## Framing of climate change issues in leading English and Urdu Newspapers: A Comparative Analysis

# By **TALEHA RAZA**

# A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

#### **MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY**

To
Department of Media & Communication Studies
Faculty of Social Sciences



NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, ISLAMABAD

©TALEHA RAZA,2024



### THESIS/DISSERTATION AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defense, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Social Sciences for acceptance.

Thesis Title: Framing of climate change issue	es in leading English and Urdu Newspapers: A Comparative Analysis
Submitted By: Taleha Raza	Registration #:08-MPhil/MS/S22
MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY  M. Phil Media & Communication Studies  MEDIA & COMMUNICATION STU	TDIES
Name of Discipline	<u>DIES</u>
<b>Dr. Aatif Iftikhar</b> Name of Research Supervisor	Signature of Research Supervisor
Prof. Dr. Muhammad Riaz Signature of Dean (FSS)	Name of Dean (FSS)

**December 18, 2024** 

Date

**CANDIDATE DECLARATION FORM** 

I Taleha Raza

Daughter of Muhammad Ashraf Raza

Registration # <u>08-MPhil/MS/S22</u>

Discipline Media & Communication Studies

Candidate of **Master of Philosophy** at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby

declare that the thesis (Title) "Framing Of Climate Change Issues in Leading English and Urdu

Newspapers; A Comparative Analysis" is submitted by me in partial fulfillment of my M. Phil

degree is my original work and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare

that it shall not, in the future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any

other university or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even

after the award of a degree, the work may be cancelled and the degree revoked.

December 18, 2024

Date

Signature of Candidate

iii

#### Taleha Raza

#### **ACKNOWLEDGEMENT**

First, I thank Allah Almighty, the source of all mercy and benevolence, for allowing me to complete and finalize my thesis. I would also like to thank my parents for their unwavering support, affection, and guidance. Their belief in me has kept me motivated and focused.

I am grateful to everyone who has supported me during this journey, especially my supervisor, Dr. Aatif Iftikhar, whose mentorship, support, and insightful comments proved indispensable to this venture. His knowledge and motivation took me to a new level of research.

I thank everyone sincerely for being part of my journey.

Taleha Raza

## **Dedicated To**

I dedicate this thesis to my father, Muhammad Ashraf Raza. His never-ending support, guidance, and affection became the bedrock of my journey in academic pursuits. I am incredibly thankful for all the values of diligence and perseverance he instilled in me. This success forms a landmark in my life's legacy and is the epitome of his long-standing influence on me. I want to express my thanks to him for believing in me.

#### **ABSTRACT**

# Framing of Climate Change Issues in leading English and Urdu newspapers; A comparative Analysis

Climate change is a pressing global issue, and its portrayal in media significantly influences public perception and policy agenda. This research investigates the thematic and episodic coverage of climate change issues in two major Pakistani English dailies (Dawn and Express Tribune) and two Urdu dailies (Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt), focusing on their linguistic and cultural differences. The study examines how these newspapers framed climate change during CoP26 (2021), CoP27 (2022), and CoP28 (2023).

Using content analysis, 985 articles were analyzed to explore framing patterns. The research highlights that English-language newspapers predominantly employ thematic framing, aligning with international press and policy-related discussions. In contrast, Urdu-language newspapers favor episodic framing, reflecting local and issue-oriented perspectives. Factors such as article position, size, and topical genres like global warming, floods, and smog indicate differentiated editorial policies tailored to specific readerships.

The findings underscore the need for equitable climate messaging across linguistic and cultural boundaries in Pakistan. By addressing these disparities, journalists, policymakers, and climate activists can develop communicative strategies to promote climate literacy effectively. This research emphasizes the importance of inclusive media approaches to foster a well-informed public and advance climate action in diverse sociocultural contexts.

**Keywords:** Climate change, content analysis, episodic framing, English newspapers, media framing, thematic framing, Urdu newspapers

# Contents

Chapter 1	
Introduction	10
1.1. Research Objectives	20
1.4. Statement of the Problem	21 1.5.
Hypotheses	22
Chapter 2	23
2.1. Literature Review:	23
2.1.1. Climate Change & Media Framing:	23
2.1.2. Climate change framing:	24
2.1.3. Language and Cultural Influences on Clir	nate Narratives25
2.1.4. Comparative Media Framing in Multiling	gual Societies 27
2.1.5. Coverage of Climate Change in South Asi	ia 28
2.1.6. Framing Climate Change During CoP Ev	ents
2.1.7. Framing and Public Engagement	30
2.1.8. Placement and Depth of Coverage	31
2.1.9. Thematic Categories in Climate Reporting	ıg 33
2.1.10. Media Framing and Policy Advocacy	33
2.1.11. Climate Policy and Governance:	34
2.1.11. Evolution of climate change frames:	35
2.1.13. Comparative Analysis of Frames	36
2.2. Theoretical Framework	37
2.2.1. Framing Theory:	37
2.2.2. Framing Theory in Climate Change Commun	iication 38
2.2.4. Framing in Multilingual Media Contexts:	39
2.2.6. Cultural Resonance and Framing	41
2.2.7. Framing and Public Engagement	
Application for the Study	42 Chapter 3
	43

3.1. Me	thodology	43
3.2. C	ontent Analysis	43
3.3. R	esearch Design:	44
3.5. Q	uantitative content analysis:	45
3.6. N	ewspaper selection:	47
3.7. R	esearch Timeline:	47
3.8. V	ariables	48
3.8.	1. Explanation of Variables in the Coding Sheet	48
3.8.	2. Newspapers	48
3.8.	3. Placement:	49
3.8.	4. Length of Story	49
3.8.	5. Source	49
3.8.	6. Genre:	50
3.8.7.	Climate Categories (Climatological Events):	50
3.8.9.	COP Conferences:	51
3.8.10	. Depth of Coverage (Frames):	51
<b>3.9.</b> C	oding Process and Scheme:	54 Inter-
Coc	ler Reliability	55
Pilo	ot Testing:	55
Str	uctured Training:	55
Chapte	r 4	56
Data Aı	1alysis	56
	troducing framing patterns:	
	atterns in Framing Across Languages	
	rage of CoP Events	
	r 5	
_	ion	
Discuss 5.1.	Climate Change Coverage: Thematic and Episodic	
5.2.	Language and Cultural Influences	
5.3.	Coverage of CoP Events	
5.4.	Placement and the depth of coverage	97

5.5.	Thematic Categories in Climate Reporting	98
5.6.	Framing and Public Engagement	98
5.7. I	Lack of integration with Theoretical Framework	100 5.8.
Links	s with Agenda-Setting Theory	100
Chapte	er 6	102
Implica	ations:	102
	6.1. Empirical Implications	102
<b>6.2.</b> T	Theoretical Implications	102 <b>6.3.</b>
Pract	tical Implications:	103
Limita	tions	104
Tei	mporal Scope	104
Ne	wspaper Selection	104
Qu	antitative Bias	104
Recom	mendations	105
Fo	r Policymakers	105
For	r Media Practitioners	105
Fo	r Climate Advocates	105
Conclu	sion	106
Appen	dix A: Coding Sheet	120
Annen	dix B: Graphs	122

#### Chapter 1

#### Introduction

Climate change globally in the 21st century is one of the most complex issues without regard to geographical location, political systems, or socio-economic status. Since the impacts are beginning to manifest visually with global warming, additional cases of heat, and disturbed systems or cycles, the media's role in political and societal concerns about such climate problems has attracted significant attention (Dietz et al., 2020). Media acts as a vital channel through which information is passed, issues are defined, and perceptions are shaped. Far within this context, the conceptualization of climate change in the media has rightly cropped up as a significant line of rigorous and innovative multidisciplinary research, especially in Pakistan's multilingual and pluralistic context (Hussain et al., 2024). Its far-reaching and profound impact remains a challenge to humanity in the global climate crisis. Rather than being a distant threat, climate change has become today's, and tomorrow's, reality, shaping the lives and livelihoods of millions right now. With climate change becoming increasingly visible, from increasing sea levels and melting glaciers to heat waves and extreme weather events, the issue of how and whether we explain what we are experiencing to people becomes crucial. While, in some ways, the power of media is to spread information, it also serves to construct public perception, motivate action, and influence policy debates (Boykoff, 2024). This chapter probes more deeply into some of the challenges and possibilities of climate change communication in Pakistan's multilingual, pluralistic, and multicultural setting.

Media is a critical channel connecting climate change science to its public and policy discourse. How people understand the urgency and importance of climate change depends partly on the climate change narratives constructed by media outlets. While studies suggest that climate change does influence not only public awareness but also individual and collective action (Feldman & Hart,2018), too often, coverage of climate change seems to take on a combative flavor due to the efforts of populist forces to keep pace with the rise in coinciding global temperatures. Another example is thematic framing, e.g., systemic and policy narrative regarding climate change, which is more effective in building a complete understanding of climate change. On the other hand, episodic framing, which focuses on one-time events and immediate impacts, taps into the audience's emotions but gives them a broader situating context.

However, the role of the media itself is even more complex in multilingual societies. For example, in Pakistan, English-language newspapers are biased toward global narratives, where they are focused on policy frameworks, scientific breakthroughs, and work with international partners. Unlike English-language media, Urdu newspapers are targeted at a wider and more local audience, and therefore, their coverage centers on more immediate and immediate effects such as floods, heatwaves, and smog (Asavir et al., 2024). This dichotomy, however, serves to highlight the need to investigate how linguistic and cultural constraints (or contexts) put in place a framework for CLCC transmissions.

From perception, to behavior, to policy priorities, media is a central force in climate change public discourse. Climate related disaster, global warming, climate change have become matter of major concern in whole world and have been covered in media in order to educate people and to mobilize the public action (Boykoff, 2022). Climate change framing is critically important in climate change coverage, deciding which topics audiences care about and how they understand problems. Framing is defined as choosing and stressing some aspects of an issue while inconspicuously concealing or not mentioning others and designing the framework of an issue for public interpretation and

follow-up policy responses (Entman 1993). Thus, the power of media to disseminate information and be a gatekeeper to public discourse underlines how dynamic that media can be.

How the media frame climate change directly affects engagement. The research indicates that themed framing prompts audiences to engage in how the systemic causes of climate change, like motive emissions and deforestation, are addressed to develop long-term answers (Boykoff,2021). Unlike episodic framing, however, which makes sense but frames public discourse around isolated events disconnected from large environmental issues (Iyengar, 1991), thematic framing illustrates how things around us connect in informing how we act.

In Pakistan, where climate literacy is low, media framing is a key tool to help bridge those gaps. Owing to the analytical and policy-oriented style of English newspapers, they can tell urban and educated audiences about the intricacies of climate change. In emotional and event-driven language, Urdu newspapers have the potential to mobilize grassroots awareness and action. These framing strategies exemplify the interplay necessary for that communication to be balanced, fitting all these audiences but remaining faithful to the climate narrative (Saleem & Rahman,2023). In societies like Pakistan, multilingual and cultural diversity is further amplified. English and Urdu newspapers reach different audiences with different eruditions, means of access to information, and socio-political concerns. This study is located at the climate change communication and media framing interface. It presents a comparative analysis of how two leading English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan frame climate change. The study prioritizes thematic and episodic framing to emphasize the role of language and culture in shaping the discussion of climate issues in public (Asavir et al., 2024).

The overall theory known as framing theory, which is grounded on the approach adopted by media to present any issue, forms the basis for understanding how media builds narratives on climate change. Iyengar described thematic and episodic formulations in 1991. Thematic frames allow for examining problems from a systemic and not individualistic perspective, connecting the problem with its causes and possible solutions. On the other hand, episodic frames are centered on specific events or occasions; here, salience is given to people or the immediate effects (Boukes,2022). The present study aims to determine how these two types of framing are utilized in reporting climate change and the extent to which they are employed in the target media outlets.

Linguistic diversity, socioeconomic disparities, and susceptibility to climate-induced disasters uniquely pose challenges for climate change communication in Pakistan. English papers cater to an elite, policy-oriented readership, whereas Urdu papers hold a more encompassing audience of a rural and less educated population. However, English media focuses on the global climate narrative, while Urdu focuses on localized impacts (Medvecky & Sharif,2018).

It is also a challenge that there has been little consistent media attention to issues around the climate generally. Through intense studies, it has been observed that in Pakistan, environmental coverage constitutes a meager part of the total media content compared to political and economic news coverage (Ali & Manzoor, 2021). However, this limitation in focus obstructs sustained public engagement and policy advocacy in the country, which falls among the ten most climate-vulnerable countries in the world (Saeed & Salik, 2022).

Language and culture are potent determinants of how media narratives are solved. While, in Pakistan, English newspapers tend to keep the thematic framing approach emphasizing systematic issues and policy frameworks. The highlight on the use of terms like 'climate finance, loss and damage and net zero emissions' goes perfectly with other important discourses that are currently in play from all over the world regarding climate change (Hussain & Iftikhar, 2023). On the other hand, Urdu newspapers show the realities of their readerships, how culturally and socio

economically they live and talk about what they acknowledge, for example floods, smogs, failures of crops, etc.

However, this is not only segmenting our audiences; it also shows how different socio-cultural contexts prioritise climate change. In fact, this conformance with international narratives on the part of the English media may actually sensitise policymakers and the urban upper class. It is possible that emphasis on local issues by Urdu media resonates deeper with the rural and semi urban populations. The understanding of these dynamics will be required to craft inclusive climate communication that moves in the discerning direction of the variety of audiences (Barri & Shahzad, 2022).

Media framing of climate change plays an important role in creating awareness and altering public opinion about that which is occurring. New studies suggest that climate related issues are reported differently by English and Urdu newspapers. For example, a study (Afzal,2021) for two elite (Dawn and Daily Times) English newspapers indicates that the political and economic stories occupied the news media space while also respectively showing media consciousness that policymaking and economic dimensions hinged on climate change. It suggests that the adoption of climate framing strategies could heavily differ between language outlets as an expression of the more generalized expression of societal stances towards climate issues. Finally, the contribution of media framing to the construction of climate change policy debate and agenda is highlighted. However, English newspapers have that inherent thematic power to illustrate systemic challenges and distant future reforms, to influence policymakers. For instance, the need for funds for CoP events, international obligations of Pakistan, English media coverage of CoP events give attention to policy gaps. This corresponds with the agenda setting theory (McCombs & Shaw, 1972) that media set the stage for what public and policy discourse follow.

For the Urdu newspapers, however, newspapers become purveyors of grass roots concerns, and amplify voices of those who are most impacted by climate change. By simply reporting on the impact of floods, heatwaves and other climate induced disaster, the Urdu media can make a huge difference to climate change. At the same time, media acts as (local and global) climate action facilitator and mediator, being a potential catalyst for climate action (Asavir al., 2024).

Different content genre—news stories, opinion columns, editorials—frame climate change differently as well. However, though different genres of climate discourse may emphasize different dimensions for example while editorials might have calls to action (specific policy changes to be taken) and news articles might be reporting facts (Javed et al., 2020). The purpose of this research will be to look at the framing of climate issues in English and Urdu newspapers, the study of which will be done through the genre tool.

The way the climate change issue is covered in Pakistan's premier English and Urdu newspapers is investigated in this research. In the comparative analysis, language and culture implications are explained in media messages in order to explain how climatic discourses are framed in Urdu and English newspapers (Asif et al., 2024). Thematic framing is used by business and political dailies, for example, because an enlightened and informed readership reads them. This method makes it fit into the narratives of the global discourse through policies, science and delayed results. Urdu newspapers, on the other hand, are targeted at a broader population. It was observed that they ascribe to episodic framing, and the recent issues concerning smog, floods, and other similar calamities were highlighted (Jabeen et al.,2024).

The nature of the media system in Pakistan provides a background for examining the construction of climate change. Pakistan is among the countries most at risk of the social impacts of climate change, incidents of regional flooding, melting glaciers, and heat waves, most notably (Adnan et

al.,2024). For these challenges, the media has a central role in creating awareness and addressing debates around the problems within society and policy circles. Urdu newspapers have a large readership, which makes them an effective way of passing information to the populace. Indeed, while limited to an English-speaking readership, they exercise considerable influence over 'setting the agenda' and influential policymakers, academics, and the urban bourgeoisie (Afzal, 2024). The study focuses on the coverage of climate change in four leading newspapers, Including Dawn and Express Tribune in English and Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt in Urdu daily newspapers. These newspapers were chosen by their circulation, coverage area, and perceived impact on the general population. Given this, this study shall identify patterns that reveal language and culture in the presentation of climate change across these newspapers. The study timeline aligns with three key international climate events: CoP26: Glasgow, United Kingdom, 2021; CoP27: Sharm El-Sheikh, Egypt, 2022; CoP28: Dubai, United Arab Emirates, 2023. Such events, therefore, provide Pakistani media with a helpful context in which to study the globalized climate story. CoPs are political meetings and forums of international climate politics and policy and implementation, expressing the political priorities and targets of climate change mitigation and adaptation. The reporting of these events in Pakistani newspapers (Rioseco, 2023) allows us to understand how global climate awareness is reconciled at the local level.

In this setting, international dialogue on climate action is extremely important in the United Nations Climate Change Conferences (CoPs). By examining climate change issues that were framed during these conferences, we will be able to draw out changes in media narratives and the public discourse over climate change. To investigate how media framing reacts to global climate agendas, this study compares the coverage from CoP 26 to CoP 28. It was proposed that existing research has shown Urdu language newspapers might incline to communicate risks taken less responsibly than English

language newspapers (Hussain, 2024). Thus, the issue arises if language causes variation in framing strategies.

Climate change is also framed during conferences of parties (e.g., CoP 26; CoP 27) in English newspapers, which shed light on the implications for Pakistan in terms of the meetings' outcomes and associated policy frameworks and science (Asif et al.,2024; Barri et al., 2022). However, Urdu newspapers regularly report local environmental catastrophes and their direct local effect, which may inhibit a broader comprehension of climate change as a structural problem. (Ali & Manzoor,2021).

Urdu media coverage tends to be event-driven: specific incidents, such as floods or heat waves, that fail to provide enough context of underlying causes or longer-term trends to be helpful in helping the people of Pakistan. For example, a study identified that the presence of environmental issues in total news coverage in Pakistani media was just 2.8 percent, and Urdu media's portion of the swap to discuss comprehensive climate change was even negligible (Ali & Manzoor,2021). Climate change is also framed differently depending on the content genre, e.g., news stories, opinion columns, or editorials. While climate discourse in different genres may prioritize different aspects, editorials may contain calls to action (specific policy changes to be taken), and news articles may report facts (Javed et al.,2020). This research will examine how climate issues are framed in both English and Urdu newspapers, the study of which will be done through the genre tool.

In the present research, the content analysis approach is employed to analyze how thematic and episodic frames are deployed in the coverage of climate change. Based on the analysis of the selected media texts, content analysis provides both a quantitative and qualitative picture of framing on different topics. The characteristics of articles used for the analysis include their

positions (front page, editorial sections), story length, and thematic categories that include matters of global concern such as global warming, smog, floods, and others.

The purpose of this research is twofold: firstly, to add to the existing literature on media framing by presenting study results from a multilingual setting, and secondly, to help policymakers, media professionals, and climate stakeholders understand the potential framing approaches that influence the public's knowledge and participation. This research uncovers important implications for the roles of Urdu and English newspapers and helps frame effective climate communication strategies to resonate with populations of South Asia. The first part of the study consists of five research questions and includes, (1) How are the climate change issues being presented by the top English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan?; (2) do Urdu and English differ in their framing practices, (3) are there variations in climate change issues in newspapers during COP26, COP27 and COP28; (4) are there variations in the framing of climate change issues based on the genre and placement?; (5) How does the frequency of climate change-related categories vary between English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan. The research questions articulate which media represent a country's climate narratives, as well as how the country's linguistic and cultural background in turn effects the narratives.

Research on climate change communication in media studies is an emerging strand, especially emerging world (Mark,2021). The purpose of choosing this topic was particularly because of the reason of it being efficient if the focus of coverage is placed on systemic roots or policy based remedies (i.e., thematic framing). This approach is found by Boykoff and Smith (2022) to make long term engagement and understanding more effective than any of the others. Framing is episodic and more understandable, which makes weak and scarce connectedness with overall climate situations (Feldman et al., 2019). Due to factors like linguistic and cultural variation, the dynamics

enabled such identification of framing patterns in multilingual media environments which can either enhance or diminish the effects of media narratives.

This research is important because Pakistan is among the countries most sensitive to climatic changes. This research focuses on five climate-related disasters that regularly threaten the country, including floods, heatwaves, and glacial melt, therefore highlighting the need to engage in proper communication approaches to create awareness and reduce vulnerability. Media framing is indispensable for defining these risks in the public consciousness and rallying people's actions. Based on a comparison of climate change framing in Urdu and English newspapers, this research fills the gap by identifying the role of media in addressing climate change education and participation across communities. As identified in the study, the results relate to a range of stakeholder groups. From the point of view of policymakers, it will be helpful to comprehend the patterns of structuring information in the media so that it can be applied while designing the principles of political promotion and implementing policy objectives. For media practitioners, the research provides practical findings on the relationship between framing options and audience response and comprehension. Such results should be interesting for climate activists, pointing out that speeches and messages should be adapted to the linguistic and cultural perspective to gain the most significant potential of influence.

Thus, the present study lays the groundwork for a discussion on the framing of climate change in Pakistan media. The subsequent chapters shall discuss the methodological framework, data analysis, and the discussion of the results to give a proper understanding of the function of media in the construction of climate discourses. As a result of analyzing the linguistic and cultural aspects of media framing, this work speaks to the literature on climate change communication. It provides

implications for future research for scholars, practical recommendations for future climate change communication strategies for practitioners, and policy implications for policymakers.

#### 1.1. Research Objectives

- To explore how climate change issues are framed in Pakistan's leading English and Urdu newspapers.
- To analyze the difference in framing (episodic and thematic) of climate change issues in English and Urdu newspapers.
- 3. To analyze the framing difference of climate change issues with respect to CoP 26, CoP 27, and CoP 28.
- 4. To investigate differences in coverage for genre and placement.
- 5. To find out the frequency variance of climate change Categories in English and Urdu newspapers

#### 1.3. Significance of Study

This research resolves a significant knowledge deficiency about Pakistani newspapers' role in constructing the climate change discourse to some extent. The comparative analysis of English and Urdu newspapers can explain how different readerships are informed about climate problems. The research advances in the field of communication by investigating framing patterns and guiding policymakers and media stakeholders in the enactment of improved climate messaging. It also helps future research on climate change narratives in the multilingual media environment.

#### 1.4. Statement of the Problem

Climate change is an urgent global concern, yet in Pakistan, a country highly vulnerable to climate-induced disasters, media coverage of climate-related issues remains inconsistent and

often lacks depth. Previous studies have highlighted how media plays a central role in shaping public perception and policy discourse through selective reporting and narrative construction. However, there exists a significant gap in understanding how different linguistic media outlets in Pakistan specifically Urdu and English newspapers frame climate change issues, particularly in the context of global climate summits like CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28.

This study addresses that gap by conducting a quantitative content analysis of 985 articles from four major Pakistani newspapers (Dawn, Express Tribune, Jang, and Nawa-i-Waqt), focusing on thematic and episodic framing strategies. It investigates how climate narratives differ across languages, genres, article placements, and coverage during key international climate events. By identifying framing patterns and linguistic influences in climate reporting, this research contributes to a deeper understanding of the role of multilingual media in shaping climate discourse in Pakistan.

- 1. RQ1: How are the climate change issues being presented by the top English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan?
- 2. RQ2: How do English and Urdu newspapers differ in their episodic and thematic framing with respect to climate change?
- 3. RQ3: How does the framing of climate change issues vary across CoP 26, CoP 27, and CoP 28?
- **4. RQ4**: What variations exist in the framing of climate change issues based on the genre and placement?
- **5. RQ5**: How does the frequency of climate change-related categories vary between English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan?

#### 1.5. Hypotheses

- 1. H1: English newspapers will use thematic framing more frequently than Urdu newspapers in their climate change coverage.
- **2. H2**: Urdu newspapers will employ episodic framing more frequently than English newspapers in their climate change coverage.
- **3. H3**: Coverage of CoP events (26, 27, 28) will differ significantly in both placement and framing across English and Urdu newspapers.
- **4. H4**: English newspapers are more likely to cover scientific and policy-related categories, whereas Urdu newspapers are more likely to focus on human-interest stories and disasters.
- **5. H5**: Front-page articles will exhibit more thematic framing compared to articles placed on other pages in both English and Urdu newspapers.
- **6. H6:** English newspapers are more likely to feature prominent stories (above 1000 words) on climate change compared to Urdu newspapers.

#### Chapter 2

#### 2.1. Literature Review:

With the media occupying a central role in defining the public's understanding and discourse of climate change, its framing in media is a highly important area of scholarly inquiry. In this domain of research, a repertoire of perspectives is considered ranging from characterization of the thematic and episodic framing dichotomy to examination of the linguistic and cultural aspects of media narratives. This chapter reviews extant scholarship on study of climate change in Urdu and English

#### 2.1.1. Climate Change & Media Framing:

Framing theory has become an effective weapon in analysing the media coverage of climate change (Moy et al., 2016). Framing means picking out or bringing forward a subset of aspects of reality and persuading audiences to understand (or construe) events in a certain way (Entman, 1993). Climate change is framed as a systemic issue: Even a sketch of Prussian agricultural history, however, should add causation, consequence, and (potential) solution. Generally, this approach defeats the subject of climate change from a larger socio political and economic context to enable an audience to better comprehend it (Boykoff & Smith, 2010). Episodic framing looks at climate change on a person by person and occurrences by occurrences basis, which can affect the heart and stir the emotions based upon the sense of immediacy (Feldman & Hart, 2018)

Climate change is already a well-researched, but ever changing issue as the impacts of it become more immediate and extreme. Recent studies demonstrate how sequential and episodic frames help fill this portion of the puzzle and how framing styles can drive audience interpretations of narrative documentaries. Thematic framing serves to help us understand climate change as a global phenomenon that also needs structural solutions (Feldman & Hart, 2018). Instead, episodic framing

is momentary, focusing on single or event-based narratives (as with individuals), and although engaging, fails to link itself to systemic issues (Rhaman, 2018).

Linguistic and cultural divides complicate a bit the task of thematic and episodic framing in a society where English is spoken too, as in the case of Pakistan. The coverage given by English newspapers like Dawn and Express Tribune tends to carry the print of international discourses especially global policy and scientific viewpoints. Localized impacts such as floods and heat waves are the focus of Urdu newspapers, like Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt, which are commonly read by the daily experience of the readership (Asavir et al., 2024). This dichotomy reflects broader socio-economic and cultural divides, which in turn inform both public discourse and advocacy policy. Thematic framing appears more common in media aimed at elite audiences, including Englishlanguage newspapers that skew toward more analytical, policy-oriented reporting. On the other hand, mass media consume episodic framing, which resonates with audience preference for stories regarding relatable, impactful events (Shehata & Strömbäck, 2021). They highlight how, through media framing, public perceptions and climate change policy discourse are affected.

#### 2.1.2. Climate change framing:

Though recent studies continue to concentrate on the framing of climate change in prominent scientific journals, such as Nature and Science, it is not clear whether this framing is consistent. Hulme et al. (2018) studied a range of frames used by authors throughout 50 years (in total, editorials published between 1966 and 2016) to discuss climate change. Through their research, they divide eight framing categories into technological and ethical challenges that guide readers' perception of climate issues (Hulme et al., 2018). The findings were also validated in subsequent research using automated text classification methods to analyze these frames and to categorize editorial content with high accuracy rates (Stede et al., 2023).

In addition to the media framing of climate change being different across linguistic boundaries, so is the narratives. Hulme et al. (2018) conducted a longitudinal analysis of editorial content (were technological challenges, ethical dilemmas and policy solutions). Recent advances in computational linguistics have made these frames able to be more precisely identified using automated text analytics to identify patterns in climate narratives (Stede et al., 2023). Through these methods, this study has ascertained that the climate frames converge during such episodes, as coverage of CoPs converges around specific themes, for example international cooperation and economic responsibility.

In addition to this, the way in which climate change has been framed has changed over time since the onset of digital media. However, the restructuring of the framing landscape has transformed as the platforms and social media have diversified the definition of frames not only creating space for the traditional journalistic frames but also for localized user generated narratives. In multilingual contexts such as Pakistan, the audiences get news through a variety of channels; therefore, this hybrid framing of combining thematic and episodic elements is particularly relevant. Then, the interplay between traditional and digital media complicates the framing process even further, requiring a complete analysis to understand the implications of all this to public engagement and the policy discourse (Guenther et al., 2024).

#### 2.1.3. Language and Cultural Influences on Climate Narratives

Language and culture matter greatly regarding how the media frame climate change. According to Raza and Akram (2023), the framing of global issues reflects various peoples' values, perceptions, and linguistic differences. Given that Pakistan is a multilingual society, these differences are pretty pronounced as Urdu and English newspapers both appeal to different readerships, having differing education levels, socio-economic status, and access to information. Language plays an irreducible

role in forming climate narratives, especially in culturally diverse societies. Language itself is a lens through which audiences view information, and as a result, it affects the content of the media narrative and how audiences will receive it. The framing between English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan differs because of linguistic differences. Thematic frames are preferred by English newspapers that emphasize that systemic causes led to global solutions, whereas Urdu newspapers prefer to frame the story with episodic frames, they stress the immediate and localized impact (Boykoff ,2021).

Climate change is as framed by cultural factors. Media narratives are more effective to the degree that they correspond to the cultural values and priorities of the public (Chong & Druckman, 2007). For instance, Urdu newspapers have attempted to present issues related to socio—cultural reality of their readership through embedding cultural references and moral appeals in their coverage. English language newspapers for an urban, more globally connected audience focus less on the exploration and more on the policy and scientific narratives that resonate with international discourse (Nabi et al., 2023). In this linguistic and cultural dichotomy, the study highlights the need for comparative analyses to fully appreciate climate change communication dynamics in multilingual societies.

Thematic framing is likely adopted by English newspapers, which find an urban and policyoriented demographic. As such, leading newspapers focus on long-term policy solutions and a global perspective (Boykoff & Roberts, 2007). On the other hand, Urdu newspapers tend to concentrate on immediate, local impacts that find an echo among a more extensive, problemutilizing audience that cares about what is tangible and relatable and has climate change impacts (Nabi et al., 2019). These linguistic and cultural nuances leave the impression that we must understand the media's part in constructing discourse about climate using comparative analyses.

#### 2.1.4. Comparative Media Framing in Multilingual Societies

It has been found in previous research that media framing is important in how people think about and respond to events. In light of studies showing that media framing is often a very important variable influencing the way issues are communicated and in turn received in societies characterized by pronounced linguistic and cultural divides (Schäfer et al. 2020), this research is more relevant than ever. The comparative studies showed that English language media frame domestic issues in systemic terms and prescribe policy solutions. By contrast, Persian language media treat crises as deviations from systemic values. Vernacular media, however, tends to frame the issue in episodic frames that address minor, localized impact with far reaching consequences (Guenther et al. 2024).

Comparison of framing of media in multilingual communities reveals the linguistic and cultural divides that produce climate narratives. Research in South Asia suggests that English and vernacular media are chalk and cheese. To illustrate, in India, the amount of the news coverage in English newspapers is strongly skewed towards the news about international climate agreements and policy frameworks. Further, the vernacular newspapers behold news about the localized impact such as droughts, loss n agricultural fields (Asavir et.al., 2024). Likewise, both English newspapers in Pakistan show an effect of news of the related global newspapers (Raza & Shah, 2024) while Urdu newspapers show an effect of the same as their related local newspapers.

They are linguistically, socioeconomically, and politically distinguished using the framing distinctions. English newspapers often find that their service is to elite audiences that fit with systemic problem solving covered in their pages and that align with the priorities of readers. Instead, Urdu newspapers reflect the immediate worries of the broad demographics, and warn of tangible health risks and economic losses (Saleem & Yaseen 2021). This research describes how

these framing strategies affect public engagement and policy advocacy, demonstrating how the media is reflective of and a driver of social priorities.

Studies of media framing have shown the latter to be a crucial determinant of the dominant public attitude and behavior. Drawing on sharp linguistic and cultural divides, media framing is a key variable in multilingual societies today to understand how issues are communicated and perceived (Schäfer et al., 2020). African media have also been shown to employ a broader thematic frame which includes systemic and institutional causes (Hussain & Iftikhar, 2023). However, given that vernacular media will likely engage in this kind of framing within episodic frames where they discuss localized and instant impacts manifested upon various demographics (Asavir et al., 2024).

#### 2.1.5. Coverage of Climate Change in South Asia

Thus, media coverage of climate change in South Asia is a particularly critical study area for a region extremely susceptible to the impacts of global climate change. In the region, research demonstrates the ways in which local contexts such as floods, heat waves, and air pollution are reflected in narratives about climate change. For instance, smog and floods had become familiar topics in Pakistan, considering the pressing issues of its local people (Akram et al., 2023). There are few regions in the world more vulnerable to global climatic change than South Asia, whereby it becomes the critical region from which to study climate narratives. The varied problems its people face — from rising sea levels to glacial melt, extreme heat waves and pollution — are mirrored in the region's coverage. Second, much of South Asian media tends to report on climate issues from a localized perspective and often narrates those impacts in terms of tangible effects—floods, droughts and smog (Akram et al., 2023).

We show how framing of climate change in Urdu newspapers in Pakistan is dissimilar from how it is framed in English newspapers in Pakistan. English newspapers concentrate on international policy debates and a high level of scientific advancement fitting to the international discourses. Urdu newspapers focus on localized stories of interest that help the reader through their daily struggle. This duality represents the broader socio-economic divide that exists in the region based on diversity in language and culture, whose access to information, resources and developmental opportunities is minimal. (Saeed, & Salik, 2022).

By comparing South Asian media, English and vernacular newspapers differed in framing climate issues in newspapers. However, vernacular newspapers highlight localized stories impacting their readerships, and English newspapers usually focus on international climate governance and policy debates (Raza & Shah, 2024). The duality in coverage represents these broader socio-political and economic divides that go with the region, which informs how audiences see and connect with climate change.

#### 2.1.6. Framing Climate Change During CoP Events

Global climate governance has its pivotal moments when most countries meet through the Conferences of the Parties (CoPs) of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC). They provide a lens through which to focus on the media coverage of CoPs as levers for localising or 'localising' global narratives. Schäfer et al. (2021) then points to studies which indicate that in developing countries, the media tends to move the outcomes of the CoP into the issue agenda of a country, bringing to the fore issues including climate adaptation, finance and loss and damage.

The governance of global climate is centred on the conferences of the parties (CoPs) of the United Nations Framework Convention on Climate Change (UNFCCC). In this thesis, the media coverage of CoPs serves as a lens into the articulation by which global stories are enacted in different contexts. Research has found that in developing countries media frames CoP outcomes in terms of

their representativeness of national priorities, including climate adaptation, finance, and loss and damage (Schäfer et al., 2020).

The framing of CoP events vary immensely in English vs. Urdu newspapers from Pakistan. English newspapers also center on policy commitments and on scientific findings, as with the global versions, and on international collaboration. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers focus more on the socio-economic implications of CoP outcomes that result in livelihood disruption and community resilience (Saleem & Yaseen, 2021). This divergence provides one example showing how climate governance and its perceived relevance in local contexts are framed by media and how it is influencing public understanding of climate change.

The manner in which the CoP events are framed in Pakistan differs so much across Urdu and English newspapers. English newspapers, as well as international discourse more broadly speak the same language, a story of policy commitment, of scientific findings and of global implications. Although Urdu newspapers highlight the socio economic impacts of climate change, including livelihood disruptions and community resilience (Ali et al., 2022). All of this is because Urdu and English media of the country are on the different waves neither have the same editorial priorities nor are the audience expected to remain the same.

#### 2.1.7. Framing and Public Engagement

A consideration of how the media frame climate change has important implications for public engagement and climate literacy. Moreover, according to studies by Feldman & Hart (2021), thematic framing is based on people's understanding of climate issues, and it helps develop an association between the individual encounters and broader systems. Episodic framing is useful for highlighting what happened on a given day or week, but it is likely to lead to narrow understanding and short circuiting very deep engagement with systemic solutions (Guenther et al., 2022).

Framing strategies are important in Pakistan, where climate literacy levels are low. Policy-oriented narratives found in English newspapers can provide urban and elite audiences with lessons regarding the systemic features of climate change. Indicating their localized sensibilities and ability to mobilize discussion around global issues in a localized and emotive manner allows Urdu newspapers to anchor the discussion on the ground, again talking about imagined localities and changes. The dual role taken by media calls for balanced framing strategies that address different audiences without compromising with climate content (Saeed & Salik, 2022). While studies exist on public engagement in Pakistan, such population segments lack climate literacy, particularly the least educated and those from rural regions. Localized impacts to which globalized globes can be linked to global causes and solutions by media thematic narratives. While episodic framings of climate change dominate Urdu newspapers aside, these framings provide little avenues for engagement with the systemic aspects of climate change (Saeed et al., 2020). This indicates the need for balanced framing strategies for the audience.

#### 2.1.8. Placement and Depth of Coverage

The way articles are placed in newspapers significantly impacts their reach and audience. Usually, front-page stories use episodic framing, which seeks to draw immediate attention, while editorial and opinion pages accommodate those that approach it as a theme (Shah, 2019). Studies indicate that similar thematic priorities are reflected in English newspapers' editorial content when compared to news items, the newspaper focuses its agenda on policy and analysis. There are also very important differences from Urdu-language newspapers. For example, front-page stories about climate are featured for front pages, and in actuality, there is quite a low focus on front pages in English news media.

The penetration and outcomes of reporting climate inside newspapers depend in a significant way on factors like the location and depth where this is reported. Episodic framing may be used especially for front-page stories, which often cite thematic analyses or arguments in the editorial sections and opinion sections of newspapers where more thought and even discretion need to be placed (Rhaman, 2018). Studies suggest that English newspapers have a greater tendency toward lengthy articles and analytical reports in line with their agenda to report on policy and system. Urdu newspapers, on the other hand, predominantly feature shorter articles that are 'more now' and more relatable in order to reach out to information-poor readers (Nabi et al., 2023).

It is also reflective of the broader editorial and audience priorities in that it differs both in terms of placement and depth of coverage. Contrary to it, the information disseminated by English papers is directed forward towards policymakers and the elite; Urdu papers attempt to capture bigger stories, even at the expense of engaging with an audience through attractive and impactful stories. Through the contrast of this juxtaposition of two different approaches, insight is shed on the way in which the media influences and outlines the public discourse of climate change equally crossing linguistic and cultural boundaries.

In addition, the research discusses the contrast in the in-depth coverage of Urdu newspapers and English language newspapers. English language news is full of long and in-depth articles that delve deeper into analyzing a situation. On the flip side, Urdu publications have much smaller articles than for media consumers who either do not have much time or perhaps they have little or no (Nabi et al., 2019). So that's yet another reason why the media will have to fragment its audience.

#### 2.1.9. Thematic Categories in Climate Reporting

The themes of climate reporting give insight into what concerns and priorities different media houses have. The findings reveal that the newspapers, whose reports are used in this study, focus on reporting content that is similarly covered at the national and international levels, including climate issues such as global warming, greenhouse gas emissions, and adherence to international policy. In contrast, Urdu newspapers emphasize local issues of concern that resonate with immediate experiences of their readership, such as smog, floods, and heatwaves (Boykoff & Smith, 2010).

The reporting of climate events in Pakistan often corresponds to national agendas. For instance, Urdu dailies in cities like Lahore and Islamabad always report on smog as an important issue; the newspapers highlight the daily impact of smog on public health and general quality of life. On the other hand, the English dailies only talk about smog in the context of air pollution and the management of environmental concerns (Saeed et al., 2020). This is the reflection of the power of media in setting the context for climate change and how this affects its interpretation and discourse (Schäfer et al., 2017).

#### 2.1.10. Media Framing and Policy Advocacy

But it is media framing of climate change that matters in the ways climate change is interpreted and framed in shaping policy advocacy and public discourse on climate change. According to Schäfer & Schlichting (2020), English newspapers function as intermediaries between the public and policy makers, translating policy talk into narratives that the public can understand. Especially at CoPs, when English media is more interested in policy commitments, international collaborations and scientific research, this is most pronounced.

But Urdu Papers' role is complementary and shed the socio-economic effects of Climate change. Urdu newspapers amplify grass root voices by focusing on stories of the affected communities, in terms of individual situations of individual locales in order to educate and enliven the voices of the affected communities and to promote community resilience. The dual role of English as well as

Urdu media emphasizes the significance of various framing strategies in action mobilization on climate issues (Ali et al.,2024)

The chapter reviewed literature that emphasizes how linguistic, cultural, and contextual factors combine (and compete) to fashion how climate change is framed in media. For instance, English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan systematically differ in their framing styles and thematic priorities because, apart from consonance with editors' agendas, these also bear some relation to the objectives and expectations of their audiences (Afzal, 2017). The variations have significant ramifications for public participation, policy promotion, and environmental knowledge.

The following chapter offers an overview of the framing dynamics that this study investigates. The research is situated within the broader context of communication about climate change to emphasize the necessity of comparative research, considering linguistic and cultural aspects. Findings from this literature review will guide subsequent chapters concerning the methodological approach, data analysis, and discussion of results.

#### 2.1.11. Climate Policy and Governance:

Understanding how regulations and governance structures shape climate action critically depends on how climate policy is framedHistorical researchers have concluded that media reports essentially mirror the political undertones of climate policies as welcoming or opposing public engagement concerning climate issues (FRC, 2023). Using thematic analysis, it is found that public opinion over effectiveness in climate action hinges upon how stakeholders address international agreements and national policies and also take up local governance issues.

Recent research has uncovered how climate impacts are hitting the most vulnerable groups the hardest, but with a concomitant call for more equitable solutions (SPREP, 2023). This thematic focus requires inclusive narratives that adequately account for how climate change overlaps with

social and economic factors in such a way that vulnerable populations are recognized in climate narratives.

Communicating science effectively to the public is of great importance in advancing public understanding and the support for climate action. Research by Chen et al. (2022) has shown that the way scientific data is presented to the public can greatly influence public attitudes toward climate change.

Recently researches have been presenting climate change in terms of adaption and resilience. Thematic analysis was used by Hinkel et al. (2020) to investigate major differences or similarities in the coverage of climate adaptation measures across regions. According to the authors of the study, for instance some of these narratives around local initiatives to build resilience can empower communities by illustrating how communities have had to adapt. Meanwhile, more of the scale of the discussions appears to revolve around the discourse of vulnerability and risk (Hinkel et al., 2020).

#### 2.1.11. Evolution of climate change frames:

Chen et al. (2022) provides a thorough analysis of coverage of climate change in the news media around the world, comparing twelve key climate events that occurred between 2012 and 2015. This isolates six different frames identified within news coverage, and explains how certain journalistic practices and specific events work together to form public discourse over climate change. Chen et al. (2022) found that, at high-attention events, such as COP conferences, there is a convergence of media framing that peaks at a more concise narrative on the issue of climate, with this more unified narrative. It is particularly important during the events of COP due to the urgency of climate negotiation and high media interest coupled with greater public involvement.

A systematic review was therefore conducted, and specifically in relation to the role of the concept of framing as it is used as a bridge between climate change communication concepts. The authors therefore compared these trends in climate change frames to those in the general broader communication research trends. They provided the basis for the requirements of the frames used by journalists and communicators with regards to how they are tied into audience perception and cultural context. This review is particularly critical in pointing out a need for new framing strategies for the proper handling of public sentiment and the complexity of the climate change narrative (Matthes et al., 2022).

#### 2.1.13. Comparative Analysis of Frames

English newspaper outlets may focus their coverage on the global implications of climate change, including the international agreements like the Paris Agreement and the current scientific consensus that climate action is necessary. For example, they may frame climate change as a global crisis which calls for immediate responses from governments and individuals. This framing has the potential of stirring up public concern and creating an influence on the policymakers for action (Urich, 2017). Instead, Urdu media might just be using this as just one cause for the worries of the communities, the agriculture, and the health. The issue will hence easily be told as it has stories including the flooding or drought tale with the faces of the farmers who underwent such experiences. This can enable local framing, which can enhance engagement in the community but position climate change further or prioritize it less than other such key issues as poverty or security (Munawar, 2015). The effectiveness of these frames is considered in the cultural context. Since socio-economic factors take a great toll on the public discourse in Pakistan, then frames that resonate with a local reality, such as economic loss due to environmental change, may be more successful than those based on global statistics or scientific data (Batool, 2019). This finding would

mean that Urdu newspapers will likely prove very useful for raising awareness to segments of the population that feel estranged from global narratives.

#### 2.2. Theoretical Framework

The media framing has been used as a theoretical framework for this study. Concept-wise, it is one of the constructions that have frequently been used in the study of communication. The use of framing theory serves to provide a theoretical base for this study, particularly about thematic and episodic framing, and explores its usage in a multilingual setting like Pakistan to assess media coverage of climate change.

### 2.2.1. Framing Theory:

Building on Goffman's (1974) original framing theory, Entman (1993) claimed that the media selects and presents information not only to provide specific information to audiences but also to manipulate their meaning, perception, and interpretation of that information. As Entman expressed, framing is about selection and salience, making media select some attributes of an issue to make them more noticeable and significant. Frames make audience interpretation easier because information is structured to mimic the values, norms, and cognitive schemas of culture.

Regarding climate change, framing seems to dictate how audiences perceive climate change: as a problem that resides in a particular location or is a global problem, as something scientific or political, or as a crisis that needs to be answered now. This research investigates how the media constructs public narratives about climate change by examining the framing around climate change in English and Urdu newspapers.

#### 2.2.2. Framing Theory in Climate Change Communication

An analysis of how media frames complex issues such as climate change can be provided through the robust framework of theory framing. Goffman (1974) states that frames are interpretive structures within which information is organized and public understanding is understood. Entman's (1993) argument that framing practices involve selection and emphasis of some aspects of the object and association with principles was further developed on this concept. Framing diverges audience minds towards seeing climate change as either a global crisis, a political problem, or a personal duty in regard to climate change.

This case is especially symptomatic of the thematic-episodic framing dichotomy (Iyengar, 1991). Thematic frames of climate change locate the problem at the macro level in terms of the broader systemic causes of industrialisation, failure of policies and policy implementations, and socio economic imbalance. On the other hand, the episodic frames look at micro level events such as floods or heat waves and remember 'individual time stamps' and 'immediate proximities' (i.e. temperatures) as important factors. Feldman & Hart (2018) argues that these framing strategies differ in terms of audience implied needs and their implications for public engagement and policy advocacy.

This research applies the framing theory to Urdu and English Pakistani newspapers to analyze how linguistic and cultural factors affect the way the climate change issues are framed and interpreted. The theoretical discourses of the study are based on framing and the study favours the notion of framing in reference to the multilingual and the culturally diverse context (Saleem & Rahman, 2023).

### 2.2.3. Thematic & Episodic Framing:

As a starting point of this study, Iyengar (1991) introduces the dichotomy of thematic and episodic framing. Thematic framing provides a broader context for issues and connects them with trends in

the causes of systems and policy solutions. This approach inspires audiences to think through structural and long-term issues with a problem in more depth (Boykoff & Smith, 2010).

On the other hand, episodic framing is dedicated solely to addressing particularities, focusing on a handful of events or individual experiences, pressing and concrete. However, this approach appeals to the audience's emotions, but in doing so, it causes people to isolate issues by removing them from their broader context, leading to fragmented understanding (Feldman & Hart, 2021). Being neither mutually exclusive nor unique to them, thematic and episodic frames are applicable as narrative strategies to different audience needs.

Episodic framing offers greater elicitation of emotional response than thematic framing. Participants who were exposed to news about animal welfare that was episodically framed stated that they felt more emotional and imputed more political responsibility than those exposed to thematically framed news (Geise & Maubach, 2024).

In this study, we apply the dichotomy between thematic and episodic framing of climate change coverage in Pakistani newspapers. The paper analyses how papers aimed at an elite, policy audience thematically frame in line with global climate discourse. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers aimed at a larger readership are more likely to apply the framing of episodes, which usually have a more immediate and more localized nature.

#### 2.2.4. Framing in Multilingual Media Contexts:

Language is a critical variable in media framing in multilingual societies. Different wordings are different linguistic approaches and they also represent the cultural and socio political priorities of different audiences (Tollefson,2015). Research reveals that English language media are primarily associated with an urban, an elite population and use a thematic framing with mostly analytic and policy orientated narratives (Boykoff & Roberts, 2007). However, framing of vernacular media is

correspondents with localized issues and experiences that address a larger public (Saeed et al., 2020).

The divide is linguistic in Pakistan, where English and Urdu newspapers are not in either case of different newspapers, but newspapers written in English and Urdu (Ashraf, 2023). World affaires, such as greenhouse gas emission and international climate agreement is sometimes highlighted in English newspaper using thematic frames for in depth analysis. Urdu newspapers, however, obtrude such episodic narratives over a regular time period which concentrate on the tangible effects of climate change, such as floods, smog or loss of livelihood which literally affect their readership (Akram et al., 2023).

#### 2.2.5. Agenda-setting and Public Discourse

Moreover, the theoretical framework includes the agenda-setting theory that outlines the complementary dimension to framing, namely, how media influences public debate. The agendasetting theory, devised by McCombs and Shaw (1972), tells us that the media does not tell people what to think but what to think about. Media prioritization of some issues helps to set the public agenda, determining where policy debates and where societal priorities should lie.

The setting theory of media under climate change is important in that it outlines the issues of what part of the problem to focus on or set aside (Feezell, 2018). For example, English newspapers can take international policy discussions as their priority due to their agenda-setting function for policymakers and academics. Local impacts, covered in Urdu newspapers, may create an informed community for awareness and action at the community level. Framing and Agenda Setting are how keywords and language are connected to create a narrative that is utilized by the media to drive public engagement in the idea of climate change (Ali et al.,2024).

#### 2.2.6. Cultural Resonance and Framing

Framing theory introduces the idea of cultural resonance — the idea that narratives carried by the media should match the cultural values and cognitive schemas of an intended audience. Audiences are more likely to be drawn to (and influenced by) frames that fit with cultural norms (Sheets et al.,2023). In the Pakistani context, what this research believe is a germ of cultural resonance helps break the language barriers in the framing and interpretation of climate change.

In doing so, English newspapers write to a globally conscious audience, which grounds climate change as a matter of policy and governance, one that follows international approaches and frames. Culturally diverse and locally rooted readership of Urdu newspapers broadcast climate change harms as immediate and tangible (colored by) health risks from smog or economic losses from floods (Akram et al., 2023). The cultural priorities they reflect in their respective audiences are displayed in their framing strategies. Cultural resonance is needed for media narratives.

### 2.2.7. Framing and Public Engagement

The framing of climate change matters tremendously to public engagement. According to research, thematic framing, linking individual experiences to broader systemic challenges, improves longterm engagement and deeper understanding (Feldman & Hart, 2021). While episodic framing can help bring attention to events, it tends to preclude substantial engagement with structural approaches (Guenther et al., 2022).

Due to Pakistan's low climate literacy, framing strategies are critical to filling gaps in awareness. English papers' thematic narratives on news about climate change can help inform policymakers and urban elites about the deeper systemic dimensions of the problem, whereas localizing impacts through episodic narratives in Urdu papers could elicit grassroots action. Framing strategies are critical to promoting extensive public engagement with climate issues, as these strategies help to perform the dual role of both thematic and episodic framing (D'Angelo et al., 2019).

#### 2.2.8. Application for the Study

Using this theoretical framework, climate change coverage in English and Urdu newspapers is analyzed. The study combines framing theory with related notions like agenda setting, cultural resonance, and public engagement to examine how thematic and episodic frames color media narratives and the audience's perception. Pakistan's multilingual context is a special case for studying the intersection of language, culture, and media framing of climate change, which adds to the overall discussion on climate change communication (Ashraf, 2023).

This research asks which of these leads to social events' outcomes, and this guides the application of this framework, as its research questions and hypotheses, for the prevalence of thematic and episodic framing, differences in framing styles across Urdu and English newspapers, and variations in coverage by article placement, length, and thematic focus. This study presents a flexible approach that comprehensively analyzes the framing of climate stories in Pakistan through linguistic and cultural analysis of climate narratives.

This study utilizes framing theory, agenda setting, and cultural resonance to flesh out a theoretical framework of how climate change is framed in English and Urdu newspapers of Pakistan. In exploring how thematic and episodic frames are being used to develop media narratives, the study examines the impact of linguistic and cultural factors on climate change communication in multilingual contexts. Built on this framework, the research goes on to analyze media coverage and its implications for public discourse as well as for policy engagement.

#### Chapter 3

# 3.1. Methodology

This study uses a comprehensive content analysis approach to explore how the frames of climate change is presented in leading Pakistani English and Urdu newspapers. This research analyzes thematic and episodic framing by first considering their distribution across selected newspapers. One content analysis method, most accepted within media studies, is a systematic technique for quantifying and analyzing communication content. Neuendorf (2017) defines content analysis as Systematic, objective, and quantitative description of media content. Accordingly, this method helps us investigate how we produce climate change narratives (language and cultural influence on public discourse).

### 3.2. Content Analysis

Quantitative and qualitative content analysis were performed. Some quantitative assessments of framing, placement and length were conducted using chi-square tests as well as other quantitative measures while other patterns in narrative styles were found through thematic analysis. Such an approach gave a complete idea of what kind of way Pakistani media projected their stories on climate change. Second, this methodology is applied to discover how Pakistani climate change issues are framed in English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan. To achieve the above, the study integrates qualitative and quantitative methods to document these nuances at a linguistic and historical and cultural level in Pakistan in order to uncover the insights of public discourse and media strategies. The coding scheme is meaningful, and the variables provide a systematic method for comparing thematic and episodic framing across both languages and periods. The approach it takes is both qualitative and quantitative, and yet, content analysis is utilized in the vast majority of media studies research, this method offers the chance to explore the creation, organization, and

the way in which content is conveyed. Content analysis, involving systematic coding and categorization is useful in helping researchers to identify patterns facing styles of narrative, editorial practice, and framing (Neuendorf, 2017). The language and culture in Pakistani media is analyzed using content analysis as a robust framework to understand how media frames the issue of climate change.

Alongside such advances have been content analysis methods pioneered by computational tools and machine learning which allow us to make fine grained analyses of big datasets. These tools can support such work by automating the laborious task of identifying frames, keywords and patterns in the processing of media content (Guenther et al., 2024). This study presented both manual coding and statistical analyses to produce a detailed understanding of how framing practices are used in four leading newspapers: The list includes Dawn, Express Tribune, Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt. This hybrid approach is very useful and reliable, yet flexible enough to deal with the complexity of dealing with content which consists of multiple languages, multiple cultures.

#### 3.3. Research Design:

The research design is comparative analysis as it analyzes climate change coverage in November, December of 2021 2022, and 2023 in a comparative analysis. Comparative analysis reveals useful similarities and differences in framing practices of English and Urdu newspapers. The advantage of this method is the ability for the researcher to examine how culturally and linguistically diverse contexts affect how media representations are understood.

Thirteen articles were analyzed for 3 key periods as interpreted with regard to CoP26 (2021), CoP27 (2022) and CoP28 (2023). To uncover the international and local tenor of climate change, the research studies these important climate events. Moreover, through comparative analysis it can be investigated how these media came to disseminate such frameworks, what editorial priorities

these conveyed, which audience engagement strategies were employed, and what were broader socio political implications of media framing.

#### 3.5. Quantitative content analysis:

This study employs quantitative content analysis as its core research method, aiming to systematically examine how climate change issues are framed in leading English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan. Quantitative content analysis is appropriate for this research because it involves the objective, systematic, and measurable coding of media content using predefined categories—such as article placement, length, genre, and framing type (episodic vs. thematic). Each article was analyzed based on a structured coding sheet, and frequencies were calculated to identify patterns and trends across newspapers and time periods. The focus on numerical data, such as word counts and frequency of frame types, aligns this study firmly within a quantitative research framework, rather than a qualitative or mixed-methods approach.

Thirteen articles were analyzed for 3 key periods as interpreted with regard to CoP26 (2021), CoP27 (2022) and CoP28 (2023). To uncover the international and local tenor of climate change, the research studies these important climate events. Moreover, through content analysis it can be investigated how these media came to disseminate such frameworks, what editorial priorities these conveyed, which audience engagement strategies were employed, and what were broader socio political implications of media framing.

#### **Population of the Study**

The population of this study includes all climate change-related articles published in the Englishlanguage newspapers Dawn and Express Tribune, and the Urdu-language newspapers Jang and

Nawa-i-Waqt during the months of November and December for the years 2021, 2022, and 2023. These months were selected to coincide with UNFCCC's Conferences of the Parties (CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28) significant global climate events that typically receive substantial media coverage. The total population consists of every article published in these newspapers that directly addresses or refers to climate change or related environmental issues during the selected timeframes.

### **Unit of Analysis**

The unit of analysis for this research is the individual newspaper article. This includes news reports, editorials, and opinion columns that focus on or significantly mention climate change. Each article is analyzed for its content characteristics, including framing style (thematic or episodic), article placement, genre, source, length, and thematic category.

### Sampling

The study uses a purposive sampling method. This approach was employed to deliberately select articles that are explicitly related to climate change, based on key terms and relevance to the thematic scope. Articles were selected manually from the digital or physical archives of the four newspapers for the months surrounding the CoP events (November and December in 2021, 2022, and 2023). This non-random, criterion-based sampling ensures that only the most relevant articles that directly pertain to climate change were included in the analysis.

#### Sample Size

The final sample size consists of 985 articles related to climate change. These articles were drawn from the four selected newspapers i.e. Dawn, Express Tribune, Jang, and Nawa-i-Waqt across the three identified CoP periods (2021–2023). This comprehensive sample provides a robust dataset

for both quantitative (e.g., statistical comparison of framing and placement) and qualitative (e.g., thematic and cultural analysis) investigations.

#### 3.6. Newspaper selection:

Two English and two Urdu newspapers (Dawn, Express Tribune, Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt respectively) are included in the study. For extensive readership and influence on public debate in Pakistan, these newspapers were chosen. English newspapers principally address elite audiences, globally and scientifically oriented, and oriented towards those who hold policy responsibilities. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers report on climate change issues that are of human interest and local-level climate effects that appeal to a broader readership.

- Dawn: This English-language paper, founded in 1941, is widely considered for its analytical, policy-driven reporting on the elite audience.
- Express Tribune: It takes a contemporary, global view of environmental issues.
- Jang: It is Pakistan's largest Urdu language newspaper with large numbers, targeting relatable and immediate concerns.
- Nawa-i-Waqt: Founded in 1940, this phenomenal Urdu newspaper mostly imparts impressions from the traditional and ideological spectrum.

### 3.7. Research Timeline:

The research included November and December of three consecutive years (2021, 2022, and 2023) as case studies. These months coincide with the annual UNFCCC Conferences of the Parties (CoPs), the core forums of global climate governance. The chosen period corresponds to the months when CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28 were held, since such global climate events generally cause an increase in media coverage. These time windows were selected because it was more likely to find volumes of relevant coverage on climate change in the news, because it was the focus of

attention at such high profile events. Beyond these windows, climate-related reporting is heard frequently, or it may be unbalanced, and this would have restricted the depth and comparability of the analysis. The study analyzes media coverage during these months to examine the interplay between international climate narratives and domestic media.

Additionally, the temporal scope of the research permits longitudinal comparisons of framing practices over time and differentiation of trends in framing practices that shift over time. For example, CoP26 in Glasgow covered global carbon reduction targets, whereas CoP27 in Sharm El-Sheikh focused on climate adaptation and finance. The selection of Dubai for CoP28 will be instructive about how media narratives experience shifts in response to changing global priorities. The coincidence of climate negotiations in this latter window (the UN Framework Convention on Climate Change [UNFCCC] Conference of Parties [CoP]) over ENSO years means the dataset enjoys considerable context.

#### 3.8. Variables

#### 3.8.1. Explanation of Variables in the Coding Sheet

The variables of the coding sheet explained how the study operationalized the content analysis for climate change issues in English and Urdu newspapers. Below is a detailed explanation of each variable and its relevance to the study.

#### 3.8.2. Newspapers

This variable identifies the newspapers included in the study:

- Dawn (Code 1): A prominent English-language daily known for its analytical and policydriven content.
- Express Tribune (Code 2): An English-language newspaper catering to contemporary and globally aware audiences.

- Nawa-i-Waqt (Code 3): A long-standing Urdu newspaper reflecting traditional and ideological perspectives.
- Jang (Code 4): The largest Urdu daily in Pakistan, reaching a wide and diverse audience. The selection of these newspapers ensures a comprehensive examination of climate change narratives across different linguistic and cultural contexts.

#### 3.8.3. Placement:

These variables capture where the article is located within the newspaper, which affects its visibility and perceived importance:

- Front Page (Code 1): Indicates the most prominent articles, usually reflecting high editorial priority.
- Back Page (Code 2): Typically features less critical but still noteworthy content.
- Editorial/Opinion (Code 3): Reserved for in-depth analysis and opinion pieces, often thematically framed.
- Others (Code 4): Includes articles in less prominent sections, such as special features or supplements.

Placement helps to assess the editorial weight given to climate change issues.

#### 3.8.4. Length of Story

This variable categorizes articles based on word count:

- Small (<500 words, Code 1): Brief articles focusing on concise reporting.
- Medium (501-1000 words, Code 2): Offers moderate detail and context.
- Large (>1000 words, Code 3): Provides in-depth analysis and is often thematically framed.

The length reflects the depth of coverage and the intended audience's informational needs.

#### **3.8.5. Source**

This variable distinguishes the origin of the article:

- Domestic (Code 1): Articles produced by local journalists, reflecting national perspectives.
- Foreign (Code 2): Articles sourced from international agencies or foreign correspondents, providing a global viewpoint.

This categorization allows analysis of the geographic framing of climate change issues.

#### 3.8.6. Genre:

This variable identifies the type of article:

- News Story (Code 1): Straightforward reporting of events and facts.
- Column (Code 2): Opinion-based articles, often authored by specialists or regular contributors.
- Editorial (Code 3): Opinions institutional to the newspapers.

Evaluating how different types of articles that frame climate change issues, helps genre.

#### 3.8.7. Climate Categories (Climatological Events):

This variable categorizes articles based on the specific climate-related topics they address:

- 1. Global Warming (Code 1): Articles that deal with the whole rise in global temperatures.
- 2. Droughts (Code 2): Analysis of coverage of prolonged periods of water scarcity.
- 3. Heatwaves (Code 3): It provides reports of extreme temperature events.
- 4. Glacier Melting (Code 4): looking at how rising temperatures are impacting glaciers.
- 5. Rains/Floods (Code 5): Exhibit of rain and flood events.
- 6. Smog (Code 6): The air quality issues and their health impacts.
- 7. Forest Fires (Code 7): It reports wildfire incidents and the environmental consequences of wildfire.

- 8. GHG/CO2 Emissions (Code 8): What are greenhouse gas emissions and how do they play a role in discussions about changing our world?
- 9. Human Activities (Code 9): Human-induced contributions to climate are focused upon. The categories constitute a framework for the thematic focus of climate change coverage.

#### 3.8.9. COP Conferences:

This variable records coverage of the UNFCCC Conferences of the Parties (CoP):

- CoP26 (Code 1): Focused on global emission reduction targets, it was held in Glasgow.
- CoP27 (Code 2): Hosted in Sharm El-Sheikh, emphasized climate adaptation and finance.
- CoP28 (Code 3): Scheduled in Dubai, addressing the progress of global climate action plans.

This allows analysis of CoP coverage and the potential role it might play in interpreting how much attention is paid to international climate governance.

### 3.8.10. Depth of Coverage (Frames):

This variable examines the framing style of the articles:

- Episodic (Code 1): It focuses on stories or precise events, calling forth emotional responses (Feldman et al., 2014).
- Thematic (Code 2): Context and systemic explanations are provided in broader views and relate climate issues to policies and societal implications (Guenther et al., 2022). Depth of coverage then evaluates the practices of newspapers in their efforts to lure audiences and guide public understanding.

By having variables for the coding sheet, climate change coverage can be systematically analyzed regarding the editorial practices and audience engagement strategies described in English and Urdu newspapers. By breaking down article topics into this specific content, this categorization also

allows for examining how climate articles are framed and themed, as well as where exact placement takes place.

### **Definition of Episodic and Thematic Framing in the Context of This Study**

In this study, episodic and thematic framing were identified based on the depth and length of coverage, inclusion of background context, research references, facts and figures, and the extent of reader awareness and knowledge provided.

# **Episodic Framing**

Episodic framing refers to news stories that focus on specific events or incidents related to climate change without providing broader context or structural insights. These stories typically:

- Are shorter in length (less than 500 words),
- Lack background information or systemic analysis,
- Do not include research, data, or solutions,
- Emphasize immediate impact, individual experiences, and emotional appeal.

Such framing was predominantly found in Urdu newspapers like Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt, where stories emphasized floods, smog, or heatwaves without connecting them to larger causes or policy frameworks.

### **Indicative Words/Phrases for Episodic Framing:**

- "شدید بارشوں سے تباہی" (Destruction due to heavy rainfall)
- اسیلاب سے متاثرہ افراد" (Flood-affected individuals)
- "گرمي کي لېر" (Heatwave)
- "ریلیف آپریشن جاری" (Relief operations ongoing)
- "مقامی کسانوں کو نقصان" (Local farmers suffer losses)
- (Public distress) "عوامي پريشاني"

- اتباه کن اثرات" (Devastating effects)
- "casualties", "victims", "emergency response", "relief camps"

### **Thematic Framing**

Thematic framing, on the other hand, involves news stories that present climate change in a systemic, contextual, and solution-oriented manner. These stories typically:

- Are **longer in length** (often exceeding 1000 words),
- Include detailed background, scientific research, and facts and figures,
- Highlight causes, policy responses, and long-term solutions,
- Aim to educate readers and enhance public awareness.

Thematic framing was predominantly observed in **English newspapers** like *Dawn* and *The Express Tribune*, where articles discussed global climate governance, CoP outcomes, and Pakistan's environmental policies.

# **Indicative Words/Phrases for Thematic Framing:**

- "climate finance"
- "net-zero emissions"
- "loss and damage framework"
- "UNFCCC negotiations"
- "scientific consensus"
- "greenhouse gas emissions"
- "climate adaptation strategies"
- "long-term mitigation"
- "Paris Agreement"

• "policy response", "research suggests", "data shows", "sustainable development goals" Summary Table

Aspect	Episodic Frame	Thematic Frame		
Story Length	Short (< 500 words)	Long (> 1000 words)		
Background	Rarely included	Included with context		
Research & Data	Minimal or absent	Frequently cited		
Reader Knowledge	Low awareness focus, emotional impact	High awareness focus, educational		
Framing Style	Event-specific, localized	Structural, analytical, policy-driven		
Examples of Phrases	"سیلاب سے تباہی", "heatwave deaths"	"climate finance", "net-zero targets", "scientific data"		

#### 3.9. Coding Process and Scheme:

The above variables were defined and used to systematically classify articles for coding. Each article was coded for newspaper, placement, length, source, genre, climate category, CoP coverage, and depth of coverage. This coding sheet provided the structure of the analysis, which was a factor behind consistency and reliability.

### **Enhancing Coding Reliability and Validity**

The study employs content analysis to examine how climate change is framed in four leading Pakistani newspapers: Express Tribune, Jang, Nawa-i-Waqt, and Dawn. To enhance the reliability and validity of the coding process, the following measures were implemented:

Inter-Coder Reliability: The articles were analyzed by a team of trained coders. There were regular meetings to discuss discrepancies and make decisions about being consistent in our coding. The inter-coder reliability was calculated as Krippendorff's alpha with more than 0.80 congruence. Pilot Testing: The coding sheet was refined and ambiguities in coding categories were addressed through a pilot study. Observations and feedback from the pilot test resulted in adjustments to the variables and to the instructions for coding.

**Structured Training:** To familiarize coders with the thematic and episodic framing dichotomy and the specific variables examined in the study, coders were taken through several structured training sessions.

These measures provided for a structured and highly systematic way of conducting content analysis, which enriched the reliability and validity of the results.

This study employs the methodology to provide a comprehensive framework in analyzing the framing of climate change in Pakistani newspapers. The research achieves the capture of the complexities of linguistic and cultural influences on media narratives by integrating qualitative and quantitative methods. The coding scheme and variables provide a systematic method that analyzes framing practices and provides a more nuanced understanding of how problems and solutions are communicated in climate issues in volunteer multilingual societies.

#### Chapter 4

#### **Data Analysis**

This chapter presents the results of the study through a structured quantitative content analysis, exploring how climate change issues are framed in leading Pakistani newspapers. Drawing on a comprehensive dataset of 985 news articles published in English and Urdu dailies (*Dawn*, *The Express Tribune*, *Jang*, and *Nawa-i-Waqt*), this analysis examines the depth and nature of framing with a focus on thematic and episodic coverage. The study investigates how language, placement, story length, and content categories influence the representation of climate change, especially during global events such as CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28.

Quantitative content analysis was employed as the most suitable methodology, as it enables systematic categorization and statistical interpretation of media texts. Each article was coded using a detailed coding sheet, capturing variables such as framing style, article length, placement, and climate category. The data were then analyzed using chi-square tests to determine statistically significant relationships between framing patterns and other variables. The following sections present findings in the same order as outlined in the coding sheet.

#### 4.1. Introducing framing patterns:

Media climate change framing is a critical lens for framing public discourse and social priorities. Chapter 3 analyses thematic and episodic frames in leading English and Urdu newspapers and shows that linguistic and cultural dimensions of reporting on climate change are shaped by the two language environments. This study draws on the patterns from a sample of 985 articles across English and Urdu newspapers to offer explanations of how these newspapers employ distinctly different editorial strategies related to climate literacy and awareness in Pakistan.

### 4.2. Patterns in Framing Across Languages

An analysis of English and Urdu newspapers shows distinct framing patterns of climate change. Of the newspaper articles analyzed, 68 percent linked climate issues to systemic causes and policy solutions through thematic frames. In line with these expectations, one frame relates to their readership's interests with analysis and policy-oriented content (Boykoff, 2024). On the other hand, Urdu newspapers are more episodic, with 62 percent of the articles being impact stories and human-interest stories. Concerning the immediate issues of the readership, these narratives touch upon the concrete consequences of climate change on their daily life (Hussain & Iftikhar,2023).

### **4.3.** Coverage of CoP Events

The linguistic divide in framing styles is also reflected in the coverage of CoP26, CoP27, CoP28, and other COPs. The analysis of English newspapers finds that international policy commitments, scientific findings, and collaboration on a global scale are stressed and how Pakistan is situated within the spirit of global climate governance. However, Urdu newspapers focus on the socioeconomic implications of CoP outcomes, e.g., adaptation funding and the local community's resilience. In these findings, language and cultural effects are further implicated in constructing media narratives around climate change.

# Framing Patterns Across Newspapers

Table 1. Crosstabulation of Language and Depth of Coverage (Framing: Thematic vs. Episodic) Crosstabulation of Language and Depth of Coverage (Framing, Thematic Vs Episodic)

Depth of Coverage	Episodic	Thematic	Other	Total
Language				
Urdu				
Count	260	171	0	431
Expected Count	207.0	223.2	0.9	431.0
% within Language	60.3%	39.7%	0.0%	100.0%
% within Depth of Coverage	55.0%	33.5%	0.0%	43.8%
% of Total	26.4%	17.4%	0.0%	43.8%
English				
Count	213	339	2	554
Expected Count	266.0	286.8	1.1	554.0
% within Language	38.4%	61.2%	0.4%	100.0%
% within Depth of Coverage	45.0%	66.5%	100.0%	56.2%
% of Total	21.6%	34.4%	0.2%	56.2%
Total				
Count	473	510	2	985
Expected Count	473.0	510.0	2.0	985.0
% within Language	48.0%	51.8%	0.2%	100.0%

% within Depth of Coverage	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%
% of Total	48.0%	51.8%	0.2%	100.0%

### **Hypotheses**

**H1:** Thematic framing will be more frequent in English newspapers than in Urdu newspapers in the climate change coverage.

Thematic framing is more in tune with English newspaper audiences because they are designed to portray an issue in a broader context and with relevant analysis.

**H2**: English newspapers will frame more episodically compared to Urdu newspapers in their climate change coverage.

Framing episodic is based on a series of events or instances that offer a more relational component to the group that constitutes Urdu newspaper readers.

# Statistical Analysis and Interpretation

### Table 1: Crosstabulation of Language and Depth of Coverage

### **Key Variables**

### Language:

Categorical variable indicating English or Urdu newspapers.

#### **Depth of Coverage:**

Thematic, episodic, or other framing approaches.

#### COPs:

Events related to CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28.

The analysis confirms that English newspapers favor thematic framing, offering a broader analytical perspective on climate change issues, whereas Urdu newspapers emphasize episodic framing, focusing on event-driven reporting.

These patterns reflect the linguistic and cultural contexts of the respective audiences, as English newspapers cater to an elite, policy-oriented readership, and Urdu newspapers serve a broader demographic with immediate and relatable narratives.

# **Episodic Framing**

The English newspapers depicted 60.3% in episodic framing whereas Urdu newspapers exhibited 38.4 % in episodic framing.

This aligns with H2, supporting the notion that Urdu newspapers rely more on episodic narratives.

### **Thematic Framing:**

English newspapers used thematic framing in 61.2% of their articles, compared to 39.7% in Urdu newspapers, supporting H1.

Table 1a.

Chi-Square Test Results for Language and Depth of Coverage (Framing, Thematic Vs Episodic)

Test	Value	df	p-value
Pearson Chi-Square	47.39	2	< .001
Likelihood Ratio	48.44	2	< .001
Linear-by-Linear Association	47.23	1	< .001
Number of Valid Cases	985		

Note. Two cells (33.3%) had expected counts less than 5. The minimum expected count was 0.88.

### **Chi-Square Test Results (Table 1a):**

The results indicate a statistically robust difference between English and Urdu newspapers in terms of framing patterns ( $\chi^2 = 47.39$ , p < .001).

The likelihood ratio and linear-by-linear association tests confirm the disparity between framing patterns across the two languages.

The results show that English newspapers employed thematic framing in 61.2% of articles, while Urdu newspapers predominantly used episodic framing (60.3%). This supports the assumption that English-language media favor analytical reporting suited to policy-focused readers, whereas Urdu outlets appeal to public empathy through event-based narratives. The chi-square test confirms a significant difference in framing patterns across the two languages (p < .001).

# **Framing During CoP Events**

Table 2. Crosstabulation of Language, Depth of Coverage, and CoPs

COPs	Depth	of Languag	e Coun	Expected	% within Depth	1 % within	n % of
Coverage		zungung	Coun	Count	of Coverage	Language	Total
COP26	<b>E</b> pisodic	Urdu	46	39.8	47.4%	56.1%	23.0%
		English	51	57.2	52.6%	43.2%	25.5%
	Thematic	Urdu	36	41.4	35.6%	43.9%	18.0%
		English	65	59.6	64.4%	55.1%	32.5%
	Other	Urdu	0	0.8	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
		English	2	1.2	100.0%	1.7%	1.0%
COP27	7 Episodic	Urdu	161	131.5	62.4%	67.1%	34.2%
		English	97	126.5	37.6%	42.0%	20.6%

	Thematic	Urdu	79	108.5	37.1%	32.9%	16.8%
COPs	Depth	of Languag	e Cour	Expected	% within Depth	% within	% of
0010	Coverage			Count	of Coverage	Language	Total
		English	134	104.5	62.9%	58.0%	28.5%
COP28	Episodic	Urdu	53	41.0	44.9%	48.6%	16.9%
		English	65	77.0	55.1%	31.7%	20.7%
	Thematic	Urdu	56	68.0	28.6%	51.4%	17.8%
		English	140	128.0	71.4%	68.3%	44.6%
Total	Episodic	Urdu	260	207.0	55.0%	60.3%	26.4%
		English	213	266.0	45.0%	38.4%	21.6%
	Thematic	Urdu	171	223.2	33.5%	39.7%	17.4%
		English	339	286.8	66.5%	61.2%	34.4%
	Other	Urdu	0	0.9	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
		English	2	1.1	100.0%	0.4%	0.2%
	Total	Urdu	431	431.0	43.8%	100.0%	43.8%
		English	554	554.0	56.2%	100.0%	56.2%

# **COP26**:

Episodic framing dominated Urdu newspapers (47.4%) but was slightly less prevalent in English newspapers (52.6%).

Thematic framing was more frequent in English newspapers (64.4%) than in Urdu newspapers (35.6%).

#### **COP27**:

The trend persists, with episodic framing higher in Urdu newspapers (62.4%) and thematic framing more frequent in English newspapers (62.9%).

#### **COP28**:

English newspapers showed a stronger thematic framing tendency (71.4%) compared to Urdu newspapers (28.6%), highlighting consistent differences across events.

#### **Overall Results:**

Thematic framing was utilized in 66.5% of English newspaper articles, while episodic framing was more common in Urdu newspapers (55.0%).

Table 2a. Chi-Square Test Results for Language and Depth of Coverage During CoPs and COPs

COPs Test	Value df	p-value	Notes
Total Pearson Chi-Square	47.391 2	<.001	2 cells (33.3%) had expected counts less than 5. Minimum = 0.88
Likelihood Ratio	48.439 2	< .001	
Linear-by-Linear Association	47.226 1	<.001	
Number of Valid Cases	s 985		

# **Chi-Square Test Results (Table 2a):**

Statistically significant differences were observed for framing patterns during CoPs across languages ( $\chi^2 = 47.391$ , p < .001)

Coverage during CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28 reveals consistent trends. English newspapers leaned heavily on thematic frames, particularly during CoP28 (71.4% thematic). In contrast, episodic framing remained dominant in Urdu coverage. The differences in framing during these high-profile events were statistically significant (p < .001), reinforcing the linguistic divide in framing strategies.

# **Placement of Articles Across Newspapers**

Table 3. Crosstabulation of Placement of Stories of Urdu & English Newspapers Concerning CoPs

COPs Language Placement		Count	Expected	% within	ı % within	ı % of
			Count	Language	Placement	Total
COP26 Urdu	Front Page	18	7.4	22.0%	100.0%	9.0%
	Back Page	25	17.6	30.5%	58.1%	12.5%
	Editorial/Opinion Page	9	20.5	11.0%	18.0%	4.5%
	Others	30	36.5	36.6%	33.7%	15.0%
English	Front Page	0	10.6	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	Back Page	18	25.4	15.3%	41.9%	9.0%

COPs Language Placement		Coun	Expected t	% within	ı % withir	n % of
			Count	Language	Placement	Total
	Editorial/Opinion Page	41	29.5	34.7%	82.0%	20.5%
	Others	59	52.5	50.0%	66.3%	29.5%
COP27 Urdu	Front Page	43	32.6	17.9%	67.2%	9.1%
	Back Page	75	51.5	31.3%	74.3%	15.9%
	Editorial/Opinion Page	24	43.8	10.0%	27.9%	5.1%
	Others	98	112.1	40.8%	44.5%	20.8%
English	Front Page	21	31.4	9.1%	32.8%	4.5%
	Back Page	26	49.5	11.3%	25.7%	5.5%
COP28 Urdu	Editorial/Opinion Page	62	42.2	26.8%	72.1%	13.2%
	Others	122	107.9	52.8%	55.5%	25.9%
	Front Page	20	11.5	18.3%	60.6%	6.4%
	Back Page	41	26.4	37.6%	53.9%	13.1%
	Editorial/Opinion Page	18	28.5	16.5%	22.0%	5.7%

		Others	30	42.7	27.5%	24.4%	9.6%
	English	Front Page	13	21.5	6.3%	39.4%	4.1%
COPs	Language	Placement	Coun	Expected	% within	% within	% of
COIS	Language	1 lacement	Coun	Count	Language	Placement	Total
		Back Page	35	49.6	17.1%	46.1%	11.1%
		Editorial/Opinion Page	64	53.5	31.2%	78.0%	20.4%
		Others	93	80.3	45.4%	75.6%	29.6%
Total	Urdu	Front Page	81	50.3	18.8%	70.4%	8.2%
		Back Page	141	96.3	32.7%	64.1%	14.3%
		Editorial/Opinion Page	51	95.4	11.8%	23.4%	5.2%
		Others	158	189.0	36.7%	36.6%	16.0%
	English	Front Page	34	64.7	6.1%	29.6%	3.5%
		Back Page	79	123.7	14.3%	35.9%	8.0%
		Editorial/Opinion Page	167	122.6	30.1%	76.6%	17.0%
		Others	274	243.0	49.5%	63.4%	27.8%

### Hypothesis (H3)

Coverage of CoP events (26, 27, 28) will differ significantly in both placement and framing across English and Urdu newspapers.

This hypothesis posits that the placement of climate change coverage will vary between Urdu and English newspapers, reflecting different editorial priorities and audience engagement strategies during the CoP events.

### **Key Variables**

- 1. **Language**: Urdu vs. English newspapers.
- 2. **Placement**: Front page, back page, editorial/opinion page, and others.
- 3. **CoP Events**: CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28.
- 4. **Count** The frequency of stories in each placement category.

# **Analysis and Interpretation of Tables**

**Table 3**: Crosstabulation of Placement of Stories in Urdu and English Newspapers concerning CoP Events

#### **Observations:**

#### **CoP26**:

Urdu newspapers published 22% of their stories on the front page, compared to no front-page stories in English newspapers.

English newspapers emphasized editorial/opinion pages (34.7%) and other placements (50%), highlighting analytical and detailed reporting.

### **CoP27**:

Urdu newspapers placed 17.9% of stories on the front page and 31.3% on the back page. The majority (40.8%) appeared in other sections.

English newspapers allocated a smaller share (9.1%) to the front page but gave substantial emphasis to editorial/opinion pages (26.8%) and other sections (52.8%).

#### **CoP28**:

Urdu newspapers again prioritized front-page visibility (18.3%), with 37.6% on the back page and 27.5% in other sections.

English newspapers followed a similar pattern, with the majority of stories in editorial/opinion pages (31.2%) and other sections (45.4%).

#### **General Trends**:

Urdu newspapers consistently gave higher priority to front-page and back-page coverage during all three CoP events.

English newspapers emphasized editorial/opinion pages and other placements, showcasing a preference for in-depth analysis over headline visibility.

**Interpretation**: The differing placement strategies align with the linguistic and audience segmentation. Urdu newspapers cater to a broader readership with immediate and accessible coverage, while English newspapers target an elite audience seeking detailed insights.

Table 3a. Chi-Square Test Results for Placement of Stories

COPs Test	Value	p- df value	Notes
COP26 Pearson Chi-Square	44.015	5 3 < .001	No cells had expected counts less than 5.  Minimum = 7.38
Likelihood Ratio	51.382	2 3 < .001	
Linear-by-Linear Association	24.902	2 1 < .001	
Number of Valid Cases	200		
COP27 Pearson Chi-Square	50.590	3 < .001	No cells had expected counts less than 5.  Minimum = 31.39
Likelihood Ratio	52.361	3 < .001	
Linear-by-Linear Association	23.620	) 1 < .001	
Number of Valid Cases	471		
COP28 Pearson Chi-Square	33.845	5 3 < .001	No cells had expected counts less than 5.  Minimum = 11.46
Likelihood Ratio	33.362	2 3 < .001	
Linear-by-Linear Association	26.292	2 1 < .001	

TAT 1	1	CTI	1 1 1	$\sim$	211
Niim	ner ດ	r va	เาด	Cases	314

COPs Test		p- Value df value	Notes
Total	Pearson Chi-Square	116.004 3 < .001	No cells had expected counts less than 5.  Minimum = 50.32
	Likelihood Ratio	118.657 3 < .001	
	Linear-by-Linear Association	68.658 1 < .001	
	Number of Valid Case	es 985	

#### **Statistical Results:**

**CoP26**: Pearson Chi-Square value of 44.015 (p < .001) indicates a statistically robust difference in story placement between Urdu and English newspapers.

**CoP27**: Pearson Chi-Square value of 50.590 (p < .001) reaffirms placement disparities for this event.

**CoP28**: Pearson Chi-Square value of 33.845 (p < .001) highlights consistent differences across placement strategies

**Overall:** For the total dataset, the placement differences across all CoP events are statistically supported by a Pearson Chi-Square value of 116.004 (p < .001).

**Interpretation**: The results strongly support H3; it is illustrated that Urdu and English newspapers employ different strategies of story placement during CoP events. Both Urdu and English

newspapers have different editorial priorities and expect their readers to seek front-page visibility in Urdu and in-depth analysis in English.

The results for RQ3 and H3 outline significant variations of where climate change coverage appeared in Urdu and English newspapers during CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28. Front and back pages are given importance for accessible Urdu newspapers while English newspapers emphasize editorial/opinion pages and other sections for complete examination. We statistically validate the differences in these newspapers as complementary in creating this divide in public discourse on climate change.

Urdu newspapers consistently prioritized front- and back-page placement for climate stories, whereas English newspapers placed greater emphasis on editorial/opinion sections. These differences were statistically validated across all CoP events, with chi-square values significant at p < .001.

### **Climate Change Categories**

**Table 4. Crosstabulation of Language and Climate Categories** 

Language	Climate	Count	Expected	% within	% within	% of
	Categories		Count	Language	Climate	Total
					Categories	
II.d.	Global	146	154.9	33.9%	41.2%	14.8%
Urdu	Warming					
	Droughts	0	1.8	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%

	Heatwaves	0	1.3	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Language	Climate Categories	Count	Expected Count	% within Language	% within Climate	% of
	Glacier Melting	1	4.4	0.2%	Categories 10.0%	0.1%
	Rains/Floods	121	123.0	28.1%	43.1%	12.3%
	Smog	138	99.8	32.0%	60.5%	14.0%
	Forest Fires	0	0.4	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
	GHG/CO2 Emissions	16	38.1	3.7%	18.4%	1.6%
	Human Activities	9	7.4	2.1%	52.9%	0.9%
English	Global Warming	208	199.1	37.5%	58.8%	21.1%
	Droughts	4	2.2	0.7%	100.0%	0.4%
	Heatwaves	3	1.7	0.5%	100.0%	0.3%
	Glacier Melting	9	5.6	1.6%	90.0%	0.9%
	Rains/Floods	160	158.0	28.9%	56.9%	16.2%

	Smog	90	128.2	16.2%	39.5%	9.1%
Language	Climate Categories	Count	Expected Count	% within Language	% within	% of
				gg.	Categories	
	Forest Fires	1	0.6	0.2%	100.0%	0.1%
	GHG/CO2 Emissions	71	48.9	12.8%	81.6%	7.2%
Total	Human Activities	8	9.6	1.4%	47.1%	0.8%
	Global Warming	354	354.0	35.9%	100.0%	35.9%
	Droughts	4	4.0	0.4%	100.0%	0.4%
	Heatwaves	3	3.0	0.3%	100.0%	0.3%
	Glacier Melting	10	10.0	1.0%	100.0%	1.0%
	Rains/Floods	281	281.0	28.5%	100.0%	28.5%
	Smog	228	228.0	23.1%	100.0%	23.1%
	Forest Fires	1	1.0	0.1%	100.0%	0.1%
	GHG/CO2 Emissions	87	87.0	8.8%	100.0%	8.8%

#### Human

Activities 17 17.0 1.7% 100.0% 1.7%

## **Hypothesis (H4)**

English newspapers are more likely to cover scientific and policy-related categories, whereas Urdu newspapers are more likely to focus on human-interest stories and disasters.

This hypothesis posits a thematic distinction in climate change reporting based on language and audience, reflecting varying editorial objectives and reader priorities.

## **Key Variables**

- 1. Language: English or Urdu newspapers.
- 2. **Climate Categories**: Topics such as global warming, smog, glacier melting, greenhouse gas emissions, droughts, heat waves, and human activities.
- 3. **Count** The frequency of stories categorized by climate topics.

## **Analysis and Interpretation of Tables**

**Table 4**: Crosstabulation of Language and Climate Categories

#### **Observations:**

## **Urdu Newspapers:**

Focused heavily on smog (32.0%) and rains/floods (28.1%).

Coverage of policy-oriented topics such as greenhouse gas emissions (3.7%) and human activities (2.1%) was minimal.

Virtually no coverage of droughts, heatwaves, or forest fires.

## **English Newspapers:**

Prioritized global warming (37.5%) and rains/floods (28.9%), reflecting attention to broader environmental concerns.

Covered policy-related topics such as greenhouse gas emissions (12.8%) and human activities (1.4%) more frequently than Urdu newspapers.

Included minor coverage of droughts (0.7%), heatwaves (0.5%), and forest fires (0.2%), which were absent in Urdu reporting.

#### **General Trends:**

Both language categories extensively covered rains/floods and global warming.

Smog was predominantly covered by Urdu newspapers, while English newspapers focused more on global, policy-oriented topics like greenhouse gas emissions and human activities.

## Interpretation:

Urdu newspapers emphasize immediate and visible climate issues such as smog and floods, resonating with local readerships concerned with direct impacts. In contrast, English newspapers highlight broader scientific and policy-driven narratives, aligning with an audience engaged in global environmental discourse.

**Table 4a. Chi-Square Test Results for Climate Categories** 

Test	Value	df	p-value	Notes
Pearson Chi-Square	61.201	8	< .001	7 cells (38.9%) had expected counts less than 5. Minimum = 0.44
Likelihood Ratio	67.200	8	<.001	
Linear-by-Linear Association	0.384	1	.535	
Number of Valid Cases	985			

## **Statistical Results:**

The Pearson Chi-Square value of 61.201 (p < .001) indicates a statistically significant difference in the distribution of climate categories between Urdu and English newspapers.

The likelihood ratio of 67.200 (p < .001) corroborates this finding.

However, the linear-by-linear association (p = .535) suggests that differences are not consistent across all categories.

## **Interpretation**:

The significant chi-square results validate **H4**, confirming that English newspapers are more inclined toward scientific and policy-related coverage, while Urdu newspapers predominantly cover interest and disaster-related issues.

The analysis of **RQ4** and **H4** demonstrates distinct thematic priorities in climate change reporting between English and Urdu newspapers:

**Urdu Newspapers**: Focus on local and immediate issues such as smog and floods, catering to a broader demographic with pressing concerns about visible climate impacts.

**English Newspapers**: Prioritize global warming and greenhouse gas emissions, reflecting a sophisticated narrative aimed at an elite, globally aware readership.

These findings highlight the role of language and editorial strategies in shaping public understanding of climate change.

Urdu newspapers focused predominantly on smog and floods, while English newspapers gave more space to global warming, GHG emissions, and broader environmental issues. These preferences were statistically significant, highlighting the role of editorial orientation and audience engagement.

## **Genre and Framing Style**

Table 5. Crosstabulation of Placement and Depth of Coverage (Framing: Thematic vs. Episodic)

Placement	Depth of Coverage	Count	Expected Count	% within Placement	% within  Depth of  Coverage	% of Total
Front Page	Episodic	69	55.2	60.0%	14.6%	7.0%
	Thematic	46	59.5	40.0%	9.0%	4.7%

	Other	0	0.2	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	
Placement	Depth of	Count	Expected	% within	% within Depth of	% of	
	Coverage		Count	Placement	Coverage	Total	
	Total	115	115.0	100.0%	11.7%	11.7%	
Back Page	Episodic	125	105.6	56.8%	26.4%	12.7%	
	Thematic	95	113.9	43.2%	18.6%	9.6%	
	Other	0	0.4	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%	
	Total	220	220.0	100.0%	22.3%	22.3%	
Editorial/Opinion	Episodic	12	104.7	5.5%	2.5%	1.2%	
	Thematic	205	112.9	94.0%	40.2%	20.8%	
	Other	1	0.4	0.5%	50.0%	0.1%	
	Total	218	218.0	100.0%	22.1%	22.1%	
Others	Episodic	267	207.4	61.8%	56.4%	27.1%	
	Thematic	164	223.7	38.0%	32.2%	16.6%	
	Other	1	0.9	0.2%	50.0%	0.1%	

Placement	Depth of Coverage	Count	Expected Count	% within Placement	% within Depth of Coverage	% of
	Total	432	432.0	100.0%	43.9%	43.9%
Total	Episodic	473	473.0	48.0%	100.0%	48.0%
	Thematic	510	510.0	51.8%	100.0%	51.8%
	Other	2	2.0	0.2%	100.0%	0.2%
	Total	985	985.0	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

## Hypothesis (H5)

# Op-ed page articles will exhibit more thematic framing compared to articles placed on other pages in both English and Urdu newspapers.

This hypothesis predicts that editorials and opinion pages, which generally allow for in-depth discussion, will feature more thematic framing compared to front-page, back-page, or other placements. **Variables** 

- 1. Placement: Includes front page, back page, editorial/opinion page, and other sections.
- 2. **Depth of Coverage**: Framing styles are categorized as episodic, thematic, and other.
- 3. **Count** the Frequency of stories by framing style and placement.

## **Analysis and Interpretation of Tables**

**Table 5**: Crosstabulation of Placement and Depth of Coverage (Framing: Thematic vs. Episodic)

#### **Observations:**

## Front Page:

The majority of stories were episodic (60%), with thematic stories comprising 40%.

Episodic framing dominates, reflecting an emphasis on immediate and event-driven coverage for high-visibility stories.

## Back Page:

Episodic framing accounted for 56.8% of the stories, while thematic framing made up 43.2%.

This section slightly balances between detailed narratives and event-based reporting.

### **Editorial/Opinion Pages:**

Thematic framing was overwhelmingly predominant (94%), with episodic framing accounting for only 5.5%.

Thematic framing's prevalence aligns with the function of these pages to provide analysis and expert commentary.

### **Other Sections:**

Episodic framing remained dominant (61.8%), while thematic framing contributed 38%. The tendency toward episodic framing reflects the general purpose of these sections for shorter or less analytical content.

#### **General Trends:**

Editorial/opinion pages are highly thematic and consistent with the hypothesis.

Although somewhat thematic, the front and back pages lean heavily toward episodic framing due to their focus on headline-driven content.

## **Interpretation**:

The placement of stories significantly influences framing styles. Editorial and opinion pages favor thematic framing, offering analytical depth, while front and back pages prioritize episodic framing, catering to immediate attention-grabbing narratives.

Table 5a. Chi-Square Test Results for Placement and Depth of Coverage

Test	Value	df	p-value	Notes
				Four cells (33.3%) had expected
Pearson Chi-Square	204.872	6	< .001	counts less than 5. Minimum =
				0.23
Likelihood Ratio	242.114	6	<.001	
Linear-by-Linear	0.455		400	
Association	0.477	1	.490	
Number of Valid				
Cases	985	985		

## **Statistical Results:**

Pearson's Chi-Square value of 204.872 (p < .001) indicates a highly significant difference in framing styles across various placements.

The likelihood ratio of 242.114 (p < .001) supports the robustness of this finding.

The linear-by-linear association (p = .490) suggests that the relationship is not linear but remains significant across placement types.

## **Interpretation:**

The chi-square results validate **H5**, confirming that editorial/opinion pages are significantly more thematic compared to other sections. This pattern aligns with their purpose of providing depth and context in climate change reporting.

## **Summary**

The findings for **RQ5** and **H5** reveal substantial variations in framing based on the placement of climate change stories:

**Editorial/Opinion Pages**: Exhibit predominantly thematic framing, emphasizing analysis and comprehensive coverage.

Front and Back Pages: Show a stronger inclination toward episodic framing, focusing on immediacy and relatability.

Other Sections: Favor episodic framing, reflecting their general-purpose nature.

These results underline the influence of genre and placement in shaping media narratives on climate change.

Editorial and opinion pieces in both languages were overwhelmingly thematic (94%), while frontand back-page articles leaned more episodic. The results support the hypothesis that editorial sections are more likely to offer analytical perspectives on climate change

## **Length of Articles and Framing**

**Table 6. Crosstabulation of Length and Language** 

<b>Length Language Count</b>		Expected	% within %		within	
		Count	Length	Language	% of Total	
Small	Urdu	361	286.2	55.2%	83.8%	36.6%
	English	293	367.8	44.8%	52.9%	29.7%
	Total	654	654.0	100.0%		66.4%
Mediun	<b>n</b> Urdu	58	122.1	20.8%	13.5%	5.9%
	English	221	156.9	79.2%	39.9%	22.4%
	Total	279	279.0	100.0%		28.3%
Large	Urdu	12	22.8	23.1%	2.8%	1.2%
	English	40	29.2	76.9%	7.2%	4.1%
	Total	52	52.0	100.0%		5.3%
Total	Urdu	431	431.0	43.8%	100.0%	43.8%
	English	554	554.0	56.2%	100.0%	56.2%
	Total	985	985.0	100.0%	100.0%	100.0%

## Hypothesis (H6)

English newspapers are more likely to feature prominent stories (above 1000 words) on climate change compared to Urdu newspapers.

This hypothesis posits that English newspapers, catering to an audience seeking comprehensive analysis, will produce longer articles compared to Urdu newspapers.

## **Key Variables**

- 1. **Language**: English or Urdu newspapers.
- 2. **Story Length**: Categorized as small, medium, and large.
- 3. **Count**: The frequency of stories based on length and language.

## **Analysis and Interpretation of Tables**

**Table 6**: Crosstabulation of Length and Language

#### **Observations:**

#### **Small Stories:**

Urdu newspapers published 361 small stories (55.2% within the length category and 83.8% within the language category), dominating this length category.

English newspapers contributed 293 small stories (44.8% within the length category and 52.9% within the language category).

Small stories accounted for the majority of coverage in both languages (66.4% of the total).

## **Medium Stories**:

English newspapers published a significantly higher proportion of medium-length stories (79.2%) compared to Urdu newspapers (20.8%).

Medium stories represented 28.3% of the total dataset.

## **Large Stories:**

English newspapers dominated the large story category, contributing 76.9% of such articles, while Urdu newspapers accounted for only 23.1%.

Large stories represented the smallest share of coverage (5.3% of the total dataset).

## **Interpretation**:

Urdu newspapers overwhelmingly focus on short articles, catering to a general audience that values brevity. English newspapers, in contrast, allocate more space for medium and significant articles, aligning with their analytical and policy-driven focus.

Table 6a
Chi-Square Test Results for Length and Language

Test	Value	df	p-value	Notes		
Pearson Chi-Square	103.633	2	<.001	No cells had expected counts less than 5.		
Likelihood Ratio	109.149	2	<.001	Minimum = 22.75		
Linear-by-Linear	87.951	1	< .001			
Association Number of Valid Cases 985						

## **Statistical Results:**

The Pearson Chi-Square value of 103.633 (p < .001) indicates a highly significant difference in story lengths between English and Urdu newspapers.

The likelihood ratio of 109.149 (p < .001) further corroborates the variation in story lengths. The linear-by-linear association value (87.951, p < .001) reflects a strong, consistent relationship across the length categories.

### Interpretation:

The results strongly support **H6**, demonstrating that English newspapers prioritize longer articles more frequently than Urdu newspapers. This aligns with their audience's expectations for in-depth reporting and analysis.

## Summary

The findings for **H6** reveal a clear disparity in story lengths between English and Urdu newspapers: Urdu Newspapers: Focus primarily on short articles, reflecting the preferences of a broad, general readership.

**English Newspapers**: Allocate more space for medium and large stories, catering to readers interested in detailed and policy-oriented content.

The statistical analysis confirms these distinctions, highlighting the role of language and audience in shaping journalistic practices.

The analysis shows that English newspapers published more medium and long articles, while Urdu newspapers focused on shorter stories. This indicates a strong relationship between language and article length, with significant differences (p < .001) that reflect the depth of coverage typical for each media category.

## Summary of Findings and Hypothesis Support

The statistical analysis across six key dimensions of climate change reporting strongly supports the study's hypotheses. English newspapers consistently favored thematic framing, longer articles,

and policy-focused content, whereas Urdu newspapers employed episodic framing, shorter stories, and disaster-related coverage. These patterns reflect editorial and linguistic distinctions that shape climate communication in Pakistan.

#### Chapter 5

#### **Discussion**

The present study investigated how climate change issues are framed in Pakistan's leading English and Urdu newspapers, focusing on thematic and episodic framing patterns. The findings reveal significant differences in how climate change is communicated across linguistic lines, with English newspapers (Dawn and The Express Tribune) consistently exhibiting a higher proportion of thematic framing, while Urdu newspapers (Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt) relied more heavily on episodic framing. These findings underscore the influence of language, audience orientation, and editorial culture in shaping climate narratives.

A total of 985 articles were analyzed using a structured coding sheet, examining variables such as article placement, length, genre, source, climate category, and framing type. The data showed that 61.2% of articles in English newspapers were thematically framed, focusing on systemic causes, policy responses, and long-term solutions, often linked to international agreements like the Paris Agreement or discussions at CoP conferences. In contrast, 60.3% of Urdu newspaper articles followed episodic framing, emphasizing event-based coverage, human-interest stories, and the immediate impact of disasters such as floods, smog, and heatwaves.

Moreover, placement and length were found to correlate with framing patterns. Thematic frames were more likely to appear in editorials and opinion sections and in longer articles (above 1000 words), particularly in English dailies. Conversely, episodic frames were dominant in front-page stories and shorter articles, especially in Urdu newspapers, where coverage tended to be more emotional and event driven.

A noteworthy trend was observed in the coverage of CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28. English newspapers not only covered these events in greater depth but also linked them to broader policy discourses, financial commitments, and global climate governance. In contrast, Urdu newspapers mentioned CoP events sparingly and framed them around domestic implications, such as government participation or potential foreign aid, rarely delving into the structural or policy dimensions of these conferences.

Additionally, thematic focus differed between language groups. English newspapers gave more attention to topics like global warming, GHG emissions, climate finance, and climate diplomacy, aligning with the international discourse. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers prioritized localized concerns such as floods, heatwaves, and air pollution, often omitting broader contextualization or causality.

These results indicate a clear divide in climate communication strategies, shaped by audience expectations, media objectives, and cultural orientation. While English newspapers serve a more policy-aware and elite readership, Urdu newspapers function as vehicles of grassroots communication, often conveying the visible effects of climate change to the general public.

This study has systematically analyzed the framing of climate change issues in four leading Pakistani newspapers i.e. Dawn and The Express Tribune (English), and Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt (Urdu) over three critical timeframes corresponding with CoP26 (2021), CoP27 (2022), and CoP28 (2023). Using quantitative content analysis, it explored how framing types (thematic vs. episodic), article placement, length, genre, and climate categories differ across linguistic lines and media platforms.

The analysis confirms that English newspapers predominantly use thematic framing, often embedding stories in broader global and policy-oriented contexts. This is in line with Boykoff and

Roberts (2007) and Feldman & Hart (2018), who argue that thematic framing in elite media helps audiences understand systemic causes and long-term implications of climate change. Such framing enables critical public engagement, especially in societies where policy literacy and media exposure are higher among English-reading populations.

In contrast, Urdu newspapers show a preference for episodic framing, focusing on short-term, emotional narratives such as floods, smog, and heatwaves. These findings support previous work by Iyengar (1991) and Raza & Shah (2024), who emphasize that episodic framing dominates media aimed at broader, less policy-oriented audiences. In the context of Pakistan's multilingual society, this reflects a deep-rooted linguistic divide in climate narratives, where English serves the urban elite and Urdu caters to the general population.

The study also found that article placement and genre are critical indicators of framing type.

Editorials and opinion columns were most likely to use thematic framing, as supported by shah (2019) and Javed et al. (2020), who noted that editorials serve as vehicles for deeper analysis and calls for policy action. Conversely, front-page and short-length news items are common in Urdu dailies and are tended to use episodic framing, capturing readers' attention but offering limited context or solutions.

In terms of thematic categories, English newspapers emphasized topics such as climate finance, GHG emissions and international cooperation, reflecting the global discourse on climate governance (Schäfer et al., 2021; Chen et al., 2022). Urdu newspapers, however, focused on localized environmental issues like smog, rainfall, and glacial melt which directly affect their readership and align with findings from Akram et al. (2023) and Saeed & Salik (2022).

Overall, the study supports the idea that media framing is strongly influenced by language, cultural context, and audience orientation. It reinforces the literature's assertion that thematic framing is

more prevalent in elite, globally oriented media, while episodic framing dominates in vernacular, mass-circulation outlets. These framing patterns influence public understanding, policy engagement, and the effectiveness of climate communication.

## Alignment of Research Questions with Hypotheses and Findings

After establishing the core findings of this study, it is now possible to evaluate how these results respond to the research questions and whether they support the proposed hypotheses. The research aimed to explore how climate change issues are framed in leading English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan, with a focus on thematic and episodic framing strategies and their variation across language, placement, length, genre, and coverage of CoP events.

This chapter provides a critical analysis of the findings, linking them to the research questions and hypotheses while situating them within the broader academic literature. The study focuses on the framing of climate change issues in leading English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan, highlighting how linguistic and cultural differences influence media narratives. The discussion below details alignment of each research question and hypothesis with the findings.

## **Research Question 1 (RQ1):**

## How are climate change issues being presented by the top English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan?

It was identified that English newspapers accommodated a thematic frame (61.2%), while Urdu newspapers essentially provided an episodic frame (60.3%) (Table 1). This is consistent with previous research, which indicates that such thematic framing is more common in elite audiences targeted media (Iyengar, 1991; Boykoff & Smith, 2022), as this form of framing includes an analysis and policy implications. On the other hand, episodic framing is more resonant with a

broader audience in terms of proximity to and human interest in immediate events (Shehata & Strömbäck, 2021).

## H1: Thematic framing will be used more frequently by the English newspaper than by the Urdu newspaper.

The data support the hypothesis with statistically significant differences in framing styles ( $\chi^2$  = 47.39, p < .001). Following Schäfer and Schlichting (2020), English newspapers turn to thematic framing to shape policy-oriented discourse due to newspapers' preference for thematic framing.

## H2: English newspapers will not use episodic framing as often as Urdu newspapers will.

And Urdu newspapers confirm this hypothesis by clearly preferring episodic framing. Similarly, Nabi et al. (2023) stress that episodic narratives in local spoken languages resonate well with local audiences. The analysis confirmed that English newspapers predominantly use thematic framing, while Urdu newspapers rely heavily on episodic framing, supporting H1 and H2. These framing strategies reflect differences in editorial focus and target audience expectations.

## **Research Question 2 (RQ2):**

## How do English and Urdu newspapers differ in their episodic and thematic framing with respect to climate change?

A key finding is that there are considerable differences in framing between the two languages. Global trends in elite media, as described by Boykoff and Roberts (2019), mirror English newspapers' thematic approach and Urdu newspapers' episodic approach may be considered to reflect localized concerns and the cultural context.

The data showed a statistically significant difference in the depth of coverage, confirming the greater use of policy-based thematic frames in English papers and event-based episodic frames in Urdu ones. This affirms the linguistic and cultural distinctions proposed in the study.

## **Research Question 3 (RQ3):**

## How does the framing of climate change issues vary across CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28?

Coverage of CoP events revealed consistent differences. English newspapers maintained a thematic focus across all three events, with the highest thematic framing during CoP28 (71.4%), compared to Urdu newspapers' episodic emphasis (Table 2). The findings align with Schäfer et al. (2021), who highlight the role of language in shaping perceptions of international climate events. H3: Coverage of CoP events will differ significantly in placement and framing across English and Urdu newspapers.

The hypothesis is supported by the results, with significant chi-square values across all CoP events  $(\chi^2 = 47.391, p < .001)$ . English newspapers prioritized editorial sections for thematic analysis, whereas Urdu newspapers focused on front-page visibility, reflecting divergent editorial priorities (Table 3).

Coverage during CoP events revealed that English newspapers gave greater emphasis to international policy discussions, whereas Urdu newspapers offered limited CoP coverage with a domestic focus, supporting H3.

## **Research Question 4 (RQ4):**

## What variations exist in the framing of climate change issues based on genre and placement?

Editorial and opinion pages predominantly employed thematic framing (94%), while front and back pages leaned toward episodic framing (Table 5). This supports the findings by Shah (2019), who argue that editorial sections are designed for in-depth analysis.

## H5: Op-ed page articles will exhibit more thematic framing compared to articles on other pages.

The data validated the hypothesis, with chi-square results confirming significant framing differences based on placement ( $\chi^2 = 204.872$ , p < .001). Editorial pages' thematic focus aligns with their analytical function.

Editorials and columns were more likely to feature thematic framing, especially in English newspapers, while front-page stories in both languages used episodic framing, validating H5.

## **Research Question 5 (RQ5):**

How does the frequency of climate change-related categories vary between English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan?

H4: English newspapers are more likely to cover scientific and policy-related categories, whereas Urdu newspapers will focus on human-interest stories and disasters.

The hypothesis is confirmed by statistically significant chi-square results ( $\chi^2 = 61.201$ , p < .001). English newspapers' emphasis on policy reflects their alignment with global discourse, whereas Urdu newspapers cater to local concerns, consistent with research by Schäfer and O'Neill (2020).

H6: English newspapers are more likely to feature prominent stories (above 1000 words) on climate change compared to Urdu newspapers.

English newspapers emphasized global warming, emissions, and climate finance, while Urdu newspapers focused more on floods, heatwaves, and smog supporting H4. English papers also published longer articles (>1000 words) with detailed context and policy analysis, confirming H6.

## 5.1. Climate Change Coverage: Thematic and Episodic

The results of this study are consistent with framing theory, namely Iyengar's (1991) thematicepisodic partition. Throughout, English-language newspapers (Dawn and Express

Tribune) prefer thematic framing that emphasizes systemic problems, policy repercussions, and the scientific underpinnings of the day's climate news. This framing strategy places climate change within a structural and long-term realm where solutions need coordinated action. Similar findings from other contexts (Boykoff et al., 2022). show that such thematic narratives resonate with educated and policy-focused audiences. English newspapers, through their coverage, integrate global concerns such as greenhouse gas emissions and international climate agreements to produce a public discourse that is analytical and all-rounded.

On the other hand, Urdu newspapers (Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt) use predominantly episodic framing and focus on localized effects such as floods, smog, and heat waves. This emboldens the approach by targeting the immediate concerns of their readership, who stand a greater likelihood of experiencing more tangible climate change in their daily lives. The more powerful framing in episodic terms is emotion packing, but it cuts off broader understanding because it cuts off understanding historical sequences of events from their systemic causes. According to this pattern, narratives. Feldman and Hart's (2018) research on episodic narratives points toward a fragmented understanding.

The similarities and differences encountered in the analysis of framing in the English and Urdu newspapers were a result of the combination of audience demographics, editorial processes, and affiliation with an institution. English language dailies like Dawn and The News International mainly serve urban, educated and policy centred audiences, which is why they highlight global climate diplomacy, scientific evidence, and policy messaging (Hussain, Saleem, & Ishaq, 2019; Nazeer et al., 2024). On the other hand the Urdu newspaper such as Jang peer to a more general audience which is rural and semi urban and they also have a proclivity towards more localized, culturally familiar representation that is based on national political rhetoric (Saeed, Hussain, & Riaz, 2023). Studies also indicate that the English media in Pakistan assumes a

liberal and elite oriented approach, focusing more on professional and global frames when compared with the Urdu media that can be described as populist and locally oriented (Khuhro & Bin Mohd Adnan, 2024). These structural and demographic differences affect the thematic emphasis, source use, and tone of voice in both media streams making them frame the same climate related occurrences in different ways.

## 5.2.Language and Cultural Influences.

Thus, the linguistic divide in framing styles manifests English and Urdu newspapers' cultural and socio-political priorities. Aligned with global media practices, English newspapers adopt thematic framing to connect themselves with international discourse and policy debates (Schäfer et al,2020). While Urdu newspapers serve a more varied and localized public, they provide news stories that are immediate and action-packed, oriented towards immediate and current affairs, and speak to their public's lived experience.

The reason for this divergence is that editorial priorities and audience expectations differ. In contrast, English newspapers are aimed at the upper-middle-class, urban readership inclined to put more incredible stores in analytical and policy reporting. While Urdu newspapers cater to a larger audience that is rural and not very educated, they prefer content that can be relatable, and that can be acted upon. The findings illustrate the more general role of media in generating public perception of climate change, as Nabi et al. (2023) asserted, about how linguistic and cultural factors determine media narratives.

In many respects, the linguistic divide observable in media coverage reflects thicker cultural and socio-political ones. However, English newspapers such as these are catered towards an urban, educated market and are therefore written in policy-oriented language and with global references that are in line with what is being said on an international climate agenda. By comparison, Urdu newspapers tend to prefer local narratives and speak using language embedded in cultural

references that have mass appeal. This divergence emphasizes the relevance of the cultural aspect while framing climate change (Guenther et al., 2024).

## **5.3.**Coverage of CoP Events

An illustration of how international climate governance reporting by English and Urdu newspapers differs in its coverage of CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28 is provided. English newspapers are thus extremely concerned about policy commitments, scientific achievements, and global collaboration. This takes a thematic approach to locate Pakistan as a nation part of the global situation and a more significant part of global climate action, as a developing nation.

English and Urdu newspapers had different priorities regarding CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28 coverage. Although Pakistan's ability to curtail emissions is frequently debated and Iran is a disputed actor, English media represented Pakistan and Iran as interesting participants in climate governance processes, focusing on policy discussions about international collaborations and emission reduction targets. However, Urdu media highlighted the socio-economic outcomes of CoP outcomes involving funding for adaptation and community resilience. The difference matches audience segmentation from South Asian media studies (Asavir et al., 2021).

Nevertheless, Urdu newspapers stress the socio-economic implications of CoP outcomes, such as ground for adaptation funding and likely impacts on local livelihoods. This episodic framing reflects the priorities of their readership—readers are more focused on tangible benefits or addressing the next biggest challenge. This is consistent with research from Boykoff (2021) that reveals different ways media in developed and developing countries handle climate governance.

### 5.4. Placement and the depth of coverage

More importantly, articles placed in newspapers can significantly shape how they are framed and how they impact individuals. The framing of front-page stories in Urdu newspapers is mainly

episodic, focusing on immediate and dramatic events (floods and heat waves). The space dedicated to thematic analysis in English newspapers' editorial and opinion sections aligns with their policy and systemic solution writing.

Coverage also varies in depth, with English newspapers publishing full-length reports offering complete analyses of climate issues. On the other hand, Urdu newspapers prefer short articles, and their articles are much shorter than English newspapers because Urdu audiences work within a set time frame and need to get information fast. Rhaman (2018) suggests that article placement and length significantly affect audience engagement and understanding of content.

## 5.5. Thematic Categories in Climate Reporting

Analysis of the thematic categories shows a striking distinction between the priorities of the English and Urdu newspapers. English newspaper discourse about global warming, greenhouse gas emissions, and international climate agreements conforms to and supports global discourse. Yet Urdu newspapers focus on localized topics like smog and floods and activities happening in their audience's neighborhood (Fizzah, 2021).

For example, extensive reporting on smog in Urdu newspapers shows the effects of smog on public health and people's daily lives, and urban centers like Lahore make an example. Smog is also mentioned in English newspapers, which frame the problem of smog as part of bigger air pollution problem in the context of environmental governance. Therefore, there is a connection between what Barri and Shahzad (2022) say that media mostly paints the context of climate matters to different audiences.

## 5.6. Framing and Public Engagement

Framing climate change in English and Urdu newspapers offers potential to engage the public and educate them to be better climate literates. In English newspapers, these understand systemic

challenges through thematic narratives that resonate with audiences to connect individual experiences to broader socio political contexts (Guenther et al., 2024). Episodic Urdu newspaper narratives are successful in calling attention to particular events, but often lead to a fragmented view of an issue and the attenuation of the potential for sustained engagement with solving the issue.

Therefore, it becomes a point of balance in seeking ways off framing strategies that serve many audiences. To improve their coverage, Urdu newspapers should overlay their episodized narratives with thematic elements that can make available stories that can speak to the readers and in so doing bring a broader context. Locational and event based news narrative can be used by English newspapers to serve a more major composition of readers (Saleem & Rahman, 2022).

The way in which climate change is being framed is distinct between English and Urdu newspapers and has essential implications for public engagement of climate change. Thematic frames found in English newspapers better understand systemic challenges and achieve a closer link between individual experience and the broader socio-political context (Feldman and Hart, 2018). Episodic frames used by Urdu newspapers are designed to have the reader focus on individual events, but they excel in generating sporadic and partial understanding of issues and rarely go to any lengths at all in terms of seeking any solutions over the long-time scale.

The difference in framing distinguishing English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan caught this study's eye the most, as the climate change discourse is framed in terms of episodic and thematic frames in both media. English newspapers (Dawn and Express Tribune) used the thematic framing to provide systemic and policy dominated view about climate change. This is corroborated by findings of Boykoff (2024) that global media has a preference for long policy implications.

Thematic frames serve as an important part in the construction of elite and policy-oriented discourse in English newspapers. These frames promote systemic thinking and help connect one experience to others to address the larger climate challenges.

Further, Urdu newspapers (Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt) mostly depended upon episodic framing discourse, which centered on immediate impacts and particular stories. This resonates with a larger audience, bringing the issues back to a human scale and making them local. While episodic framing manages to place events within their context, it too easily traps events into being isolated from their wider context, making it difficult for audiences to understand systemic causes and possible solutions to problems (Feldman & Hart, 2018).

## 5.7.Lack of integration with Theoretical Framework

This study's findings confirm the theoretical framework and the ideas regarding thematic and episodic framing, agenda setting, and cultural resonance. The framing of thematic articles across English newspapers replicates Iyengar's (1991) model, centered on systemic issues and policy solutions. Stories in Urdu newspapers are framed episodically because these tales resonate with how important localized narratives are for their readership (Chong & Druckman, 2007). Understanding the role of mass media in shaping the public discourse also provides some valuable lenses provided by agenda-setting theory. English and Urdu newspapers change what some readers think about and how they understand climate change by promoting select aspects of climate change over others. These findings also highlight the significance of media framing to the broader debate around public engagement with climate change and the role of linguistic and cultural factors in framing climate change news (Waleed, 2024).

## **5.8.Links with Agenda-Setting Theory**

The findings also reinforce the agenda-setting theory as a theory of media influence in the public discourse. English and Urdu newspapers situate certain aspects of climate change at the front and center of their agenda and, by doing so, determine what their audiences think about and how they think about these issues. English newspapers' thematic focus complements such global climate agenda. In contrast, the episodic focus of Urdu newspapers converses such local agendas, implying the media's twin role in constructing public perceptions and policy debate.

## Chapter 6

## **Implications:**

## 6.1. Empirical Implications

The present study offers strong empirical evidence about the extent to which linguistic and cultural factors shape the climate change framing in Pakistani newspapers. Results of the significant chisquare displayed across framing styles, placement strategies, and thematic content demonstrate the existence of distinct audience priorities and editorial strategy in English and Urdu newspapers. Thematic framing is given preference by English newspapers, and they align with global and policy-oriented narratives. In contrast, Urdu newspapers prefer episodic framing to resonate with local and event-based concerns. These findings speak to broader media studies empirics and provide a context-specific framing view of Pakistan's diverse media landscape.

## **6.2.** Theoretical Implications

This study extends Iyengar's episodic-thematic dichotomy to a crosslinguistic and cultural context and contributes to the theoretical discourse on media framing. The study finds that language and cultural audience segmentation can mediate the application of these frames. This research situates the results within broader theories of agenda-setting and the formation of public discourse around climate change. It highlights the importance of linguistic media in the narratives constructed around this issue. Additionally, the results indicate that framing theory can be extended to a more explicit consideration of socio-cultural factors and for subsequent comparative studies.

## **6.3. Practical Implications:**

- For Journalists and Editors: Thus, the findings indicate that editorial teams of Urdu and English newspapers need to address the need for balanced reporting in favor of thematic and episodic frames.
- For Policymakers: Thematic framing's dominance in English newspapers allows policymakers to convey policy-related information to an elite audience. On the other hand, grassroots climate campaigns in Urdu newspapers can be exploited in Urdu newspapers due to their episodic focus.
- For Climate Advocates: By knowing these newspapers' framing tendencies, climate communicators can design more effective narratives that speak more slackly to their audiences' linguistic and demographic groups.

#### Limitations

**Temporal Scope:** This limits the analysis to periods of climate discourse surrounding CoP 26, CoP 27, and CoP 28 events. A longitudinal study could obtain a deeper understanding of framing trends through time.

**Newspaper Selection**: Although the study focused on leading newspapers, some concerns, excluding regional and online-only platforms, may exclude different narratives and framing styles. **Quantitative Bias:** While the inferential insights provided by reliance on chi-square statistics are very strong, they may miss illuminating nuances of qualitative aspects of narrative framing for which textual analysis might provide insight. An approach that combines both mixed methods and an analysis that engages discourse or textual inquiry would have added value to the results, as it would have discovered the underlying strata of meaning present in climate change discourse.

#### Recommendations

## For Policymakers

Policymakers can use thematic narratives in English newspapers to promote a systemic understanding of climate issues among urban elites and decision-makers. To make climate communication strategies inclusive and context-sensitive, episodic narratives in Urdu newspapers can be employed on the same footing to create awareness in rural and semi-urban areas.

#### For Media Practitioners

This study also suggests that media practitioners craft balanced accounts using thematic and episodic frames. Combining systemic analysis with stories relatable to the reader could help newspapers further explain climate change without sacrificing readers' interest. Training programs for journalists on climate communication can drive further refinement among journalists.

#### For Climate Advocates

Media outlets should get together with climate advocates to amplify localized narratives and make visible systemic solutions. How Journalists, Scientists, and Policymakers Can Break Down Knowledge Gaps to Produce Accurate, Impactful Media Narratives.

#### Conclusion

This study set out to examine how climate change is framed in leading English and Urdu newspapers in Pakistan through the lens of quantitative content analysis. The primary objective was to analyze the use of episodic and thematic framing across different linguistic media platforms and assess how these framing patterns vary by newspaper type, article length, placement, and climate-related topics particularly during international climate events such as CoP26, CoP27, and CoP28. The findings revealed a clear linguistic and editorial divide in the way climate change is communicated. English newspapers (Dawn and The Express Tribune) predominantly employed thematic framing, focusing on systemic causes, policy measures, international climate negotiations, and long-term implications. In contrast, Urdu newspapers (Jang and Nawa-i-Waqt) favored episodic framing, highlighting localized disasters, weather-related tragedies, and immediate impacts of climate events on communities. Statistical analysis confirmed significant differences in framing styles across languages and platforms, reinforcing the idea that media framing is shaped by audience orientation, cultural expectations, and editorial policies. Thematic frames were commonly found in longer articles and opinion/editorial sections, while episodic frames were more frequent in shorter articles and front-page reports, especially in Urdu-language media. By bridging the gap between language, media behavior, and climate communication, this study contributes to a better understanding of how media framing can influence public discourse and awareness of environmental issues. It offers valuable insights for media practitioners, environmental communicators, and policymakers on the importance of context-rich, policyinformed journalism in addressing climate change at both national and global levels.

Ultimately, the study emphasizes that in multilingual societies like Pakistan, media language is not just a medium of communication but also a mediator of meaning, shaping how different audiences understand and engage with climate change. This research provides a foundational step toward evaluating the role of linguistic media in environmental awareness and offers pathways for future research to explore audience reception and the impact of framing on public perception and behavior.

The role of English and Urdu newspapers in making meaning for Pakistan is dual. These media outlets favor thematic and episodic framing, respectively, and oblige by serving a different type of audience and, in general, the same linguistic and cultural divides. The findings systematically validate the hypotheses and answer research questions, providing critical insights for academic and practical application. Integrating digital media into the conversation around climate change could offer a complete understanding of how we move through the themes and access the ever more episodic nature of democratic participation in an increasingly digital media landscape. Although this study provides some information about the framing of climate change as it appears in Urdu and English newspapers in Pakistan, it is not constraint-free. Methodologically, the content analysis used can be systematic but also lacking in depth of language or implicit meanings of the news articles. The concentration on four key papers (while overlooking predictable regional and digital platforms) also thus misses out on additional perspectives, especially in places most vulnerable to climate change. The coverage analysis is performed temporally over November and December 2021, 2022, and 2023 (CoP events).

This study focuses on climate change framing in the Pakistani media by incorporating the linguistic and cultural aspects of the issue. It presents implications for journalists, policymakers, and climate change advocates. Through thematic and episodic framing dichotomy comparisons in English and Urdu newspapers, the research emphasizes the need for multiple communication strategies to address the different audience requirements. Further research should be undertaken to understand

how digital media and reception studies could advance the study of communication on climate in multilingual contexts.

The research emphasizes the linguistic and cultural facets of media framing in influencing how people engage with the climate change issue. It compares thematic and episodic frames in Urdu and English newspapers to reveal how Pakistani media differs in addressing the country's climate challenges. The results point to the necessity for inclusive climate message scenery addressing the diversity of people to close the gap between the global and local climate narratives.

Online platforms are increasingly influencing public discourse, and future research should test how digital media may be used as a force for climate communication. Furthermore, audience reception studies could contribute important information on how differing age categories and demographic representation perceive and react to media framing of climate change. Targeted recommendations for scholars and practitioners are presented that, if acted upon, have the potential to advance the field of climate communication and lead to more effective strategies for public engagement and policy advocacy.

While this timeframe is important for international climate conversations, it misses periods when climate might dominate a local conversation, for example, floods or smog. As a contextualization argument, Urdu and English media get left out, and then, by nature of the argument, regional languages like Sindhi or Pashto, which, as you can imagine, bring in different cultural backgrounds. Furthermore, since the newspapers selected are urban-centric, they may not express the interests of the rural areas. However, theoretical limitations such as using the thematic—episodic framing dichotomy exclude hybrid frames that include elements of both. The study does not look into how audiences interpret these frames but further understands how various demographics make sense of climate stories. Last is the exclusion of digital media, both social platforms and blogs,

thereby reducing the scope of the analysis when communication online is critical to climate discourse.

## References:

- Abdel Nabi, E., Shafik, S. A., & Saad, A. M. (2023). Assessment of Nursing Students' Awareness regarding Climate Change. *Helwan International Journal for Nursing Research and Practice*, 2(1), 69-82.10.21608/hijnrp.2023.201614.1068
- Adnan, M., Xiao, B., Bibi, S., Xiao, P., Zhao, P., & Wang, H. (2024). Addressing current climate issues in Pakistan: an opportunity for a sustainable future. *Environmental Challenges*, 100887. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envc.2024.100887
- Afsheen, S., & Naz, F. (2024). The Intersection of Digital Media and Climate Change in Pakistan:

  Assessing Awareness and Charting a Path Forward. *Journal of Media and Communication*Studies,

  4(2).https://media.teckiz.com/amcap-jmcs-association-of-media-andcommunication-academic-profe/jmcs-amcap/2024/07/09/668d39b1821a0.pdf.
- Afzal, M. S. (2024). Print Media Coverage of Climate Change Crisis in Pakistan: A Comparative Study of Two Newspapers Dawn and Daily Times. *Journalism, Politics and Society*, 2(01), 21-39.https://doi.org/10.63067/fay9ab50
- Afzal, M. S. (2024). Print Media Coverage of Climate Change Crisis in Pakistan: A Comparative Study of Two Newspapers Dawn and Daily Times. *Journalism, Politics and Society*, 2(01), 21–39. <a href="https://doi.org/10.63067/fay9ab50">https://doi.org/10.63067/fay9ab50</a>
- AFZAL, N. (2017). The media portrayal of Arab spring in newspaper editorials: The case of Pakistani The News International and Saudi Arabian Arab News. *Unpublished doctoral dissertation, Universiti Utara Malaysia, Malaysia*. <a href="https://hdl.handle.net/10037/33035">https://hdl.handle.net/10037/33035</a>
- Akram, N., Khan, N., & Ahmed, N. (2023). Climate Change Issue in the Pakistani Press: Exploring the Predominant Themes during and after the 2022-Floods. *Pakistan Languages and Humanities Review*, 7(3), 225-237.

- Ali, A., & Manzoor, S. (2021). Media and climate change in Pakistan: Perception of the journalists in mainstream media. *Annals of Social Sciences and Perspective*, 2(2), 145-155. <a href="https://doi.org/10.52700/assap.v2i2.82">https://doi.org/10.52700/assap.v2i2.82</a>
- Ali, A., & Manzoor, S. (2021). Media and climate change in Pakistan: Perception of the journalists in mainstream media. *Annals of Social Sciences and Perspective*, 2(2), 145-155. <a href="https://doi.org/10.52700/assap.v2i2.82">https://doi.org/10.52700/assap.v2i2.82</a>
- Ali, A., Riaz, M., & Ahmed, S. (2024). Historical Narratives And Modern Media: Climate Change Discourses In Pakistan. *Migration Letters*, 21(S13), 346-355.
- Ali, S., Saeed, A., Kiani, R. S., Muhammad, S., Khan, F., Babar, R., ... & Fahad, S. (2021). Future climatic changes, extreme events, related uncertainties, and policy recommendations in the Hindu Kush sub-regions of Pakistan. *Theoretical and Applied Climatology*, *143*, 193-209. https://doi.org/10.1007/s00704-020-03399-7
- Ashraf, H. (2023). The ambivalent role of Urdu and English in multilingual Pakistan: a

  Bourdieusian study. *Language policy*, 22(1), 25-48.

  https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2017.1281035
- Asif, A., Jamil, N., & Ahmad, S. (2024). Media Portrayal of Climate Change in Pakistan: A Systematic Literature Review. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 8(2), 332-339. https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2024(8-II-S)29
- Asif, A., Jamil, N., & Ahmad, S. (2024). Media Portrayal of Climate Change in Pakistan: A Systematic Literature Review. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 8(2), 332-339. https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2024(8-II-S)29
- Asif, A., Jamil, N., & Ahmad, S. (2024). Media Portrayal of Climate Change in Pakistan: A Systematic Literature Review. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 8(2), 332-339

- Barri, F. A., & Shahzad, M. (2022). The Editorial Coverage on Climate Change in Context of Other Emerging Environmental Issues: A Comparative Analysis of English and Urdu Print Media of Pakistan. *Global Regional Review*, 8(2), 211-220. http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/grr.2022(VII-II).20
- Batool, S. (2019). Media representations and refugees crises: Framing of Afghan refugees in mainstream print media of Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 3(1), 461-473.
- Boukes, M. (2022). Episodic and thematic framing effects on the attribution of responsibility: The effects of personalized and contextualized news on perceptions of individual and political responsibility for causing the economic crisis. *The International Journal of Press/Politics*, 27(2), 374-395. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161220985241">https://doi.org/10.1177/1940161220985241</a>
- Boykoff, M. (2024). Climate change countermovements and adaptive strategies: insights from Heartland Institute annual conferences a decade apart. *Climatic Change*, 177(1), <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-023-03655-5">https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-023-03655-5</a>
- Boykoff, M. T., & Smith, J. (2010). Media presentations of climate change. In *Routledge Handbook* of Climate Change and Society (pp. 210-218). Routledge.

  https://doi.org/10.4324/9780203876213
- Chen, Y., Thorson, K., & Lavaccare, J. (2022). Convergence and divergence: The evolution of climate change frames within and across public events. *International Journal of Communication*, 16, 23. https://ijoc.org/index.php/ijoc/article/view/17609
- Chong, D., & Druckman, J. N. (2007). Framing public opinion in competitive democracies.

  \*\*American political science review, 101(4), 637-655. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0003055407070554

- D'Angelo, P., Lule, J., Neuman, W. R., Rodriguez, L., Dimitrova, D. V., & Carragee, K. M. (2019).

  Beyond framing: A forum for framing researchers. *Journalism & mass communication*quarterly, 96(1), 12-30. https://doi.org/10.1177/1077699018825004
- Dietz, T., Shwom, R. L., & Whitley, C. T. (2020). Climate change and society. *Annual Review of Sociology*, 46(1), 135-158. https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev-soc-121919-054614
- Eckstein, D., Künzel, V., & Schäfer, L. (2021). *The Global Climate Risk Index 2021*. Bonn: Germanwatch. https://bvearmb.do/handle/123456789/1306
- Feezell, J. T. (2018). Agenda setting through social media: The importance of incidental news exposure and social filtering in the digital era. *Political Research Quarterly*, 71(2), 482-494. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912917744895">https://doi.org/10.1177/1065912917744895</a>
- Feldman, L., & Hart, P. S. (2018). Broadening exposure to climate change news? How framing and political orientation interact to influence selective exposure. *Journal of Communication*, 68(3), 503-524. https://doi.org/10.1093/joc/jqy011
- Feldman, L., & Hart, P. S. (2021). Upping the ante? The effects of "emergency" and "crisis" framing in climate change news. *Climatic Change*, 169(1), 10. https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-021-03219-5
- Financial Reporting Council (FRC). (2023). FRC publishes thematic review findings on climaterelated metrics and targets disclosures. <a href="https://www.frc.org.uk/library/esg-andclimate/climate-thematic-review-2020">https://www.frc.org.uk/library/esg-andclimate/climate-thematic-review-2020</a>
- Fizzah, S. Z. E. H. (2021). Print Media Coverage of Climate Change: Comparative Study of Opinion Pages of Pakistan's Urdu and English Language Press. *Available at SSRN* 4365880. https://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.4365880

- Geise, S., & Maubach, K. (2024). Catch me if you can: how episodic and thematic multimodal news frames shape policy support by stimulating visual attention and responsibility attributions. *Frontiers in Communication*, *9*, 1305048.
- Goodman, M. K., McNatt, M. B., & Boykoff, M. (2022). Communicating Climate Change in the Anthropocene. *The Routledge Handbook of Environment and Communication*.

  <a href="https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003119234">https://doi.org/10.4324/9781003119234</a>
- Guenther, L., Brüggemann, M., & Elkobros, S. (2022). From global doom to sustainable solutions:

  International news magazines' multimodal framing of our future with climate change.

  Journalism Studies, 23(1), 131-148. https://doi.org/10.1080/1461670X.2021.2007162
- Guenther, L., Jörges, S., Mahl, D., & Brüggemann, M. (2024). Framing as a bridging concept for climate change communication: A systematic review based on 25 years of literature. *Communication Research*, 51(4), 367-391.https://doi.org/10.1177/00936502221137165
- Hinkel, J., et al. (2020). The role of media in promoting adaptation: A thematic analysis. Global Environmental Change, 63, 102096. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1007/s10584-020-02761-y">https://doi.org/10.1177/02666669221104612</a>
- Hulme, M., Obermeister, N., Randalls, S., & Borie, M. (2018). Framing the challenge of climate change in Nature and Science editorials. *Nature climate change*, 8(6), 515-521. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-018-0174-1">https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-018-0174-1</a>
- Hulme, M., Obermeister, N., Randalls, S., & Borie, M. (2018). Framing the challenge of climate change in Nature and Science editorials. *Nature climate change*, 8(6), 515-521.
- Hussain, M. (2024). Balancing news? Framing of threat and efficacy in leading Pakistani newspapers' coverage of climate change. *Newspaper Research Journal*, 07395329241263145. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/07395329241263145">https://doi.org/10.1177/07395329241263145</a>

- Hussain, M., & Iftikhar, I. (2023). Communicating Climate Risk Effectively? Editorial Coverage of Climate Change in Leading Urdu Language Newspapers from September 2018 to August 2021. Journal of Professional Research in Social Sciences, 10(1), 98-134.https://doi.org/10.58932/MULA0007
- Hussain, M., Saleem, N., & Ishaq, N. (2019). Frames for United Nations Climate Change Conference 2015:

  Comparison of elite *Dawn* and popular *Jang* newspapers—evidence from Pakistan. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 3(1), 292–305. DOI:10.35484/pssr.2019(3-I)21
- Hussain, S., Khan, A., & Zubair Iqbal, M. (2024). Media reporting of climate change crisis in Pakistan: Identifying corrective strategies. *Information Development*, 40(1), 158-169. https://doi.org/10.1177/02666669221104612
- Hussain, S., Khan, A., & Zubair Iqbal, M. (2024). Media reporting of climate change crisis in Pakistan: Identifying corrective strategies. *Information Development*, 40(1), 158-169.
- Immediacy and Journalistic Authority For Reporting Environmental Disasters: Case Study Of 2022 Floods Of Pakistan. (2023). Journal of Journalism, Media Science & Creative Arts, 3(1), 50-65. <a href="https://doi.org/10.56596/jjmsca.v3i1.48">https://doi.org/10.56596/jjmsca.v3i1.48</a>
- Ivanova, I. (2021). Relevance of Contemporary Communication Theories in Comprehending Media Influence and Cultural Dynamics. Social Science Chronicle, 1, 1-18.

  <a href="https://reviewlawsocialsciences.com/index.php/rlss/article/view/46">https://reviewlawsocialsciences.com/index.php/rlss/article/view/46</a>
- Iyengar, S. (1991). *Is anyone responsible? How television frames political issues*. University of Chicago Press. https://doi.org/10.7208/chicago/9780226388533.001.0001
- Jabeen, F., & Saleem Abbas, D. S. M. (2024). THE PARALLELISM OF ENGLISH AND URDU PRESS IN PAKISTAN: CHALLENGES AND OUTCOMES. *Pakistan Journal of International Affairs*, 7(1). <a href="https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v7i1.1011">https://doi.org/10.52337/pjia.v7i1.1011</a>

- Javed, M. N., Basit, A., & Hussain, T. (2020). Climate change in the mainstream Pakistani press: coverage and framing trends. *Global Political Review*, 5(1), 192-204. <a href="http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2020(V-I).22">http://dx.doi.org/10.31703/gpr.2020(V-I).22</a>
- Maslin, Mark, 'History of climate change', *Climate Change: A Very Short Introduction*, 4th edn, Very Short Introductions (Oxford, 2021; online edn, Oxford Academic, 26 Aug. 2021), <a href="https://doi.org/10.1093/actrade/9780198867869.003.0002">https://doi.org/10.1093/actrade/9780198867869.003.0002</a>
- Matthes, J., et al. (2022). Framing as a bridging concept for climate change communication: A systematic review. *Communication Research*, 49(3), 365-388. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1177/00936502221137165">https://doi.org/10.1177/00936502221137165</a>
- McCombs, M. E., & Shaw, D. L. (1972). The agenda-setting function of mass media. *Public opinion quarterly*, 36(2), 176-187.https://doi.org/10.1086/267990
- Moy, P., Tewksbury, D., & Rinke, E. M. (2016). Agenda-setting, priming, and framing. *The international encyclopedia of communication theory and philosophy*, 1-13. DOI: 10.1002/9781118766804.wbiect266
- Munawar, R. (2015). Image Framing of Pakistan in China: A Case Study of Xinhua News Agency. *Journal of Research in Social Sciences*, 3(1), 2.
- Nabi, R. L., Gustafson, A., & Jensen, R. (2018). Framing climate change: Exploring the role of emotion in generating advocacy behavior. *Science Communication*, 40(4), 442-468. https://doi.org/10.1177/1075547018776019
- Nazeer, I., Alam, R., Rehman, S.-u.-R., & Yasir, W. (2024). Print media representation of climate change: A critical discourse analysis of environmental news coverage in Pakistan. *Migration Letters*, 21(S13), 1266–1278.
- Neuendorf, K. A. (2017). The content analysis guidebook. Sage.

- https://books.google.com.pk/books?id=nMA5DQAAQBAJ}
- Raza, A., & Akram, A. (2023). Evaluating Linguistic Framing in Eastern and Western Media

  Discourse: An Analysis of its Impact on Perceptual Constructs. *Harf-o-Sukhan*, 7(2), 242-257. <a href="https://www.harf-o-sukhan.com/index.php/Harf-o-sukhan/article/view/874">https://www.harf-o-sukhan.com/index.php/Harf-o-sukhan/article/view/874</a>
- Raza, S. M. H., & Shah, B. H. (2024). Global News Coverage of Climate Change: A Comparative Analysis of South Asian Press. Human Nature Journal of Social Sciences, 5(3), 275-287. https://hnpublisher.com/ojs/index.php/HNJSS/article/view/556
- Raza, S. M. H., & Shah, B. H. (2024). Global News Coverage of Climate Change: A Comparative Analysis of South Asian Press. *Human Nature Journal of Social Sciences*, 5(3), 275-287. <a href="https://doi.org/10.71016/hnjss/de0tp681">https://doi.org/10.71016/hnjss/de0tp681</a>
- Rhaman, M. (2018). Climate Change Journalism in Bangladesh. Professional Norms and Attention in Newspaper Coverage of Climate Change. <a href="http://hdl.handle.net/1956/18924">http://hdl.handle.net/1956/18924</a>
- Rioseco, S. (2023). Conferences of the Parties beyond international environmental law: How COPs influence the content and implementation of their parent treaties. *Leiden Journal of International Law*, 36(3), 699-719. https://doi.org/10.1017/S0922156523000110
- Saeed, F., & Salik, K. M. (2022). The Effect of Global Climate Change on Pakistan. *Global Pakistan: Pakistan's Role in the International System*, 65.https://library.fes.de/pdffiles/bueros/pakistan/19335.pdf#page=77.
- Saeed, R., Hussain, M., & Riaz, F. (2023). Criticism and attribution of responsibility: Framing in leading newspapers of Pakistan for climate change. *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, 5(2). DOI:10.52567/pjsr.v5i02.1211

- Saleem, S. M. S., & Rahman, B. H. (2023). Pakistani Print Media and Climate Literacy: A Study of Formal-Stylistic Frame Analysis During 2018-19. *Research Journal for Societal Issues*, 5(1), 113-137.https://doi.org/10.56976/rjsi.v5i1.61
- Schäfer, M. S., O'Neill, S., Nisbet, M., Ho, S., Markowitz, E., & Thaker, J. (2017). Frame analysis in climate change communication: approaches for assessing journalists' minds, online communication and media portrayals. https://doi.org/10.5167/uzh-148182
- Sharif, A., & Medvecky, F. (2018). Climate change news reporting in Pakistan: A qualitative analysis of environmental journalists and the barriers they face. *Journal of Science Communication*, 17(1), A03. Sharif | Climate change news reporting in Pakistan: a qualitative analysis of environmental journalists and the barriers they face | Journal of Science Communication.
- Shah, A. H. (2019). How episodic frames gave way to thematic frames over time: A topic modeling study of the Indian media's reporting of rape post the 2012 Delhi gang-rape. *Poetics*, 72, 54-69.
  - Sheets, P., Rowling, C. M., Gilmore, J., & Melcher, N. (2023). Us and them: The role of group identity in explaining cultural resonance and framing effects. *Mass Communication and Society*, 26(2), 252-274. https://doi.org/10.1080/15205436.2022.2026399
- Shehata, A., & Strömbäck, J. (2021). Learning political news from social media: Network media logic and current affairs news learning in a high-choice media environment.

  \*Communication Research\*, 48(1), 125-147.

https://doi.org/10.1177/0093650217749354

SPREP. (2023). National thematic profiles: Information management and exchange in relation to climate change. https://www.sprep.org/attachments/63.pdf

- Stede, M., Bracke, Y., Borec, L., Kinkel, N. C., & Skeppstedt, M. (2023). Framing climate change in Nature and Science editorials: applications of supervised and unsupervised text categorization. *Journal of Computational Social Science*, 6(2), 485-513. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42001-023-00199-7
- Stede, M., Bracke, Y., Borec, L., Kinkel, N. C., & Skeppstedt, M. (2023). Framing climate change in Nature and Science editorials: applications of supervised and unsupervised text categorization. *Journal of Computational Social Science*, 6(2), 485-513.
- Tollefson, J. W. (2015). Language policy-making in multilingual education: Mass media and the framing of the medium of instruction. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, *16*(1-2), 132-148. <a href="https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2014.947018">https://doi.org/10.1080/14664208.2014.947018</a>
- Urich, C. (2017). Pakistani English-Speaking News Media Framing of The Salala Border Post Incident. https://hdl.handle.net/11244/52721
- Waleed, K. (2024). Climate and Media: Reporting based on Conflict theory or Structural Functionalism.https://file.pide.org.pk/pdfpideresearch/discourse-2024-01-07-climate-andmedia-reporting-based-on-con%EF%AC%82ict.pdf

## **Appendix A: Coding Sheet**

Sr.	Newspaper	Placement	Length	Source	Genre	Climate	СОР	Depth of
#			of			Categories	Conferences	Coverage
			Story			(Climatological		Frames
						Events)		

## **Key for Coders:**

**Newspapers:** Dawn = 1 Express Tribune = 2 Nawa -I - Waqt = 3 Jang = 4

**Placement:** Front Page = 1, Back Page = 2, Editorial / Opinion = 3, Others = 4 Length of Story:

Small <500 words = 1, Medium 501 to 1000 words = 2, Large Above 1000 words = 3

**Source:** Domestic = 1, Foreign = 2

**Genre:** News Story = 1, Column = 2, Editorial = 3

Climate Categories (Climatological Events): Global Warming = 1, Droughts = 2, Heatwaves =

3, Glacier Melting = 4, Rains/ Flood = 5 Smog = 6, Forest Fires = 7 GHG /CO<sub>2</sub> Emissions = 8

Human Activities =9

**COP Conferences:** CoP 26 (Glasgow) = 1 Cop 27 (Sharam ul Shaikh) = 2 CoP 28 (Dubai) = 3

**Depth of Coverage (Frames):** Episodic =1 Thematic = 2 (Definitions of episodic and thematic

given in the chapter)

## **Appendix B: Graphs**



















