

**HETEROTOPIA, AGENCY, AND THE  
EMBODIED SPACES: A NEW  
MATERIALIST READING OF THOMAS  
MANN'S *THE MAGIC MOUNTAIN* AND  
MOHAMMAD HANIF'S *OUR LADY OF  
ALICE BHATTI***

**BY**

**MIRAJ ULFAT**



**NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES  
ISLAMABAD**

**January, 2025**

**HETEROTOPIA, AGENCY, AND THE EMBODIED  
SPACES: A NEW MATERIALIST READING OF  
THOMAS MANN'S *THE MAGIC MOUNTAIN* AND  
MOHAMMAD HANIF'S *OUR LADY OF ALICE BHATTI***

By

**MIRAJ ULFAT**

M. A English Literature and Linguistics, Air University Islamabad, 2019

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF

THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

**MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY**

In **English**

To

FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES



NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, ISLAMABAD

© Miraj Ulfat, 2025



FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES  
NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES

## THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defense, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Arts & Humanities for acceptance.

**Thesis Title:** Heterotopia, Agency, and the Embodied Spaces: A New Materialist Reading of Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif's *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*

**Submitted by:** Miraj Ulfat

**Registration #:** 125-MPhil/E Lit/S21

Dr. Sibghat Ullah Khan

Name of Supervisor

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of Research Supervisor

Dr. Farheen Ahmed Hashmi

Name of Head (GS)

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of Head (GS)

Prof. Dr. Arshad Mehmood

Name of Dean (FAH)

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of Dean (FAH)

Prof. Dr. Muhammad Safeer Awan

Name of Pro- Rector Academics

\_\_\_\_\_  
Signature of Pro –Rector Academics

\_\_\_\_\_  
Date

## AUTHOR'S DECLARATION

I Miraj Ulfat

Daughter of Ulfat Hussain

Registration # 125 MPhil/Eng Lit/S21

Discipline English Literature

Candidate of **Master of Philosophy** at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby declare that the thesis **Heterotopia, Agency and the Embodied Spaces: A New Materialist Reading of Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif's *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*** submitted by me in partial fulfillment of MPhil degree, is my original work, and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare that it shall not, in future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any other university or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even after the award of a degree, the work may be cancelled and the degree revoked.

---

Signature of Candidate

Miraj Ulfat  
Name of Candidate

---

Date

## ABSTRACT

**Title: Heterotopia, Agency, and the Embodied Spaces: A New Materialist Reading of Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif's *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti***

This study investigates the concept of Heterotopia in Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif's *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*. It focuses hospital as heterotopic space. I have drawn on Michel Foucault's idea of "heterotopia" and Karen Barad's concept of "Agential Realism". As a supporting theoretical lens, I invoke Henry Lefebvre's idea of "embodied spaces". In both the selected texts, the human body has been used as an embodiment of space that moves between heterotopic and normative spaces. It experiences a transition between two spaces and develops spatial consciousness. This spatial consciousness leads to radical subjectivity in order to create harmony among societal conflicts. Barad's "Agential Realism" is the mutual interaction of human and non-human agencies. Barad calls human and nonhuman interaction "agential cuts" that open the way to attach "others" unintentionally as they are not very far from us. The location and fluidity of human characters into and around heterotopic spaces reveal intra-actions of human experience and non-human material objects. That is how embodied spaces, heterotopias and agential realism get connected in an argument. I have conducted my research from a new materialist perspective. New Materialism is an interdisciplinary field of study where the focus lies on quantum mechanical description of material which goes against the anthropocentric approach of study. New materialism opens up new avenues to rethink human existence within new materialistic framework. I have used Catherine Belsey's research method, 'Textual Analysis' in order to examine my primary texts. This study is likely to productively contribute to the production of knowledge in the area of spatial studies.

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

Chapter	Page
<b>THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM .....</b>	<b>ii</b>
<b>AUTHOR’S DECLARATION .....</b>	<b>iii</b>
<b>ABSTRACT .....</b>	<b>vii</b>
<b>TABLE OF CONTENTS.....</b>	<b>viii</b>
<b>LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS.....</b>	<b>x</b>
<b>ACKNOWLEDGEMENT .....</b>	<b>xi</b>
<b>DEDICATION .....</b>	<b>xii</b>
<b>1. RATIONALE OF THE STUDY.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Introduction .....	1
1.2 Locating the Selected Primary Texts in the Spatial and New Materialist Tradition in Fiction .....	7
1.3 Situatedness of the Researcher .....	8
1.4 Delimitation of Study .....	9
1.5 Thesis Statement .....	10
1.6 Research Questions .....	10
1.7 Research Plan .....	10
1.8 Significance of the Study .....	11
<b>2. LITERATURE REVIEW: A CRITICAL SURVEY OF EXISTING SCHOLARSHIP.....</b>	<b>13</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	13
2.1 Materiality of Space and Heterotopia .....	14
2.2 Production of Space in Relation to Human Interaction .....	17
2.3 Works Already Done on the Primary Texts.....	18
<b>3. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH.....</b>	<b>27</b>
3.1 Introduction .....	27
3.2 Theoretical Framework.....	27
3.3 Theory of New Materialism and Agential Realism .....	29
3.3.1 Performance of Matter in Human Life.....	31
3.4 Henry Lefebvre’s Theory of the Production of Space.....	33
3.5 Research Methodology .....	34
3.6 Textual Analysis .....	35
<b>4. HUMAN BODY AS AN EMBODIMENT OF SPACE IN THOMAS</b>	

<b>MANN'S <i>THE MAGIC MOUNTAIN</i>.....</b>	<b>37</b>
4.1 Introduction .....	37
4.2. The Embracing Ambience of Heterotopia.....	39
4.3. Material Space in Relation to Human body as an Agentive Subject.....	40
4.4 Human Body as an Embodiment of Space .....	46
4.5 Othering as a Productive Phenomenon.....	49
<b>5. PERFORMATIVITY OF THE HUMAN BODIES INSIDE</b>	
<b>HETEROTOPIA IN MOHAMMAD HANIF'S <i>OUR LADY OF ALICE</i></b>	
<b><i>BHATTI: A TEXTUAL ANALYSIS</i>.....</b>	<b>52</b>
5.1 Introduction.....	52
5.2 Epistemic Violence.....	54
5.3 Power Dynamics .....	55
5.4 Performativity of Human Existence inside the Hospital Space as Heterotopia.....	57
5.5 Power and Agency attained by the Protagonist Alice Bhatti and(The Ward Boy) Noor.....	60
<b>6. CONCLUSION.....</b>	<b>65</b>
6.1 Recommendations for Further Research.....	67
<b>WORKS CITED.....</b>	<b>63</b>

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

TMM	<i>The Magic Mountain</i>
OLAB	<i>Our Lady of Alice Bhatt</i>



## ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, I am profoundly grateful to Allah Almighty. Without His blessings, I would not have been able to complete this challenging task.

I owe a debt of gratitude to my supervisor, mentor, and teacher, Assistant Professor Dr. Sibghatullah Khan, for his endless support and encouraging cooperation throughout this journey. His unwavering belief in me and his constructive challenges have consistently brought out the best in my work.

I would also like to express my deepest thanks and love to my late father, Ulfat Hussain. Despite facing a terminal illness, he remained a pillar of strength and steadfastly encouraged my pursuit of higher education. His enduring love, wisdom and support continue to inspire me even in his absence. My heartfelt thanks go to my mother, brothers, and sisters, whose unwavering support has been a cornerstone throughout my academic journey. Additionally, I extend my sincerest gratitude to all my teachers, friends, and relatives for their encouragement and support during this process.

Lastly, I am grateful to the English Department of NUML for providing me with the academic and creative space necessary to bring this thesis to life.

Thank you all.

## DEDICATION

I humbly and lovingly dedicate this thesis to my beloved parents, whose unwavering love, sacrifices, and support have been the foundation of my success.

In particular, I dedicate this work to the memory of my late father, Ulfat Hussain. His steadfast belief in my abilities, constant encouragement, and the values he instilled in me have been a source of strength throughout my life. Though he is no longer physically present, his spirit continues to guide and inspire me at every step. I am deeply grateful for the love, wisdom, and principles he imparted, which have shaped my journey.

I also dedicate this thesis to my beloved mother, Aziz Begum whose unconditional love, immense sacrifices, and unwavering support have been instrumental in my achievements. Her strength, prayers, and encouragement have been my greatest motivation, providing me with the resilience and determination to overcome challenges. I owe much of this accomplishment to her boundless care and guidance.

With profound gratitude, I acknowledge the invaluable role my parents have played in shaping my path, and I dedicate this work as a token of my deep appreciation and love for them.

# CHAPTER 1

## RATIONALE OF THE STUDY

### 1.1 Introduction

This project examines the concept of ‘heterotopia’ in Thomas Mann’s *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif’s *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*. This research principally deploys Michel Foucault’s idea of “heterotopia” theorized in *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences* (1966). The main characters in both the novels experience different ways of living in the hospital spaces considered as heterotopia. The hospital space as “heterotopia” is the main subject of investigation in this study. The character’s interaction within the heterotopia creates meanings through Karen Barad’s concept of agential realism. Barad explicates the role of agential realism through human bodies and notes that “like all other bodies, [the human bodies] are not entities with inherent boundaries and properties but phenomena that acquire specific boundaries and properties through the open-ended dynamics of intra-activity” (172). Heterotopia represents physical space that has unfavorable bodies to make a real space possible and to make that space a utopian space. As a supporting theoretical position, my research invokes Henry Lefebvre’s idea of the “Spatial Triad” to see how embodied spaces (human bodies) move in and out of heterotopia, and how their subjectivities (agencies) are produced and affected.

The materiality turn began in the nineteenth century when scientists and theorists observed that the environment, surroundings, and material objects have an equal impact on shaping the mental state of human beings. Pasquale Gagliardi in his book *Symbols and Artifacts: Views of the Corporate Landscape* (1990) highlights “the perception of “things” which frame it and define its contours” (Gagliardi 5). Through this book Gagliardi sheds light on the construction of space through architecture, objects and cultural relations. He gives examples of different institutions that how the construction of a particular institution plays its role in the production of a social space. He includes the quote: “A simple artifact often holds the essence of a whole social system” (Wuthnow et al. 1984: 21). Artifacts and symbols play pivotal role in creating sensory and emotional understanding of the things; therefore, it helps

in creating cultural relationships. Our cultural identity and cultural representation depend on the way we communicate and live in a particular social environment, therefore human existence is possible in a two-way approach as material space and survival of human beings in this world is just like two sides of the same coin. In this domain of materiality anthropologists and sociologists are the ones who highlighted this notion of human survival in relation to entities.

This investigation is in sync with this materiality turn discussed in the foregoing paragraph. It is instructive to outline the key concepts that inform the content of this research. I am focusing on the representation of hospital space as “heterotopia” and how that space creates spatial consciousness among human and nonhuman subjects in the two selected primary texts, *The Magic Mountain* and *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*. “Heterotopia” is the term coined by Foucault to present spaces that have more layers of meaning and possess actual place for people to live in. It is a place which is neither utopia nor dystopia but a place of both risk and possibility. “Heterotopia” is a fluid place without any boundary where everyone can live and interact with other human beings. This concept challenges the prevailing cultural and social norms of a normative space that exists outside its boundary.

Hospital space as “heterotopia” possess agency in the form of resistance and subversion of human behavior and attitudes. Heterotopic spaces may appear open and accessible to all, but they often involve exclusion. This exclusion is not in the sense of considering people as “othered” but these exclusions involve shaping and reshaping human behavior for the sake of creating a productive space that accepts and embraces the identity of every human being. The characters after living inside such spaces feel difference in their physical being, and when they move to the normal space, they appear to be more affective and helpful for other people living there. The purpose of the present study is to deconstruct this stereotype related to heterotopia as “othered” space because if these spaces are helpful in giving voice and agency to the human bodies, we perhaps cannot label such spaces as something excluded from the norms of society.

This idea was further supported by Foucault himself in his work “*Of Other Spaces*”. This work is a short lecture delivered by Foucault to a group of students in the year 1967. He states that

[t]here are others, on the contrary, that seem to be pure and simple

openings, but that generally hide curious exclusions. Everyone can enter into the heterotopic sites, but in fact that is only an illusion—we think we enter where we are, by the very fact that we enter, excluded. (6, 7)

Heterotopia are places with multiple layers containing meaning inside. He discusses multiple types of heterotopia, for instance, the crisis heterotopia includes boarding school and motel room whereas heterotopia of deviation includes several institutions where an individual's behavior is considered odd and out of the norms of the society like hospitals, prisons and asylums. Other than these types he talks about heterotopias of time and heterotopia of ritual but, in my study, I engage only with the hospital space as heterotopia.

Hospital space as heterotopia envisions a world where the human is invited to 'listen' and to 'pay heed' to nonhuman agency.<sup>1</sup> In other words, heterotopic spaces may give voice and agency to human beings and vice versa. Barad's New Materialist lens gives human beings agency to glance at the material objects in a generative way.<sup>2</sup> There are always points of intersection which open up new ways of interaction between the human world and the world of agentic matter. Theory of New Materialism rejects the notion of structures and patterns. Other than structures, this theory focuses on the countless 'events' comprising the material effects of both nature and culture, which together construct the world and human history.

According to Foucault, the relations and layers of information about locations and between locations are a fundamental principle of space perception. We, as users, get diverse meanings to different types of spaces depending on the connection we make between them, dividing the inner from outer, and internal from external. Heterotopia is contextually associated to the more distinguished term "Utopia", which Foucault uses as heterotopias' theoretical opposite. He says that external sites like utopias and heterotopias have the atypical attribute of existing in relation with all the other sites, but in such a way as to question, negate, or invert the set of relations that they happen to identify, mirror, or reflect. Heterotopias are actual locations that serve as "counter-sites," symbolizing, opposing, and inverting all other traditional sites in contrast to utopias, which are imaginary, wonderful, and perfect surroundings. Heterotopia is the place which exists in real form, and it is the place where people live in order to develop a space to perform their daily routine activities. As, people living in such places are also labeled as "othered" which is a kind of stereotype that people living in heterotopia

are abnormal in fact, they compete between two spaces the normal space and the heterotopia for their livelihood.

Another concept adapted from Karen Barad's theory of "Agential Realism" suggests that if human beings are part of the world, it is impossible to completely separate or distinguish human and nonhuman agencies from each other, as they are entangled through their continual intra-actions. "Intra-actions" is another term coined by Barad and it implies giving up subject-object dichotomies, linear time, cause-and-effect relationships as well as individual agency. Intra-action therefore acknowledges the impossibility of absolute separation between bodies and, thus, subverts classical objectivity. In the novel, *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*, Mohammed Hanif presents a compelling protagonist, Alice Bhatti. In the complex and stratified society of Pakistan, Alice Bhatti is considered as othered because she belongs to the Christian community. But in the hospital space, Alice Bhatti emerges as embodiment of space and demonstrates her ability to carve out her own place within the hospital setting, which can be viewed as heterotopia. Despite being considered untouchable and marginalized in the Pakistani society, Alice finds solace and a sense of belonging within the confines of the hospital walls. So, the materiality of space comes into account through intra-actions, as material space is not the inherent property of an individual to be exercised. It is a vitality of forces in which all designated 'things' are constantly exchanging and diffracting, influencing and working inseparably.

Similarly, in the novel *The Magic Mountain*, protagonist Hans Castorp enters the hospital space as a visitor, but his first interaction with the environment and the architecture of the sanatorium makes him to ponder upon his personal and psychological condition of his mind. He considers Sanatorium Berghof (heterotopia) as a place different from the outer world. He learns the true lesson of human existence in the hospital space and tries to absorb positive elements from the different patients living there. The attachment of the human body with the architecture of the hospital space rejects the notion of labeling such spaces as 'othered' or exclusive since; these non-material objects possess the ability to transform human perception in a positive way.

Along with that, I have chosen Henry Lefebvre's idea of the "Spatial Triad" as my supporting lens. It is defined in his book *The Production of Space*. I deploy it as a reading prop to study the production of space, like hospital space, to see if the space is inclusive or exclusive. In both the texts, the human body is used as an embodiment of

space that shuttles between heterotopic and normative spaces, experiences a transition between two spaces, and creates spatial consciousness. Spatial consciousness pluralizes us in a lived space and the human body is figured, configured, and reconfigured in terms of exploitation, economically, politically, culturally and physically as well. This consciousness is expressed in our lived spaces if we recognize them and look for them. The spatial consciousness makes the human body aware of its surrounding, and lets human body recognize how space oppresses, encloses, dominates, shapes, and frustrates our daily lives to have a new form of radical subjectivity achieved through social space. The hospital space labeled as “heterotopia” is presented as a social space consisting of a continuing dialogue between the normal and the abnormal, the familiar and the strange, the known and the unknown individuals.

In the literary domain, many scholars have given several definitions of space, and the readers are obliged to use this idea of space in several dimensions. The description about a particular space given in a particular text depicts some agency of that space, and that narrated space is re-imagined and re-shaped in the reader’s mind in a nuanced way. There is a paradoxical relationship between body and space. Space carries agency which shapes human body; contrary to that, human body also shapes space. This is an ongoing phenomenon. Therefore, various scholars have talked about spaces and how spaces emerge as a fundamental element in the study of literature. Robert Tally, Marx Simmel, Henry Lefebvre, Edward Soja, Michel Foucault, and many others have tried to theorize space to add insights into the production of space as to how space is produced with flows that are perceived, interpreted and experienced in several proportions. In other words, space is formed through social production, making it a social space.

The third theoretical position I have chosen as my supporting lens is Henry Lefebvre’s idea of “Spatial Triad”. In his book *The Production of Space* (1974), Lefebvre approaches space as a social product and argues that space does not exist in any absolute, a priori form. Space is not a readymade product; it is always the result of a negotiation between our conception of space (conceived space/space of representation) – space of planners, architects, which is also called the dominant space. The second one is (perceived space/spatial practices) our concrete, material, physical perception of space - the space that we use and that belongs to our everyday experience. Lefebvre’s third concept of space is (lived space/space of representation) the

experienced space that the imagination seeks to change and appropriate, also called the dominated space. This theorization of production of space is known as “Spatial Triad”.

I shall be using all three concepts of spaces in my analysis to reinforce my argument. I take my lead from these key concepts and approach the selected novels to study how material agency empowers the human body to interact with nonhuman material forms in order to see if they could make “othered” spaces inclusive. As exclusion of certain important entities from our living circle makes things difficult, division of spaces in a society creates hierarchy and cultural difference among individuals.

This research examines two novels in terms of hospital space as “heterotopia” and engages directly with the research question of what role does heterotopia play with reference to the hospital space and the human agency. The first novel, *The Magic Mountain* (1924), by Thomas Mann introduces us with the protagonist of the novel Hans Castorp, a twenty-three-year-old engineer from Hamburg who gets into the tuberculosis sanatorium, to visit his sick cousin Joachim Ziemssen in the Swiss sanatorium in Alps. He intends to stay for three weeks but remains there unexpectedly for seven years. I am interested in exploring how these seven years make him stay in that sanatorium space and how it shapes and reshapes his body in pre-war era. This unexpected seven-year stay indicates that the hospital space which is being “othered” and named as “heterotopia” has the potential to attract people to stay there unexpectedly. It intrigues me to see if this shows the agency of the material object towards human agencies, which compels them to stay there unexpectedly.

Through the lens of “agential realism,” “embodied spaces,” and “the spatial triad”, we can better understand the profound importance of the hospital space in the novel *The Magic Mountain* by Thomas Mann. At the heart of this sprawling narrative lies Hans Castorp, a young and impressionable protagonist who becomes, in many ways, an embodiment of the novel's exploration of the concept of space. The protagonist Hans Castorp moves into the International Sanatorium Berghof where people with lungs disease live together and they name that sanatorium “Half-Lung Club” instead of tuberculosis sanatorium. Hans engages in various philosophical discussions and ponders upon the questions related to morality, illness, and the nature of human existence. Settembrini is one of the characters living inside Sanatorium with whom Hans engages with philosophical discussions such as, democracy, progress, mysticism,



role of death in one's life, disease as part of normal life, and the importance of health issues. In short, they talk about each and every aspect of human life in hospital space.

In his novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* (2011), Mohammad Hanif presents a Christian nurse, Alice Bhatti, in the domain of a Government Sacred Heart Hospital for all Ailments. Alice Bhatti has been tortured, mocked, and humiliated inside hospital space which we call heterotopia. Throughout the novel, Alice Bhatti moves between two spaces, the space outside the hospital which is a normal space, and the hospital space which is heterotopic space. What interests me is to see how by moving across these two spaces as an embodied space, her body passes through a continuous transition inside the hospital space which is considered "heterotopia". The protagonist herself feels the difference in her personality when she moves between two spaces. When she steps inside the Sacred Heart Hospital, she gains autonomy as a nurse and considers herself as an agentive subject to serve for the sake of humanity. It is the hospital space (material space) through which she gains autonomy. Therefore, the present study helps scrutinize how we can make "othered" spaces as inclusive, productive, and agentive, rather than confined and restricted for human beings.

## **1.2 Locating the Selected Primary Texts in the Spatial and New Materialist Tradition in Fiction**

In this section, I have attempted to place my primary texts into the spatial and new materialist tradition in fiction writing. Many authors have written the novels in spatial and new materialist tradition. *The English Patient* (1992) by Michael Ondaatje is the late twentieth century novel. In this novel the author has presented an Italian villa during the period of World War I. Later, this villa is converted to the hospital where a burned man Almasi is treated by the Canadian nurse Hana. This novel is a true depiction of the villa that is converted to hospital space. The protagonist of the book is fully burnt and feels peaceful and comfortable in that villa which is in ruins. He spends the rest of his life in bed on the villa and keeps on remembering his old days when he was totally fine and was preparing to fight in WWI. The novel depicts that even the ruins possess this power to provide agency and autonomy to those who feel to die in a normal space. In this way the space in relation to material agency works together and provides a sense of affection inside ruins.

Similarly, in another fiction *Veronica Decides to Die* 1998 by Brazilian author

Paulo Coelho. In this story, Veronica, a twenty-four-year-old, young and gorgeous lady, tries to kill herself out of nothing, but she finds herself in a Villeta, (a psychiatric hospital). Same as Almásy, in the text, she feels something meaningful in that space and tries to find meaningful ways to live her life. Similarly, my selected primary texts *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* 2011 and *The Magic Mountain* 1924, are located under the New Materialist and Spatial paradigm because, they explore the intricate relationship and challenges the human-centered approach by focusing on non-material objects as these objects help in shaping human experience.

Furthermore, my research digs into the notion of embodied spaces, where human bodies interact with the materiality of the space and gain agency within that particular space. In Pakistan the cultural boundaries interact with our physical and personal autonomy, therefore it creates a barrier for human body to gain autonomy. The reading of the primary texts through the lens of new materialism gives power and agency to the human body. The novel *The Magic Mountain* exposes the psyche and living condition of an educated engineer Hans Castorp who finds solace and comfort in a tuberculosis sanatorium. Similarly, in the novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* the protagonist of the novel Alice finds shelter in hospital space. She belongs to a minor Christian community; therefore, society does not let such characters to live peacefully, but heterotopic spaces are the one that proves as a place of safety for such characters. Exploring the hospital space from the perspective of spatial and new materialist paradigm involves the understanding of hospital space, as a space with the specific dynamics and the way it relates to societal issues depicted in the narratives. Under the next sub-heading, I discuss my situatedness as a researcher and the research.

### **1.3 Situatedness of the Researcher**

The project is significant for me because of my situatedness as a researcher in Pakistani society. In my research I aim to study heterotopias, agency and embodied spaces in socio-cultural Pakistani context. My research aims to observe the intersectionality of these diverse concepts in Pakistani context. In the contemporary scholarship, my study intervenes in the sense that it talks about the agency of the human body inside heterotopic spaces. Many people around the globe are being “othered” on the basis of their low cast identity, but they try to adjust themselves for the sake of their survival. The hospital space in the novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* considered as heterotopia is the space where the protagonist Alice is being humiliated, tortured and

abused because she works in the Sacred Hospital for all Ailments (heterotopias) and secondly, she is a Christian by religion. Thus, she is doubly marginalized and tortured but, through her consistent efforts, she tries to make her own space within that particular space which is known as heterotopia. The hospital space provides her a sense of freedom and her professional identity as a nurse is being polished inside the hospital space. My dissertation foregrounds this idea that people in minority should be given equal rights. Our country is not yet a developed country, and sometimes there are instances that minorities are being ignored. As a researcher, it would be a great contribution if my study can be part of raising consciousness about giving the rightful, respectable position to the minorities in Pakistan.

Similarly, in the novel *The Magic Mountain* by Thomas Mann, the protagonist Hans feels more secure and refreshing in the Berghof Sanatorium and he does not want to leave that place because he considers himself more philosophical and peaceful there. The materiality of the space compels him to change his decision of leaving Berghof Sanatorium after spending seven years there. As a researcher, this phenomenon makes me to highlight the importance of the materiality of space and the human body itself as an “embodiment of space”, that how human body itself makes her space to survive within heterotopia. By focusing on both the primary texts in Pakistani context I have taken a subjective view of texts to validate my argument, this study is likely to resonate with my argument. In this regard, textual analysis as a research method is likely to help me out in this research.

#### **1.4 Delimitation of Study**

The proposed thesis is delimited to the study of two primary texts: Thomas Mann’s *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif’s *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*, through the proposed theoretical framework of Michel Foucault’s notion on heterotopia, Keran Barad’s idea of agential realism and Henry Lefebvre theory on the production of space. This project is likely to be an important contribution to the field of spatial literature in that it focuses Mann and Hanif’s portrayal of hospitals as heterotopias to investigate how the production of space uses its agency by making the human body pass through a continuous process of transition.

## 1.5 Thesis Statement

Hospital space, as a heterotopia, appears as an agentive subject in the selected novels *The Magic Mountain* and *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* that provides agency to the characters as compared to normal social spaces. In the hospital environment, shaped by agential realism, their bodies are figured, configured, and reconfigured within the spatial triad, and they reconstruct their own individual and social identities.

## 1.6 Research Questions

This research attempts to answer the following controlling questions:

1. What are the configurations of heterotopia in linking up the hospital space with the human agency?
2. In what ways does the materiality of space interact with the human body in the selected texts?
3. How does the human body emerge as an embodiment of space in the selected texts?

## 1.7 Research Plan

The proposed research study is arranged in the following fashion:

In the first chapter, I explain the situatedness of the project. I discuss the rationale of the study along with thesis statement and research questions. The significance of the study situates my study in the relevant literary scenario. The research questions give direction to my thesis.

Chapter two is the literature review which helps me to contextualize my research in the existing scholarship. I review a range of articles and books related to my area of study to find the research gap and space for my intervention. This chapter is divided into two parts the first part is about the materiality of space and heterotopia and the second part has been narrowed down to works already done on the primary texts.

In Chapter Three, I have tried to explain how and why the theoretical support I have deployed is relevant to my study. I have explained Michel Foucault's idea of heterotopia in relation to Karen Barad's theory of agential realism and Henry Lefebvre's notion of production of space. My theoretical lens gives a clear picture about my thesis and makes it easy for the reader to understand my theoretical props.

Chapter Four and Five are based on the textual analysis of the selected primary texts, *The Magic Mountain* and *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*. I have analyzed both the texts by using both primary and secondary sources to vindicate my argument.

Chapter Six is the last chapter of my thesis in which I conclude my research and discuss the findings thereof. I also give recommendations for future researchers in this chapter. In the next heading, I have explained how this study is significant and how this study contributes to the spatial and new materialist tradition.

## **1.8 Significance of the Study**

This study is significant in the sense that it contributes to the developing discipline of spatial literature by engaging with the idea of hospital space as heterotopia in the two selected novels. I have dealt with the concept of heterotopia further in relation to materiality and the embodiment of space. By examining the role of human body in creating its own space within the hospital environment, my investigation sheds light on how individuals negotiate their way through these heterotopic spaces. I argue that the hospital space, functioning as heterotopia, provides a unique opportunity for the socially excluded individuals to reclaim their agency, identity and power that are denied them in the normal social spaces. The protagonists in the selected texts experience a shift in their social identities in the hospital space. They feel a huge difference when they step into the world of heterotopias from the normal space. By exploring the dynamics of agency and power within the hospital space as heterotopia, my research attempts to explore how human subjects reconstruct their social identities, utilize the hospital space to regain a sense of agency, and how they remap their positions within their respective societies. This research, therefore, uncovers the complexities and nuances that surface in the “othered” space that offers insights into the ways where individuals manage to coexist with their environment.

I chose one German author and one Pakistani author not for the sake of making comparison but to highlight my argument which is survival of human beings in such places which are considered as something alien as compared to the normal space. I chose two different authors from different spaces to show that it all depends on the power, agency and authority of human beings to make their space inclusive, and to live on a piece of land which is considered normal. After explaining how my study is

significant, it is important to contextualize my research in the existing area of study. For this purpose, I have reviewed a range of the available scholarships related to my research in the next chapter.

## CHAPTER 2

### LITERATURE REVIEW: A CRITICAL SURVEY OF EXISTING SCHOLARSHIP

#### 2.1 Introduction

The key purpose of this literature review is to situate the proposed research project in the growing contemporary scholarship on heterotopia and material agency of space. Also, this review serves the secondary purpose of finding researchable gaps to affirm the validity of the present study. I review related secondary sources that are related to my domain of study. As this project involves new materialist reading of the selected primary texts from the perspective of heterotopia, I divide this chapter in three parts. In part I, I critically review scholarship on the general concept of materiality of space and heterotopia at a broader level and, in part II, I review production of space in relation to human interaction. In part III, I review works already done on my primary text, which include dissertations and other literary scholarships on my selected texts. Concluding my review, I determine gaps in the current critical sources in my domain of research and the possibility of my intervention.

An overview of my research project is in order here. I analyze Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain* and Mohammad Hanif's *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* from the perspective of human agency and materiality of space through the lens of heterotopia. I also talk about the production of space through human interaction and body movement within a particular space. This study also foregrounds the human body as an agentive subject and how that agentive subject uses its agency against the norms of the power construct made by society. Review of literature is likely to help me establish a link between my research and the corpus of literature produced prior to this thesis. I have reviewed the selected critical sources under the following subheadings:

- Materiality of Space and Heterotopia
- Production of Space in Relation to Human Interaction
- Works Already Done on the Selected Texts

## 2.1 Materiality of Space and Heterotopia

Tobin Seber's book "*Heterotopia: Postmodern Utopia and the Body Politic*" (1994) is significantly related to the project. Tobin Anthony Seber presents the deep analysis of heterotopias from the perspective of postmodernism. As postmodernism talks about fragmentation, unreliability and hyperreality, therefore Seber uses postmodern stance in reference to heterotopia that it is as a fragmented space that challenges grand narratives like a strong and unified grand state. In this book, Seber states heterotopia as the best utopia because it depicts the true reality with which human beings get allergic. He states that "reality consists of the climatic conditions, the unstable geology, and the unlucky placement of the city at the border between regions that have been given different names by warring factions at different times in history" (28). The aforementioned line depicts that reality has a relation with uncertainty and chaos rather than peace. For Seber, the utopian and dystopian narratives in fiction provide an insight to look at the power dynamics and societal issues. He states that, like the idea endorsed by postmodernists, the places labeled as heterotopia possess multiplicity of meaning inside them. He further talks about George Orwell's dystopian novel *1984* published in the year 1949. The book talks about the miserable and meager condition of the people of Oceania that is constantly bound by the surveillance and control of the government.

Through this novel Orwell shows the condition of the masses, how their bodies and freedom are controlled by the brutal and merciless authority of the state. The protagonist of the novel, Winston Smith, rebels and protests against the oppressive regime and Seber considers the novel *1984* as "heterotopia" where people live with freedom by rejecting the rules and norms created by the authority. Other than this novel Seber further talks about the "cultural texts" that how people by connecting with virtual reality like second life, internet and social media go against the social norms and enjoy their freedom. All these digital spaces are considered as heterotopia where people gain agency and use it in the way they want. Therefore, heterotopia is a place of reality and truth where people face certain challenges, and they make and remake their identity in a different manner. The book situates the study in contemporary critical knowledge in my area. Firstly, it uses postmodernism in relation to heterotopia how fragmented reality interlinks with heterotopic spaces such as prisons and virtual spaces and the role



they play in shaping and reshaping human behavior. Thus, through the review of this book, I find that Siber's addresses the concept of heterotopia from a postmodern perspective, whereas I am looking at heterotopia from the perspective of human body. Therefore, my study focuses on filling this gap and, thus, intervene in the available critical scholarship in this area.

In another book *Heterotopia and the City Public Space in a Post-Civil Society* (2008) Ignasi de Sola-Morales Rubio a Spanish philosopher and architect presented the idea of "liquid architecture" (248) that truly assemble with my research work. He states that "an architecture that engages human flows in traffic connections, airports, terminals and railway stations cannot be concerned with appearance or image" (248). Morales' idea connects heterotopic spaces with urban landscape. The fluidity of the architecture connects and joins the existence of human identity with each other. Therefore, the human body through this fluid space creates a bricolage within that connected interconnected space. He further connects this idea of liquid architecture with the projects of Flow Urbanism. Like the Yokohama International Port Terminal, Japan (Foreign Office Architects, 1995–2002) is built in such a way that this port is interconnected with Arnhem as well. Both the surfaces are interconnected to abandon the idea of boundary space. Public traffic is free on both the spots to visit the port without any obligation. In the same book, Yael Allweil and Rachel Kallus in their essay "*Public-space heterotopias*" consider public spaces as a new form of heterotopia. They consider public spaces as counter sites where different people come together and they share their ideas without any boundary wall. "The layering of public spaces in the same physical location brings counter-publics in contact and confrontation with each other" (83). These public spaces provide space and power to the marginalized and the poor of the city, at these public places they get power and agency to share their ideas without any apprehension. So, such places appear as places of cohesion and conflict as well.

The author further states that these public spaces are the spaces of collective memory and belonging. Memory plays a significant role in shaping human identity. As whatever ideas people share in such public spaces, they have a long lasting effect on their psyche and mind as compared to other spaces. Public spaces have more weightage to add beauty to the urban spaces because the boundaries between the temporal dimensions i.e. past, present and future blur and make the space fluid and transformative. The second important place which is considered as heterotopia is the

“Independence Park” in Tel Aviv in Israel. This park is considered as an iconic park because this area challenges the dominating powers, and it is an iconic place for gay rights struggle. On weekends, people from different classes, ethnicity and groups come inside that park and they perform homosexual activities there by breaking the normal societal rules. On this space gay community enjoy their life with zeal and freedom by singing and dancing on the beat of drums. This book truly depicts the idea of fluidity of spaces but the notion of human agency through the lens of material space has not been addressed which is the research gap and I am filling this gap in my research work.

In the article “Material Agency in the Writings of Shadab Zeest Hashmi: A Transcorporeal Sherbet (2020)” the Pakistani co-authors Dr. Asma Mansoor and Dr. Aroosa Kanwal brings attention towards the dis-anthropocentric approach in the works of Shadab Zeest Hashmi, where human centrality is not given importance but materiality of the nonhuman world from Islamic perspective is focused upon. “*Qasida of the Railroad Garden*” is one of the poems of Hashmi which brings insight into the world of Islamic nation. In this poem the poet talks about trees, plants, green bushes and lush green leaves which depicts interconnectedness of the human beings with the material world to make this world a peaceful territory. Hashmi’s poetry is considered as “textual fossil” which breaks the binary between human and nonhuman power dynamics. As Cohen says: “When matter exerts its right to be the protagonist of its own story, epistemological frames shift, a Copernican revolution with multiple realignments” (39). Karen Barad’s idea of “intra-act” has been used to focus on the notion that this material world exists in relation to mutual interaction of the entities rather than living in isolation. Furthermore, Hashmi incorporates the element of food as the aroma of food connects people with their culture, memory and induces a sense of placement and belonging with the material space. Matter is as pregnant with life and expectation as the human world that chimes in with echoes of human laughter (Hashmi 6).

Another most powerful symbol which she uses in her poetry is stones and rocks which are a historical symbol of spirituality in the realm of Muslim rule in Spain. She further relates the fall of minaret with past Muslim identity and the broken rocks are considered as the spiritual manifestation of the corporeal and metaphysical realms. This article delves into the notion of dis-anthropocentric notion of material world and focuses on blurring the boundaries between the binary relation of human/non-human,

object/subject, and evil/good relationship between various entities. In contrast to this research, my study is different in a sense that this research focuses on the human agency in relation to material space. My primary texts talk about the human agency in relation to heterotopia that how heterotopia as “othered” material space gives agency and power to the human body and how body as a subject stand against the constructed norms of the society. This is the research gap which I am exploring in my research project. In the next section, I do a review of the critical scholarship on my selected texts.

Bernard Tschumi a Swiss architect, writer and educator, is well known for his theory about the formation of architecture in an urban setting. In his book *Architecture and Disjunction* (1994), he explains the role of human body in relation to the architectural and cultural practices within the society. The word disjunction used in the title of his book points towards the complexities faced by the human beings. Tschumi encourages architects to inter-relate human relations with the formation of architecture. He thinks that architecture is not only a field of study but a way of thinking. In his book, he states: “The unfolding of events in a literary context inevitably suggested parallels to the unfolding of events in architecture”

(146). The combination of architecture with literature makes an interdisciplinary approach and opens new doors of innovation for the readers. Tschumi’s focus is on the material buildings, that how architectural buildings perform their role in making this world one whole. Contrary to that, my study focuses on architecture of hospital buildings in relation to the idea of agential realism, that how people gain agency by moving inside the places of heterotopia.

## **2.2 Production of Space in Relation to Human Interaction**

Yi-Fu Tuan Chinese-born American geographer and writer wrote a few books on the idea of space, place and the role of human emotions in relation with space. In his book *Space and Place: The Perspective of Experience* (1977) Tuan applies the humanistic approach on spaces and places. He endorses the notion of emotions in relation to space formation. Tuan in his book writes: “Visual perception, touch, movement and thought combine to give us our characteristic sense of space” (3). Tuan follows a humanistic approach in reference to the formation of space. He further states that: “The study of status belongs to sociology whereas the study of location belongs to sociology” (12). This research is closely related to my project as my research also

focuses on the involvement of human beings in the formation of space. Secondly, my research focuses on the embodiment of space in reference to heterotopia, whereas Tuan is not concerned with heterotopic spaces.

David Abraham an American ecologist and philosopher in his book *The Spell of the Sensuous* (1996) writes: “Language here is inseparable from song and story, and the songs and stories, in turn, are inseparable from the shapes and features of the land” (105). Abraham interlinks language and stories of human individuals with material space. He considers that the stories of human individuals are only described in relation to geography. As, human memory and emotions are only described in relation to some place. Places and material shape our feelings and emotions; space gives shape to our abstract emotions. Abraham relates his theory with feelings and emotions in relation to space. While my stance is different as I talk about hospital space as heterotopia and how the human body plays its role while living there.

Frédéric Gros is a French philosopher and an expert in writing Michel Foucault’s papers. He wrote many famous works in French, and they are translated into English language. One of his famous works is *A Philosophy of Walking* (2008). In this book, Gros shares his experience of walking and experiencing space. He discusses different ways of walking and gaining the experience achieved by that walk. He says that the protest March, the pilgrimage walk, gives different experiences about space. The role of walking for different purposes gives a sense of space in a different way. He relates walking experience with nature and endorses the importance of the natural world to the human psyche. My research study is different from Gros’s perspective as he talks about a general way of experiencing place while my study foregrounds Michel Foucault’s idea of heterotopia in relation with Karen Barad’s theory about agential realism and Lefebvre’s theory about production of space. By employing these theories my study attempts to fill the gap of making spaces inclusive and useful rather than exclusive. In the next heading, I discuss critical works already done on the primary text to find the research gap.

### **2.3 Works Already Done on the Primary Texts**

Abroo Nazar (2016), in her article “Silencing of Subaltern in *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*” unearths the condition of postcolonial women in Pakistani society in the city of Karachi. The term “subaltern” (2) was coined by the Italian Marxist philosopher

Antonio Gramsci for those who do not have a say in society. Identity is the most highlighted topic in postcolonial studies and therefore the protagonist Alice Bhatti: the marginalized, excluded personality is the one who faces hardships in Pakistani society. Nazar in this article talks about the condition of a Christian nurse Alice Bhatti who is considered as untouchable within Muslim community. Nazar by using theoretical framework of Gayatri Spivak's idea discussed in her essay "*Can the Subaltern Speak*" tries to explain her viewpoint through Postcolonial feminist lens. The woman Alice Bhatti is marginalized, and she is treated as "othered". Alice is the daughter of a "choorah" named Joseph Bhatti, who lives in French Colony, the word "choora" label them as something very inferior. "Alice is shown as woman who is facing the overwhelming lust of a wolfish society" (7). Different people analyzed this novel with postcolonial angle and talked about this novel through the lens of marginalization and subaltern perspective. Contrary to that my study is not dealing with the marginalization of a woman in Pakistani society; rather it focuses on the setting of the hospital space as heterotopia which acts as a place of shelter for Alice Bhatti who is considered as untouchable.

Mushtaq Bilal (2022), investigates the idea of "Pak-ness" (purity) which is the main focus of Pakistani Muslim identity. In his article "*Yes, I am Joseph Bhatti Choorah: Reading Joseph Bhatti as a Palimpsest*" Bilal tries to focus on the character of Joseph Bhatti, father of Alice Bhatti as palimpsest of multiple cultural, political and social changes through which he passes and observes multiple faces of Pakistani society. The article emphasizes the need to observe that how minorities are treated in Pakistani society as laborers and chuhars, they are not judged on their skills, but they are judged on the basis of their race and ethnicity. Joseph Bhatti goes on to claim, "I am not just the son of the soil. I am the soil (2). Thus, the reviewed article reveals that the gap here lies in the fact that my research discusses how hospital space in the novel provides position and identity to such marginalized people.

Dante Prado (2022), in his thesis "*The Crisis of Laughter at the End of the Long Nineteenth Century: Laughter in Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain**" foregrounds the element of disruptive laughter, that how Joachim and Hans Castrop through the element of laugh tries to normalize the life of psychic patients, who are passing through the phase of ambiguity and death. In tuberculosis sanatorium death and diseases are the situations faced by all patients so in that situation laughter works as a soothing element

for them. Hans's laughter acts as an opportunity for his friend Joachim to laugh against the seriousness produced by the environment inside the sanatorium. While the current research is debating on the idea of hospital space as heterotopia that how hospital space is the space which inhabit people of every class and category without any exclusion.

Paul Stenner and Monica Greco in the article "*On The Magic Mountain: The Novel as Liminal Affective Technology*" by using the theory of Arpad Szakolczai, states that contemporary novels greatly dramatize reality in an effort to help readers "find our way back to a genuine and meaningful life" (2). Szakolczai uses an analogy in his books "*Novels and the Sociology of the Contemporary*" and "*Permanent Liminality and Modernity*" to argue that novels would give sociology what dreams gave psychoanalysis. The novel in the context of "liminal affective technologies" (3) is a singular historical event. This is demonstrated further in *The Magic Mountain*, which supports Szakolczai's idea that psychosocial alterations are channeled by using affective technologies. According to Szakolczai novels are written in response to cultural activities of a group and vice versa. He used the term "theatricalisation" which suggests that such technologies are used to blur the boundaries between real and fake. He further relates this concept with Plato's criticism of the dramatization of reality. He highlights that the role of technology is not confined to novels and theaters, but it is linked to the art of paintings and sculpture as well. These thoughts can lead to the proposition that the meaning of "technology" should be questioned, introduced by Marcel Mauss (1935) and developed by Michel Foucault notion of technologies with the self. Liminal technologies require the creation of liminal experiences and feelings and therefore whether something can be classified as liminal or unimportant.

The whole concept invites examination into how experiences of liminality are occasioned. The authors prefer to call them spontaneous liminal occasions because they were not artificially or deliberately devised. They usually involve experiences that "happen to us" (4) rather than what we "do to ourselves" (6) even though there is no clear line between the two. For example, real-world liminal situations are explored by Szakolczai: "occurrences like illnesses, disasters or other crises" (7) can "equally generate ruptures with respect to existing order or structure" (7). Overall, this article enmeshes the idea of Szakolczai in relation to artificial technology and their effect on human psychology. Contrary to that my stance on the novel *The Magic Mountain* is different in a sense that in my study I fill the gap by focusing on the theory of heterotopia

in relation to material space.

Wil Gesler (2000) in his article “Hans Castorp’s journey-to-knowledge of disease and health in Thomas Mann’s *The Magic Mountain*” tries to highlight the element of health and disease through the protagonist Hans Castorp. Gesler tries to show that how knowledge about illness and health, life and death is gained by passing through multiple transitions. Gesler points out that the environment of the sanatorium provides with the pure natural environment on the mountains of Davos, Switz. Illness stories work as an element of therapy which makes other people to read the story and find solution about their experience of disease and health while living in real environment. My study is different from this research as I am focusing on the hospital space as heterotopia and how that space serves as a place of inclusion rather than exclusion. The human body is foregrounded which tries to create its own space in that heterotopia.

Ansin Berfin (2019) conducted research on Michel Foucault’s concept of Heterotopia and space in Jeanette Winterson’s *The Passion* (1987) and Orhan Pamuk’s *The Museum of Innocence* (2008). The spaces depicted in both the texts carry the baggage of heterotopic qualities and these spaces are mentioned as possessing oppressive mechanisms. Berfin has done a comparative analysis of the two novels to show how power floats between marginalized spaces and between spaces of privilege. When these two spaces come close to each other, they come across at the level of conflict and resistance. The main claim about his research work is that in normal spaces people try to exercise their power and they consider heterotopic places marginalized and oppressive. While I am also interested in studying the conflict between places of privilege and “othered” heterotopic spaces, I am making my interventions by addressing the concerns of hospital space as heterotopias through the study of intra- action forces and entanglement of materiality between human and non-human interactions.

Megan E. Fourqurean (2022) takes a plunge into the representation of postcolonial South Asian literature in terms of Agential Realism. South Asian literature and new materialism have rarely engaged in meaningful dialogue despite sharing an interest in alternate possibilities for human and nonhuman involvement. Using a new materialist analysis of Kiran Desai’s novel *Hullabaloo in the Guava Orchard*, where human and nonhuman characters interact with one another to imagine posthumanist possibilities of being in the world. Fourqurean in the novel *Hullabaloo in the Guava*

*Orchard* (1998) by Kiran Desai initially instead on focusing on the characters of the novel she investigates the interaction between human and nonhuman matter inside India's material environment. The novel's protagonist Sampath a middle-class young man living in the village of Shahkot.

When he loses his job in a local post office, he wants to leave that village space and reside in a guava orchard. He wanted to live alone within the material world away from the interaction of human beings.

As a researcher I have used this theory of Agential realism to question the boundaries that exist between human and nonhuman bodies. This research intrigued me in a sense that the researcher has used South Asian novel to find interaction between materiality of space and human beings by using Karen Barad's theory of "Agential Realism". My intervention lies in personifying the body as an embodiment of space in relation to intra-actions in a heterotopic space. Henry Lefebvre's idea of "embodiment of space" is my third supporting lens.

Karen Barad in her book *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning* (2007) in chapter four about Agential Realism: How Material Discursive Practices Matter, she redirects her focus towards performativity of matter in human life. Language, culture formation and mutual interactions among human and nonhuman agencies are considered as the fundamental elements which makes human beings survive in this world. She proposes a posthumanist performative approach to understand the phenomenology of matter in the universe in relation to human beings. She takes a step further from post-structuralist account and emphasizes the importance of matter as matter has tendency to always entangle with dialogue in the enactment of phenomena among entities. She further says that the universe is composed of intra-acting agencies that only take on definitive form if an agential cut is made. Her idea serves as the foundation for a large portion of the work in the field of information systems that is classified as sociomateriality. Her work, which is significant, questions the veracity of worldviews based on representationalism and so-called Cartesian dualism.

Contrary to her stance regarding materiality and agency of material, I have incorporated the concept of "heterotopia" by Foucault, and I aim to talk about the materiality and agency of such spaces which are being "othered" by human beings. My



analysis concerns the production of space more inclusive and dynamic as I intend to incorporate Lefebvre's concept of "Spatial Triad". For Lefebvre space produces due to mutual interaction among human beings. He gives importance to the lived spaces, and lived spaces are formed through human interaction and their daily human activities within a particular space.

Harvey Molotch (2014) redirects his focus of Lefebvre's theory about "Production of Space" in terms of how and why space is produced and reproduced. He claims that space is not something which is inherited from nature or determined on pre-established laws or values. Space is a construct which is used and consumed on the basis of profit and loss. Molotch looks at the construction of space from Marxist approach. For him, "Production" also implies that space be considered parallel to other economic goods. He further says, "Capital now actively shapes space not just to achieve ideological results or to sustain appropriate conditions for production in other spheres, but because "the market in spaces themselves"(Molotch 5). Space is a setting in the sense that it serves as the obvious foundation for all action, but it also encompasses much more. Architecture, population concentrations, and geographic relationships all influence what can be done in space. The conflict within capitalist space creates contestation, occasionally yielding open rebellion but more pervasively reflected in the power for modernization, for responsive arrangements, and for a break with imposed homogeneity.

Molotch talks about the conflicts of space within globalized world, because the whole world revolves around the hegemony of loss and profit, and it is the occupation of space and conflict between powerful stakeholders and unprivileged social class. My take of Henry Lefebvre's theory is quite different from Molotch, as he looks at the space from Marxist perspective, while I aim to incorporate this theory with Karen Barad's idea of "Agential Realism" that how space is created through mutual interaction of human and nonhuman objects.

Zachary Montgomery in his research *"The Time of space and the space of time in Benito Cereno and The Magic Mountain: Towards a Comparative Utopian Reading"* (2016) focuses on the novel with the lens of Fredric Jameson's essay *"On Form Production"*. In this essay Jameson focuses on how cultural forms are directly related with the benefits of the economy of the state. He relates cultural forms with the benefits of the capitalist state that how capitalist minds always manipulate things for the sake of

their own personal usage rather than focusing on the needs and requirements of the individuals. Similarly, Montgomery relates the value of time in relation to European flatlands occupied by the capitalist state from where Hans Castrop moves up to the isolated place of sanatorium away from the troubles of capitalist norms. The role of time between two spaces plays a vital role in the shaping Castrop's life. While talking with his cousin Hans says: 'It's as if I'd been up here two months already- that would be pure non-sense.' All I can really say is 'a very long time' (Mann 103). In the isolated sanatorium Hans Castrop feels sense of freedom and subjectivity as compared to what he calls the "flatlands" (721). Montgomery in his dissertation talks about the importance of time and space in the heterotopic place whereas my work focuses on the human agency and subjectivity inside heterotopia. Along with the theory of heterotopias I also talk about how the human body uses the agency in the production of space.

I have employed Lefebvre's theory from his book "The Production of Space" (1974) for making my argument more lucid and nuanced.

Sourav Paul and Dr Shri Krishan Rai (2018) in their article "*Sexual Violence and Sainthood: A Critical Study of Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*" foregrounds the notion of sexual violence with the protagonist of the novel Alice Bhatti and questions the power of sainthood existing inside Alice. She is a nurse in the Sacred Hospital where she makes certain predictions about the future, and she also brings back a dead child to life. But Paul and Rai in this article highlight this problem that why Alice Bhatti became the victim of sexual abuse and violence and even she died and couldn't use those powers to save her own life. In this article the co-authors highlight the Dr. Terry Rey's essay "*Junta, Rape, and Religion in Haiti, 1993-1994*" in which he talks about the involvement of religion in women molestation. Sexual abuse and violence is considered as something normal in certain societies and it is not considered as something serious for society until and unless something happens to the person himself. "Alice Bhatti's body is a battleground of different ideas and ideologies" (5). She resists back to the unethical behavior of the people who speak against the self-respect of a woman. In the present century Alice prove herself as a challenging figure for a male chauvinistic society. This novel is a social satire on the normal behavior and attitude of the people as well. That is how people humiliate other human beings who belong to marginalized community or the one who don't have say in the society. Alice Bhatti is not only being raped by the Junior in the Sacred hospital, but her husband also throw acid on her face

to kill her.

By presenting such incidents, Hanif highlights this brutal face of the male dominating society. As male members think that only they have the right to live their life in the way they want. Paul and Rai in this article talk about the brutality of male dominating society in the city of Karachi Pakistan. They highlight the element of sainthood as well, which does not prove affective for Alice, as she has this miracle power of saving life of human beings by using her spirituality but these powers do not prove helpful for herself. Contrary to that, my thesis talks about the hospital space as heterotopias and how such spaces appear as places of inclusion for those who are marginalized and excluded from the normal living standard. Along with the idea of heterotopia my thesis talks about the agentive power of human beings by using Karen Barad's theory of agential realism that how people attain power and knowledge from such places and how these places help them to survive in the normal space.

To sum up, the purpose of my research project is to situate the idea of "heterotopia" in my selected primary texts as a space which entangles both human and nonhuman agencies to create a plural space. To achieve this purpose, I have invoked the concepts of "Agential Realism" proposed by Karen Barad in her book *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning* (2007) and the concept of "Spatial Triad" by Henry Lefebvre in *The Production of Space* (1974). The human body has been used as an embodiment of space that moves between heterotopic and normative space and experiences a transition between two spaces and creates spatial consciousness. Spatial consciousness pluralizes us in a lived space and the human body is figured, configured, and reconfigured in terms of exploitation, economically, politically and culturally. This consciousness has been expressed in our lived spaces if we recognize them and look for them. This consciousness about how space oppresses, encloses, dominates, shapes, and frustrates our daily lives will be given to have a new form of radical subjectivity.

My literature review helps me contextualize my research with the available critical scholarship and point out the gaps therein. The selected texts *The Magic Mountain* (1924) by Thomas Mann and *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* (2011) by Mohammad Hanif are focused through the lens of hospital space as "heterotopia". I have not reviewed my principle and supporting theorists' works because I discuss them in Chapter Three in detail. This review has also helped me affirm my theoretical

framework and research methodology that I discussed in the next chapter.

## CHAPTER 3

### THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK AND RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

#### 3.1 Introduction

The review of secondary sources in the second chapter of literature review has proved helpful in determining the suitability of theoretical support for examining the selected primary texts. In reference to theoretical framework, it has enabled me to clearly select my research methods and methodology in line with the research gap which I have found while performing literature review. In this chapter, I give a rationale for my theoretical framework that I deploy as a support for reading the selected texts. First, I explain my theoretical framework and then I discuss research methodology for my research project.

#### 3.2 Theoretical Framework

The proposed study is conducted by principally invoking Foucault's concept of "heterotopia". Together with his idea, I am employing a bricolage of theoretical positions in order to read my texts and vindicate my argument. The theoretical underpinnings of the texts are selected from three different works: the concept of "heterotopia" from Foucault's *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences* (1966), the idea of "Agential Realism" from Karen Barad's *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning* (2007) and "Spatial Triad" from Henry Lefebvre's *The Production of Space* (1974). In his essay, Foucault presents six principles about heterotopia. Theorizing this idea, Foucault writes:

There are also, probably in every culture, in every civilization, real places— places that do exist and that are formed in the very founding of society— which are something like counter-sites, a kind of effectively enacted utopia in which the real sites, all the other real sites that can be found within the culture, are simultaneously represented, contested, and

inverted. Places of this kind are outside of all places, even though it may be possible to indicate their location in reality. Because these places are absolutely different from all the sites that they reflect and speak about, I shall call them, by way of contrast to utopias,

heterotopias. (4)

For Foucault, heterotopia is the counter-site where the rules and laws of the normal space are being questioned. These places are true depictions of utopia and they work as a mirror, as they reflect the true condition of human existence. He further states that:

Heterotopias are disturbing, probably because they secretly undermine language because they make it impossible to name this and that, because they shatter or tangle common names, because they destroy 'syntax' in advance, and not only the syntax with which we construct sentences but also that less apparent syntax which causes words and things (next to and opposite one another) to 'hold together. (Foucault 16)

The term “heterotopia” is basically a medical term which emerges out of the displaced organ of the body from its normal condition. Foucault gives this idea of heterotopia because he thinks that normal space is classified and divided into many categories. This division is for the benefit of the dominating authorities whereas the masses are not getting any benefit from this categorization system. Michel Foucault gets the understanding of heterotopia by reading the Chinese encyclopedia “*Celestial Emporium of Benevolent Knowledge*”. In this book, animals are categorized as follows:

(a) belonging to the Emperor, (b) embalmed, (c) tame, (d) sucking pigs, (e) sirens, (f) fabulous, (g) stray dogs, (h) included in the present classification, (i) frenzied, (j) innumerable, (k) drawn with a very fine camelhair brush, (l) et cetera, (m) having just broken the water pitcher, (n) that from a long way off look like flies. (42)

Interpreting the above list, Foucault considers each concept as political in terms of heterotopia, as each point gives a different ray of meaning to it. The above-mentioned categorization creates hierarchy in normal space, and it makes the space restricted for the downtrodden and powerless people.

He got further understanding of the idea of heterotopia from a short story “*Funes the Memorious*” written by Borges. In the story Funes is a man who after falling from the horse remembers and recalls everything with minute details. Focusing on each and every moment passed in his life, he did not follow the traditional ways of thinking and interpreting things. His memory does not follow the actual pattern of the language and he uses the language in jumbled form. He uses language to fill up the gaps which create hindrance in understanding the meaning of the words. This heterotopic language helps him understand the world in a new way. This is the actual account through which Foucault relates the notion of heterotopia with Funes memory, as memory works same like heterotopic spaces which are interlinked in a juxtaposed state as they possess layers and layers of meaning in multifaceted form.

The selected texts in this study are read to analyze hospital space as heterotopia. It is the term coined by Foucault to create a relationship between “othered” and normative spaces. Foucault in his essay “*Of Other Spaces: Utopias and Heterotopias*” further elaborates that: “We do not live inside a void that could be colored with diverse shades of light, we live inside a set of relations that delineates sites which are irreducible to one another and absolutely not super imposable on one another” (3). As, the possibility of human survival is based on the mutual interaction of human and non-human objects in the world. By unsettling the normal and usual way of looking and observing space, it helps us to question the dominant prevailing laws of society and rupture the binary relations built within spaces. The existence of heterotopia helps the human mind to understand the reality of this existing world and these places challenge the dominant social constructs. In the next heading I have explained the theory of new materialism in relation to agential realism proposed by Karen Barad.

### **3.3 Theory of New Materialism and Agential Realism**

Expounded in her 2007 book, *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning*, Karen Barad’s theory of “new materialism” and “agential realism” is crucial to my theoretical framework and analysis of the texts. New materialism holds the idea that this material world is not a static entity, and the material space remains in a flux. The unrest state of the material world in relation to the human body makes this world a living place. Barad’s idea posits that objects do not exist in isolation, but the relationship between subject and object is created through the interaction between them. Gilles Deleuze a French Philosopher and

Felix Guattari a French psychoanalyst worked together and wrote a few books together. One of the popular books they wrote together is *A Thousand Plateaus Capitalism and Schizophrenia* (1980). In this book, they discuss the fluid nature of material in so many places, they refer to this material as:

The matter of expression, "grass stem," acts as a component of passage between the territorial assemblage and the courtship assemblage. The fact that the grass stem has an increasingly rudimentary function in certain species, the fact that it tends to cancel out in the series under consideration, is not enough to make it a vestige, much less a symbol. A matter of expression is never a vestige or a symbol. The grass stem is a deterritorialized component, or one en route to deterritorialization. (324)

This means that matter tends to express itself, just like a grass root which is intact with its root place but through the material object it emerges and makes a rhizomatic structure of its existence on the surface of the earth. The grass root expresses fluidity of meaning in terms of cultural relations and therefore it depicts that matter possess multiplicity of meaning inside it. Many thinkers and philosophers such as Rosi Braidotti, Elizabeth Grosz, Jane Bennett, Vicki Kirby, and Manuel DeLanda talked about new materialism in different perspectives because this is an interdisciplinary field of study for both the humanities and natural sciences. Bruno Latour in his book "*We Have Never Been Modern*" states that: "History is no longer simply the history of people; it becomes the history of natural things as well" (82).

He endorsed the importance of material space in relation to human history, as history does not solely depend on human subjectivity though it depends on material history as well. The natural objects, ecosystem, surroundings of the individual play a vital role in shaping and reshaping human history, we cannot solely rely on one thing while neglecting the other. From this huge strain of study, I have used the concept of Karen Barad's idea of agential realism in terms of defining material space possessing fluidity of meaning in the form of "intra-actions". I have talked about the theory of agential realism in the next heading.

Karen Barad is an American feminist theorist, currently working at the University of California Santa Cruz and co-director of the Science & Justice Graduate Training Program, funded by the National Science Foundation. The other theory which I have selected is the theory of "Agential Realism" proposed by Karen Barad for considering matter and



discourse in their intra-active inseparability and inseparably enacting practices. Her idea of “Agential Realism” may be simplified that human and nonhuman things do not just relate with each other but they depend on each other. The myths about coherent binaries collapse by opening new ways of mutual performativity of human and nonhuman agency. She defines agential realist account in the following fashion: “In an agential realist account, matter does not refer to a fixed substance; rather, the matter is a substance in its intra-active becoming-not a thing but a doing, a congealing of the agency. The matter is a stabilizing and destabilizing process of iterative intra-activity” (151). Barad focuses the world of fluid relationships, the world where human and nonhuman things interact and gives importance to production of bodies and formation of their identities. I have comprehensively explained below how I attempt to substantiate my point by invoking the theory proposed by Karen Barad about agential realism.

### **3.3.1 Performance of Matter in Human Life**

Barad, in her book, *Meeting the Universe Halfway*, makes matter the centre of discussion instead of language and culture. She enforced the notion of matter eagerly and states that: “There is an important sense in which the only thing that doesn't seem to matter anymore is matter” (132). Our discursive practice within a particular space involve the interaction of matter unknowingly because it is the matter which provides life to language and culture without matter and without discursive practice we cannot perform our actions inside this world. “The world is an open process of mattering through which mattering itself acquires meaning and form through the realization of different agential possibilities” (141). Barad quotes Foucault’s statement in her book and mentions the importance of discursive practices.

According to Foucault: “discursive practices are the local sociohistorical material conditions that enable and constrain disciplinary knowledge practices such as speaking, writing, thinking, calculating, measuring, filtering, and concentrating” (147). Agential realism acknowledges that all material things have agency which can bring difference in the world. This agency is not confined to human beings only, but it’s a mutual activity of creating a productive space to live in. “Reality is composed not of things in- themselves or things-behind-phenomena but of things-in-phenomena” (Barad 140). Barad gives importance to “agential cuts” and states that “agential cuts, cut things together and apart” (381). Agential cuts point towards the idea that the boundaries

created between humans and nonhumans do not exist, and agency is not limited to human power only but it is disseminated across a set of connections. These cuts open up new ways in understanding human and nonhuman interaction. The entanglement of human and nonhuman material things are connected through these cuts. By doing so, agential realism seeks to open up new ways of understanding the world, beyond the confines of the traditional norms.

Barad, in relation to materiality of space, endorses the notion of inclusion and diversity and interconnects the multiple ideas on one platform. Her simplest description about agential realism is explained by her as follows:

Agential realism does not simply pose a different dynamic (substituting one set of laws for another); it introduces an altogether different understanding of dynamics. It is not merely that the form of the causal relations has been changed, but the very notions of causality, as well as agency, space, time, and matter, are all reworked. Indeed, in this account, the very nature of change and the possibilities for change changes in an ongoing fashion as part of the world's intra-active dynamism. (179)

The theory of agential realism talks about the transformative nature of objects, space and time in the world. For the understanding of power dynamics in the world one has to connect with dynamic inter-connected reality of elements in the world. Barad engages with the idea of Judith Butler's theory of performativity and illustrates that Butler's theory of performativity is based on power relations while in contrast to his theory she states that:

In contrast to Butler's more singular focus on the human body and social forces, crucially, the framework of agential realism does not limit its reassessment of the matter of bodies to the realm of the human (or to the body's surface) or to the domain of the social. In fact, it calls for a critical examination of the practices by which the differential boundaries of the human and the nonhuman, and the social and the natural, are drawn, for these very practices are always already implicated in particular materializations. In my agential realist account, matter as a process of materialization is theorized beyond the realm of the human and the social, providing a more complete and complex understanding of the nature of practices (including regulatory ones) and their participatory role in the production of bodies. (Barad 209).

### 3.4 Henry Lefebvre's Theory of the Production of Space

Henry Lefebvre, in his seminal work, *The Production of Space* (1974), lays out the famous “spatial triad” which asserts a dialectical relationship between space and society. The use of ‘triad’ in this construction refers to three basic elements. The first one is spatial practice (perceived space) which designates society’s organized physical spaces and divides and separates the built environment in material and ideological terms. Spatial practice is concerned with the materiality of the things around us. It includes buildings, routes, networks and daily human interaction with material things. Lefebvre states that “Spatial practice, which embraces production and reproduction, and the particular locations and spatial sets characteristic of each social formation (33). Overall spatial practice is a fundamental element of our daily life. It shapes the human body in relation to the daily human interaction around the world.

The second is representation of space (conceived space) which is the dominant space in any society, conceptualized by possessors of expert knowledge such as city planners and architects. “Representations of space must therefore have a substantial role and a specific influence in the production of space” (42). The third kind is representational spaces (lived spaces) which are the spaces of lived experience-directly encountered through everyday practices. They are the spaces of daily life that stand in contrast with structured and regulated, hegemonic space. Lefebvre’s spaces of representation are the physical and mental moments in spatial reality combined into social space.

Each triadic element is dynamically associated to the others, and they assist to make sense of the social patterns that collectively produce space. Lefebvre’s eventual objective is to show that the production of space necessarily involves its interaction with social relations. With the claim that “authentic knowledge of space must address the question of its production” (388). Arguing that space is a fundamental element of our practice of the world around us, Lefebvre sets forth a conceptual triad for understanding space and its social production.

\In this study, Michel Foucault’s concept of “Heterotopia” serves as a foundational lens through which hospital space is analyzed. This challenges conventional norms and binary relations. The analysis is enriched by Karen Barad's "Agential Realism" which highlights the interdependence of human and nonhuman entities in shaping the world by focusing on mutual performativity. Furthermore, Henry Lefebvre's "Spatial Triad"

offers a dialectical framework that intricate interplay between space and society, encompassing spatial practices, representations of space, and lived experiences. Together, these theoretical perspectives congregate to unveil the complexities of hospital space as heterotopia, by shaping and reshaping our understanding of its social construction and the entangled agencies within.

Lefebvre thinks that space is not like a glass of water or a container which comes into existence when we fill up but space is formed by the interaction of the people and the activities they perform in a particular space. He states that:

It is not the work of a moment for a society to generate (produce) an appropriated social space in which it can achieve a form by means of self-presentation and self-representation - a social space to which that society is not identical, and which indeed is its tomb as well as its cradle. This act of creation is, in fact, a process. (34)

Lefebvre also holds this notion of continuous progress and effort of both human and non-human elements, in the production and formation of a living space. The formation of a space is a difficult and ongoing process and it keeps on evolving and redefining, according to the social needs of the individuals.

This theoretical framework helps in making the heterotopic space inclusive rather than exclusive. In both the selected texts, the human body has been foregrounded as an embodiment of space that remains in a state of transition in heterotopic and normative spaces that develop radical subjectivity among human relations. As I have elaborated the theoretical perspectives and relevant key concepts that I have applied in this study, I now turn to discussing the research methodology and methods that I have used in my research work.

### **3.5 Research Methodology**

This project is located in the qualitative paradigm and, that is why, it is suitable for qualitative analysis. An interpretive and exploratory approach is used to critically read the selected texts, *The Magic Mountain* (1924) and *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* (2011). Qualitative research is non-generalizable research, that is why it is written in discursive mode. Qualitative research, according to Creswell and Poth (2016), is a study which locates the viewer inside the world by interpreting the material practices that construct the visible world. Since qualitative researchers scrutinize the ordinary order

of the world and engage in a process to find meaning, this research interprets the material processes in the hospital spaces in the selected primary texts.

### 3.6 Textual Analysis

The present research uses Catherine Belsey's "Textual Analysis as a Research Method" for an intensive exploration of the language of the text. Catherine Belsey supports this idea in her essay "*Textual Analysis as a Research Method*," included in Gabriele Griffin's book "*Research Methods for English Studies*" (2005). She writes that "textual analysis is indispensable to research in cultural criticism, where cultural criticism includes English, cultural history and cultural studies, as well as any other discipline that focuses on texts" (157). I, as a researcher agree with Belsey when she uses Roland Barthes's idea of reader as "the 'destination' of the text" (161) and, especially, when she explains the position of the reader through an analogy with the position of (common) people after they took charge of their destiny in the French Revolution. "Barthes's manifesto," Belsey notes, "has to locate the reader in the place of the people [in the French Revolution]" who is free to interpret text without the restrictive influence of the "institution" (162). By "institution," Belsey (possibly) means those critics who interpret all literary works in terms of the writers' intentions and their biography. She uses "critical institution" (dismissively) twice on page 162 for the same kind of critics. She, in fact, tries to explain Barthes' idea in ("Death of the Author") of a free reader who looks to the text and not to author's biography and intention for his interpretation.

The purpose of choosing this method is that it rejects the finality of a single signifier and promotes multiplicity of meaning and interpretation through an intensive investigation of binary pairs in opposition. This method deconstructs the binary relations between entities and provides open ended reading of the text. Textual analysis is a type of qualitative analysis that focuses on the essential ideologies and cultural assumptions hidden inside a text. It makes readers to close read the text in order to develop his/her own argument towards a particular angle. Belsey's method establishes reading as a meaning-making process. In her words, 'textual analysis' is a "close encounter with the work itself, an examination of the details without bringing to them more presuppositions" (160). The reader and the text engage in a dialogue where the reader absorbs the text with meaning based on the ways it invites or offers to be read. Belsey believes in the multiplicity of meaning and rejects the absoluteness of one single

meaning. She emphasizes on poststructuralist approach in meaning-making process. She asserts that:

The text [works] as a tissue of signifiers, then, makes certain demands on the textual analyst, provides the material for analysis. That material is by no means an empty space, a vacancy into which we pour whatever we like; instead, the text itself participates in the process of signification (167).

The text possesses multiple layers of meaning inside it, and makes the reader to analyze it by using open ended approach. The text itself guides and informs the critical process of understanding the inherent structure of the text. Therefore, textual analysis demands a critical eye to read a particular text to construct meaning out of it.

A poststructuralist reading of a particular text demands multiplicity of meanings because, for Belsey, each sign gives different meanings to different readers. Belsey associates textual analysis with poststructuralist interpretive paradigm and writes: “We can see how interpretations come to differ from each other. Although meanings are not at our disposal, we not only iterate them with a difference, however infinitesimal; we also recognize them with a difference, however marginal” (165). The reading of hospital space as “heterotopia in relation to Agential Realism and the embodiment of space, in the selected texts, unveil the differences at play within the heterotopic space and a normal space.

To conclude, the theoretical perspectives and the research methodology that I have employed for my research are useful in analyzing my primary texts. With clarity on theoretical support and research methodology I set out to critically analyze the selected texts in the next chapter.

## CHAPTER 4

### HUMAN BODY AS AN EMBODIMENT OF SPACE IN THOMAS MANN'S *THE MAGIC MOUNTAIN*

#### 4.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I critically examine Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain*<sup>3</sup> from the perspective of heterotopia to explore how and to what extent his work depicts the Sanatorium Berghof as heterotopia and how this space emerges as inclusive rather than exclusive. In his work, *Of Other Spaces*, Foucault refers to heterotopia as a place which is excluded from the normal living spaces in the world. He states: "The heterotopia is capable of juxtaposing in a single real place several spaces, several sites that are in themselves incompatible" (121). It is a place which does not force individuals to follow certain rules, in that space though individuals feel a sense of belongingness.

This is a fact that in every culture and society these spaces co-exist within normal space, where human activities are performed in routine. As Foucault states: "heterotopias . . . have a function in relation to all the space that remains" (6). Mann's *TMM* seems to ascribe with Foucault's viewpoint. Therefore, in the ongoing chapter, I am concerned to investigate the role of hospital (Sanatorium Berghof) that how it appears as a place of inclusion rather than exclusion as portrayed in Mann's text.

Karen Barad's agential realism enriches our understanding of heterotopia by emphasizing the active, entangled, and agentic nature of space. It challenges us to view heterotopias as dynamic places of interaction, contestation, and transition, where many realities coexist and change rather than merely as physical places. This viewpoint promotes a more thorough investigation of the ways in which human and non-human actors form and is influenced by places, which advances our knowledge of the social, cultural, and political ramifications of spatial behaviors.

---

<sup>3</sup>Henceforth, I use TMM as abbreviation of *The Magic Mountain* across the thesis for citations.

A German novelist, philanthropist, critic, essayist and the 1929 Nobel Prize winner in Literature, Paul Thomas Mann was born in the year 1875 in the house of a salesman situated on the North Sea in the medieval town of Lubeck. He studied science at Lubeck Gymnasium Secondary School. Later, he joined Ludwig Maximilians University of Munich and The Technical University of Munich, along with the study of Journalism he continued his studies in Literature, History and Economics. Mann lived in Munich from 1891-1933 and later he moved to Davos, Switzerland. His early work focused on the problems of the creativity of the artists, he thinks that it is very difficult for a creative artist to relate imagination with reality. For him imagination, art and reality are the true elements which make the piece of literary work more vivid and apprehensive.

The outburst of World War I made Mann understand his responsibility as a writer. He wrote first time for the German magazine *Simplicissium* and his first story got published in the year 1898. He was the second child in his family, his mother had a great interest in music, and therefore, he was exposed to the life of music at a very early age. His epic work *Buddenbrooks* (1901) is an autobiographical book in which Mann has presented how moral decay directly affects the physical representation of human beings. His writings made him understand his ownself. His lecture *The German Republic* (1922) and the essay *Goethe and Tolstoy* (1923) were the most noteworthy works of his achievement. In the year 1905 Mann got married to Katja Pringsheim, she helped Mann in his writings and made him to fully devote himself to his work.

The characters in his novels have a complex nature which transforms throughout their journey in a constructive way. Major themes related to his works include: a psychological and transformative change of an individual, spiritual, philosophical and mental growth of an individual. His other notable works to name a few includes *Death in Venice* (1912), *Doctor Faustus* (1947), *Joseph and His Brothers* (1948). During the Second World War, Mann, along with his wife, moved in a sanatorium because his wife was suffering from tuberculosis and she was the first patient of that time who was admitted in Wald Sanatorium in Davos, Switzerland. By getting inspiration from his wife's will and inner strength he thought of writing the philosophical novel *The Magic Mountain* (1924).

*The Magic Mountain* is one of the most famous novels of Mann's writings notable for unique narrative technique that blends third-person omniscience with



occasional first-person commentary. The novel has an interdisciplinary approach because it provides the knowledge about art, science and literature. The specialty about the novel is that the author has used very philosophical language, and the way characters perceive this world, by neglecting the negative elements of the outer world is one of the interesting elements of the novel. The word choice of this novel is very intriguing, because the conversation between the characters in the novel opens new avenues of understanding this world. Time and space work as a quest of self-discovery of the individuals. Everyone who lives inside sanatorium has a different and unique personality since they perceive this world as immortal and do not care for the death. Death is considered natural phenomena that is the reason these elements combine to create a work that is not only a expression of its time but also a timeless exploration of human experience and intellectual inquiry.

I have examined Mann's *The Magic Mountain* under the following sub-headings:

- The embracing ambience of heterotopia
- Material space in relation to human body as an agentive subject
- Human body as an embodiment of space
- Othering as productive approach

#### **4.2. The Embracing Ambience of Heterotopia**

*The Magic Mountain* was published in the year 1924. It is one of the most significant works of twentieth century literature. This novel is set in the pre-war era, before World War I. Mann wrote this novel during his stay inside a sanatorium as his wife was diagnosed as having pulmonary tuberculosis. Mann, for the first time, analyzed the world of sanatorium as something which has a wide and realistic impression on his mental health. The ambience and setting of the sanatorium at the top high altitude made him write this novel *The Magic Mountain*. My analysis in this chapter centers around the idea of heterotopia by Michel Foucault and how the human body itself appears as an agency by using the notion of embodied space that how a particular space is shaped and reshaped through the orientation and physical movement of the human body. Putting into question this element of embodied spaces an American anthropologist and a cross-cultural researcher Edward Twitchell Hall, the American cultural anthropologist in his book *The Hidden Dimension* (1966) introduced the term

“proxemics”, the use of space in terms of the way people interact with each other. Hall states that “individuals are surrounded by a bubble of personal space the size of which varies according to social relationship and setting” (1). The change in human behavior depends on the fluctuation of the space available around the human body. Embodied space is the location through which the human body during the experience takes on material and spatial form. *The Magic Mountain* is a bildungsroman novel, based on the protagonists’ moral and spiritual growth in terms of change in behavior.

The story of novel is based on the spiritual and mental growth of a young twenty-three years old engineer Hans Castorp. The most intriguing thing about this novel is that this novel is bildungsroman, and it focuses on the mental and psychological growth of the protagonist inside heterotopias which is considered as “othered”. The places which are neglected and excluded from the norms of society are appearing as the spaces of growth and reformation and such places are playing a vital role in producing positive human beings for the society. He leaves behind his career-oriented thoughts and leads towards International Sanatorium Berghof to meet his cousin Joachim Ziemssen who is a soldier by profession. Joachim serves in the military as a lieutenant. But later, he becomes ill and is suffering from tuberculosis. This novel depicts the mental, physical and psychological change in the character of the protagonist in the following words: “Space like time, engenders forgetfulness; but it does so by setting us bodily free from our surroundings and giving us back our primitive, unattached state” (*TMM* 4). This is the state of Hans Castorp as after entering into heterotopia he feels free from the shackles of his daily life activities like his job and the social responsibilities as an engineer which he was performing in his usual life.

### **4.3. Material Space in Relation to Human body as an Agentive Subject**

The opening chapter of the novel, “Arrival”, informs the reader that Hans Castorp moves from his native city of Hamburg to Davos Platz for three weeks visit only. But later in the chapters we come to know that he stays inside sanatorium for seven long years. This is the most intriguing point of the novel which shows that the ambiance and material space of the hospital which is considered as “othered” makes the protagonist stay inside the Bergof Sanatorium for the time span of seven long years. Mann by focusing at the importance of space writes that “Space, like time, engenders forgetfulness; but it does so by setting us bodily free from our surroundings and giving

us back our primitive, unattached state” (*TMM* 4). He compares material space with time and memory, as when the human body is surrounded by some environment it shapes and reshapes our physical being by detaching human body from the uncertainties and providing a sense of freedom to them. When Hans meets his friend Joachim he says to Hans that he is going to see some things “you’ve never dreamed of-just wait” (7). Time and again in the novel Joachim and Hans compare the life on the top of the mountains “up here” (8) and the life down there which shows that people living inside heterotopia shape their mind and personality according to that place and they don’t think the world is much better outside that heterotopia.

The starting chapters of the novel, provide the detail regarding Sanatorium Berghof, Hans keep on exploring the material space of the sanatorium he likes the paint, colour, walls and the furniture available inside the sanatorium: “What a nice room!” (12), which shows that Joachim gets indulged in the materiality of the space surrounding him. In the chapter “In the Restaurant” Joachim moves inside the restaurant for dinner, in that place he comes to know that the waitresses were called as “dining-room girls” (16) he had never heard this name before in the world down the mountain. As, he thinks that waitresses are not given much respect ever in the world outside of the sanatorium and they are humiliated and insulted because of having low standard jobs down there. By reading the vocabulary of this novel and the words used for the workers in the sanatorium, Joachim becomes astonished as he enjoys the meal for the first time in his whole life which he never enjoyed in the outside world of sanatorium. He considers it an event for himself “a break in the everlasting monotony” (16). He enjoys the passing time on the top of the mountains and considers life as something like paradise. He thinks that time is passing very fast “living up here” (16). Karen Barad’s idea of agential realism is enmeshed here with the living condition of Joachim inside sanatorium.

She states that: “Meaning is not a property of individual words or groups of words but an ongoing performance of the world in its differential dance of intelligibility and unintelligibility” (149). Similarly, Joachim’s understanding regarding his surroundings does not solely depend on his subjectivity but his ongoing living experience inside the space makes him to understand the world of sanatorium. Baston Bachelard in his book, “*The Poetics of Space*” (1958) talks about the relationship between human existences in relation to the interconnectedness of human memory with

space. “Memories are motionless, and the more securely they are fixed in space, the sounder they are” (9). He takes the initiative of explaining the importance of tiny objects occupying huge space in our life. He highlights the importance of drawers and corners of the room and defines that even such tiny objects possess a huge space in our life and we get attached to their existence.

Bachelard’s idea of affiliation with the things and objects resonates with my idea of the embodied spaces in a sense that Hans Castrop while living in sanatorium with his friend compares everything with the world inside and world down there. Hans looks down at the world outside heterotopia through the lens of kaleidoscopic perspective, an angle which has multiplicity of meanings inside it and which does not differentiate people on the basis of their caste, ethnicity and race. He analyses everything in a positive way. Kaleidoscopic perception talks about inclusivity of things inside a phenomenon. Hans comes across a new and innovative type of vocabulary used by the patients and nurses in sanatorium. The patients, instead of considering themselves weak and ill, remain positive and they call themselves the “Half-Lung Club” (*TMM* 60) everyone knows them with this name. Such kind of philosophical thinking of the people living in sanatorium diverts this notion of “otherness” a label attached to the people living inside heterotopia. For them disease and illness are a part of life and bad time in life makes people to remain intact with each other and bad time brings positive attitude among humans. As Joachim clarifies to Hans that people have certain groups inside sanatorium just like the half-lung club and they consider disease like “pneumothorax brings people together” (60). They think that diseases and hardships in life are the things which connect human beings together. The novel does not talk about the individuals, but it is a transitional novel which depicts temporal and spatial changes along with the outbreak of World War I.

The atmosphere inside sanatorium is a universe of peace but the world outside is full of chaos, sufferings and conflicts among the people. The structure and construction of the sanatorium is unique. The hall was constructed in a modern style to give “the right touch of individuality” (51) and “everybody seemed in good spirits” (53).

The ambience of the sanatorium seems imaginative and unreal as everything gives the idea of a utopian way of living in society. As Barad’s idea of “agential cuts” as “different agential cuts produce different phenomena” (175) truly assembles the

living condition of not only Joachim and Hans but other characters in the novel as well. Kelvin Knight in his dissertation “*Real Places and Impossible Spaces: Foucault’s Heterotopia in the Fiction of James Joyce, Vladimir Nabokov, and W.G. Sebald*” quotes Foucault’s words as heterotopia “dissolves our myths and sterilize the lyricism of our sentences. They destroy ‘syntax’ in advance, and not only the syntax with which we construct sentences but also that less apparent syntax which causes words and things (next to and also opposite one another) to ‘hold together (15). Syntax and language along with the material space of the certain characters in the novel makes this novel more fascinating and philosophical. Language and conversation are the elements which gives power and agency to the characters in the novel. The most prominent characters in the novel involved in philosophical talk are Mr. Herr Settembrini and Professor Naphta. They talk with each other on the importance of death and life. Settembrini considers death as “absence of life” (22) while Naphta is a nihilist, he rejects the idea of Settembrini about death and says that death has its own charm and peace. In Settembrini’s words Naphta “is always searching for new combinations, new associations and adaptations, new shades of meaning proper to the time. You saw how he surprised even me by his theories” (411).

Edward William Soja, a postmodern political geographer and urbanist presented his theory on third space. Soja categorizes urban space in to three layers just like Henry Lefebvre as he was much inspired by his idea of the production of space. He considers the first space which exists in real world, where we live. The second space is the conceived space which exists in the mind of the people and about the third space he states:

Everything comes together in Thirdspace: subjectivity and objectivity, the abstract and the concrete, the real and the imagined, the knowable and the unimaginable, the repetitive and the differential, structure and agency, mind and body, consciousness and the unconscious, the disciplined and the transdisciplinary, everyday life and unending history.  
(56)

Thirdspace for Soja is the space, which gathers everything together, it is the place where dichotomy of subject/object does not exist. Thirdspace for Soja is the space of inclusion,

he endorses on the connection of living and non-living things in Thirdspace. Soja further clarifies his idea about third space as: “the space where all places are, capable of being seen from every angle, each standing clear; but also a secret and conjectured object, filled with illusions and allusions, a space that is common to all of us yet never able to be completely seen and understood, an “unimaginable universe,” or as Lefebvre would put it, “the most general of products” (56). Even Soja’s idea of third space talks about the inclusion of each and everything existing in the world and there is no idea of exclusion of the entities existing around the globe.

Third space opens multiple ways and meanings for human beings. It is the space which opens doors for everyone to practice the space in the way they want. Similarly, inside Sanatorium Berghof The conversation between Leo Naphta, Lodovico Settembrini and Hans Castorp is the most philosophical conversation about life, death and cultural manifestations which takes place between three of them inside Sanatorium Berghof. Naphta often making use of Spanish phrases in his narrative and descriptions. Thus he would speak of the “dos banderas’ —the two standards — the Satanic and the celestial, beneath which the armies gathered for the great struggle: the one near Jerusalem, where Christ was the “Capitan general” of all the faithful, the other on the plains of Babylon, of which the “caudillo” or chieftain was Lucifer (447).

The views on religion and existence of God make both characters to talk on religion, faith, Islam and chaotic world. Naphta mostly believes in paradoxical views on mysticism and religion and Settembrini talks about moral values and enlightening ideas. living inside heterotopia makes their identity more Their intellectual debate reflects their knowledge and scholarly attributes which depicts that how living inside hospital space makes them to converse about the things which brings nuanced ideas in human mind:

[Y]et with all the polished elegance of a full-dress debate —as were, indeed, all engagements between Settembrini and Naphta — such a dispute is in itself highly diverting to hear, even for those who understand but little of it or its bearing. Strangers sitting near them listened in amaze to the exchange of words and were chained to the spot by the passion and brilliance displayed. (519)

Certain debates in the novel on life and death, theology and philosophy, liberalism and individualism, reason and reality, inner and spiritual self of human beings in relation to conflicts and existence on human life on this earth, gives this novel a new turn. As characters living inside such places, they have more knowledge about the things other than the people living in a normal space. About life and death Settembrini thinks human life means progress in terms of growth and enlightenment. He thinks that man's life has a purpose and man should avail opportunities in life, "disease and death is only another expression of interest in life" (495). The patients living inside the Sanatorium do not consider disease as something fatal or havoc, for them it is a normal condition of human beings. "Death has no mastery over my thoughts. For therein lies goodness and love of humankind, and in nothing else. Death is a great power. One takes off one's hat before him and goes weavily on tiptoe" (496).

After awakening from his dream and listening to the conversations of Settembrini and professor Naphta, Hans Castrop considers life in a different way. The conversations and discussions inside the hospital space keep on shaping and reshaping the mental state of not only Hans but the other people as well. "For the sake of goodness and love, man shall let death have no sovereignty over his thoughts" (496). His ideas and perception about life keeps on changing as Joachim said to him in the start that "one's ideas get changed" (8). This change is due to the living conditions and the material space that makes Hans's perception totally altered. Professor Naphta considers Alchemy not only the process of changing metal to gold but symbolically as a metaphor he relates it to the spiritual purification of human beings. "The primary symbol of alchemic transmutation, Naphta said, "was par excellence the sepulchre." For him the death brings purification, transformation and spiritual essence in the human body and this is not something strange and it is the natural phenomena.

The novel itself is an embodiment of intertextual phenomena and the most intriguing thing is that the people who are considered "othered" appear to be philosophical and think about the betterment of the people living in society. Settembrini while arguing with Hans Castrop states that: "the friend of humanity cannot recognize a distinction between what is political and what is not" (515). Settembrini thinks that the true human being does not care for his personal benefits as politics is not limited to government and authorities only, but the masses also consider everything politically and look for their own personal benefits. Settembrini gives importance to "Masonic

thought” (515) a blend of political, ethical and moral ideas which is not political, and which looks for the equal rights of all human beings. In the next section, I have explained the role of the human body which helps in making spaces productive and meaningful.

#### **4.4 Human Body as an Embodiment of Space**

The other thing which makes the environment of the Sanatorium entertaining and attractive is the condition of the weather. The snowy weather makes the patients of the Sanatorium cheerful and contented. Hans spends long hours on the balcony of sanatorium Berghof. In the main dining area, people talk about the importance of snowy weather and the newcomers including tourists plan to do ski-joring. Patients inside the space became happy due to the changing weather and they plan to watch such activities of the tourists. Hans has this habit of spending hours and hours in the balcony of the sanatorium and each time he spends more time there he feels some changes in his way of perception. He has this habit of taking naps on the balcony:

At the moment of slipping off one might give a start — yet what sleep could be purer than this in the icy air? It was dreamless. It was as free from the burden — even the unconscious burden—of organic life, as little aware of an effort to breathe this contentless, weightless, imperceptible air as is the breathless sleep of the dead. (472)

The view from the balcony gives a sense of peace and comfort not only to Joachim but to the other patients also. This is the reason for the uniqueness of the place of sanatorium. Such places possess an abstract emotional attachment inside their material space and appear as healing spaces: “The wide-open balcony door did afford him some share of the warm shimmer outside” (203).

So, the material space and the view from the Sanatorium have a different and amazing effect on the personality of the people living there. This is how the embodiment of space works and helps them to make their space in the environment. The chapter inside the novel “*Fullness of Harmony*” is one of the chapters of the novel which depicts the true internal feelings of Hans Cstrop while sleeping and watching a dream. In his dream he observes himself very closely and watches himself roaming in the fields very close to nature. His dream is full of leisure activities away from the societal norms. He also listens to the French opera songs who sing song by playing



gramophone and one of the song's lyrics are: "Now the parting hour has come I must leave my loved home" (649). Again, they sing the lines: "I found my solace there," and "For rest and peace is here" (650). These lines are the true depiction of Hans feelings and desires to spend his time in peace and leisure in the sanatorium away from societal chores. This whole novel is written before the outburst of World War I and Hans prepares himself to participate and fight in that war. This is quite ironic that an engineer gather will power to fight in WWI. Karen Barad very beautifully exposes the true definition of ethics in relation to the existence of the people that we consider as others in a normal space. "Ethics is therefore not about the right response to a radically exterior/ized other, but about responsibility and accountability for the lively relationalities of becoming of which we are a part" (393). Hans and Joachim's feelings in relation to space truly depict Barad's idea of Entanglement of matter as both the characters are deeply and emotionally attached to the sanatorium. As she states:

The very nature of materiality is an entanglement. Matter itself is always already open to, or rather entangled with, the "Other." The intra-actively emergent "parts" of phenomena are co-constituted. Not only subjects but also objects are permeated through and through with their entangled kin; the other is not just in one's skin, but in one's bones, in one's belly, in one's heart, in one's nucleus, in one's past and future. (392)

Barad very strictly and quaintly negates this idea of otherness and separation between the entities. She explains very beautifully this idea of otherness as superficially we categorize the skin, the color, the creed of subjects and individuals as something different but internally everything is interconnected. Human feelings and emotions are the connections which interlink the human body with the other body therefore we cannot neglect the existence of other human beings based on their caste and creed. In the novel *The Magic Mountain* Joachim didn't want to leave sanatorium though he recovered, as he feels personal attachment with the place he lived in. Similarly, Hans becomes so energetic that the space and philosophical talks and discussions prepare him to fight in WWI. So, the role of material space appears productive for the people living there. An Engineer prepares himself to fight in war and time and again his identity and nature is shaped and reshaped by the space he lives in. Secondly, his interaction with people belonging to different walks of life also affects in making and remaking of his identity. Jane Bennett, an American political theorist and philosopher, wrote a book,

“*Vibrant Matter: A Political Ecology of Things*”, in which she explores the idea of material agency and entangled nature of the material objects:

The vital materialist affirms a figure of matter as an active principle; and a universe of this lively materiality that is always in various states of congealment and diffusion, materialities that are active and creative without needing to be experienced or conceived as partaking in divinity or purposiveness. (Kant quoted in Bennet 93)

Such theorists consider matter as always in a state of flux and motion. The attachment and entanglement with the matter is from both sides i.e. human and non-human agencies. Therefore, the material universe is viewed as dynamic and full of possibilities, where the ability to act and change is understood as a basic property of all matter rather than a quality exclusive to supernatural or sentient beings. This change in knowledge suggests that the characteristics of matter itself may produce complex and imaginative occurrences, encouraging a better awareness of the agency and connection within the physical universe. Joachim decides to go back to the military to fulfill his responsibilities though Behrens a senior doctor in the sanatorium after his physical checkup informs him that he is not physically fit, but he still wants to join military.

This shows the responsible nature of the characters living inside the hospital space. Both Hans and Joachim want to leave the peaceful environment of the sanatorium and they are ready to face the chaotic world outside that space. In the novel, two contrasting terms “up here” (706) and “flatlands” (721) have been used to differentiate between two different modes of existence. The people living in the normal space or at the flatlands consider the people living in sanatorium as others. But this novel shows that the people which we consider as others have more knowledge as compared to the people living in normal space. The Berghof Sanatorium and other places like this place gives more knowledge and understanding of the world. The way Hans converses with Naphta and Settembrini depicts that how they are concerned for the betterment of the living standard of all humanity.

In the book, *The Mushroom at the End of the World: On the Possibility of Life in Capitalist Ruins* (2021), a Chinese American anthropologist Anna Lowenhaupt Tsing highlights the importance of matsutake mushrooms. In the chapter, “Interlude Tracking”, she explains the value and existence of matsutake mushrooms as these are

basically “fruiting bodies of fungi” (137). Fungi are available under the soil in the form of thread-like structure. If the soil becomes transparent human beings can visualize it as a net of fungal hyphae. She further explains that fungi are not plants, but they are like animals and the positive about them is that they make world for other species. They excrete certain nutrients from their body into the soil which helps soil and plants to grow. She relates this idea of attachment and entanglement of material objects with the metanarrative i.e. existence of human world. As the existence of matsutake mushroom is due to entanglement and interconnectedness with the soil and fungi similarly, there is no concept of detachment and othering in the world. “History” is both a human story telling practice and that set of remainders from the past that we turn into stories. Conventionally, historians look only at human remainders, such as archives and diaries, but there is no reason not to spread our attention to the tracks and traces of nonhumans, as these contribute to our common landscapes” (168).

Symbolically, Tsing highlights the survival and growth of the mushroom species in an uncertain and chaotic environment. As the advancement in the field of science and technology has made changes in the ecological system of the world, this specie of mushroom has power and agency to emerge in disturbed landscape just like heterotopia, instead of deforestation and pollution mushrooms use their agency to outgrow in an uncertain environment. They use their aroma as an embodied space to grow intact with uncertain space. Same as mushrooms, the characters living in heterotopias use their agency in order to make their space in the world. The next section describes the role of heterotopia which helps in making other spaces productive and useful.

#### **4.5 Othering as a Productive Phenomenon**

Though the term “othering” normally refers to the marginalization of the weak, the sick, the racial others, all kinds of ethnic minorities, and the disenfranchised people, it works as a productive phenomenon when we analyse *The Magic Mountain*. Although Hans Castrop (a visitor) and other patients, who live in the heterotopia of Berghof Sanatorium, are traditionally othered by normal healthy people living outside, the sanatorium becomes an enabling and productive space for its inmates. After spending time in conversation with other patients and doctors, Castrop and his soldier friend, Joachim, leave the sanatorium enlightened and empowered (mentally and spiritually), and become agentive subjects because they want to join WW1 and fulfill the obligations for their fellow citizens and make sacrifices as part of their duty to their nation.

Dr. Behrens and Dr. Krokowski are the two senior doctors in the hospital space. The environment they provide for the patients is very pleasant and friendly. Secondly, the hospital space and the patients living there survive there without creating any hierarchy which makes the environment surprising and affective for all patients. Contrary to that, normal space creates boundaries and hierarchies among the people. As Dr. Behrens while sharing his previous experience once says: “I have not only the old scars that come from my schooldays, but the fresh places that give me my fever” (559). So, places where people live not only give space to live but they create emotional and personal attachment with the human beings. In the book *“The Body in the Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason”* the author Mark Johnson writes: “We have bodies that are acted upon by "external" and "internal" forces such as gravity, light, heat, wind, bodily processes, and the obtrusion of other physical objects. Such interactions constitute our first encounters with forces, and they reveal patterned recurring relations between ourselves and our environment”. Johnson in this book highlights the element of object and human interaction with the non-human entities. The interaction between human and non-human objects creates meaning and coherence within the world. Immanuel Kant a German philosopher is the one who talked about the term “schema” and “thought of the perceptual contents as material elements that must be structured by formal elements (which include [a] concepts, and [b] the structures of spatial and temporal organization for all our experience)” (148).

Even we cannot understand the signs and images without connecting them with other objects in the world. About the human embodiment Johnson further claims that “much of the structure we find in the social, epistemic, and conversational or speech-act domains is intimately related to parallel structure in our embodied (so-called physical) experience” (63). He introduced the term “image schemata” (195), the understanding of one’s surroundings through body movement which is what I have highlighted in my research as (embodied spaces): “An image schema is a recurring, dynamic pattern of our perceptual interactions and motor programs that gives coherence and structure to our experience” (12).

Many theorists consider schema as image of something in human mind or the structure of something, but Johnson considers this schema in relation to body movement within the space, like whatever human body experience within a space is known as “embodied schemata” (19). According to his idea the human body has this

capability to make space for its ownself and to understand the surroundings. The “meaning is not situated solely in propositions; instead, it permeates our embodied, spatial, temporal, culturally formed, and value-laden understanding” (172).

To conclude, this novel shows that Hans’ movement from normal space to the sanatorium Berghof as heterotopic space changes his personality. Such places have power and ability to transform not only human behavior but human psychology as well. Hans thinks: “I found my solace there,” and “For rest and peace is here” (650). Heterotopic places, which are excluded from the norms of society, help shape and reshape human identities. Individuals living inside these spaces continuously go through the learning phase, as they remain in changing flux all the time. *The Magic Mountain* possesses a strong narrative approach which gains the attention of critics and readers to explore the nature of human individuals.

The concept of heterotopia, in relation to the theory of agential realism and Lefebvre’s theory about space formation makes my study more intriguing and innovative. Throughout the novel, the characters remain in the state of transformation and their identity remains in continuous flux. Hans appear productive for other human beings, as he wants to fight in World War I, At the first page of the novel, we see Hans as an engineer and in the last pages we see him preparing to move out of sanatorium to fight for his country. Therefore, this novel presents the state of transition in human characters which makes this novel interesting and fascinating. In the next chapter, I carry out a textual analysis of Hanif’s novel *Our Lady OF Alice Bhatti* from the perspective of heterotopia to map out the dynamics of space formation, and how a Christian nurse, by using her agency, makes an othered space a living space.

## CHAPTER 5

### PERFORMATIVITY OF THE HUMAN BODIES INSIDE HETEROTOPIA IN MOHAMMAD HANIF'S *OUR LADY OF ALICE BHATTI*: A TEXTUAL ANALYSIS

#### 5.1 Introduction

In this chapter, I present my analysis of a British-Pakistani writer Mohammad Hanif's novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* (2011).<sup>4</sup> I argue that Hanif in his novel talks about the importance of human body that how human body which is being exploited, humiliated and even confined to death empowers itself inside the walls of heterotopic place known as Sacred Heart Hospital for All Ailments. Much research has been done on the novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*, but no one has talked about this novel through the lens of heterotopia. The purpose of the analysis is to look for themes, ideas and analyze the key elements. The theme and ideas given in a text makes us connect our purpose of the research with those ideas. I have analyzed this novel by focusing through the lens of Michel Foucault's idea of heterotopia. Foucault suggests that heterotopia is the place that exists outside the norm of human society. Contrary to that I argue in my analysis about the importance of those bodies that reside inside heterotopia and create their own agency, by moving against the norms of society.

Mohammad Hanif was born in Okara, Pakistan in the year 1964. He did his graduation from Pakistan Air Force Academy as pilot officer but later on he became a journalist, as he had a great interest in literature. He moved to London with his family in the year 1990. He wrote articles for BBC, New York Times and The Guardian. He wrote several plays and did a short degree in Creative Writing Program at the University of East Anglia. His first novel *A Case of Exploding Mangoes* (2008) made him a very successful author. Hanif shifted back to Karachi as he has great zeal to write about his own Pakistani narratives. Hanif's writing style focuses on the unprivileged and marginalized people of the society. His other artistic creation is "*Red Birds*" (2018). This novel talks about the ugliness and monopoly behind the war and is beautifully

---

<sup>4</sup> Henceforth, I use OLAB as abbreviation of *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* for citations across the thesis.

narrated by the author. By focusing on different narrative positions, Hanif talks about the unjustified, dark side of society so that the authorities take action against the injustice against the oppressive.

The story of *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* revolves around the protagonist Alice and the ward boy Noor. This story highlights the chaos and sufferings of the protagonist Alice who is a Christian and who tries her best to survive against anti-Christian, misogynistic and vicious society. My research explores the mind set of Pakistani society that how people label marginalized and unprivileged as “choorah” or “ugly” and still their daily chores are performed by these marginalized communities. When Alice Bhatti goes for the interview the interview panel does not bother her presence and she keeps on standing in front of the panel for three minutes. “She doesn’t get the opportunity to ask anything as the interview panel is too busy debating the cost-benefit ratio for patients on pacemakers” (2). This is the first appearance of Alice Bhatti inside the hospital space where she is unable to do or say anything. She doesn’t really understand what they are talking about, only wonders why she was called in if all they were going to talk about was electricity generators, ventilators, running costs and heartless relatives of the deceased arriving .... demanding compensation” (2). If we look at her helpless body inside the walls of hospital space, Michel Foucault’s theory of heterotopia truly fits the idea of heterotopia and, later, how she gains agency and battle against the iron shackles made by the society. In the light of this introductory discussion, my argument of this chapter is about how moving between normal space and the hospital space gives voice and agency to the characters under study. In accordance with my research objectives, I have examined *OLAB* in the following five sections:

- Epistemic Violence
- Power Dynamics
- Performativity of Human Existence inside Heterotopia
- Power and Agency attained by the Protagonist Alice Bhatti and the Ward boy Noor
- Architectural role-play in making spaces inclusive

## 5.2 Epistemic Violence

Discussion of the novel, *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*, is incomplete without discussing Indian literary critic, Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak's essay "*Can the Subaltern Speak*" (2009). In her essay, Spivak talks about the subaltern, the marginalized community of the nation that they are the one who cannot speak for themselves. She also asserts that "the oppressed, if given the chance, can speak and know their conditions" (78). Other than postcolonial perspective, the subalterns are not given the chance to speak for their rights. The term "epistemic violence" (84) truly justifies the notion of silencing the voice of the marginalized community residing inside a particular space. For instance, the interview panel including Ortho Sir, Dr. Jamus Pereira, (the chief medical officer of the hospital), they use their knowledge just for the sake of humiliating Alice Bhatti: "She has an odd sensation of overhearing a conversation that she is meant to overhear" (2).

The interview panel continuously talks with each other on their personal conversation which has nothing to do with Alice who stands there for three and a half minutes without any notice. Every character in the novel has this attitude of exercising power over the individual who is weak in status. Paulo Freire a Brazilian educator and philosopher in his book *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* state that "The more radical the person is, the more fully he or she enters reality so that, knowing it better, he or she can transform it. This individual is not afraid to confront, to listen, to see the world unveiled". (27) The quote foregrounds the idea that those people who are more essential and dare to face reality, they get a better understanding of the world they exist in.

Sir Ortho again and again asks her name to make her realize that she belongs to Christian family. "So, are you Alice or are you Bhatti? . . . I am surprised that you are trying to hide basic information. Your full name is Alice Joseph Bhatti". Are you ashamed of your father's name?" (5, 6). On asking this question regarding her father's identity, she says abruptly that her father was a school teacher, and she is proud of her identity.

As Karen Barad, in her book *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and the Entanglement of Matter and Meaning*, enforces the idea that "reality is composed not of things in-themselves or things-behind-phenomena but of things-in-phenomena". (140) Reality does not solely depend upon the existence of the things



around us, but reality depends on the human subjectivity and the way human mind perceive the things around him. The authority inside the hospital space calls into question the existence of Alice Bhatti inside the hospital space, but Alice does not give up against the harsh and humiliating words used by the interview panel. She uses her agency against their humiliating voice and authority and gains the position of a nurse inside Sacred Heart Hospital for All Ailments. Sara Teagarden in her dissertation “*Technological Heterotopia*” analyzes the relation of social human body with advancement of technology. She incorporates Foucault’s definition of heterotopias in relation to technology as “We are at the moment, I believe when our experience of the world is less that of a long life developing through time than that of a network that connects points and intersects with its own skin” (1).

This suggests that advocates viewing life as a network where many points connect and interact with one another, generating a web of experiences that influence our perspective of the world, as opposed to viewing life as a journey that progresses through time. It raises the possibility that our experiences are not discrete occurrences but rather dynamic components of a wider network that intricately shape and influence one another. Other than hospital space Alice Bhatti had spent fourteen months in Brostal Jail for Women and Children, she did graduation from the jail which is another place considered as heterotopia.

This text depicts the true depiction of heterotopic places in a sense that the places which are mentioned or labeled as “othered” are making human bodies as useful and effective for the people residing in a normal space. In normal living space people tag each other’s name with certain bad names. “Life has taught Alice Bhatti that every little step forward in life is preceded by a ritual humiliation” (55). For instance, Alice’s father Joseph Bhatti is called by the name “choohra” (49) by the Muslim community, though he does not feel ashamed of his name and owns his identity. “Yes, I am Joseph Bhatti Choohra” (49). This epistemic violence acts in many ways in a sense that it makes the subaltern introvert and speechless in front of the ones who demonstrate themselves as knowledgeable and dominant.

### **5.3 Power Dynamics**

Power dynamics are considered essential not only in consideration of patriarchy, but in accordance with the dominance on female body as well. Teddy Butt who proposes

Alice by putting his gun on her without her consent shows power of a man over women. Sexual abuse and sexual violence against women adhere to power dynamics of the society. In such societies where power is implied on the bodies of downtrodden and poor, such societies do not progress in a productive way. In the VIP room of the hospital space Junior tries to commit rape of Alice Bhatti but in reaction she cuts the genital organ of him and advises him to go to the accidents department as they are used to handle such cases at night. This is the agency which she uses against the power dynamics enforced by the men. “Mostly people call her “daughter” or “sister” and then they do exactly what they do with their own sisters and daughters: they treat her like a slave they bought at a clearance sale” (Hanif 82).

Sourav Paul and Dr Shri Krishan Rai, in their article “*Sexual Violence and Sainthood: A Critical Study of Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*”, highlighted the role of sexual violence as a dominant strain against women empowerment. Such kind of brutal acts against the will of women body gives them agency and voice to speak against the unethical and treacherous attitude of the men against women. “Throughout the multidimensional free play of events Alice Bhatti’s body is a battleground of different ideas and ideologies” (Paul and Rai 5).

When the human body is considered an object, it attains power and agency against such power dynamics and try to wrestle against the unethical behavior of the power structures. “In her entire journey of life Alice’s self-reflexivity is the counterpart of her tireless endeavor to defend feminine entity in midst of the phallogentric hierarchy of existence” (Paul and Rai 4). The reality is when authority, the people who are in power or the so-called Government of a particular state misuses power against the masses or the powerless, no one acts against it. But, when the downtrodden or the poor raise their voices against injustice and the brutality being exercised against them, they are considered rebellious, and the ones who don’t know the right way to live inside space. Characters like Alice Bhatti and the ward boy Noor try hard to create their living space both inside and outside heterotopia. This heterotopia made them think philosophically and to raise voice against illegal power used by the authority of the hospital. Living conditions of the Sacred hospital make them to think in a more nuanced way and it also brings positive attitude inside them. The places which are being othered dispatch a positive attitude to their personality and it shapes and reshapes their personality in a positive way.

## 5.4 Performativity of Human Existence inside the Hospital Space as Heterotopia

The performance of the human body depends on the understanding of the individuals residing inside heterotopia. The survival of individuals inside heterotopia is a new trend which elaborates how the young individuals by residing inside a particular othered space shape spaces and how spaces shape their personalities in return. In the novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* the character Noor along with Alice Bhatti is a young boy who use to live with her inside Brostal jail. In both the characters we see that they both while residing inside the hospital space shapes and reshape their identity. Noor is the one who learnt to write properly inside Sacred Hospital. “Now Noor is learning to write properly. At the Sacred Hospital, he started by filling out admission forms, people’s names and their dates of birth, their dates of admission” (23). In one place like Brostal jail Noor learnt how to read and write while in the Sacred Hospital of all ailments he is using his skills as a professional worker inside heterotopia which shows the agency of Noor’s body inside heterotopia. This shows that such places which are being othered appear as places of education and reformation. Therefore, the performativity of the individuals totally relies on the space where they live. The act of learning corresponds directly with the agency of the human body.

For further elaboration of this idea, I take support of Karen Barad’s idea of diffraction. “Diffraction is a material-discursive phenomenon that challenges the presumed inherent separability of subject and object, nature and culture, fact and value, human and nonhuman, organic and inorganic, epistemology and ontology, materiality and discursivity” (381). Diffraction talks about the role of phenomena that how things existing inside the world are in relation with each other. Theologian Catherine Keller and philosopher of religion Mary-Jane Rubenstein, in their collection of *essays “Entangled Worlds: Religion, Science, and New Materialisms”*, enforce the notion of interconnected of the things existing around the world. “When the smallest parts of matter are found to be capable of exploding deeply entrenched ideas and large cities,” matter itself comes into question and brings us all with it” (3).

As like Alice who is a Christian by her religion recites kalmia inside the hospital space when any Muslim patient breathes his last. Now this recitation of kalma by the Christian nurse questions accepted wisdom and blurs the lines between religious

identities in the physical setting of the hospital. In addition to reflecting Alice's own complicated identity and views, this performative act also represents a kind of resistance against the societal and religious standards that aim to marginalize her. Alice demonstrates the transforming potential of religious rituals to change and dispute social realities through her performative act, which also emphasizes her presence and agency inside the space. Furthermore, Alice's recitation of the Kalma highlights the ways in which people negotiate their beliefs and practices within a variety of disputed and different locations, underscoring the flexibility and complexity of religious identity. Noor the ward boy moves inside the hospital in a way that he belongs to the walls of the Sacred hospital. Both Alice and Noor, after getting intact with the walls of hospital space gains agency and strength to survive against the dominant forces.

In the same book *“Entangled Worlds: Religion, Science, and New Materialisms”*, Carol Wayne White in his essay *“Stubborn Materiality: African American Religious Naturalism and Becoming Our Humanity”* gives example of a cell, as a single cell residing inside a living body does not function alone, it needs multiple cells to make the human body function in a proper way. “a cell is like a community: Its inner workings are segregated into interacting compartments, whereas its outer membrane defines its interactions with the rest of the world” (260). The characters like Alice and Noor time and again make a comparison of the inside world of hospital space with the outer world. “People might put up with discrimination in the outside world” (23), this discrimination is based on their worldly benefits but inside hospital space the dominating powers do discrimination between the things which are for their own personal benefit. They use the poor and the weak for their personal chores without paying them wages.

Henry Lefebvre in his book *“The Production of Space”* (1991) talks about how space is produced and formed out of chaos. This book is a influential work in urban space and geography. “Man does not live by words alone; all 'subjects' are situated in a space in which they must either recognize themselves or lose themselves, a space which they may both enjoy and modify” (35). The making and re-making of space depends not solely on one object but it is a collective phenomenon. Even the narration of the stories needs specific time and space. All the disputes around the globe are mostly about space. “Space is neither a 'subject' nor an 'object' - but rather a social reality - that is to say, a set - of relations and forms” (116). Lefebvre considers the subject as

production of space as well. Space becomes representational with the existence of the human body and vice versa. Living spaces are directly linked with the survival of human existence. Hazal Ertem in her dissertation “*Analyzing Interrelations between Aspects of Spatial Triad in the case of Syrian Refugee Craftsmen in Ulubey Neighborhood, Ankara*” (2019) endorsed the idea of Thacker he states: “Lefebvre emphasizes that “space is not only a blank area but also it is a space that shape human society and is shaped by human activities” (30).

The lens of Lefebvre’s “spatial triad” makes this notion clear that the hospital space is not a physical entity to live on, but space is social construct, and it is created through the mutual interaction of the people at a particular space. Space is formed through the cooperation of human activities. The most important thing about the Sacred hospital space as heterotopias is that those who are considered “othered” in relation to Foucault’s idea of heterotopia use philosophical language to make a space productive to live. “When people see Noor, their first reaction is look at that poor little boy, what a pity, when he should be playing but they can keep their pity to themselves because Noor considers himself a man of this world”(24).

The aforementioned line depicts that such characters/individuals which are considered as “othered” they consider that othered place their whole world and try to find comfort and peace in that “othered” place. Even such places which are excluded from the normal strain of life, these places appear as the places of reformation and rehabilitation. Noor and Alice time and again try to adjust themselves in the hospital space and even this hospital space gives them identity Alice Bhatti becomes a professional nurse and Noor becomes a ward boy inside the hospital. “They were very good about certain things in the Brostal. They tried to teach you to wash your hands and they made you learn to read the alphabet and some easier bits from the Quran” (22). The aforementioned lines state that such places which are excluded from the norms of the society, these places prove as the places of reformation and reconstruction of the individual’s identity, which lives inside the spaces identified as heterotopia. The normal, power dominating authorities claim that normal or standard living spaces work for the betterment and reformation of the people, contrary to that they neglect these heterotopic places just because these places are labeled as “othered”.

Alice Bhatti marries Teddy Butt who is Muslim by his religion, but when she gets pregnant, she remains much concerned about the name of her child that which religion

will make her child to live peacefully. “Would it be easier if it were a girl? She would have settled easily on some neutral name, not Joseph or Judith obviously, but something that would have worked for both of them, something neutral like Salamat or Saleem maybe” (180). This shows that the people which are considered as “othered” how they use philosophical language, and they are much concerned about the identity of their next generation that, after their life, their children can survive in the world where they have no place to live, and they are even willing to compromise on their names, religion and identity. “When these doctors get drunk, they suddenly remember their principles, their stupid oath... what is it called? (11). Inside hospital space the doctors who remain strict to their rules get this advantage of drinking and they do not even bother not to do such unethical things inside the hospital space, but they have made certain rules for the defenseless people.

This shows that the dominant powers make wrong use of the agency even inside such places labeled as heterotopia. In the whole it is agency of the unprivileged which makes the narrative of the story to move forward. The whole story of the novel depicts that no matter what if human body has the agency and willingness to break the boundaries and obstacles created against their power and value, they can do anything for their survival.

### **5.5 Power and Agency attained by the Protagonist Alice Bhatti and (The Ward Boy) Noor**

In this section, I discuss how Alice Bhatti and the ward boy, Noor, attain power and agency inside the heterotopic space of the hospital. Afzaal et al., in their collective article “*Gendered Discourse on Women’s Identity: A Discourse Analysis of Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*” (2021), talk about the patriarchal subjugation of women in Pakistani society. In this article the authors prove their argument with the use of Fairclough (1992) theory “gender is learnt, and once it is learnt it produces, reproduces and legitimizes the choices and expects conformity to one category” (4). Alice is an untouchable and doubly marginalized in Pakistani society but still she uses her agency and power against all the worldly obstacles against her and learn to survive in a patriarchal society. The character in the novel inspector Malangi has the habit of humiliating and using bad language against women. He considers women as a source of entertainment and leisure. He talks about women as: “You can’t trust them even when their hearts stop beating” (209). When Alice Bhatti is treated in a negative way both from inside the hospital space and

in the outer world, this humiliation and marginalization makes her gain agency and power against all social constructs created by the people around her.

The production of space also depends on the language and attitude of the people living in a particular place. If dominating powers do not behave in a taunting and humiliating way with the downtrodden or the masses, the spaces where human beings live cannot be modified in a more productive way. The positive thing is that people who reside inside these places consider these places as an opportunity and get the advantage of this opportunity by making themselves fight against the unethical bounds and shackles woven around them. The hatred, neglect and prejudice of the people against such marginalized people ooze out as a positive element. It brings up positivity in their life and they comprehend things in a more nuanced way. Heidegger (1971), quoted in Maria João Durao article "Embodied Space: A Sensorial Approach to Spatial Experience", states that "'Dwelling is the essence of Being-in-the-World', so we are always in relation with things in the world, in a spatial relation characterized by an 'inconspicuous familiarity', a 'belongingness', an 'insideness' and by sensorial inputs known in the body and by the body that occupies a given place" (399).

For him, living in space is only possible through "material embodiment" (1) and it is the body and the space which has surrounded the human body which helps in interconnectedness of the material things. It is the body and the movement of the body which makes material things to orient in the right direction. The material space and the role of the human body residing inside the material space, they have direct connection with each other. If one does not remain the other would not be able to exist inside the world. For the survival of all human beings, it is necessary to understand the living spaces, as both living experience in the space and the body movement inside the space, shapes and reshapes human body. The other character in the novel is sister Hina Alvi, her actual name is Hannah but for the sake of living in society and to earn her bread she changed her name and people use to call her with the Muslim name as Hina Alvi. "Hannah. That was my name. Hannah, Hina Alvi says, slightly lost, as if she has just remembered a word that she hasn't used for a while" (Hanif 203). In the normal living space, they are scared to embrace their Christianity but the hospital space embraces their identity and they get the job inside that othered space.

By analyzing the novel through the framework of Lefebvre's "Production of Space" and heterotopia we can uncover the intricate connections between individual

experiences, social structures, and spatial practices in the context of urban life in Karachi. This approach allows us to appreciate how literature can offer valuable insights into the complex dynamics of space and society, enriching our understanding of both fictional narratives and real-world urban environments and subsequently contribute towards a more inclusive and supportive social fabric. Therefore, we can consider this “otherness” of the spaces in a positive sense as these spaces provide voice to the marginalized and untouchable, these spaces provide strength and power to those who don’t have a say in society. David Harvey in his book “*Spaces of Hope*” (2000) highlighted several important elements which play a very comprehensive role in creating inequity and hierarchy in the world. One such element is neoliberalism which has made powerful people more powerful, and all the authority and money has been given transferred to the authority of the state. Neoliberalism caused inequity and deregulation around the globe therefore societies had been divided into hierarchies. “The geographical mosaic is a time-deepened creation of multiple human activities” (Harvey 77).

Therefore, it is not possible to control involuntary actions performed by human beings. “The body is not a closed and sealed entity, but a relational thing that is created, bounded, sustained, and ultimately dissolved in a spatiotemporal flux of multiple processes” (Harvey 98). He also talked about the seminal work of Foucault and states that: “*The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*” (1966) heterotopia is solely considered in relation to discourse and language” (Harvey 183). He further writes about such spaces as: “whatever *happens* in such spaces of otherness is of interest and even in some sense acceptable or appropriate” (Harvey 185). The spaces of otherness as highlighted in Foucault’s book the cemetery, the concentration camp, factories, shopping malls, militia camps are all the sites and places where people perform alternative things. Just like postmodernists stance, which is open-endedness of each and everything, these places give space to everyone who is not given space in a normal place.

## **5.6 Architectural Role Play in Making Spaces Inclusive**

In this novel the author Mohammad Hanif also talked about another place of heterotopia which is known as “Borstal jail” (10). Hanif’s mentioning of another place as heterotopia depicts the identity of Alice Bhatti as more agentive and powerful. As in chapter twelve it is mentioned that “While in Borstal, she never missed her own home”



(74). The walls and architecture of the jail gives her home-like feelings, that's why she again joins the Sacred Hospital as a nurse. "In fact, it was during her time in the Borstal that she first felt free" (92). This shows that the architecture of such places possesses agentive power that is why people feel at home there. She spent fourteen months in jail as someone charged her for committing someone's murder. As in a normal Pakistani society, if someone spends some time in such spaces which are considered odd like jail he should be ashamed of his deeds no matter he has done the crime or not, but here Hanif very beautifully sheds light on the stereotype and states that "how can spending time in jail automatically be a proof of someone's guilt? Did our Lord Yassoo not spend two nights in the Sanhedrin's prison? (179).

The biblical reference shows that even saints and priests spent time in such spaces than why do people living in a normal space consider such spaces exclusive. Juhani Uolevi Pallasmaa a Finnish architect and a former professor of architecture and dean at the Helsinki University of Technology. He emphasizes on the idea that body movement inside architecture helps human body to better understand the material space. In his book "*The Eyes of the Skin Architecture and the Senses*" (1996) Pallasmaa in chapter The Task of Architecture states that:

Architecture reflects, materializes and eternalizes ideas and images of ideal life. Buildings and towns enable us to structure, understand and remember the shapeless flow of reality and, ultimately, to recognize and remember who we are. (71)

It is not in the control of human beings to label and restrict spaces for other human beings as it is a natural flow of understanding and experiencing certain spaces in relation to body movement. "We behold, touch, listen and measure the world with our entire bodily existence, and the experiential world becomes organized and articulated around the centre of the body" (64). The human body itself has capacity to make space for its existence in the spaces which are considered restricted or confined for human bodies. As the protagonist Alice makes her space inside the heterotopia by herself and when she moves out of the space she is treated in a different way in a normal space as well. Though, she finds the way for her survival and livelihood in both spaces.

In my two analysis chapters, a qualitative analysis of both the texts aided by the theoretical support has enabled me to appraise where both of my selected texts stand in

terms of the representation of materiality of space, heterotopia and embodied spaces. In the forthcoming chapter, I conclude my dissertation by giving my findings and recommendations for further research. The qualitative method of reading both the primary texts enabled me to justify my thesis statement and research questions respectively.

## CHAPTER 6

### CONCLUSION

In order for me to wrap up my research project, and to write a concluding note about the analysis of my argument, it is important to re-examine my primary research claims and theoretical framework deployed for the study of my primary texts. I have examined Thomas Mann's "*The Magic Mountain*" (1924) and Mohammad Hanif's "*Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*" (2008) through the critical lens invoked from Michel Foucault's idea of "heterotopia", Karen Barad's idea of "agential realism" and Henry Lefebvre's notion on "spatial triad" taken from the book *The Production of Space*. By employing theoretical framework, I have analyzed my texts to bring out this idea that spaces and the people which are excluded from the norms of the society appear as more productive and philosophical. So, such places as heterotopia are the places of inclusion rather than exclusion. As a researcher, I have been able to raise questions about heterotopia as othered space. In my analysis, I tried to explain extensively how these othered spaces accept the unacceptable human individuals. People who get ignored in a normal space and who do not find a job and space for earning their livelihood, such people are given shelter by the othered space that is heterotopia.

Secondly, the novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti* has not been analyzed from the perspective of heterotopia, material agency or by using the lens of Lefebvre's notion of the production of space. My purpose of doing research through the lens of heterotopia is that, as Pakistan is already a Postcolonial country and those who are marginalized or live inside such spaces are considered unprivileged and defenseless, So, as a researcher, I tried to highlight such issues so that minorities in any state of the world could be able to make their position in society. My effort for writing this thesis is to serve as a helping hand for those who cannot raise their voices, amplifying their experiences and perspectives through thoughtful analysis and research.

In a normal space, Alice Bhatti was not able to raise her voice. Contrary to that, the hospital space as heterotopia provides her both voice and means of earning as a nurse. I have done interpretive and expository analysis of my primary texts. For textual

analysis, I have employed Catherine Belsey's textual analysis as a research method. After a detailed analysis of my primary texts in the preceding chapters, it may be easier now to see if my research foregrounds the thesis statement and the research questions have been answered properly. In the novel "*The Magic Mountain*" I have been primarily concerned with the depiction of not only the physical space, but the conversations and the change occurred in the behavior of the characters living in that space. The environment and the space of sanatorium has different ambiance which attracts the attention of not only the patients, but the visitors also feel a sense of belonging there. The novel had a complex interplay of power, agency and space.

Therefore, this novel is a true depiction of how material space plays pivotal role in making human life more subjective and normal. As Harvey states: "But in reflecting on what we insurgent architects do, a space must be left for the private and the personal—a space must be left for the private and the personal — a space in which doubt, anger, anxiety, and despair as well as certitude, altruism, hope, and elation may flourish" (235). He endorsed the idea that a living space is an amalgamation of multiple things and therefore just like human identity spaces are formed, shaped and reshaped with both negative and positive elements. Even people in authority which he labeled as "insurgent architects" (235) who want to change the architectural norms and rules, have this mix personality full of emotions and subjectivity which works as embodied space and therefore, helps in space production.

It is instructive to present my findings one by one.

I remain intact with the research questions while doing analysis of my primary texts. The research questions in my whole dissertation helped me to direct my analysis in the right direction. My first research question was about the configurations of heterotopia in linking up the hospital space with the human agency. My analysis helped me to find the answer to this question and now after my analysis the question has become an affirmative sentence for me, because I have found my answer in my analysis. Karen Barad's theory about agential realism and Henry Lefebvre's idea on space formation leads to the fact that it is very difficult to separate humans from non-human objects. If we separate one element from the other, it would not be possible for any of the entity to continue to exist alone.

My second research question was about how heterotopias as a material space

interrelate with the human body. Foucault has pointed out that heterotopia is a place which acts as a counter-site. These sites provide critical reflection on societal norms, highlighting certain elements which challenge the social hierarchy of the normal space. My third question was how the human body emerges as an embodiment of space in the selected texts. For the answer to this question, I foregrounded the idea of embodiment of space presented by Henry Lefebvre that, human body has this ability to interact with non-human entities and through this interaction with non-human objects human body gains agency to fight against the unjustifying laws of the society.

By focusing on research questions and keeping them in my mind I have conducted my research from a new materialist perspective. New Materialism is an interdisciplinary field of study where the focus lies on quantum mechanical description of material which goes against the anthropocentric approach of study. New materialism opens up new avenues to rethink human existence within new materialistic framework. Jane Bennet an American theorist, philosopher and professor of political science at Johns Hopkins University in her book “*Vibrant Matter A Political Ecology of Things*” (2009) talks about “thing power” which means that things or entities in the world have power to change our thoughts and they give us new ideas to look around the things in a more nuanced way. This is the power of material objects which makes human mind to change their view regarding certain idea. It has been observed that such places as heterotopia affect human psyche and memory. The human mind has direct relation with the formation of human identity. Since my research project is on heterotopia in engagement with agential realism and embodied spaces, it contributes to critical scholarship in the domains of spatial and new materialist studies. In the next heading, I have given recommendations for further research in the domain of material and spatial literature.

## **6.1 Recommendations for Further Research**

This study has enabled me to recommend to future researchers to explore the idea of heterotopia in other works. New Materialism and the theory of heterotopia can be explored further in Pakistani context. Just like the novel *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*, Hanif’s another novel *Red Birds* can be looked at with the angel of heterotopia, as this novel talks about the refugee camps in an unknown desert. Since, Mohammad Hanif as a Pakistani author unveils the role of oppression, violence, patriarchy and class struggle in the Pakistani society so, it would be useful to look at his novels through the lens of

new materialist paradigm. As in the world of literature, there is a huge paradigm shift, literature has opened new avenues to explore and research the world from new perspective and now human centered approach is not focused much. Contrary to that, non-anthropocentric approach is followed in the paradigm shift. The new researchers should engage their readings and ideas with new ways of learning. My research frame about the materiality of space and the role of agential realism provides insight to the readers to look at the spaces from a positive angle and instead of dividing spaces into pieces we need to connect places to create human connection.

Other than this, the idea of heterotopia can be applied in the novel *Cancer Ward* by Aleksandr Solzhenitsyn. I worked on the space of heterotopia in relation to hospital space, contrary to that, the future researchers can work on the idea of ruins, prisons, and refugee camps. The *Ministry of Utmost Happiness* by Arundhati Roy is one of the most famous novels on which the future researchers can work from the perspective of heterotopia. In this novel, the character of Anjum is mentioned as a broken character, she looks for a comfortable space for her survival and, finally, she moves into an old Muslim cemetery and intends to stay there. Another novel, *All Quiet on the Western Front* by Eric Maria may be studied from the perspective of heterotopia. The refugee camps in this novel play the role of shelter for the soldiers. In the outer world, they face the brutality of war but, inside the camps, they feel a sense of belonging.

Theoretical Framework of New Materialism in relation to heterotopia and affect theory by Sarah Ahmed can be employed for reading the aforementioned texts to bring new insights in the domain of material and spatial field of study. I anticipate that my thesis paves way for the other researchers to investigate all kinds of heterotopias and add to the production of knowledge in the fields of new materialist and spatial theory.

## WORKS CITED

- Afzaal, Muhammad, et al. "Gendered Discourse on Women's Identity: A Discourse Analysis of *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*." *Pakistan Journal of Society, Education and Language* (PJSEL) 7.1 (2021): 308-317.
- Anşın, Berfin. *Resistance and Hetertopia: An Analysis of Space in Jeanette Winterson's The Passion and Orhan Pamuk's The Museum of Innocence*. MS thesis. Middle East Technical University, 2019.
- Barad, Karen. *Meeting the Universe Halfway: Quantum Physics and The Entanglement of Matter and Meaning*. Duke University Press, 2007.
- Bachelard, Gaston. *The Poetics of Space*. Penguin, 2014.
- Belsey, Catherine. "Textual Analysis as a Research Method." *Research Methods for English Studies*. Ed. Gabriele Griffin. Edinburgh University Press, 2005.
- Bennett, Jane. *Vibrant Matter: Apolitical Ecology of Things*. Duke University Press, 2020.
- Bilal, Mushtaq. "Yes, I am Joseph Bhatti Choohra": Reading Joseph Bhatti as a Palimpsest." *Angles: New Perspectives on the Anglophone World*. 14 (2022).
- Coelho, Paulo. *Veronika Decides to Die*. HarperOne, 2016.
- Creswell, John W. and Cheryl N. Poth. *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design: Choosing Among Five Approaches*. Sage Publications, 2016.
- Dehaene, Michiel, and Lieven De Cauter. "Heterotopia in a Postcivil Society." In *Heterotopia and the City*. Routledge, 2008. 15-22.
- Ertem, Hazal. *Analyzing Interrelations between Aspects of Spatial Triad in the Case of Syrian Refugee Craftsmen in Ulubey Neighborhood, Ankara*. MS thesis. Middle East Technical University, 2019.
- Farman, Jason. "Stories, Spaces, and Bodies: The Production of Embodied Space through Mobile Media Storytelling." *Communication Research and Practice*. 1.2 (2015):101-116.

- Fourqurean, Megan E. "Agential Realism and Trans-Corporeality in Contemporary South Asian Literature." *The Journal of Commonwealth Literature*, Jan. 2022, p.002198942110643: 130-144.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Order of Things: An Archaeology of the Human Sciences*. Vintage Books, 1994.
- Foucault, Michel. "Of Other Spaces." *Diacritics*, Vol.16, No.1, 1984, pp. 22–27.
- Freire, Paulo. *Pedagogy of the Oppressed* (revised). New York: Continuum, 1996.
- Griffin, Gabriele. *Research Methods for English Studies*. Edinburgh UP, 2013.
- Gagliardi, Pasquale. *Symbols and Artifacts: Views of the Corporate Landscape*. Routledge, 2017.
- Gesler, Wil. "Hans Castorp's Journey-to-Knowledge of Disease and Health in Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain*." *Health & Place* 6.2 (2000): 125- 134.
- Geerts, Evelien. "Review of Catherine Keller and Mary-Jane Rubenstein eds. *Entangled Worlds. Religion, Science, and New Materialisms* (Transdisciplinary Theological Colloquia). New York: Fordham University Press, 2017, 333 p., ISBN 978-0-82-3276-22-6. *Religion and Gender* 8.1 (2018): 129-131.
- Gomboc-Turyan, Julie, and Sarah Tourtellotte. "Edward T. Hall and Proxemics." *The Proceedings of the Laurel Highlands Communications Conference*. Indiana University of Pennsylvania, Department of Communications Media, 2010.
- Harvey, David. *Spaces of Hope*. Vol.7. University of California Press, 2000.
- Hanif, Mohammed. *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*. Random House, 2011.
- Hanif, Mohammed. *Red Birds*. Bloomsbury Publishing, 2019.
- Howell, Francesca Ciancimino. *Sense of Place and Festival in Northern Italy: Perspectives on Place, Time and Community*. Diss. The Open University, 2011.



- Johnson, Mark. *The Body in The Mind: The Bodily Basis of Meaning, Imagination, and Reason*. University of Chicago press, 2013.
- Keller, Catherine, and Mary-Jane Rubenstein, eds. *Entangled Worlds: Religion, Science, and New Materialisms*. Fordham University Press, 2017.
- Knight, Kelvin. *Real Places and Impossible Spaces: Foucault's Heterotopia in the Fiction of James Joyce, Vladimir Nabokov, and WG Sebald*. Diss. University of East Anglia, 2014.
- Lefebvre, Henri. *The Production of Space*. Blackwell, 1991. Mann, Thomas. *The Magic Mountain*. RandomHouse, 2018.
- Molotch, Harvey. "The Space of Lefebvre." *Theory and Society*, eds, Henri Lefebvre and Donald Nicholson-Smith, vol. 22, no. 6, 2014, pp. 887–95.
- Nazar, Abroo. "Silencing of Subaltern in *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*. " *International Journal of English and Education* 5.2 (2016): 1-2.
- Ondaatje, Michael. *The English Patient*: Special Edition. A&C Black, 2009. Orwell, George. 1984: Nineteen Eighty-Four. BoD–Books on Demand, 2023.
- Paul, Sourav, and Shri Krishan Rai. "Sexual violence and Sainthood: A Critical Study of *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* 10.3 (2018): 121-27.
- Prado, Dante. *The Crisis of Laughter at the End of the Long Nineteenth Century: Laughter in Thomas Mann's *The Magic Mountain**. Diss. University of Calgary, 2022.
- Roy, Arundhati. *The Ministry of Utmost Happiness: A Novel*. Vintage, 2017.
- Remarque, Erich Maria. *All Quiet On the Western Front*. Vol.68. Bloomsbury Publishing USA, 2004.
- Sibers, Tobin, ed. *Heterotopia: Postmodern Utopia and the Body Politic*. University of Michigan Press, 1994.

Sie Paul, Sourav, and Shri Krishan Rai. "Sexual Violence and Sainthood: A Critical Study of *Our Lady of Alice Bhatti*." *Rupkatha Journal on Interdisciplinary Studies in Humanities* 10.3 (2018): 121-27.

Solzhenitsyn, Aleksandr. *Cancer Ward: A Novel*. Macmillan, 1991.

Spivak, Gayatri Chakravorty. "Can the Subaltern Speak?" In Ashcroft, Bill, et al., eds. *The Post-Colonial Studies Reader*. London and New York: Routledge, 1999 [1995;1997]. 66-109.

Stenner, Paul, and Monica Greco. "On *The Magic Mountain*: The Novel as Liminal Affective Technology." *International Political Anthropology* 11.1 (2018).

Teagarden, Sarah. *Technological Heterotopia*. Dissertation, School of the Art Institute of Chicago, 2019.

Tsing, Anna Lowenhaupt. *The Mushroom at the End of the World: On the Possibility of Life in Capitalist Ruins*. Princeton University Press, 2021.