GEO-TRAUMATIC SPACES: MAPPING POST CATASTROPHE PSYCHOGEOGRAPHY IN SHAMSIE'S *BURNT SHADOWS* AND TANWEER'S *THE SCATTER HERE IS TOO GREAT*

BY

MARIA ZAINAB

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES

ISLAMABAD

June, 2024

GEO-TRAUMATIC SPACES: MAPPING POST CATASTROPHE PSYCHOGEOGRAPHY IN SHAMSIE'S *BURNT SHADOWS* AND TANWEER'S *THE SCATTER HERE IS TOO GREAT*

By

MARIA ZAINAB

B.S (Hons.), Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, 2020

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

In **English**

To

FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, ISLAMABAD

FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES
NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES

THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defense, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Arts & Humanities for acceptance.

Thesis Title: Geo-Traumatic Spaces: Mapping Post Catastrophe Psychogeography in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*

Submitted By: Maria Zainab **Registration:** MP-Elit-F21-1019

Dr. Yasir Arafat _____
Name of Supervisor

_____
Signature of Supervisor

Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi
Name of Head (GS)

_____
Signature of Head (GS)

Dr. Arshad Mahmood
Name of Dean (FAH)

_____
Signature of Dean (FAH)

_____
Date

AUTHOR'S DECLARATION

I, Maria Zainab

Daughter of Abdul Ghafoor Malik

Registration # MP-Elit-F21-1019

Discipline English Literature

Candidate of **Master of Philosophy** at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby declare that the thesis **Geo-Traumatic Spaces: Mapping Post Catastrophe Psychogeography in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*** submitted by me in partial fulfillment of MPhil degree, is my original work, and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare that it shall not, in future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any other university or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even after the award of a degree, the work may be cancelled and the degree revoked.

_____
Signature of Candidate

_____
Name of Candidate

_____
Date

ABSTRACT

Title: Geo-Traumatic Spaces: Mapping Post Catastrophe Psychogeography in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*

This research maps the psychogeographical changes that eventuate in the aftermath of a catastrophe as seen in Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*. Psychogeography expands our understanding of the bond linking psyche and space. The research adapts Catharina Löffler's conceptualization of psychogeography as well as Rachel Pain's theorization of geo-trauma to analyze how individuals' perception of space changes after encounter with a life-altering catastrophe and how trauma manifests itself in places other than the site of the catastrophic event. Psychogeographic analysis of subject novels deepens our understanding of trauma linked to space. The scars left by violence run deep, not only are they visible in the streets and roads of urban spaces but in the psyches of traumatized individuals as well. The psychogeographical understanding of both novels suggests that psychology and geography have a complex relationship whereby the psychology of an individual is affected by the surrounding geography and vice versa. The characters of both novels under consideration bear the physical as well as psychological scars of geospatial destruction. Their trauma linked to the original site of catastrophe manifests itself in the site of ruin as well as spaces other than the site of ruin. This research provides an impetus for further understanding of psychogeography and its significance in trauma studies. The in-depth study of post catastrophe psychogeography allows for a deeper understanding of trauma, its relationship to geography and how it manifests itself it different spaces.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my gratitude to Allah Almighty for bestowing me with his countless blessings and allowing me to complete this difficult task. I would not have been able to do so if not for his benevolence.

My heartfelt gratitude to my supervisor Dr. Yasir Arafat, for guiding me through this tedious task and providing his valuable insight on the content of my research.

My deepest thanks to my family without whom I would not have been able to take up such a difficult task. Their help and support provided me with the courage to pursue this degree without any hurdles. My mother and sister's constant support, prayers, and motivation have helped me a great deal to accomplish this task. I would also like to extend my sincerest gratitude to my dearest friend, Marwa Almas, who encouraged me to keep going despite her own struggles, without her this degree would have been an absolute nightmare to complete. A token of thanks to my husband and in-laws as well for facilitating me.

Thanks to the English Department of NUML for offering me the academic and creative space, to bring this thesis to life.

Thank you all.

DEDICATION

This thesis is dedicated to my beloved Ammi and Appia.

CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

"A great city must always present you with options…"

~ Burnt Shadows, Kamila Shamise

"a city is all about how you look at it…We must learn to see it in many ways, so that when one of the ways of looking hurts us, we can take refuge in another way of looking."

~ The Scatter Here Is Too Great, Bilal Tanweer

Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* chronicles global catastrophic events across four major cities of the world, i.e., Nagasaki, Delhi, Karachi, and New York, over a period of five decades. Each section of the story paints a historically embedded picture of the respective city, making it easy for the readers to not only imagine but re-construct the city in a new light. *The Scatter Here Is Too Great,* the debut novel of Bilal Tanweer, is another piece of literature that represents a gripping map of a city infused with violence i.e., Karachi. The Karachi of Tanweer's novel is particularly appealing since it invites its readers to re-cartograph the city. Of particular importance, in both novels, is the characters' psychogeography which is altered by the catastrophic events that take place in these urban spaces. While navigating through these cities, not only do the catastrophic places become "site(s) of trauma" (Trigg 96) but the way places elsewhere are perceived is also tainted by the trauma accompanying these characters.

Shamsie's story is brought together by Hiroko Tanaka, a Japanese school teacher, from her life in the pre-nuclear bomb blast Nagasaki to post-9/11 New York. In contrast, the fragments of different stories in Tanweer's novel are tied together by one major event, i.e., the 29th December 2012 bomb blast, near Karachi Cantonment Railway Station. The plots of both the novels under study touch upon a series of tragic events, which in the scope of this research are termed catastrophes, and the novels are thus classified as catastrophe fiction.

A catastrophe, as described by Lecia Rosenthal in the book, *Mourning Modernism Literature, Catastrophe, and the Politics of Consolation* is an event that defies logic, it "points to a beyond that can never be placed either inside or outside a prior logic of integration, meaning, or futurity" (4). A catastrophe, then, is an event of such magnitude

that brings cataclysmic changes and permanently alters a society. The changes forced upon a society can materialize in more than one form including physical or psychological and individual or collective. Patrick Parrinder uses the following words to describe catastrophe in his article *H. G. Wells and The Fiction of Catastrophe,*

> …a disaster of such scale and magnitude that, though it can be imagined in advance, it can only be confirmed retrospectively. The essence of a catastrophe is that it consists of events outside the control of the person or persons who judge it to have taken place...The new phase of society forced into existence by the catastrophe may be either an advance to a higher form of civilization, or a reversion to one more barbarous and primitive. (40)

Catastrophes, thus, breed societies with permanently altered *modus vivendi*. Marks left on the bodies and psychologies of the affected communities are discernible across centuries and are carried over to generations. The subject novels in this research address catastrophes of similar magnitude, the repercussions of which are not only carried over time but also spaces. As with the subject novels, catastrophe fiction deals with "mass slaughter, dehumanization, and survival ethics, crude subjects" (Parrinder 42) and the narrative sequence of events unfolds with the benefit of hindsight.

The development of city spaces cannot be solely attributed to architects or engineers or the subsequent architectural structures, arts, media, academic discourse, and literature, in particular, have a significant role to play in solidifying and strengthening urban structures and spaces (Rohleder & Kindermann 3). The ability of art to change reality, to not only construct but deconstruct and sometimes, reconstruct the changing geographies of urban spaces is an interesting point for investigation and exploration.

Urban spaces and the events occurring in these spaces in stories, or literature, in general, are not to be read or dealt with as merely a setting or background of the story. More often than not, urban narratology breathes life into the story, if not more than probably as much as the characters do. The narratives not only tell stories about the cities but they also inform our understanding of the city allowing us to reconstruct the city in a new form (Rohleder & Kindermann 9). It also highlights the importance of setting in any narrative without which a story lacks basic structure and understanding To separate a city from the

story or to read a story in isolation is to strip the story of its various interpretations and rob the city of its multifaceted existence.

The bond linking the geography of a cityscape to the individual psyche, i.e. psychogeography, forms the core of this research. The term psychogeography was suggested by an illiterate Kabyle to one of the pioneers in the field, Guy Debord. Guy Debord describes the term as the study of the "precise laws and specific effects of the geographical environment, whether consciously organized or not, on the emotions and behavior of individuals" (23). The concept, a combination of 'geography' and 'psychology', investigates the ways in which the geography of an urban space affects the psychology of individuals.

Psychogeography, over time, has acquired varied meanings and has come to be known as a fluid term that, at one and the same time, encompasses a plethora of meanings. The beginning of the concept can be traced back to *Robinson Crusoe* and *Journal of the Plague Year* by Daniel Defoe (Coverley 12). Over time, great names in the literary community have contributed to the understanding of psychogeography. Of particular importance are the works of William Blake, Alfred Watkins, Baudelaire, Henri Lefebvre, Walter Benjamin, Guy Debord, and most recently, Iain Sinclair, Ackroyd, and Will Self (Coverley 11-18). Their contribution to the field of spatial studies has added a great deal of knowledge and furthered our understanding of psychogeography.

When it comes to psychogeography, the 'psyche' of the individual is of special importance since it interpolates with the production of space itself. Tina Richardson in the book *Walking Inside Out - Contemporary British Psychogeography* comments on the link that binds the psyche with geography. She argues that our perception of a place connects us with it, linking our memories and emotions with it (82). Our inherent attachment to a space and the associated feelings are subjective and it is this subjectivity that gives rise to "multifarious and often contradictory accounts of specific spaces" (82), allowing for multiple interpretations of the same spaces.

Evidence of the same can be found in various works of English literary tradition. The English novel weaves a visionary journey, taking its readers on a stroll across the urban space, allowing them to reconstruct "the layout of the urban labyrinth" (Coverley 11). The novel acts as a representational space narrating the structure of the city through its symbols,

sometimes hidden, sometimes apparent (Lefebvre 33). Writers, as Henri Lefebvre puts it in *The Production of Space*, "describe and aspire to do no more than describe" (39) the city space via associated images and symbols. Novels, and other forms of literature, thus serve as representational spaces wherein writers construct vivid images of city spaces through their writing.

Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great,* i.e., the novels chosen for the scope of this research, are yet another representational space that, by the use of symbolic and imaginary elements, construct varied interpretations of different cities – each urban space having its "source in history - in the history of a people as well as in the history of each individual belonging to that people" (Lefebvre 41). The settings of the novel along with the various elements that constitute these settings allow for a multifaceted understanding of each space in relation to each individual's subjective experience with the said space.

Spaces carry the memory of the past in the forms of ruins, monuments, memorials, museums, etc. Similarly, memory reveals itself in different spatial and topological forms. This complex bond that binds space and trauma is described by Patrizia Violi, in her book *Landscapes of Memory: Trauma, Space, History,* as "twofold reciprocal implication" (73). Just as spaces or sites of ruin influence an individual's psyche or trauma, similarly, an individual's traumatic memories materialize in different spaces and influence his perception of the said space. As Lefebvre puts it, this rendering of an individual's perception of space in the aftermath of a catastrophic event affects his production of space

The site of ruin, also called as 'trauma space' (Kasten 144), elucidates a double relationship between trauma and space; the physical place itself is traumatized with ruins, debris, monuments, etc. and it is traumatic as well since it evokes feelings of anxiety and fear in the minds of the victim. Jacquelyn Micieli-Voutsinas has further elaborated on the relationship between space and trauma in his doctoral dissertation titled, *Rummaging Through the Wreckage: Geographies of Trauma, Memory, and Loss at the National September 11th Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center*. He elaborates that the remembrance of trauma is not limited to a specific place or time, rather it forges a temporal and spatial link that connects the past that is no longer there and the future elsewhere, resurfacing in different places and at different times (15). Micieli-Voutsinas's research

provides a valuable insight into trauma's temporality and its ability to emerge and influence different spatialities.

Trauma is not limited to the specific place or time of occurrence, it is the "belatedness" (Caruth 8-9) of trauma that allows it to be located outside the boundaries of a specific space or time. The word 'belatedness' entails trauma's persistence in the life of the victim. Its recurrence and ability to repeat itself creates a belated impact that terrifies the traumatized time and again. Traumatic memories transcend the boundaries of space and time to influence the life of the traumatized by forcing him to relive the memories at inexplicable times and spaces.

To describe the intricate link that binds traumatic memory and its rootedness in place and time outside the specific occurrence of the event, Virginia E. Blum and Anna J. Sector use the term "topological constellation" (105). The word constellation indicates the scattering of trauma over urban spaces. Consequently, the memory of the traumatic event is subject to distortion and transformation in relation to the new space.

Traumatic memories are embedded in the psyche and can emerge at any point in time, at any space. The instant reemergence of such a memory brings about a "caesura in time and space", as Koçak calls it (36). A traumatic event ceases an individual's life by arresting his memories and forcing him to relive the past experience in the present and future. These interruptions can be triggered by certain images, faces, objects, etc. that remind the individual of the past. The continuous cycle of memories, triggered by certain markers in space, recurring in the flow of space creates an indelible link between trauma and space. The reemergence is evidence that the essence of the traumatic happening is deeply rooted in the life of the individual and it finds way to materialize through space. The overlaying of trauma in the present gives rise to a redetermined contemporary that carries the scars of the past.

The constant layering of the past over the present affects the way an individual perceives his physical environment. Memories of the cataclysmic event haunt the victim and taint the way he perceives the present space. In the representation of trauma, place then takes a central place since it allows the writer to explicate multiple meanings of the event through the physical space of suffering. It acts as a medium through which writers "demonstrate the internal struggle of the self and the various workings of the mind as the

individual attempts to understand, incorporate, and explain the traumatic event" (Balaev 161). Space acts as an external medium through which an individual relives the memories of the past in the present.

Space and place are used interchangeably in the context of this research to refer to geographical areas or city spaces. No distinction, whatsoever, is used to differentiate one from another. A place is essentially a space with meaning attached to it, as such both the terms are used concurrently to denote a geographical area of significance.

To extend the narrative of this research, it is important to explore the concept of geo-trauma that is tied to psychogeography. The understanding of geo-trauma will act as a lens through which the respective texts can be analyzed for post-traumatic psychogeography. Geo-trauma, in the scope of this research, is defined as trauma that affects/alters individuals' production of urban space (Pain 974). The main aim of this research is to explore and analyze the psychogeographical underpinnings of the novel and cartograph visions of urban spaces as seen through the eyes of its characters. The image of the cities seen through the characters' eyes will help readers understand how differently post catastrophe psychogeography materializes. This research is an attempt to investigate and explore the effects of catastrophe on an individual's psychology. Furthermore, it seeks to identify how an encounter with a life-altering event can change a person's vision of urban spaces- the place of origin and places elsewhere.

1.1 Thesis Statement

Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great* not only provide insight into the social and political upheaval and general unrest but also seem to act as a lens through which readers can map and experience the psychogeographical changes in characters' understanding of respective cities after a life-altering catastrophe. Mapping post catastrophe psychogeography of the characters will perhaps allow readers to explore the various repercussions of catastrophe and how a traumatic event of such magnitude irreversibly alters an individual's vision of urban spaces, and not just the vision of the site of ruin but visions of urban spaces elsewhere as well.

1.2 Research Objectives

The aims of this research are to:

1. Analyze the geospatial changes a city acquires when seen through the eyes of characters that have experienced a life-altering traumatic catastrophe, as seen in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great*
2. Explore how post catastrophe psychogeography in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great* alter the production of urban spaces other than the original sites of catastrophe.

1.3 Research Questions

1. What geospatial changes does a city acquire when seen through the eyes of characters that have experienced a life-altering traumatic catastrophe, as seen in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great*?
2. How does post catastrophe psychogeography in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great* alter the production of urban spaces other than the original sites of catastrophe?

1.4 Research Methodology

This research falls into the qualitative paradigm since it aims to explore and analyze the texts and does not rely on quantifiable results. Qualitative research draws on assumptions and theoretical frameworks to shape the scope of the research, establish patterns, and derive meanings (Creswell 44). Textual analysis is the research method adapted to unearth the potential meaning of the text and draw possible conclusions. Catherine Belsey, in *Research Methods for English Studies,* highlights the indispensability of the method in cultural criticism i.e., English, cultural studies, etc., especially subjects that focus on texts.

Textual analysis, as described by Besley, is a method that requires close reading of the work and examining its details without bringing unnecessary presuppositions into the equation (160). An important aspect of textual analysis in research is that it does not merely examine/study the text but helps explore something new to add to the existing body of knowledge. It traces the intertext with special attention to reading to highlight the peculiarity of the text. Multiple sources with legitimate logic and reasoning are brought

into the research to analyze the text from various perspectives and make assumptions accordingly. It is imperative to note that the research in question does not have to be entirely "original" (163), it can be, instead, a reassembling of ideas in a way that has never been done before.

Textual analysis suggests the lack of unity of meaning and insists that there is no one truth (176). The method is a means of bringing to the fore possible interpretations of the text supported by textual evidence as well as secondary sources. The conclusions drawn from the method do not imply the existence of one true meaning but highlight the possibility of meanings that can be withdrawn from closely analyzing the text.

1.5 Significance & Rationale of The Study

Trauma is central to the Pakistani literary canon owing to the tumultuous history of the region. Pakistani anglophone writers have produced various fictionalized accounts of historical catastrophic events and the accompanying trauma that has transcended generations. Keeping in view the abundance of literature produced on the subject, it is unsurprising that countless research works have been produced on trauma studies. It is, however, important to note that trauma has almost always been associated with physical wounds, mental scars, or emotional injuries. The spatiality and temporality of trauma in Pakistani Anglophone literature is a concept that is left rather unexplored. Considering the lack or absence of research targeting the geographical aspect of trauma, this research is significant since it offers a unique vantage point for understanding and mapping trauma.

The research is also significant since it allows the mapping of different cities through the eyes of traumatized individuals, helping to see how trauma can permanently alter the production of space. In addition, the research will help understand how this trauma is projected onto different cities, signifying the complete adulteration of individuals' psyche manifested in different spaces across time.

1.6 Delimitation

The study is delimited to two novels i.e., *Burnt Shadows* written by Pakistan Anglophone writer Kamila Shamsie, and *The Scatter Here Is Too Great* by Bilal Tanweer, a Pakistani writer, and translator. The context of the study is delimited to the geography of trauma and focuses on spatial mapping of psychological trauma, it does not address any

other issue in any other context or setting. The basic premise of the research is restricted to the topic of geo-trauma, as such, it analyzes the text in the same context. All the characters, settings, and surroundings are studied under the same context.

1.7 Chapter Breakdown

The first chapter of the research offers a brief introduction to the topic, the context of the study, and the research methodology used to conduct the research. The second chapter provides a review of the literature on the texts to situate the study and find the gaps in previous research. The third chapter delineates the theoretical framework adapted to carry out the study. The fourth chapter provides a detailed analysis of both texts under consideration and finds corresponding evidence that supports the claim. The conclusion is drawn in the fifth chapter on the basis of the analysis and future recommendations are given for further research on the topic or texts.

CHAPTER 2

LITERATURE REVIEW

Trauma is usually understood in terms of physical wounds inflicted on an individual or collective society, or emotional and psychic scars that affect the minds of those affected. It, as Kai Erickson puts it, involves "a continual reliving of the original experience in daydreams and nightmares, flashbacks and hallucinations, and in a compulsive seeking out of similar circumstances" (457-458). Trauma associated with a catastrophic event invades and occupies an individual's existence, dominating his mind and threatening to drain him entirely. Over time trauma studies have taken a temporal and "spatial turn" (Walker 47), turning towards a spatial understanding of trauma.

Trauma as defined by *American Psychological Association* stands for "an emotional response to a terrible event like an accident, crime, natural disaster, physical or emotional abuse, neglect, experiencing or witnessing violence, death of a loved one, war, and more" (American Psychological Association). These experiences can lead to conditions like post-traumatic stress disorder (PTSD), characterized by symptoms such as flashbacks, anxiety, and emotional numbness. Unlike physical wounds, psychological trauma can persist and affect one's mental well-being long after the event has occurred. Caruth has defined trauma in these words,

> …trauma is not locatable in the simple violent or original event in an individual's past, but rather in the way its very unassimilated nature--the way it was precisely not known in the first instance--returns to haunt the survivor later on. (Caruth 4)

Trauma, both as a psychological condition and a narrative concept, has evolved significantly over time. The understanding of trauma has shifted from early medical interpretations to more complex psychological and cultural theories. Historically, trauma was first recognized in medical contexts, particularly in relation to physical injuries. In the 19th century, with the advent of industrialization and war, doctors and psychologists began to observe symptoms that were not easily explained by physical harm alone. In an editorial, *Psychotraumatology in Greece*, researchers Kolaitis and Olff define the word trauma, originating from the Greek word for "wound" (1). Systematic medical inquiry into trauma

began in the 1860s with the study of "railway spine," a condition observed in railway accident victims who showed physical symptoms without clear injuries. The railway, as a symbol of industrial progress, became closely linked to early understandings of trauma (Sütterlin 11-22). The term trauma gradually began to include psychological dimensions. Jean-Martin Charcot and later Sigmund Freud played key roles in laying the foundation for psychological trauma, especially in relation to hysteria and repressed memories (Figley et al. 2-3). Freud's theory of the unconscious, particularly his early work with Josef Breuer in *Studies on Hysteria* (1895), marked a crucial point in understanding trauma as something that could be mentally and emotionally internalized.

Trauma studies explore the impact of trauma in literature and society by analyzing its psychological, rhetorical, and cultural significance (Balaev 360). Literary trauma theory began to emerge prominently in the 1990s, influenced by scholars like Cathy Caruth, who argued that trauma defies simple representation and often appears indirectly through narrative gaps, silences, and fragmentation. In her seminal work *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History* (1996), Caruth asserts that trauma is not fully grasped when it occurs but returns in repeated flashbacks, dreams, or haunting narratives. This idea helped shape trauma fiction, a genre characterized by non-linear timelines, unreliable narrators, and a focus on memory, loss, and the struggle for understanding.

Trauma fiction often reflects the psychological disruptions caused by traumatic events. Novels in this genre may use fractured narrative structures to mimic the mental fragmentation experienced by trauma survivors. These stories are not only about depicting suffering but also about exploring the limits of language and narrative in expressing what feels inexpressible. Scholars like Dominick LaCapra (2001) also emphasized the role of narrative in working through trauma, distinguishing between "acting out" and "working through" as different responses to traumatic memory. Fiction becomes a space where personal and collective trauma can be processed, reimagined, and perhaps partially healed.

The representation of trauma in literature, known as trauma fiction, serves not only to depict the aftermath of traumatic events but also plays a crucial role in the healing process. Narratives that explore traumatic experiences allow individuals to process and articulate their suffering, facilitating recovery. Conversely, suppressing or avoiding these narratives can exacerbate the trauma, leading to more severe psychological issues.

Historically, trauma narratives have been integral to both medical and literary traditions. One of the earliest examples is Homer's *The Odyssey*, which chronicles the psychological toll of war and the longing for homecoming. Throughout history, various forms of trauma narratives have emerged, including memoirs, autobiographies, and fictionalized accounts, each contributing to the understanding and processing of trauma.

Contemporary trauma fiction continues to evolve, reflecting the complexities of modern psychological experiences. Works such as Pat Barker's *Regeneration* (1991), which delves into the effects of World War I on soldiers, and Laurie Halse Anderson's *Speak* (1992), which addresses the trauma of sexual assault, exemplify how literature can illuminate the multifaceted nature of trauma and its enduring impact on individuals.

Trauma significantly impacts mental health, often leading to disorders such as Post-Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD), as outlined in the *Diagnostic and Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders, Fifth Edition (DSM-5)*. PTSD arises after exposure to actual or threatened death, serious injury, or sexual violence, manifesting through symptoms like intrusive memories, nightmares, flashbacks, avoidance of reminders, negative alterations in mood and cognition, and heightened arousal responses. These symptoms must persist for over a month and cause significant distress or impairment in social, occupational, or other important areas of functioning.

In literature and media, characters exhibiting trauma often display behaviors aligning with DSM-5 criteria. For instance, a character may experience flashbacks (intrusion), avoid places or people associated with the trauma (avoidance), harbor negative beliefs about themselves or the world (negative alterations in mood and cognition), and exhibit irritability or hypervigilance (arousal and reactivity). Such portrayals offer a nuanced understanding of how trauma affects mental health, providing insight into the complex interplay between traumatic experiences and psychological well-being.

The concept of trauma is generally understood as a severely disruptive experience that profoundly impacts the self’s emotional organization and perception of the external world. In recent years, trauma studies have broadened to include environmental and spatial dimensions, giving rise to concepts like geo-trauma and psychogeography. Psychogeography examines how geographical environments affect emotions and behavior, while geo-trauma considers how the earth and physical landscapes bear the scars of

traumatic histories—be it war, colonialism, natural disaster, or displacement. Trauma narratives, when viewed through the lens of psychogeography and geo-trauma, reveal how memory and suffering are not only embedded in the mind but also inscribed onto places. In this sense, trauma becomes both a psychological and spatial phenomenon. This intersection allows literature to explore how landscapes themselves can become repositories of collective pain and memory, offering new ways to understand and narrate trauma beyond the individual psyche.

This chapter provides a detailed review of the literature on spatial turn in trauma studies as well as Kamila Shamsi's *Burnt Shadows* and Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*. It is divided into four sections with the first section focusing on studies related to trauma's spatial understanding, the second and third sections providing a detailed review of literature on Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great* and the last section identifies the research gap and how this research aims to fill it.

2.1 Spatial Turn in Trauma Studies

Spatial turn in trauma is a relatively new stream of research in trauma studies that focuses on the role of physical space and place in understanding traumatic experiences. The interdisciplinary approach allows for the conception of trauma's mobility across places, spaces and time. Traumatic memories resurface in the form of intrusive flashbacks and retraumatize the traumatized forcing him to confront a place and time that no longer exists. Its mobility makes it difficult to be contained within a specific time or location. These memories along with physical and emotional scars accompany the sufferer across time and space. The disruption of connections between space and place due to the "afterwardness" (Caruth *Listening to Trauma* 27) of memories makes it difficult for the traumatized to return to the site of suffering for it is no longer the place it once was.

Cathy Caruth has inscribed the term "belatedness" (8) in her book *Trauma-Exploration in Memory* to describe the psychoanalytic temporal and spatial structure of trauma. The impact of trauma "lies precisely in its belatedness, in its refusal to be simply located, in its insistent appearance outside the boundaries of any single place or time" (Caruth 8). The belatedness of trauma is such that it is unmappable, "simultaneously and paradoxically in place and out of place, of place and placeless" (Coddington & Micieli-

Voutsinas 3). Its inability to be placed within a specific temporal or spatial frame makes it fundamentally incomprehensible.

Trauma does not remain contained within the site of catastrophe, it is, instead, transmitted across time and place. The recollection or remembering of memories in another time and place is where the traumatic memory manifests itself. Janet Walker's research on the geographies of suffering concerning Hurricane Katrina in selected documentary films and videos provides an in-depth understanding of the link between spaces and catastrophic experiences. She is of the view that the conceptual understanding of spatial turn in trauma in art and literature will help understand trauma as the "experiential displacement of place, protagonist, and … of spectator" (53). The understanding of geography and its link with trauma allows for a deeper understanding of traumatic experiences and how it projects itself across space and time.

Coddington and Micieli-Voutsinas in the article *On Trauma, Geography, And Mobility: Towards Geographies of Trauma* elaborate on the permeability of trauma in the body of the traumatized. The deep seeded nature of trauma is such that it "not only ensnares the body, it permeates it, seeping in through its pores and sticking to its skin" (3). The pain of memories of trauma are lived in the mundane routine of daily life, "intertwining the everyday and the extraordinary, writing it on the skin." (3). As such, trauma is not limited to spatial construction but becomes a part of the victim's body and mind.

The 9/11 attack on the World Trade Center, in New York, for example, is a catastrophic event that left lasting effects on the world. It changed the geography of world politics, giving rise to a new stream of resistance against such terror attacks, the so-called 'war on terror'. It is, however, important to note that the scars left by the attack run deeper than the skin. Besides the loss of life, emotional trauma, and physical pain that afflicted thousands of people, the terror attack created what Jacquelyn Micieli-Voutsinas aptly calls, "geographies of trauma" (7). Micieli-Voutsinas links trauma conceived as a result of this tragedy with spatial and temporal continuity, highlighting how "multiple temporalities and spatialities are present and possible within sites, or places of memory" (19). The spatial turn in trauma studies has given way to the development and understanding of the importance of spatiality in trauma.

2.2 Review of Literature on Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows*

Kamila Shamsie, the author of *Burnt Shadows*, one of the two novels under study, belongs to the diaspora. Her identity as a Pakistani Anglophone writer belonging to the diaspora is a point of debate for many. While it is purported by certain critics that diasporic writers lack 'intimate acquaintance' with their fictional setting, Shamsie argues that it is not "really a question of geography at all. It is a question of texture." These textures, when evoked, transform the unfamiliar into the familiar. The "geographical widening of my(her) imagination" through these textures and the intimacy with which Shamsie's cities are mapped in *Burnt Shadows* is a reflection of her skill at invoking the same texture in her texts. It is with this artful expertise that Shamsie is able to "make a distant place feel intimate" (Shamsie *The Guardian*). The meticulous depiction of cities in her novel makes the place feel real and tangible.

Gohar Karim Khan, for example, in his research titled, *The Hideous Beauty of Bird-Shaped Burns: Transnational Allegory and Feminist Rhetoric in Kamila Shamsie's Burnt Shadows* comments on the "multiplicity of her [Shamsie's] existence, and its translation into a novel that transcends space, time and race" (54). As a part of diaspora herself, Shamsie's narrative carries with it the longing for home and belonging. The in-betweenness of her identity - belonging yet not belonging, national yet international, a position that transcends borders - allows her to write from a standpoint that transcends the norms of nationalism.

In an interview with Harleen Singh, Shamsie talked about the interweaving of the real with the fictional. The geographical and temporal events that ensue in the novel are deeply intertwined with the real history of the region. When asked about the geographic and chronological sweep of *Burnt Shadows*, Kamila Shamsie, as a person from the diaspora, explains how her "own concerns and obsessions" come through in the novel (158). The decentering of 9/11's cataclysmic events underscore Shamie's attempt at debunking the mythologizing "Ground Zero of history" (153) narrative surrounding 9/11. As a person of color, Shamsie has a unique take on world events, quite unlike the hegemonic misrepresentation publicized by western powers. *Burnt Shadows* is a unique narrative for it does not look at 9/11 in isolation or as "if history proceeds from it but doesn't precede it" (158). By creating a chain of events that links the atomic bombing in Nagasaki,

the independence of the sub-continent, 9/11, and the 'war on terror', Shamsie has highlighted the indispensability of the past to the understanding of the present.

While the author's South-Asian identity comes through in the novel and is the impetus of the narrative, Abbas and Iqbal claim that the narrative employs the use of "unreliable narration and unfavourable descriptions", giving the author the title of a "re-orientalist writer" (412). Their claim, however, is backed by inaccurate evidence and a biased understanding of the novel. The burn scars are not a "symbol of disgrace" (415) for the protagonist, but a symbol of her identity reduced to the bomb. These scars define her, they are a part of her identity as a Japanese and carry the memory of the trauma the protagonist has been through. Similarly, the use of third-person narrative may not be the narrator's attempt to distance herself from the victim's pain but an attempt to emphasize and highlight the suffering of the character. Moreover, it would be unwise to categorize the novel as a "Western-centric" (416) narrative since it highlights the hypocrisy of colonial masters, the plight of the colonized, and the globalized dehumanization. The reality-based depiction helps readers identify and understand the duplicity of the colonizers. To say that there is an imbalance in the representation of the characters, will be an injustice to the narrative since the characters, although fictional, mimic the reality of the Indian subcontinent in the 20th century. The characters' nostalgia and longing for home categorically mirror the author's own desperation and yearning for her homeland.

While traveling between US, UK, and Pakistan, Shamsie witnessed the changing attitudes of these countries and the extent to which they were willing to go "in the name of self-defense" (Singh "Interview with Kamila Shamsie" 159). During wartimes, nations, relying on dubious logic, decide the fate of other nations (Others) and the price they should pay for the calamities done to them. The resulting violence in nation-states gives rise to dissatisfaction among the menfolk and loss of their moral compass. This cycle of violence and dehumanization is evident in the novel, wherein historical events follow a timeline of violent, catastrophic events, starting from the nuclear bombing in Nagasaki, and culminating in the confines of Guantanamo Bay.

Burnt Shadows is a palimpsest of historical events and memories, scattered across decades of the protagonist's life. It offers multiculturalism and cosmopolitanism but is also a commentary on the difficulties of finding a home wherein one feels at ease. Bruce King (2011) highlights the richness of Shamsie's characters and the complexity of her plot so

that multiple narratives within a story interact with one another forming a cohesive whole. Her stories are rooted in the past, and culminate in the present, providing a wider context to the happenings within the novel and the "present being a gateway to events in the past" (King 149). As in her previous novels, a sizeable portion of *Broken Verses* is set in Karachi, which is an ode to her own life in Karachi. When asked about her associations with Karachi, Shamsie replied, "Karachi is my hometown, so I'm biased, but to me it's one of the world's great, fascinating cities" (Chambers 187). Karachi, as one of the settings of her novel, reflects her love and fascination for the city. King argues that transnational movements in the novel coincide with Shamsie's own move from Karachi to London, highlighting the embeddedness of Shamsie's own identity in her texts.

Burnt Shadows reconciles race, gender, nationality, geography, and history. Global and personal intertwine in Shamsie's narrative, beaded in a string via the "travelling body" (Jose 7) of the protagonist. From the thrashed lands of Hiroshima to the skyscrapers of New York, Hiroko Tanaka's body carries with it the remnants of what it has gone through, and the geographical spaces it has been in, and acquires new meaning while traversing newer places.

Hiroko Tanaka, the protagonist, transcends territorialization forced through borders. The assimilation of her existence in four vastly different urban spaces explains the hybridity of her identity, making it "impossible to place her within a geographical, cultural, and social frame" (Vitolo 4). Hiroko's character offers a unique vantage point in which readers can truly see and experience an identity that is free from nationalistic borders. Each place, connected to a historical occurrence, denotes the beginning of a new chapter in the novel that imparts a significant change in the character's identity formation. In Hiroko, particularly, Shamsie has created a transnational character that promotes transnational solidarity (Vitolo 7). The many border-crossings across the novel and the different traits Hiroko adopts throughout her life make it impossible to categorize and limit her identity to a single place, culture, or society.

Hiroko's identity is in constant flux, shifting with her movement across borders and nations. Place and space play a pivotal role in the development of Hiroko's identity across the ever-changing global political and physical geographies. She constantly negotiates her identity in order to develop a sense of belonging and inclusion while maintaining some semblance of her individuality. Loretta (2011) calls Hiroko a transmigrant in light of her

continual migrations and her constant state of becoming in response to these migrations. She, at one and the same time, belongs to the local and the global. The reconciliation of the inner with the global corresponds with the geographical relocations as well as the historical events accompanying the protagonist.

Not only is the protagonist a victim of a transnational identity crisis, but her son, Raza Konrad Ashraf, is also prey to a similar struggle. His transnational heritage is constantly in contention with American modernity centered around the "exclusion of the Other" (Singh "Insurgent Metaphors" 36). Raza, a Japanese Pakistani multilingual working for an American military contractor, is on "both sides of the war on terror" (36). Due to his ambivalent, amorphous identity, not only is he constantly striving to determine the locus of his identity but also, forced to prove his loyalty everywhere he goes. Raza Konrad Ashraf's (Hiroko's son) multicultural identity contributes to the fluidity or "hybridization" (Sadaf 120; Babar 123) of his character. The uniqueness of his name (Raza Konrad-Ashraf), his physical appearance ('Raza Hazara'), and his mixed parentage (Japanese Pakistani) accounts for the indefiniteness of his identity throughout the novel. It is this very foreignness and his ability to conform to any situation that allows Raza to adapt to different cultures and later lands him a job as a spy. His yearning for belonging, acceptance, and approval, however, is undying throughout the novel.

Wahid Pervez's reflections on Sajjad's character as a "hybrid" (38) in the article titled *Critical Study of Kamila Shamsie's Novel 'Burnt Shadows' in The Light of Post-Colonial Theory* seem a little forced. Although Sajjad stands on the cusp of two cultures, hybridity demands more than engaging or interacting with two distinct cultures. The creation of a third space or liminal space is a condition of hybridization. Homi K. Bhabha draws parallels between the liminal space that emerges as a result of the interaction between two cultures and a stairwell that essentially functions as a connective tissue between two floors. The stairwell, he writes, functions as a liminal space "in-between the designations of identity, … [acting as] the connective tissue that constructs the difference between upper and lower, black and white." (Bhabha 5). Although Sajjad regularly interacts with the Burtons, the colonial masters, and is "unhomed" (Babar 116) from Dilli, he does not give in to the "The margin of hybridity, where cultural differences 'contingently' and conflictually touch" (Bhabha 296) and preserves his identity as a Dilli-wala. Post-

independence, Sajjad evolves through cultural negotiations and adapts to his life in Karachi, later coming to love the city like his own.

Moreover, the researcher's claim that the preceding occupations on the sub-continent were welcomed wholeheartedly and/or accepted by the natives peacefully is also objectionable. The greed for land and resources invited conquerors from all over the world to India, be it Turks, Arabs, Huns, Mongols, or Persians (Pervez 36) and each conquest was met with resistance from the natives. The subsequent years may have been more peaceful than the British rule but the struggle for sovereignty cannot be denied to the natives. The author's claim that the conquerors were "heartbroken and tears were running down from their eyes" (36) seems unauthentic and borders on hearsay. The only point of difference, however, as Pervez points out, is the feeling of Otherness that the British subjected the Natives to. British occupiers ruled with force, upheld a certain level of superiority over their Indian counterparts, and, as harbingers of white man's burden, disdained the natives for being 'uncivilized' and 'uncultured'.

In addition to the characters' transnational identity, the pervasiveness of terrorism and violence across nations suggests the dispensability of nationalistic borders. The geographical and historical chronology of events in *Burnt Shadows* suggests that terrorism is "more pervasive across time and space than commonly accepted" (Khan "Narrating Pakistan Transnationally" 67). The porousness of violence in Shamsie's narrative gives rise to, what Gohar Karim Khan in her doctoral dissertation calls, "Transnational terrorism" (67). From the confines of a cold cell in Guantanamo Bay to the atomic bomb in Nagasaki, the independence of the subcontinent, the 9/11 attack, and the 'war on terror' in Afghanistan, the novel juxtaposes these catastrophic events so that it reiterates terrorism as "modern and transnational" (68). The departure from archaic selective representation of historical violence is the writer's attempt at uncovering the prejudices and biases in dominant discourse.

On the hybridity of the novel itself, Sandrine Soukaï's *The Hybridity of Partition Novels in English: Reshaping National Identities in Amitav Ghosh's The Shadow Lines and Kamila Shamsie's Burnt Shadows* draws parallels between the tropes and vocabulary used in the subject anglophone South Asian fiction, borrowed from various Indian literatures. The article provides a detailed analysis of both novels, elaborating on the use of pre-partition tropes and "memory maps" by diasporic writers like Shamsie to cartograph

"home". The narrative, through its use of pre-partition linguistic and literary tropes, becomes a "transcultural poetic space" (Soukai 78) wherein the author's imaginary homeland is constructed via memory maps. When asked about "intertextual allusions to Faiz, Shakespeare, soap operas, high and low culture, Urdu and folk tales, David Mitchell, and Michael Ondaatje" (Chambers 180) in *Burnt Shadows*, in an interview with Claire Chambers, Shamsie mentioned Salman Rushdie, Michael Ondaatje, David Mitchell, and Agha Shahid Ali who have influenced her work in one way or another.

The catastrophic events outlined in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* have an impact that reaches far beyond the boundaries of personal or communal. Adriana Kiczkowski in her research titled, *Glocalization in Post-9/11 Literature." Burnt shadows" by Kamila Shamsie* provides an in-depth analysis of the bond linking the global with the local, i.e., glocalization, explaining how the global events are intertwined with local lives. The global impact of each event is a standpoint for political debate and historical mapping to date. The relativity of the event, however, with the characters within the novel tears this cloth of global, bringing it into the personal and familial realm. The interweaving of the local and global is one of the key points of the narrative that helps in better comprehension of its diverse characters (Kiczkowski 129). The interlinking brings the global into the local, and the effect of global events is felt locally.

The bird-shaped burns on Hiroko Tanaka's back are a point of debate for many researchers. Şahin Kiziltaş, for example, in the research *Symbolisation of Memory and Space In Kamila Shamsie's Burnt Shadows,* discusses the link between memory and space through "externalised images and symbols" one of which are the scars on Hiroko's back. The memories of the catastrophic event are etched on Hiroko in the form of three bird-shaped scars. The shape and placement of the scars, according to Kiziltaş is an ode to her Japanese origins and the traumatizing memory that Hiroko, perhaps desperately, wants to get rid of but is unable to. The scars are representative of Hiroko's trauma that she carries with her and that has become a part of her identity. Gohar Karim Khan has also commented on the bird-shaped burns on Hiroko's back in her research, *The Hideous Beauty of Bird-Shaped Burns: Transnational Allegory and Feminist Rhetoric in Kamila Shamsie's Burnt Shadows*. The burns, in her opinion, are a symbol of a "monstrous and destructive form of nationalism" (58) that she is forced to carry the burden of throughout her life. As seen in the novel, Hiroko Tanaka's identity as a Japanese is reinforced through these burns that are

not only a symbol of her trauma but also of her identity as a Japanese. These scars and the pain they carry play a pivotal role in the construction of Hiroko's identity through her life in different cities of the world.

Feminist studies on the novel extrapolate on the coexistence of secular ideals with the religious culture in the country. The notion of pre-partition emancipated women stands in stark contrast to western narratives that the British brought emancipation to the women of South Asia. *Burnt Shadows* interlinks Islam and feminism suggesting a unique outlook on feminist theory that involves Muslim women's own "cultural histories, background and experience" and depicts "non-obvious ways" (Ranasinha 148) in which Muslim women exercise agency. The coexistence of two seemingly disjointed ideas, i.e. religiousness, and secularism, in a harmonious framework, creates a unique worldview. Shamsie herself alludes to this heterogeneity, she states that "there are secular feminists like me, and thinkers who want to produce valuable feminist reinterpretations of the Qur'an" (Chambers 186). This heterogeneity adds to the Euro-American-centric views on secularism while alluding to the spirituality and gentleness of Islam and how important it is to individual Muslims.

Physical cartographies are deeply intertwined with mental cartographies in Shamsie's novel. The territorialization of each character and the reduction of their identities to their places of origin results in the "striation" of nationalistic ideologies (Nadeem and Hashmat 73). The reinforcement of physical borders and the emphasis on nation-states undervalue individualistic identities and reduce personhood to the nation they belong to. The way territorialization emasculates globalization is evident in the many characters in the novel. Be it Hiroko who carries the identity of a 'hibakusha', Sajjad who, on account of his status as the colonized, is expected to serve the English masters, Raza who is cast out like an outsider, Kim who never realized the power of her white passport, or Abdullah, an Afghan, who criticizes Americans for fighting a war "somewhere else" (Shamsie *Burnt Shadows* 350). Each character, the way they are perceived and expected to behave is confined to the borders of their nation-state.

2.3 Review of Literature on Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*

Claire Chambers, in *Review of Bilal Tanweer, The Scatter Here is Too Great* calls Bilal Tanweer the "creative writing protégé of Kamila Shamsie", applauding the way

Tanweer has mapped the metropolitan city i.e., Karachi in his work. She has commended Tanweer for bringing together a scattered narrative, tying in five different stories from nine different voices in a coherent whole; "novel in five stories", as she calls it (Chambers *DAWN.com*). When asked about the different stories coming together in the novel, Tanweer in an interview with *The Asian Writer* replied that the novel originally started off as individual stories. Slowly, however, these stories started "speaking…arguing…and yelling at each other", but eventually they formed a whole, giving birth to new stories together (Shaikh *The Asian Writer*). These fragmented stories are weaved into a single cloth in the backdrop of Karachi giving rise to a coherent whole story.

Sarah Waheed applauds the fragmented narrative of Tanweer's novel in *A Different Story: New fiction in English on Karachi.* Although the bombing at Cantt station is at the center of the plot, the fragmented narratives of the people affected by it serve as "map-making" for the city. The unique storytelling compels readers to not only visualize but listen to the intricacies of the city and cartograph the "interruptions, the connections and broken links between people, as well as the fractured states of mind that accompany the experience of violence" common to the inhabitants of the city (Waheed *The Caravan*). The stories and their fragmented connection with Karachi allow for a better understanding of the city, its inhabitants, and the bond linking the two.

Karachi, as a major city, has been the center of many fictional narratives, including both novels under consideration in this study. As a metropolitan city, Karachi has much to offer in terms of diverse cultures, different ethnicities, diverse identities, and much more. The Karachi of Tanweer's novel, however, departs from the more popular descriptions of the city seen in narratives of writers like Kamila Shamsie, and Mohsin Hamid, etc. The gaze shifts from the elite view to the underbelly of the city. Bilal writes about "The very middle of the middle class in Karachi and a very local reality: The bus drivers, the vendors, and the crowd-gathering, smooth-talking street performers" (Rehman *Herald Magazine*). Tanweer's Karachi is a cosmopolitan city, home to all and sundry. His novel, as such, describes the city and its inhabitants in its entirety, bridging the gap between real and fictional.

The ordinary Karachiites in *The Scatter Here is Too Great* carry individual identities and have distinct voices. Thin spiderwebs link all the characters into a collective whole, creating a network of interconnected individuals facing the mammoth of violence

in the “ruinously mad city” (Tanweer 175) of Karachi. Nudrat Kamal applauds Tanweeer’s characterization, calling it “his novel's biggest strength”. Each character provides a different perspective, each perspective carries some semblance of truth and defines characters’ “sadnesses, happinesses, their most important decisions in life” (Shaikh *The Asian Writer*). It is the ordinariness and gullibility of each character and their scattered lives in the city that carry a certain relevance and bring them to life. “The great secret of ordinariness” Tanweer remarks, “is that it’s like the smell in your mother’s room: commonplace but at the same time, incredibly powerful in its evocation of empathy” (Shaikh *The Asian Writer*). Tanweer’s characters, in a similar manner, carry the ordinariness and mundaneness of simple Karachiites navigating through the city and the chaos it carries.

Although each character leads a separate life, the way they are all connected, and their lives centered around the blast brings the narrative together as a whole. Tehmina Pirzada, in the article *“Sharing the Scatter”: Assemblage and Affect in The Scatter Here Is Too Great,* reflects on the re-territorialization of the otherwise “dystopian landscape” (82) in the aftermath of the bomb blast. The scattered experiences of individuals converge and find common ground, binding everyone into a collective “we” (82). The varied interstices of Karachi merge with the collective experience of violence and the resultant trauma. The ability of Karachi and its inhabitants to work through the loss, reterritorialize the landscape, and negotiate with trauma, forms what Pirzada calls the “redeeming” qualities of Karachi and its people (84). The characters’ creativity in counteracting the violence defies cartographic lines and definitive borders, instead, the city is mapped anew on fragments of memories, human emotions, and relationships. The assemblage of this scatter forms the core of Karachi and its inhabitants (74). The resultant landscape contains traces of “blood, sweat, tears, and memories” (74) that translate into love, longing, loss, terror, and dispossession.

Karachi, the central, most powerful element of Tanweer’s novel does not function as a mere setting or background, it rather emerges as a character “as vivid and alive as the motley crew of individuals that people it” (Kamal *Newsline*). The closeness and affinity with which Tanweer describes the city speaks volumes about the bond that connects the writer and Karachi, like “like someone talking about a close friend” (Kamal *Newsline*). The author maintains a strong bond with Karachi and has expressed his love and unbreakable

bond with the city on various instances, “I grew up there, it is the city of my subconscious, … That is the city I dream about.” (Doval *Mint*). For the author, Karachi is the one true defining space of his identity, a reference point against which he measures everything else (H. Shah *Pakistan-U.S. Alumni Network*). In another interview, Tanweer says that he has only ever experienced true happiness in Karachi and Lahore. The emotional connection with geographical space, Tanweer remarks, “define[s] you in ways that you cannot comprehend. Places create certain emotive responses.” (Rehman *Herald Magazine*). The author’s bond with Karachi is carried over in the novel and defines the lives of the characters living in Karachi.

Khamsa Qasim and Munazza Yaqoob have explored the monstrosity of the city in Tanweer’s *The Scatter Here Is Too Great*. In their article, titled *Monstrous Urban Spaces and Violence in The Scatter Here is Too Great,* they reflect on the city’s abominable nature that makes it, at one and the same time, hate-able and enviable. Karachi is a conundrum of colliding spaces and histories; the opposing forces of the city give it a monstrous quality. In Tanweer’s novel Karachi emerges as a microcosm of “conflicting ideologies and violent tensions that are plaguing the whole country” (100), a space wherein monsters of violence and contradicting forces loom at large.

The Scatter Here is too Great, however, does not comment on the looming darkness of violence and terrorism in Karachi, nor does it critique sectarianism, or extremism prevalent in the city. It rather lets its characters guide the narrative. Erum Haider writes, “those who read this novel for a comment on terrorism and violence in Karachi will find themselves taken on several different tangents”, for these characters, rooted in the chaotic city, branch out and lead different lives (Haider *Tanqeed*). When asked about the centrality of Karachi and the bomb blast, in particular, Tanweer states that his novel is “an attempt to make readers look away from the ‘event’ of the bomb blast to other things that get left out from the conversation”, things such as loss, how it impacts people’s lives, how they think about it and how it affects the way they remember a place (Das *Times of India*). Although violence is at the core of Karachi’s existence, Tanweer’s novel is an attempt to look outside the events of violence and trace how it is inscribed in the lives of Karachiites.

By separating the narrative from violent, political overtures, Tanweer has given voice to more nuanced human experiences. These shared experiences find their way through the divides of sectarianism, and other discriminatory practices, binding all

individuals in a collective community. Through this distancing that otherwise breeds divide, Tanweer has written to himself, to Karachi, and to the ordinary, everyday people who live mundane lives in the city. The author's gaze on the city provides a new perspective, one that allows readers to "connect to it instantly" (Zahidi *Chaaidaani*). The ordinariness of the city and its inhabitants and the mutual experience of violence in the city allow readers to establish a connection and relate to it.

Violence, trauma, and terrorism form the epicenter of Pakistan's literary arena, especially literature written after 9/11 and the so-called 'war on terror'. *Moth Smoke* by Mohsin Hamid*, The Spinner's Tale* by Omar Shahid Hamid*,* and *A Case of Exploding Mangoes* by Mohammed Hanif are a select few of many that comment on violence and terrorism in the country. The depiction of violence in Pakistani literature, however, is not a mere "journalistic account of Pakistani socio-cultural scenario" (Hamid & Khan 230), instead it serves the purpose of evoking sentiment and generating a response from the reader. The juxtaposition of violence and aesthetics in Tanweer's novel, for example, according to Sahar Hamid and Shahzeb Khan, is not the author's attempt at trivializing the chaos prevalent in the city. It, rather, serves as a "cultural signifier" (248), evidence of common people's perseverance and their undying hope in the face of violence. The intertwining of violence with aesthetics invites readers to negotiate with the present reality (244), giving new meaning to violent images by evoking readers' sentiments and attaining a therapeutic release.

On understanding the trauma of the characters of Tanweer's novel, Afeera Mehboob's thesis titled, *The Smell of Survival: Urban Chaos and Post-Traumatic Growth in The Scatter Here is Too Great by Bilal Tanweer* is of particular importance. The study elaborates on the various traumas faced by different characters of the novel and extends the narrative on the same. *The Scatter Here Is Too Great* is undoubtedly a valuable addition to the South Asian Trauma Fiction, the novel through its twisted yet unified plot portrays different traumas experienced by individuals and how they deal with it, as indicated by Mehboob in her research. Mehboob has also established a link between the characters and the city, aptly calling Karachi a "protagonist of the novel" (11) since its engagement with the characters extends beyond a 'setting' or 'place'. Karachi, in the novel, stands as a symbol of resilience and violence, healing and trauma, a city that is alive yet plagued with diseases of violence.

Amidst the deafening sound of violence and the diverse Karachiite voices, it may seem easy for a character to lose its essence. Tanweer, however, skillfully breathes life into each life, pulsating with the rhythm of the city. Syed Murtaza Ali Shah explores the relationship between Sartre's 'existence precedes essence' and the novel's characters' fight for their essence in his research titled *'Essence and Existence' in Bilal Tanveer's The Scatter Here Is Too Great.* Shah argues that in this fight for survival and finding meaning, each character emerges victorious. Through creative catharsis, be it in the form of storytelling or imaginative drawing, the characters find a way to not only maintain their sanity but also find meaning in the ever-chaotic city of Karachi.

2.4 Identifying and Filling the Research Gap Through This Study

As evident from the discussion above, both the novels under study have been explored from various perspectives. The geography of urban spaces has been a point of concern for various researchers, especially Karachi's relationship with respective authors and the inhabitants of the city has been studied by researchers at length. It is important to note that none of the studies link the geography of these cities with post catastrophe trauma of the characters. The literature review suggests that although urban areas have been the focal point of research in both novels, little attention has been paid on mapping how trauma associated with a catastrophe alters characters' production of space.

This research aims to fill this gap by analyzing how geography and trauma interact with one another in respective novels. It also explores how trauma associated with the place of catastrophe is projected onto other spaces, showing how individuals' psychogeography is irreversibly altered in the aftermath of a catastrophic event.

CHAPTER 3

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The research uses the concept of psychogeography as theorized by Catharina Löffler in her book *Walking in the City: Urban Experience and Literary Psychogeography in Eighteenth-Century London* to analyze the psychogeographical undertones in both the texts under study. Löffler expands on the link between psyche and geography whereby individual experiences are shaped by urban surroundings and individuals, in turn, project their subjective experiences onto the city.

In order to investigate traumatic geographies and how they pan out in the concerned literature, the research further adapts the lens of Geo-trauma as described by Rachel Pain (2021) in the article, *Geo-trauma: Violence, Place And Repossession.* The research elaborates on the 'spatial turn' of trauma, building upon existing research, and explores the spatiality of trauma via Rachel Pain's seven placings of trauma namely memorial places, retraumatizing places, layered places, hardwired places, mobile places, places of repossession and healing places (Pain 972).

Both concepts are conjointly used to analyze the connection between psyche, space and trauma. Through theoretical triangulation, the research highlights how trauma affects physical space as well as psychology of a character and how a character's psychology in turn affects their perception of space. Löffler's conceptualization of psychogeography serves as a medium through which the link between characters' psyche and space is established. On the other hand, Pain's placement of trauma allows for an in-depth understanding of the workings of trauma in city spaces. Using the concept of psychogeography and geo-trauma the research aims to bring forth the "twofold reciprocal" (Violi 73) relationship between trauma and psychology.

3.1 Explorations in Psychogeography by Catharina Löffler

Psychogeography, an amalgamation of psychology and geography, describes "spatial experiences in relation to social, physical, historical, psychological and geographical dimensions of everyday life" (Löffler 6). The combination of objective, i.e. the laws of geography, with the subjective, i.e. behavior and emotions of individuals, forms the core of the concept. The purpose of psychogeography, as Löffler puts it, is to "take in the objective,

material environment of the city and uncover from it subjective, hidden meanings of the city that vary from individual to individual" (46). Varying subjective experiences of the city are at the heart of psychogeography for it prioritizes the emotional and psychological side of urban experiences (6). Individuals with their urban settings are linked via a bidirectional bond whereby individual experiences shape the city and the city, in turn, shapes subjective experiences. Psychogeographical understanding serves to access and decode" (41) the individual urban experience.

The emergence of psychogeography gave rise to a new understanding of space wherein it ceased to exist as a mere backdrop or setting of a historical event. Spatial understanding gave way to newer meanings of our life in space. The study of the ever-changing dynamics of space and its effect on social relations is essential for a psychogeographical understanding of space. With the development of psychogeography and its progression into a key concept for understanding subjective experiences of a city, the notion of space as a "neutral container of history" (26), has become archaic. Space has acquired a significant new place in the understanding of different temporalities, adding more depth and profundity to different spatialities in time.

The representation of urban spaces in literature is marked by a certain degree of referentiality. While every literary city may not have a real-world counterpart, many texts represent fictional accounts of real-world cities. Literary accounts of real cities carry a certain degree of fantasy, however, the connection with the real-world is undeniably noticeable. The fictional accounts of urban spaces may carry references to specific landscapes, locations, streets, notable architecture, historical buildings, etc. that make the association with the real city apparent in the literary text. The "grade of referentiality" (27) can vary in different texts, nonetheless, it serves as an imperative in the understanding of literary psychogeography. Since each literary text is a product of the author's imagination, literary texts carry not one but multiple representations of a city. These varying representations "appear in kaleidoscopic manifestations of reality" (32) giving way to different versions of reality with multiple viewpoints and world-building. The differences in the accounts of a city lead to "multi-focalisation" (32) of the urban space allowing for multiple perspectives and understanding of the same space.

The fictional construct wherein the real and the imagined collide gives rise to a world "in-between" (33). The mixing of imagination and reality works in a way so that

fiction crosses the realm of reality and reality is portrayed in a manner so that it appears fictional. The cities thus birthed in fiction, create spaces in-between or urban imaginary, "where factual descriptions of reality are enriched with subjective interpretations" (35). These spaces in-between carry certain aspects of real cities mixed with fictionalized elements giving rise to urban imaginaries.

Of crucial importance, in psychogeography, is the art of walking called *dérive*. Walking through a city is a way of relating to the world around us, developing a deeper, more personal understanding of the surrounding world, and "perceiving ourselves in relation to our surroundings" (36). It is the epitome of subjective experiences and gives way to new perspectives. The subjective accounts of a city conjured by walking around the city form the crux of psychogeography (41). Löffler writes,

> The walker experiences the city first-hand and can engage with his urban surroundings individually, creating a highly dynamic interaction between him and his spatial surroundings: While walking through the city…pedestrians interact with the city and create individual urban texts. (40)

The limitations or restrictions in the path of walkers do not function as obstacles, they rather structure the individual experiences and add more depth to the understanding of the cityscape. Walking creates diverse urban imaginaries built upon the subjective footprints of the walker across the city.

Löffler uses the term "literary psychogeography" (51) to describe the representation of psychogeography in literature. Literary psychogeography involves more than topographical referencing, it entails the mood created by the geographical setting and the effect of the mind on the same. Owing to the difference in authors' accounts of an urban imaginary, literary psychogeography can take several forms. The reading experience is a mental journey for the reader of literary psychogeography in which the reader traces the footprints of texts and experiences the city through a selected perspective. Not only do the authors serve as guides to the city, but the protagonists also act as guides to the urban imaginary, taking readers on a mental walk across the city. Psychogeographic writings provide a view of "life of the city and of life in the city" (57), recording and preserving the influence of geographical settings on the individual mind. The distancing from the familiar allows for the rediscovery of the city. The urban imaginary in literary texts serves as a form

of mapping wherein readers can cartograph a city anew and ascertain specific meanings to locations in the city.

In order to explore the psychogeographical undertones of literature, Löffler suggests dominant characteristics of the concept that can be traced in literature. Since the characteristics cover both the discourse and the story, Löffler has divided them into two categories: themes and formal elements of literary psychogeography (96). Of the themes present in psychogeographical writings, the most important is the bond linking fact and fiction. The fact or objective situatedness of the text stems from the topographical details referring to the city in the real world. These references are key to the reader's spatial understanding and allow him to situate himself within the city. The fictional or subjective accounts are brought in via personal details, moods, feelings, etc. Hence, the city in literary texts is not a mere physical setting but an account of subjective experience and the emotions it evokes.

While engaging with the text, the reader can develop a sense of the place triggered by the clash and subsequent fusion of objective and subjective ambiance of the space in question. Psychogeography defies monotony and banalization of everyday experiences, by attributing new meanings and a different interpretation of the cityscape. The representation of the underbelly of urban spaces also contributes to the psychogeographical mapping of the urban imaginary. Exposing the dark, ugly, and dirty of the city gives rise to fear, anxiety, curiosity, and heightened sensations (102-104). Psychogeographical writings expose these grim details highlighting the layers hidden underneath.

In understanding and experiencing the city, the use of multiple senses is necessary. While sight occupies the most important position in experiencing the city, the importance of other senses is unequivocal. A multi-sensory perception of the cityscape serves to provide a multi-dimensional experience of the city. The use of all five senses helps in "structuring experiences of and contributing to orientation in urban space" (108). Auditory and olfactory sensations shape geographical spaces as well as establish "geographical reputations or prejudices" (110), attributing cultural meaning to specific areas.

When it comes to text, one of the formal elements in literary psychogeography is the element of *focalisation* (114). The subjective experiences of the city are subject to the

cognition and perspective of a single character. The character, also termed as *focaliser* (114), acts as a lens through which a city is experienced.

> The city is fleshed out from the perspective of a focal character, restricting the perception of the city to one pair of eyes and one mind, and shaping the city with the help of narrative descriptions of individual spatial surroundings, spatial experiences, or spatial relations…In that way, the city in literary psychogeography only exists in relation to the focal character who describes it, even if it may appear objective at first. (114)

Focalisation fuses objective with the subjective, or real with the imagined resulting in multiple layers of perception stacked on top of each other that create a palimpsest of the urban imaginary.

Tracing psychogeographical characteristics in literary texts demands more than analyzing the texts. It requires an in-depth analysis of the non-textual elements as well. Using multiple modes or *multimodality* (117), as Löffler calls it, "intensifies the reading experience" (119). Multimodal elements bring more depth to the city's perception and allow readers to immerse themselves in the fictional world rather easily.

As mentioned above, walking is imperative to psychogeography. There are two dimensions of walking in discourse; firstly, the "activity of walking" reflected in the narrative structure of the text and secondly, a "terminology of walking that stresses the importance of perceiving the city from the perspective of a walker" (119-120). As such, the *rhetorics of walking* (119) in the narrative reflect the importance of walking as it guarantees "psychogeographical experiences of urban space" (123). Walking allows for a subjective understanding and interpretation of the city space. The different accounts of experiences echo the ways cities are perceived differently by different individuals.

Understanding the significance of the relationship between psyche and geography and how it pans out in the larger context of trauma provides valuable insights into how geographical spaces are imbued with personal, social, and cultural significance, influencing individuals' perceptions, behaviors, and interactions with their surroundings. Through psychogeographical mapping of the subject novels, the research explores and analyzes the ways the reciprocal relationship between psyche and geography unfolds in the aftermath of a catastrophe.

3.2 Rachel Pain's Placings of Geo-Traumatic Spaces

When it comes to trauma or traumatic experiences, literature is rife with the psychological, social, cultural, individual, and collective effects of the same. To be traumatized, as Cathy Caruth puts it, is to be "possessed by an image or event" (5). In recent times, however, researchers have explored the temporal and spatial underpinnings of trauma and how it materializes in different times and spaces. The rootedness of trauma in the place of occurrence and its materialization in spaces defying geospatial logic is evidence of trauma's unbreakable bond with space and its multidirectional nature. The complex bond linking trauma and geographies involves "spatial and temporal psychological dislocation and [is] triggered by aspects of place or particular sites where memory, pain or ongoing violence linger" (Pain et al. 288). Pain locates trauma in places by categorizing seven overlapping 'placings' (Pain 974), each space serves a particular purpose in the geo-trauma narrative, helping to situate trauma in space.

Trauma does not stay rooted in its space or time of origin; it moves across different spaces and temporalities. The remembrance of the memory and the resulting trauma can materialize in contemporary space and time even if it shares no relationship with the catastrophic event. The geographical or spatial effects of trauma form the core of geo-trauma. Rachel Pain (2021) defines the term in the following words, "Geo-trauma describes multiscalar, intersecting and mutual relations between trauma and place…the relational clasping of place with the experience and impacts of trauma." (Pain 974).

Since the locus of this research is the identification and analysis of geographies of trauma in space, it will specifically focus on the placing of trauma in space using the seven placings categorized by Pain in her article.

3.2.1 Memorial Places

Memorial places are specific places that invoke the memory of an individual with respect to the sites of catastrophic events. What is important here is the site of the ruins and the role it plays in encapsulating that which is no longer present. Although trauma materializes itself in places outside the site of ruins, the rootedness of the place in which the trauma took place, and the memory of that location are inextricably bound. Memories of the violent incidence attached to a specific place inexplicably affect the experience with the said place.

The site of the catastrophe has a complex relationship with what it was before the catastrophe struck thus allowing for multiple interpretations of the site. The site of the ruin may evoke a memory of what it was in the past, creating what Dylan Trigg (2009) calls "negative space" through the "presence of memory" (96) such that the ruins mirror a memory of the place it once was.

The memories associated with the site of ruin form superimposed layers, each layer corresponding to different temporalities and the varying spatialities associated with them. The memory of the place before, during, and after catastrophe struck as well as the memory of the place as it exists in the present time form different layers of the sedimentation of that place. These varying memories, although associated with the same place, give rise to different spatialities with dissimilar geographies of the same space.

3.2.2 Retraumatizing Places

Retraumatizing places, as the name indicates, are places that re-trigger traumatic memories and feelings. These memories can get invoked in other places and bring about the same effects in affected individuals. Any actions, events, images, sounds, or smells in places outside the site of ruin that trigger a traumatic response in an individual and bring back the memories of the catastrophic event are included in this placing (Pain 980). Retraumatizing places induce flashbacks of the traumatic event in spaces and times other than the site of origin and the pain accompanying that trauma also resurfaces (Coddington and Micieli-Voutsinas 1). Retraumatizing places, thus, add to the existing trauma of an individual and impede the process of healing.

It is also important to specify that the word 'site', according to Dylan Trigg, "distance(s) the remoteness and fragmentation of trauma with the felt experience of place", it is a "liminal space at once incomplete and in transition" (89). The liminality of this space indicates that it can manifest itself elsewhere and can invoke the same memories. Trigg further elaborates that the spatial and temporal unity emerges as a result of the centrality of the body that performs actions peculiar to the event and it is in these actions that the memory actualizes itself in the present. Micieli-Voutsinas argues that these palimpsestic assemblages of memory combine with narratives of the past that are "realized in and through their re-materialization in contemporary time and space" (19) which is to say that

the traumatic memories are re-produced across different times and spaces irrespective of the site of the memory.

3.2.3 Layered Places

Trauma does actualize itself in one layer, it is, rather, a palimpsest of memories, with one layer on another renewing and reshaping the whole terrain of trauma. Rachel Pain, while elaborating on this concept of layered places and the subsequent trauma, borrows the word "sedimentation" from Mounts study titled, *Island Detention: Affective Eruption As Trauma's Disruption*, to describe this layering of trauma, one on top of another (qtd. in Mounts 2). The gradual layering reinforces trauma extending deep and far. The violence of the past and the ones continuing in the present, create a palimpsest of trauma (Pain 980). This layering does not erase the presence of previous traumas, rather, it is a build-up that threatens to erupt when triggered, bringing the past into the present and adding more complexity to contemporary events.

3.2.4 Hardwired Places

The hardwiring of trauma suggests that it can get embedded in certain cues such that when said cues are triggered in a different place or time, the same memories can actualize themselves in that very space. Trauma, in such a case, is embedded in environmental cues, i.e., the material, social, and emotional fabric of the environment, that trigger the traumatic memory (Pain 981). These cues, once encountered, bring back memories of the traumatic event as well as the space in which the catastrophic event took place.

Hardwired places are indicative of the internal workings of trauma and how it shifts in relation to the space outside (Pain 981). While it is true that trauma is hardwired in the actual place of occurrence, a certain flexibility is associated with trauma that allows it to get hardwired again in response to triggering cues in another place and time. Just as trauma becomes hardwired in place, place can become hardwired in trauma and adversely affect the experience of space.

3.2.5 Mobile Places

The existence of mobile places suggests the linking of trauma to different spatialities. As Coddington and Micieli-Voutsinas suggest in their research, trauma has a

complicated relationship with space. Locating trauma in spaces other than the site of ruin allows for the conceptualization of its movement across different spatialities and temporalities. The conceptual understanding of spatial turn in trauma helps understand how "it is relationally experienced across scales, bodies, and emotions." (1). Pain rightfully argues against the rigidity of trauma and its embeddedness in a certain place and time, she argues that trauma itself links different places and time, creating a bridge that transcends the bounds of spatiality and temporality.

Pain suggests that the mobility of trauma applies to subjective narratives of trauma, "travelling sites of trauma, and to damaged social relations that stretch across multiple places" (981) such that it is not just a bond that extends from an individual and links him/her to a catastrophic event but is also a commonality that bridges the gap between places and time such that past traumas can get evoked after witnessing a certain triggering event, etc.

3.2.6 Places of Repossession

Places of repossession act as a survival strategy for traumatized people to take back control and displace existing trauma. Places of repossession imply that there are "diverse spatialities to survivorhood" (Pain 982). Repossessing the place of trauma allows survivors to reestablish their material and emotional link with the site (983), allowing them to establish grounds for their healing.

While the spatial turn of trauma accounts for its existence in spaces beyond the original, spatial repossession is a resistance against the violence inflicted on the victims. It is also a healing strategy that allows survivors to reclaim space and heal from the effects of that traumatic memory.

3.2.7 Healing Places

Healing places are the last of the seven places included in Pain's placings of geo-trauma. She argues that "healing constitutes not forgetting but integrating experience, connecting with others and with activism" (982). The recreation and regeneration of places act as an impetus for healing for traumatized individuals. Healing does not imply the obliviating of memories or a complete detachment from the event itself. It, in contrast, combats "structural violence itself, through grassroots activism and policies to tackle the

entangled and layered violences that underpin geo-trauma" (Pain 983), allowing for the alleviation of trauma.

Geo-trauma and the categories explained above not only compound spatial trauma but also provide an impetus for healing. It not only helps locate trauma in space but also allows for place-based healing and repossession of spaces. Rachel Pain's seven placements of trauma allow for an understanding of city spaces in terms of their relationship with trauma. As such, the above theoretical framework can help identify how trauma emerging from catastrophic events can manifest itself in different places and how certain places can become an impetus for healing from the trauma itself.

Keeping psychogeography and geo-trauma at the center, this research employs textual analysis method to analyze Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*. The study integrates the above theoretical frameworks to understand the indelible connection between geography and trauma. Moreover, the research also delves into the geographical implications of a catastrophe to study the various ways trauma affects the spatial perception of an individual.

CHAPTER 4

ANALYSIS

Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great* are analyzed in this chapter to cartograph a psychogeographic map of the cities in both novels. Not only does it explore the relationship between psychology and geography of different characters but also seeks to study the changes in psychogeographic mapping before and after characters encounter and experience a catastrophic event. While Shamsie's story moves around the globe, from Nagasaki to Delhi, Karachi, and finally New York, Tanweer's novel is set in Karachi. The perception of space and its effect on psychology as well as the effect of psychology on the perception of space forms the basis of this analysis.

4.1 Psychogeographic Mapping of Geo-Traumatic Spaces in Kamila Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows*

The deep entanglement of space with psychology is apparent at the onset of Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* wherein the protagonist and her German fiancé share a war-stricken, distorted, and fractured view of Nagasaki before the atomic bomb. The interweaving of psychology and geography continues through the entire length of the novel, traveling from war-affected Nagasaki to British-occupied Delhi, post-independence Karachi and finally post 9/11 New York. What follows along is the characters' trauma linked to the cities, the way these cities are perceived before the catastrophe struck, and how they change in the aftermath of the devastating catastrophe.

4.1.1 Nagasaki – The Epicenter of Atomic Bomb

Japan, as one of the epicenters of war, bore the brunt of the force with two atomic bombs taking the lives of hundreds of thousands, destroying the cities in their entirety, and leaving generations of trauma along with deformities to be carried over to future generations. The first section of the novel takes place in Nagasaki, reeling from the effects of existing war.

Nagasaki, one of the targets of the American nuclear bombs during World War II, was once hailed as the "turn-of-the-century cosmopolitan world" in Japan with English newspapers, international clubs, and "intermarriages between European men and Japanese

women" (Shamsie 12). David Palmer in the article *Nagasaki's Districts: Western Contact with Japan through the History of a City's Space* elaborates on Nagasaki as the seat of Japan's connection with the Western World, calling it a "microcosm" (477) of Japan's shifting position in the world. The city was Japan's initial contact with the European world, gave way to modernization, and was a militarist-industrialist empire during World War II. Post-war Nagasaki, however, lost its former glory owing to the ongoing war between the Allies and the Axis and "The New Bomb!" (8) that "leveled [the city] into a vast wasteland" (Palmer 500). The enormity of the blast and the destruction it caused is unparalleled for not only did it raze a city to the ground but also afflicted its people with trauma that is carried over to generations.

The Yet Unknowing World: Nagasaki, 9 August 1945, the opening section of the novel, is readers' introduction to Nagasaki on the catastrophic day the atomic bomb was dropped. Urakami, the setting of the novel's first section is one of the four districts of Nagasaki, the "hypocenter" (Palmer 477) of the atomic bomb. Just like any other day, the day in Nagasaki's Urakami district dawns with "perfect blueness of the sky" (5) suggesting peace and calm, however, there are fragments of war and destruction fracturing the view.

Before catastrophe strikes Nagasaki in the form of the nuclear bomb, it's already seen grappling with the catastrophic destruction brought on by the ongoing war. When seen through the eyes of Hiroko, the protagonist of Shamsie's novel, the only word that best describes Nagasaki and how the war changed it, is "Functional" (Shamsie 6) – "Everything distilled or distorted into its most functional form" (7). Being functional demands being practical and useful rather than attractive and this is the very purpose everything in Nagasaki is forced to fulfill, from young children to the elderly, from material goods to the land, etc. Not only do human lives and weapons become expendable during war, but every place, every space, is forced to find and serve a purpose to be useful during warring times. The subjective perception of the city reflects Hiroko's understanding and her outlook on war and how it has changed the urban landscape. It also translates into Hiroko's longing for the world as it was before the war as well as her grief for the new role space has acquired during war.

The destructive force of war takes away from Nagasaki, its "enchantment" (6). Konrad, the German fiancée of the protagonist, remembers much of Nagasaki's enchantment in the "glassy loveliness of frost flowers in winter, seas of blue azaleas in

summer, the graceful elegance of the Euro-Japanese building along the seafront – but war fractures every view. Or closes off the view completely." (6). The land bearing proof of the ongoing war attains a different meaning for Konrad such that the green and brown leaves strewn across the grass acquire the shape and form of "warring armies" (6) longing for closeness in death.

Before the atomic bomb hit, there were twofold geographical changes seen in Japan. First is the land's utilization as the battlefield for war: marred by destruction and ravages of war, bearing marks of the ongoing war in the form of uprooted fields, destroyed buildings dilapidated structures, etc. Secondly, land elsewhere is also forced to shed its former natural beauty and fulfill a different, more efficient function. Hiroko ponders on this "falling-off of love" (7) while walking past the vegetable patches of land that were once home to beautiful azaleas, "How to explain to the earth that it was more functional as a vegetable patch than a flower garden, just as factories were more functional than schools and boys were more functional as weapons than as humans" (7). The dispensability of land during war times and its reduction to a functional space is proof of how wartime completely upturns the topography of the land.

Hiroko is the one character most affected by the catastrophic events in Nagasaki. Some of the behavioral traits exhibited by her in different parts of the novel correspond with DSM-5's diagnostic criteria of Post Traumatic Stress Disorder (PTSD). Not only does Hiroko "directly experience the traumatic event" (301) but also witnesses its repercussions on the people and places dear to her. The memories of the distressing event emerge as intrusive 'flashbacks' (306) forcing her to relive the experience. It is due to the severity of the effects of the atomic bomb that Hiroko refuses to go back to Nagasaki as it will serve as an external reminder of the traumatizing event and the associated memories.

The melancholy with which Hiroko laments the withering away of Nagasaki's past and its fall from former glory is reminiscent of the "Hüzün" with which Orhan Pamuk remembers Istanbul in his memoir *Istanbul: Memories and the City*, "everything being broken, worn out, past its prime" (Pamuk 132). While Pamuk mourns the loss of Istanbul's previous grandeur and glory and its excessive westernization, Hiroko grieves the loss of Nagasaki's once natural beauty, shattered by the bruises of war. Although Nagasaki shares a very short portion of Shamsie's book, and the protagonist "didn't ever want to go back to

Nagasaki" (62), she carried the city with her, in the form of memories and trauma associated with it, to places far and beyond.

Shamsie's Nagasaki is an amalgam of the real and the imagined. While there are references to real-life places like Urakami Cathedral and the battleship Musashi, there are also fragments of fictional places such as the Azalea Manor. The "autonomous reality" (Löffler 32) thus created, seen through the eyes of Konrad and Hiroko tells the tale of Nagasaki from a "purple-roofed city laid out like an amphitheatre" (Shamsie 6) to a city "reduced to ash" (99). The fracture in the narrative is recounted to "That unspeakable day. Literally unspeakable." (99), when the "New Bomb" (12) was dropped on Nagasaki turning the whole world white. The "physical" (26) light from the fires unfurled hell on earth, engulfed everything in sight and seared it into char.

The atomic bomb dropped on Nagasaki overturns the course of the protagonist's life. A single BOOM and the whole world turns white. The smell of dead flesh emanating from Urakami Valley, fires roaring so angrily it seems as though "all of Nagasaki a diamond cutting open the earth, falling through to hell" (27), the feeling of raw, bumpy, lifeless flesh on her back, the fat from people's bodies sticking to the walls, and the sight of her father covered in scales, "No skin, no hair, no clothes, just scales." (99) are some of the many traumatic memories of the bomb in Nagasaki that Hiroko is burdened with for a lifetime. Fire and smoke engulfing the valley became a part of Hiroko's flesh; her charred back, and seared flesh became one with the burning valley. The unfamiliarity of the place Nagasaki turned into after the bomb was so daunting that Hiroko doesn't want to stay in the city anymore. Material as well as psychological loss of grounding (Pain 982) along with the fear of getting reduced to the bomb also forces her to leave Japan and travel elsewhere.

Urakami Catholic Cathedral, significant to the protagonist as memorabilia of Nagasaki and her fiancé Konrad, was home to a majority of Japan's Christian population. Although entirely rebuilt in 1959, the church housed Christian saints' statues charred from the atomic bomb blast, a remnant of the apocalyptic event (Palmer 501). It is the concentration of the Christian population in the city that allows Hiroko to delude herself into thinking, "The other cities of Japan may have suffered heavily in the aerial raids, but not Nagasaki" since it was the "most Christian of Japan's cities." (8). Ironically, however, the Urakami district becomes the epicenter of the plutonium core nuclear bomb owing to a cloud cover over Nagasaki's sky.

Hiroko shares an unbreakable bond with Urakami Cathedral before and after the bomb. The place evokes two layers of memories. While Hiroko has displeasure for the Cathedral before the bomb hit and the notion of having her wedding there is distasteful to her, one of her first thoughts after the bomb hit was to look through the clouds of smoke for the spires of Urakami cathedral, "Where is Urakami Cathedral? …Where is the cathedral?" (28) where she hopes to find her fiancé. Konrad was walking towards the cathedral "less than five hundred meters from the epicenter" when the bomb hit turning all the people inside into "melted rosaries", as Hiroko describes it (76). Even weeks after the bomb, everything in the Urakami Valley smells of burning reminding her of the "Valley of Death" from the Bible (77). The place that once "never meant anything" (100), later comes to be something she desperately longs to return to, "I want to see Urakami Cathedral. I want to hear its bell ringing." (100). The memories of the cathedral along with that of Nagasaki before and during the war and after the atomic bomb form layers superimposing one another. Hiroko's trauma linked to these memories gives rise to varied geographies of the same place and finds its way through different temporalities and spatialities. Urakami Cathedral functions as one of the memory places "attending to specific sites of past traumatic events and their ongoing implication" (Pain 980) wherein Hiroko's trauma is rooted.

"Incidents, actions, images, sounds, smells and interactions" (980), as Pain puts it, can act as triggers that retraumatize an individual. Retraumatization can occur far from the original site of the traumatic event. The memories of the traumatic event are stored in the brain in such a way that once triggered the traumatized individual is pulled back to re-experience their trauma such that they lose the ability to be present. During her stay in Delhi and Mussoorie in India, at various instances, Hiroko is reminded of her life before and after the atomic in Nagasaki. Be it the bark of a tree in Delhi that reminds her of something from Nagasaki (Shamsie 49) or the flowers in Mussoorie that seem familiar yet foreign for she can't recall their names in Japanese, the memories reappear in the form of flashbacks.

Her stay in Mussoorie reminds her of Nagasaki, the memories string together like rosary beads. The familiarity of the place evokes memories of the past; of her father preparing paint, the purple sky studded with constellations, evenings filled with her neighbors' voices, the sound of schoolchildren rising to their feet as she entered the classroom, and long walks with Konrad, her fiancé. In the calmness and peace of the place

she finds herself looking back at the past but cannot find it in herself to imagine a future or find her place in the "talk of tomorrow" (96). These recollections linked to, perhaps, the most insignificant of things are reflective of the memories and past events that have become a permanent part of Hiroko's identity.

While living with the Burtons in Delhi, all Hiroko thinks about is "losses" (99), reminding her of Nagasaki and the life that could have been if not for the abominable bomb that made her home more unfamiliar and stranger for her than Delhi of which she knew nothing of, except it being the place where the stepsister of her fiancé resided with her husband. The trauma of the bomb blast follows her everywhere and reminds her of everything she once had but can never have again. Trauma's mobility and multidirectional nature allow for the establishment of a link between different places and times, between Nagasaki, 1945, and Delhi, 1947. Even while residing in Karachi with her family, Hiroko never discloses the happenings surrounding the bomb and her experiences to her son, Raza Konrad Ashraf, "Why tell him of the momentum of a bomb blast that threw her into a world in which everything was unfamiliar, Nagasaki itself become more unknown than Delhi?" (223). Post catastrophe Nagasaki is a strange place for her because it no longer rouses any familiarity, and the foreignness of the space is not something she wishes to share with her son.

So unnerving is the catastrophic experience that Hiroko craves for familiarity in her home in Nagasaki, the one she had known her whole life after the place was "reduced to ash" (99) in the aftermath of the bomb. While she wants to gain that part of her life back, wants to "hear Japanese", "tea that tastes the way tea should taste", "look like the people around me [her], "live between hills and seas" "eat kasutera" etc. (99-100), she doesn't want to return to Nagasaki or Japan for the burns of her back were a constant reminder of her identity reduced to the bomb, a hibakusha. The place that once provided solace and was supposed to be her safe place, becomes a reminder of the scars branded on her back and her bomb-marked identity.

Nagasaki, it seems, is not just a sight of remembrance but a slight to Hiroko's identity for her person is reduced to nothing but a hibakusha, "an explosion-affected person" (49). The stigma even follows her son, labeled as the "bomb-marked mongrel" (195) and "deformed" (189) in light of his Japanese parentage, even though he was born perfectly healthy twenty years after the Nagasaki atomic bomb blast. Even though Hiroko

tries to shield Raza from the poison that is the atomic bomb and Nagasaki through made-up fairy tales, the charred birds on Hiroko's back, with their "beaks dripping venom into her bloodstream, their charred wings engulfing her organs" (222) somehow find their way into Raza's mind, engulfing him into similar feelings of paranoia and a yearning for belonging.

Hiroko and Sajjad find a way to heal from their trauma by integrating their shared experience of loss. They find, in one another, a shared sense of loss and trauma that not only brings them together but grants them thirty-six years of love and togetherness. The protagonist and her husband had "too much loss in our [their] lives, too early" and it is this sense of loss that makes them understand those "parts of the other which were composed of absences" (163). The couple experiences devastating catastrophes that not only tie them with lifelong trauma but bring them to a point in their lives where they can never go back to life as it once was. Sajjad loses his beloved Dilli to slowly encroaching westernization brought by the British occupation in India and later the independence of Indo-Pak in 1947. Whereas Hiroko loses her home in Nagasaki to war and the atomic bomb. "Partition and the bomb" – two catastrophes that destroyed the homes of the couple yet brings them together in the face of the adversary are a testament, as Harry remarks, to the things "humans can overcome" (181). The shared experiences of loss and trauma give way to a better understanding of each other and sow the seeds of love between the couple.

Karachi, the newfound home of Sajjad and Hiroko in Pakistan, reminds Hiroko of Nagasaki (176). Although the memories of the place and the destruction are always there with Hiroko, certain glimpses of Nagasaki emerge here and there, merging memories of the past with the present and evoking trauma linked to the atomic bomb blast. While at twenty-one Hiroko experiences various facets of loss due to the Nagasaki nuclear blast, it is in the death of her husband that she realizes "Nagasaki taught her everything to know about loss but in truth, it was only horror with which she had become completely familiar" (239). It is this fear and horror of loss that resurfaces and revisits Hiroko in different geographical locations of the world.

There are certain markers that remind Hiroko of her past. These environmental cues act as triggers that mobilize trauma. Trauma has a shifting nature, but it becomes hardwired in "material, social and emotional ecologies of place" (Pain 981). The encounter with such cues triggers a relationship between the exterior world and the internal ecology of trauma.

For example, the faded missing person poster pasted on the graffitied wall of one of the buildings in New York reminds Hiroko of a similar poster she had seen after the atomic bomb in Nagasaki. Chinatown in New York is one other place where the protagonist finds herself remembering Nagasaki and her life in Japan. With so many familiar vegetables and fruits and familiar Chinese names, she finds herself thinking of Nagasaki and recalls the name "Hong xao" for a green-yellow spherical fruit, called "bair" in Urdu (275). These seemingly insignificant cues are her ties to the memories of Nagasaki and Japan.

Every place becomes a sight of remembrance, the slightest thing a trigger that pushes the memories of the catastrophe to the forefront. Hiroko remembers Nagasaki in the peace and calm of Mussoorie, in the chaotic streets of Delhi, in the sea of Karachi, and in the hubbub of New York. The geography of places reminds her of her loss, time and again. The scars of the bomb run so deep and hurtful that "the bomb remained the one thing in the world she would not laugh about" (251). It is the trauma associated with the city and the bomb that materializes every now and then and accompanies Hiroko on her journey across four major cities of the world. Her experiences with violence in various cities of the world gradually form layers, reinforcing and extending the already existent trauma. This assemblage of trauma adds more complexity to her existence and often evokes memories of the past in the present.

4.1.2 Delhi – From Dilli to Delhi

Delhi, towards the end of British colonial rule in 1947, is the setting of the second section of Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows*. Psychogeographic exploration of the text allows for a deeper understanding of the individual experiences of the city. The city's transition from Dilli to Delhi makes up one section of the novel as well as its centuries-old "chequered and tumultuous spatial history" (Khanna 607) of occupation, devastation, and destruction. The sense of loss is visible in the shattered historical monuments littered throughout the city as well as the broken hearts that lament the city. The "ruins of Hauz Khas…just ruins" in the landscape stand as a testament to its previous glory and the fact that "even this had come to pass' (Shamsie 64). Sajjad, the "lovely Muslim boy who works for James" as Konrad remembers him, has perhaps, the strongest bond with the city.

The transition from Dilli to Delhi is apparent in the very first page of the second section, wherein Sajjad tries to, "…locate the exact celestial point at which Dilli became

Delhi. Dilli: his city, warren of 'by-lanes and alleys, insidious as a game of chess', the rhythmically breathing heart of cultural India." (33). The city, rebuilt several times, acquired a new meaning at every stage. Whether in Dilli or Delhi, the feelings of loss and dislocation are built into the very core of the city and are an inseparable part of its pre- and post-colonial historical trajectory (Khanna 620). The separation between the old and new city is almost indecipherable yet so obvious to Sajjad. Delhi was the,

> …city of the Raj, where every Englishman's bungalow had lush green gardens, lined with red flowerpots… No trees growing in courtyards for English, no rooms clustered around those courtyards; instead, separations and demarcations. (Shamsie 33-34)

These separations account for the difference between Dili and Delhi. While Dilli is the city of togetherness and unity, where Muslims and Hindus stood as one unit, Delhi is devoid of such harmony and is marked with boundaries and demarcations suggesting divisions and partitions.

Any notion of separation from Delhi is simply unthinkable for Sajjad as he shares an unbreakable bond with the city, "the idea that anything could cut him off from Dili was not just absurd but insulting" (52). Even though Delhi, under colonial rule, bears marks of British occupation and Westernization at every turn, Sajjad is unwilling to uproot his life in the city for any reason whatsoever. Every street, every area is reminiscent of some cherished memory that strengthens his bond with the urban landscape.

Jama Masjid of Delhi reminds him of his deceased father who used to carry him on his shoulders up to the mosque. The story of the creation of the masjid, "a glimpse of heaven's architecture" (53) narrated like a fairytale to Sajjad. The story is imbued with reverence for the masjid and its unmatched architecture, told with devotion to religion. The reference to Emperor Shah Jahan and him wielding the Prophet's sword to "cut through the sky" (53) is an ode to the city's history and God's benevolence on its people for the masjid is a religious marvel bestowed upon people through a miracle.

Sajjad, time and again, remembers Dilli like a devout devotee remembering his beloved. His love for the city is ever present in his conversations and his personality. While there are no obvious signs of trauma associated with pre and post colonization of Indian subcontinent that correspond with any criteria of mental disorders, Sajjad exhibits a dire

longing for the city of his childhood. The air of Dilli engulfs him in an embrace so tightly that it seems impossible to separate one from another. His yearning for the city remains unchanged throughout his life. While narrating his meeting with Konrad, in a conversation with Hiroko, Sajjad describes summer in Delhi as the sun's possessiveness for the city, "it wants all its beauty to itself, so it chases everyone away. The rich to their hill stations, the rest of us to darkened rooms, or under trees where the shade marks the edges of the sun's territory" (75). The beauty with which Sajjad describes the city is proof of his love for it. The smell of mangoes wafting in the streets takes the form of some god having walked and sweated through the streets.

The Burtons also acknowledge Sajjad's love for "Sajjad's Delhi" (82) time and again. It is on one of their picnics to the historical site i.e. Qutb Minar that Sajjad realizes how things should actually be – "he, an Indian, introducing the English to the history of India, which was his history, not theirs." (80). This thought does not only come due to Sajjad's ancestral link with the Kings but also due to his aversion to the colonial empire. The history of the place is of special significance to Sajjad, for the colonial masters, however, it's just a "wasteland" (81), as he remarks "My history is your picnic ground" (81). The ruins of the place bear no link to the English, and so their experience with India is a superficial one. Sajjad, on the other hand, has deep ties to the place and so Dilli is part and parcel of his identity.

Different thought processes of the characters indicate subjective interpretations of space. The unlimited diversity of the city allows for individual experiences, creating a palimpsest of the city with layers upon layers stacked on top of each other. For the Burtons, Qutb Minar is an "unsubtle" (78) existence outside the British Raj, a place that is worthy of sightseeing. For Sajjad, though, the place is a link to his familial ancestry, a part of his dear Dilli. The importance of the place is lost on Burtons, their interpretation is reduced to it being a picnic point since they bear no historical connection, nor any familiarity with the place that is so close to Sajjad's heart.

The tragic memories of Nagasaki and the bomb are an inseparable part of Hiroko, the trauma is imbued into her existence. After coming to know of the events surrounding the bomb blast, Sajjad too finds himself thinking of the ruins and devastation. While pedaling through Civil Lines to work, the fiery clusters of flowers on gulmohar trees remind him of "Hiroko stalking away across a barren tract of land with collapsing monuments

strewn around" (86). The geographical overlapping is suggestive of the burgeoning love shared between the couple. Furthermore, the overlaps also suggest a bond, a connection of a sense of loss and trauma shared between the two people. Sajjad reminisces the past glory of his ancestors, the sight of ruins is a sad reminder of the lost grandeur. Additionally, Hiroko has the trauma of Nagasaki and the ruins there that accompany her in the streets and mohallas of Delhi.

Hiroko's broken heart finds solace in Sajjad's world "which resembles Japanese traditions" (90) more than the world of the English. The commonalities between their feelings and culture bring them together over time. Sajjad's Delhi is as rich and vibrant as Nagasaki once was. The shards of colonization are also equally obtruding in Delhi as were the imprints of war in Nagasaki. The two catastrophes sadden and traumatize the characters physically and emotionally as well as psychogeographically for they can map the ruins of war and colonization littering their city and taking away from it the life it previously had.

The death of Khadija Ashraf, Sajjad Ashraf's mother, is perhaps the final straw that breaks Sajjad's ties with Delhi. After her death, Dilli, which Sajjad so fondly recalls as "My Dilli" (103), becomes estranged from him for he senses "absence, not belonging" (103) from the Old City. It appears his mother was one of his strongest connections to the Old City, "no matter how often he circled Delhi he would always return to the world of Dilli" (106). It isn't, however, the only catalyst separating Sajjad from the city. The gaps emerge here and there with the ongoing violence between Muslims and Hindus as well as the approaching Indo-Pak independence. The reality of the situation slowly dawns on Sajjad as to how Dilli and "Dilliwallas" (105) sentiments have changed over time due to frequent clashes between Hindus and Muslims and talks of a new state for Muslims. His own sentiments also take a turn, when atrocities done to Muslims affect him more than the violence carried out by Muslims, a thought he despises despite it being true.

His home, where he resided for the most part of his adult life, "the place, this mohalla, was past already" (107). The city slowly turns into a place no longer familiar to him. Even while he is employed at the Burtons' house, he acknowledges the fallacy of Delhi. New Delhi is the epitome of everything British and manifested modernization. Dilli, his "true world" (113), in opposition, is the place where he comes home to and replaces his shirts and trousers with kurta pyjama. A place that slowly starts fading out of existence as soon as the idea of Pakistan starts becoming reality, it takes away the "familiarity from the

streets of Dilli" (113). The creation of this new world leaves him with no option other than change and having to learn to live and adjust to the changing world. It is during this shift that Hiroko and Sajjad realize that both their worlds, their homes, do not exist anymore. During the shifting geographies, they crave some "constancy" (113) and comfort in each other so that this change is less unnerving.

Even during the most uncertain of times, Sajjad refuses to part ways with his beloved city, instead thinking of shifting from Dilli to New Delhi which is "Both a world apart from the Old City and just a few minutes away by bicycle. A great city must always present you with options, and Dilli-Delhi is the greatest of cities." (114). While the Old City rouses familiarity and comfort, New Delhi presents new and better opportunities. On one hand the loss of the former is tragic, on the other though, Sajjad is ready to embrace the newness of the latter. His plans, however, are hashed because of partition violence engulfing all the subcontinent into flames of death.

Before even gauging the extent of options available to him in Delhi, Sajjad is forced to flee the country to Turkey supposedly on his and Hiroko's honeymoon. Although the beauty and magnificence of Istanbul are beyond compare, Sajjad has his heart stuck on Delhi. Nothing in the great city appeals to his senses, not even the ruins; the "crumbling decay of this once grand city did not have the right tempo, the right texture, the right quality of sighing." (121). The city does not resonate with Sajjad, neither its culture nor its aesthetics. The familiarity of Delhi is so tasteful that the grandeur of Istanbul fails to charm him.

Sajjad and Hiroko spend September, the month after partition, in Istanbul. But the agony of being away from his home eats away at Sajjad. The thought of returning during such turbulent times is equally undesirable since violence had engulfed the city entirely, infecting all and sundry like a contagious disease. The conflicting emotions tear away at Sajjad making him feel like he is betraying his city. Even when the news of contagion violence spreading like wildfire reaches him in Istanbul, he is unwilling to let go of the city. He wholeheartedly wishes to accept and embrace New Delhi for it is still his beloved city.

Even though Sajjad knows that Delhi must have changed during this time and that he'd no longer be returning to the Delhi he once knew, the "essential Dilliness" (125) of the city bars Sajjad from ever abandoning the place. While the city may have changed

drastically due to communal violence and partition riots, the essence of its "dil" is reason enough for Sajjad to not contemplate leaving. Once again, however, Sajjad is forced to face the bitter truth when the Indian Consulate refuses to process his paperwork barring him from ever returning to Delhi. It is at this point that Sajjad realizes he'll no longer be able to hear pigeons fluttering in the sky, the call of the muezzin of Jama Masjid, the cacophony of his brothers, the hubbub of the marketplace in Chandni Chowk, the sound of rustling leaves in monsoon, the laughter of his nephews and nieces and his own frantic heartbeat (126). The places he was familiar with, the things he was so used to seeing ceased existing for Sajjad, his home was taken away from him just like that.

Even when the couple moved to Karachi, Pakistan, and made a home for themselves, Sajjad often laments the loss that is Delhi and everything it once offered to him. He had once dreamt of a lifetime in his mohalla in Delhi, but the catastrophic partition left no way for him to realize this dream. He muses that if he had an inkling of his foreboding separation with the city, he would have "made lists of all the sights and sounds and daily texture of Dilli life" (134) to carry them with him and compare every other place in the world with. The comparison, he knows, will turn every other place in the world to dust in front of the brilliance of his Dilli. Years after partition, while settled in Karachi, Sajjad when questioned about his love for Delhi, replies "Dilli is Dilli…My first love." (161). The love and longing for Delhi is an all-time presence in his life.

Layers of previous and new changes in the geography of the cityscape resulting from colonial rule and partition superimpose as sedimentation creating layered places of trauma. Previously, it was the plight of colonization tainting the history and aesthetics of Delhi with encroaching westernization that divided the city into the opposing Dilli and Delhi. The former reflecting the essence of the city in its entirety, the unity of its inhabitants, and the peace and comfort native to it, while the latter is proof of the inevitable change brought by British colonization, of the demarcations separating the hearts of the Dilliwallas and the divide that eventually led to Indo-Pak independence 1947. Once the colonization period came to pass, what is left of Dilli is no longer the place Sajjad can return to. The world as he once knew it was "departing" (106) and it is not possible for him to live among the shards of remnants left. The violence of partition, massacre, riots, and deaths had overtaken the city and turned it into a "virtual siege town" (124) making it impossible to return to the city. This trauma of the "collapsed world in Delhi" (181),

partition violence, and separation from home accompanies Sajjad throughout his later life in Karachi.

A contrast can be drawn between Hiroko and Sajjad's love for their native city and their longing for home. Hiroko reminisces about her life in Nagasaki, the smallest details of the city, and desperately wants to return to life as it once was. The bomb, however, does not only take away her loved ones but also scars her identity, reducing her to a hibakusha. This newfound identity is one she does not want to embrace and forms the prime reason for her refusal to go back to Nagasaki. Sajjad, on the other hand, wants to return to Delhi, no matter how it changed after the partition, but the authorities refuse to let him return. His longing for the city never stops, nor does his love for the city weaken at any point in time.

4.1.3 Karachi – The Collision of Identities

Karachi, Pakistan, the setting of Burnt Shadows' third section *Part-Angel Warriors,* is not so much a site of trauma as compared to other places mentioned in the novel, instead, it is a place where the Ashraf Tanakas' and Weiss-Burtons' worlds collide. It also carries with it a certain nostalgia for their life in previous years. The remnants of it appear here and there obstructing the continuity of their life in Karachi. The significance of space and its link with psychology in the novel, however, remains an important area for exploration and analysis.

Harry Burton's first entry into the country, for example, is filled with the feeling of "homecoming" (148), a feeling that accompanies urban tribes when they enter unfamiliar places. Islamabad, one of the "fastest-growing cities in the world" (148), is a city devoid of any history instead filled with "antiseptic air of diplomacy with germs rife beneath the surface" (148). The description, although grim and grey, is an apt portrayal of the capital of the country, the center of governmental and diplomatic activities infested with the germs of corruption and everything dark and dirty.

Karachi, on the other hand, pulsates with more life than Islamabad. The metropolitan city is home to people belonging to different ethnicities and religions. The city of "comings and goings" (160), as Sajjad calls it, offers countless possibilities and opportunities to everyone. Even though there are "colonial remnants" (149) jutting out from architectural structures in the form of balconies on yellow-stoned buildings, the absence of boundary walls, "gardens and driveways buffering the space between one house and

another" (151) stand in stark contrast to pre-partition structures symbolized with boundaries and demarcations. The difference in architecture is proof of its colonial past as well as of post-independence changes.

Karachi of Shamie's novel presents a unique picture, a city where, "tree roots cracked cement, and broad tree-trunks were canvases for graffiti, and branches became part of the urban architecture" (153). In this city that Sajjad would once have ridiculed for its lack of "history and aesthetics and poetic heritage" (161), the Ashraf-Tanakas make a home for themselves. While struggling to find ways to live and inhabit a city so "removed in its architecture and its air and its pace of life from the city [Dilli] he had wanted to live and die in." (237), Sajjad Ashraf slowly comes to fall in love with Karachi. It is the place where the Ashraf-Tanakas peacefully live for thirty-six long years of their married life. Karachi holds a special place in Raza's heart as well for whom it was a place he could always return to and call home. The emergence of "civic violence" (302) decades after, however, turns the city into a battleground and their house is demolished to make space for a more modern building. The sense of loss of home, unfortunately, became a part of the next generation.

4.1.4 New York – A Safe Haven for Migrants

New York, Hiroko's dwelling in the fourth and last section *The Speed Necessary to Replace Loss,* is where Raza and Abdullah rekindle their friendship years later. Post 9/11 New York, however, is much less open and accepting, as America once was. Harry hails America as the "nation of migrants", "a single democratic country in power" (172) that "insisted" on migrants as "part of its national fabric in a way no other country had ever done." (171). Post 9/11, however, things shift for New York as well as its immigrant population. New York where there once was "Nothing foreign about foreignness" (289), which was accepting of people from other nations, no longer remains the same, "The island seemed tiny, people's views shrunken" (289). After the fall of the Twin Towers, the city and its inhabitants suddenly start brimming with the notion of patriotism. The display of patriotism is evident in the profusion of flags stuck all over the country; on the windows of cars, on bumper stickers, on side mirrors, hanging out of windows, "flags waving at welcome service stations; flags painted on billboards…" (342). The flags serve as reminders of America's burgeoning nationalism and its aversion to its immigrant population.

Kim Burton, perhaps, is the one most affected by the 9/11 bombings. The trauma of the attack is so vivid that Kim gets horrified at the slightest indication of a similar event, frequently dreaming of buildings collapsing, always worrying about the safety of her father, and wishing for the world to be as it once was. Kim is repulsed by the "terribleness of the world" (292), of bombs going off in Afghanistan, and of violence terrorizing the country. As a structural engineer, while she is ready to combat earthquakes or floods, the notion of having to "calculate the effect of a bomb on an aeroplane" (292) throws her off balance. She can't fathom having the added responsibility of having to figure out constructional details in the occurrence of terrorist activities.

Harry Burton, although "unsurprised by 9/11" (271), is also stunned and feels deep fury for the place that embraced and adopted him when he was eleven years old. Hiroko Tanaka also finds herself in a feeling of "solidarity quite unfamiliar, utterly overwhelming" (289) for the place she had started a love affair with, where she could hear different languages in the same space. Even though the charred scars Hiroko sports on her back are a product of the American frenzy of war, Hiroko's feelings of solidarity are proof that her identity exceeds the bounds of nationalism.

4.1.5 Kandahar – War on Terror

Afghanistan is also a geographically significant part of Shamsie's narrative. Though there is very little of Kandahar in the novel, Shamsie seamlessly weaves it into the global narrative of war. Just as the war drew "Different worlds moving from their separate spheres into a new kind of geometry" (204), Shamsie's novel has a certain geometry that links Nagasaki, Delhi, Karachi, New York, and Kandahar together, creating a tapestry of interwoven cities. The territorial war between the Afghans and the Soviets was an international affair with Egypt offering Soviet-made arms, and funds provided by America, along with training and technological equipment, and Pakistan providing bases for training camps. India, Israel Scotland, China along with other various other countries joined the war, the epitome of "internationalism, powered by capitalism." (204). Afghanistan, the battleground of global forces, faced the brunt of the force with unwarranted human and economic costs.

The war compelled the people of Afghanistan to take refuge in neighboring countries with the majority of the Afghanis migrating to Pakistan in search of safety and

security. It is in one of these Afghan immigrant establishments that Raza finds Abdullah. Sohrab Goth, one of the villages on the outskirts of the city, was home to nomadic Afghans living in makeshift homes. The unpaved pathways and dilapidated condition of make-shift homes in the area are a representation of the underbelly of the city. Such a portrayal adds to the grim details that make up the city. Sohrab Goth serves as the place where Raza and Abdullah's friendship takes root and follows them years later in New York.

The destruction brought about by the war in Nagasaki during World War II is similar to the destruction brought by two decades of war in Afghanistan. The similarities between the war-torn places are uncanny. While land in Nagasaki is utilized for functionality, land in Afghanistan is marked by barren lands where barely anything thrives besides juniper bushes and a handful of villagers. The shards of destruction are just as sharp and hurtful as they are in Nagasaki. Burial grounds in Afghanistan lined with strips of colored clothes tied to long poles tell the tale of thousands who fell victim to twenty long years of war, "Some bleached to whiteness, some bright as fresh blood, each marking the burial place of those who died in some version of the war which had rolled across Afghanistan for over twenty years." (297). The different colors of clothes hanging from the long poles indicate how old or new a grave is, with the brighter colors indicating a recent burial and faded colors symbolizing older graves. The abundance of these colorful clothes indicates the countless lives lost to war.

Abdullah, Raza's friend from Afghanistan, who lost his father to the war in Afghanistan carries the trauma of the catastrophic war and longs to turn his homeland from a "doorway to hell" into "Paradise" (216). The feelings of "lost homelands and the impossibility of return" (313) with which Abdullah looks at the "photographs of Kandahar's orchards" (313) remind Hiroko of the love and fervor Sajjad harbored for Dilli. Abdullah, like Sajjad, longs for a place that no longer exists.

Kandahar, the place where Abdullah grew up, was full of life and colorful but war tore the fabric of peace and calm in the country, "First they cut down the trees. Then they put landmines everywhere. Now…Cluster bombs" (311). The expendability of space is once again apparent here where fertile land is looted off its fertility and made the battleground for explosives. The land Kandahar once was, only remained in photographs and in the memories of its people. It is not the Afghanistan of now or the post-war future

that Abdullah longs to return to but “Afghanistan then.” (311), the country when it was thriving, the place as it existed in photographs and Abdullah’s memories.

The traces left by the “American bombing campaign” (317) litter Kandahar everywhere even after a month of the Taliban’s defeat. Only dust and fierceness are apparent in the now infertile land, be it in the form of a “door standing unsupported in a field of bricks as though it were a miracle crop; craters in the road, indiscriminate as a meteor shower; [or] black metal shaped like a jeep in a headstand.” (317). The view is so bleak that at the slightest glimpse of grass, Raza finds himself rolling in it, rubbing it on his face, arms, etc. In the grotesque violence that left its marks everywhere, Baba Wali shrine provides a glimpse of Kandahar’s lost beauty, the beauty Abdullah clutches onto and refuses to let go of since his childhood. The orchards surrounding the shrine along with the “fleet river and the mountains beyond” (317) make up Abdullah’s Kandahar, the Kandahar he grew up in.

As simple a life as coming back to Kandahar with family, “farm in the shadow of Baba Wali, and visit his shrine every Friday as my[his] family has done for generations. To watch my[his] sons, measure hand-span against a pomegranate, not a grenade.” (320), as described by Ismail, Abdullah’s brother, is the kind of life and normality desired by Abdullah and every other Afghani. The simplicity of the life Abdullah wishes to return to seems easily achievable, but the realities of war make it impossible to realize this dream for that life no longer exists. The place he remembers as ‘home’ is no longer the same, war has fractured the views as well as the minds of the people. Just as the trauma of the catastrophe follows the victims around so does spatial destruction manifest itself in different ways in various places of the world.

4.1.6 Conclusion

The novel comes full circle back to where it once started. Be it the expendability of the city space in Nagasaki, Delhi, Karachi, New York, or Kandahar, the expendability of seventy-five thousand Japanese, the usability of millions of Indians, the dispensability of three thousand New Yorkers, or the disposability of hundreds of thousands of Afghans, everything was “Acceptable” and “expendable” (362). After all, in the big picture, what is the importance of a piece of land, what is the significance of thousands of lives when millions are at stake? Against the many, few do not hold any significance whatsoever.

Different characters act as focalisers and narrate their perception of the city. It is through their lens that readers develop an understanding of the city. Hiroko, for example, focalizes her perception of Nagasaki, Sajjad's narrative focuses on Delhi, Kim Burton introduces readers to New York, and Abdullah's narrative recounts the geography of Kandahar.

The journey starts from the atomic bomb in Nagasaki, and moves to British-occupied, pre-partition Delhi, post-independence Karachi, post 9/11 New York, and finally, Kandahar. The study of the bond interlinking trauma induced by these events with the geography of the places before and after the catastrophic event marks the crux of this research. City spaces, as observed by the characters of the novel, take on different meanings with changing temporalities. The encounter with a traumatic event of huge magnitude alters the way spaces are perceived in the novel.

4.2 Psychogeographic Mapping of Geo-Traumatic Spaces in Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*

Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great* is a tale of Karachi's citizens, the most common of its people. Tanweer has used the metaphor of a "bullet-smashed windscreen" to refer to Karachi, a city that is "broken, beautiful, and born of tremendous violence." (1) Divided into five sections, the novel offers unique points of view of different characters and their lives in Karachi. Unlike *Burnt Shadows, The Scatter Here is Too Great* is set in one city, i.e. Karachi with different characters sharing their perspective of Karachi before and after the bomb blast at Cantt Railway Station.

4.2.1 Karachi – A Ruinously Mad City

Karachi, one of the largest cosmopolitan cities in Pakistan, is home to more than 18 million people with diverse backgrounds. Ironically, violence in the city is equally diverse, emerging from ethnopolitical, military, sectarian, and criminal conflicts. Since 2008, more than 8000 people have lost their lives to violence in the city (Yusuf 3). Violence enmeshed within the cloth of the city rears its head every now and then and terrorizes the masses.

The first encounter with violence in the novel is perhaps the minutest of all the terrorizing events of the novel proceeding. On the road to the sea, the one and the same sea that exists everywhere around the world, the boy with protruding teeth has his first

experience of the fear that engulfs the city every day. The blackboard in his head that he used to draw on always contained a “big-sized sun” (Tanweer 8). The big, bright sun was a common occurrence in all of his imaginative paintings, indicating the naivety of his imagination and the innocence of the character. The brightness of the sun in his drawings was proof of his untainted, worry-free mind.

Violence in the city, however, takes away from him the brightness that he was so fond of, for his drawings of the sea are no longer bright and the ship in it looks like “an empty place, like a shadow” (17). The armed robbery of the bus marks a significant turning point in the boy’s life and his encounter with violence and chaos in Karachi. The black shadows that threaten to engulf his imagination are indicative of empty places that overshadow the bright existence of the city. The robbery marks the first event that taints the boy’s experience of the city. The city that once stood bright and sunny in the boy’s imagination is all of a sudden smeared with anarchic chaos.

The novel also includes commentary on the political scenario, often critical of President Zia’s Islamization. President Zia-ul-Haq’s forced Islamization in political as well as public affairs gave rise to a new wave of religious extremism and intolerance. Karachi, just like all of Pakistan, bore the brunt of the force due to this forced religiosity in public affairs. The reduction of everything to Muslim or non-Muslim had a snowball effect and is still a major reason for the divide in Pakistan’s masses. It is, according to the cartoonist, due to Zia, the “dog of the CIA” (22), that “Islam and drugs and guns and bombs came into the city” (22). The introduction of Islamization in the political scenario marked the beginning of violence in the city backed by radical Islamists. Zia’s Islamist agenda is a point of critique in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* as well. Sajjad criticizes the state for its forceful imposition of Islamic studies as a compulsory subject. He curses the government for it “kept trying to force religion into everything public” (Shamsie 147). It was Zia’s totalitarian regime that led to the removal of public urinals and toilets in cities such as Karachi, calling it an “unislamic way of pissing” (75). It was due to this that people started relieving themselves “all over the city” (75), the religious fanaticism did more harm than good for Karachi as well as the rest of Pakistan.

Through the eyes of the teenage boy in FX, a completely different map of Karachi can be drawn. The streets have no name and are remembered by certain landmarks instead. The nameless existence of the city’s streets is curbed by markers that symbolize an address.

It is only the inhabitants of Karachi, who in this mesh of a city, can recognize these markers and associate them with roads and streets. A metal shiner standing at the corner of a lane with a pushcart is symbol enough for the boy to locate the specific place, it is "how anyone remembers anything in the city, where most streets don't have names." (29). It is through mental associations that people have developed with the city space over time that they cartograph and remember the city. It is important to note that the novel also does not assign names to most of its characters. They are only remembered through association with other characters or certain characteristic traits. The inhabitants of the city, much like the city itself, have a nameless existence in the hubbub of urban life.

At one of the busiest intersections of the city, Shahrah-e-Faisal, the so-called "jugular vein of the city" (33), the boy comes face to face with another dark and dirty secret of the city. The "distrusting stares and smiles from everyone" (34) directed at the car and the couple are a common occurrence in the city. The judgmental eyes indicate a class divide for nobody could direct dirty stares at shiny, four-wheeled cars for the fear of getting implicated. A broken car, however, was subjected to such scrutinizing gazes regularly and was unlikely to be spared.

While traversing the narrow streets and the overcrowded roads of Karachi, the boy fights "for inches" (37). Survival in Karachi is as difficult as scouring the city roads for a tiny bit of space, one always has to fight his way through. The difficulty of survival in the city is reflected in the boy's thoughts, "You train your eyes to scour them and the rest of yourself to devour them. Drive to survive." (37). It is eat or be eaten on the streets of Karachi. The same thoughts are reflected in Sadeq's critique of the city, "if you're going to get anywhere in this place, you must protect yourself from getting fucked, and the moment you get a chance, you must fuck the other person." (77). The crude words from a teenage, school-going boy suggest the difficulty of surviving in the city.

The Cantt Station blast mentioned in the novel is based on an actual incident that occurred on the 29th of December 2012 outside Karachi's biggest railway station. The blast ripped open the roof of a passenger bus and resulted in the death of six passengers and injured forty-eight others ("Blast outside Karachi railway station kills six"). The cause of the catastrophic event remained unclear, leaving much to speculation. Whether it was an accidental cylinder blast or a deliberate terrorist activity, it, nevertheless, inculcated fear of violence in the hearts of the city's inhabitants.

The Cantt Station blast marks a catastrophic tragedy that shakes the boy to his core. The devastating event is so impactful that it changes the trajectory of the psychogeographic mapping of the city. Different characters have different outlooks on the blast, but the scars on their mentality run deep. The psychological trauma resulting from such an experience, in one way or another, dictates the perception of space. The blast scratches and sears everything, turning buildings into "charcoals. Smoke in hot black clouds. Tar and scrapes of fire." (61), vehicles blown out of shape, bodies roasted, skulls pierced with pieces of shrapnel, and glass panes shattered with bullet holes. The encounter with a catastrophic event of such magnitude changes the way the boy experiences the city. Suddenly, it's as if he loses the ability to navigate through the city for "nothing felt safe or far enough" (38), and when they come to the sea it is "sudden, almost out of nowhere." (38). The change is as sudden and immediate as the blast itself.

The combination of subjective experience with objective environment gives rise to an urban imaginary. Psychogeographic exploration serves to uncover the hidden meanings associated with the objective environment. The vast expanse of sea, for example, takes on different meanings at different times for the characters of the novel. At times, it is calm and reassuring, at others, it is violent and scary, just like the ever-changing turbulent environment of the city. The way the sea in the city is perceived not only changes from character to character but also changes with changing temporalities. For the writer accompanying the school students on the bus to the sea, it is an escape from self, but it only feels good for a few days for it starts feeling suffocating. In contrast to the sea, he says, the city is better with its labyrinth of lanes and alleys allowing one to lose himself in its complexity.

The way different characters identify with the sea offers multiple perspectives on how it is a diverse entity subject to personal emotions and feelings. For some characters the sea is a healing place where they come to alleviate their trauma, for others it is a mobile place that bridges the gap between time and the site of trauma. After the blast, the palmist hears sea waves crashing from his balcony and "squeals of creatures of the sea" (156) never seen before. He keeps hearing crane-like sounds coming from the sea for the next two days and the next day a 40-foot whale is found dead on the beach. The sounds of cranes as well as the dead whale are harbingers of the end, marking the beginning of the end, the death of the city.

For the schoolboy on bunk to the sea, it is “one Karachi dream that came true each day. It was one part of the city that remained as it ever was” (85). Scraps and garbage littering the beach are as strong a part of the sea as they are of the city. The boy’s creative imagination is at work while embracing the view of the sea as it was. The movement of the waves of the sea mimics the workings of the city. Just as big waves gulp tiny wavelets, similarly the policemen mug the schoolboys for a tiny bit of cash. The whole ordeal is a testament to how one has to be vigilant to survive in the city and how it is always ready to devour you if you misstep a little.

The boy on a date with Sapna has a different understanding of the sea before and after the blast. The sea that was once the “deserted last bit of earth” (39) for the youngster where he made out with girls in the backseat of his car was no longer the same. In all his years of running away to the sea, this is the first time that he sees “the sea in a new way. It did not seem like the end of the city.” (40). The sea was once a place where he found the space to exercise his freedom. The force of the blast, however, takes away that feeling of liberty and makes him see the sea in a different light.

Psychogeography bridges the gap between psychology and the geographical environment, helping to decode the experiences of a city. The diverse feelings and emotions experienced by different characters in the novel for the same city are a testament to the plethora of meanings a city adapts when seen through the eyes of different individuals. These “kaleidoscopic manifestations” (47) as Löffler puts it, indicate the great potential of a city to evoke a wide range of emotions in individuals. For the father of the boy, Karachi is the bane of his existence, “He loves the city” (Tanweer 75) and hates anyone or anything that tries to tarnish the city in any way. Every place that the father-son duo travels through is a site of remembrance for the father. While sitting in front of Empress Market, he recollects his time as a student, remembering the city as it was in the past, “This place was the heart of the city, cleanest in all of the city…That building you see there was a billiard room…That corner store, which is selling cheap socks, was a cabaret and a bar.” (84). The fond memories associated with different city spaces remind him of his past and quite possibly, a Karachi that was devoid of violence.

He struts through the city as if he owns it. He had formed a meaningful connection with the city, and countless memories associated with different places in the city. The son’s rumination on his father’s love for the city perfectly encapsulates the core of

psychogeography; “places and people are like things: both made of memories and meaningful to us in the same way: we construct ourselves in our conversations with them” (85). The father’s overwhelming love for Karachi is apparent in his musings while he walks the city with his son. Not only does he carry profound love and adoration for his city, he tries to imbibe the same in his son, “You see, my son, a city is all about how you look at it…We must learn to see it in many ways, so that when one of the ways of looking hurts us, we can take refuge in another way of looking. You must always love the city.” (87). The different ways of looking at the city reflect the multiplicity of ways a city can be interpreted.

The boy’s desire for the city, however, changes with time. As a child, he imagines the city as a small dot full of games. This small dot encapsulates his whole world, “cars, roads, buildings, Baba, I and Amma and my school. Everything” (87). This is the first inkling of his love for the city, an existence that contains everything he loves. After the death of his father and his shenanigans with Sadeq, his outlook on the city and sea, specifically, changes. He dreams of being surrounded by the vast blue sea and losing himself in it. This was how he desired the city the second time. His feelings are a reflection of changing temporalities and how they alter the experience with the surrounding space. They also reflect how a change in psyche can influence the way a person perceives the city. From a rather carefree and childish image to one that espouses fear and anxiety, his psychology takes a different turn over the course of his life in Karachi.

As a writer and someone whose father loved the city so dearly, his understanding of the city and the sea is greatly influenced by his psyche. As a child, before he comees across violence, his imagination of the city is bright, sunny, and full of liveliness. As he grows older and has first-hand experience with injustices and wrongdoings happening in the city, his psyche takes a major hit turning the city from bright to dark, the slow poison of violence slowly pollutes his experience. His mind is gradually littered with such fragments that threaten to steal his sanity. To deal with the burgeoning tension, he chooses to avoid the city altogether, choosing instead to walk on a few roads to and from work to block the all-consuming noise of the city. The reluctance to face the city is perhaps to avoid the associated traumatizing memories from reemerging. It reflects a deeper understanding of his mental state that it is so tainted by violence in the city that he refuses to reface the city in its entirety. By restricting his movement across the city, he writes and pieces together

his urban story. His choice of path and "personal composition of the city" (Löffler 120) reflect the rhetorics of walking, adding to the psychogeographical understanding of urban spaces. The limitations or restrictions in the pathways do not function as hindrances, instead, they add to the individual experience of the cityscape. The fragments of stories, the "scatter must be gathered." (197). And so, he must gather these fragments of true stories to make stories and once again, imagine the mad world he lives in to make sense of it all.

Akbar, the ambulance driver's mental condition takes a hard hit in the aftermath of the catastrophic Cantt Station blast. As a professional serving the in the line of duty, the direct exposure to "grotesque effects" (DSM-5 305) of the bomb blast results in PTSD. The exposure to "serious injury or death" (305)-such as the one the ambulance driver is forced to experience- qualifies as trauma. The "horrendous atrocity" (140) traumatizes him to his core, taking away from him the zest for life he previously had. He has no desires left in him, feels empty physically, feeling like just "eyesight looking out from his head" (147). The psychological wounds of the blast act like eyes similar to bullet smashed holes that provide focus and sharpness, "Seeing outside becomes seeing inside." (65). It is the wounds incurred in the aftermath of the blast that allow Akbar's brother to reflect on his wrongdoings and repent wholeheartedly. The two men wearing long pink robes walking among the dead seem to be a manifestation of Gog and Magog, "the harbingers of the Day of Judgement." (147), roaming around the city announcing the end of the world. The soothsayer, who was a painter and did palmistry, describes the blast that shook the whole city as something like hell "where everything burns together" (155). The catastrophic tragedy prophesized the death of the city, everything indicating death and decay.

The metaphor of a bullet-smashed windscreen aptly describes Karachi, a city of perpetual violence and chaos. Just as the bullet hole carves, "new paths, new boundaries" (161), violence in the city cracks open new ways of perceiving the city. The cracks act as "maps of an uncharted city" (161), telling different stories. Each crack in the screen serves as a different perspective on the city from yet another individual living and surviving in it. The clean web that stems from the bullet-smashed screen is beautiful to look at yet violent beyond compare, the perfect metaphor, "a crass memento" (174) for the city that is stunningly beautiful yet terribly violent.

In the last section of the novel, the story forms links, connecting different characters into a single string. While walking on Clifton Bridge, the sub-editor looks toward buildings

around the intersection where the bomb went off. The cracks on the buildings are proof of years of "noise, smoke and dust" (169) they had weathered. Consistent violence in the city had left its mark everywhere but the city still stood tall. The world from Clifton Bridge made sense to the sub-editor,

> [he] had spent many hot afternoons standing here feeling the feral breeze of this city, and staring at the railway tracks forking below…On the bridge you could stand aside, and simply observe the enormous angry mad busy world rushing past you. (171)

The description of the city as seen from the bridge resonates with his admiration for the city when he was a child and desired the city in a dot. This dot represents a world "playing many games" (87); the small cars moving in straight lines, the shapes of the buildings, and the movement of everything in clumps within the lines of the roads. While the dot is an isolated piece encapsulating his world and everything he loved, the city as seen from the bridge is a tiny glimpse of the ruinously mad city rushing past the sub-editor. The ability to see chaos unraveling in the city from a distant point allows him to take in the city in its entirety while maintaining a distance and not becoming a part of that chaos.

An important point of this research was to explore how catastrophes change the way individuals look at a city. *The Shatter Here is Too Great* perfectly captures the essence of post catastrophe trauma that alters geographical perception. The string of stories beaded on the map of Tanweer's Karachi is nothing but dust once the bomb blast comes to pass. Violence erases any semblance of peace replacing it with chaos,

> These stories, I realized, were lost. Nobody was going to know that part of the city but as a place where a bomb went off. The bomb was going to become the story of this city. That's how we lose the city-that's how our knowledge of what the world is taken away from us-when what we know is blasted into rubble and what is created in its place bears no resemblance to what there was and we are left strangers in a place we knew, in a place we ought to have known. (173)

It's as if the city is forced to shed its cloak of historical and cultural relevance and pushed to adopt a new identity, one it doesn't conform with. The presence of violence is a similar existence in Karachi, always looming in the background but once such a big tragedy targets the city, it's brought to the forefront. And it is the presence of such a huge catastrophe that

forces the city to garb this new garment of violence and tragedy as an inherent part of its map.

The ever-present violence that looms on the streets and roads of Karachi forces its inhabitants to form a

> …certain relationship with violence and news of violence: you expected it, dreaded it, and then when it happened, you worked hard to look away from it, because there was nothing you could do about it-not even grieve, because you knew that it would happen again and maybe in a way that as worse than before. Grieving is possible only when you know you have come to an end, when there is nothing more to follow. This city was full of bottled-up grief. (178)

It is this grief for the city that forms a bond between the young child's father and Comrade Sukhansaz. Both the characters share profound love for the city and their conversations always spiral from "an initial animation…[into] an abiding sadness." (179). The animation was perhaps from their memories of what this city had been, and the sadness, a result of grief over what violence in the city had turned it into.

While his father's heart brims with love for the city, the son can't fathom the absolute chaos Karachi is. His writing journey starts with little fragments of the city that fill his head over the course of the day. After travelling through the whole city, taking it in its entirety, he comes home with these fragments of stories. The "manic psychic energy of the city, with countless nameless voices" (175) waiting to be poured out on paper. The overflowing energy, however, cannot be contained on paper, nothing he writes captures the true essence of this "ruinously mad city" (175). The fragments as he sees them are true to the core but lack life in the center and it is this emptiness that forces him to stop "roving the city" (176). This wis an attempt on his part to block the noise inside and conceal his sight. In the stories he strives to write, he tries to shut the outside world and avoid it, his father, on the other hand, wrote stories to communicate with the world and find ways leading into it.

The air in the city is thick and heavy with violence, "a part of us dies each day, and a bird springs out of our open skulls each day announcing our deaths and the addresses of our murderers…but nobody listens. The air is thick with the chorus of these birds of death." (184). It seems that none of the characters experience the city as closely and as deeply as

his father does. Karachi has a lifelike existence in his memories, pulsating with life but the rhythm is often obstructed by violence ensuing in its streets, roads, etc. Every inhabitant of the city has his own story of crime, people are looted and beaten up on the streets, in banks, homes, offices, etc. The broken parts of their existence are fragments of their true stories in the city bloodied with violence.

Karachi stands as an enigma wherein survival demands a lot from its inhabitants. To live in this city, one must learn to, "See as little as possible, hear even less, and touch absolutely nothing". The trick to living and surviving in the city is to learn to disentangle yourself from all the influences that threaten to poison your existence while maintaining a calm appearance. It is also imperative to "emanate some of those influences…fit things to your need, even if it's a name. Borrow someone's finger and make it your screwdriver. (186). Karachi is imbued with the violent struggle for survival, every part of its existence bearing marks of undue injustice and chaos. Survival in the city demands obliviousness to the ongoing violence and the ability to manipulate things as seen fit.

The place where the sub-editor follows the Bird of Death to meet his brother is another such existence. The settlement is home to millions who provide cheap labor for the city's industry and its domestic servants. It, however, does not exist on paper. There are no records of the place in state records hence no sewage lines or official source of water. In order to survive, people dug their own holes and installed hand pumps to draw water. Places such as these only gained attention when an "operation" (190) was underway against a criminal gang. This part of the city is the "long dark shadow...they [government] choose to ignore." (190). Even with a huge population living in the area, the area was non-existent for the state. The representation of such a space in the narrative sequence adds more depth to the psychogeographical mapping of the city. The grim details of the area rouse fear, anxiety, and curiosity, adding layers to the palimpsestic understanding of the city

4.2.2 Conclusion

Karachi's map when seen through the eyes of different characters in Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great*, takes on different meanings. From a child who imagines the city like a dot to an adult who admires the city in its entirety, a young delinquent who strives to survive in this violent city, and many others, the novel delineates the struggles of living in a city infused with violent crimes and injustices everywhere. The psychogeographic

cartography of the city provides insight into the variety of ways it is perceived by the novel's characters. Cantt Station blast marks the beginning of a dent in their understanding of the city. Although it is only one of the many violent events occurring in Karachi every day, the magnitude of the blast makes it more tragic. It certainly alters the characters' psychology and how differently they view the city in the aftermath of the catastrophic blast.

The scatter of violence in the city forms fragments of truth in the story. Each story highlights the depth of chaos in the city and how people struggle to make sense of the city. The difference in each character's experience with the city shows the way subjective experiences influence emotions. Each individual has a different understanding of the city leading to multi-focalisation of the urban space. The blast also influences how characters perceive the city, the change in their psychology alters the way they comprehend the city.

CHAPTER 5

CONCLUSION

The first question of the research aimed to explore the geospatial changes a city acquires when seen through the eyes of characters that have experienced a life-altering catastrophe, as seen in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great.* The analysis of the two novels, as explained in 4.1 and 4.2, shows the complex nature of the relationship between geography and trauma. Just as the geography of a place influences or affects the psychology of an individual, similarly, psychological makeup affects an individual's perception of space or, as Catharina Löffler puts it, "people are as much shaped by the city as the city is shaped by its people" (47). Cities, when seen through the eyes of characters that have experienced a life-altering catastrophe, acquire different geospatial characteristics. The trauma linked to the catastrophic event has an irreversible effect on characters, altering their perception of the city. Be it, Hiroko who loses the will to return to Nagasaki (refer to page 33) after the atomic bomb blast in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows,* or the young boy whose imaginative paintings turn shadowy and dark from bright and sunny in Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great,* trauma permanently alters the way they comprehend the city (refer to page 42).

The second question of the study was related to post catastrophe psychogeography in Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* and Tanweer's *The Scatter Here Is Too Great* and how the resulting trauma alters the production of urban spaces other than the original sites of catastrophe. Post catastrophe psychogeography, as observed in both novels, not only affects the way the original site of ruins is remembered and experienced but also alters the way spaces elsewhere are perceived. Cantt station, for example, is the original site of the catastrophic tragedy, but post catastrophe psychogeography indicates that characters' perception of other places in the novel also changes after encountering the blast (see page 52). Similarly, there are certain triggers in places other than the site of the catastrophic event that give rise to the traumatic memories associated with the site of ruin (see page 37). The materialization of traumatic memories in places elsewhere suggests that spaces influence the psychology of an individual and encounters with a tragic event, such as those mentioned in both novels, change the way places elsewhere are perceived. The exploration of the interconnection between psychology and geography in the subject novels suggests

that spaces of trauma alter our experience or perception of the said space as well as spaces elsewhere.

5.1 Findings of Psychogeographical Analysis of Both Novels

Different characters, in *Burnt Shadows*, pine after and reminisce about different cities and hold traumatic memories of the relevant catastrophes that struck their city. In *The Scatter Here is Too Great*, however, the characters' life is centered in and around Karachi, each in their own unique way. The difference in how each character encounters and experiences the city is reflective of the subjective interpretation of the city. The similarity with which characters of both novels reminisce pre-catastrophe cityscapes is undeniable. Their memories of the city before violence ensued have a homely feeling to them, they find solace in the hubbub of their cities.

The protagonist of Shamsie's novel, Hiroko, carries the traumatic memories of the atomic bomb blast in Nagasaki (refer to 4.1.1) to different cities around the world. In Delhi, for example, she reminisces about her life in Nagasaki before the atomic bomb and the commonalities that link her life in Nagasaki to that in Delhi. During her stay in Mussoorie, the flowers, like the ones in Japan, remind her of her life in Nagasaki before the war. In Karachi, the painting of the mythical foxes is an ode to her Japanese ancestry. Moreover, she sympathizes with post 9/11 New York on accord of her own experience with a catastrophic tragedy. The trajectory of her life forces her to face different catastrophic events across different geographic locations. Each later encounter reminds her of the atomic bomb in Nagasaki and how it turned her life upside down.

It is important to note that these memories are not limited to the site of catastrophe but emerge in different cities in different parts of the world. The feelings and emotions experienced in Nagasaki are projected onto different cities. Be it a flower, a painting, or a missing person poster, the memories of Nagasaki crop up every now and then. The alteration in the psyche of the individual pushes those memories to the forefront when triggers associated with the site of catastrophe are encountered.

Sajjad, Hiroko's husband, has a similar nostalgia that engulfs him. The analysis in 4.1.2 suggests his unwillingness to give up on Delhi no matter how it changes. The memories associated with different places in Dilli turn up at every corner of the city. Even while living in Karachi, his love for Delhi does not die down. The geography of the city

left deep impressions on his psyche, a profound love for the city had taken root in his heart and refuses to let up even when he knows he cannot return to the city ever. Perhaps Kim does not share that profound a love for New York, but the seed of nationalism had taken root in her heart after 9/11. The catastrophic event had saddened her beyond compare and her father's death also added to her grief.

Similarly, Abdullah's love for pre-war Kandahar, as described in 4.1.5, is undeniably intense. The city that was once home to beautiful pomegranate trees and Baba Wali's shrine that he used to visit with his family was no longer the same. War tore the city apart, turning it into rubble of destruction and broken buildings. Not only is he burdened by the memories of the past as well as the memories of post-war Kandahar, but American authorities' relentless pursuit of his arrest also adds to his torment. The psychological burden he carries weighs down his shoulders heavily.

The Scatter Here is Too Great by Bilal Tanweer is another piece of literature that offers insight into the bond linking psyche and geography. The characters of the novel share an inexplicable bond with Karachi. There are characters like Comrade Sukhansaz and the unnamed boy's father who share a deep love for Karachi (refer to 4.2.1). They trace memories of their past on the roads and streets of Karachi. Not only is their love for Karachi intense but their grief over the violence that has taken over the streets of Karachi also runs deep.

The boy on the FX, on the other hand, has a completely different outlook on the city. Streets and roads are nameless entities remembered by significant markers rather than their names. Survival in the streets is also a do-or-die situation wherein one has to strive really hard to be able to make a living in the city. His psyche is also tainted by the bomb blast at Cantt station. The encounter with an event of such a huge magnitude leaves a deep scar on his mind, altering the way he perceives the city and the sea.

The boy whose father loves the city has different experiences with the city at different times in his life. In childhood, he sees the city as his beloved world that contains everything he loves. The innocence of his mind, however, is slowly tainted by violence overtaking the city streets and roads. During adolescence, his relationship with the city takes another hit seeing the chaotic injustices happening everywhere. The sea, as well, takes on a completely different meaning after his repeated encounters with violence in the city.

By the time he reaches adulthood, he tries his best to block the city's noise so that it does not litter his mind. The blast, however, is such a tragic event that he is once again forced to face the city and its chaotic disorder.

5.2 Summary of the Discussion

While the suffering and loss of human lives during catastrophic war times is inexplicable, the terribleness of war and its effect on geography is also implausible. Similarly, the scars left by violence on geography also run deep. Cities, when seen through the eyes of characters who have experienced a life-altering catastrophe, take on a completely different geospatial understanding. The spaces that were once a site of peace and comfort, now rouse trauma and fear. Be it Shamsie's *Burnt Shadows* or Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great,* the encounter with a disastrous event of huge impact alters the psyche of characters in such a way that spaces and places take on different meanings. This is also a testament to how psychology affects the way an individual perceives a place and how geospatial changes affect the psyche of an individual.

5.3 Future Recommendations

This research focuses on the psychogeographical understanding of selected Pakistani fictions of catastrophe, analyzing trauma's link with space and how it manifests itself in different spaces. Literary analysis of the selected texts with the theoretical framework of psychogeography and geo-trauma offers a nuanced understanding of how catastrophes not only alter physicality of a space but also reshape the psychological landscape of an affected individual. Through a detailed analysis of Kamila Shamise's *Burnt Shadows* and Bilal Tanweer's *The Scatter Here is Too Great,* the research demonstrates how narratives of post-catastrophe cities serve to establish a link between geography, trauma and psychology.

The main contribution of the study lies in the link it establishes between spatial destruction and mental trauma. The analysis reflects the importance of setting in literary pieces as more than mere background, setting of a literary text function as a space that absorbs, reflects and reconstitutes trauma. The development of a nexus between literature and theories from geography and trauma studies can help future researchers replicate the model and apply it to texts from other cultures and different contexts. It further expands the role of psychogeography as a medium to unravel a plethora of meaning from across

disciplines. Other researchers can adapt and build upon the intersection of geography, trauma and psychology to explore and study other texts where setting functions as more than background.

Further studies can be conducted in multiple directions. For example, literary texts from different cultural and geopolitical contexts can be examined for their depiction of urban transformations post catastrophic destruction. The studies thus conducted will allow researchers to formulate a pattern or identify shared pattern of spatial trauma and how the nexus between geography and psyche is negotiated in post catastrophe urban spaces. Texts from historically troubled or conflict-ridden regions- such as Afghanistan, Palestine, Iraq, Syria, etc.- in particular, can serve as footprints for tracing the psychogeographical effects of trauma. The depiction of colonization, war, violence, occupation, etc. in these literary pieces can further enhance our understanding of the topography of geographical and psychological trauma.

For a more practical and tangible understanding of trauma inflicted on earth and how it corresponds with psychology, research can be conducted using mapping tools and digital GIS technologies. The incorporation of digital technology can allow better visualization of actual spaces depicted in the literature. The geospatial tools can help construct trauma maps by plotting fictional spaces onto real urban plans. The concrete visualization will augment psychogeographical analysis and provide insight into how literature encodes the topography of an urban space in the aftermath of geo-trauma.

Research in spatial studies of trauma can add to our understanding of the relationship between space and psyche as well as trauma's complex relationship with space. Future studies can be conducted in collaboration with psychologists and therapists to study whether mapping one's trauma can aid in recovery. Case studies, interviews, surveys, etc. of survivors can help expand our knowledge and bridge the gap between theory and practice. Comparative analysis of fictional and personal narratives can further add to memory studies and how trauma oscillates between personal and collective in post-catastrophe spaces.

Owing to the ongoing climates crisis and global warming, research work has now expanded to include ecocritical studies. As such, future studies can be directed at analyzing eco-psychogeography in literature. A study of natural catastrophes and how they interact

with and alter human experience with space can further supplement our understanding of geo-trauma, spatial memory, communal displacement, etc.

Another important field of study can be the temporal implication of geographical trauma. The altered sense of time, fragmentation of different timelines and fractured temporal maps of urban spaces in different literary pieces can help understand how literature acts as a psychogeographical tool that mirrors the disrupted sense of temporality.

This research offers a psychogeographical lens that mirrors and maps post catastrophe urban spaces. By establishing a link between psychology and geography, it encourages future researchers to further explore urban spaces as not only targets of a disastrous event but as active participants in how trauma is remembered, embodied and reimagined.

WORKS CITED

Abbas, Amina, and Hafiz Muhammad Zahid Iqbal. “Investigating The East-West Encounters: A Postcolonial Re-orientalist Reading of Kamila Shamsie’s Burnt Shadows: A novel.” *Pakistan Journal of Social Research*, vol. 05, no. 01, 31 Mar. 2023, pp. 412–418, https://doi.org/10.52567/pjsr.v5i01.1021.

Ali, Murtaza. "Essence and Existence in Bilal Tanweer's The Scatter Here is Too Great." *Available at SSRN 4151441*, 2022.

American Psychiatric Association. *Diagnostic And Statistical Manual of Mental Disorders.* American Psychiatric Association Publication, 2022.

Babar, Shazia. “Burnt Shadows: ‘Home’, ‘Cosmopolitanism’ and ‘Hybridization’.” *The Journal of Humanities & Social Sciences*, vol. 24, no. 2, 2016, pp. 109–126.

Balaev, Michelle. "Trends in literary trauma theory." *Mosaic: A journal for the interdisciplinary study of literature,* vol. 41, no. 2, 2008, pp. 149-166.

Balaev, Michelle. "Trauma Studies." *A Companion to Literary Theory,* 2018, pp. 360-371.

Benjamin, Walter. “Paris: Capital of the Nineteenth Century.” *Perspecta*, 1969, pp. 165–172.

Besley, Catherine. “Textual Analysis as a Research Method.” *Research Methods for English Studies*, edited by Gabriele Griffin, 2nd ed., Edinburgh University Press, pp. 160–178.

Bhabha, Homi K. *The location of culture*. Routledge, 2012.

“Blast outside Karachi railway station kills six”. *DAWN,* 29 Dec. 2012, www.dawn.com/news/774805/blast-at-karachi-railway-station.

Blum, Virginia, and Anna Secor. "Psychotopologies: closing the circuit between psychic and material space." *Environment and Planning D: Society and Space,* vol. 29, no. 6, 2011, pp. 1030-1047.

“Mapping Trauma: Topography to Topology.” *Psychoanalytic Geographies*, 2016, pp. 127–140, https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315602806-11.

Caruth, Cathy. *Trauma: Explorations in Memory*. Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1995.

Caruth, Cathy. *Unclaimed Experience: Trauma, Narrative, and History.* Johns Hopkins Univ. Press, 1996.

Chambers, Claire. “Cover Story: Review of The Scatter Here Is Too Great.” *DAWN.COM*, 19 Jan. 2014, www.dawn.com/news/1081110.

Chambers, Claire. “Kamila Shamsie”. *British Muslim fictions: Interviews with contemporary writers*. Springer, 2011, pp. 207-227.

Coddington, Kate, and Jacque Micieli-Voutsinas. "On trauma, geography, and mobility: Towards geographies of trauma." *Emotion, Space and Society,* vol. 24, 2017, pp. 1-21.

Coverley, Merlin. *Psychogeography*. Oldcastle Books Ltd, 2018.

Creswell, John W. “Designing a Qualitative Study.” *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing among Five Approaches*, 3rd ed., Sage, London, 2013, pp. 42–68.

Das, Srijana Mitra. “I like Writing to Be Intense — It Should Take Everything from Me, Then Demand More: Bilal Tanweer.” *Times of India*, 22 Jan. 2015, Accessed 20 Feb. 2024.

Debord, Guy. “Theory of the Dérive.” *Internationale Situationniste*, vol. 2, no. 20, 1958.

Doval, Nikita. “Being Seen as a Pakistani Does Not Interfere with My Writing Process: Bilal Tanweer.” *Mint*, 23 Jan. 2015, Accessed 20 Feb. 2024.

Erickson, Kai. “Notes on Trauma and Community.” *American Imago*, vol. 48, no. 4, 1991, pp. 455–472.

Habermas, J. (2003). “Fundamentalism and Terror: A Dialogue with Jürgen Habermas”. Philosophy in a Time of Terror: Dialogues with Jürgen Habermas and Jacques Derrida. Ed. Giovanna Borradori. Chicago: University of Chicago.

Hamid, Sahar, and Shahzeb Khan. "Beauty out of Chaos: A Parallel Study of Pakistan's Trauma Art and Literature." *Journal of Research (Humanities),* no. 54, 2018, pp. 228-251.

Haider, Erum. “Twenty-Three Million Stories.” *Tanqeed*, Mar. 2014, www.tanqeed.org/2014/03/twenty-three-million-stories-book-review/.

Jose, Naomi Therese. “The Travelling Embodied Self in Kamila Shamsie’s Burnt Shadows.” *Oceánide*, vol. 11, 31 Dec. 2018, pp. 7–11.

Kamal, Nudrat. “Book Review: The Scatter Here Is Too Great.” *Newsline*, Feb. 2014, newslinemagazine.com/magazine/book-review-the-scatter-here-is-too-great/.

Kasten, Jeremy. "Representing a Trauma Space and Rendering the Real of the Spanish Civil War in Carlos Saura’s La caza." Trauma and Meaning Making. Brill, 2016, pp. 141-157.

Khan, Gohar Karim. *Narrating Pakistan Transnationally: Identity, Politics and Terrorism in Anglophone Pakistani Literature after “9/11,”*. University of Warwick, PhD dissertation. University of Warwick Publications Service & WRAP, Dec. 2013, https://wrap.warwick.ac.uk/66150/. Accessed 17 Jan. 2024.

Khan, Gohar Karim. “"The Hideous Beauty of Bird-Shaped Burns “Transnational Allegory and Feminist Rhetoric in Kamila Shamsie’s Burnt Shadows.” *Pakistaniaat: A Journal of Pakistan Studies*, vol. 3, no. 2, 2011, pp. 53–68.

Khanna, Stuti. "Out of Place in Delhi: Some Vignettes of Loss." *The Palgrave Handbook of Literature and the City*, 2016, pp. 607-621.

Kiczkowski, Adriana. “‘Glocalization’ in Post-9/11 Literature. ‘Burnt Shadows’ by Kamila Shamsie.” *Journal of English Studies*, vol. 14, 2016, pp. 125–136, https://doi.org/10.18172/jes.2813.

King, Bruce. "Kamila Shamsie’s novels of history, exile and desire." *Journal of Postcolonial Writing*, vol. 47, no. 2, 2011, pp. 147-158.

KIZILTAŞ, Şahin. “Symbolisation of Memory and Space in Kamile Shamsie’s Burnt Shadows.” *RumeliDE Dil ve Edebiyat Araştırmaları Dergisi*, vol. 25, 2021, pp. 1151–1160, dergipark.org.tr/en/download/article-file/2140459

Kolaitis, Gerasimos, and Miranda Olff. "Psychotraumatology in Greece." *European Journal of Psychotraumatology*, vol. 8, 2017, pp. 135175.

Koçak, Betül Ateşci. *Traumatic Spaces In The Post-9/11 Novel.* 2015. Universidad de Salamanca, PhD dissertation.

Lefebvre, Henri. *The Production of Space*. Blackwell, 1991.

Löffler, Catharina. *Walking in the city: Urban experience and literary psychogeography in eighteenth-century London*. Springer, 2017.

Mehboob, Afeera. "The Smell of Survival: Urban Chaos and Post-Traumatic Growth in The Scatter Here Is Too Great by Bilal Tanweer." *Academia*, *Lahore College For Women University*, 2016, www.academia.edu/30210996/The_Smell_of_Survival_Urban_Chaos_and_Post_Traumatic_Growth_in_The_Scatter_Here_is_Too_Great_by_Bilal_Tanweer. Accessed 28 Feb. 2024.

Meretoja, Hanna. "Philosophies of trauma." *The Routledge Companion To Literature And Trauma*. Taylor & Francis, 2020, pp. 23-35.

Micieli-Voutsinas, Jacquelyn. *Rummaging through the Wreckage: Geographies of Trauma, Memory, and Loss at the National September 11th Memorial & Museum at the World Trade Center*. 2014. Syracuse University, PhD dissertation.

Mountz, Alison. "Island detention: Affective eruption as trauma's disruption." *Emotion, Space and Society,* vol. 24, 2017, pp. 74-82.

Nadeem, Sabeen, and Safana Hashmat. "Physical Cartographies—The Harbinger of Mental Cartographies in Kamila Shamsie's Burnt Shadows." *Journal of Literature, Languages and Linguistics,* vol. 8, no. 66, 2015, pp. 66-75.

Pain, Rachel. "Geo-trauma: Violence, place and repossession." *Progress in Human Geography,* vol. 45, no. 5, 2021, pp. 972-989.

Pain, Rachel, Nahid Rezwana, and Zuriatunfadzliah Sahdan. "Trauma, gender and space: insights from Bangladesh, Malaysia and the UK." *Routledge handbook of gender and feminist geographies*. Routledge, 2020. pp. 287-296.

Palmer, David. "Nagasaki's districts: Western contact with Japan through the history of a city's space." *Journal of Urban History,* vol. 42, no. 3, 2016, pp. 477-505.

Pamuk, Orhan. *Istanbul: Memories and the city*. Vintage, 2006.

Parrinder, Patrick. "H. G. Wells and the Fiction of Catastrophe." *Renaissance and Modern Studies*, vol. 28, no. 1, 1984, pp. 40–58, https://doi.org/10.1080/14735788409366475.

Pervez, Wahid. "Critical study of Kamila Shamsie's novel 'Burnt shadows' in the light of post-colonial theory." *International Journal of Social Sciences & Educational Studies*, vol. 1, no. 1, 2018, pp. 28–39, https://doi.org/10.23918/ijsses.v5i2p98.

Pirzada, Tehmina. "'Sharing the Scatter': Assemblage and Affect in The Scatter Here Is Too Great." *South Asian Review*, vol. 38, no. 1, June 2017, pp. 73–84, https://doi.org/10.1080/02759527.2017.12002551.

Qasim, Khansa, and Munazza Yaqoob. "Monstrous Urban Spaces and Violence in The Scatter Here Is Too Great." *Pakistan Journal of Languages and Translation Studies*, vol. 2, 2022, pp. 100–109.

Qwarnström, Loretta. "Transmigrant Movements and Crossings in Kamila Shamsie's Novel" Burnt Shadows"." *4th Global Conference: Interculturalism, Meaning and Identity, Prague. 2011*.

Ranasinha, Ruvani. "Resistance and Religion: Gender, Islam and Agency in Kamila Shamsie, Tahmima Anam, Monica Ali and Ameena Hussein." *Contemporary Diasporic South Asian Women's Fiction: Gender, Narration and Globalisation*, Palgrave Macmillan, London, 2016, pp. 129–171.

Rehman, Saeed Ur. "I Imagine and Write in a Locally Grounded Way: Bilal Tanweer." *Herald Magazine*, 31 Jan. 2018, herald.dawn.com/news/1154015.

Richardson, Tina. *Walking inside out: Contemporary British Psychogeography*. Rowman & Littlefield International, 2015.

Rohleder, Rebekka, and Martin Kindermann. “Introduction: Exploring the Spatiality of the City across Cultural Texts.” *Exploring the Spatiality of the City across Cultural Texts*, 2020, pp. 1–22, https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-55269-5_1.

Rosenthal, Lecia. *Mourning Modernism: Literature, Catastrophe, and the Politics of Consolation*. Fordham University Press, 2011.

Sadaf, Shazia. "Human dignity, the ‘War on Terror’ and post-9/11 Pakistani fiction." *Narratives of the War on Terror*. Routledge, vol. 22, no. 2, 2020, pp. 24-36.

Shamsie, Kamila. “Kamila Shamsie on leaving and returning to Karachi.” *The Guardian*, 2010, www.theguardian.com/books/2010/mar/13/karachi-leaving-london-writing-fiction.

Shamsie, Kamila. *Burnt Shadows*. Bond Street Books, 2009.

Shah, Hira Nafees. “Debut Novel by Fulbright Alumnus Lauded as Love Letter to Karachi.” *Pakistan-U.S. Alumni Network*, 8 Apr. 2014, pakusalumninetwork.org/debut-novel-by-fulbright-alumnus-lauded-as-love-letter-to-karachi/.

Shaikh, Farhana. “Bilal Tanweer.” *The Asian Writer*, 30 Oct. 2015, theasianwriter.co.uk/2014/09/15/bilal-tanweer/.

Singh, Harleen. "Insurgent Metaphors: Decentering 9/11 in Mohsin Hamid’s The Reluctant Fundamentalist and Kamila Shamsie’s Burnt Shadows." *ariel: a review of international english literature,* vol. 43, no .1, 2012, pp. 23-44.

Singh, Harleen. "A legacy of violence: Interview with Kamila Shamsie about Burnt Shadows (2009)." *ariel: a review of international english literature,* vol. 42, no. 2, 2011, pp. 157-162.

Soukaï, Sandrine. “The hybridity of partition novels in English: Reshaping national identities in Amitav Ghosh’s The Shadow Lines and Kamila Shamsie’s burnt

shadows." *Commonwealth Essays and Studies*, vol. 40, no. 2, 1 Apr. 2018, pp. 69–79, https://doi.org/10.4000/ces.291.

Sütterlin, Nicole A. "History of trauma theory." *The Routledge Companion to Literature and Trauma*. Routledge, 2020, pp. 11-22.

Tanweer, Bilal. *The Scatter Here is Too Great*. Random House, 2014.

American Psychological Association. Trauma, https://www.apa.org/topics/trauma.

Trigg, Dylan. "The Place of Trauma: Memory, Hauntings, and the Temporality of Ruins." *Memory Studies*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2009, pp. 87–101, https://doi.org/10.1177/1750698008097397.

Vitolo, Daniela. "The Performance of Identity in Kamila Shamsie's Burnt Shadows." *Transnational Literature*, vol. 8, no. 2, 2016, pp. 1–7.

Violi, Patrizia. *Landscapes of memory. Trauma, space, history*. Peter Lang, 2017.

Waheed, Sarah. "A Different Story: New Fiction in English on Karachi." *The Caravan*, 1 Feb. 2016, caravanmagazine.in/reviews-essays/a-different-story-new-english-fiction-karachi.

Walker, Janet. "Moving Testimonies and the Geography of Suffering: Perils and Fantasies of Belonging after Katrina." *Continuum*, vol. 24, no. 1, 2010, pp. 47–64, https://doi.org/10.1080/10304310903380769.

Yusuf, Huma. *Conflict dynamics in Karachi*. Vol. 19. Washington: US Institute of Peace, 2012.

Zahidi, Farahnaz. "In Conversation with Bilal Tanweer: Between Literature and Life, He'd Choose Life Any Day." *Chaaidaani*, 17 Dec. 2013, chaaidaani.wordpress.com/2013/12/17/in-conversation-with-bilal-tanweer-between-literature-and-life-hed-choose-life-any-day/.