 148-149.

<sup>43</sup> Iqbal Chawla, "Prelude to the Accession of the Kalat State to Pakistan in 1948: An Appraisal", Published in *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, University of the Punjab Lahore, volume 49, 2012. Accessed on 13 January 2019, [http://www.academia.edu/13372388/Prelude\\_to\\_the\\_Accession\\_of\\_the\\_Kalat\\_State\\_to\\_Pakistan\\_in\\_1948\\_An\\_Appraisal](http://www.academia.edu/13372388/Prelude_to_the_Accession_of_the_Kalat_State_to_Pakistan_in_1948_An_Appraisal)

situation he states in his memoirs, ‘Pakistan cabinet manned by incompetent and inexperienced members, and basing their policy formulations on absurd assumptions, was working on the scheme to break up the 500-year-old State (the Khanate of Kalat). The nature of their program, as it turned out subsequently, was tantamount to a political castration of the Baloch people. For the Cabinet decided to cut off Kharan and Lasbela the two subordinate states of Kalat by giving them an equal status with that of Kalat and obtaining their merger with Pakistan directly. Similarly, Makran which had been a part of Kalat for last 300 years was made independent of Kalat state on 17<sup>th</sup> March 1948, and one of its three Sardars made its ruler. Thus Makran, too became part of Pakistan’<sup>44</sup>. While Las Bela and Kharan acceded quietly to Pakistan, there were some issues with Makran. Turbat at that time was the administrative headquarters of Makran, where the Gitchkis ruled. Nawab Bai Khan Gichki was brother in law of Khan of Kalat and he acceded to Pakistan against the wishes of Khan. The rule of Makran was shared between Gitchkis and sardars of Panjgur and Tump. While the Gitchkis agreed to join Pakistan, younger brother of Khan of Kalat, Abdul Karim, who was administrative head of Makran, as appointed by Khan did not agree to the accession of Kalat with the state of Pakistan. He later headed an insurgency campaign which shall be covered in subsequent chapter. Finally, without much choice left, Khan decided to voluntarily merge the state with Pakistan on 30<sup>th</sup> March 1948. Explaining the rationale behind this decision, Khan states, ‘there was no time to think or deliberate. The very existence of Pakistan was at stake. I realised that I must act now and act quick. Therefore, without obtaining the formal sanction from the tribal sardars, I signed the merger documents in my capacity as the Khan –e-Azam on 30<sup>th</sup> March 1948’<sup>45</sup>. Khan suspected that frustrated British bureaucracy could create problems for the nascent state of Pakistan while repatriating. He believed that British could fuel a war against Pakistan from both west and east, by Russia through Afghanistan and India with its huge Army respectively.

### 1.3.9 From Baloch State Union to Province of Balochistan

The four new states of Kalat, Makran, Las Bela and Kharan (See Annex- II) were highly under populated as can be seen on the graph attached as Annex III. These states were too backward and above all showed reluctance to accept any constitutional and social reforms initiated by the

---

<sup>44</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan *Baloch, Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009)158-159.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid*, 162.

Federal government / cabinet from Karachi. Finally, in 1951, AGG, Mian Aminuddin proposed to Federal government, merger of the four states into Balochistan States Union (BSU) to apply common rules to all and pension off the rulers. This appeared to be the only way out for implementation of constitutional and social reforms in the region (page 260). And this formula had been successfully tried out in India also. The ultimate aim was to merge the four states with the province of Balochistan, which constituted Quetta and other surrounding areas (Mostly Pashtun dominated). 'In March 1952, the Government of Pakistan announced merging the four states of Kalat, Makran, Kharan and Las Bela into a Union of states called, Balochistan States Union. All the four states immediately fell in with the idea. Less than a month after the first public proposal, the Balochistan States Union Covenant was signed on 11 April, 1952 by Mir Ahmad Yar Khan on behalf of Kalat, by Mir Baloch Khan Naoshervani (representing his father Nawab Muhamad Habibullah Khan) on behalf of Kharan, by Nawab Bai Khan Gichki on behalf of Makran, by Mir Ghulam Qadir Khan on behalf of Las Bela, and by Col Abdur Rahim of the Ministry of States and Frontier Regions on behalf of Government of Pakistan. The four rulers accepted the integration of their territories into a single state union with a common executive, judiciary, and legislature. Four supplementary instruments of accession were also signed, whereby the rulers acceded this federated unit to Pakistan'<sup>46</sup>. This again clearly disproves the myth that Pakistan forced accession through use of military muscle. Khan of Kalat was declared the ceremonial President of the Council of Rulers, which under no circumstances meant that the unified State of Kalat was gifted to him by Pakistan. In return for accession, the rulers of these states were partially pensioned off, with fixed income going to them. Khan of Kalat was to receive an annual allowance of Rs 4,25,000/-, Rs 200,000/- for Nawab Bai Khan Gichki, Rs 1.70,000/- for Mir Ghulam Qadir Khan of Las Bela, and Rs 61, 000/- for Nawab Muhammad Habibullah Khan of Kharan <sup>47</sup>. The ex-rulers clearly understood that these were the most underdeveloped areas of Pakistan but their mutual differences and failure to look beyond their personal interest, prevented any real reforms introduced here. Maintenance of law and order was more important to the central government and social reforms therefore were sacrificed for the former. This phenomenon has been repeated over and over again until a decade before by both the Central and Provincial Govts. Seeing the failure of BSU to bring any positive change, many

---

<sup>46</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 261.

<sup>47</sup> Ibid, 262.

Sardars of Balochistan, demanded dissolution of BSU and its merger into the Chief Commissioner's province of Balochistan. This was also owing to fact that development in the Chief Commissioners province was much better and people were better off in terms of social and legal care. So finally, the government annulled BSU and accorded special status to these states in June 1954, something in between BSU and the final merger with the Chief Commissioner's province. The constitutional efforts to merge these states formally with Pakistan and Chief Commissioner's province continued besides other developments taking place at the Federal level, like the coup by Ghulam Muhammad on 24 October 1954. In 1955 he finally succeeded in convincing the ex-rulers of these states in signing another instrument of accession for additional personal benefits. ' His Highness the Khan –e-Azam hereby cedes to the government of the dominion of Pakistan his sovereignty and all his rights, authority and powers as President of the Council of Rulers of the Union, together with all his territories, including territories known as the leased areas, and , having been duly authorized to that end by the members of the Council of Rulers, that is to say the Rulers of Makran, Las Bela and Kharan, their sovereignty and all their rights, authority and powers as such rulers together with all their territories. The government of the Dominion shall exercise all powers, authority and jurisdiction for the governance of the said Union and territories in such manner and through such agency as it may think fit.<sup>48</sup> This final act abrogated all previous agreements and the rulers were finally pensioned off, with Khan of Kalat getting RS 6,50,000/- per annum, the wali of Makran Rs. 225,000, Jam of Las Bela RS.200,000, Nawab of Kharan Rs 70,000.<sup>49</sup>

The research proved that the people of Balochistan comprise different nomadic tribes like Brahuis, Baloch, Pakhtuns and others which came and settled in different parts establishing localized governments. The most eminent of these was the Khanate of Kalat established since 1666. This Khanate of Kalat saw its zenith in late seventeenth Century but began to decline with the advent of British to this area before the First Afghan War in 1834. British assumed power and writ of the area through adroit management of its erstwhile rulers. For ease of administration and in order to consolidate hold, Robert Sandeman serving as Agent to the Governor General (AGG) introduced reforms, popularly called Sandeman reforms which over time changed the

---

<sup>48</sup> Ibid, 266.

<sup>49</sup> Ibid, 267.



entire culture of Balochistan and many nationalists ironically own these as if these were part and parcel of centuries old Baloch Culture. Mainly these reforms constituted financial benefits to all power holders or sardars for winning their loyalties, Jirga system for dispute arbitration and executive force in the form of Levies to ensure writ of Sardar and British Empire. This British – Sardars collusion came at the cost of freedom of expression by the poor masses and their unexplainable social standing. Balochistan's lack of literacy, political freedom and poverty owes a lot to these reforms and their continuity to this day. British Balochistan, governed by British was much better developed compared to areas totally under the Khanate of Kalat and other tribal heads. The people here were more literate and well off socially. This comparative affluence encouraged people from the interior to come and settle here. In the absence of any adult franchise, Shahi Jirga was considered sole representative of the people and all political decisions especially merger of the British Balochistan with Pakistan was unanimously taken by it.

When the political activity started in Balochistan after the 2<sup>nd</sup> World War, All India Muslim League emerged as a prominent party in competition with Congress, KSNP and Anjuman-e-Watan party. Many Sardars including the Khan of Kalat were ideologically closer to Muslim League and respected the person of Quaid-e-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah. The states of Las Bela, Kharan and Makran acceded to Pakistan willingly without any political or military coercion. State of Kalat followed suit after few days totally willingly and voluntarily.

The above facts clearly dispel myths about forceful accession of Balochistan perpetrated by vested interest groups. All states including the state of Kalat willingly joined Pakistan and their rulers were compensated by paying them handsome amount as pension by the state of Pakistan. Many future insurgencies were fuelled based on this myth of Balochistan being forcibly annexed by the state of Pakistan as shall be discussed and analysed in the next chapter.

## CHAPTER – 2

### INSURGENCIES IN BALOCHISTAN AND THE ROLE OF FEUDALS

Ever since independence, Balochistan has been gripped with localised or general insurgencies. This transition from tribal to settled culture, following the independence of Pakistan and specially Balochistan was highly turbulent. Volatile Sardars supported by hostile foreign media misconstrued history to make it a case of forceful occupation of province by Pakistan instead of a popular free-will decision of their leaders to form part of Pakistan. Lawlessness in Balochistan was accentuated by the lacklustre, disproportionate or knee jerk response of the federal and provincial law enforcement agencies with myopic objectives. Political leadership of the province, having feudal background, remained bystander in this stage-managed dispute of the province with federation. They received unaccounted monetary benefits and appeasement from the Federation and foreign masters, cried wolf when they were with people lambasting the Central government and aligned with militants ideologically for political and personal aggrandizement. People were the biggest sufferers in this grand game, losing direction, free will and social protection. Vested foreign interests took full advantage of these fissures to further their national agendas. Foreign hand has been a common denominator in every insurgency in Balochistan. This chapter would cover the root causes of different insurgencies, role of Sardars and foreign masters and why federal government was compelled to use armed forces for national security. It will also unravel the genesis of different militant groups, their areas of influence, ideological alliance with sub nationalist political parties and foreign sponsorship.

#### 2.1 **First Insurgency (1948)**

When Khan of Kalat signed accession treaty with Pakistan in March 1948, his younger brother, Agha Abdul Karim Khan, resented this decision. He was at that time Hakim-e-Ala or Khan's naib in Makran, entitled to collect 50% of revenue with rest going to other tribal heads.<sup>50</sup> Mobilising few loyal tribesmen and politicians like, Muhammad Hussain Anqa, Malik Saeed Dehwar, Qadir Bakhsh Nizamani and Maulvi Muhammad Afzal he revolted against new state. He called this force, 'Baloch Mujahedeen'. The resistance movement was restricted to Jhalawan area. Armed Forces were immediately sent to Kalat. He along with his 130 followers escaped to

---

<sup>50</sup> Ibid, 242.

Afghanistan in May 1948. On promise of safe conduct, he returned to Pakistan in July 1948 but was arrested along with his followers, tried by court and sentenced to 10 years imprisonment. He was released from jail in 1955.<sup>51</sup>

This was the first armed resistance initiated by a sardar to preserve the status quo and given name of Baloch nationalist struggle. As is obvious it was limited to Kalat and launched to restore the Feudalistic Status of Khanites. It lacked any support outside Jhalawan (Present day Kalat and Khuzdar Division) and even limited support from the other Sardars of Jhalawan. Even Ahmad Yar Khan, while addressing notables in Kalat in September 1949 justified his accession to Pakistan and distanced himself from the actions of his brother.<sup>52</sup> Khan totally disowned his actions and maintained that he was misguided by people and suffered for not following his advice.

## 2.2 Second Insurgency (1958 – 1960)

In 1954, the One Unit Scheme was introduced by then Prime Minister, Muhammad Ali Bogra, ostensibly to control administrative expenditures, end provincial prejudices and promote harmony amongst all provinces and ethnicities but the real purpose was to counter the political and population advantage of East Bengal, later to be called East Pakistan.<sup>53</sup> Under this scheme, Balochistan, Sindh, NWFP and Punjab were integrated into one unit.

One Unit also brought about separation of Quetta Division from Kalat Division which annoyed the Khan of Kalat, who was now repenting his earlier decision to merge with Pakistan and was vying to restore the state to its former position. The sardars of ex Kalat State, whether on insistence of Khan of Kalat or at their own, which is difficult to determine now, appealed to Khan to do away with One Unit, restore the tribal rights of Sardars and accord Kalat specially the same status as the Tribal Frontier Region making it akin to what it was before independence of Pakistan. A meeting of these Sardars was arranged by Khan with General Sikandar Mirza on 8<sup>th</sup> October 1957. The meeting went well but General Sikandar Mirza demanded list of ancient customs and traditions which they thought were indispensable for Balochistan, he also demanded proof that it was also desired by the majority of the people of Balochistan and asked Khan to

---

<sup>51</sup> Ibid, 234.

<sup>52</sup> Ibid, 236.

<sup>53</sup> Naimatullah Gichki, *Baloch: In Search of Identity* (Washington: Wrigley's, 2015), 238.

seek legal opinion on its reversal of previous decision to restore state of Kalat.<sup>54</sup> This prima facie were very genuine things to ask for before bringing any special reforms.

The general political situation in the country had deteriorated a lot by October 1958, with Sikandar Mirza politically isolated and desperately trying to stabilise the situation through purchase of loyalties or threat of martial law. In Balochistan, failure to get a concrete response from Federal government and to take advantage of this state of general anarchy, Mir Ahmad Yar Khan on insistence of some people decided to secede from Pakistan. He hoisted his ancestral flag on the palace of Kalat and appealed to people to raise arms. Some even say that Sikandar Mirza, President of Pakistan also encouraged and tricked Khan, in fact to find a reason for imposing Martial law<sup>55</sup>. This was immediately quelled through military intervention in October 1958 and Khan was arrested and dispatched to Lahore. His privy purse of 600, 000/- a year was stopped, and his eldest son Prince Dawood Jan was appointed as Khan.<sup>56</sup> Martial Law was imposed in the entire country on 7<sup>th</sup> October 1958.

Nowroz Khan the head of Zarakzai Tribe and Nawab of Jhalawan was a close confidant of Khan of Kalat. He started an armed struggle, demanding (1) withdrawal of one-unit plan (2) Release of Khan of Kalat and amnesty for his men (3) Exemption of his area from the land reforms (4) Return of all arms and ammunition confiscated by military. In 1960, after a military campaign, Nowroz Khan was arrested, and many of his supporters were killed and hanged for treason. Nowroz Khan died four years later in Kohlu prison.

This movement again was limited to Jhalawan and launched to restore the tribal rights of Sardars and Khanate of Kalat. Another purpose was to resist the land reforms initiated in entire country to limit land holdings. While it was fully implemented in Punjab and NWFP, the move was resisted strongly in Balochistan. With knowledge of hindsight one can assume that One Unit was not the immediate cause of this insurgency but an effort to maintain status quo in Balochistan, ensuring writ of Feudals instead of Federation.

---

<sup>54</sup> Mir Ahmad Yar Khan Baloch, *Inside Balochistan: Political Autobiography of Khan-e-Azam* (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 2009), 167- 174.

<sup>55</sup> Naimatullah Gichki, *Baloch: In Search of Identity* (Washington: Wrigley's, 2015), 243.

<sup>56</sup> *Ibid*, 243.

### 2.3 Third Insurgency (1962 – 1969)

Field Martial Ayub Khan assumed power and imposed Martial Law, in 1958. He introduced presidential form of government and programme of Basic Democracies. He won the elections in 1962 and according to basic democracies programme many Baloch Sardars were elected. Sardar Khair Bakhsh Murri, Attaullah Mengal and Ahmad Nawaz Bugti became the Members of Parliament. They were nationalist leaders, and some say that Ayub Khan was threatened by their ability to wield power, he therefore replaced them with other handpicked people. This aspect probably needs more research as Ayub Khan was both the President and Chief of Army Staff and wielded absolute powers. This infuriated them and their followers and another insurgency was initiated. This movement was popularly called “Parari” (a Balochi word used to illustrate a person or persons whose afflictions cannot be addressed through negotiations)<sup>57</sup>. Insurgents established base camps from Jhalawan in the south (Mengal Tribe) to Marri and Bugti areas in the north. Military convoys were attacked, railway lines blown, and government installations attacked. The insurgency was headed by Sher Muhammad Marri, a front man of Khair Baksh Marri and he was supported by Mengals in Jhalawan. Another important development of this period was the establishment of Balochistan Student Organization (BSO) which later proved to be the nursery for little understood Baloch Nationalism and perpetuation of armed struggles.<sup>58</sup>

As a reaction to this armed resistance, a strong need was felt for established of new cantonments in the interior of Balochistan, besides requirement of Internal Security, it also addressed the need to disperse formations during peace time. This was again resisted vehemently as it was most serious threat to Feudal tendencies and its tool in the form of armed resistance to this day. This insurgency ended in 1969, when Gen Yahya took over the power. He announced general amnesty for the Baloch leaders and abolished One–Unit. As a result of this dissolution, Balochistan emerged as a province in its present shape in 1970. General Yahya’s martial law was short lived and he conducted general elections in 1970s. National Awami Party (NAP) won the elections and Attaullah Mengal became the Chief Minister of Balochistan with Ghaus Bakhsh Bizenjo as the Governor.

One realises that the main reason for this insurgency was deposed leadership of Sardars and a revolt against the military cantonments in Baloch majority areas. This act was considered a threat

---

<sup>57</sup> Rehana Saeed Hashmi, “Baloch Ethnicity: An Analysis of the Issue and Conflict with State,” *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 52, (January-June 2015), 14.

<sup>58</sup> Dr Naimatullah Gichki, *Baloch: In Search of Identity* (Washington: Wrigley’s, 2015), 246.

to the status quo, challenging absolute powers of Sardars in these areas. Seeing things in retrospect, one cannot but appreciate the logic of this action; besides addressing internal security issues, these cantonments have served as an oasis, benefiting local population in health, education, social reforms and through provision of immediate response in tens of major natural calamities that have struck Balochistan from time to time. Moreover, if the insurgency was launched to maintain traditional sardars, one wonders if it was a fight for nationalism or survival of feudalism. This misnomer of calling insurgency by few as nationalist struggle can be understood by the latest definition, ‘A nation is a collection of people who, on the basis of ethnic, linguistic, or cultural commonality, so construct their reality as to primarily perceive themselves to be members of the same group, which defines their identity. Thus, the term nation state implies a convergence between territorial states and the psychological identification of people within them. However, in employing this familiar terminology, we should exercise caution because this condition is relatively rare; there are few independent states comprising a single nationality. Most states today are populated by many nations, and some nations are not states. These “nonstate nations” are ethnic groups—such as Native Americans in the United States, Sikhs in India, Basques in Spain, or Kurds in Iraq, Turkey, Iran, and Syria—composed of people without sovereign power over the territory in which they live.’<sup>59</sup> Balochistan constitutes multiple ethnic groups which generally are called Baloch besides a sizeable minority of Pashtuns (some claim over 35%). Even within Baloch majority areas, majority are peaceful tribes. It is a misnomer to call insurgency a nationalist struggle because of its recurrence within a defined area and in a particular ethnic group. Since it is initiated and propagated by selected sardars for self-serving interests, it is not even remotely associated to a nationalist struggle.

#### 2.4 **Fourth Insurgency (1973-1977)**

General Elections were held in 1970, in which Awami League of East Pakistan won overwhelmingly, securing 160 seats in a house of 300 seats. Denial of power to Awami League led to civil war fully triggered and supported by India. This was followed by invasion of East Pakistan by Indian Forces, fall of Dacca and emergence of Bangladesh. Success of hostile forces in dismembering Pakistan, fuelled nationalism in both NWFP and Balochistan where NAP ruled.

---

<sup>59</sup> Charles William Kelgley and Shannon Lindsey Blaton, *World Politics: Trends and Transformation* (Boston: Suzane Jeans, 2011), 17

East Pakistan model of ethnic cleansing and armed struggle appeared to be a successful model to draw greater concessions from the federation or threaten to secede with the help of outside powers.

NAP government started asking for greater rights and started ethnic cleansing of settlers in Balochistan, replacing the non-Baloch bureaucracy with Baloch officers. As per ‘Repatriation Scheme’, NAP government decided to rid Balochistan of all non-Balochi officers in an effort to indigenise the province and it was planned to repatriate about 5,500 officers by the year end.<sup>60</sup> Alongside other factors, this evoked, Federal Govt’s finally dismissing the provincial government. Chief Minister Attaullah Mengal began to displace the Balochistan reserve police, just because of the non-Baloch officers with the new police structure by the name “The Balochistan Dehi Mohafiz (BDM). He also armed his followers in Mengal tribe and ordered them to attack Jam of Lasbela in District Lasbela. House of Jam of Lasbela and others were looted, Jam Muhammad Yousaf the son of Jam Ghulam Qadir Khan was abducted and taken to Mashkey by the so-called BDM.<sup>61</sup> In the new system they preferred to recruit people loyal to NAP.<sup>62</sup> Marri armed fighters attacked and killed Punjabi settlers in Pat Feeder canal area of District Kalachi. All non-Baloch teachers were expelled from the province on a single day notice by CM Attaullah Mengal, creating a big void in quality education filled with BSO and poor-quality teachers. At the same time in 1973, large cache of weapons had been discovered in the Iraqi embassy in Islamabad, en route to Balochistan to arm Baloch nationalist militias.

#### 2.4.1 Dismissal of Baloch Provincial Government

Some incidents leading to final dismissal of Baloch provincial government, banning of NAP<sup>63</sup> and start of military campaign against the insurgents are as under:-

- In the general elections of 1970, the PPP, while winning a majority in Sindh and Punjab, did not win a single National Assembly seat from Balochistan. Bhutto therefore had to contend with a NAP-JUI alliance in both Balochistan and NWFP. After the provincial

---

<sup>60</sup> Farhan Hanif Siddiqi, *The Politics of Ethnicity in Balochistan: The Baloch, Sindhi and Mohajir Ethnic Movements* (New York: Routledge, 2012), P 66-67.

<sup>61</sup> Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal. Interview was conducted in Khuzdar, September 3, 2018.

<sup>62</sup> Rehana Saeed Hashmi, “Baloch Ethnicity: An Analysis of the Issue and Conflict with State,” *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan*, 52, (January-June 2015), 71.

<sup>63</sup> *Ibid*, 71.

elections, Attaullah Mengal was appointed Chief Minister, while Ghaus Bakhsh Bizenjo was appointed the Governor.

- Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti was aligned with Bhutto and politically and ideologically opposed to the NAP government. Some say he was also instrumental in initiating the sacking of the provincial government.
- A large number of the local police, bureaucracy and intelligentsia was dominated by Punjabis, and CM Attaullah Mengal embarked on an active plan to rid Balochistan of these alien people. This at one point of time created extreme vacuum in the educational institutions when all Punjabis were ordered to leave the province, a serious setback to education - occupied by highly politicised and inefficient teachers and BSO.
- Another contentious point between the province and the centre was establishment of rural police called the Dehi Mohafiz. In the new system they preferred to recruit those loyal to NAP. This was being justified to fill the vacuum left by the abolishment of the Civil Armed Force by the federal government and in part due to the perceived non-cooperation of the police which was under the Interior ministry headed by Abdul Qayyum Khan, a lifelong enemy of the NAP and Wali Khan.
- Bhutto government was closely aligned with the Shah of Iran and the Shah was deeply suspicious of support to Iranian Baloch people by the nationalist government in Balochistan. Iraq, allied with the USSR, had a history of supporting Baloch separatism in Iran in response to Iran's support of Kurd separatists in Iraq.
- The Pakistani Army, fresh from its defeat in East Pakistan, was deeply suspicious of the Baloch nationalists and moves like the establishment of the provincial rural police only added to this suspicion.
- In September 1972, the central government actually accused the NAP leaders of what was called the "London Conspiracy" with Mujibur Rehman – allegedly they had plotted to divide Pakistan into four states.
- Provincial issues of local law and order faced by the NAP government were exacerbated by the central government, condemning Provincial government for its inefficiency.
- In 1973, large cache of weapons had been discovered in the Iraqi embassy in Islamabad, en route to Balochistan to be used to arm Baloch nationalist militias. For PM Z.A. Bhutto this acted as last straw, and Provincial government was dismissed in Feb 1973. This armed



support to nationalists was being done by Soviet Union to destabilise the region and seek access to Warm Waters through Afghanistan.

- This also became the basis of the infamous Hyderabad tribunal from 1975- 1979, which led to the banning of the National Awami Party in 1975.<sup>64</sup>
- Baloch guerrillas started their activities after the ouster of the provincial government. The Murri tribesmen and Baloch students under the leadership of Khair Bakhsh Murri formed the Balochistan People's Liberation Front (BPLF) and inflicted heavy casualties to the LEAs.
- With this backdrop, the central government arrested Sardar Attaullah Mengal, Khair Bakhsh Murri, and Ghaus Bakhsh Bizenjo, charging them for treason and for their supporting the struggle against Pakistan Army. Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti played a significant role in making accusations against the NAP politicians, claiming, that Mengal and Wali Khan had shared with him their "free Balochistan" plan in early 1973.<sup>65</sup>

According to some, military response to this insurgency was harsh and unprecedented. Even Akbar Bugti, who was made governor of Balochistan following Bizenjo's dismissal, resigned in 1974 as a result of his disagreement with the centre on the military operation in Balochistan. The Baloch revolt came to an end in 1977, When Z.A Bhutto government was overthrown by General Zia-ul-Haqq, who declared general amnesty to all the rebellious people and allowed their return from Afghanistan and Soviet Union, which were providing all possible help to them. However, the most aggressive and fierce organization of all factions, "the Baloch Student Organization" (BSO) reorganized itself and continues as nursery for militancy to this day. Marri and Mengals were released and they went to Europe, while Bizenjo followed the politics of reconciliation.

Analysis reveals that the trouble in this period, which followed immediately the secession of East Pakistan, was a result of political immaturity, trust deficit and communication gap between the centre and province, intensifying fear of fissiparous tendency and justifying over-reaction by the military. However, this may also be seen against the backdrop of ethnic cleansing by the political

---

<sup>64</sup> "Bhutto charge ANP for Treason", *Siasat.Pk*, accessed April 23, 2019, <https://www.siasat.pk/forums/threads/bhutto-charge-anp-for-treason.42065/>

<sup>65</sup> Ibid.

government and covert support by hostile foreign powers, which could not be ignored in the interest of national security.

## 2.5 **Fifth Insurgency (2001-2008)**

Period from 1977 to 1999, was relatively peaceful when the nationalist leaders started to participate in political process, however, when the military took over power in 1999, the Baloch nationalists rejected military government. 9/11 brought paradigm change in the international environment in general and South Asia in particular. Pakistan had to give up its long friendly relations with Taliban in Afghanistan, in support of the US lead international effort to neutralise Al Qaida hosted by Afghan Taliban. This U-turn, in our international relations ended the relative calm on our western border and Balochistan. The new Afghan government led by Northern Alliance was hostile to Pakistan and Pakistan's lost political space was occupied by India, a traditional foe supported of Northern Alliance. US and NATO forces turned a blind eye to what was happening in Afghanistan against the state interests of Pakistan through collusion of NDS (National Directorate of Security), the intelligence agency of Afghanistan replacing KHAD (Khadamat-e Aetla'at-e Dawlati) along with RAW (Research and Analysis Wing) of India. The relative calm on our western borders during the era of Taliban rule was lost and our western borders and adjoining areas fully sensitised. US occupation of Afghanistan led to mass exodus of Taliban and Al Qaeda elements to Pakistan and reactivation of Haqqani Group<sup>66</sup> with alleged Headquarters in Waziristan and Quetta Shura with bases in Balochistan. Both were viewed as anti US militant groups tacitly supported by ISI (Inter-Services Intelligence) of Pakistan. Despite rendering all possible logistic, operational and intelligence support to US, Pakistan's role was viewed dubiously. This period saw the emergence of TTP (Tehreek- Taliban Pakistan) and reinvigorated militant nationalists in Balochistan to counter influence of Pakistan in Afghanistan and cut Pakistan to size for making it more manageable. While TTP had bases in tribal areas of Pakistan and adjoining Afghan provinces, it was fully supported by hostile elements in Afghanistan. As per Stanford University, 'in April 2017, a former spokesman for the TTP, Ehsanullah Ehsan, claimed that Afghan and Indian intelligence agencies allegedly provide the TTP with funds and other assistance to combat the Pakistani government. The TTP's relationship

---

<sup>66</sup> "The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica, Haqqani Network, Pashtun Militant Organization" <https://www.britannica.com/topic/Haqqani-network>. Accessed on 19 January 2019

with the Afghan National Directorate of Security (NDS) and India's Research and Analysis Wing (RAW) theoretically developed in 2014, when TTP militants fled across the border to Afghanistan as a result of Operation Zarb-e-Azb. Ehsan claims that both the NDS and RAW supported the TTP by providing financial assistance. Additionally, Ehsan alleged that the NDS issued TTP militants special identity cards for free movement in Afghanistan, while the RAW offered payment for the TTP's willingness to conduct attacks on certain targets.<sup>67</sup> Similarly, active training camps for Baloch nationalists were sponsored by Afghanistan providing liberal material and moral support. This also coincided with mushrooming of Indian Consulates along the Pak – Afghan border<sup>68</sup> for this support. US and Allied forces turned blind eye to this development, always harping for Pakistan to 'Do More'.

The Baloch nationalists also viewed that the influx of Pakhtuns and other ethnic groups in the wake of 9/11 in Balochistan is an effort to marginalize the Baloch in their own territory, whereas this was a plain fact that US operations in Kandahar had sent another wave of Afghan muhajireen to Balochistan. The simmering tension between the government and nationalist Sardars further aggravated when government announced mega developmental projects, like Gwadar Port, Coastal Highway, Mirani Dam and Kacchi Canal etc injecting over 100 billion rupees in the local economy. This magnitude of investment was not made in Balochistan in last 150 years, a fact accepted by many nationalists regrettably. This was threat to status quo and many Baloch Sardars opposed this tooth and nail.

This coincided with the surfacing of Balochistan Liberation Army and its likes which started targeting of railway lines, government installations and Gwadar Port. 'Dissidents from Pakistan are trained at Sarobi (a city in Kabul Province) for missions inside NWFP. Kandahar has its forward bases at Lashkargah and Nawah. Their target area is our province of Balochistan. The dissidents from Balochistan are trained at Lashkargah for undertaking missions in Balochistan as well as in support of the Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA). Approximately 600 ferraris, or Balochi tribal dissidents, are getting specialized training to handle explosives, engineer bomb

---

<sup>67</sup> Stanford University, Mapping Militant Organisations: Tehrik-i-Taliban Pakistan. <http://web.stanford.edu/group/mappingmilitants/cgi-bin/groups/view/105>. Accessed on 19 January 2019

<sup>68</sup> Afifa Kiran, "Indian Quest for Strategic Ingress in Afghanistan and Its Implications for Pakistan". *ISSRA Papers 2009* [https://ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra\\_pub/articles/issra-paper/ISSRA-Paper-Vol-I-2009/02-INDIAN-QUEST-FOR-STRATEGIC-INGRESS-IN-AFGHANISTAN.pdf](https://ndu.edu.pk/issra/issra_pub/articles/issra-paper/ISSRA-Paper-Vol-I-2009/02-INDIAN-QUEST-FOR-STRATEGIC-INGRESS-IN-AFGHANISTAN.pdf).17. Accessed on 19 January 2019

blasts, and use sophisticated weapons in these camps'.<sup>69</sup> Moreover in 2004, Chinese engineers were killed in Gwadar by the militants and Musharraf assigned military the responsibility of safety and security of foreigners. During this period, the government and Akbar Khan Bugti had conflict over the issue of Sui gas, royalty and compensation. He waged an armed struggle against the military, firing rockets at the military Garrisons. Military was employed to quell this insurgency and Akbar Khan Bugti took to mountains to launch a guerrilla war. He was surrounded by military and while negotiations were taking place with him inside the cave, it collapsed with an explosion, killing him, his servants and commanding officer of the Army unit in 2006. This was most probably an act of suicide in which precious lives of military personnel were also lost but was fully exploited by vested local and foreign powers to fuel a full-fledged insurgency. This led to mass protests, giving fillip to nationalist struggle. President Musharraf as a result was the most hated leader in Balochistan for his alleged involvement in death / suicide of Akbar Khan Bugti and his following actions, by far the biggest threat to status quo or writ of Sardars:

- The implementation of local government Act, allowing common people to be elected members of union council and District Council, with plenty of funds available and liberty of planning without bureaucratic rigmaroles. Maximum development in rural Balochistan was carried out during this period.
- Conversion of over 90% of 'B' areas into 'A' areas
- Merger of levies, private tribal force, into Police, after proper training.
- Introduction of mega projects like completion of Coastal Highway from Karachi to Gwadar, Construction of Mirani Dam, work on Gwadar Port, extension of natural gas to many districts of Balochistan etc.

The era of Musharraf saw extreme acts of terrorism in FATA, KPK, Punjab and Sind due to religious militancy, which eclipsed the insurgency being waged in Balochistan in the name of nationalism. However, after the elections of 2008, which resulted in establishment of PPP government in Centre and Balochistan, a marked decrease in the militancy was witnessed and it brought political reconciliation. Besides suppression of democracy at national level, and accidental death of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti, this insurgency was launched to stop the high

---

<sup>69</sup> General Mirza Aslam Baig, "This Is How Afghanistan is used Against Pakistan and China", *Pakistan Think Tank*, 2 Nov 2007, Available online at [http://www.ahmedquraishi.com/article\\_detail.php?id=135](http://www.ahmedquraishi.com/article_detail.php?id=135). Accessed on 8 January 2019.

pitch of development in Balochistan, challenging status quo in economic and political areas. This also coincided with the maturing of militant wings after long period of indoctrination, recruitment, and support by foreign powers. Southern Balochistan was the main target, sensing development and alleging marginalisation of masses due to these mega projects. In this insurgency, Sardars and middle-class nationalists had commonality of interest in stopping the flow of development. Militant nationalists were supported by hostile intelligence agencies, like NDS and RAW. India established series of consulates along the Pak-Afghan border, to support anti Pakistan activities providing, moral and material support to these organisations. This era witnessed most blatant support to Baloch nationalist by foreign powers.

## 2.6 Sporadic Acts of Terrorism (2008 - to Date)

Insurgency in its classical terms, finished following the General Elections of 2008. Militants lost popular support in the masses, due to their hollow allegations, claims and acts of terrorism which affected the common man in Balochistan more than the government or Armed Forces. Gas pipelines blown, electric towers destroyed, affected the daily lives and many people turned against the militants despite fear of reprisals. Sporadic acts of terrorism however continued in Balochistan as in rest of Pakistan, a phenomenon neither new nor a threat to national security. This era witnessed two politically democratic Govts completing their terms at Federal and provincial level. Pakistan People's Party (PPP) government from 2008 – 2013 and Pakistan Muslim League (Nawaz) PML (N) from 2013-2018. Many sub-nationalist parties which boycotted the elections of 2008, feared complete loss of popularity and relevance in mainstream politics and joined the political band wagon in subsequent elections, restoring relations and demonstrating eagerness in building the province positively.

PPP government announced Aghaz-e-Haqooq-e-Balochistan package in 2009. Parliament approved the package unanimously and Senator Raza Rabbani was made in charge for its implementation<sup>70</sup>. This was aimed at giving Balochistan, allocation over and above the annual budget to give fillip to development, overcome feelings of deprivation and appease Sardars, the political heads of province. This included dialogue, return of dissidents, and holding commissions to investigate killing of Baloch nationalist leaders. The package restricted role of

---

<sup>70</sup> Zahid Gishkori, "The Aghaz-e-Haqooq-e-Balochistan: Reform Package stopped in its Tracks", *Express Tribune*, March 7, 2011, accessed January 19, 2019. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/128835/aghaz-e-haqooq-e-balochistan-reform-package-stopped-in-its-tracks/>.

armed forces and pledged number of developmental projects for the province. Although the project fell short of its intended objectives due to lack of funds, it did ease things out in Balochistan.

Another PPP government's biggest achievement was passing of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment<sup>71</sup> in the Constitution of Pakistan in 2010. The meant devolving a number of federal subjects to Provinces and realisation of most of nationalists' demands ever since creation of Pakistan. This brought a paradigm change in the Governance of Province, empowering its elected people to run the province. One negative aspect of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment however was reversal of the A Areas back to B Areas, undoing this basic reform of the province, introduced by President Musharraf. This was done exclusively to appease Sardars who felt threatened due to these acts.

The military at the same time continued minor raids on BLA camps and others of its likes and wave of anti-state sentiment was slowly and gradually reversed. The nationalists accused military for thousands of missing persons and mass graves found in Jhalawan area. ISI / Military Intelligence (MI) and Frontier Corps (FC) were blamed for killing these militant nationalists. They wanted commission to probe these charges and finally a commission under Justice Javed Iqbal was instituted in 2011. According to Baloch militants, 18000 Baloch were missing by 2014 and this was widely propagated by so called champions of human rights and hostile media. Commission of Inquiry on Enforced Disappearances, under Justice (Retired) Javed Iqbal however, disproved these allegations. 360 total cases were registered with commission from Balochistan up to October 2018, of which 225 have been disposed off and 135 are pending<sup>72</sup>. Province wise details are attached as Annex-IV.

2013 elections were fully participated by all political groups in Balochistan and PML (N) after winning the general elections made an alliance with the national parties, allowing them to rule the province for first two and half year. The militancy came to lowest ebb, with complete empowerment of its elected representatives. This period also saw institution of CPEC (China – Pakistan Economic Corridor) with a network of roads started all over Balochistan. It was accompanied with further development of Gwadar Port and city. These acts mobilised the local people adding employment and prosperity, marginalising the militancy seriously. A new wave of loyalty to Pakistan was infused with heroes like Siraj Raisani and people began to realise that

---

<sup>71</sup> <http://lgkp.gov.pk/wp-content/uploads/2014/03/Full-text-of-18th-Amendment-Bill.pdf>. Accessed 4 December 2018.

<sup>72</sup> Commission on Enquiry on Enforced Disappearances. <http://coioed.pk/>. Accessed on 19 January 2019.

their future lied in a united, prosperous Pakistan and not in militancy. Siraj Raisani was son of late Nawab Ghaus Baksh Raisani, former Balochistan Governor and youngest brother of former Balochistan chief minister Nawab Aslam Raisani and former Senator Nawab Zada Lashkar Raisani. He was killed in a suicide blast on 12 July 2018 along with 128 innocent people<sup>73</sup>, while running his election campaign for Balochistan Awami Party. He was scheduled to contest for PP-35 (Mastung). He was an enlightened Sardar who openly blamed India for atrocities in Pakistan and challenged the writ of pro-India sardars (like his own brothers, Sardar Akhtar Mengal and Mahmood Khan Achakzai). There is little doubt that he was martyred by NDS and RAW employing Daesh militants. This act did not leave an iota of doubt of the atrocities committed in Pakistan by our neighbouring countries. Following the Pulwama incident in Indian Held Kashmir in which about 40 Indian soldiers were killed by a freedom fighter, India heightened the ante, striking inside Pakistan followed by a rebuttal in which two of its aircrafts were downed. Immediately after this incident, sporadic acts of terrorism increased in Balochistan, first 20 Hazara were killed in Quetta and then 14 servicemen and Punjabi labourer were brutally murdered on Coastal Highway on 18 April 2019. Pakistan official spokesperson clearly pointed finger at India, for this act.<sup>74</sup>

The period from 2008 to date saw continuation of democracy in Pakistan. The improved situation in Balochistan proves beyond doubt that a worst democracy is better than any other form of government. Reins of power handed over to nationalist forces took venom out of their hearts and as stake holders in development of the province they leaned against the federal government instead of foreign players. Military continued minor operations to quell the insurgency, fanning out to remotest areas and overlooking the security of CPEC projects. This is marked as the best era for Balochistan in its tainted history so far.

## **2.7. Propaganda by Feudal Politicians**

Sardar Akhtar Mengal is son of Sardar Attaullah Mengal and brother of Sardar Javed Mengal. Sardar Attaullah Mengal a self-proclaimed leader of Jhalawan has been the chief Minister of Balochistan. When he was Chief Minister of Balochistan, exodus of hundreds of Punjabi teachers is accredited to him, ironically to rid Balochistan of all aliens, and practically destroying

---

<sup>73</sup> Geo News. <https://www.geo.tv/latest/203201-who-was-nawab-siraj-raisani>. Accessed 19 January 2019

<sup>74</sup>“14 Massacred Execution Style near Gwadar”, The Express Tribune, April 19, 2019.

the education system of the province for this cheap popularity. His son Sardar Javed Mengal and brother of Sardar Akhtar Mengal, is settled in United Kingdom and heads Lashkar-e-Balochistan, a militant outfit, responsible for the killing of hundreds of non-Balochis and security forces. Sardar Akhtar Mengal has been harping over his six-point agenda to normalise situation in the province<sup>75</sup>. He proposed an immediate end to all military operations; missing persons to be presented before the court; abolition of agency death squads; free rein to Baloch political parties to function; punishment to those found guilty for heinous crimes; and rehabilitation of thousands of displaced Baloch people. These points need to be analysed in detail to unravel the real motive and see the implications from national security perspective.

- **Missing Persons:** This has been one of the most politicized issue by nationalist parties headed by Sardars. Sardar Akhtar Mengal head of BNP (M) has repeatedly talked about thousands of missing persons and alleging that they have been rounded up by intelligence agencies and perhaps killed. President Zardari instituted a commission headed by Justice Retired Javed Iqbal to probe and give facts. As per him, the matter has been politicized and blown out of proportion for vested interests of Sardars, nationalists and their foreign masters to defame military and its intelligence agencies. As per him<sup>76</sup> since 2011, 5290 cases of missing persons were registered with the commission out of which 3462 cases were resolved. 1828 cases are being investigated. Out of total missing persons, only 131 belong to Balochistan. Justice Javed Iqbal has recently asserted that many have been victim of inter and intra tribal disputes or sought asylum in foreign countries and settled there. Ironically, Hyrbyair Marri and Brahamdagh Bugti settled in UK and Switzerland respectively are also included in the list of missing persons. The situation of other provinces is not different, and numbers are highly exaggerated. This ploy has been used repeatedly to sensitize the human right bodies and claim media coverage and material supports.
- **Military Operations.** Pakistan has been the worst sufferer from terrorism in the wake of 9/11 when our alliance with US cost us wrath of all anti US extremist groups like Al-

<sup>75</sup> “Mengal’s Six Point”, published in The Nation, 29 September 2012. <https://nation.com.pk/29-Sep-2012/mengal-s-six-points>. Accessed on 19 January 2019

<sup>76</sup> “Enforced Disappearances Missing Persons Issue Politicized”, *The Express Tribune Islamabad*, 29 August, 2018 and “Commission Chief Plays Down Enforced Disappearances”, *Pakistan Today* on 28 August 2018 <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/08/28/commission-chief-plays-down-enforced-disappearances/>



Qaeda, Tehreeq-e-Taliban Pakistan, ISIS, Lashkar-e-Jhangvi etc. Lack of writ in Afghanistan and continued civil war, provided ideal havens to all anti Pakistan terrorist groups supported by India and blind eye turned to these outfits by the NATO / US forces. It started with killing of four Chinese engineers in Gwadar in May, 2004<sup>77</sup>, followed with insurgency in Sui and Marri areas, when security forces were attacked and killed, railway lines blown, electric lines cut off and all state machinery attacked. This situation was well beyond the control of police and Frontier Corps and limited Army operations were carried out in Makran, Dera Bugti and Kohlu areas. The situation worsened after the killing of Nawab Akbar Bugti in a mysterious manner, some even say it was a suicide killing three senior Army officers in the cave along with him. Major military operations in the wake of 9/11 were carried out in Swat, and tribal areas in which thousands of people were killed and displaced. Compared to this, operations in Balochistan were mere storm in a teacup. Small subunit level cordon and search operations were carried out only in the trouble prone areas with minimal collateral effects. The nationalists, however, blew this out of proportion for attracting world's attention. Seeing the length and breadth of the province, now many military formations have been moved out into the remote areas to reduce reaction time and improve logistic support. Additional command of the Frontier Corps has been raised both in KPK and Balochistan. Now there is northern Command of FC with headquarters in Quetta and Southern Command with headquarters in Turbat. Similarly, 33 Infantry Division has been moved to Khuzdar Garrison and 70 Brigade has been pushed to Awaran. Gwadar and Sui have become new Cantonments. This forward displacement of formations and additional wings of FC have improved the law and order situation greatly, with acts of terrorism greatly curtailed.

- **Abolition of Agency Death Squads.** Sardar Akhtar Mengal has also complained that death squads assisted by agencies have been responsible for unjudicial killing of hundreds of nationalists. There is no doubt that some active members of his party were killed besides some hard-core terrorists in the past one decade, but the number is highly exaggerated. People with criminal background have been responsible for these acts, posing that they are being sponsored by agencies and members of Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal's, Baloch

---

<sup>77</sup> Dawn, 5 May 2004. <https://www.dawn.com/news/393852>. Accessed on 4 January 2019.

Musallah Defai Tanzeem,<sup>78</sup> . In personal interview, he viciously denied any connection to this outfit, calling it group of thugs. In fact, both Sardar Akhtar Mengal and Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal belong to same area and are old political rivals. Sardar Akhtar Mengal is the traditional Sardar, claiming support of the people because of political and feudal legacy, whereas Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman has challenged his writ by being close to the downtrodden people and his ideological struggle against anti-Pakistan forces. He like Siraj Raisani are the pioneers in Balochistan, for challenging the BLA, its affiliates, traditional sardars and the foreign sponsors. He survived the first suicide bombing in Quetta in his house, led by BLA in which he lost scores of this people. In his garb many anti-social elements have been committing atrocities and minor crimes in the area, claiming to be close to agencies. While they killed some miscreants belonging to BLA, BNP (M) and BLF (Balochistan Liberation Front), they also settled personal scores and killed many innocent people like Jumma Khan Raisani and Attaullah Muhammadzai etc. This group however is not active anymore and seems to have disintegrated.

- **Freedom of Space to Baloch Political Parties.** This again is more a propaganda ploy than anything real. National Party and Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party ruled Balochistan along with PML (N) in last five years, the former two are sub national parties and given complete freedom. Sardar Akhtar Mengal was convincingly beaten in last elections and he made an excuse that his party was not given freedom of action. In the recent elections he emerged as a third major party of Balochistan, after BAP and JUI (F). He is member of National Assembly and supported PTI for election of Prime Minister Imran Khan, this allegation like the other five has expired with age.
- **Rehabilitation of Displaced Baloch People.** More than 200,000 non settlers were pushed out of Balochistan in the last 18 years, due to ethnic cleansing by BLA and others of its like. Following military campaign some terrorists took to mountains to continue the war against the state. Besides this, after the demise of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti, many Kalpar Bugtis who were forcibly exiled by him during his life, repatriated to claim their lands and property. This led to internecine struggle in the Dera Bugti area which keeps simmering. Akhtar Mengal is probably pleading case of those who took to mountains to continue war

---

78

<https://www.google.com.pk/search?q=shafiq+mengal+wikipedia&oq=shafiq+men&aqs=chrome.4.0j69i57j0l4.9672j0j7&sourceid=chrome&ie=UTF-8>

against the state or is against the Kalpar Bugtis who have returned to native land after more than 40 years to claim their legacy.

- **Punishment to those found Guilty of Heinous Crimes.** Let charity start from home, elder brother of Sardar Akhtar Mengal, Javed Mengal is successfully running a militant outfit, Lashkar-e-Balochistan from UK. They have scores of Ferrari camps established around Wad, to harass innocent people claiming freedom from this Sardari Nizam and is guilty of hundreds of deaths of LEAs and non-settlers, independently or by abetting BLA/ BRF. It is typical of most Sardars to cry wolf, while stalking as wolf to target and kill LEAs. There is a need to constitute a truth and reconciliation commission in Balochistan to punish or reconcile differences and accept peace loving sub nationalists and those on opposite side into mainstream politics.

## 2.8 Profile of Militant Groups in Balochistan

It is important to study the genesis of various militant groups in Balochistan to unravel the link between the Sardars, foreign masters and their agenda to prove the hypothesis that Balochistan imbroglio is deeply linked to these two elements.

### 2.8.1 Balochistan Liberation Army (BLA)

In 2000, the BLA launched the fifth insurgency, when its leader, the late Nawab Khair Bakhsh Marri (1928-2014), was arrested after being charged with the murder of then senior judge of the Balochistan High Court, Mir Mohammad Nawaz Marri. The group is also said to have been active in the 1973 insurgency, under the umbrella of the Marri tribe, but lacked proper organisation.<sup>79</sup> The locals say that BLA was founded in 1970's by Khair Bakhsh Marri of Ghazeni cast of the Marris and his associates. They were active in Russo-Afghan war, funded by Soviet Union but it disappeared after the Soviet defeat and reappeared after 9/11. This was built around the leadership of Balochistan Student Organisation (BSO) with same ideology and membership. It originated from Kahan Tehsil of District Kohlu District, the hometown of Nawab Khair Bakhsh Marri. After 9/11 when US forces came to Afghanistan, it established its first training camp in the mountains of Bolan near 'Sangan' a small town near Sibi. Their second training camp was established in 'Shur Paarod' which is 35 km west of Kalat city. Strategically

---

<sup>79</sup> Shazada Zulfiqar, "The Price of Liberation", News Line (2019): accessed October 28, 2019, <https://newlinemagazine.com/magazine/the-price-of-liberation/>

‘Shur Paarod’ mountains are in between three districts of Kalat, Noshki and Kharan. From Noshki side it enjoys border with Afghanistan. Currently Balach Marri s/o of Nawab Khair Bakhsh Marri is leading on the ground while his elder brother Hyrbyair Marri stationed in UK fosters relations with all anti Pakistan elements and renders political and material support for creation of Greater Balochistan. Balach Marri used BSO Azad for recruitment of Baloch, Brahvi youth in BLA. So, unlike the insurgencies of 1960’s and 1970’s when only Marri tribe was fighting the state, now they had the representation of youth from a much vaster area, thanks to efforts of BSO Azad. Gaining support, Hyrbyair Marri established two more training camps at Tootak area of Khuzdar and Mashke area of Awaran District. Apart from Marris, the other important commanders of BLA were, Ali Sher Kurd, Aslam alias Accho (Man responsible for attack on Chinese Consulate in Karachi, and reportedly killed thereafter in a suicide attack in Afghanistan), Dr Allah Nazar, Bashir Zeb, Safeer Sarparah, Ghafoor Jam, Zafar Qalandrani, Akhtar Nadeem, Zakir Majeed, Mir Abdul Nabi Bangulzai, etc. Majority of these commanders came from BSO Azad. After the death of Balach Marri and complete destruction of Tootak camp and partial destruction of Shur Parod camp, BLA could no longer control Mashkey camp which was responsible for the coastal belt and Makran District. Moreover, Dr Allah Nazar belonging to middle class and an opportunist, developed differences with Hyrbyair Marri, and founded BLF along with Commander Akhtar Nadeem. Currently BLA has camps in Kahan area of Kohlu District and collects monthly ‘Bhatta’ in millions from coal mines. It also has camps in Splinee Mountains near Mastung and has a camp in Shur Parod<sup>80</sup>. According to Mark Perry (He is the former co-Director of the Washington, D.C., London, and Beirut-based Conflicts Forum), CIA memos reveal that in 2007 and 2008 Israeli agents posed as American spies, recruited Pakistani citizens to work for Jundallah, which is an affiliate of BLA to create subversion in Iran <sup>81</sup>. BLA is also working to frustrate and scare China away from CPEC in the interest of India and other such states.

### 2.8.2 Balochistan Liberation Front (BLF)

This was founded by Jumma Khan Marri in 1964 in Syria. The initial objectives of BLF were to fight Iran for greater Balochistan. It was funded by Iraq and weapons seized by Pakistani forces from the Iraq Embassy in 1973 were intended for BLF. Later, the organisation decided to fight

<sup>80</sup> Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal. Interview was conducted in Khuzdar, September 3, 2018.

<sup>81</sup> Mark Perry. <http://cvemonitor.cpakgulf.org/index.php/2017/10/25/balochistan-liberation-army/>. Accessed 10 January 2019.

for Independent Balochistan, and once leader of BSO – Azad, Dr Allah Nazar took over its command. It is also believed that Brahamdagh Khan Bugti, who lives in Switzerland has also joined BLF.<sup>82</sup> Dr Allah Nazar belongs to Hussaini cast of Muhammad Hasni tribe. He belongs to village ‘Mayhee’ of tehsil Mashke, District Awaran. Akhtar Nadeem is his second in command from Zikri religion. The group is strong in all mountainous regions of Makran Division. Recently they have spread over to other Baloch and Brahvi populated areas of Balochistan also. India and Afghanistan are the main sponsors but even Iran has allowed them to establish bases in Iran. Reportedly, at present he is living in Iran’s bordering region with Pakistan.<sup>83</sup>

### 2.8.3 Lashkar-e-Balochistan (LeB)

It is headed by Javed Mengal s/o of Sardar Atallah Khan Mengal<sup>84</sup>. He is elder brother of Akhtar Mengal who is head of Balochistan National Party (Mengal) or BNP (M). Javed Mengal is also son in law of Nawab Khair Bakhsh Marri and Javed’s sons, Nooruddin and Bhawal look after the affairs of LB as 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> in command of party respectively. Wad tehsil of District Khuzdar is the strong hold of the party where it has two training camps in Phab Mountain range and in Mountains of Shah Noorani which is sub tehsil Sarona of Tehsil Wad.<sup>85</sup> This party is mainly supported by India and Afghanistan. Javed and his sons are stationed in England but visit Dubai frequently to coordinate the activities of LeB.

### 2.8.4 United Baloch Army (UBA)

This party is led by Mehran Marri s/o of Nawab Khari Bakhsh Marri. Mehran had some differences with Hyrbyair Marri on financial issues. The group has its presence in Kahan and Splinjee Mountains near Mastung.<sup>86</sup> India and Afghanistan are the main sponsors of this party. Mehran Marri is also representative of Balochistan for United Nations Human Rights Council and for the European Union. In his absence from country, the militancy is led by Mir Abdu Nabi Bangulzai.

---

<sup>82</sup> “Mapping Militant Organisations”. *Stanford University*. <http://web.stanford.edu/group/mappingmilitants/cgi-bin/groups/view/457>

<sup>83</sup> Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal. Interview was conducted in Khuzdar, September 3, 2018.

<sup>84</sup> Data Base of People with Extremist Linkages. <http://www.dopel.org/Lashkar-e-Balochistan.htm>

<sup>85</sup> Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal interviewed in Khuzdar on 15 September 2018.

<sup>86</sup> Ibid.

### 2.8.5 Balochistan Republican Army (BRA)

It was founded in 2006 by mostly men from Bugti tribe. It does not declare its leader openly, but it is a well-known fact that it is headed by Brahamdagh Bugti<sup>87</sup> grandson of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti from Raheja cast of Bugtis. He is son of late Rehan Khan Bugti. BRA took its birth from Dera Bugti, the hometown of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti. It has training camps in Dera Bugti and in the Makran belt bordering Iran. India, Afghanistan and Iran are rendering support to this militant group. Brahamdagh Bugti is living in Switzerland and despite his militant background enjoying state asylum.

### 2.8.6 Lashkar-e-Jhangvi / Daesh / BLA Collusion

This by far is the recent development, in which the three major militant organisations have joined hands to wage a collective war against the state of Pakistan in Balochistan. Pro-active military operations and losing support of masses, the three joined hands to impact situation in Balochistan. This was rather easy, as all three have headquarters in Afghanistan and the same pay masters, namely, NDS, RAW and according to some even CIA (The Central Investigation Agency) of US.<sup>88</sup>

## 2.9 Summary of the Militant and Political setups of Balochistan

An annexure (Annex- V) shows a tabulated fact sheet published in ‘Balochistan Case Study’ by Michael Brown, Mohammad Dawod, Arash Irantalab, and Mahmud Naqi and published in INAF 5493-S in June 2012. It narrates the causes of insurgency in Balochistan, starting 2006 and shows political parties sponsoring openly or tacitly these militant organisations.<sup>89</sup>

---

<sup>87</sup> Stanford University. Mapping Militant Organisations. <http://web.stanford.edu/group/mappingmilitants/cgi-bin/groups/view/457>. Accessed 7 January 2019.

<sup>88</sup> Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal. Interview was conducted in Khuzdar, September 3, 2018.

<sup>89</sup> Michael Brown, Mohammad Dawaod, Arash Iranlatab and Mahmud Naqi. “Balochistan Case Study: Ethnic Conflict: Causes, Consequences and Management.” [www4.carleton.ca/cifp/app/serve.php/1398.pdf](http://www4.carleton.ca/cifp/app/serve.php/1398.pdf)

### 2.10 Arrest of Kulbhushan Sudhir Jadhav

A serving Indian Naval commander was arrested from inside Balochistan on 3<sup>rd</sup> March 2016<sup>90</sup>, he was in possession of a fake passport with fake name and had visited Pakistan over 17 times for sponsoring sabotage, subversion and terrorism. He disclosed that he was involved in financially supporting militants and was involved in Karachi's unrest. Interrogation also reportedly revealed that naval combat training was being conferred to Baloch separatists, in an attempt to target the ports of Gwadar and Karachi. Pakistani authorities stated that Jadhav, during his interrogation, gave details about his funding, and plans to destabilise the country. This proved beyond an iota of doubt the Pakistani claim that India was behind spate of terrorism in Pakistan, especially Balochistan. India sought his release from International court of Justice, but Pakistan has submitted the complete and irrefutable evidence of his involvement.

The genesis of militant groups, their leadership and location abroad of their leadership clearly points to the two irritants in Balochistan, Feudals and foreign powers. Political stability in last ten years has deprived the militant organisations popular slogan of Balochistan deprivation with reins of power firmly in their hands. Moreover, military operations and Pakistan's political efforts at international level exposed many outside players putting a caution to their liberty of freedom. The insurgency is dying, giving birth to pro-Pakistan loyalists like late Siraj Khan Raisani. For insurgency to end, Pakistan has to remain committed to full scale development of the province, its political stability and zero tolerance towards terrorism. One surprising thing that happened in last one year is clear evidence that all these militant outfits regardless of their area of influence, leadership or ideology are being led by same master. BLA BLF, ISIS and LeJ have been found supporting each other and same mercenaries were noticed switching areas and claiming different names to confuse the government and LEAs. Even MQM (London) was reported to be helping these outfits if operations were needed in Karachi attack in Chinese Consulate by BLA in Karachi a case in point. The master in all attacks in Pakistan was invariably NDS supported by RAW, with all information known to our so-called US friends.

The political and military outfits clearly affect the socio-political profile of the province, with vested interests opposing development and writ of government, for their continued political hold

---

<sup>90</sup> "Who is Kulbhushan Jhadev", *Dawn*, April 10, 2017, accessed July 8 2018, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1326117>

and exploitation of Balochistan's mineral wealth for personal aggrandizement rather than a concern for the masses, a fact dilated in next chapter.



## CHAPTER 3

### POLITICAL, ETHNIC AND SOCIAL CONTOURS OF BALOCHISTAN

Balochistan constitutes almost 43.6% of Pakistan's area and as per 6<sup>th</sup> Population and Housing Census of 2017 by Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, it has a population of 12.34 million which is 5.94% of Pakistan.<sup>91</sup> It however, has shown maximum growth rate of population at 3.37% since last census conducted in 1998 (See Annex-VI). Despite huge area, it has lowest poverty index<sup>92</sup>, lowest literacy rate and maximum mortality for the new-born children and almost non-existent middle class. The tribal nature of its people being totally subjugated to tyrannical feudal system, continued state of insurgency, poor Governance at Federal and provincial levels and foreign meddling have been the causes.

Balochistan has 34 districts under six geographical divisions (See Annex-VII). This chapter would dilate on the socio-economic profile of the districts in the backdrop of tribal and ethnic influence. It would show how the province is politically and demographically divided and how the socio-economic profile of Districts is impacted by the feudal system, federation and foreign powers to deepen the fissures.

#### 3.1 Ethnic Profile

Baloch and Pashtuns are the two major tribes living in Balochistan with some settlers from other Divisions, residing mostly in Quetta. As per 2017 Census, 'the Baloch population has shrunk from 61pc to 55.6pc in the province over a period of 19 years in 21 districts where the Baloch form a majority. However, the total number of Baloch people has increased from 4 million in 1998 to 6.86m in 2017. The count does not include the population of two districts viz. Quetta and Sibi where people of various ethnicities, including Baloch and Pashtun also reside.<sup>93</sup> The Pashtuns are about 33 % and about 6 % others. The others are mostly settlers, who migrated from India, Afghanistan and other provinces and settled mostly in the urban centres of Quetta,

---

<sup>91</sup> Pakistan Bureau of Statistics, 6<sup>th</sup> Population and Housing Census of 2017. [http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/PAKISTAN%20TEHSIL%20WISE%20FOR%20WEB%20CENSUS\\_2017.pdf](http://www.pbs.gov.pk/sites/default/files/PAKISTAN%20TEHSIL%20WISE%20FOR%20WEB%20CENSUS_2017.pdf). Accessed on 20 January 2019

<sup>92</sup> "Multidimensional Poverty in Pakistan", *UNDP Report*, accessed April 23, 2019, <https://www.undp.org/content/dam/pakistan/docs/MPI/MPI%204pager.pdf>.

<sup>93</sup> "Number of Balochi-Speaking People in Balochistan Fall", *Dawn*, September 11, 2017. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1356899>. Accessed on 7 January 2019

Khuzdar, and Zhob. They are Punjabis, Hazaras and Pathans. Some Hindus also decided not to migrate to India after partition and are settled in urban centres. About 3-4 million Afghan muhajireen migrated to Balochistan during war against Soviet Forces and after 9/11. Some have repatriated but many are still here with or without registration. This was a serious concern of many Baloch nationalists before the census, but against their expectations, the population of Pashtuns did not increase proportionately. The comparative decrease in population of Baloch is attributed to lawlessness in these areas which compelled people to move to Quetta or other provinces (Ethnic profile of the province is attached as Annex- VIII).

Baloch population is further divided into the Baloch and Brahui people. 52% of people have Balochi as their mother tongue. Pashtuns constitute about 36% and remaining 12% are Brahuis, migrants from India and other provinces and Hazaras. This affords a heterogeneous culture warranting equal treatment to all the population groups.<sup>94</sup>

### **3.1.1 Baloch**

This forms the majority population of the province, settled almost exclusively in Nasirabad and Jaffarabad Divisions and partly in others besides the Quetta city. Some of the areas were under the British Balochistan while rest were under the Khan of Kalat at independence of Pakistan. ‘Balochi speaking tribes include Rind, Lashar, Marri, Jamot, Ahmedzai, Bugti Domki, Magsi, Kenazai, Khosa, Rakhshani, Dashti, Umrani, Noshervani, Gichki, Buledi, Notazai, Sanjarani, Meerwani, Zahrozai, Langove, Kenazai and Khidai. Each tribe is further sub-divided into various branches. The tribal chief is called Sardar while head of sub-tribe is known as Malik, Takari or Mir. Sardars and Maliks are members of district and other local Jirgas according to their status’<sup>95</sup>, The areas are sparsely populated, and rank lowest in literacy and poverty index. These were all tribal areas with strong hold of Sardars/ Nawabs. Discovery of Sui Gas, oil and coal especially Chamalang coal mines, kicked off commercial activity. Legally the mines belong to Federation but denial of royalty to the province initially provided good excuse to Sardars to exploit the arrangement in their favour. State personally paid to sardars a huge part of earning, employed levies as per their wishes and made them stake holder in the wages of employees. This

---

<sup>94</sup> “Balochistan Pakistan,” Last modified May 21, 2019. [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Balochistan,\\_Pakistan](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Balochistan,_Pakistan)

<sup>95</sup>“Balochistan.gov.pk”

[http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com\\_content&view=article&id=39&Itemid=785](http://www.balochistan.gov.pk/index.php?option=com_content&view=article&id=39&Itemid=785) . Accessed on 13 January 2019

arrangement was repeatedly challenged on one or other pretext to get bigger and bigger share of the pie. Sardars were gradually abetted by other alien states to create law and order situation and this finally led to death of Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti in a military operation. This gave lot of fillip to insurgency in the province with moral advantage against the armed forces. BRA and BLA headed by Bugti and Marri chieftains respectively, continue to target the state infrastructure. Repatriation of Kalpar Bugtis to this area has however, seriously changed the demographic nature of Bugti populated areas, reducing the hold of traditional Nawab family.

### 3.1.2 **Brahui**

There are mixed opinions about the origin of these people. Some believe they are Dravidians shifted from East India, as Brahui language has strong familiarity with Dravidian language. Others believe they migrated from Central Asia and the language is over 50% same as Balochi. ‘Brahui speaking tribes include Raisani, Shahwani, Sumulani, Sarparrah, Bangulzai, Mohammad Shahi, Lehri, Bezenjo, Mohammad Hasni, Zehri, Sarparrah, Mengal, Kurd, Sasoli, Satakzai, Lango, Rodeni, Kalmati, Jattak, Yagazehi and Qambarani, most of these tribes are bi-lingual and are quite fluent both in the Balochi and Brahui Languages.<sup>96</sup> Brahui people have traditionally ruled entire Balochistan, as Khan of Kalat was a Brahui too. They inhabit complete Kalat Division and have presence in Makran and others too. A dialect very close to Brahui is spoken in Makran Division. Since this area suffered most through well entrenched Sardari / tribal system, it ranks lowest on the social development index. The area is sparsely populated with minimum to non-existent road infrastructure, hospitals, and schools. The literacy rate is lowest, and poverty is highest. Being a ‘B’ area, levies strongly influenced by Sardars controls it. As an outcome of all this, unsatisfactory youth fall easy prey to anti state activities. It is therefore is hub of BLA/ Lashkar-e Balochistan and Da’esh. The strong appearance of Da’esh in Mastung and Noshki is a recent phenomenon, evident through repeated attacks on Hazara population, state agencies and men like Siraj Raisani. The area is mostly barren except for some irrigated areas of Mastung and Khuzdar. The rugged mountains provide easy refuge to ferraris.

---

<sup>96</sup> Ibid.

### 3.1.3 Pashtuns

They are mostly settled in Quetta and northern Districts, as indicated in map attached (see Annex-VIII). ‘The Pakhtun tribes include Kakar, Ghilzai Tareen, Mandokhel, Sherani, Luni, Kasi and Achakzai’<sup>97</sup>. This area constituted, British Balochistan under the patronage of Agent to the Governor General (AGG). A part of this area was taken by British from Afghanistan and apart from Khan of Kalat for administrative purpose. British established one of the largest military garrisons of present-day Pakistan in Quetta, developed roads, infrastructure and promoted trade with Afghanistan and Central Asia. Pashtuns traditionally enjoyed a lot of freedom to act, with no subjugation by a single Sardar or Khan, and capitalized fully the good governance afforded by British for trade, agriculture and education. The population density is more in Pashtun majority areas due to availability of social infrastructure. They have better literacy rate, political awareness and are strongly aligned with Federation of Pakistan. They however, claim to be as populous as the Baloch and demand greater share in the political and service structure of the province. These areas did not host any major insurgency in the last 70 years, and remain focussed on the trade, smuggling through porous border with Afghanistan. Following 9/11, however, US claims that Quetta Shura of Afghan Taliban is established in this area and works against the interests of US<sup>98</sup>. In order to counter this menace, or destabilize Pakistan, Daesh/ ISIS with bases in neighbouring Afghanistan has become fairly active, perpetrating terrorism and targeting Hazaras, who follow Fiqh-e-Jafria. The recent suicide blast on Siraj Raisani in Mastung was also claimed by them in which nearly 150 persons were martyred.<sup>99</sup>

### 3.1.4 Makrani

Bordering a long coastline, with almost non-existent agricultural activity, people are mostly fisherman and work abroad specially Oman. Many also work in Karachi or are involved in smuggling from Iran and Afghanistan. While Khan of Kalat had an administrator placed at Turbat for collecting revenues, the people did not fall under a single sardar or elder. Gwadar, the

---

<sup>97</sup> Ibid.

<sup>98</sup> “The Quetta Shura”, *Dawn*. (September 27, 2009). <https://www.dawn.com/news/914466>. Accessed on 14 January 2019

<sup>99</sup> Amir Wasim, “Siraj Raisani laid to rest in Mastung; PM announces national day of mourning on Sunday” *Dawn* (July 14, 2018).

deep seaport, changed hand from Khan of Kalat to King of Oman and back to federation of Pakistan during the period of President Ayub Khan. ‘On September 7, 1958, after four years of negotiations, including six months of intense negotiations, Pakistan purchased the Gwadar enclave from the Sultanate of Muscat and Oman for USD \$3 million. Gwadar formally became part of Pakistan on December 8, 1958, after 174 years of Omani rule’.<sup>100</sup> The people are traditionally peace loving and docile. However, the birth of BSO and BLF has created serious law and order situation in the area. The world first witnessed signs of anarchy when Chinese engineers were killed in Gwadar in 2004. This was followed by limited military operation and increased military presence. The long coastline and long border with Iran, logistically sustain the anti-state elements. BLF headed by Dr Allah Nazar is believed to have headquarters in bordering region with Iran, in places like Mand, Buleda and Nimroz Iran.<sup>101</sup> He keeps instigating the local population over their marginalization if the CPEC project materialises and against people from other regions who made large investments and moved here. These elements present greatest threat to Gwadar Port Project and CPEC. Acute scarcity of sweet water is the existential threat to entire population.

### **3.1.5 Hazaras**

These people settled in Quetta almost two hundred years ago and follow Fiqh-e-Jafria. They are the most peace loving and refined people in Balochistan. They are literate and have good representation in armed forces and bureaucracy. Most of them were once involved in thriving business, but over the last 20 years, following their repeated genocide, have confined themselves to their small enclave in Quetta City. Lashkar-e-Jhangvi and Da’esh have repeatedly attacked them in Quetta and their travellers to Iran in districts of Mastung and Noshki. Their business activity has come to naught and they live under siege like conditions in Quetta. Balochistan chapter of Human Rights Commission for Pakistan (HRCP) said ‘the Hazara ethnic group was worst hit by the unrest, with as many as 200,000 of them relocating to Pakistan’s major cities or

---

<sup>100</sup> “Why did Oman sell Gwadar to Pakistan?”, <https://www.quora.com/Why-did-Oman-sell-Gwadar-to-Pakistan>. Accessed on 20 January 2019

<sup>101</sup> Mir Shafiq-ur-Rehman Mengal. Interview was conducted in Khuzdar, September 3, 2018.

abroad'.<sup>102</sup> The Provincial government and armed forces have failed to deliver for their safety and wellbeing.

### 3.1.6 Punjabi and other Settlers

This makes about 6% of the population. They constitute people from Punjab, Hazara Division of KPK, muhajirs from India and some other casts specially Hindus. They are mostly settled in Quetta and other urban centres. Almost all are literate, with major contribution in the business, education sector and bureaucracy. These people were specifically targeted by BLA and other militants to spread fear and force their desertion from the province. According to the BLA, an estimated 500 Punjabis were killed.<sup>103</sup> Some of it was instigated by Qabza Mafia to buy their properties at much lower than the marked price. Reportedly about 100,000 of these people were forced to leave the province in last 20 years, without any remorse of provincial and federal govts, media, human right organisations and supreme judiciary.<sup>104</sup> A highly callous act, leaves one wondering about the existence of state, its institutions and worst of all a living human consciousness. The successive provincial govts have been hostage to the agenda of anti-state nationalists for complicity or fear. After Hazaras this community has suffered the most in this ethnic cleansing drive of militants. Hatred against settlers dates back to 1973 when Sardar Attaullah Mengal, Chief Minister of Balochistan ordered all non-Baloch teachers to quit jobs and leave the province. The slots were filled up by incompetent Baloch teachers, creating a big vacuum in quality education and giving birth to BSO and other militant organisations.

### 3.2 Division of 'A' and 'B' Areas

Major Robert Sandeman was tasked to secure Balochistan for ease of governance and as launch pad against Afghanistan in 1872. He exploited the rivalries between Sardars and the Khan of Kalat to reduce his suzerainty. He would provide funds and assistance to Sardars directly in return for their loyalty and services. Besides supporting the Jirga System and other traditions of Baloch people, he introduced the concept of levies or tribal police to control law and order. They

---

<sup>102</sup> "HRCP Reports Exodus of Minorities from Balochistan", *Dawn*, October 15, 2014, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1138151>

<sup>103</sup> "Centre for International Security and Cooperation", Stanford University, accessed October 28, 2019, <https://cisac.fsi.stanford.edu/mappingmilitants/profiles/balochistan-liberation-army>

<sup>104</sup> Ibid.

were native warriors employed in their own area. They were paid by Sardars, who received this money from the British masters. Besides this, British also had a parallel control over levies force through their special representative, usually a Hindu from some other tribe. The levies force acted as eyes and ears for the British and Sardars were comfortable with this arrangement as they appeared to be pay masters and overall responsible for peace in their areas. However, if Sardars acted against the interest of the British, they would stop his levies fund<sup>105</sup>. Pakistan inherited this system from British and still the system is implemented in about 93 % area of Balochistan, called ‘B’ Areas. Urban Centres which constitute about 7-9% Areas where law and order is maintained by Police are called ‘A’ areas.

‘General Pervez Musharraf ordered to disband the Levies as he believed that it was a force controlled by the tribal chieftains, particularly Marris, Bugtis and Mengals (considered the rouge Sardars as compared to rest of the 72 Islamabad-loyal chieftains). The process of disbanding the Levies and its absorption into the police started in December 2003 at the total cost of Rs5.5 billion. The process that converted some of the ‘B’ areas into ‘A’ areas, took four long years to complete – mainly because the nationalist parties strongly resisted this conversion. However, the PPP government restored the Levies after the Balochistan Assembly adopted a unanimous resolution in April 2010. The civil bureaucracy headed by the then District Management Group which had become toothless after police reforms of 2002 and the district government system introduced by Musharraf, played a vital role in reverting the ‘A’ areas (police) into ‘B’ areas.<sup>106</sup>

As is evident from above, Sardars were not ready to part with this power of Levies and neither did they want Police Force to maintain law and order. Federal government failed to maintain reforms initiated and Balochistan Assembly which virtually is a House of Lords, prevailed to maintain anarchy in the province. If we compare the socio-political profile of A and B areas, devastation of people in terms of literacy, poverty and lawlessness is very obvious in B areas. This helps the hostile powers, keep hatred against federation, FC and Army simmering.

---

<sup>105</sup> Martin Axmann, *Back to the Future: The Khanate of Kalat and the Genesis of Baloch Nationalism 1915-1955* (Karachi: Oxford, 2012), 31.

<sup>106</sup> Shahzada Zulfiqar, “The many lawmen in Balochistan”, *The News International*, September 25, 2016, <http://tns.thenews.com.pk/many-lawmen-balochistan/#.XEXuTFwzY2x>. Accessed 11 November 2018

### 3.3 Balochistan's Economy versus Vested Interests

#### 3.3.1 Chamalang Mines

Spreading over an area of 500 square kilometres, of Loralai, Bar Khan and Kohlu districts, these mines are reportedly the second biggest in Asia. These were first discovered in British time, 1885 and extraction stopped in 1974 after disputes over its ownership between Marri and Luni tribes. Pakistan Army successfully concluded a tripartite agreement in 2006 and work resumed here. This is best quality coal produced in Pakistan and is used as fuel for brick making industry and Cement factories. Vested foreign interests and local feudals never wanted this to take off, and workers were frequently attacked by BLA/ BRA militants. Since 2007, approximately 55,000 jobs have been generated by the coal mines for the residents of Balochistan, Khyber-Pakhtunkhwa and Punjab. An estimated 73,926 people including Chamalang levies, contractors and labourers have been employed in the coal mines. After Chaghi marble and Saindak Copper mines, Chamalang coal mines are the largest project in terms of revenue generation. The estimated value of reserves is about 200 Billion rupees. A large contingent of Frontier Constabulary is employed for protection of workers here. Reportedly, there exists a tacit agreement between the mine contractors and militants for peace against 'Bhatta' paid to militants backed by Sardars. In 2011, Marri tribesmen attacked trucks carrying coal; Frontier Corps was called and 11 tribesmen were killed in the action. The government in Quetta believes that India is busy arming these people to stop work on the mines.<sup>107</sup>

#### 3.3.2 Sui Gas Field

Sui gas was discovered in 1952 and despite diminishing reserves, it is still one of the largest natural gas producing project in Pakistan<sup>108</sup>. It is located in District Dera Bugti. Balochistan had genuine grievances over the distribution of Sui gas to people of Balochistan and this issue was exploited fully by Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti despite fact that he obtained share in the royalty of gas, employment of workers in Sui Field and levies force posted here for protection of the infrastructure. He would frequently create law and order situation to claim bigger share for himself from this field, and often, federal government obliged him economically and politically. It was in

<sup>107</sup> Qaiser Butt, "Chamalang Mines: FC action against Marri Tribesmen", *The Express Tribune*, July 24, 2011, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/216330/chamalang-mines-fc-action-against-marri-tribesmen/>. Accessed 13 November 2018

<sup>108</sup> Suhail Qadeer and Nusrat K. Siddiqui, "Sui Gas Field: A Case History". <http://www.searchanddiscovery.com/abstracts/pdf/2012/90145pag1998/abstracts/extended/qadeer.pdf>



President Musharraf's time that he almost openly started attacking the infra-structure which led to military operation and finally his mysterious death in a cave, after a siege of the area by military. The attacks have since declined coupled with mass inflow of Kalpar Bugti's in the area and intense efforts of military to improve education and other social infrastructure here.

Some statistics are as under; <sup>109</sup> (This is data up to June 2018)

### 3.3.3

<b>Year</b>	<b>Incidents</b>	<b>Killed</b>	<b>Injured</b>
2005	5	10	16
2006	19	0	0
2007	31	1	1
2008	31	2	1
2009	29	0	3
2010	3	0	0
2011	52	3	10
2012	23	0	0
2013	10	0	0
2014	17	0	0
2015	10	0	0
2016	2	0	0
2017	0	0	0
2018	0	0	0
<b>Total*</b>	<b>232</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>31</b>

Source: [http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Balochistan/data/Attacks\\_Gas\\_pipeline.htm](http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Balochistan/data/Attacks_Gas_pipeline.htm)

### 3.3.4 Saindak Mines

Saindak is a small town in Chaghi District of Balochistan. Copper and Gold mines were discovered here in 1961<sup>110</sup> by Geological Survey of Pakistan. It was leased to Chinese firm,

<sup>109</sup>“South Asian Terrorism Portal”

[http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Balochistan/data/Attacks\\_Gas\\_pipeline.htm](http://www.satp.org/satporgtp/countries/pakistan/Balochistan/data/Attacks_Gas_pipeline.htm)

Metallurgical Corporation of China Ltd. (MCC), part of China Metallurgical Group Corporation, which is still working here with its contract renewed in 2017 for another 5 years. Balochistan government and Federation are not on one page regarding the distribution of assets/ resources from this mine. Federal government finally transferred bulk of its shares in Saindak Metals Ltd to the provincial government bringing its shares to 35%. The process was however stopped by Federal government which asked Saindak Metals to first pay Rs 29 billion which the Federal government had invested in this project. However, the company ran out of funds after paying Rs 6 billion and offered Federal government additional 20% share for the balance amount. Lack of mutual understanding led to stopping of shares transfer to Provincial government by the Federal government.<sup>111</sup> The facts are distorted, and this too is portrayed by vested interests an exploitation of Balochistan by the Federal government. It is also suspected that Chinese firms are taking out more than what they disclose and both the provincial and federal Govts are being made to suffer.

### 3.3.5 Reko Dig Mines

It's a small town in Chagai District close to borders with Iran and Afghanistan. The mine was discovered way back in 1978. Tethyan Copper Company (TTC) believes mines can generate 5.9 Billion tonnes of Copper at 0.41% and an average gold grade of 0.22g/tonne. Tethyan held a 75% interest in an exploration licence encompassing the Reko Diq deposit, with the government of Balochistan (the provincial authority) holding the remaining 25% interest. However, government of Balochistan refused to award lease contract to the company in 2009<sup>112</sup> and TTC approached international arbitration against Balochistan government and Federation. Tethyan won the arbitration case and presently government of Balochistan and the company are negotiating for an out of court settlement. Like Saindak, this too has not materialised to benefit the people of Balochistan for vested interests of the ruling political elite both at provincial and Federal levels. Undecided and unexploited, this too is quoted by vested interest a cause for the deprivation of the people of Balochistan. While the provincial government is to blame mainly for this, Army and Federation are held as escape goats and maligned.

---

<sup>110</sup> Muhammad Akbar Notezai, "The Saindak Files", Dawn, January 7, 2018, accessed December 10, 2018 <https://www.dawn.com/news/1381378>.

<sup>111</sup> [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Saindak\\_Copper\\_Gold\\_Project](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Saindak_Copper_Gold_Project). Accessed on 24 January 2019

<sup>112</sup> Maqbool Ahmed, "Magic Mountains: The Reko Diq Gold and Copper Mining Project", *Herald*, September 29, 2017, <https://herald.dawn.com/news/1153283>. Accessed on 21 January 2019

### 3.3.6 Kachhi canal

It was commenced in 2002 by President Gen Pervez Musharraf. The length of the Main Canal is 500 km (Phase-I 403 km) which includes 391 km (lined) in Punjab and Balochistan Provinces<sup>113</sup>. It will originate from Taunsa Barrage and is likely to bring green revolution in Balochistan, after completion of its three phases. It is planned by WAPDA in three phases as under;

- Phase-I - in district Dera Bugti (will irrigate 102,000 acres)
- Phase-II - in district Bolan & Naseerabad (will irrigate 267,000 acres)
- Phase-III - in district Bolan, Naseerabad and Jhal Magsi (will irrigate 344,000 acres)

Phase 1 of the project was inaugurated by PM Shahid Khaqan Abbasi in September 2017<sup>114</sup>. Completion of this project will greatly improve the agriculture in province and greatly allay the feeling that other provinces especially Punjab has been exploiting the natural resources of province giving nothing in return. This will also help reduce the dependence of people on Sardars, with alternate means of earning and their abandoning the militant hideouts for rich farmlands.

### 3.3.7 Mirani Dam

This is another success story of WAPDA in Balochistan, the project was conceived in 1956 but work did not start until 2002 when President Gen Pervaiz Musharraf decided to build it. The ground-breaking was done in 2001 and the project commenced in 2002. It was completed in record time and inaugurated in 2006 by President Pervaiz Musharraf.<sup>115</sup> It is about 7 kilometres downstream of the confluence of two tributaries of Dasht river, Kech river and Nihing rivers which are seasonal rivers taking summer rains to the Indian Ocean. This project has been built to supply water to Turbat and Gwadar cities and irrigate about 33,000 acres of virgin land. This too has helped allay the feeling of deprivation of the people whose survival was at stake without the availability of fresh water.

---

<sup>113</sup> “Kacchi Canal Project. Pakistan Water and Power Development Authority”, <http://www.wapda.gov.pk/index.php/projects/water-sector/o-m/kachhi-canal-project>. Accessed 22 January 2019

<sup>114</sup> “Kacchi Cana”, *Dawn*, September 16, 2017, <https://www.dawn.com/news/1357874>

<sup>115</sup> <https://www.dawn.com/news/219361>

### 3.3.8 Drug Smuggling

Afghanistan is the leading poppy growing country of the world with 90% of world's heroin produced here. Only in 2017, the area under poppy growth has increased by 10% from 183,000 to 201,000 hectares. US and Afghan forces have failed to stop this upward trend due to their increasingly tenuous writ in rural areas. Taliban, warlords or other terrorist groups including ISIS control these areas. UN report all states that 60% of the Taliban finances are being met through drug production and transportation. 50% of Afghanistan's poppy is grown in Helmand province bordering Balochistan.<sup>116</sup> With this magnitude of heroin production in Afghanistan in general and Helmand in particular, its smuggling to Pakistan through porous border and transportation to the coastline cannot be virtually stopped. Pakistan's Chagai District borders Helmand and its city, Bramcha hosting a huge Afghan refugee camp is the centre of trade for opium in Balochistan. The opium and its derivatives are transported through Pakistan to Iran, Turkey and rest of the world. The areas hosting this multibillion international trade are controlled by drug lords, sardars, Afghan refugees or other notables and writ of government is denied by them in name of nationalism and religion. This assertion has been corroborated by a student of Naval Post Graduate college, Monterey California, Gregory D. Pipes in these words, 'Joining the mainstream politics of country means, giving up arms and strengthening the writ of state, which will lead to their loss of huge economic benefit, as nothing compares to income generated through drug trafficking. As a result, smugglers would be profoundly affected by Baloch integration. Therefore, the smuggling of drugs and guns provides a financial resource for the Baloch insurgency, props up involved Sardars, and reduces Baloch inclinations towards joining the Pakistani mainstream. It seems to answer the questions regarding the enhanced capabilities of the Baloch insurgency, especially with respect to advanced weapons. It also provides possible incentives to push the Baloch away from Islamabad.'<sup>117</sup>

---

<sup>116</sup> Noor Zahid, "Afghanistan's Deadly Poppy Harvest on the Rise Again", *Voice of America*, (May 16, 2017), <https://www.voanews.com/a/afghanistan-deadly-poppy-harvest-on-rise-again/3853575.html>. Accessed on 23 January 2019.

<sup>117</sup> Gregory D. Pipes, "The Baloch Pakistan Tensions: Problems of National Integration", *Naval Post Graduate College, Monterey, California*, 2010. <https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a518534.pdf>. Accessed on 24 January 2019.

### 3.3.9 Gwadar Deep Sea Port: Geo-Strategic Concerns

This probably is the biggest project in the history of the country, which can be a game changer for both Pakistan and Balochistan. The geo-strategic position of Pakistan can play a vital role in the future regional, geo-economic and geo-political outlook. Pakistan borders two regional powers, China and India, besides oil rich Iran and land locked US occupied Afghanistan and the Central Asia. Gwadar is a natural deep seaport which overlooks the Persian Gulf and the oil traffic of entire world. The area is hot bed of international intrigues and new Great Game is unfolding in this region, with stakes of all major and emerging powers. Gwadar when operational as an international seaport shall have significant ramifications for not only China which is heavily investing to seek a land route to Arabian Sea but for the Gulf countries also.

The potential of Gwadar was realised long before, when in 1964 the Government of Pakistan decided to transform Gwadar into a world class seaport. Later, in 1993, a technical and financial study was conducted on the construction of Gwadar Port, which endorsed that Gwadar, having a significant geo-strategic position, may become vital for regional trade. The construction of the port commenced in March 2002<sup>118</sup>, when it was handed over to the Port Authority of Singapore (PSA). The first phase of the project was completed in December 2006 and the port was inaugurated by then President, General Pervez Musharraf in March 2007. ‘Musharraf hoped it would bring financial independence to people and empower them, keep the troublemakers out, and serve as the precursor of another enormous economic opportunity- a trade corridor for Central Asia, particularly for its oil and gas. The dissident sardars rose up in arms in an effort to destroy the project and its profound impact on Balochistan’s economy for fear of losing their hold on the people. In a sustained campaign, aided and abetted by outside interests opposed to Gwadar port, fears were expressed that this was an effort to colonize Balochistan, Gwadar’<sup>119</sup>. Following the failure of the PSA to make the port operational, the construction of the port was handed over to a state-run Chinese firm, China Overseas Port Holding Company (COPHC) in 2013.

---

<sup>118</sup> Farooq Yousaf, “Gwadar Port: Chinese Acquisition, Indian Concerns and its Future Prospects”, *APSA- Spotlight South Asia*. October, 2013, <https://crss.pk/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/SSA-10.pdf>. Accessed on 25 January 2019.

<sup>119</sup> Shahid R. Siddiqi, “Why Insurgency in Balochistan Cannot Succeed”, *Foreign Policy Journal*. 30 May 2010, accessed January 25, 2019, <https://www.foreignpolicyjournal.com/2010/03/30/why-insurgency-in-balochistan-cannot-succeed>.

The Salient Features of Gwadar Port are as under;

- Gwadar Port will enable exploitation of vast exclusive economic zone spread over an area of approximately 180,000 sq. km along Makran coast.<sup>120</sup>
- A deep-water channel more than 14 km long will permit large vessels to anchor and could potentially woo away the transit trade from neighbouring port cities.
- The port will provide an alternative trans-shipment facility for both West and East bound cargoes and oil shipments, which, so far originate from Dubai or Salalah ports
- Pakistan with its modern transit facilities, seaports and long-distance pipelines networks would also supplement development efforts of the SAARC countries. Pakistan can provide the transit routes to the SAARC countries.
- Gwadar is farthest from India and therefore, provides strategic depth against any attack. Because of this distance from Pakistan's eastern neighbour, it also provides more warning time against air and naval threat.
- It offers natural protection against weather.
- It is more suitable for capitalising on trade opportunities with energy rich Iran and the Caspian Region.
- Gwadar Port, being a gateway to the Persian Gulf at the Strait of Hormuz, will offer various harbour services like showcasing and storage of sea resources, shipment, trans-shipment, and manufacturing conveniences for regional and extra-regional key players, as well as for UAE, Gulf States and European nations.
- Manufacturing conveniences for regional and extra-regional key players, as well as for UAE, Gulf States and European nations.
- Once desired infrastructure, services and facilities are made available at Gwadar Port, it will also be a port of choice for transshipment of cargo to and from a number of countries. It's ideal location in relation to international Sea Lines of Communication (SLOC), natural deep-sea water port and quick turnaround will attract larger vessels to offload their cargo for further transshipment to the countries in the Persian Gulf and the littoral states of north Arabian Sea.

---

<sup>120</sup> Mir Sherbaz Khetran, "The Potential and Prospects of Gwadar Port", Strategic Studies, accessed 23 April, 2019, [http://www.issi.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Sherbaz\\_3435\\_SS\\_41\\_20142015.pdf](http://www.issi.org.pk/wp-content/uploads/2015/12/Sherbaz_3435_SS_41_20142015.pdf) .

- The construction of the port has prompted other major infrastructure projects in the area. This includes the 700 km Makran Coastal Highway which has now been completed.
- Other road projects include the Gwadar-Quetta-Chaman road and the Gwadar-Panjgur and Khuzdar road which is being constructed by Frontier Works Organization (FWO).
- This will greatly facilitate trade and transportation from Gwadar Port to Quetta, and further to Afghanistan and Central Asian Republics.
- The construction of the roads will also benefit upcountry logistics as a 100 km link from Basima to Khuzdar will connect it with the Indus Highway and complete the access of Pakistan-China Economic Corridor's western route from Gwadar to Khunjerab.

Areas under the Khan of Kalat and other Khanates were least developed at the time of Independence as compared to British Balochistan (Quetta and other Pashtun majority areas) and owing legacy of the feudal system, through A and B areas, the curse of oppression of masses has continued to this day. These areas are least developed socio-economically and politically. This vicious circle has given birth to feeling of deprivation, initiated by feudals and being exploited by all vested interests. The same interest groups viciously oppose mega projects as these can reverse the deplorable state of masses and take them away from their clutches. An educated youth independent in its thinking and economic survival could be menacing for their hold over them. Ironically, Federation has been a silent bystander when ethnic cleansing of non-Baloch people started here leading to their mass exodus, little covered by media or international watch dogs.

A retrospective study reveals that maximum reforms for Balochistan, started during the period of President Musharraf, namely, coastal highway, Gwadar Port, Mirani Dam, Kachhi canal, introduction of basic democracy neutralizing role of Sardars, abolition of B areas and merger of levies into police. It is a plain fact that development in Balochistan will remain elusive, until basic land reforms, abolition of B areas and merger of Levies is not undertaken. Multibillion-dollar drug trade from Afghanistan to Pakistan bolsters incentive to keep these areas out of state writ for continuation of the huge economic advantage to select few. This needs to be taken care of involving international stake holders. Besides mega projects, there is an urgent need to address the education, health, justice and socio development at grass roots levels. At the same time,

border control and management at Pak-Afghan and Pak-Iran border has to be ensured to prevent free movement of drugs, weapons and terrorists. Fencing of border and recent checks initiated at Chaman border are steps in right direction.



## CHAPTER 4

### ROLE OF FOREIGN POWERS IN BALOCHISTAN

Balochistan has been a hot bed for international intrigues ever since its merger with Pakistan. This interest was invoked owing its geo - strategic location, size and mineral wealth. Off course the dis-satisfied fuedals, masses and weak writ of government, helped fuel the negative tendencies. Geo-strategic importance of Balochistan can never be over emphasised, with it bordering US occupied Afghanistan, oil rich Iran and long coastline at the mouth of Gulf. Its 42% land mass of Pakistan hosts immense mineral resources. During the period of Cold war, it was influenced by Soviet Union's attraction for warm waters through its proxy Afghanistan. It also acted as safe conduit for harbouring insurgency against Iran by countries like Iraq.

It came under sharp focus of US in the aftermath of 9/11 because of suspected Quetta Shura of Taliban in Balochistan and US efforts to cultivate its own eyes and ears through anti-Pakistan Baloch nationalists with safe havens in Afghanistan. Balochistan was catapulted to international focus recently because of significance of Gwadar to regional and international players and Pak-China's, CPEC accord and its implications especially for USA, India, Gulf and Iran. The chapter would highlight geo-political importance of Balochistan and role of international powers in its current challenges and opportunities.

#### 4.1 **Historical Perspective: Recovery of Arms Cache in Iraqi Embassy**

Shahid Saeed narrated the story of recovery of Arms Cache in Iraqi Embassy, will commenting in blog of Pakistan Politics, on March 6, 2011. He stated that it was in February 1973, when under full media blaze, the house of Iraqi consulate was raided to recover a huge cache of arms<sup>121</sup>. At this time National Awami Party (NAP) had government both in NWFP and Balochistan, Prime Minister Bhutto alleged that the weapons were meant to trigger instability in Balochistan, and this was being done by NAP, backed by Soviet Union through Iraq. Some even believed that weapons were meant for Baloch separatists living in Iran and basically had nothing to do with Pakistan. This happened immediately after some trouble in Pat Feeder Canal, and Bugti tribesmen threatening to walk into Quetta against the provincial government. The Jam of

---

<sup>121</sup> Shahid Saeed, commented on Pakistan Politics, "Arms Cache in Iraqi Embassy in Islamabad 1973", the Pakpolitis Blog, (March 6, 2011), <https://discuss.pkpolitics.com/topic/13532/arms-cache-in-iraqi-embassy-in-islamabad-1973>

Lasbela, Samad Achackzai and Nawab Akbar Khan Bugti had also voiced concerns over proliferation of arms in the province, demanding federal government to interfere. Bhutto made this an excuse to sack NAP government in both provinces and urged USA to help Pakistan against Soviet conspiracies for fuelling insurgencies. Recently declassified papers of US State Department released in 2007 state that Soviet complicity was not proven in this incident. However, Iraq's effort to support Pakistani and Iranian Baloch dissidents for anti-state activities does prove foreign hand in Balochistan as early as 1973.<sup>122</sup>

#### 4.2 Soviet Union / Russia

Soviet Union's intervention in Pakistan dates back to seventies, and creation of Bangladesh was its clear manifestation, when it openly supported India for vivisection of Pakistan. Syed F. Hasnat alleged that during the Soviet–Afghan War (1979–1989), the Soviet Union helped establish the Balochistan Liberation Army which chiefly operates from southern Afghanistan<sup>123</sup>. During the period of Soviet occupation of Afghanistan, it was feared that Soviet Union with the help of Baloch guerrilla force would advance up to the Arabian Sea and accomplish its dream of access to war waters. The Soviets however, did not have much trust in the capability of Baloch insurgents to do this. Instead they focussed on infusing Marxist ideology in the Baloch leaders for an ideological takeover, Sardar Khair Bakhsh Marri was especially motivated and supported by Soviet Union.<sup>124</sup> They helped many such leaders financially and educated their families and children in Soviet Union to impart the soviet ideology. Russian hand in the current insurgency however has not been proven.

#### 4.3 Afghanistan

History proves that no other country supported insurgencies in Pakistan as vehemently as Kabul, irrespective of fact it was being used as a proxy or not. It has so far supported all the insurgencies in Balochistan, beginning with the first one in which Abdul Karim, the brother of

---

<sup>122</sup> “The Iraqi Arms Caper and The Larger Picture”, *Declassified Papers of US State Department*, October 11, 2007, accessed January 27, 2019, <https://2001-2009.state.gov/documents/organization/97518.pdf>.

<sup>123</sup> Syed F Hasnat, “Insurgency in Balochistan”, accessed January 25, 2019, [https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Insurgency\\_in\\_Balochistan#CITEREFHasnat2011](https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Insurgency_in_Balochistan#CITEREFHasnat2011)

<sup>124</sup> Gregory D Pipes, “The Baloch – Islamabad Tensions: Problems of National Integration” (Thesis, Naval Postgraduate School Monterey California, 2010) accessed January 10, 2019, P-48 <https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a518534.pdf>

Khan of Kalat revolted against the state of Pakistan. While in Afghanistan he garnered support of both Afghanistan and Moscow to wage this war. He was arrested but on his release from jail, he launched the second Baloch insurgency, using Afghanistan as a base. ‘The third insurgency saw the most direct support from Kabul. Mohammad Daud, the Prime Minister of Afghanistan, permitted the Pararis, a large group of Baloch rebels, to establish two camps on the Afghanistan-Pakistan border. While labelled “refugee camps,” the Pararis utilized them as their insurgent headquarters. As part of his pacification of the Baloch, Zia extended amnesty to the Baloch rebels living in Afghanistan, thereby allowing their return to Pakistan.<sup>125</sup>

Baloch insurgency got a fillip in the wake of 9/11 when US / NATO forces moved to this place. Afghanistan encouraged Pakistan hostile foreign powers to spread spy network through their consulates and helped establish staging camps of Baloch insurgents within its territory. Over recently there is news that NDS (National Directorate of Security) has brought about a unification of Baloch insurgents and ISIS for terrorism activities in Pakistan. It now directs and plans all acts of terrorism inside Balochistan, with different militant groups accepting responsibility. This fact has been corroborated by different sources, both official and private but security reasons constrain mentioning their names.

The Afghanistan’s interest in Balochistan is not without its strategic concerns. Balochistan is also home to Pashtuns who are historically, socially and economically bound with Pashtuns in Afghanistan. It is also a fact that Ahmad Shah Durrani, ruler of Afghanistan had his rule extended to state of Kalat until 17<sup>th</sup> Century. Afghans have always lamented the Durand Line imposed by British in late 19<sup>th</sup> Century and loss of big Afghan territories to United India and later to Pakistan. Afghanistan believes that separation of Balochistan from Pakistan, can possibly result in its absorption by Afghanistan, making it accessible to Indian Ocean. ‘In 1978, the Afghan Prime Minister Hafizullah Amin said that the Durand Line “tore us apart” and that, “we will do our historical duty when the time is right.” As a result of this commitment to the Afghan interpretation of the Afghan-Pakistan border, Amin said that the “Baloch nationalist movement is very dear to us”.<sup>126</sup>

The successive Afghan regimes, even Taliban who rose to power with Pakistan’s help, opposed Durand Line. Fed up with infiltrations from Afghanistan, Pakistan has recently decided to erect

---

<sup>125</sup> Ibid., 19.

<sup>126</sup> Ibid., 57.

fence all along the porous Duran Line. This is being vehemently opposed by all forces across the border, and many physical and fire raids have been carried out against our LEAs to frustrate the effort.

#### 4.4 **India**

India has always supported forces in Afghanistan, averse to Pakistan. It supported the insurgency of 1973 to replicate the East Pakistan model here. This was done in cooperation with its traditional ally Soviet Union. During the rise of Taliban, following Soviet withdrawal, India supported the Northern Alliance to hold sway over areas in the North and kept Taliban from ruling this area. After 9/11, Northern Alliance and India provided a safe bridgehead to US forces to invade Taliban and spread their rule to entire country. With Northern Alliance or pro-US Pashtuns in helm of affairs ever since 9/11, India enjoyed complete freedom of action in Afghanistan in collaboration with NDS, US forces and CIA. Pakistan lost complete sway over affairs in Afghanistan, despite its huge sacrifices rendered in supporting Soviet withdrawal. Similarly, the hosting of about 5 million refugees and proliferation of gun and drug culture as a result went unheeded. India was gifted with the opportunity to present two front conflicts to state of Pakistan, conventionally from East and through its proxies from West. It wasted no time in supporting all anti-Pakistan elements, to create turmoil in FATA, Balochistan and rest of Pakistan, pinning down huge military forces in this low intensity conflict. The most vicious being the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP), Lashkar-e-Jhangvi an anti-Shia group and supporting almost all Baloch militant groups, namely, BLA, BRF, and LeB etc.

It created quasi diplomatic missions, through its consulates all along the Afghan – Pakistan border to provide logistic support to these groups. Pakistan raised this matter many times to US, UN and India but it was brushed away as a myth, on pretext of no concrete evidence given. “Secretary of State Hillary Clinton asserted that there is no evidence of India’s involvement in Balochistan despite Pakistani allegations”<sup>127</sup>. This assertion was widely spread to make a mockery of Pakistan’s allegations and world turned a deaf ear, not realising how the insurgency can be sustained for this long against a state, without outside support. This assertion proved wrong when in the conference of Non-Aligned Nations in 2009 in Egypt, Prime Minister of

---

<sup>127</sup> Hillary Clinton, "No Proof of Indian Involvement in Balochistan: Hillary to Pak", *The Economic Times*, (November 2, 2009).

Pakistan, Syed Yousaf Raza Gilani met with his India counterpart, Prime Minister Manmohan Singh and India agreed to re-consider its interventions in Balochistan. This implied tacit acceptance by India of its involvement in Balochistan.<sup>128</sup>

The insurgents were equipped with latest arms and highly trained to be destructive, yet elusive. Thanks to apprehension of a serving Indian naval officer, Kulbhushan Sudhir Jadhav, on 3 March 2016, from Mashke near the border region of Chaman that this myth was broken. He was in possession of a fake passport with fake name and had visited Pakistan over 17 times for sponsoring sabotage, subversion and terrorism. He disclosed that he was involved in financially supporting militants and was involved in Karachi's unrest. Interrogation also reportedly revealed that naval combat training was being conferred to Baloch separatists, in an attempt to target the ports of Gwadar and Karachi. Pakistani authorities stated that Jadhav, during his interrogation, gave details about his funding, and plans to destabilise the country. This proved beyond an iota of doubt the Pakistani claim that India was behind spate of terrorism in Pakistan, especially Balochistan. Ironically, India denied his involvement and US, India's strategic partner and partner in crime remained tight lipped. India sought his release from International court of Justice, but Pakistan has submitted the complete and irrefutable evidence of his involvement.

Some defend India's involvement in Balochistan, saying that any instability in the region would jeopardize Turkmenistan Afghanistan Pakistan India (TAPI) and Iran Pakistan India (IPI) gas pipelines, therefore it's against Indian interest to meddle in affairs of Balochistan. However, they fail to appreciate that India has already wriggled out of IPI to appease US and TAPI remains a far cry with more than 70% of Afghanistan lacking government writ. Indian interest in Balochistan can be summarised as under;

- Stoking trouble in Balochistan, create a tit for tat situation in parallel to occupied Kashmir, making Pakistan withdraw support of Kashmiris in return for peace in Balochistan.
- Present Baloch cause to world as a justified struggle for freedom, giving it legitimacy through United Nations and comity of nations. In this wake, it has successfully involved many US senators funding their election campaigns. Almost all Baloch dissidents, sardar Javed Mengal, Brahumdagh Bugti, Balach Marri and Doctor Allah Nazar are on its pay role, presenting Baloch cause to the world.

---

<sup>128</sup> Reuters, "TEXT - India, Pakistan Prime Ministers' Joint Statement," *Reuters India*, July 16, 2009.

- Exaggerate and disseminate narrative that Pakistan Army is involved in serious human rights violations through extra judicial killings and responsible for missing persons. Malign the Army and Pakistani state in the eyes of Baloch people. For this, it has Pakistani politicians like Sardar Akhtar Mengal on its side to spread the narrative. His six-point agenda is ripe with vested Indian interests. Ironically even the present PTI government has forged an alliance with BNP (M) of Sardar Akhtar Mengal at federal level to sustain marginal majority in the National Assembly and Senate and keep giving assurances to BNP(M) without much conviction.
- India is energy starved country and desperately needs access to cheap energy and its sustained supply. For this it has developed cordial relations with Iran and undertaken to build Chahbahar Port at the mouth of Gulf with road infra structure leading to Central Asian States. Competing with China for access to CARs energy resources it wants to keep Balochistan unstable and establish its foothold in CARs earlier than maturity of CPEC and Gwadar Port.
- Unrest in Balochistan and FATA has pinned down bulk of Pakistan's military. This has seriously cut down Pakistan's limited offensive capability against India. A sustained low intensity conflict in Balochistan and FATA, with possible aggression from Afghanistan – a two front war situation, allows great advantage to India militarily.
- Loss of Balochistan, denies strategic depth to Pakistan's nuclear forces. This not only allows great advantage to India but also makes Israel safe from any perceived misadventure by Pakistan. This commonality of interests can justify depriving Pakistan of Balochistan by many vested interests.
- India with its Blue Water Navy considers itself as hegemonic power in the region. Gwadar Port allows depth to Pakistan's Navy, menacingly close to international sea lanes and India's energy supply line. 'India's naval chief, Admiral Sureesh Mehta, said that Gwadar could be used by Pakistan to "take control over the world energy jugular"<sup>129</sup>..
- To make matters worse, Pakistan has entered into a strategic partnership with China over building of Gwadar Port and CPEC. Indians also fear possible use of Gwadar by Chinese

---

<sup>129</sup> Gregory D Pipes, "The Baloch – Islamabad Tensions: Problems of National Integration" (Thesis, Naval Postgraduate School Monterey California, 2010) accessed January 10, 2019, P - 48 <https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a518534.pdf%20-%20research%20paper%20on%20Balochistan%20by%20Naval%20Postgraduate%20college>

naval forces, seriously endangering Indian interests in the Arabian Sea. This concern is shared by US also and promotes convergence of strategic efforts to foment trouble in Balochistan. At the eve of launching development project for eight nuclear powered attack submarines, Indian Naval Chief, Admiral Sunil Lanba, justified the security threat to India, through presence of Chinese Naval Ships at Gwadar saying, "It will be a security challenge. We will have to look at it and mitigate"<sup>130</sup>.

- In case of blockade of both Strait of Hormuz and Strait of Malacca GCC countries and Iran can continue uninterrupted supply of oil and gas to China and Pakistan. This strategic liberty negates advantage of Blue water Navy of both India and US.

#### 4.5 United States

The US interest in the region has been 'on' and 'off' repeatedly. Balochistan was used as a base against Soviet occupation of Afghanistan in eighties but then fell to oblivion following the Soviet withdrawal and its disintegration. 9/11 catapulted Balochistan to centre stage owing ease of conducting spy missions against Afghanistan and Iran from its bordering region, logistic lifeline for US forces in Afghanistan through Chaman and for keeping an eye on alleged Quetta Shura of Taliban. Pakistan allowed its air space to US in the wake of 9/11 and offered ground bases to CIA for operating its Predator Squadrons. One such base was Shamsi in Kharan District. US presence in the province, allowed US direct access to locals who were used by them for security of their bases, protection of NATO supplies from Karachi to Chaman and to track and target Quetta Shura of Taliban. Since many anti – Pakistan Baloch militants had bases in Afghanistan, so their employment by US cannot be ruled out.

US is also wary of the growing Pak-China partnership and any instability in the area to thwart CPEC can serve its interests. Ironically, US has always downplayed Pakistan's allegation of Indian involvement in Balochistan and paid no heed to our diplomatic efforts in this regard. Instability in Balochistan and neighbouring Baloch regions of Iran for creation of greater Balochistan serves interests of both US and Israel.

US Congressman Dana Rohrabacher introduced a resolution in the US House of Representatives asking Pakistan to recognise the Baloch right to self-determination. This motion was co-

---

<sup>130</sup> Times of Islamabad, 'Chinese warships at Gwadar Port in future are national security threat to India: Indian Navy Chief', Times of Islamabad, December 1, 2017, accessed February 17, 2019. <https://timesofislamabad.com/01-Dec-2017/chinese-warships-at-gwadar-port-in-future-are-national-security-threat-to-india-indian-navy-chief>

sponsored by House Representatives Louie Gohmert and Steve King. They held Federal Government of Pakistan, responsible for all the insurgencies of Balochistan, its economic exploitation and violation of human rights. They asserted, though ironically, that US is supporter of human rights all over the world, and should support creation of a sovereign country for Baloch people living in Iran, Afghanistan and Pakistan. Our foreign office rightly called it a shameful intervention in our internal affairs and far from truth.<sup>131</sup> This narrative of US congressman was strongly condemned by our foreign office and Pakistani diaspora in US. The force behind the US congressman is strong Indian community and their support to US congressmen in their election campaigns. The US state office totally neglects Pakistan's concerns of Indian consulates in Afghanistan and turns blind eye to their anti-Pakistan activities. US also downplays Pakistan's allegation about the number of Indian consulates and their anti-Pakistan agenda.<sup>132</sup>

#### 4.6 Iran

Iran views Balochistan as a region offering both opportunities and posing challenges. Jundallah (Arabic: جندالله, lit. 'Soldiers of God', with its alleged bases in bordering region of Pakistan is a sunni militant organisation. It is also known as People's Resistance Movement of Iran (PRMI), and it operates in Balochistan and neighbouring Sistan Balochistan region of Iran. It has claimed to have killed hundreds of Iranian soldiers and Shia Muslims. It was founded by Abdolmalek Rigi, who was captured and executed in Iran in 2010<sup>133</sup>. It is believed that Saddam Hussain created this group and supported them with arms and ammunition. Even the disclosure of arms cache in Iraqi Embassy is linked in some way to Jundallah. Iran claims that it is supported by US, Israel and Pakistan. However, Pakistan has vehemently denied any involvement in it. In fact, the bordering region of Mand is infested with all types of militant bases including those of BLF. It is also suspected that Dr Allah Nazar, who is head of BLF is

---

<sup>131</sup> Huma Imtiaz, "US Congressman Tables Bill for Baloch Right to Independence", *The Express Tribune*, February 18, 2012, accessed February 17, 2019, <https://tribune.com.pk/story/338079/us-congressman-tables-resolution-calling-for-independence-of-baloch/>.

<sup>132</sup> Gregory D Pipes, "The Baloch – Islamabad Tensions: Problems of National Integration" (Thesis, Naval Postgraduate School Monterey California, 2010) accessed January 10, 2019, P – 50. <https://apps.dtic.mil/dtic/tr/fulltext/u2/a518534.pdf%20-%20research%20paper%20on%20Balochistan%20by%20Naval%20Postgraduate%20college>

<sup>133</sup> "Jundallah (PRIM)", *Terrorism Research and Analysis Consortium*, accessed February 17, 2019. <https://www.trackingterrorism.org/group/jundallah-prmi>



based in Iran and tacitly supported by Iran. Kulbhushan Jadhav, the captured India naval officer has confessed to have been operating from Chah Bahar, a port in Iran, bordering Pakistan.

Iran views Gwadar as challenge to its writ in Persian Gulf and may have tried to undermine the development of Gwadar in competition to Chah Bahar. Chah Bahar is being developed with cooperation of India and Afghanistan and here one does find commonality of interests between India and Iran for a relative instability in Balochistan. This concern off course cannot be accepted at diplomatic level and Iran's ambassador to Pakistan Mehdi Honerdoost, while addressing a forum at Institute of Strategic Studies in Islamabad (ISSI) on 27 May, 2016, stated, 'Chabahar Port agreement between Iran, India and Afghanistan is "not finished" and "not limited to these three countries."<sup>134</sup> He said that both are sister ports and not in competition with each other. At the same time, one cannot ignore fact that peace and stability in Balochistan will help overcome bases of Jundallah from Pakistan and offer Iran immense opportunities of trade with China through CPEC.

#### 4.7 China

China is involved since long in mineral projects of Balochistan; Chinese companies are working on Saindak Copper and Gold mines since 1970. China Metallurgical Group Corporation is still working here with its contract renewed in 2017 for another 5 years. China was entrusted with the development of Gwadar Port in 2002 and over recently the operation of the Gwadar Port has also been given to Chinese firm, Chinese Overseas Port Holding Company (COPHC).<sup>135</sup> CPEC the flag ship of China's One Belt One Road initiative has increased our cooperation to strategic levels and projected the geo-strategic and geo-economic importance of Balochistan manifold.

CPEC has emerged as a win – win situation for both China and Pakistan, because of very similar situation in Balochistan and Xingiang province until some time back. China's Xingiang province occupies 56 per cent of the country's land mass and 23 per cent of its population. It was prone to separatism and extremism due to its Muslim population and was least developed economically, plunging it into vicious circle of backwardness and deprivation. China invested heavily in this western region of Xinjiang and it boasted a trade of \$ 33 billion in 2013 as compared to \$ 22.8

---

<sup>134</sup> Mateen Haider, "Chabahar not a rival to Gwadar, Iranian Envoy tells Pakistan", *Dawn* (May 27, 2016), accessed February 16, 2019. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1261006>

<sup>135</sup> Farooq Yousaf, "Gwadar Port: Chinese Acquisition, Indian Concerns and Its Future Prospects", APSA, October, 2013, accessed February 17, 2019. <https://crss.pk/wp-content/uploads/2013/10/SSA-10.pdf>

billion the previous year. Chinese investment in this region has swelled to \$ 70 billion in 2018.<sup>136</sup> Similarly, its GDP rose to \$ 130 billion a year, an increase of 12 per cent. This region is nearest to Gwadar for exports to the rest of world in comparison to Chinese ports. Gulf oil has to go through 14,500 kilometres to reach Xinjiang province in China through the traditional Strait of Malacca route. First it takes 10,000 kilometres through sea and then 4500 kilometres by almost whole of the Chinese land. Gwadar is expected to curtail the total distance by almost 11,500 kilometres in total even if the distance between Oman and Gwadar port is included. It would be only 2500 kilometres from Gwadar to Xinjiang (See Annex-IX). It is not only cost effective but also safe and secure in comparison to the maritime route. Moreover, China's 60 per cent energy requirements are met from the Persian Gulf. Gwadar reduces the distance by several thousand km even for eastern China once the oil pipeline from Gwadar to China materializes.

The Government of Pakistan and Chinese commitment will lead to a large-scale sea-borne trade and make Pakistan an investment centre for the region and the world at large. The proposed Gwadar-Xinjiang energy pipeline would provide a safe, secure and cheaper energy supply to China bypassing the Strait of Malacca.

Though China has large volume of trade with GCC countries, it is obvious that the increasing energy and global strategic needs compel China to work on alternatives and rely on diversified trading partners as well. China meets 80% of its energy needs through imports. China has overtaken Germany as Iran's third largest trading partner. Sinopec acquired a 50 percent share in Iran's Yadavaran oilfield and in 2004 it concluded a deal estimated between \$70-100 billion to buy Iranian crude oil and natural gas over 30 years.<sup>137</sup> More recent deals have included a \$1.76 billion deal to develop Iran's North Azadegan oil field<sup>138</sup> and a \$3.2 billion gas deal signed in March 2009 to build and transport liquid gas line from the South Pars Gas Field.

However, Chinese presence close to Gulf and Strait of Hormuz is of great strategic worry for the US and India. They fear that their interests in the energy-rich Middle East and Central Asian Republic (CARs) are threatened. This would also bring China into competition with India and

---

<sup>136</sup> "Xinjiang to invest \$70 billion in infrastructure in 2018", *China Daily*, January 7, 2018, accessed February 17, 2019. <http://www.chinadaily.com.cn/a/201801/07/WS5a51bf96a31008cf16da58c5.html>

<sup>137</sup> Paresa Hafezi, "Iran, China's Sinopec Sign oil-field Deal", *Reuters*, December 9, 2007, accessed February 15, 2019.

<https://www.reuters.com/article/us-iran-china-oil/iran-chinas-sinopec-sign-oil-field-deal-idUSBLA92867220071209>

<sup>138</sup> "China's CNPC to Take Oil from Iranian Fields it owns as Normal", *Reuters*, November 9, 2018, accessed February 15, 2019. <https://www.reuters.com/article/us-china-iran-sanctions-waiver/chinas-cnpc-to-take-oil-from-iranian-fields-it-owns-as-normal-idUSKCN1NE09V>

the US as both these countries would resist Chinese presence in the Indian Ocean. Moreover, keeping in view the Iran's uncomfortable relations with GCC countries the strengthening trade and business ties of China with Iran are matter of concern for GCC countries.

Pakistan is and would bear the brunt for this new Great Game. Attack on Chinese Consulate on 23 November 2018 was claimed by BLA.<sup>139</sup> The same day another suicide attack in Orakzai Agency in which about 32 civilians were killed was claimed by ISIS. The synchronization amply proves that the master mind is the same for planning both attacks claimed by two different terrorist groups. Pakistan police has claimed that the type of explosive used in attack on Chinese consulate was of Indian origin. An FIR was lodged against Hyrbyair Marri and 12 others.<sup>140</sup> It may be known that Hyrbyair Marri head of BLA is enjoying asylum in UK. It also puts to test the moral principles of UK in harbouring terrorists on its soil. This, however, makes China an equal stake holder in the security and development of this region, a positive outcome of this strategic partnership.

#### 4.8 Gulf Cooperation Countries

In GCC region Saudi Arabia is largest oil producer and exporter and it would prefer to diversify its market, reducing its dependence on the Europe and USA. Gwadar offers one possible outlet for Saudi oil to China. It is probably in this wake that Saudi Arabia has over recently expressed willingness to establish a US \$ 8 Billion oil refinery in Gwadar and an MOU has been signed with the Government of Pakistan.<sup>141</sup> China has raised no objection to the project despite fact that it was initially assigned to China. This obviously is a good omen for Pakistan to diversify investment in CPEC projects and increase stake holders in its security and investment.

UAE and Oman however, may view Gwadar as a rival port and may not be keen in its development and operations. This is owing fact that when fully developed it can offer transshipment facilities inside the Persian Gulf, a trade jealously guarded by Salala and Dubai (Sketch attached as Annex-X amply highlights the importance of Gwadar vis-à-vis GCC region).

---

<sup>139</sup> "Attack on Chinese Consulate in Karachi planned in Afghanistan with Support of Indian Agency", *Dawn*, January 11, 2019, accessed February 14, 2019. <https://www.dawn.com/news/1456906>

<sup>140</sup> "BLA Chief Hyrbyair Marri, 12 others booked for Chinese Consulate Attack", *The Express Tribune*, (November 24, 2018), accessed February 12, 2019. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1853649/1-baloch-leader-harbiyar-among-13-booked-chinese-consulate-attack/>

<sup>141</sup> "Talks with Saudi Arabia on \$ 8 billion Gwadar Refinery in Final Stages", *Dawn*, (October 4, 2018).

With no concrete evidence available it may just be a coincidence that majority of anti-Pakistan nationalist leaders, have Dubai as a second home, Sardar Akhtar Mengal being a case in point. Many terrorists nabbed had satellite telephones in possession (Thuraya Sets) with numbers registered in Dubai.

The Gulf's main gas exporters, UAE (Abu Dhabi and Qatar) channel their exports through the Strait in liquid form (liquefied natural gas- LNG). Currently, no pipelines exist in the Arabian Gulf to export gas outside the GCC – although the Dolphin Pipeline transports Qatari LNG to the UAE, also connecting across the border into Oman. Seeing Kingdom of Saudi Arabia's interest in establishing oil refinery, states like the UAE and Qatar may like to establish LNG terminals in Gwadar or extend pipeline through it.

Foreign intervention in Balochistan is as old as the history of Pakistan, with Afghanistan providing haven to sub-nationalist militant elements. Afghanistan has done this unabated whether it had political independence or when it was under occupation of Soviet or US forces. The only respite we had was during the brief period of Taliban rule. With no writ of government and US forces in areas outside urban centres, militants can survive with or without the state backing. The fact that militancy in Balochistan has survived this long against a state with all its resources, bespeaks of a strong backing. Latest weapons, hard core training and elusive nature of terrorists are clear proof of their foreign patronisation. It will not be wrong to assume that undermining Pakistan's claim of foreign sponsorship by US and West, makes them partners in crime. Ironically, despite apprehension of Indian serving naval officer, red handed, no country has condemned India and Afghanistan. Most of the hard-core terrorists are running militancy in Pakistan enjoying political asylum in West. Brahumdagh Bugti lives in Switzerland, Sardar Javed Mengal and Hyrbyair Marri in UK. Dr Allah Nazar, heading BLF is claimed to be living in Sistan-o-Balochistan area of Iran. These countries claim to be stalwarts against terrorism and extremism in the world but turn blind eye to activities of these people. Moreover, the research also revealed that most of the anti-Pakistan and pro independent Balochistan web sites are hosted from India, Afghanistan and the West. This cannot be a mere coincidence.

The influence of these vested international interests is also exemplified in the rhetoric of Human right commissions, which hypocritically cry wolf over missing persons in Balochistan but make

no mention of thousands of settlers who have migrated to other provinces owing atrocities by militants and neither do they highlight killings of LEAs, Hazaras and settlers by these militant outfits. This is despite fact that Justice Javed Iqbal as head of commission has declared hoax, the toll claim of thousands of missing persons in Balochistan. These NGO's and UN even fail to see what is happening in occupied Kashmir.

The recent spate of terrorism especially in Makran region is directly targeted at CPEC and Pakistan – China's strategic interests and goals. India along with its allies is sponsoring this. Attack on Chinese consulate on 23 November 2018 by BLA and by ISIS in Orakzai Agency on the same day, amply prove that the master mind is same and averse to peace and development of Pakistan. The presence of Indian origin explosive used in Consulate attack further exposes the hitherto fore hidden hands. We have to seriously look for macro administrative reforms to bring about a paradigm change in the current socio- political setup, dividing Balochistan into more manageable units and devolving power to the lowest level for empowerment of people rather than the feudals. This issue shall be covered in the next chapter.

## **CHAPTER 5**

### **CONSTITUTIONAL AND ADMINISTRATIVE REFORMS**

Balochistan is plagued by administrative inequalities, unmanageable land and people, strong feeling of deprivation accentuated by Sardars with vested interests, huge economic potential untapped owing security concerns and mala fide intentions of those at helm of affairs. This is accentuated by hostile international powers, drug mafia, incompetent federal and provincial setups and a highly negative media ready to sell anything given the right price. With host of problems like this, no quick fixes are possible. A holistic or strategic management of the province is needed seeing through all its micro and macro problems and binding it irrevocably to the mainstream. Balochistan is part and parcel of our chequered history, biggest political challenge and yet our hope for future. This chapter will highlight implications of its large size and dilution in space of the little financial inflow. The province has to be geographically manageable with devolution of power to make it progressive and strengthening its integrity to mainland. This may seem odd to some, but future of province lies in its administrative division and devolution of power to the lowest strata.

#### **5.1 The Size of Province: Administrative Division**

Balochistan constitutes almost 43% of Pakistan and is most sparsely populated owing to its arid, mountainous terrain and little livelihood available. The population is cantered to few big towns and small villages where some business activity is generated, or source of water is available respectively. Colossal corruption of its political leaders notwithstanding, the little funds spared for masses are diluted in huge space making no difference in the lives of people. They continue to plunge deeper and deeper into this abyss of illiteracy and social exploitation, remaining at the mercy of their feudal lords. This vicious circle cannot be circumvented without administrative reforms to create more units. This model has been tried out by carving out more districts, but the motive behind this was drawing political mileage of its leaders rather than any sincere effort to develop the area and its people. Federal Minister for information, Mr. Fawad Choudhary tweeted that Rs 1500 Billion were transferred to Balochistan from national kitty in last 10 years

and this amount does not include provincial taxes collected by the province.<sup>142</sup> Very little of this money is visible in form of developmental projects and the bulk of it has been swindled by its feudals turned political leaders. With this level of corruption in the provincial political system, Federation has to intervene, undertaking mega projects and bringing about administrative reforms.

Syed Farooq Hasnat in his book, *'The System of Federation in Pakistan: Constitutional Provisions for Decentralization'* stated that "in some countries, the Federation of decentralization is created purely on the basis of administrative divisions. While in others a nation is decentralized on the criteria of either racial or linguistic considerations. Pakistan being a multi ethnic country carries with itself both the considerations, namely, the establishment of a provincial setup based on ethnic as well as administrative efficiency."<sup>143</sup> Many countries in South Asian region have created more administrative units to manage better the people and resources. India is administratively divided into twenty-eight states and seven union territories; the states and territories are themselves further subdivided. India has divided all states into smaller units which presented any threat to the integrity of the country, like Punjab, which was further divided into three states. Similarly, governance was improved through administrative division and states were created as late as in 2000. Iran has multi-ethnic and multi-sectarian society, with Shiites forming about 50 % of the population. Iran has 30 provinces, 7 out of them were created in last two decades to make them more homogeneous and better administered. After the fall of monarchy in Afghanistan, it was ruled first by the socialists and then by hardliner Islamists. It is a multi-ethnic society comprising Pashtuns, Tajiks, Hazaras and Uzbeks etc. in the same order of popularity. Realizing the administrative requirements, a country smaller than Pakistan has been divided into 34 provinces. A couple of these were created even after 9/11.

In the light of above facts, we observe that conversely in Pakistan, we have not evolved as an efficient Federation since independence. We still have a unique status given to Gilgit-Baltistan and Azad Kashmir; even the merger of FATA with KPK has taken almost 70 years to realise. There is a sharp mismatch in the size of provinces vis-a-vis population, resources and backwardness. Moreover, all of our provinces are heterogeneously composed with multiple

---

"Fawad says Rs1500 billion transferred to Balochistan in last 10 years", *International the News*, (November 17, 2018), accessed February 12, 2019. <https://www.thenews.com.pk/latest/394962-fawad-says-rs1500-billion-transferred-to-balochistan-in-last-10-years>.

<sup>143</sup> Syed Farooq Hasnat, *The system of Federation in Pakistan: Constitutional Provisions for Decentralization* (New Delhi, Deep and Deep Publications, 2000), 83.

ethnic groups lumped under a manipulative provincial and Federal administrative structure. Punjab with majority of population is asymmetrically composed of Pothwar, central Punjab and Saraiki areas. Seeing the centralization of resources to central Punjab, especially Lahore, the feeling of deprivation has increased in Seraiki belt and present PTI government has already embarked to garner support for division of the province. Sind has two distinct ethnicities of Sindhis and Muhajirs. Moreover, the Karachi metropolitan with a conglomerate of ethnicities has become unwieldy. MQM has many a times raised voice of making Karachi a separate province. KPK has division of the Pashtuns and Hindko speaking people. Concentration of resources in Pakhtun belt has given fillip to demand for Hazara as a separate province. Balochistan with 43.5% of Pakistan has only 6% of population which is heterogeneously composed of Baloch, Brahui, and Makrani and Pashtun tribes. The Pakhtun belt is already challenging the population census and domination of province by ethnic Baloch. Moreover, the provinces have not devolved powers to District Governments for vested reasons and centralized the division of resources without any logical resource distribution criteria. Balochistan has a long history of deprivation and for sustained development the division of the province into homogenous and manageable additional provinces is inevitable. Some factors considered towards this end for proposed division of Balochistan into smaller regions are;

- Geographic contiguity of districts/ areas.
- Demographic homogeneity as far as possible but not must as long as the population is equal more or less
- Administrative convenience: Old Divisional boundaries should conform to new provincial boundaries.
- Economic viability: the area or region should generate sufficient revenues to ensure sustained development with minimum dependence on federal support. Rich and poor districts should be combined for this reason.
- Political stability: areas prone to terrorism should be merged with others having normal law and order situation.
- Interdependency: every federating unit should be dependent on the other in terms of communication infrastructure, rivers or sweet water, electric/ gas supply to thwart tendency for secession or breaking away.



### 5.1.1 First Option: Possible Division

Having considered above factors, Balochistan can be ideally divided into five distinct regions as under:

#### **Northern Region**

This comprises Pakhtun dominated areas of Pishin, Zhob, Qila Saif Ullah, Qila Abdullah, Ziarat, Loralai and Musa Khel Bazar. District Barkhan also has a sizable population of Pakhtuns but only census can determine the exact percentage. These are the most populous areas and may form almost 50% population of Balochistan. The literacy rate is highest; this can be judged by majority of posts in provincial bureaucracy occupied by Pakhtuns. Most of the people are involved in business activity or smuggling of goods, weapons and drugs because of porous Afghanistan border neighbouring them. There are no sardars or tribal heads in traditional sense and people are free to act and choose. JUI and Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PKMAP) are major parties. Kakars, Pannis, Zarghoons, Mandokhels are the main tribes (Map attached as Annex-XI).

#### **North Eastern Region**

This comprises Baloch dominated areas of Kohlu, Bolan, Dera Bugti, Sibi, Nasir Abad, Jhal Magsi, Jafar Abad and Barkhan. The area is rich with natural resources and a strong tribal culture prevails here. For vested interests, Nawabs and Sardars of Dera Bugti and Kohlu resist state control and their remnants are still engaged in an armed struggle. Other than these two districts, remaining people support the development efforts by the government and counter the nationalist forces politically. JWP and BAP are main political groups. Balochi language is spoken by majority of people and major tribes are Marris, Bugtis, Domkis, Jamalis, Magsis. Umrani, Kaheri, Buledi, Khosas and Jats. It also has Pathans and Hindus in lesser numbers (Map attached as Annex-XII).

#### **Central, South East and Southern Region**

This is Brahui dominated area comprising Mastung, Kalat, Khuzdar, Awaran and Lasbella. The area is commonly known as Jhalawan or South. It is sparsely populated and dependent on

agriculture, cattle grazing and mining except Lasbella which hosts Hub industrial zone. RCD highway runs through all the districts except Awaran. NP, BNP(M), PML(Q), BNP(A), IUI and BAP are the main political parties. Major tribes are, Mengals, Jamots, Zehris, Sasoli, Bizenjo, Raisani, Shahwani, Mosiani, Lasis etc. (Map attached as Annex-XIII).

### **Western and South Western Region**

It mostly comprises of ex Makran Division or areas having same language, tribes and influence. People speak Balochi - Makrani which is a dialect of Brahui. Districts falling in this region are Gwadar, Turbat, Panjgur, Kharan, Washuk, Chagai and Nushki. This would be the largest region in the proposed division. There is little agriculture in the region but has rich mineral resources including copper and Gold reserves of Sandak and Reko Diq and Gwadar deep seaport. It relies on fisheries and smuggling. BAP and NP are more popular political parties in the area. Nausherwanis, Kambranis, Hoats, Rinds, Kalmatis, Rais Langer, Mengals, Muhamad Hasnis, Raisanis, Sarpara, and Rakshani Baloch inhabit the area (Map attached as Annex- XIV).

**Quetta Region.** Provincial capital is the most densely populated area with almost 30% people of entire province living here. As an independent province, Quetta will get opportunity to address metropolitan problems. Population is a mix of Pakhtuns, Baloch, Brahuis, Punjabis and Afghan Muhajirs. Pashtuns with Afghan muhajireen form the bulk. It is hub of all political, economic and social activities. The region draws strength from its trade, commerce, mining and fruit farming. BAP, PTI and PKMAP are the main political parties.

#### **5.1.2 Second Option: Possible Division**

Division of Balochistan into five provinces will invoke strong resistance by all and sundry fearing loss of their nationalist support. At the same time, federation may not be able to support funds for the administrative structure, including LEA, executive, judiciary, health and education. A compromised solution will have to be conceived, with a mix of ethnicities and offering viable economic support. Recently, federation has created two commands of frontier constabulary in Balochistan, the northern command and the southern command to effectively control law and order and smuggling in these vast areas. Similarly, 33 Division ex Southern Command has been moved to Khuzdar Cantt from Quetta to be exclusively responsible for IS operations in this

region. 41 Division at Quetta shall look after the Quetta region and areas in the north and west. This administrative convenience can be followed for creation of the two provinces as under;

### **Northern Province**

With Quetta as provincial capital, it should comprise of mostly Pashtun and Baloch areas merging Quetta, Pishin, Zhob, Qila Saif Ullah, Qila Abdullah, Ziarat, Loralai, Musa Khel Bazar, Barkhan, Kohlu, Bolan, Dera Bugti, Sibi, Nasir Abad, Jhal Magsi and Jafar Abad. This area will support comparatively majority population, coal mines and areas rich with natural gas and potential oil reserves. It can be called Sarawan (meaning north in Brahui) (See Annex-XV for Map).

### **Southern Province**

It can have provincial capital in Turbat and would comprise mostly Brahui and Makran ethnic areas. Mastung, Kalat, Khuzdar, Awaran, Lasbella, Gwadar, Turbat, Panjgur, Kharan, Washuk, Chagai and Nushki Districts can be part of this province. Although, it appears to be less developed, with low literacy and per capita regions, yet the economic activity generated due to Gwadar port and Saindak/ Reko Diq mines can make it the fastest growing area. With seat of governance shifted to Turbat, the feeling of deprivation will be greatly mitigated and help controlling extremism and terrorism. This area can be called Jhalawan or South in Brahui (See Annex-XVI for Map.)

#### **5.1.3. Merits and Demerits**

Option-1 is supported to start with due to more chances of its realization. Some obvious merits and demerits are listed in succeeding paragraphs. Some merits are as following: -

- Will improve inter-provincial and intra-provincial harmony, strengthen national integrity and security.
- Balochistan will get greater representation in the Senate as a whole.
- Dilution in space coupled with corrupt bureaucracy compromises all developmental efforts. This arrangement will allow a more focused and sustained development.
- Secession of complete province with or without outside support is a perpetual threat. This fear/ risk would be warded off by dividing the Province. As a result, the foreign intervention would abate leading to stability and reduced threat to national security.

- Will bring more political awareness with provincial government in each region.
- Health, education, law and order and justice would be easily available due to close monitoring of the provincial government. This will improve social structure and literacy.
- Flow of population from rural to few urban centres would stop, preventing congestion of cities; Quetta has become unmanageable due to this phenomenon.
- Rich and poor districts have been so combined that almost every region can generate sufficient provincial funds, reducing dependency on the Federal government.
- Prolific opium trade with its long un-interrupted supply line would be easily severed/interdicted as it passes from one administrative zone to another.
- It would enhance the prospects for exploration of natural resources, thereby contributing to the overall economic development of the area and country.
- It would foster friendly environments for foreign investment and broad-based economic activity.

Some demerits are being discussed below;

- Sub-nationalists can exploit this situation by arousing the sentiments against the state.
- Inter-regional harmony will take time to come and small issues may erupt into inter-tribal clashes.
- Reduced size of the province can conform to the area of influence of some sardar/elder who may take over the political and administrative control. However, District government system if followed in letter and spirit can help overcome such an eventuality.
- Net proceeds from gas surcharge will be available only to a part of the present Balochistan. This can be compensated by additional grants to other province and its capacity building to bring it at par.
- Few existing institutions of higher learning in some regions may deprive others of requisite share of seats or access to higher education. This will require fixing of quota as per population and centralized monitoring for some time.

- Miscreants/ outlaws may pass from one to another province easily, making persuasion of investigations difficult. Legislation for this will have to be enacted at the Centre.
- Huge financial outlays would be required for raising infrastructure and institutional mechanism. Old Divisional setup may be used to save some cost.

## 5.2 Apportionment of Other Provinces

Apportionment of Balochistan alone will never be acceptable to people unless concomitant to this, logical division of other provinces is also suggested. Following can be considered in this regard: -

Punjab may be divided into three regions comprising southern Saraiki belt (Multan-Rahim Yar Khan), central or Punjabi belt (Kharian-Okara) and northern Pothwar belt (Attock -Jhelum). PTI government has vowed to create Southern Punjab during its election campaign and now this is being supported by almost political parties, including PML (N) and PPP.

In case of Sindh, Karachi/ Hyderabad and Interior Sind can make two separate regions, addressing the concerns of less advantaged Muhajir community and addressing poverty and backwardness of interior Sindh.

While taking Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK) into consideration, it can be said that merger of FATA with KPK has considerably increased the size and population of KPK, besides people of Hazara have a long-standing demand for an independent province and this can be given a serious thought.

In Northern Areas, status of a province be given to Northern Areas through referendum, which will strengthen our viewpoint of self-governance to the disputed areas.

Last but not the least, in case of Azad Kashmir, it is time to reconcile with injustices of history and merge it with Pakistan, giving status of a province. This, however, should be last to consider seeing diplomatic strings attached and without compromising our stance on IOK taken at international level.

### 5.3 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan

The Baloch people always complained of Federation not devolving powers down to the province and exploitation of resources. The situation was not different for other provinces but feeling of deprivation was much stronger in Balochistan. Frequent taking over power by Army or President dissolving the parliament through article 58-2(b) were serious concerns of all the political parties and it was in this wake that a Charter of Democracy was signed between Mohtarma Benazir Bhutto (Late) and Mr. Muhammad Nawaz Sharif in London on 14<sup>th</sup> May 2006. This was endorsed by all other political parties. Following the general election of 2008, in which Peoples Party won, it was decided to repeal part of 17<sup>th</sup> Amendment in 1973 Constitution which justified taking over rule by Army and bring other changes to devolve powers to the provinces. 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment was passed by both houses of parliament on 15 April 2010 and signed by President Zardari on 19<sup>th</sup> April, 2010<sup>144</sup>. This can be considered a big step forward for continuation of democracy as per spirit of 1973 Constitution and addressing the long-desired aspirations of Balochistan. All national parties including the nationalist parties of Balochistan signed it. As a result of this amendment in the constitution many subjects part of Federal or Concurrent list were devolved to provinces. This has ensured a reasonable autonomy to the provinces and made its political leadership clearly and squarely responsible for the development and prosperity of its people without the luxury of passing the buck to the federation. The devolution of many subjects immediately to provinces however was not very successful to start with. The provinces especially Balochistan lacked the capacity to exploit this freedom of planning and execution. This coupled with mega corruption in the provinces both by bureaucracy and the political leadership prevented expected development. Funds allocated for education, health and agriculture etc. were largely swindled. Balochistan tops the list for not using the federal allocations with the financial year, leading to large sums lapsed every year. Little respite was provided to the general public and they remained gripped in poverty and lawlessness. 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment however greatly decreased the animosity towards federation and the real face of the feudals turned politicians was fully exposed. People realised that instead of blaming Army and central government, the real problem lied with legendary political leadership and their

---

<sup>144</sup> “18<sup>th</sup> Amendment Bill”, National Assembly of Pakistan

[http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/report\\_constitutional\\_18th\\_amend\\_bill2010\\_020410\\_.pdf](http://www.na.gov.pk/uploads/documents/report_constitutional_18th_amend_bill2010_020410_.pdf)

exploitative culture for self-aggrandizement. The salient of the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment are given in succeeding paragraphs.

The committee designated to draft the amendment was mandated to have transparency in system, minimizing individual discretion, strengthening parliament and provincial assemblies, provincial autonomy, independence of judiciary, further strengthening of fundamental rights, the question of merit, good governance, strengthening of institutions.<sup>145</sup> Senator Mian Raza Rabbani headed the committee as chairman and performed a leading role in drafting the bill and obtaining concurrence of all political parties. The major recommendations made to the Central government by the committee were as quoted below;

“Federal government and ministry of Defence to ensure equal opportunities to all provinces/ FATA for recruitment in armed forces. Second, changes in FCR and freedom to national parties to operate in FATA. Third, judges for Islamabad High Court to be taken from all provinces and Federal territory. Fourth, Government should constitute an Implementation commission to ensure devolution of subjects following the abolition of concurrent list. Fifth, provision of infrastructure for availability of water in all provinces. Sixth, division of work between the federal service and provincial service be re-worked to ensure smooth transition of duties and good governance. Seventh, to promote harmony, stability, and goodwill between the Baloch, Pakhtun and all communities in the province of Balochistan, the committee recommended that equity be maintained in all spheres of life until the structural problems involved are resolved by mutual dialogue and consensus. Eighth, the Federal government would keep in mind the traditions being followed in the appointments of constitutional offices in the province. The provincial government will strictly follow and enforce the zonal employment scheme and allocation of development funds in a manner to ensure that regional disparities and backwardness are given priority.”<sup>146</sup>

Although the amendment was signed by all stakeholders, some notes of dissent, reservations or reiterations expressed by members and major political parties are as under;

- “Renowned lawyer and constitutional expert, S.M. Zafar, expressed reservation over complete abolition of concurrent list. He maintained that some subjects should continue to be jointly looked after by both federation and provinces. Complete abolition of concurrent list will over burden the CCI (Council of Common Interest), supreme constitutional body to look after the federation-provincial issues. He also recorded a very important note of dissent, in which he re-iterated that constitution should evolve an easy mechanism for changing the

---

<sup>145</sup> Ibid, 7.

<sup>146</sup> Ibid, 19.

provincial boundaries and creating of more provinces, as creation of new provinces would be need of the hour in times to come. This observation of Mr. S.M. Zarar was highly visionary and conforms to the writer's suggestion of bringing order and stability in Pakistan in general and Balochistan in particular.

- Awami National Party (ANP) supported proposal of Pakhtunkhwa Milli Awami Party (PKMAP) in protecting rights of Pakhtuns in Balochistan province, appointment of President on rotational basis from each province of Pakistan, integration of FATA and PATA in mainstream provinces, more powers for senate especially in passing money bills for giving due weightage to the wishes of smaller provinces.
- Mutahida Qaumi Movement (MQM) demanded abolition of quota system in job, sales duty on goods to go to provinces instead of federation and overseas Pakistanis to have representation in the parliament.
- Jamaat-e-Islami, proposed no extension be allowed in the tenures of major appointments like Chairman NAB, heads of armed forces, uniform education system/ curriculum in the entire country, no extradition of Pakistani nationals unless allowed by supreme judiciary, and greater role of senate in passing bills.
- The three Balochistan parties, Jamhuri Watan Party (JWP), National Party (NP), and Balochistan National Party Awami (BNP – Awami) proposed that all regional languages should be declared national languages, members of federation and provinces should be equal in National Economic Council (NEC), and national budget should also be approved by the senate. BNP (A) proposed that except for four subjects of Defence, Currency, Foreign relations and communication rest all should devolve to provinces.
- PKMAP proposed greater powers for Senate, regional languages to be accepted as national languages, equal rights to Pakhtuns vis-à-vis Baloch in the province of Balochistan. They also proposed division of Balochistan into two halves, as it existed before the imposition of one unit, namely comprising the state of Kalat and the Chief Commissioner Province.



- Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PML – Nawaz), supported provision for uniform curriculum.”<sup>147</sup>

### **Analysis of 18th Amendment**

The committee took special care of the concerns of Balochistan and decisions of 8th NFC Award which allowed more resources to the provinces especially to Balochistan, were made the part of the constitution. This ensured that instead of population alone, factors of poverty and area were also given due cognizance. Similarly, two committees, Council of Common Interest (CCI) and National Economic Council (NEC) were tasked to settle inter provincial disputes and ensure balanced development in all provinces respectively. This also addressed to a large extent the concerns of smaller provinces like Balochistan and KPK that Federation or Punjab could exploit these. The governor of any province would be the voter and resident of the same province and shall not be taken from any other province. This particularly helped Balochistan where Governors were installed from other provinces or ex Generals. For the imposition of emergency in a province, the requirement of a resolution of the concerned provincial assembly has also limited the dominance of the Federation and increased the muscle of the provinces. This meant that the elected representatives of the province will decide its fate. The spellings of Balochistan (instead of Balochistan) and Sindh (instead of Sind) were changed as demanded by the regional political parties. Khyber Pakhtunkhwa was the name given to NWFP to please the majority Pakhtuns but to the dislike of Hazara people. Thus, the perpetual claim of different ethnic groups for the recognition of their identity was accepted. Presidential powers of dissolution of the National Assembly were curtailed. The dissolution is discretionary power of the President only when vote of no confidence has been passed against the Prime Minister and no other member of the National Assembly commands the confidence of National Assembly. Moreover, the appointments of the Chairman, Joint Chiefs of Staff Committee, the Chiefs of Army, Naval and Air Staffs, the Chairman of the Public Service Commission would be made by the President but not in his discretion and on advice of the Prime Minister. The voting or abstaining to vote on a Constitution Bill against the policy of the political party has been included in the list of causes to disqualify a parliamentarian on ground of defection from the political party. This addressed the culture of promoting turncoats through money. There have also been down sides of the

---

<sup>147</sup> Ibid., 21.

Amendment Bill. 16 departments were transferred from federal government to provincial governments under the 18th Amendment. Abolition of the Concurrent List for the sake of giving more autonomy to more provinces has produced a controversy, as some say that it will weaken the federal government without adding anything to the powers of the provinces.<sup>148</sup>

Education was one subject devolved at the provincial level. This was done without thinking whether the provinces are equipped in terms of teachers, infrastructure to shoulder this responsibility. Balochistan suffered the most, where level of literacy was lowest and plagued with ghost schools, militancy, cheating and corruption. Regulating health to provinces with no checking authority, created havoc. The provinces are/were ill equipped to handle this critical area of social wellbeing and service to people. Balochistan tops the list suffering as a result. Some say that it would have been better if the subjects had been devolved in phases, smoothing out the teething problems systematically.<sup>149</sup>

As one sees these eight years in retrospect, overall the 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment has done good rather than bad. Many of Balochistan's concerns regarding exploitation of its resources, highhandedness of Federation and Army and lack of empowerment have been addressed. These were the popular demands of its feudal political leadership which have been addressed but ironically the condition of masses has not improved. The devolution process started at Federation has stopped at the provinces. The local bodies and districts have not benefitted as a result of this huge devolution of money owing the NFC, special Balochistan package, 16 subjects and their resources handed down and money released through CPEC mega project. The House of Lords, the Balochistan Assembly, is filled with greedy, corrupt politicians who only believe in self-aggrandizement with no love lost for the people and region.

Division of provinces especially Balochistan to improve national integrity and harmony is a new concept based on personal knowledge and analysis of the writer. The concept needs a formal analysis by other state institutions like provincial government, NRB and Law Ministry before its formal persuasion. If convinced, the matter has to be resolved constitutionally; preceded by a

---

<sup>148</sup> Mahboob Hussain, 'Eighteenth Amendment in the Constitution of Pakistan: Success and Controversies', *Asian Social Science*, Vol 8, January 2012, accessed 15 February 2019. file:///C:/Users/admin/Downloads/11145-43072-1-PB.pdf

<sup>149</sup> Yasmin Aftab Ali, "Revisiting the 18th Amendment", *Pakistan Today*, October 1, 2018, accessed February 11, 2019. <https://www.pakistantoday.com.pk/2018/10/01/revisiting-the-18th-amendment/>

media campaign invoking national dialogue. A manageable province with direct allocation of funds from the state as per national finance commission, devolution of power as per 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional amendment and local body elections will trigger focused development, bring transparency and hasten integrity with the state, dissipating separatist mindset.

## CONCLUSION/ RECOMMENDATIONS

The people of Balochistan are most blessed yet most denied, most loving yet despised and most loyal to Pakistan yet suspected of separatism, all these negative perceptions have been built by vested local and foreign actors and propagated by media. In order to manage the province a host of measures in the fields of political, social and economic reforms, re-aligning our diplomatic priorities and media management are required. This section undertakes an analysis of the problems confronted to the province and perceived way forward/ recommendations.

### Findings

- Balochistan Imbroglio is a consequence of three factors, namely the state, the feudals and the foreign powers. Since idiosyncrasies of the central Govt, like frequent military take-overs or democracies ripe with feudalistic mindset have been equally averse to all the provinces, the peculiar situation of Balochistan is more due to the remaining two factors, namely the feudals and the foreign influence.
- The present socio-political make-up of the province is more a legacy of Sandeman Reforms; owing 'B Areas', use of levies and allowing limited powers to Sardars for holding jirgas and enforcing writ rather than proud cultural heritage as falsely acclaimed by self-proclaimed nationalist leaders.
- Once Feudals are the new nationalists, to seek old ends through new means, namely, black mailing of the state for free flow of funds, unquestioned writ over the destiny of their people and mineral resources. Failing which, they seek foreign support threatening secession and evoking militancy.
- With people sick of militancy and ever since the passing of 8<sup>TH</sup> Constitutional Amendment, the militant leaders are losing the narrative of deprived Balochistan. The number of nationalists/ secessionists is fast dwindling and they are being marginalised in the electoral process. Moderate Baloch are gaining popularity and winning trust of the people.
- RAW-NDS collusion and their support to terrorism has been established after the apprehension of serving Indian naval officer, Kulbhushan Sudhir Jadhav and India losing

its case in the International Court of Justice. India will intensify the militancy in Balochistan to divert attention from its atrocities in Indian Occupied Kashmir.

- CPEC has intensified world's attention to the region bringing many challenges and opportunities. This warrants a holistic national security response, including diplomacy, economy, security and social reforms.

### **Recommendations**

- Balochistan's size and its dispersed nomadic population make it almost impossible to bring it at par to other provinces for progression and development. The solution lies in its geographical division into smaller manageable units. Federal government needs to bring constitutional changes to facilitate creation of more provinces. Besides, 18<sup>th</sup> Constitutional Amendment needs to be reviewed for bringing harmony and ensuring federal oversight in some cases. Balochistan has been politically avoiding local body elections as the members of provincial assembly do not want to devolve powers and funds down to union councils. This aspect again needs to be reviewed at both legislative and judicial levels as it is denial of rights to the people of Balochistan.
- Afghanistan is at crossroads of history once again, with Taliban calling the shots and US/Afghan forces on the receiving end. More than 60% of rural areas are now being controlled by Taliban and government forces are confined to garrisons. The US is desperately trying to save face and has entered for the first time into direct talks with Taliban to facilitate honourable pull out. The Afghan government and India have serious concerns over direct US-Taliban talks facilitated by Pakistan. Seeing a possible change in scenario in Afghanistan, Russia, China and Iran are also engaging in direct talks with Taliban. While Taliban have a rather favourable stance towards Pakistan, withdrawal of US forces from Afghanistan will create a big vacuum, and civil war may ensue between the ethnic Pashtun Taliban, government forces and the northern alliance. This will have spill over effects on Pakistan and may further aggravate the law and order situation in the adjoining areas of Balochistan and KPK. Following is suggested in this regard;
  - Continue to support dialogue between the opposing forces for ensuring peace and stability in Afghanistan. No other country is hit as hard as Pakistan, with unrest in Afghanistan.

- See that vacuum after the withdrawal of US forces is not filled by India, this can be done by developing friendly relations with government in Kabul, irrespective of ethnicity and ideology. Indian presence should be marginalized through economic and diplomatic overtures.
  - The government in Afghanistan, should work towards ending terrorism, extremism and drug trade. Even if Taliban come to power, they should realise that promoting extremist ideology will be zero sum game. They should embrace people from other ethnicities and religious ideologies and focus on good governance.
  - Pakistan should continue its efforts to fence the complete border and prevent cross border movement of terrorists and smugglers.
  - Afghanistan should be made a partner in CPEC and increase its stakes in the development of region.
  - TAPI should be re-invigorated.
  - Providing safe havens to Baloch nationalists should end; Pakistan must reciprocate with transparency on its end as far as alleged support to Haqqani network is concerned.
- President Trump's brinkmanship has brought Iran and Pakistan closer to each other. Both the countries are equally affected due to US diplomatic overtures, sanctioning Iran for pursuing nuclear program and Pakistan for its alleged insincerity in curbing terrorism in Afghanistan. Both Iran and Pakistan are affected by instability in Afghanistan, though for different reasons. Iran is concerned with growing influence of anti – Shia Taliban and Pakistan with growing terrorism within its frontier, abetted by forces in Afghanistan. Peace in Afghanistan undisputedly is long desired by both countries. Another common threat to both countries is foreign sponsored Baloch nationalism and a better border management and military support is needed. Although, Iran is concerned with growing Saudi interest in CPEC and its opening of an oil refinery in Gwadar, Pakistan also has some concerns regarding RAW's anti Pakistan activities from Iran / Chabahar and suspected presence of BLF camps in the adjoining areas of Iran. Some suggestions to improve relations are as under;

- An improved border management system with Iran to prevent cross border movement of terrorists, drug mafia and human smugglers. Fencing the border may be seriously concerned as being done with Afghanistan.
- Our diplomatic support to Iran should continue for pursuing a peaceful nuclear program under IAEA auspices. Pakistan should restrain any open condemnation of Iran on this issue.
- Re-invigorate IPI pipeline to make both India and Iran stake holders for peace and stability in Balochistan.
- Urge Iran to restrain anti-Pakistan activities of Indian consulates.
- We may consider trade corridor to CARS through Iran for exchange of similar facility to Iran for China from us. This will allow optimum utilization of Gwadar Port and CPEC.
- Allay Iran's fear of Gwadar competing with Chahbahar Port of Iran and any anti Iran activities even after Saudi Arabia's establishing an oil refinery in Gwadar.
- Offensive and irreconcilable stance of Prime Minister Modi has distanced India and Pakistan more than ever before. Atrocities committed by Indian forces in IOK and its open support to Baloch militants has widened the gulf. India has made heavy economic and political investments in Afghanistan and is seriously concerned with the growing power of Taliban. Withdrawal of US forces from Afghanistan will put India in direct confrontation with Taliban if it decides to support the Afghan government and Northern Alliance. This emerging scenario will decide if India fills the vacuum by putting its forces in Afghanistan to embolden the Afghan government or to go into retreat as before when Taliban gained power or keep its presence by supporting the Northern Alliance and ISIS. There are reports that India has been supporting anti Pakistan activities of ISIS and TTP from bases in Afghanistan and they will continue to support them economically, through intelligence sharing and supply of weapons. In any case, it would tend to reduce India's nefarious designs in Pakistan. Following needs to be pursued;
  - Resumption of dialogue with India.
  - Confidence building measures like opening of Kartarpur corridor and allowing trade to Afghanistan through Wagah border crossing.
  - Including India in CPEC, conditional to the progress on dialogue.

- China through its One Belt One Road (OBOR) initiative has mobilized the entire world, helping developing countries for building of infrastructure and improving interconnectivity thereby, exploiting economic potentials. This initiative is highly menacing to US globally and India regionally. They attempted to make CPEC debatable, implying that it is only favourable to China at the expense of Pakistan. Chinese workers and consulates in Pakistan have been attacked and vested powers are frantically trying to stall the work. Following needs to be done to make CPEC a success and protect China-Pakistan interests;
  - Guaranteeing maximum possible security to Chinese nationals working in Balochistan.
  - Increased Chinese assistance in Sandak project, Hub industrial zone and other road construction projects.
  - Increase Chinese-Baloch people to people contact for image building and allaying any concerns propagated by Baloch sub-nationalists.
  - Make port operational as soon as possible and trade to China.
  - Sponsor Taliban – China talks to improve China’s acceptability in the region.
  - Don’t allow Pakistan coastline and ports for basing of Chinese military fleet. This can plunge Pakistan in unwanted turf war.
  - Increase stake holders in CPEC; KSA to begin with, Iran, Afghanistan and may be India in times to come.
- USA was our strategic ally ever since independence but intermittent love and hate relationship has continued ever since. Despite idiosyncrasies of Trump, one cannot rule out its economic, military potential and political influence in the region. It is going through a trying time in Afghanistan and desperately wants to leave honourably. Following policy level measures need to be pursued;
  - Pakistan should continue assisting US-Taliban dialogue for ensuring long lasting peace and stability in Afghanistan and pull out of US forces.
  - Assist US in pull-out providing all possible logistic support.
  - Wielding influence over Taliban, strive to end terrorism and extremism in Afghanistan.
  - Take US into confidence over CPEC, assuring that no military strings are attached to it.



- Allay US concerns over our sponsoring militancy in Afghanistan, with zero tolerance against terrorists, irrespective of their ideology.
- Russia has recently held direct talks with Taliban to the dismay of government in Afghanistan. Russia has stakes in the region, fearing spreading of Taliban ideology to the neighbouring Central Asian States and its strategic concerns owing US presence in Afghanistan. Russia has had close relationship with the northern alliance leadership and holds a lever in the area. Its interests can be better served if;
  - US forces ensure long standing peace in Afghanistan before pulling out. Having suffered serious losses in Afghanistan, Russia would refrain any military presence in the country to ensure peace, following US withdrawal.
  - It has a working relationship with Taliban to wield influence following US withdrawal.
  - Any access to Central Asian states through Afghanistan is levered by Russia.
- After the devolution of immense powers to Province through 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment, there is a dire need to devolve powers and resources to the districts of Balochistan. Balochistan hosts some of the most underdeveloped areas of Pakistan and unless new provinces are carved out, the government in Quetta should undertake to equitably develop all Districts irrespective of their political or ethnic leanings. Basic Democracies or District Govts introduced during President Musharraf's time is an immaculate concept which impacted the political dynamics appreciably in Balochistan. The system however needs further reforms, maturity and acceptability at the grass root level. Present backwardness of the interior Balochistan can be expeditiously addressed if it is followed in letter and spirit.
- Poverty stricken, subdued and with agrarian background, most people are scattered in the remoteness of Balochistan. Extending communication infrastructure and other social amenities to these areas is not economically viable. The resources are diluted in the huge space of the province. Government should select and develop model villages along existing and proposed highways by providing houses, TWs, Schools and BHUS, etc. People living in remote areas should be encouraged to come and settle in these model villages. This program can be financed by international financial institutions and can change destiny of

people in the shortest possible time. The concept warrants a serious consideration and separate study.

- New cantonments in Balochistan is a compulsion because of our strategic capability, military's need for dispersion of formations during peace time, availability of training areas, highly sensitized western border, increasing assistance to LEA/ provincial departments and for promoting national integration. A well-orchestrated strategy of 'Winning Hearts and Minds' of the masses should be launched either prior to launching the earth-breaking of new garrison or this may go side by side. New cantonments at Dera Bugti/ Sui and Kohlu are extensively involved in nation building and should serve as models. Following the earthquake, Army moved to District Awaran and turned it into a peaceful, model District, establishing model villages, schools and hospitals. The recent re-organization and re-deployment of Army in Balochistan has hastened restoration of peace and development also, with 33 Infantry Division moving to Khuzdar from Quetta and 70 Infantry Brigade going to Awaran from Khuzdar. Besides FC Balochistan has been divided into Northern and Southern Commands, with headquarters at Quetta and Turbat respectively. This movement into interior Balochistan will immensely help the development process.
- The Levies were primarily introduced as a community police force in 1883. This was brainchild of Sir Robert Sandeman. Instead of controlling the tribes directly he decided to empower the sardars by giving them money and arms and allowing them to raise and maintain this local police. Levies were paid by British directly or through the sardars and they could use these to punish any obstinate sardar. The areas under the direct British rule however had regular police. Balochistan therefore was divided by British into A and B areas, controlled by Police or levies respectively. Unfortunately, 95 % of Balochistan continues to be ruled by levies, while the world has moved much beyond tribalism even in the remotest parts of Africa. Sardars controlled induction of levies and their salaries. This coupled with prevalence of Jirga system, rested complete powers of executive and judiciary with them. President Musharraf wanted to change this paradigm and ordered abolition of B areas and levies in 2003. This was to be done in phased program, converting few districts each year, with completion planned in 2007. Levies were trained by military, and the men were happy to become part of regular police, getting away from stranglehold

of sardars. Sardars opposed this vehemently using floor of the provincial assembly (House of Lords as some call it) as it could lead to denuding their powers. They claimed that replacing levies with police will open door for induction of non-Balochis or men from other tribes, the new force will lack knowledge of the area and people and adversely affect the law and order situation. Those supporting abolition of levies maintained that, levies lacked investigation skills, basic education required for law enforcement, was biased and incapable of dealing with the emerging threat of foreign backed sectarianism and ethnicity<sup>150</sup>. The sardars however prevailed as ever, and federal government led by PPP finally succumbed to their wishes in 2010. This was the darkest hour of Balochistan as it was again plunged into the abyss of tribalism at the expense of justice and peace. Police is a provincial subject after the approval of 18<sup>th</sup> Amendment in the constitution, but federation cannot remain a silent bystander with worsening law and order situation in the province. If FATA and PATA can be merged, its levies abolished, how we can allow the handful of sardars of Balochistan to continue to play with the lives of its people. With virtually no policing in vast majority districts of Balochistan, the onus of law and order falls directly on Frontier Constabulary (FC) and Army which are supposed to be 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> lines of defence respectively. The new provincial government needs to enact legislation for abolition of levies, training of its manpower on most modern lines and finishing political influence in enforcement of law and order.

- The biggest problem Federation and people of Balochistan confront today is not reality but perception of its being exploited and its deprivation vis-à-vis other provinces. Its people have been made to think both by its leaders and vested foreign interests that Balochistan was forcibly merged with Pakistan, its immense resources are being misused and exploited by Federation and its people are being killed illegally and kidnapped. The explanations countering these allegations have been covered in earlier chapters, but following needs to be done to separate reality and myths;
  - Introducing history of Pakistan, as a subject in schools to prevent pollution of minds at this early stage.

---

<sup>150</sup> Muhammad Ali Babakhel, "Policing Balochistan through Levies", *The Express Tribune*, July 17, 2015, accessed 11 January 2019. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/922151/policing-balochistan-through-levies/>

- Holding open, live debates with sub-nationalists' leaders to discuss history with evidence and dispel wrong perceptions regarding the annexation of Balochistan forcibly by Pakistan.
  - Revealing the funds released to Balochistan in last two decades, with strict accountability and conviction of those guilty of corruption. Reko Deq and Saindak projects should be made public to ensure proportionate share due to province.
  - The dissemination of reports compiled by national commission for missing persons, headed by the current DG NAB, Justice (Retd) Javed Iqbal. The report clearly states that alleged number of missing persons is highly exaggerated.
  - Highlighting atrocities committed by sub-nationalist militants, losses suffered by LEAs, common citizens and economic loss to state and province.
  - Making international human right organizations cognizant of the ground realities, allowing probe to determine the hoax of missing persons and so-called deprivation of the provinces from the federal instruments.
- Balochistan has immense potential in the fields of fishing in the coastal belt, agriculture in the canal/ tube irrigated areas, livestock and mining. Efforts needed towards this end are;
    - Establishment of service centres for livestock, provisions for supply of feed, veterinary services and technical training in livestock farming.
    - Agricultural sector is beset with several problems ranging from water management to pest control to sorting and packing of the produce for marketing in the country and abroad. Technical support in terms of modern horticulture know-how and training at each level of the production chain can help farmers obtain higher values for their produce in the domestic and export markets.
    - Fishing sector has huge potential, but this is being ravaged by the foreign trawlers, fishing illegally along Makran Coast. This must be stopped. Additionally, provision of larger motorized boats with processing and packing facilities can empower the impoverished fisher community.
    - Mining sector in Balochistan also suffers from a rather informal character. The management methods and the technology used are medieval, resulting in damage to much of the ore at the extraction stage. This must improve by provision of latest machinery and training of the Work force. Moreover, many mines are closed due to

- fear of paying 'Bhatta' to BLA like militant organisations or feudals of the area. State sponsorship and security needs to be extended to the local community to benefit from this huge potential.
- The state of education in the province is deplorable, owing politicization, ghost teachers and schools and very poor quality of teachers. Future of Balochistan lies in its educated middle class. A comprehensive strategy needs to be crafted at provincial level to address education at all tiers. Education must be depoliticized, and quality improved by provision of competent teachers, even if for the time being, these are brought from other provinces. BSO like student organizations need to be totally banned and colleges and schools to be rid of all kinds of militancy. More cadet colleges and Army Public Schools in newly established garrisons can help a lot in bringing quality education at the footstep of people.
  - The state of health is no better than education. Tertiary health care is not available even in District headquarters. Epidemics are rampant and quacks flourish in absence of qualified doctors, risking lives even more. Provincial health budget needs to be equitably distributed to districts and local community and district govts mobilized to improve the quality through consistent efforts.
  - The land in Balochistan belongs to the tribe with bulk owned by Sardar and then inherited by the eldest son. Individual holdings as a result are as big as entire tehsil area. Unlike other provinces there have never been land reforms in Balochistan. There is a need to lay limit for the individual land holdings depending upon the yield. Moreover, tribal inheritance system should be replaced by the national/ Islamic system.
  - The people of Balochistan should benefit from the port and CPEC to feel ownership of the mega project. Vocational and education institutes should be established in Makran specially to increase employment.
  - The reservations of fishing community should be addressed, without compromising the essential development needs.
  - Land frauds in sale and purchase of Gwadar land should be addressed fairly to save investment of people from other provinces.
  - Industrial zone in Gwadar needs to be expedited giving tax holiday and facilitating transportation.

- Security of the Port city needs to be accorded top priority introducing ‘safe city’ concept as done for Islamabad and some other cosmopolitans.

The research has underlined a number of issues and ways which need to be attended on priority to alleviate the condition of people. Writ of the government must be ensured to not only curb the militancy but provide people a secure environment with quick and reliable justice. A cost-effective way of improving socio-economic conditions has been suggested through consolidation of population along highways, which again needs political and bureaucratic support and commitment. It's high time, people of Balochistan realize they are part and parcel of this great nation and future holds a great promise for their socio-economic development, without exploitation by feudals or being used as pawn to alien actors in this new great game.