# EXPLORING TRANSLANGUAGING PRACTICES IN ENGLISH CLASSROOM: A SOCIOLINGUISTIC ANALYSIS OF GRADUATE-LEVEL ENGLISH LANGUAGE TEACHING

BY

## MUHAMMAD UMAR RAZAQ



## NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES

### RAWALPINDI

**December, 2023**

# Exploring Translanguaging Practices in English Classroom: A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Graduate-Level English Language Teaching

By

## MUHAMMAD UMAR RAZAQ

BS. Hons. English, University of Education Lahore

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF
THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

## MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

In **English Linguistics**

To

FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, RAWALPINDI

**NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, FACULTY OF LANGUAGES**

# THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

**The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defense, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Arts & Humanities for acceptance.**

**Thesis Title**: Exploring Translanguaging Practices in English Classroom: A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Graduate-Level English Language Teaching

**Submitted by:** Muhammad Umar Razaq    **Registration #:** 16MPHIL/Eng Ling/RWP/S21

Master of Philosophy
MPHIL ENGLISH LINGUISTICS

English Linguistics
Name of Discipline

Dr. Muhammad Farooq Alam                         _____
Name of Research Supervisor                          Signature of Research Supervisor

Dr. Muhammad Safeer Awan                          _____
Name of Dean (FAH)                                        Signature of Dean (FAH)

_____
            Date

# AUTHOR'S DECLARATION

I  Muhammad Umar Razaq

Son of Abdul Razaq Durrani

Registration # <u>16MPHIL/Eng Ling/RWP/S21</u>

Discipline <u>English Linguistics</u>

Candidate of **Master of Philosophy** at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby declare that the thesis **Exploring Translanguaging Practices in English Classroom: A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Graduate-Level English Language Teaching** submitted by me in partial fulfillment of MPhil degree, is my original work, and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare that it shall not, in future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any other university or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even after the award of a degree, the work may be canceled and the degree revoked.

_____
Signature of Candidate

Muhammad Umar Razaq
_____
Name of Candidate

_____
Date

# ABSTRACT

**Title: Exploring Translanguaging Practices in English Classroom: A Sociolinguistic Analysis of Graduate-Level English Language Teaching**

This research has attempted to explore Translanguaging practices in English language teaching classrooms at Graduate level of Ghazi University Dera Ghazi Khan. Translanguaging as proposed by Garcia and Le Wei (2014) which has been used as theoretical framework focuses on the process of teaching strategy in English language classroom, the phenomena of Translanguaging thereby create an ease in learning the target language and teachers teaching English employ Translanguaging as pedagogical tool in the English language classroom. This study followed the mixed method research design to collect the data for the study through three set of data collection, 1) Semi-structured interviews with the teachers, 2) Classroom observations and 3) closed ended questionnaire. This study analyzed the 10 interviews conducted with the teachers, eight classroom observations and 100 questionnaire respondents selected from the English Department of Ghazi University Dera Ghazi Khan. The study employed mixed method approach. This study found that teachers and students use Translanguaging as a technique to enhance their language learning capabilities. It was found explicitly that learners were inclined more to use Translanguaging in order to comprehend the knowledge of the target language. Thus, Translanguaging has been used as an effective tool of language learning and teaching processes. This study also found that Translanguaging is not only the necessity of classroom practices but also it can be noticed outside of the classroom activities. This study recommends different language learning and teaching strategies for the teachers and students to create a better and conducive language learning atmosphere in classrooms to build up the linguistic repertoire of the students via using Translanguaging techniques at graduate level.

**Keywords:** *Translanguaging, multilingual classroom, Bilingualism, English language teaching*

# TABLE OF CONTENTS

# LIST OF TABLES

# ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I am thankful to Allah, without whose blessing I would not have been able to complete this difficult task.

I owe thanks to Prof. Dr Muhammad Safeer Awan, Dean Faculty of Languages, Prof. Dr. Ejaz Mirza, Head Department of English for their cooperation in the entire process.

Thank you all.

# DEDICATION

This dissertation is a tribute to my devoted parents, who have always supported and inspired me in everything that I do. Additionally, I want to thank my Supervisor for serving as both a mentor and a guide for me throughout this process. I want to express my gratitude to my family and friends for their everlasting support and for always being there for me.

# CHAPTER 1

# INTRODUCTION

This study explores the linguistic intricacies of Pakistan, focusing on debates over medium and language issues such as English for social development. Urdu assimilations regional languages; regional integration or separation from certain provinces; socioeconomic status paradigm shift; mother tongue. Situated within a historical framework focusing on ethnicity and the variation of languages, this research discusses 'Translanguaging' as an essential tool in understanding everyday acts involving several diverse language forms that occur at educational institutions. Targeting language planning and policies, the research article steers through a complex path of managing linguistic diversity with educational efficacy in Pakistan.

The translanguaging behaviors of learners, which emphasize the usage of many other languages, served as the inspiration for this study. Translanguaging is a language approach that maximizes communication potential by enabling bilinguals to accomplish a communicative act through access to various linguistic elements of independent languages. According to Garcia (2009a), translanguaging is therefore a responsible communication technique that provides everyone with opportunities for communication and education. As a result, groups of learners from linguistically varied backgrounds were seen engaging in oral translanguaging to test out concepts and strategies for learning and improving literacy skills.

Translanguaging is based on the easily visible actions of bilinguals to make sense of their multilingual environment rather than language. As such, translanguaging is more than just code-switching, even if the phrase encompasses it. The researcher was advised to watch these activities in the classroom, as well as how they are presented and portrayed, to help graduate students negotiate various meanings using translanguaging techniques. The researcher's goal to find out how translanguaging techniques affect the learning process in a multilingual classroom where English is the target language further directs this investigation.

Pakistan, being a multilingual country, has insurmountable challenges in terms of language planning and the medium of instruction in educational institutions. There is a philosophical division between supporters of English, Urdu, and regional languages. While English is crucial for science and education, Urdu represents a sense of patriotism. The purpose of this study is to look at people's opinions concerning these languages and their decision to use them as a language of learning and teaching. Ethnic origins are so strong that, since independence, the language of teaching in educational institutions has been a governmental concern. Two languages are troublesome, three languages are inefficient, and more languages are ludicrous. Urdu, as a national language, has always been a strong contender for bringing the country together. However, according to the condition of institutional efficiency, English has prevailed (Rehman, 2002).

The term "translanguaging" comes from the Welsh word "Trawsieithu" and was developed in 1994 by researcher Cen Williams, who conducted a practical school study in which budding bilinguals switched between two learning languages: their native tongue and English as a second language. Basically, the term refers to the use of more than one language in a classroom, or it can be used to describe the way bilinguals use their linguistic resources to make sense of and interact with the world around them. Later, the phrase was transliterated as translanguaging, which is currently the name for a concept that encompasses a wide range of viewpoints on the use of multilingual materials. Garcia defines the term as participating in a two- or more-language conversation (Garcia, 2009, p. 44).

Baker defines translanguaging as "the process of molding experiences via the use of two or more languages to achieve insight and knowledge'' (Baker, 2011, p. 288) Even though the notion of translanguaging is widely used, the original instructional purpose still holds sway in the sector. CenWilliams In school, the translanguaging methodology had a rigid concept of rotating between Welsh and English. However, the pedagogical vein of translanguaging has broadened to include studies on instructors' approaches to teaching kids' identity development and instructional content, presenting the view that translanguaging is a flexible multilingual resource that allows students to use two languages to improve their communication and learning ability.

Since Pakistan is a multilingual and multicultural state where education is mostly provided at four levels, English is prioritized above other languages, which is strongly prohibited. Some students are perceived as having trouble expressing themselves in other languages; others are referred to as "English Medium" students, who acquire proficiency in both English and Urdu through Islamiat and Pakistani studies taught in Urdu. This type of education is frequently linked to government-run institutions where students' performance is viewed as being extremely low; thousands of "Madrassas" fall into this category, where teaching and learning of English is prohibited and instruction is provided. These "Madrassa" students struggle mightily to compete.

The researcher was curious to find out how learners continue to employ hybrid language practices in order to develop communicative competency, given the learners' varied cultural and linguistic backgrounds. The researcher has been compelled by these phenomena to look at the roles and efficacy of translanguaging techniques in the process of learning in a multilingual university classroom. Investigations also demonstrated a reason for choosing a qualitative approach and research design, as well as a justification against the study's stated goals and objectives. The primary focus of this study is to examine how translanguaging techniques affect students taking a Bs (Hons) English course at Ghazi University in D.G. Khan, Pakistan, as they learn the language.

According to the current study, translanguaging helps people understand a subject matter more deeply by conversing in one language and writing in another. Students frequently turn to what they already know from their original language while learning a second language. This helps learners comprehend information and communicate in a second language. In Pakistan and Asian settings, translanguaging research is not particularly common. There are three main trends in this field. In order to develop teachable practices, improve students' academic achievement, and raise their language awareness, academics have first demonstrated the importance and potential of merging heritage languages in the classroom.

## 1.1 Background of the Study

Rahman, who cites a Pakistani report from 1998, says Punjabi is spoken by 44.15 percent of the population, whereas Pashto is spoken by 15.42 percent. Sindhi, with 14.10 percent of the population, and Balochi, with 3.57 percent,

are the next most spoken languages in Pakistan. There are indeed regionally prominent languages, including Urdu (as well as the official language), Saraiki, and Hindko, spoken by 26.33 percent of the total population. As per the fact book, Urdu is considered the second language of even more than 105 million inhabitants. According to Rahman in the report on the dispersal of languages in Pakistan, Punjabi, Saraiki, Potohari, and Pahari are spoken in Punjab, whereas Sindhi is spoken in rural Sindh. Urdu is spoken by most people in urban Sindh, although Gujrati is spoken by a certain important minority. Pashto is among the most widely spoken languages in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa (KPK). Peshawar (the capital of the province of KPK) and its nearby cities, notably Bannu, Kohat, Naushehra, Tarbela, Haripur, Abbottabad, Swabi, and Ghazi, also speak Hindko as a prominent language. Baluchistan is a multilingual province of Pakistan, with Balochi, Pashto, and Brahvi being the prominent languages. Persian and Urdu, as well as Sindhi and Saraiki, have a strong effect on these languages (Rahman, 2002).

English, on the other hand, has a unique place in the country. It is widely utilized in politics, courts, the military, and civil bureaucracy, as well as in elitist private institutions, as a medium of education. It is also used as a medium of teaching for university-level education. Professional success necessitates language competence, and society has developed into a bilingual culture. In terms of communication and access to power, Urdu is second only to English. It is considered the country's national language because of its capacity to unify speakers of various regional languages across the country. With English and Urdu spoken widely throughout the country, Pakistan is best described as a trilingual setting (Talat, 2002).

Most importantly, bilingualism has become a valuable global resource that may be traded in the marketplace in the twenty-first century, and the teaching of extra languages has shifted to the college and university level for language-majority pupils. As language awareness, content, language-integrated learning, and bilingual programs become more common at the primary level, translation to a second language is making a comeback (Wu et al., 2020). This tendency has been seen in bilingual and multilingual programs, particularly for language minority groups, where the recent emergence of translanguaging education has brought translation along as a tool to adapt to the new ways of

understanding bilingualism, even if translanguaging theory answers to a different epistemology concerning language and bilingualism than translation. Experts contend that teaching kids about translanguaging increases their awareness of different cultures, which is crucial for fostering equality and respect in a multicultural society. Multilingual and bilingual perspectives can be linked to disciplinary language in many educational fields since second language learners's benefit from engaging in teaching practices that combine disciplinary content with appropriate linguistic skills. There are many different languages spoken in Pakistan (Manan et al., 2019).

In connection with the history of translanguaging, translanguaging as a pedagogical tool has played a significant role in the history of language instruction, particularly at educational institutions. It next offers ideas and research findings in translanguaging classrooms before concentrating on the pedagogic approaches that teachers have created to incorporate these findings. Finally, the study discusses future directions for translanguaging as a pedagogic practice and translanguaging research in educational institutions. Separate places were intended to be assigned to the two languages based on day, time, subject, professors, room, and even building. Therefore, the researcher is interested in knowing how the learners continued to use hybrid language practices to advance their communicative competence, considering the learners' diverse cultural and linguistic backgrounds. This phenomenon has pushed the researcher to investigate the roles and effects of translanguaging strategies on the acquisition of the English language in a multilingual classroom. This study's main objective is to examine the effects of translation methods on teachers at post-graduate institutions.

### 1.2 The Statement of Problem

English language teachers from diverse linguistic backgrounds employ a variety of linguistic resources to foster competence in their students in the target language. To enhance the clarity of this process, it is imperative to delve into specific examples of how these teachers deploy linguistic resources in their teaching practices. This departure from exclusive reliance on the norms of the target language is noteworthy, as it suggests a dynamic navigation through different linguistic resources. Therefore, it is apparent that English

language teachers often draw on their already-acquired linguistic resources to facilitate the learning of a second language in a multilingual classroom. In essence, learners frequently resort to translanguaging, utilizing it not only to build a linguistic repertoire but also to enhance the convenience of the second language learning process.

Translanguaging supports language phenomenally in teaching English in the classroom, but certain complexities may arise during its implementation in the classroom. One of the most common factors is reliance on the native language. Students may become dependent on their native language, which demolishes their learning ability to learn English. It creates serious problems and becomes an obstacle to learning the English language. It restricts their ability to use the language in English-speaking environments. Another problem is the language proficiency of the teacher. In most cases, teachers are not fluent in all the languages that are spoken by their students. This creates a huge problem in the learning environment. The miscommunication problem becomes prevalent in this way of learning. Another factor that destroys the learning environment is the unequal language proficiency of the students sitting in the English language classroom. This leads to disproportions in participation and learning outcomes when translanguaging is employed. Weaker students mostly rely on their native language. Translanguaging also has a negative impact on students' native languages or dialects; this can create a reluctance among students to use their home language in the classroom, even when it could facilitate learning. It also disrupts efforts to create an immersive English-language learning environment. Which is crucial for developing proficiency. Students may revert to their native language too frequently, hindering their exposure to and practice of English. If teachers are not proficient in all the languages spoken by their students, then during the assessment process, it becomes challenging to accurately gauge students' English language skills and identify areas for improvement.

The prevalence of a second or additional language is increasing globally due to the growing use of English as a language of instruction and heightened population mobility. Translanguaging, being learner-centered, supports the development of all languages employed by learners. In the pursuit of language and content proficiency, it blurs the boundaries between

languages, fostering metalinguistic awareness. Pedagogical translanguaging, utilizing the learner's entire linguistic repertoire, aims to enhance language and content competencies in school settings. This study delves into the application of pedagogical translanguaging in teaching a second language and its potential as a valuable strategy for safeguarding and promoting minority languages. In line with this focus, the study specifically investigates the role of translanguaging in a bilingual classroom during the process of learning a target language.

## 1.3 Objectives of the Study

The researcher meets the following research objectives:

1. To investigate the effectiveness of Translanguaging in the process of teaching English language.

2. To explore the phenomena of Translanguaging which creates as an ease in learning the target language.

3. To explore the implication of Translanguaging as an instructional method in the English language classroom?

## 1.4 Research Questions

The study attempts to answer the following research Questions:

1. How does Translanguaging affect the process of teaching and serve as valuable strategy in English language classroom?

2. How does the phenomena of Translanguaging create an ease in learning the target language?

3. Why do English language teachers use translanguaging as an instructional method in the English language classroom?

## 1.5 Significance of the study

Translanguaging, according to the present study, enhances a deeper comprehension of topic matter by conversing in one language and writing in another. When working with a second language, students constantly resort to what they already know from their first language. This aids learners in the information processing and communication of a second language. Translanguaging research is not very prevalent in Pakistani and Asian contexts, with three primary tendencies in this subject. First, academicians have established the value and promise of integrating heritage languages in the

classroom to build teachable practices and increase students' academic performance and language awareness.

The study's major purpose is to encourage students to speak out in class and make personal connections between what they're learning and their real-life experiences. L1 is important in learning and comprehending the target language in each situation when employing several languages to build meaning and interact. In some unique contexts, the target language is more capable of directly expressing the semantic content based on the context, while the dominant language is simultaneously replaced by the target language, and the process of translanguaging between them can be better linked with their linguistic repertoires.

## 1.6 Delimitations

This research delves into the phenomenon of translanguaging, examining its manifestations in both spoken and written communication. Dera Ghazi Khan District acts as a specific geographical boundary for the study, potentially offering insights into regional variations or influences on translanguaging practices. Furthermore, the research narrows its focus to graduate-level students enrolled in the English department at Ghazi University, Dera Ghazi Khan.

Specifically, the study seeks to investigate how translanguaging is used and perceived in an academic context. The selection of graduate-level students in the English department indicates a greater level of language competency and academic engagement, resulting in a more nuanced grasp of translanguaging's implications for language acquisition and academic discourse. Furthermore, focusing on a single institution, such as Ghazi University, allows the researcher to analyze institutional issues that may impact translanguaging procedures, such as curriculum design or language policy.

This research design allows for a detailed examination of translanguaging within a defined context, shedding light on its role and significance in language use among graduate students in Dera Ghazi Khan District, particularly within an academic framework.

## 1.7 Organization of the Study

This study is comprised of five chapters, each contributing to a comprehensive exploration of the subject matter.

**Chapter 1: Introduction** This chapter serves as a comprehensive introduction, encompassing the study background, literature review, research questions, research methodology, theoretical framework, tools for data gathering, data analysis, problem description, importance of the study, and study delimitation.

**Chapter 2: Literature Review** The primary objective of this chapter is to underscore the existing empirical research relevant to the subject. It consists of three main sections, each containing sub-sections that provide a nuanced understanding of the topic. A summary follows the conclusion of this chapter.

**Chapter 3: Methodology** This chapter delves into a detailed discussion of the methodological approaches adopted for the study, offering insights into the research design, data collection procedures, and analytical techniques employed.

**Chapter 4: Results** Specifically designated for presenting the findings derived from the collected data, this chapter provides a comprehensive overview of the empirical outcomes of the study.

**Chapter 5: Conclusion and Recommendations** Concluding the study, this chapter offers a succinct yet thorough examination of the key findings, a detailed discussion, and a summary. Furthermore, it concludes with valuable recommendations for future research endeavors.

# CHAPTER 2

# LITERATURE REVIEW

## 2.1 Overview

This chapter is specified for discussing terms such as...

- The study aims to investigate how translanguaging affects learner performance and language acquisition.

- To explore that the norms of translanguaging are effective in bilingual/Multilingual classroom in fully understanding the information provided.

- To distinguish concepts of translanguaging from terminology like bilingualism, multilingualism, polyglot, and plurilingualism that are connected to it.

## 2.2 Introduction

To convey the key idea of the current research, this chapter offers a condensed literature review. An overview of the entire procedure is provided in the introduction. Because translanguaging is largely considered an approach to bilinguals and multilinguals, a discussion of translanguaging norms as they are implemented in the emergent multilingual educational system is held first.

Additionally, the global standard of translanguaging, its implementation in educational settings, and its impact have been discussed. Later, a distinction between bilingualism and multilingualism, code-switching, pluralism, and polyglot was brought up. In the section that follows, the extended definition of bilingualism in the form of multilingualism is given concerning multilingual education, and its applicability is demonstrated with the aid of newly developed ideas like plurilingualism and translanguaging. Translanguaging, its origins and incorporation into educational policies, as well as how it differs from other terms such as code-switching and dynamic bilingualism, were discussed in the final section. Its applicability has been demonstrated by translation, co-language, translanguaging, and related practices in multilingual education. The subsections that follow this section discuss its details.

## 2.3 Translanguaging

In the context of the present research, the topic of using the first language in a second language class has generated significant debate in the field of teaching bilingual students. The main goal of educational institutions around the world is to help students develop intellectually and approach problems in the real world with deep understanding and critical thinking (Rebelo et al., 2023). This is followed by problem-solving skills they have acquired throughout their educational career. An examination of the literature on the topic reveals the need for more research on translanguaging in the Pakistani context. Rafi and Fox (2021) suggest that translanguaging is a rising educational strategy in other countries. The flexibility and effectiveness of translanguaging are the main topics of the current study in the context of higher education in Pakistan. Few studies have focused on how teachers understand, perceive, and use translanguaging, even though there have been many studies on the many aspects of translanguaging (Ticheloven et al., 2021).

Garcia and Wei (2014) define "translanguaging" as a novel pedagogical technique in their book "Translanguaging: Language, Bilingualism, and Education." They begin by defining the term "language" as a link between all separate activities and processes, such as language interaction and development, regarded as the collective effort for extracting meaning from the outside environment. Translanguaging offers many viewpoints on bilingualism and multilingualism. Contrary to what has traditionally been assumed, translanguaging claims that bilinguals, multilinguals, and all other language users really select and apply certain traits from a unified linguistic repertoire to understand and negotiate a variety of communication circumstances (Otheguy et al., 2015). Translanguaging is another term for a language-teaching approach that respects and utilises students' diverse and dynamic linguistic practices. Translanguaging has demonstrated how colonial modernist language ideas created and maintained social injustices based on racial, cultural, and linguistic differences (Dolsa, 2020). It challenges conventional wisdom on bilingualism, multilingualism, and bilingual development to overthrow the hierarchies that have rendered the use of minority groups' native languages inadmissible. Academics have been able to better expand, build upon, or explain

translanguaging views by contrasting and contrasting them with competing and complementing conceptions of bilingualism. The ongoing debates between those who have mostly accepted translanguaging and others who oppose or just partially accept its foundations are covered in detail by academics (Dolsa, 2020).

The use of translanguaging in education has sparked the most interest—and accordingly, controversy (García & Lin, 2017). Concerns about language instruction are being worked on by various educators. The formation of new languages for all people, as well as minority languages, has embraced translanguaging and education. Translanguaging has much to contribute to our understanding of bilinguals' language practices since it prioritizes bilingual performances over only monolingual ones. Hungwe (2019) thinks that translanguaging, as an instructional method, makes use of learners' native tongues in ways that improve their comprehension of and engagement with challenging texts and subjects. Serai (2022) explored the practices and attitudes towards translanguaging in Algerian university EFL classrooms in their doctoral dissertation. They suggest that the two identified languages that are the focus of bilingual education are also encouraged to flourish because translanguaging pedagogy sees them as a horizontal continuum rather than as discrete compartments in a hierarchical relationship (Serai, 2022).

As a result of the globalization of multilingual and multicultural academic contexts, translanguaging has developed as a topic of interest in the educational sector as an effective teaching approach for second language learning (Leung & Valdés, 2019). The same is true in Pakistan, where a high proportion of students come from diverse cultural backgrounds and speak their mother tongue at home and at school, resulting in inadequate exposure to the target language used in the classroom. Teachers are increasingly adopting translanguaging as a pedagogical technique for catering to the learning needs of multilingual students (Cenoz & Gorter, 2020). Same is trend in Pakistan despite the fact that the higher education commission of Pakistan's prescribed monolingual pedagogical technique when teaching a foreign language, as evidenced by the gradual proliferation of translanguaging in the multilingual settings of Pakistani higher education institutes' classrooms (Hussain & Khan, 2021).

The current study seeks to shed some insight on Pakistani teachers' conceptualization of translanguaging in this context. To facilitate effective, goal-oriented learning, it also incorporates the instructors' perspectives on the use of translanguaging as a pedagogical strategy in multilingual classrooms. Therefore, it has a better understanding of the opinions, viewpoints, feelings, and attitudes of the professors at Pakistani higher education institutions regarding the effects of translanguaging in the classroom. Emerging bilinguals can improve their language abilities and synchronize their motions with more experienced learners by promoting translanguaging. Pakistan is regarded as a country with substantial linguistic and cultural variety, both domestically and internationally. Pakistan is also known as the Land of Many Languages (Rahman, 2006). Top of Form In Pakistan, children are born speaking several languages, which they subsequently acquire and incorporate into their linguistic repertoire. This is one of the key reasons why rules governing teaching, terminology used by students and teachers, and educational practices are inconsistent. A monolingual approach to teaching foreign languages has always been advised. The monolingual method has been impacted by the various language regulations and national ideologies of numerous nations. The complexity of multilingualism in diverse contexts and social domains has been described using a range of terms by opponents of linguistic purism. For instance, Canagrajah put out the idea of codemeshing.

## 2.4 Emergence of Translanguaging

In the 1980s, Welsh bilingual schooling was the place where translanguaging first emerged. Cen Williams coined the term "trawsieithu," which was later translated into English as "translanguaging," to refer to "the planned and systematic use of two languages for teaching and learning within the same session." The pedagogic potential of translanguaging has started to be recognized by practitioners working in English as an Additional Language (EAL) situations in the UK in ways that may also be helpful to other language education practitioners. Contemporary debates on translanguaging are closely related to a current ELT rethink of what Hall and Cook (2012) refer to as "own-language usage" in language classes.

Translanguaging conceptually adheres to Cummins' theories, whose work has greatly inspired EAL practitioners globally. His "common underlying proficiency" (CUP) and "linguistic interdependence" theories place a significant focus on the benefits of transfer in language learning. Researchers who work in multilingual classrooms use the term "translanguaging" to characterise multilingual oral interaction and the use of other languages in written works (Cummins, 2001). Translanguaging suggests an approach to language that goes against some of the common ideas about ELT, regardless of whether it is seen as primarily a pedagogy or a style of engagement. Language is seen as an ongoing "process" rather than a "thing."

Translanguaging is a contentious subject with challenges in research, theory, and practice. Some scholars question the need for this theory given that the well-known concepts of code switching and code mixing already provide a framework for understanding the use of multiple languages. Blackledge et al. (2014) have mentioned the disadvantages of this position. They argue that it makes false distinctions between so-called monolingual, bilingual, and multilingual individuals and suggest that, despite only speaking and writing one particular "language," we are all, in a sense, "multilingual" since we have access to a range of language-using strategies. Researchers assert that concepts like translanguaging put silly ideas like "standard" and "target" language, with their underlying hierarchies of languages, to the test and argue against the deficit ideologies that surround multilingualism in schools. Furthermore, they claim that by shedding light on "the ways in which linguistic resources are deployed in our societies and how this deployment of resources reproduces, negotiates, and contests social difference and social inequality," among other ideas, the concept of translanguaging raises critical issues pertaining to social justice in language learning (Blackledge et al., 2014).

The basis of the issues with translanguaging in ELT policy and practice is what Hall and Cook refer to as the "entrenched monolingualism" of these components. Despite the massive increases in migration and mobility throughout the world and the concurrent expansion of multilingualism in the global north, Cummins' "two solitudes"—in which languages are kept apart and pupils' native tongues are ignored—remain widespread in many language schools. National and standard languages continue to receive significant priority

in language policies, curriculum, and evaluation procedures. But encouraging signals are present. Researchers who are devoted to seeing this possibility in their classroom-based research and teachers who understand the value of translanguaging in developing relationships with their students that produce reciprocal empowerment may one day establish translanguaging pedagogies (Hall & Cook, 2012).

## 2.5 Translanguaging and Education

Translanguaging has been added to the study of language in society from a poststructuralist critical perspective. However, translanguaging has proven to be most successful—and perhaps most contentious—in the educational sector. Around the world, structuralist views of language usage are frequently accepted in official educational institutions. Politicians, educators, and administrators continue to see bilingualism from additive or subtractive perspectives on a global scale. Translanguaging is now accepted as a practice in classrooms all around the world as globalisation picks up speed and more multilingual students enroll in schools. The popularity of translanguaging has grown across Europe because of the promotion of plurilingualism, which enables individuals to use many languages to varying degrees and for a variety of purposes. Translanguaging has been observed as a practice with students who are refugees or immigrants, as well as in more conventional language settings with students who want to study many languages (Council of Europe, 2000).

Garcia and Lin have talked about the advantages and disadvantages of using translanguaging in school. The weaker version promotes multilingual teaching methods that employ what society would classify as the students' L1 while still supporting national languages and looser boundaries in education. In this aspect, Cummins has criticized the "two solitudes" and called for flexible teaching strategies to promote language transfer. However, a strong argument in favour of translanguaging as a linguistic theory contends that bilinguals build a repertoire of just one language from which they learn to select the appropriate traits. This section also emphasises the significant contribution that educational institutions have made to the development of exclusive linguistic categories, the regulation of linguistic behaviour, and the preservation of the English language's integrity. The significant use of translanguaging theory may enable

students to develop a critical outlook on the growth of standard languages. Only then would they be able to utilise their students' complete linguistic repertoire, support the growth of their bilingualism, and assist them in choosing personality qualities suitable for an academic setting. (Garcia & Lin, 2016).

No matter whether training focuses on those who communicate using minoritized or standard language practices, universal bilingualism will continue to elude us until all language educators take a critical view of named standardized languages. For students to acquire what is seen as another named language in society, translanguaging must be acknowledged when they add new vocabulary to the unified language repertoire that they learn to use in social interactions with others. Most of the translanguaging that occurs in classrooms is student-led. Translanguaging-based, explicit teacher-directed pedagogical practices are being developed because of the theory's widespread use in educational settings over the past few years (Celic & Seltzer, 2013).

Translanguaging has been observed to be helpful in education since it promotes more unbiased learning and gets rid of prejudices that could impede development. Since it is based on outdated prejudices against bilingualism and primarily western conceptions of unification through one common language, translanguaging still sparks debate between those who support it and those who contradict it as an educational method, but it is gaining popularity in its use in language instruction (Vogel & Garcia, 2017). Some people are against translanguaging because they think it would obscure the crucial distinction between each language's developments. Even though today's society is made up of individuals who understand several languages, the national language is still the predominant language of instruction in schools across the world (Garcia & Wei, 2014). However, it cannot be denied that today's society is multilingual, and in this sense, the idea of translanguaging in education has proven to be quite beneficial (Vogel & Garcia, 2017). To promote plurilingualism, teach multicultural classes with children who are immigrants or refugees, and even teach more languages to individuals who are eager to learn them, translanguaging is beginning to be employed on a worldwide scale as societies become more globalized (Vogel & Garcia, 2017).

Garcia and Wei (2014) define translanguaging in education as the practice of treating languages differently than two separate languages and

instead considering them as one body of information. They assert that translanguaging may be utilised by all instructors and in all classes to promote impartial learning. The words "weak" and "strong" variants of translanguaging are used in education to differentiate between strategies that promote national language while allowing for the softening of barriers and bilingual teaching techniques that also allow for language transfer, while the strong version refers to the formation of a single repertoire from which the learners pick. This powerful version also highlights how the idea of a standard language has been formed and supported in schools, which is at odds with the idea of a unified linguistic repertoire and may inhibit kids from becoming bilingual and from developing their capacity to recognize and choose between characteristics for different reasons (Vogel & Garcia, 2017).

## 2.6 Translanguaging in today's Classroom

As our understanding of multilingual communication has evolved, academic interest in the idea of translanguaging has increased. It is a neologism that has evolved to represent ideas such as the following: Multilinguals have access to a repertory of languages for communication. For them, languages form a linked system rather than an isolated and distinct one. Multilingual competence is a result of regional practices where several languages are negotiated for communication. As a result, multilingual proficiency is centered on repertoire development, or mastering the numerous functions that different languages fulfill. Competence is multicompetence that works in concert with the several languages in one's repertory rather than a set of distinct competences for each language. Much research is being done on translanguaging since it is being observed in many social and educational contexts. This activity is the subject of several theories from different disciplines. The terms mentioned below are used for translanguaging in a variety of academic fields (Canagrajah, 2006).

There have also been studies on translanguaging that ignore procedures in favour of a focus on the result. This strategy is described in Blommaert's book Grassroots Literacy (2008). Blommaert studies and evaluates two Congolese subjects' historical and biographical works to comprehend their decisions. He describes multilingual, multimodal writing as heterography, which further

complicates matters. But because he can only observe the results and is unable to speak with the writers directly, he develops a false understanding of translanguaging (because they are dead). Since they lack access to elite literacy, his research demonstrates that the participants from the Democratic Republic of the Congo employ translanguaging. Blommaert further thinks that because the authors are not consciously attempting to reach their intended audience, they are (Blommaert's, 2008). To combat such bad reading, we need to do more than merely document instances of translanguaging and analyse their linguistic and literary realisations. There must be more questions concerning the procedure, like: What strategies do trans linguists employ to help readers' and listeners' understanding of their language choices? What choices did they have regarding laws and customs when they were producing? What elements play a role in their decision-making? What planning or cognitive processes go into the production of translation? By asking these questions, we may gain more knowledge about the translanguaging processes and enhance the way we teach them to students (Blommaert's, 2008). In addition, although much research on translanguaging has till now concentrated on spoken interactions between individuals, we haven't examined how it functions in other genres and communication modalities. For instance, young people use codes in computer-mediated communications. They have been referred to as hybridity rather than cases of translanguaging. We may compare these interactions with face-to-face interactions to see if the translanguaging strategies differ. There isn't enough study on translanguaging in writing. In fact, some scholars adamantly oppose translanguaging in written works. Combining coding systems in writing, according to individuals who speak in a variety of coding systems, is improper (Lam, 2004).

Studies reveal that translanguaging occurs often in educational contexts. Most of these studies demonstrate that educators do not purposefully employ educational strategies to encourage acts of translanguaging. They show up on their own. In many of these circumstances, translanguaging really occurs discreetly, behind the instructors' backs, in classes that strictly prohibit language mixing. When teachers have taken a more proactive approach, they have created settings where students may use their multilingual repertoire for educational goals and have collaborated with students to use the repertoire as a resource.

Two pedagogical approaches, the biliteracy workshop and the continuum of the biliteracy model (Hornberger 2003), theorize how students may transition between languages and learning modes while they are learning. Before we can develop instructional approaches based on these broadly construed concepts, there is still a long way to go (Hornberger, 2003).

A recent classroom study indicates that translanguaging is common among multilingual students. Translanguaging cannot be completely prevented by monolingual educational programmes. With minimal pedagogical effort on the part of educators, it is achievable. However, such findings might suggest that translanguaging is not a skill that has to be taught. There is little more that the school can do to support translanguaging among multilingual children because it is already well-established in their home and community contexts, even if it does occur spontaneously in the most unexpected situations. Such investigations are supported by cognitive orientations to competence, which maintain that translanguaging "comes naturally" to multilinguals (Bhatia et al., 2004).

## 2.7 Teaching Foreign Language in the Context of Globalization

Due to the rising globalization of people, wealth, and conceitedness brought about by territorial social networks, it has become more difficult to conceptualize culture in foreign language study without succumbing to reductionist cliches or tourist depictions of foreign reality. Although linguists have identified connections between culture, ways of thinking, and ways of speaking, foreign language instructors have only just started to address the global realities that their students are exposed to. It is no longer adequate to teach a national monolingual native speaker's L2 coupled to a uniform national C2. The goal has changed to being a multilingual, multicultural speaker who can "work across languages" and transition between various cultural contexts (Hanks, 2015).

Language, language usage, learning, and instruction continue to be impacted by globalization, which Giddens (1990) described as the deepening of worldwide social relations. Through the lens of learner-centered principles, I investigate the nature of globalization and its impacts on online language training in this article. I also examine the conflicts that arise between competing

ideas and participation techniques in virtual learning environments. In conclusion, I argue that a focus on the learner must be balanced by a focus on technology or innovation within global learning settings to interact with and solve new concerns, difficulties, and practices, as well as to improve our understanding of language learning and teaching in the twenty-first century (Giddens, 1990).

The dynamic and innovative methods used today to teach and learn languages are unmatched in history. Even if electronic class rooms have enabled even the shyest students to write more freely, video and the Internet have made authentic materials more available than ever, and telecollaboration and social networks have improved students' access to real native speakers in real-world situations, there has never been a greater contradiction between what is taught in the classroom and what the students learn outside of it. Language teachers are confused about what to teach or how to prepare their students for real-world situations because of how much the world has changed over the past several decades (Hanks, 2015).

## 2.8 Foreign Language Teaching and Translanguaging in Pakistan

The colonial pasts of many English language teaching (ELT) contexts have impacted how language is conceptualized, how language regulations are made, and how language education is organized. ELT in colonized countries continues to support the imperialism of English through the naming (i.e., labeling of linguistic phenomena as distinct languages, dialects, and language varieties), separation and hierarchy of languages, and predominance of monolingual policies and practices in the classroom, to name just a few (Motha, 2014). Translanguaging, a theory and methodology that challenges colonial understandings of language and monoglossic norms in language education, has the potential to release language practices that have been rendered invisible by dismal thinking in ELT (Motha, 2014).

Translanguaging is the idea that multilingual learners only employ linguistic components from one linguistic repertoire rather than truly possessing two or more distinct language systems (Vogel & Garcia, 2017). Translanguaging as a pedagogy encourages instructors to use all their students'

linguistic and semiotic repertoires to support their learning rather than requiring them to keep languages outside of the classroom. The use of translanguaging as a pedagogy in educational settings that addresses socially and politically imposed language limits is hindered by ideological and organizational hurdles. This study utilizes data from a collaborative translanguaging pedagogy created through teacher-researcher collaboration to address these difficulties and investigates them in connection to the Malaysian language teaching context (Garcia et al., 2021).

ELT has long been a language and culture vacuum, disconnected from the multilingual reality of the students in its classrooms and society. Despite the fluid integration of linguistic activities that take place outside of the classroom, languages are taught independently and in a hierarchical manner in schools. The classification and hierarchy of languages must be viewed from the standpoint of colonial objectives. Languages were developed because of colonialism, say Makoni and Pennycook, "the mapping of European colonial and Neo-colonial concepts onto numerous settings." The process of classifying languages (i.e., by creating categories that included the names of ethnic groups, languages, and how they were to be defined) and drawing borders between them justified the colonizer's use of linguistic practices and expertise (Makoni & Pennycook, 2005).

A translanguaging pedagogy can decolonize the teaching of English as a second language by bringing together languages that have traditionally been divided, hierarchic, and racialized because of colonialism. The collaborative translanguaging pedagogy created through teacher-researcher collaboration in this study addressed the customization of languages brought on by English-only policies as well as the separation of roles of teacher, researcher, and learner in the classroom. A collaborative approach was especially responsive to the needs of the Malaysian environment since it supported the collectivist ideas widely respected in Malaysian society. However, much more work must be done before translanguaging in Malaysia and other contexts may lead to significant changes in the social, political, and institutional landscape. If we assume that languages were designated because of colonial endeavours all over the world, then a translanguaging pedagogy must aim to not only unite languages but also to disinvest and rebuild them (Makoni & Pennycook, 2005).

## 2.9 Translanguaging and Multilingualism

People always speak, no matter where they are. Language is a tool used in the most complex type of human communication. No matter where it is, the community won't be cut off from language exchange. Due to linguistic contact, Pakistan, with its multilingual audience, surely experiences the phenomenon of several languages. One of these occurrences is the emergence of multilingualism in a society. Diglossia and linguistic diversity are two additional criteria that are necessary for this phenomenon to exist as it does. Language variations are brought on by diglossia, which is one of the effects of the phenomenon of bilingualism, as well as formal and casual situations (Heller, 2007).

The idea of heteroglossia languages, which values bilingualism in and of itself, is promoted by a modern concept in bilingual education called translanguaging. Multilingualism does not exist, according to certain translanguaging scholars who have questioned whether separate languages really exist. I argue that the political use of language names can and should be distinguished from the social and structural idealizations used to study linguistic diversity by favouring what I refer to as an integrated multilingual model of individual bilingualism as opposed to the unitary model and dual competence model. Grammars are further distinguished from linguistic repertoires by my claim that bilinguals, like monolinguals, have a single language repertoire but a very diverse mental grammar. This method represents what I call a multilingual viewpoint on translanguaging.

Translanguaging, a new term in bilingual and multilingual education, has given voice to a heteroglossia language philosophy that sees bilingualism as a self-sustaining communal resource as opposed to passively allowing a change to monolingualism in the dominant language. However, some translanguaging academics now claim that multilingualism does not exist and wonder if distinct languages do exist. According to Makoni and Pennycook (2007), rather than existing as genuine things in the world or coming from or resembling actual settings, languages are the products of social, cultural, and political processes. These results were motivated by the colonial history of

language names and restrictions as seen from a postmodernist viewpoint on language planning and policy (Makoni & Pennycook, 2007).

Denying the existence of several languages and, consequently, code switching, has significant consequences. The empirical evidence for rejecting the deficit perspective of language mixing, a significant and often-cited body of fundamental scientific research, would disappear if code switching didn't exist. We lose the scientific case against a deficit viewpoint on bilingualism by opting for the latter over the former, leaving us with only an ideological one. In other words, we cannot both hold a favourable view of bilingualism and reject the existence of multilingualism and code switching by relying on code switching studies (Makoni & Pennycook, 2007).

## 2.9.1 Multilingual Language diversity in English classes (Pedagogical consideration)

Recent methods mostly ignore the LI rather than expressly disallow it. The LI is only brought up when recommendations are made on how to employ task-based learning and communicative language training more sparingly. For instance, none of the important theoretical studies on task-based learning mention the use of the LI in the classroom. By excluding any references to the LI, most method descriptions suggest that the ideal classroom has the absolute minimum amount of the LI. Cook argues for the thoughtful use of the LI in the teaching of secondary and foreign languages, but he also provides a warning: "It is absolutely useful to apply considerable volumes of the L2, all other things being equal (Cook, 2001).

According to a basic learning idea, previous knowledge is the foundation for all future learning (Bransford, Brown, & Cocking, 2000). Since prior knowledge is encoded in English Language Learners' (ELL) LI cognitive schemata, especially in the early stages of English language acquisition, it is necessary to link English concepts and information with the learner's LI cognitive schemata to activate and build on past knowledge (Lucas & Katz, 1994). This linking cannot be successful if student LI is not allowed in the classroom (Lucas & Katz, 1994). Encouragement of newcomer students to write in their native language (LI) and collaboration with peers, community members, or instructional resource people to translate LI writing into English scaffold students' output in English and allow students to use higher-order and critical

thinking skills much sooner than if English is the only language that is acceptable for intellectual expression in the classroom (Cummins, 2001; Reyes, 2001). The printed versions of the dual language books that the students have created can be distributed (and made accessible online to a larger audience) or made available in the classroom or school library for other students to borrow (Cummins, 2001; Reyes, 2001).

Since the monolingual principle is still regarded as "common sense knowledge" everywhere, English teachers and students are unfairly handled in a variety of ways. It promotes the ethically dubious and scientifically unproven notion that native speakers make superior English language teachers to non-native speakers. Additionally, the rhetoric that the native languages of children are a substantial factor in academic underachievement and should be erased as soon as possible by immersion in English is meant to assume that this is the case in countries like Germany and the United States (Esser, 2006; Porter, 1990). Finally, it compels beginning students to sit out of the traditional (and occasionally ESL) class until they can speak English without sounding awkward (Esser, 2006; Porter, 1990).

## 2.10 Translanguaging and Bilingualism

The definitions of bilingualism in the past were quite constrained and substantially tilted toward monolingualism. Fluency in two languages was required to qualify as bilingual. The problem is that it might be difficult to determine if someone has native-like control in a second language (L2). This original definition has several methodological and theoretical errors. It's too vague and hard to define; it only considers skill levels and ignores non-linguistic components (Dewaele & Housen, 2002).

Based on the dynamics of worldwide migration trends, Dewaele and Stavans developed two measures of bilingualism that are used today in studies on bilingual or multilingual education. In the past 45 years, both the number of immigrants from other nations and the amount of research on bilingual or multilingual education that has been published have increased significantly. The numbers for each frequency of usage in each language are added to determine the "total frequency score" (Dewaele & Stavans, 2014). On the other side, the word "multilingualism" describes the ability of an individual or a group of

individuals to communicate effectively in three or more languages. On the other hand, monolingualism refers to the ability to speak just one language (Dewaele & Stavans, 2014). People who can speak many languages are known as polyglots or multilinguals. Most people who utilize human language, according to researchers, are at least multilingual and speak more than one language. Thus, in quantitative terms, monolingualism may be the exception rather than the rule (Auer & Le Wei 2008).

One of the most well-known researchers in bilingual education, Colin Baker, discovered how the technique of translanguaging, which he originally translated from the Welsh trawsieithu, helped young students understand and pick up knowledge. He continued by saying that for the subject to be read about, discussed, and written about in another language, it must be addressed and "digested." According to Baker, translanguaging in the classroom may have four benefits (Colin Baker, 2011, p. 289). In the past, bilingual programs for linguistic majorities have often emphasized additive bilingualism, which simply adds a second language to a first. For linguistic minorities, schools tend to encourage subtraction bilingualism, which eliminates the child's original speech. As a result of the ethnic revival and minority groups' demands for their civil rights in the latter half of the 20th century, bilingual education evolved into a strategy for fostering bilingualism in language-prioritized people, particularly in those groups that had experienced language shift and language loss because of monolingual schooling. When the door to developmental bilingual education for everyone was opened, a new type of bilingualism evolved that didn't always follow geopolitical boundaries. Flexible bilingualism "places the speaker in the center of the encounter, without evident bounds," as described by Blackledge and Crease (2010) (p. 109). Crease and Blackledge (2010) use their ethnographic research of ethnic community supplemental schools in the UK to illustrate how teachers use students' flexible bilingualism, or translanguaging, to convey concepts and promote "cross-linguistic transfer." Crease and Blackledge (2010), who looked at the translanguaging pedagogy used in supplemental schools, state the following:

> "Each language is used to communicate a distinct educational message, but only bilingual texts—which require simultaneous use of both languages—can convey the entire message".

In their examination of the pair work, students also write, "It is the blending of both languages that keeps the task moving forward" (p. 110). In the classrooms of the complementary schools Crease and Blackledge were observing, teachers were using bilingual label quests, repetition and translation across languages, and simultaneous literacy to engage students, establish students' identity positions, keep the pedagogic task moving, and negotiate meanings. According to Crease and Blackledge, these complementary institutions' translanguaging educational technique is used in both identity performance and language learning and instruction. Language is merely a social resource in the absence of well-defined national, regional, and social group limits (Crease & Blackledge, 2010).

## 2.11 Translanguaging and code switching

Code-switching is the process of switching between two languages, often the speaker's native tongue and second language (L2) (Cook, 2001). Code-switching has not been promoted in traditional L2 classes, where the students' native language and the target language are clearly divided and the target language is required to be the classroom's "official" language. Such a tendency could be attributable to the widely held belief that switching to a different language proves one doesn't completely comprehend the language in which the speech was originally delivered (Reyes, 2004).

Many academics now agree that code-switching frequently happens in multilingual settings, not simply when one partner is not fluent in the other language but also for several other communication goals. For example, multilingual speakers seem to alter their linguistic codes to forge multilingual or multicultural identities among themselves, finish intellectually hard tasks, or more effectively convey the desired idea (Reyes, 2004). (Zentella, 1997). Additionally, code-switching has interpersonal and societal benefits since multilingual speakers continually monitor and work to adjust to their interlocutors' linguistic styles. The benefits of code-switching in language classes have been examined in recent multilingual research, as suggested by the features (Zentella, 1997). As a result, in today's multilingual contexts, language instructors and curriculum designers occasionally employ code-switching.

The phrase "translanguaging" has only lately been introduced in the literature in relation to code-switching. Translanguaging is like code-switching in that it refers to multilingual speakers switching between languages in a natural way. But initially, it was a pedagogical tactic whereby Welsh bilingual classrooms deliberately changed the linguistic mode of input and output (Williams, 2002). Through thoughtful classroom language planning that integrates two or more languages in a systematic way within the same learning activity, translanguaging aims to assist multilingual speakers in making sense of, shaping experiences in, and gaining deeper understandings and knowledge of the languages being used as well as the content being taught (Cenoz & Gorter, 2011).

Translanguaging, which differs in its epistemology from the study of code flipping in education, challenges the traditional separation of languages in language teaching and learning. All around the world, teachers have used code switching, sometimes referred to as switching back and forth between languages, to scaffold the teaching of new languages. Even though code switching has not usually been supported by language education scholarship, teachers frequently employ it. This approach is, however, heavily contested when used to train young learners from linguistically diverse backgrounds. Using the other language raises the obvious issue that it may "contaminate" the state or national language. However, studies have shown that teachers regularly employ code flipping to ensure that students comprehend what is being said when instructing them in a colonial or dominant language. Code flipping has "pedagogic validity" when students do not understand the lessons (Arthur & Martin, 2006).

Despite being a widespread pragmatic behaviour that has been recorded, code flipping is "seldom institutionally supported or pedagogically endorsed" (Creese and Blackledge, 2010, p. 105). In the late 1980s, Rodolfo Jacobson developed what he called the "concurrent approach." Despite its importance, code flipping in the education literature focuses on teaching a second language, whether pedagogically by the teacher or pragmatically, as in the Jacobson approach, rather than preserving bilingualism per se. As we demonstrate, the concept of translanguaging provides a unique perspective in this respect and differs significantly from an epistemological one in that it challenges the notion

that bilinguals are only moving from one language to another (Creese & Blackledge, 2010).

## 2.12 Code Mixing and Translanguaging

Another event that is closely related to code swapping is code mixing. Several linguists have defined instances of code-mixing. It gives us the clarity we need to understand the concept of meaning code-mixing. Below is a list of them. When speakers of two languages interact to the point where they flip between them in a single utterance, this is referred to as code mixing, according to Wardhaugh (1998). It suggests that the conversant has just slightly altered their original statement. Code mixing happens without a change in subject and might involve several language levels, such as morphology and lexical items (Wardhaugh, 1998).

Code-switching and other interactions that place a larger focus on lexical components are included in the broader category of language contact that is referred to as "code-mixing." This definition is found in the text below. Muysken defined code-mixing as the use of lexical and grammatical components from two distinct languages in a single sentence. He also explains in code the use of linguistic fragments when a speaker is truly speaking in a different language (Muysken, 2000).

The term "translanguaging" was expanded by Garcia to encompass a variety of discursive practices in which students freely and flexibly incorporate language norms acquired in school into their own linguistic repertoire. By "bringing together numerous components of their personal history, experience, and surroundings, their attitudes, beliefs, and performance," Wei (2011) claims that the act of translanguaging is intended to provide multilingual speakers with a social space. The languages are utilized freely and purposefully in the classroom so that students can benefit from the permeability of learning across languages. As a result, the participants are freed from having to cope with sociolinguistic concerns like language power and identity or language separation, which frequently affect how speakers of minority languages behave in conventional monolingual environments (Garcia, 2009).

Two of the multilingual techniques, code switching and translanguaging, are nevertheless widely acknowledged and hardly ever

employed. There isn't a set of educational strategies that works in every kind of classroom (Canagrajah, 2011). Furthermore, it is still unclear how much these strategies contribute to the academic achievement and language learning of multilingual students. For language educators and researchers, implementing multilingual practices is still a desired goal since it may help multilingual individuals recognize and utilize a greater variety of linguistic practices and to develop rich and varied communication repertoires (Hornberger & Link, 2012).

**2.12.1 Concept of Code meshing**

According to the information we do have on educational contexts, translanguaging seems to be a naturally occurring phenomenon. Most of these studies show that teachers do not consciously employ educational strategies to encourage acts of translanguaging. They show up on their own. In many of these circumstances, translanguaging really occurs discreetly, behind the instructors' backs, in classes that strictly prohibit language mixing. In situations where instructors have adopted a more pro-active position, they have established settings in which students may use their multilingual repertoire for educational goals and have also collaborated with students to use the repertoire as a resource. Like their research from 2010, Crease and Blackledge Two instructional approaches, the biliteracy workshop (Garcia, 2009) and the continuum of the biliteracy model (Hornberger, 2003), theorize how students may transition between languages and learning modes while they are learning. However, more must be done to develop instructional approaches based on these widely accepted theories (Canagrajah, 2011).

The term "code-meshing" was first used by Canagrajah in his writing to describe a "communicative device used for specific rhetorical and ideological purposes in which a multilingual speaker intentionally integrates local and academic discourse as a form of resistance, re-appropriation, and/or transformation of the academic discourse" (Michael-Luna and Canagrajah, 2007). Code meshing, in contrast to code switching, is a Canagrajah term for a single integrated system that combines several symbol systems and communicative modalities other than language itself. Code-meshing techniques have been found by Michael-Luna and Canagrajah (2007), and they include choosing texts that are multilingual and multimodal and simulating oral (Canagrajah 2007, p. 56).

According to recent classroom research, translanguaging is frequent among multilingual pupils. Monolingual educational initiatives cannot eliminate translanguaging. It is doable with a little pedagogical work on the part of teachers. These results, however, may imply that translanguaging is not a talent that has to be taught. It may be claimed that multilingual children's home and community settings have already rendered translanguaging so sophisticated that schools can only serve as a practice environment if translanguaging happens spontaneously in the most unexpected scenarios. Cognitive orientations to competence, which contend that translanguaging "comes naturally" to multilinguals, promote such analyses (Bhatia et al., 2004).

The researcher believes that students who speak many languages still have a lot to learn about translanguaging. The researcher would propose a practice-based model to explain how these abilities develop through the socialization of multilinguals in contact situations, which departs dramatically from the cognitive theories of competence put forth by the writers (Canagrajah, 2007). This point of view contends that practice is crucial to the development of competence and expertise. Techniques for reading and writing effectively may always be improved, not to mention speaking persuasively and creatively. To envision such transformations, we must go beyond offering kids secure spaces where they may utilize their multilingual repertoire for educational objectives and teachers working with pupils (Canagrajah, 2007).

## 2.13 Bilingualism and Multilingualism

People always speak, no matter where they are. Language is a tool used in the most complex type of human communication. No matter where it is, the community won't be cut off from language exchange. Due to linguistic contact, Pakistan, with its multilingual audience, surely experiences the phenomena of several languages. One of these occurrences is the emergence of multilingualism in a society. Diglossia and linguistic diversity are two additional criteria that are necessary for this phenomenon to exist as it does. Language variations are brought on by diglossia, which is one of the effects of the phenomenon of bilingualism, as well as formal and casual situations. (Heller, 2007). The definitions of bilingualism in the past were quite constrained and substantially tilted toward monolingualism. Fluency in two

languages was required to qualify as bilingual. The problem is that it might be difficult to determine if someone has native-like control in a second language (L2). This original definition has several methodological and theoretical errors. It's too vague and hard to define; it only considers skill levels and ignores non-linguistic components. (Li, Dewaele, & Housen, 2002).

Dewaele and Stavans created two global measures of multilingualism based on the dynamics of global migration patterns and have been represented in the development of research on bilingual or multilingual education. The number of emigrants from other countries has risen dramatically over the past 45 years, and the amount of research on bilingual or multilingual schooling that has been published has grown at a comparable rate. The "total frequency score" is calculated by adding the values for soul frequency of usage in each language (Dewaele & Stavans, 2014). On the other hand, the term multilingualism refers to a person's or a group of people's capacity to converse successfully in three or more languages. Monolingualism, on the other hand, is the capacity to speak only one language. Polyglots, or multilinguals, are people who can speak many languages. Researchers estimate that most human language users speak more than one language, indicating that they are at least bilingual. Monolingualism may thus be the exception rather than the rule in quantitative terms (Peter Auer & Le Wei 2008).

## 2.14 Bilingualism and Plurilingualism

The concept of plurilingualism is advantageous in that it permits us to abandon conceptions of balanced bilingualism since it broadens the idea of mastery of two or more standard languages to incorporate hybrid language activities. However, because the neoliberal economy requires flexible labor, Garcia has more recently criticized multilingualism. Translanguaging pedagogy, which is seen as being roughly equivalent to plurilingualism pedagogy, is strongly supported by extensive empirical research demonstrating the cognitive and linguistic advantages of bilingual literacy development and the increased academic engagement of students who are given the chance to use their multilingual repertoires in the classroom. As seen by the rising number of instructional initiatives in bilingual classrooms, encouraging teachers (and school officials) to investigate instructional

innovation is a distinct strategy. The development of knowledge and theory in plurilingualism education has been aided by instructors demonstrating the effectiveness and effects of plurilingualism and trans-lingual teaching methods. Some of the key ideas associated with Plurilingualism in TESOL include how binary ideas in teacher education may cause instructors and students to self-impose unreachable standards, why drawing on learners' (and teachers') entire linguistic repertoires is a legitimate practice, and why they must remain mindful of the reality that not all language varieties are equally valued. That is to say, TESOL teachers need to be aware of how language and power influence the emergence of plurilingualism (Enrica Picardo, 2018).

The historical roots of the plurilingualism vision, as well as the relevance and potential of such a vision, are illustrated, along with how this idea may serve as the basis for more than simply a theoretical foundation in language training. As a result, the words plurilingualism and translanguaging are defined and explained, and examples of how each has affected the general study of bilingualism and multilingualism are provided. The terms have been used to introduce several multilingual speaker epistemologies. Since the two ideas have different sociopolitical underpinnings, educational practice now follows different paths. The educational benefits of plurilingualism are discussed here. Translanguaging challenges the widespread belief that bilinguals have a dual lexico-grammatical system. The ongoing practices of educators who are influenced by plurilingualism and translanguaging, both of which have participated in bilingual education, are highlighted among the differences (Picardo, 2018).

English language instruction in Europe is inextricably linked to the use of other languages in the classroom. Most of the time, English is one of the languages that is particularly included in the curriculum, along with other state languages or minority languages that are also prioritized within the curriculum (De Houwer & Wilton, 2011). This article examines the tight and flexible divisions between the teaching of English and other languages in Europe. The absence of other languages from students' linguistic repertoires and academic curricula has historically been associated with the teaching of English as a second or foreign language. The next section goes through this (De Houwer & Wilton, 2011).

## 2.15 Bilingualism and Polyglot

The cognitive abilities of the executive function in relation to language acquisition and usage are becoming more significant in a modern mobile and engaged global society. A particular focus is placed on polyglots and strategies for improving executive functions for further language learning as well as preventing unintended or detrimental effects from those other languages when functioning in a specific target language. Following a discussion of the findings on how multilingualism affects the executive function's evolution through time, a general summary of the executive function is provided. The majority of studies on these effects focus on the early phases of language development and employ bilingual subjects. There is very little study on the effects of learning and using a much greater number of languages on executive function dynamics, let alone studies on trilinguals or multilinguals. In addition to analyzing quantitative results, this study attempts to offer helpful information first from the standpoint of polyglots (Kim, 2013).

Its executive function is activated in situations when language transmission is both positive (intended) and negative (unintended). Positive transfer or facilitation occurs when knowledge from one or more languages is used to make an educated guess, either actively or passively, in the target language. For instance, by considering the shared morphological differences across the languages, one can effectively use elements of one or more Slavic languages to anticipate or remember a necessary phrase in another. Research on the possible advantages of polyglots and multilinguals in terms of executive functioning is scant. Additionally, there are a number of issues plaguing recent academic writing and study. Even though neurolinguistics (brain plasticity) is now widely accepted as a lifelong phenomenon, most research focuses on children at various stages of cognitive and language development (Morton & Harper, 2007).

## 2.16 Application of Translanguaging in Pakistani ESL Context

English has developed into a critical language to enable communication among individuals all over the world about behavioral and interactional activities such as academic pursuits, enjoyment, personal or professional progress, and establishing international relationships. Indeed, an

estimated 7.5 billion English as a Second Language (ESL) students are classified as bilinguals or multilinguals, meaning they speak two or more languages. As a result, more bilinguals and multilinguals are enrolling in English classes in educational institutions around the world because the ability to listen, speak, read, and write in English is so important. Teachers, on the other hand, have consistently employed traditional and classic English language teaching (ELT) techniques in the ESL classroom to teach the target language by immersing learners in an English-only setting with little to no interruption or use of their first language (L1). This has led to their acquisition of appropriate language skills (Beare, 2020).

An emerging method for enhancing bilingual or multilingual learners' ESL abilities is the simultaneous and systematic use of their native tongue and English in learning and teaching sessions. Numerous research has shown that Tran's lingual does in fact hold pedagogical promise for the teaching of ESL. Translanguaging, however, is still a relatively new idea in the teaching and learning of ESL. It is sometimes mistaken for code-switching because it generally considers language switching in discourse to be grammar-focused and results from the use of two distinct languages, each of which serves a different function while one of the languages appears dominant. Contrarily, translanguaging is a bilingual or multilingual approach that combines linguistic resources from several languages into a unified system to achieve learning and communication goals (Garcia, 2009).

## 2.17 Translanguaging in Bilingual Classroom

Language differences are preserved by bilingualism at both societal and personal levels. Additionally, it tends to highlight a person's unique, highly developed mastery of each language. On the other side, plurilingualism is interested in the links and interconnections that exist between languages, particularly but not only at the individual level. Instead of emphasizing linguistic cohabitation and balanced mastery, it places more emphasis on the ongoing process of language learning and usage. In addition, bilingual students are urged to use all their linguistic skills in the classroom, regardless of the language that is required, to make sense of the material being learned. By employing a strategy like translanguaging, a teacher may appreciate the

presence of a learner's culture and linguistic abilities. Translanguaging as a method also highlights the idea that bilingual and multilingual speakers are not the sum of their language components and that the learner's brain is not segmented. Utilizing children's bilingual and multilingual abilities as a resource throughout their new language acquisition and first language development would result in a successful teaching strategy when using an approach like translanguaging in the classroom to develop students' overall literacy skills (Honegger & Link, 2012).

Investigating the use of translanguaging in the classroom is essential. If children continue to face obstacles in their education, they may speak languages other than English, and we as educators are failing them. Although administrators and teachers cannot end the marginalization of English language learners on their own, they may collaborate to embrace their cultures and enhance their educational opportunities by leveraging what the students themselves have to offer. The system continues to marginalize English language learners and label them as "disabled" in our society if alternatives to support their success are not put in place. (Honegger & Link, 2012).

## 2.18 Application of Translanguaging in Pakistani ESL Context

English has developed into a crucial language to enable communication among people all over the world about behavioral and interactional activities such as intellectual pursuits, pleasure, personal or professional growth, and establishing international contacts. Indeed, an estimated 7.5 billion English as a Second Language (ESL) students are classified as bilinguals or multilinguals, meaning they speak two or more languages. As a result, more bilinguals and multilinguals are enrolling in English classes in educational institutions around the world because the ability to listen, speak, read, and write in English is considered to be so important. Teachers, on the other hand, have consistently employed traditional and classic English language teaching (ELT) techniques in the ESL classroom to teach the target language by immersing learners in an English-only setting with little to no interruption or use of their first language (L1). This has led to their acquisition of appropriate language skills (Beare, 2020).

An emerging method for enhancing bilingual or multilingual learners' ESL abilities is the simultaneous and systematic use of their native tongue and English in learning and teaching sessions. Numerous studies have shown that Tran's lingual does, in fact, hold pedagogical promise for the teaching of ESL. Translanguaging, however, is still a relatively new idea in the teaching and learning of ESL. It is sometimes mistaken for code-switching because it generally considers language switching in discourse to be grammar-focused and results from the use of two distinct languages, each of which serves a different function, while one of the languages appears dominant. Contrarily, translanguaging is a bilingual or multilingual approach that combines linguistic resources from many languages into a single system to achieve learning and communication goals (Garcia, 2009).

## 2.19 Identifying teachable strategies through Translanguaging

This research examines the efficacy of a teacher training program that introduced the teaching of African languages to speakers of other African languages to produce teachers who are multi-competent and multi-vocal. From a pool of 60 multilingual pre-service teachers, a mixed-methods approach was used to acquire the participants' narrative comments and their reading and vocabulary success scores (30 experimental; 30 control group). The study's conclusions show that using translanguaging techniques in the experimental class helped the students' emotional and social growth as well as their understanding of the topic. A paired t-test showed a statistically significant difference in performance in favor of the experimental group after three months of a translanguaging intervention program. By using the translanguaging approach and contrasting it with a "ubuntu" lens of viewing the world from an amorphous and continuous cultural space, I argue for the creation of a multilingual teaching pedagogy that is based on this worldview to advance the theory and practices of translanguaging as a teachable strategy. Further research is suggested, and pedagogical considerations for multilingual classrooms are considered for adjustments in similar circumstances (Makalela, 2014).

The term "translanguaging" is discussed in the article, which traces its Welsh origins from the 1980s to its current widespread usage. It suggests that

the term's growing popularity is connected to an alteration in the ideologies supporting bilingualism and multilingualism, not just among academics but also considering evolving political environments and public attitudes toward bilingualism. The basic pedagogic advantages of a planned use of translanguaging in pedagogy and dual literacy are joined by an enlarged conceptualization that sees translanguaging as a spontaneous, frequent way of meaning-making, experience-shaping, and communication by bilinguals. A cutting-edge translanguaging hypothesis considers how learning two languages alters brain activity. A distinction between neurolinguistic translanguaging, universal translanguaging, and classroom translanguaging is presented (Gwyn Lewis, 2012).

This article covers the history of translanguaging and summarizes the studies in this special issue. The contrast between code-switching and translanguaging is explained using a new paradigm in the study of bilingualism and multilingualism. A fresh perspective on languages, speakers, and repertoires is required by this paradigm. The many contexts in which bilingual and multilingual education takes place may have an impact on teachers' and researchers' perceptions of translanguaging. This article draws a comparison between instructional translanguaging and spontaneous translanguaging. Bilingual and multilingual speakers use discursive tactics called instructional and spontaneous translanguaging. The term "pedagogical translanguaging" describes certain teaching strategies. The work included in this special issue serves as an example of how translanguaging may improve educational chances and negotiate social identities. They also demonstrate that there are significant contextual disparities in terms of language, cultural, and educational objectives, typical child characteristics, and instructional strategies (Jasone Canoz, 2017).

## 2.20 Translanguaging and its Pedagogical implications

The current study investigates how concepts from translanguaging theory and pedagogy may be useful for teaching business communication courses like writing and translation. To do this, the first section compares the development of genre theory and pedagogy with that of translanguaging theory and pedagogy, highlighting the parallels and discrepancies in terms of their

historical roots, underlying assumptions, theoretical frameworks, and research methodologies. The second component of the study recommends a framework for teaching corporate communication courses in the Greater Bay Area that is genre-based and supplemented with key principles and broad ideas of translanguaging pedagogy. This framework is built on these integrated narratives.

Although Aristotle initially proposed the concept of a genre, it wasn't until the early 1990s that practical linguistics fully embraced it. "These intentions are recognized by the expert members of the parent discourse community and therefore offer the rationale for the genre," according to Swales' definition of a genre, which is "a class of communicative occurrences, the members of which share some set of communicative intents" (Swales, 1990, p. 58). For academic and professional discourse, genre analysis has advanced significantly during the past 30 years (Swales, 1990). Speech is often organized and repeated, which is the main tenet of genre theory (Swales, 1990, p. 58).

Over the past twenty years, translanguaging theory and pedagogy have advanced quickly in the applied linguistics field, parallel to the growth of genre theory and genre pedagogy. The term "translanguaging" was first used in the Welsh bilingual education programme, and it gained popularity when Baker (2001) introduced it as a deliberate cross-curricular strategy for "the planned and systematic use of two languages for teaching and learning inside the same lesson" (Baker & Wright, 2021). Like the Sydney Genre School, Halliday's early systemic functional notion of language serves as a major source of inspiration for translanguaging.

## 2.21 Making meaning through Translanguaging in Literacy Classroom

The number of students in schools who don't speak English is rising at the fastest rate right now (National Clearinghouse for English Language Acquisition, 2010). Emergent bilingualism draws attention to the specific benefits for these students: Emergent bilinguals continue to cultivate their native tongues in their homes and communities while still learning English and absorbing material. By utilizing their bilingualism, these children's scholastic, cognitive, and social achievement can be increased, claims Cummins (2005).

Instead of making newly bilinguals use only one language in class, translanguaging pedagogies encourage pupils to use all of their linguistic capabilities (Garcia & Kleifgen, 2010). In this teaching tip, we demonstrate three pedagogies that successfully combine students' native tongues into literacy classes. Every activity we provide strives to enhance students' growing bilingualism and their English language skills in their native tongues.

According to the translanguaging idea, newly bilingual individuals routinely and spontaneously use all their languages to comprehend their environment (Garcia & Kleifgen, 2010). Each of these tongues is a component of the same linguistic system, which may be used strategically depending on the circumstances. In the literacy classroom, pedagogies that promote translanguaging can help emergent bilinguals in a variety of ways, such as by facilitating access to background knowledge (Sayer, 2013), assisting with the learning of new vocabulary (Cunningham & Graham, 2000), enhancing understandings of language features or metalinguistic awareness (Jimenez et al., 2015), and encouraging the use of effective reading strategies like summarizing and clarifying (Jimenez et al., 2015). Allowing translanguaging in the classroom not only benefits students academically but also strengthens home-school relationships and creates more welcoming learning settings for all children, especially for those who are still refining their English language abilities (Manning & Felderman, 2013). This viewpoint is reiterated by Canagrajah, who claims that using translanguaging in instruction provides potential for promoting academic performance and the development of students' skills as strategic language users.

Nearly all the emerging bilingual students in Ms. Little's second-grade class speak Spanish as a first language; their school is in a neighborhood with a sizable population of people from Mexico and Central America. During her small group guided reading classes, Ms. Little works with two children who have recently arrived in the nation and two developing bilinguals who have been enrolled in American schools since preschool. By boosting their ability to summarize English literature, she is helping students improve and demonstrate their reading comprehension (Duke & Pearson, 2008). Ms. Little informs the students that they are doing book reports in Spanish about the English book Just a Seed. She explains to them that she would use these book evaluations to help

students who don't speak English grasp the story later. Following their reading aloud, Ms. Little pairs the students up based on their proficiency in Spanish and English. She initially asks that the pairs discuss in either English or Spanish what happens to the seed during the duration of the story. She requests an explanation from the group on what each character did with the page's seed. The girl, the artist, the boy, and the mother are the four protagonists in the narrative. She tells each pair to record what they did with the seed on a T-chart. On the left side of the chart, students write these occurrences in Spanish, and on the right, they write them in English. After guided reading, the students use the T-charts to write a summary in both English and Spanish during the writing portion of their center time (Duke & Pearson, 2008).

## 2.22 Translanguaging in Today classroom (A Biliteracy lens)

We present two brief situations from a variety of educational settings to illustrate this viewpoint. In both cases, pupils are seen translanguaging, a practice that is becoming more widely recognized in educational literature as the world becomes more internationally integrated. In a broad sense, the term "translanguaging" describes how bilingual students integrate and blend linguistic components from many languages to communicate and express meaning. By creating an orientation to translanguaging activities like those in the two scenarios below, educators may obtain awareness of the communication repertoires that students bring to school and how to leverage those repertoires to provide effective educational experiences for all students. After briefly defining translanguaging and presenting the two scenarios, the continuum of biliteracy is offered as a method for organizing education to value and build on students' translanguaging behaviors to support their learning. We state as a conclusion that educators and decision-makers may benefit from an approach that prioritizes the wide range of communication behaviors that children and their families engage in through translanguaging (Hornberger, 2010).

The program's developers, who are not native speakers of Sepedi, encourage their students to use spoken and written Sepedi in addition to South African English, other Englishes, and other foreign languages, as well as other regional languages. This technique is referred to as translanguaging. For instance, students are getting ready to carry out a little research study in their

local Sepedi-speaking communities, where they analyzed Sepedi-speaking children's private speech following conceptual and methodological standards created by Vygotsky in Russia about a century ago. These rules have been read about and discussed with their English teacher. According to their professor, this research provides new contexts and angles for understanding Vygotskyan concepts (Hornberger, 2010).

In most classrooms throughout the world and in the US today, where students and teachers come from a variety of linguistic and cultural backgrounds, language and literacy are at the center of learning and teaching processes. Biliteracy—or communication in "two (or more) languages in or around writing"—is inexorably occurring regardless of whether there is an officially or unofficially recognized medium of instruction because of the rich and varied communicative repertoires that educators, students, and their families bring to school. Although academics, professionals, and policymakers frequently contrast first versus second languages, monolingual versus bilingual individuals, or oral versus literate societies to describe both bilingualism and literacy, these analytical opposites are, in each case, merely theoretical endpoints on a continuum. Therefore, the bulk of biliteracy usage and learning occurs along and across continua, which are dynamic and occasionally contested places (Hornberger, 1990, p. 213).

The continuum of biliteracy offers a set of perspectives through which instructors might organize their education in today's linguistically varied classrooms. This is due to the ongoing attention paid to all the elements—context, content, medium, and development—that research says should be considered to establish a learning environment that recognizes and develops the language and literacy repertoires pupils bring to school. Teachers can especially use the context lens to focus on the blend of multilingual to monolingual language usage and oral-to-literate language practices that would best support students' learning, from settings of micro-level interaction to macro-level policy. In addition, they could think about how they are organizing their teaching through the lens of content to include a range of perspectives and experiences along a majority-to-minorities spectrum, a variety of literary and nonliterary styles and genres, texts that reflect decontextualized to contextualized language and literacy usage, and everything in between. In a

manner like this, the development lens enables one to observe how learners' evolving first language-second language, receptive-productive, and oral-written language abilities may backtrack, spurt, or crisscross throughout their language and literacy repertoires. The media lens also invites one to think about the actual media of instruction: the languages, literacies, technologies, and other communicative resources instructors use in their pedagogy, as well as its forms, scripts, and sequencing (Hornberger & Sylvester, 2000).

## 2.23 Teachers Perception towards Translanguaging

The notion that people's use of their home language improves their competency in a foreign language has led to the development of several bilingual language pedagogies, including translanguaging. Instead of just switching between two languages, this expression refers to the systematic usage of two languages in a particular language instruction activity. This study employed a questionnaire to assess how English language instructors felt about translanguaging. To determine the reasons for the differences between their perceptions and actual use of L1, semi-structured interviews were undertaken. Classroom observations were also done to find out why they utilize L1 in their instruction. Participants in the study were English language instructors employed in Turkish public and private schools. Descriptive statistics were used to statistically analyze the Likert-type items on the questionnaire, and structural-coding analysis was used to examine the data from open-ended inquiries, classroom observations, and semi-structured interviews. The results showed a misalignment between the attitudes and behaviors of EFL teachers. Despite having favorable thoughts about translanguaging in some specific situations, they did not frequently employ this strategy due to expectations from their institutions, colleagues, and the parents of their pupils (Yuvayapan, 2019).

The relevance of context and various combinations of interpersonal interactions on being bilingual is emphasised by functional bilingualism. Functional bilingualism, according to Baker (2011), is the use of one's multilingual ability to achieve interaction in a variety of everyday circumstances. In a monolingual culture, a bilingual person does not have the opportunity to use two languages in everyday situations, but they may move between languages easily in a bilingual environment. Here, the idea of language

usage is at play, which is impacted by a bilingual person's tastes and beliefs. Another element that influences language use is identity (Baker, 2011). According to Cummins and Corson (1997), bilingual education refers to the use of two languages as a medium of instruction to teach subject matters and has roots in the Greek and Roman periods. Bilingual education's advantages are still highly debated, even though it has been a topic of literature since the 1920s. Opponents of bilingualism view bilingual educational programmes as detrimental to pupils' cognitive development and academic success. The use of two languages as a teaching medium hinders the acquisition of various elements of learning two languages, notably vocabulary. There are academicians who believe that bilingual education promotes the social divide rather than conserving national identity in terms of educational policy (Cummins & Corson, 1997).

Despite criticism, bilingual education is gaining popularity in several countries, including Canada, the United States, Hungary, Norway, and Sweden. These countries make use of this kind of instruction to foster the intellectual, linguistic, academic, and multicultural development of their pupils (Rodriguez et al., 2014). Bilingual education's potential repercussions have lately become a significant concern in Turkey. Studies have investigated the connection between bilingualism and learning English (Eker, 2018).

Whether on design or not, there is some translanguaging in Turkish English classes. This study attempts to investigate how English language teachers (ELTs) feel and act toward translanguaging, a novel teaching method that is gaining popularity in bilingual education. Canagrajah (2011) claims that despite the fact that teaching translanguaging presents a number of challenges in educational settings, this topic has not received significant attention in the literature. Translanguaging teachers, according to Lubliner and Grisham, are prepared to intentionally use a variety of languages to improve their training by fusing the linguistic and cultural resources of their students. The main point that must be emphasized here is the intentional usage of languages. If they wish to build bridges between different languages and cultures, EFL teachers must (Lubliner & Grisham, 2017).

## 2.24 Investigating translanguaging logos in the Pakistani educational system's language planning

As a diverse and multicultural nation, Pakistan makes it difficult to select only one or two languages as the main method of communication (Afzal & Bashir, 2020). Due to the prominence of ethnic identities, a significant policy problem affecting the language of teaching in educational institutions has emerged since independence (Rahman, 2002). According to Pattanayak, who said it properly, using two languages is difficult, using three languages is expensive, and using more languages is pointless (Qadir, 1996). Although English currently outperforms Urdu in terms of official effectiveness, Urdu has always stood out as a viable option for bringing the country together.

In Pakistan, a variety of languages are used for communication. According to Rahman (2002), who quotes the Pakistani Census Report from 1998, 15.42% of Pakistanis speak Pashto, which is spoken by 44.152% of the population. Balochi, which has 3.57% of speakers among Pakistan's total population, follows Sindhi, which has 14.10% of speakers. Saraiki, Hindko, and other regionally significant languages like Urdu are spoken by the remaining 26.33% of the population. According to ethnologies, more than 105 million people use Urdu as a second language (Grimes, 2000). Punjab province is home to speakers of Punjabi, Saraiki, Potohari, and Pahari, whereas rural Sindh is dominated by Sindhi, according to Haque (1983), who describes the regional distribution of languages in Pakistan (Haque, 1983). Most urban Sindhis speak Urdu, although a substantial minority speaks Gujrati. Pashto is one of the most widely spoken languages in Khyber Pakhtunkhwa, or KPK. In addition, Hindko is a widely spoken language in Peshawar, the provincial capital of KPK, as well as other cities including Naushehra, Kohat, Bannu, Abbotabad, Haripur, Tarbela, Ghazi, and Swabi (Rizvi, 2007). The most widely spoken languages of Baluchistan, a multilingual area of Pakistan, are Balochi, Pashto, and Brahvi. Persian and Urdu are primarily responsible for the impact of these languages, as well as Sindhi and Saraiki (Rizvi, 2007).

A crucial location for English across the country (Channa, Manan, &David, 2020). It is frequently used in military, political, judicial, and administrative bureaucracies, as well as in oligarchic private schools. It also acts

as the main mode of instruction for training at the university level. Language competence is essential for professional success, and society has evolved to become multilingual. Like how communication and access to power are inferior to Urdu in English. As the official language of the country, it is highly valued for its ability to unite individuals who would otherwise speak different regional dialects on a national scale. Regional language speakers take pride in their distinct communities (Afzal& Bashir, 2020). As a result of the widespread use of English and Urdu, Pakistan is best described as having a trilingual setting (Talat, 2002).

Governmental actions are only one aspect of language and policy efforts; they also address issues of power and policy, minority language rights, the status of heritage languages, the impact of language planning and policy on local language ecologies, and in particular the interference of the English language, which has the status of lingua franca. As a result, languages that were formerly colonial but are now widely spoken and dominant may change. Due to this, language planners and policymakers have increasingly turned their attention to the social and ideological components of language use, which may be helpful in maintaining elitist status and societal control (Tollefson, 2006).

Recent studies have looked at the effectiveness of linguistic tactics used in educational contexts to negotiate the multilingual and multicultural identities of students and teachers. One such project is the research on supplemental schools in the UK. These institutions see multilingualism as a resource, and their approach is made to consider the many viewpoints of both teachers and students (Creese & Blackledge, 2010). As an ecological tactic, it attempts to unite the ancient and contemporary. To create pedagogy that would build a holistic knowledge of the learner, Van Lier (2008) endorses this approach and emphasises the significance of developing new languages in addition to the ones that already exist. It is crucial in specific socio-political contexts where language use creates, reflects, and challenges hierarchies and hegemonies (Lier, 2008).

## 2.25 Outcomes of Translanguaging

A unique adaptive approach to teaching and studying languages that has gained favour recently is translanguaging. This page defines translanguaging

and covers its philosophy, practice, and educational components. The reason why it signifies a paradigm shift in how we view language is also discussed. Before discussing the instance of the Wellington Translanguaging Project there, this article first provides a description of the linguistic landscape of Aotearoa, New Zealand. The methods used for data collection and analysis in the Wellington Translanguaging Project are then discussed, along with the project's conclusions and how they relate to speakers of heritage languages and new speakers (those acquiring the target linguistic variety for the first time in school) (those with a family connection to the target linguistic varieties).

A theoretical framework, a description of language use, and a pedagogy are all referred to as "translanguaging." Translanguaging is a paradigm shift in how we view language as a theoretical construct. Translanguaging is political, revolutionary, and radical since it contradicts current prescriptivist discourses that instruct people that there is a right way and a wrong way to speak (such as a predefined "standard") (Canagrajah, 2013). This theoretical point of view also acknowledges the bias toward monolingualism in the way we discuss languages, particularly code-switching, which presupposes that we turn one language "off" to switch on another. Translanguaging fights against this bias towards monolingualism and advances a multilingual theoretical framework that recognises speakers' usage of a varied, interconnected linguistic repertoire. As a result, one of the key goals of translanguaging is to improve how speakers (and their linguistic repertoires) are treated in the classroom and in society. There is no one dialect or linguistic variety that is better than another (Canagrajah, 2013).

The normalisation of translanguaging behaviours, which are prevalent in all cultures and occur regularly, is the cornerstone of translanguaging theory. Translanguaging is defined as "the deployment of a speaker's complete linguistic repertoire without concern for cautious adherence to the socially and politically established bounds of designated (and frequently national and state) languages" by Otheguy, Garcia, and Reid (2015). The process of "shuttling" between several language systems (Canagrajah, 2011). These methods include "codeswitching," as it is commonly known to those with monolingual viewpoints. However, a translanguaging perspective does not exclude the

existence or use of code switching and codemeshing. But to mention translanguaging is to mention an activist perspective (Seals, 2020, p. 122).

Third, translanguaging is a pedagogical strategy as well. When translanguaging theory serves as the foundation and translanguaging practice is the desired result in the teaching and learning environment, translanguaging pedagogy is created. Translanguaging pedagogy welcomes and builds upon "the ways in which [multi]lingual students and instructors participate in complex and fluid discursive practices that involve, at times, the home language practices of students" to "make sense" of teaching and learning, to convey and apply subject knowledge, and to create academic language practices (Garcia, 2014, p. 112). Translanguaging pedagogy focuses on empowering students by allowing and encouraging them to utilise all linguistic resources at their disposal to transform the learning environment into a pedagogy of possibilities (Garcia, 2014, p. 112).

## 2.26 Advantages of Pedagogical Translanguaging

The theoretical and practical dimensions of translanguaging, a linguistically inclusive educational approach to language teaching and learning, have been extensively studied over the past 20 years. The translanguaging paradigm is used throughout this thorough review of the literature, which focuses on empirical research in English language teaching (ELT). This study, which complies with PRISMA guidelines for systematic reviews, aims to illuminate the current state of knowledge about the affordances of translanguaging pedagogies in a range of educational contexts throughout the world while highlighting potential paths for future research. Eleven databases were searched to provide a dataset that covered the time span from 2011 to February 2021 and had about 3000 publications. Translanguaging is a transformational bilingual practice that involves "using one's linguistic repertoire without regard for socially and politically imposed language labels or borders," according to a sizable body of research that investigates its theoretical and empirical elements (Otheguy et al. 2015, p. 297). The empirical research that employs the translanguaging framework to teach English as a target language or as one of the targets in English language teaching (ELT) and beyond is the topic of this comprehensive review of the literature. English can also be

used as a teaching tool and in other contexts, such as content- and language-integrated learning (Otheguy et al. 2015, p. 297).

Translanguaging in language education, according to Prada and Turnbull, has been crucial in promoting the mainstream adoption of bilingual language practices and kindling the creation of new pedagogical paradigms based on a flexible use of languages. The term "translanguaging" was used by the Welsh educator Cen Williams (1994, 1996) to designate a planned teacher-initiated educational activity based on the purposeful concurrent use of two languages during a lesson or task. Williams thinks that translanguaging is a useful strategy that dual-language classrooms should embrace and employ to help kids flourish in both languages (Prada & Turnbull, 2018).

A generic term for a variety of techniques for utilising a language user's whole linguistic repertoire to achieve communicative goals in various communicative situations and modalities started to gain traction in the field of multilingualism research about 20 years ago (Garcia 2012). In this study, I focus on research on the use of translanguaging in classrooms, where languages are used to encourage literacy in two or more languages in a flexible and useful way (Lewis et al. 2012). This research is based on translanguaging pedagogy, which is described as "the instructional mobilisation of students' complete linguistic repertoire and the promotion of constructive dialogue across languages" (Cummins 2019, p. 21).

For the sake of this analysis, it is crucial to emphasize the distinction between translanguaging used in the classroom or for educational purposes and its spontaneous or widespread manifestation (Lewis et al., 2012). Williams (1994, 1996) first understood "educational translanguaging" to refer to a particular pedagogical strategy developed or facilitated by teachers and centered on utilising students' whole linguistic repertoire (Cenoz 2017). Spontaneous translanguaging, on the other hand, occurs both inside and outside of educational contexts, and, in the words of Cenoz and Gorter (2017), it "refers to the reality of bi/multilingual usage in naturally occurring circumstances where borders between languages are flexible and continually altering" (Lewis et al., 2012).

## 2.27 Co Language and Translanguaging

Garcia (2009) mentions the term "co-languaging," which focuses on how languages are organised in the classroom. It is grouped with the term "translanguaging." She continues by advancing the notion that "co-languaging" describes the concurrent use of curriculum materials across a number of language groups. According to Lewis (2010), Welsh secondary and higher education uses these methods. William claims that in this setting, learning and teaching both occur in a bilingual context and frequently conflict with one another. Such practices of bilingual teaching scenarios or teaching and learning in multilingual situations may be easily discovered in the Welsh context as true examples of what Garcia truly refers to as "co-languaging."

Throughout their early years of school, children are exposed to classes in two languages. At the same time, other children are observed practicing and listening in other languages, while the same students are shown co-languaging by switching between them (Garcia, 2009). Jones and Lewis (in press) claim that "co-languaging" is "the best example of translation for the whole class, when the teacher guides the students for activities in two languages where students understand and follow the instructors' both languages" (Garcia, 2009).

## 2.28 Gap in the Existing Literature

Translanguaging has the potential to make use of students' linguistic origins, increase academic performance, and address social disparities. While studies in monolingual, bilingual, and multilingual environments attest to the virtues of translanguaging for learning, well-being, and identity formation, fewer studies have focused on early childhood education and multilingualism. Moreover, little is known about how translanguaging pedagogies are implemented and the problems that professionals encounter. The research discussed the difficulties that three teachers encountered when introducing translanguaging in their preschool courses, as well as how they overcame them. They shifted from a negative attitude toward multilingual schooling, created a social-constructivist setting, and kept track of their language usage. The findings revealed the complexity of the implementation process as well as the requirement for professional learning support.

Furthermore, bilinguals' languages are not seen as having different linguistic systems in translanguaging. The concept emphasizes how bilinguals choose aspects of their language arsenal to communicate in a flexible and meaningful way. Translanguaging, in effect, provides the basis for understanding bilingual education as a democratic initiative for social justice. Translanguaging is connected to other fluid language acts that have been labelled by academics under various names. However, what distinguishes translanguaging from other fluid language activities is that it is transformational, trying to eliminate hierarchy. As a result, translanguaging might be a social justice strategy, particularly when teaching pupils from language minority populations. Of course, such organizations run the risk that a reader is more familiar with the overarching translanguaging framework than with the guide for their specific student population, and it exemplifies the difficulties in adopting translanguaging as a perspective and pedagogy in the face of entrenched conceptual frameworks about language, conversational fluency, and bilingual language acquisition.

Since translanguaging is more than a framework for emerging bilinguals learning societal dominant language practices in schools, evidence of it should be found across ages, communication situations, and social status. If it's more than simply vocal code swapping, it should show up in literacy and composition as well. As a result, it's critical that instances of translanguaging include a diverse variety of language users and that the term and its related pedagogic escape be relegated to a merely remedial term.

## 2.29 Research Gap

While bilingualism and multilingualism have attracted significant research, there is a marked dearth of study on the topic of translanguaging practices within English classrooms in Pakistan. Translanguaging is the dynamic use of several languages in communication and becomes a potentially fruitful way to improve L2 acquisition and develop attitudes towards language diversity. Nevertheless, empirical data covering the use and outcomes of translanguaging in graduate programs for English learning is limited in Pakistan to date. This gap is bridged by this study, which explores the use of translanguaging practices among Pakistani graduate learners studying in

English-medium institutions. In particular, we seek to investigate how these learners utilize their linguistic capital in navigating English academic discourse while still maintaining a connection to the mother tongue. Therefore, the results of this study may provide useful information on the viability and appropriateness of translanguaging as a pedagogical approach in teaching English in Pakistan and serve to guide policy decisions about instruction style for the national language.

## 2.30 Summary

Finally, bilingualism is essentially the standard all around the world. Practices for bilingual education are used in Pakistani classroom conversations. At the beginning of these activities, learners are restricted to monolingual presumptions, which stops them from developing their communication capacity using regional and national languages. Since translanguaging enables pupils to use different languages, these multilingual strategies are beneficial in Pakistani educational environments. All learners are expected to utilize the target language, and switching between languages is discouraged. This leads to failure in the job.

# CHAPTER 3

# RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

## 3.1 Overview

The general strategies used to carry out the current research are covered in this chapter. It includes the theoretical foundations for the present inquiry as well as the research plan, methodology, sample, and data gathering techniques.

## 3.2 Research Setting

This is a mixed method study that took place at Ghazi University, Dera Ghazi Khan, South Punjab, Pakistan (hereafter GU, D.G. Khan). The southern districts of Punjab, like D.G. Khan, are quite near the western borders of Baluchistan, as are those of neighbouring provinces like Khyber Pakhtunkhwa. Due to its location, it presents an intriguing blend of numerous civilizations and illustrates the diversity of various languages. A sample of students and instructors from the English Department of Ghazi University, Dera Ghazi Khan, who originate from diverse places, have varied cultural backgrounds, speak various mother languages, and attend the university to seek higher education, is included in the research.

Translanguaging, or switching between languages, is a common technique used by learners to maintain a linguistic repertoire for negotiating numerous meanings, bridge communication gaps, improve their cognitive abilities, and simplify and make learning intelligible. Students from a diverse variety of cultural origins and languages are chosen randomly for engagement in the study, such as Saraiki, Balochi, and Urdu, and who not only use but also understand each other's languages, at least for communication. Closed-ended surveys and participant observation in the classroom with audio recording were the main data collection instruments used. In addition to these techniques, semi-structured interviews with the goal of transcription were also employed.

## 3.3 Employed Research Design

Using both qualitative and quantitative research designs, this study employs a mixed method approach. The qualitative research design, according

to Devers and Frankel (2000), is an outline that the researcher utilizes while carrying out the study. This research approach, which is typically flexible, inductive, and dynamic, centers on the development and change in the study topic, circumstances, and connection to the researcher (Devers & Frankel, 2000). Additionally, the design is nonlinear and nonsequential. Although based on Magilvy and Thomas, qualitative design is the method that enables researchers to respond to the what-and-how questions. The current study, like earlier studies, employed a qualitative methodology to address how- and what-specific concerns. The current study additionally looks at previously collected information in the form of closed-ended questionnaires. It is content analysis since the researcher wants to infer something from the chosen data's content.

The interviews, questionnaires, and classroom observations as data collection methods are great in a way; therefore, their design was also created with careful consideration of what they bring to the research tables. To ensure flexibility, semi-structured interviews were employed to allow the participants freedom of expression in their thoughts. Specific questions aimed at prompting thoughtful answers to ensure broad and meaningful views of participants were obtained on a given topic. On the other hand, a closed-ended questionnaire gave structure to interviews with predetermined response options, ensuring consistency in the data collected and ease of conducting quantitative analysis. The intention of this approach was to capture a large number of responses in an efficient manner. The tool that was used in analyzing and documenting the events of code-switching is indeed one strong point for this research since it has been noted to have utilized an observation checklist, which by all indications must have been developed with great care given its sensitivity as a translanguaging theoretical framework. The utility of these instruments individually, coupled with their individual foci when taken together, plays a role in the immense volume and scope of the data they offer, allowing for an all-around definition concerning the phenomena being investigated.

## 3.4 Mixed-Method Research Paradigm

The qualitative paradigm-based discipline of ethnography acts as the understudy, as was already mentioned. In the current study, I have opted to express and assess my data using words rather than numbers, making my

research qualitative. Given (2008) described these as the "words" "that comprise the qualitative data." The researcher therefore dedicated his complete attention to what he observed in the classes as well as the data participants provided in their semi-structured interview replies and questionnaire responses.

By taking part actively and occasionally passively, the researcher becomes a research tool. The researcher visited the natural environment that serves as a staging area for the gathering of initial information. Researcher closely observed learners' behaviour in both formal and informal contexts since human behaviour is influenced by context and place (Bodgan & Biklen, 1997).

Using this qualitative method, the researcher found a way to obtain free access, gather rich data on the ground, and thoroughly describe the subject while doing in-depth analysis (Steinke & Kardof, 2004). Real perspectives on the use of various languages were sought out through their contact and interview sessions. The sole aim was to identify acceptable and clear goals and to understand their viewpoints. A qualitative technique was the best way to collect data for this operation.

This process of acquiring data and its interpretation defined my study, in contrast to quantitative methodologies, where many things are evident and well understood before the work starts and a plausible hypothesis may be created right away (Given, 2008). Instead of looking for a theory statement, it was decided to create some research questions. Based on those research questions (which are listed in Chapter 1, the researcher tried to dive into the study's objective. The researcher had to look at how these student volunteers used language in official and informal settings. Even though they were enrolled in a Master's programme in English Language and Literature where English was the main method of teaching, they were regularly overheard conversing in both official and casual settings in their native regional and local tongues.

The researcher was present at Ghazi University, Dera Ghazi Khan, where students transition between languages to broaden their communication repertoire, and was eager to look at the topic from the standpoint of speaking in local tongues other than English. The researcher kept looking at the problem at hand and digging further. The research only included 100 students, their 10 teachers, the crucial and willing ones, as well as ten classroom observations. They were picked for it due to the variety of their language and cultural origins

and their enrolment at the university for the entirety of the previous academic year.

## 3.5 Population

Population is the total number of individuals from which a researcher is expected to obtain the required sample for their research. The participants in this study are undergraduates at Ghazi University in Dera Ghazi Khan who are pursuing Bachelor (Hons) degrees. Ten (10) teachers and 100 students, as well as eight classrooms for observation, serve as samples for this study.

## 3.6 Sampling Methods

Convenient sampling is required for qualitative and ethnographic research, in contrast to quantitative research sampling, which already has a pre-established technique, making it tedious to fully describe the selection of the sample. In population research, convenience sampling is frequently used, especially in prehospital and catastrophe research. Because convenience sampling is less costly, less time-consuming, and easier to adopt than other sample methods, it is commonly used. It is advantageous to use convenience sampling to develop a potential hypothesis or research goal. Despite convenience sampling's shortcomings, there are steps that may be taken to strengthen the credibility of this popular and simple method.

The researcher has also chosen a convenient sample since the study setting is quite conducive to both the researcher and the participants. The researcher chooses D.G. Khan because of its location and physical ties to neighboring provinces, where learners come from many cultural, linguistic, and ethnic backgrounds. Information on these students was meticulously acquired both within and outside the classroom, and the participants were afterwards questioned. The participants' eager participation and lack of any reservations during the data collection process have been greatly appreciated by the researcher. The information was sufficiently complete to address the study's goals and queries. The process for acquiring data is now being described by the researcher; a more in-depth discussion has been followed.

### 3.6.1 Sample Size

There is neither concrete evidence nor a set standard for sample size. The sample size is significantly influenced by the study's topic. For the present

issue, the researcher's sample consisted of just one hundred students for the questionnaire and ten classes for classroom observation from that selected department. Later, interviews with the ten teachers in that department were also conducted.

One hundred students were chosen for Questionnaire at random by the researcher for the research. They were 18 to 25 years old, of both sexes, and spoke several languages, including Balochi, Urdu, and Saraiki. They were chosen to take part in a class observation as well as a follow-up interview with their ten teachers for the study.

## 3.7 Data Collection

Researchers don't rely on just one method since they need to get qualitative data; thus, they employ a variety of methods (Gay and Mills, 2008). This study set out to find out if translanguaging enhances the acquisition of spoken English proficiency. Additionally, this study sought to understand how multilingual learners strategically integrate many languages to create communication patterns. Given (2008) argues that employing a variety of methods improves the validity of the qualitative approach, whose major component is the gathering and cross-analysis of data. Real-world examples make it simpler to view things holistically.

Berg gives similar guidance and advice using a variety of approaches, describing qualitative research as a "line of sight" that analyses many aspects of the relevant reality. The researcher thoroughly researches the topic at hand within the "line of sight" framework. Other academics have described the researcher's use of a variety of methodologies as "a strategy of refining, extending, and reinforcing conceptual links." Goetz and Le Compete in Berg (Berg, 2001, p. 5). For instance, the researcher becomes subjective while presenting conclusions during the data analysis stage since the researcher's voice is not always reliable. It is therefore always a good idea to employ a number of approaches to ascertain the thoughts of both the participants and the observers. The following list of tools is provided by the researcher as an explanation of how they were used to get the data.

(i)     Questionnaire

(ii)    Semi-Structured interviews

(iii)     Classroom Observation

**3.7.1 Questionnaire**

     A close-ended survey was completed by one hundred (100) participants. When a survey question is closed-ended, it provides respondents with a predetermined number of answers from which to choose. It has a question stem and many possible answers (the response alternatives). When administered by someone like a survey interviewer, a closed-ended question must be presented to the respondent exactly as written, including the full range of possible answers (Lavrakas & Paul, 2008).

     As the name implies, a closed-ended question only allows a certain number of responses. For instance, the interviewee might select from a list of options or just say "yes" or "no." It is their goal to deliver a focused, immediately recognizable, and category-specific answer. Particularly when the goal of the interview is to be encoded in accordance with pre-established criteria, this type of questioning is employed. Similar to open-ended inquiries, there is not much room for expression. Focus groups and one-on-one interviewing protocols frequently contain this kind of inquiry, enabling the interviewer to collect data uniformly from different respondents. In truth, there is a structure and pattern to closed-ended questions (Paul & Lavrakas, 2008).

     The researchers distinguished between both implicit and explicit closed-ended questions, where respondents are given a choice of replies, and closed-ended questions that make assumptions about respondents' likely responses. One illustration of a closed-ended question is, "How often do you eat pasta each week: never, once or twice, three to four times, five times a week, or more?" How many times a week do you eat pasta? Would be the altered version, presented as a presumed closed-ended question (Lavrakas & Paul, 2008).

     Translanguaging has become a dynamic and inventive pedagogical strategy that questions established paradigms for language instruction in recent years. The purpose of this study is to investigate translanguaging methods in graduate-level English language teaching. The research aims to provide important insights into the use and efficacy of translanguaging in English language education environments by concentrating on sociolinguistic elements.

The principal study instrument, a closed-ended questionnaire, was chosen to efficiently collect quantitative data. Closed-ended questions are constructed to facilitate a methodical examination of participants' viewpoints, inclinations, and experiences with translanguaging techniques. The researcher will be able to assess and measure trends through the use of quantitative data, giving a clear picture of the prevalence and attitudes toward translanguaging in the intended educational setting.

Additionally, using a closed-ended questionnaire is in line with the practical considerations of the research, allowing for a thorough and effective method of gathering data from a diverse population of graduate-level English language learners. The questions are purposefully constructed to collect important details on the goals, difficulties, and perceived efficacy of translanguaging in English language classrooms.

### 3.7.2 Semi Structured interviews

Both "structured" and "semi-structured" describe a component. In applied linguistics, this type of interviewing is done. The framework is open-ended, and a constant stream of interesting prompts encourages the participant to offer thorough explanations. This form of interview is appropriate when the researcher is knowledgeable about the phenomenon and can provide a variety of questions without limiting the respondent's ability to explain. For this tool, a face-to-face interview has been conducted with ten (10) teachers in the English department. The interview session is audio recorded and transcribed later, following the conventions of transcription. In a semi-structured interview, a series of open questions that promote conversation are combined with the chance for the interviewer to go deeper into particular topics or replies. (Adeoye & Olatunde, 2021). Through interviews, which are utilized expressly as a technique, you may learn everything there is to know about a person or a group of individuals easily and effectively. Fray and Fontan (Shkedi, 2005). Additionally, the researcher conducted in-person, semi-structured interviews with his four main subjects. According to Whyte (2001), "flexibly generated" criteria can be changed right away if there is any ambiguity because they are merely organized in the researcher's imagination. This gives the researcher the opportunity to see things honestly. This method of conducting anthropological interviews is known as "pleasant talk" by Spradley (Brog & Gall, 1995, p. 397).

Additionally, it greatly aids in the emergence of a cordial connection between the interviewer and the subject.

Due to the possibility of prepared questions, semi-structured interviews are popular among researchers. By doing this, the interviewer might come across as knowledgeable and prepared. In order to give the researchers the chance to fully understand the topic of interest, which is crucial for crafting insightful and relevant semi-structured questions, semi-structured interviews are generally preceded by observation, informal interviewing, and unstructured interviewing (Adeoye & Olatunde, 2021).

Often, the first step in designing an interview guide is outlining the issues and topics that should be discussed. Your research question and the goals of the interview should guide the course you follow in this situation. This might be broken down into several questions that the interviewee can understand and that are relevant to them. No answer to open-ended questions that encourage just "yes" or "no" responses. Be realistic about how many inquiries you can make during the limited time and structure them using simple terms (Adeoye-Olatunde, 2021).

A great interview guide should promote natural conversation. There must be an introduction, a middle segment, and a conclusion in an interview guide. Use sections to structure your interview guide. Any topic changes need to be stated explicitly, especially when the next question might not be a direct continuation of the previous one. Give an explanation as necessary to help you transition from one topic to another, such as "I'd now like to question you about..." Check to see whether there is a logical order to the questions. Make prompts to direct your in-depth examination of meaning, perspectives, and feelings and to ensure that no important information is missed. Plan for your closure and decompression operations (Adeoye-Olatunde, 2021).

The qualitative nature of the research aims led to the decision to use semi-structured interviews as the main research method. A flexible and dynamic approach is provided by semi-structured interviews, which enable a thorough examination of participants' experiences, attitudes, and perceptions of translanguaging methods. The research attempts to gather rich and context-specific information that goes beyond simple quantitative statistics by having conversations with graduate-level English language learners and instructors.

Semi-structured interviews offer an open-ended format that allows participants to freely share their ideas, experiences, and difficulties with translanguaging procedures. Using a more comprehensive perspective of the sociolinguistic aspects involved, this approach facilitates a greater understanding of the complications surrounding the use of translanguaging in English language classrooms.

Additionally, the semi-structured interview method makes it possible to explore unanticipated findings and emerging themes. This adaptability is especially important when researching a complicated phenomenon such as translanguaging, where context-dependent and intricate connections can arise between language, culture, and identity.

Through semi-structured interviews, the study seeks to reveal the various functions of translanguaging in graduate-level English language instruction. By providing light on the sociolinguistic processes influencing translanguaging methods, the qualitative information gathered through interviews will help us understand learners' and teachers' lived experiences on a deeper level.

### 3.7.3 Interview Recorded Data Transcription

After these rounds of data collection were complete, interviews and recordings of classroom activities were made. With the aid of my departmental colleagues, considering the precise romanization of the other vernaculars was crucial for this study to avoid significant transcription errors, only the Saraiki language was transcribed. For the advantage of English readers, the researcher also translated comments written in languages other than English into English.

In terms of transcription, Eisner (1992) emphasizes the importance of taking notes and recording audio in qualitative research since they give immediate recommendations for description and analysis in the form of feedback. The participant's voice was frequently hard to hear, which presented difficulties for the researcher. The solution to this issue requires listening to the audio recordings repeatedly to comprehend the participant's actual speech. Due to the heat in the region, the sound of fans in the classroom recording was extremely distracting. The researcher overcomes these challenges, nevertheless, by often consulting with their editing colleague and supervisor.

### 3.7.4 Classroom Observation

A sheet has been developed focusing on translanguaging practices in the English language classroom. In this perspective, data has been gathered from ten classes using factors and following a pre-determined timetable. Unstructured observation is conducted in an open, unorganized manner without the use of predetermined variables or objectives. It offers the outcome in terms of frequency, etc.

As a result of the high volume of activity in classrooms, according to Wragg (1999), "observers need to be on their toes." A recent advancement in classroom context studies states that the researcher additionally listened to and documented what students said during class discussions. The data-gathering stage of this study took roughly three months. Throughout the eight sessions, the participants were observed at various locations inside the classroom. The classroom recording lasted 800 minutes in total. The individuals were then watched in class and interrogated.

Thinking about why we do class observations affects what we observe and how we react to what we are experiencing. I recommend the three key objective categories that are described below, which are quite similar but not identical:

1. Educating by observation.

2. Learning by observation.

3. Examining and observing

For instance, when TAs do peer observations as part of an assignment for the methodology course I teach, they mix observing-to-learn with observing-to-evaluate. When they evaluate how the observed actions relate to the ideas we discussed in class, they acquire knowledge. A supervisor's observations could include elements of all three aims to some extent. What concerns are we prioritizing? The less probable it is that TAs would view observations as helpful for their professional growth, the more emphasis we place on observing-to-evaluate as the primary goal for observations. Instead, a simple checklist is used to determine how well someone "fits into the tight departmental pattern." It is less of a tool and more of a test in this sense. Even though it might not be possible to eliminate the assessment component when a supervisor is the observer, teaching and learning should come first. The most fruitful

observations combine teaching and learning objectives. Both parties must be willing to learn, just as the observer must be keen to pick up lessons from the observed (Henshaw & F, 2022).

The combination of various tools for gathering data at the point where this research design was formulated was deliberate because it allowed for a comprehensive understanding of translanguaging as applied to the educational sphere. The triangulation of methodologies involving teacher interviews, classroom observations, and questionnaires was a concern in the study to allow for a thorough investigation into three research questions. Interviews with teachers played a significant role in the discussion, eliciting perceptions from educators, which proved to be insightful into unattained attitudes and practices about translanguaging. Classroom observations afforded a detailed analysis of translanguaging in authentic teaching settings and provided an elaborate, realistic portrayal of its use. The questionnaire, however, acted as a quantitative instrument for the acquisition of learners's perceptions and attitudes toward translanguaging. This triangulated approach allowed us to increase the credibility and dependability of our outcomes while producing a solid analysis of translanguaging complexities in an academic environment. This careful choice of tools, in turn, coincides with the multidimensional nature of objectives set forth in research and contributes to a more consistent probing into the phenomena under investigation.

The choice to use classroom observation is in line with the necessity of having a current grasp of how translanguaging takes place in graduate-level English language classrooms. Direct observation of teacher-student interactions, language use, and the application of translanguaging procedures can be obtained through classroom observation. The dynamic and context-specific nature of translanguaging methods is seen holistically by this method.

Thematic analysis is selected as the main analytical tool to derive significant insights from the observed data. Recurring themes, patterns, and meanings in the observed translanguaging processes can be found, analyzed, and interpreted through the use of thematic analysis. With its organized framework for revealing the various functions and ramifications of translanguaging, this approach is especially well-suited to investigate the sociolinguistic subtleties woven throughout the exchanges.

The examination of the intricate sociolinguistic dynamics at work during English language instruction sessions is made easier by the qualitative nature of thematic analysis and classroom observation. Through a detailed analysis of the context-specific application of translanguaging techniques, this study seeks to reveal how sociolinguistic variables impact and mold the use of translanguaging in graduate-level English language instruction.

Furthermore, a thorough framework for comprehending translanguaging procedures is anticipated to be developed with the help of the thematic analysis's findings. In addition to providing guidance to educators and language professionals, this framework will help with the creation of practical plans for integrating translanguaging into graduate-level English language teaching curricula.

## 3.8 Rationale for Selection of Data

Population is the total aggregate of people from which a researcher is supposed to select the desired sample for study. The participants in this study are those who are enrolled at Dera Ghazi Khan District postgraduate institutions while studying towards a Bachelor (Hons) degree. The sample for this study is 100 students, and there are ten (10) teachers.

The sample of this research study is composed of 100  students of English Department Boys Postgraduate Colleges in Dera Ghazi Khan District and their ten (10) teachers. The study uses convenient sampling. In convenience sampling, participants are chosen who are "convenient" to the researcher. There is no established method for finding these res ponders; they might be discovered by just asking people on the street, in a public place, or at work, for instance. This idea is frequently confused with "random sampling," since people are "at random" stopped (Galloway, 2005). Sampling in statistical analysis is the process of choosing a certain number of observations from a larger population. Simple random sampling and systematic sampling are frequently used to sample from a larger population, depending on the type of study being undertaken (Touvila, 2019).

A current study found that conversing in one language while writing in another improved subject-matter knowledge. Students frequently make use of what they already know from their first language when learning a second one.

Students undoubtedly benefit from this as they learn to communicate in their second language and grasp information. Translanguaging research is not very frequent in Pakistan and Asia. In this industry, there are three major trends. Academics have first established the significance and possibility of introducing heritage languages in the classroom. This has helped educators create teachable practices, enhance students' academic progress, and increase language awareness.

The study aims to motivate students to participate in class discussions and to personally link what they are learning to their lives outside of school. In this approach, the urge to interact with the environment motivates translanguaging as a mode of being. L1 is essential for comprehending and learning the target language in each situation while utilizing several languages to communicate and interact. In some specific contexts, the target language is better able to directly express the semantic content based on context than the dominant language, and the process of translanguaging between them can be better linked with their linguistic repertoires. As the dominant language is simultaneously replaced by the target language.

## 3.9 Analysis of gathered Data

To fully comprehend the phenomena being examined, all of the qualitative data that had been collected had been thoroughly analyzed before data analysis began. The information was then categorized appropriately to investigate how translanguaging strategies aid in the expansion of a communicative repertoire in a multilingual university class.

### 3.9.1 Data Analysis of Questionnaire

The questionnaire tool has been analyzed with the help of descriptive statistics. A closed-ended questionnaire has been developed and distributed to one hundred (100) individuals. A closed-ended survey question gives respondents a preset range of options to pick from. In addition to the question stem, there are other response possibilities. When a closed-ended question is being administered by someone like a survey interviewer, it must be given to the respondent exactly as written, including the full range of possible answers (Lavrakas & Paul, 2009).

A closed-ended question only allows a certain number of answers, as the name suggests. The interviewee might, for instance, choose from a list of choices or simply respond with "yes" or "no." Their objective is to provide a targeted, instantly recognizable, and categorized response. This method of inquiry is often used, especially when the interview's objective is to be encoded in accordance with pre-established criteria. There isn't much room for expression, much like open-ended questions. Focus groups and one-on-one interviewing protocols frequently contain this kind of inquiry, enabling the interviewer to collect data uniformly from different respondents. In reality, closed-ended questions have a structure and pattern (Paul & Lavrakas, 2009).

**3.9.2 Semi Structured interviews Data Analysis**

To find out what the study participants thought about the subject at hand, interviews with teachers were performed as a method of gathering information. Although there was evident control over the questions during the interview process, the respondents respected their freedom to respond to the questions. The study's major focus is on the effects of these activities in informal contexts, such as classroom interactions; hence, that portion of the interview with one participant who even utilized translanguaging was omitted. After the interviews were taped, transcripts, codes, and categories were created. These categories assisted in the development of the themes that eventually served as the basis for data analysis and theme construction (themes are mentioned in the introduction to Chapter 4). Additionally, these categories assisted in resolving issues with the study's research.

**3.9.3 Data Analysis of Classroom Observation**

Audio recording served as a helpful research tool, provided a thorough overall view, and was a priceless asset during the analytical process. In his analysis of the importance of audio recording, Heap (1982) argues that it enhances and broadens the observer's perception of the things being seen. He said that audio recordings had the advantage of being powerful weapons for alienation.

Like this, Van Lier (1988) proposes that ethnographers primarily use audio recording to observe unplanned events or interactions in the classroom because this is the researcher's ideal study setting. He continued by noting that audio recording is the best tool for providing various descriptions and analyses.

By using this technique, the researcher was able to watch the students' communication behaviors from a distance, both within the classroom and outside. By replicating the situation, the researcher was able to bring it together and comprehend what had happened without making any assumptions (Lier, 1988).

Sack (1994) examined the benefits of audio recording and said, "Audio recorded materials may be replayed and could be transcribed not merely for the researcher to study extensively but also as a record to be assessed by others who could argue with the researcher." The researcher was able to assess the students' translanguaging strategies during class discussions thanks to the data that had been transcribed.

## 3.10 Theoretical Framework

The translanguaging school of thought, a theoretical lens that looks at bilingualism and multilingualism from a fresh angle, has been put forth by Garcia and Le Wei (2016). Instead of having two or more autonomous language systems, as has been traditionally assumed, bilinguals, multilinguals, and all language users choose and apply diverse traits from a unified linguistic repertoire to generate meaning and negotiate communication situations. Three main concepts serve as the foundation for translanguaging theory. First, it talks about how individuals choose and use characteristics from a scripting language arsenal to communicate. The study examined how teachers employ linguistic source knowledge in interacting with students from varied linguistic backgrounds while keeping in mind the first assumption of this approach. Building on the previous point, translanguaging theory asserts that each speaker has a distinctive language repertoire made up of components that are selected and developed under various conditions. With the goal of elevating the status of individuals and communities whose linguistic practices have traditionally been marginalized and labeled as non-standard, the research seeks to question established paradigms of bilingualism and multilingualism. The research also takes a stance on bilingualism and multilingualism, which puts the dynamic linguistic and semiotic practices of speakers above national and state languages. The study analyzes these language learning characteristics acquired dynamically through an individual's experiences and actions in the

physical and social environment of an educational institution, keeping in mind the second assumption of this theory. In the end, it acknowledges the real effects of structuralist language ideologies and socially constructed language categories, particularly for speakers of minority languages. The way a speaker uses language features and how society labels and assesses their use of two defined language families are two very different things, according to research that applies the translanguaging hypothesis.

While using the theoretical lens of translanguaging proposed by Garcia and Le Wei's (2016) study, which also elaborates on defining bilinguals' language practices, the internal and external differentiation created inside translanguaging theory is extremely important. From an outside perspective that places value on socially established linguistic categories, it appears to indicate that bilinguals are using two independent codes to communicate or code switching when they choose and use features that are independent of language, called categories. From the inside, however, multilingual flexible and fluid language usage is acknowledged as going beyond the socially imposed constraints of named languages and is hence known as translanguaging as a teaching tool. (Garcia & Wei, 2016).

It appears that "translanguaging" captured people's attention. It is used in the education process, everyday social contact, cross-modal and multimodal communication, music, visual and performing arts, and transgender discourse. According to the expanding corpus of research, translanguaging may be used for any activity that deviates somewhat from the norm. There is debate surrounding the notion that translanguaging will eventually replace terminology like "code-switching," "code-mixing," "code-meshing," and "crossing" as the umbrella term for a number of multilingual and multimodal behaviors. In academic discourse, other concepts like polylanguaging, polylingual languaging, multilingualism, heteroglossia, hybrid language practices, translingual practices, flexible bilingualism, and metrolingualism all appear to be vying for attention. (Wei, 2017).

Along with, but far beyond, linguistics, applied linguistics has included a wide range of concepts and techniques from other domains. However, the fields from which we have drawn theories and methods pay very little attention to our work as applied linguists, and we have very few original analytical

techniques and theoretical ideas. The term "applied" is occasionally used interchangeably with "theoretical," which has less scientific meaning. Many applied linguists would not mind it, as our major focus is on language policy and practice and how to handle issues in the real world where language is a huge concern (Brumfit, 1995). However, since we are providing fresh perspectives, many applied lingsuists would want to believe that what we do is, or ought to be, "theoretical." Many individuals contest the phrases and the other words' usefulness, condemning them as meaningless slogans that are post-modern and maybe post-truth. The main goals of this study are to define the word "translanguaging" and its added value, address some of the criticisms made by academics who support or reject the concept, and dispel certain myths that have arisen as a result of its widespread use. The study offers translanguaging as a usable theory of language. In spite of the fact that this article was undoubtedly the product of extensive research (Brumfit, 1995).

# CHAPTER 4

# DATA ANALYSIS

This chapter presents the study of semi-structured interviews, closed-ended surveys, and observed classrooms. The questions for the semi-structured interviews were developed with the study's main topic in mind. The volunteers thoughtfully and seriously addressed each issue. They were quite open and honest in expressing their sentiments. The interviews were conducted in a calm, well-equipped office to avoid any distortion during the recording procedure. It was noted that the interviewees were able to explain their cautious use of translanguaging at this stage of the data collection process. It took three months to complete the interviewing and classroom observation processes.

The total number of volunteers in the study was 100 students and 10 teachers, and the researcher did a fantastic job of informing them about the experiment before starting the data gathering process. Most of them expressed a willingness to participate in this process and offered to do so. In contrast, just 10 teachers were randomly chosen for the sample, and they were picked because of their validity and reliability as well as their wide range of cultural and linguistic backgrounds. They were also observed twice weekly in eight separate classes, after which the declared participants were interrogated. The most difficult and chaotic duty was transcribing standards, which was time-consuming due to the way the data was collected.

The researcher has also tried to provide the data analysis in a way that logically links and categorizes the subjects to come up with the essence of the understudy.

## 4.1 Participant Interviews

To investigate any issues that could have arisen with translanguaging methods in a multilingual classroom, interviews were conducted. As the teachers were interviewed about their thoughts, the following topics came to be at the forefront of the conversations:

1.    Introduce yourself.

2.    May I ask Some Questions from you related to my thesis?

3.     What is your first language?

4.     How many languages can you speak?

5.     Which language do you prefer to speak at workplace?

6.     What is the number of languages spoken at your home?

7.     Which language do you find most effective in a classroom setting?

8.     Which language do you prefer to use while speaking with friends in a cafeteria or other casual setting?

9.     How often do you switch between different languages in conversation?

10.    Do you believe that your friends utilize translanguaging techniques to communicate by using different languages at once?

11.    What justifies your opinion that translanguaging is required in the classroom?

12.    Can translanguaging help people learn other languages and contribute to that process?

13.    Do you believe that translanguaging should be used more frequently or less frequently to help students become proficient in the target language?

14.    Do you actively want to preserve easy access to learning using translanguaging?

The results of these interviews affected the researcher's comprehension of the phenomenon of translanguaging in a bilingual classroom. The results of the interviews show its significance and several advantages: At a multilingual institution, translanguaging nurtures and enhances communication skills and shows its effects.

**4.1.1 Discussion and evaluation of respondent 1's interview**

This instructor attended institutions with an English-language curriculum from first grade through his BS and beyond. He speaks Urdu at home because it is his mother tongue. He is able to speak in three languages—English, Urdu, and Saraiki—and has become proficient in them all. While he speaks Saraiki well, he prefers to use Urdu at home with his family since he believes that it is his natural language. He was fluent in various regional languages as well as English. He has taken part in discussions in both English and Urdu, and he has received several regional and national awards.

He also remembers how wonderful it was to use his language and literary analysis skills. The section that follows provides an analysis of his interview considering the themes that have previously been emphasized as the debate's central issues.

**4.1.1.1 Language preference other than English**

This interview made it apparent that he wanted to communicate in the target language while learning a foreign language, but he also expanded the idea that he ought to be permitted to utilize other idioms to further his comprehension of any subject if he ever felt unable to do so in the target language. He described the many languages in which these phrases were employed.

"Although I would like to talk in English in class, I will switch to my native tongue if I am having any problems explaining myself. I have the ability to publicly express my ideas. I feel at peace and at liberty to express myself in my own speech''.

It is reasonable to deduce from the discussion above that bilingual and multilingual students have chosen for many years to be given the opportunity to voice their thoughts during the debate in class in their preferred language. He would prefer to use the language he was studying, but he was forced to acknowledge the importance of utilizing other languages. Another immediate benefit is that teachers use languages other than the target language to communicate and express themselves. According to Van Lier, the instructor constantly includes the student in educational activities to promote "a wide panoramic picture of self" (2008, p. 54). In light of these findings, it is essential to keep in mind that speaking different languages helps learners understand and feel at ease while they communicate knowledge they already know in their own tongues.

**4.1.1.2 Preferred Language with friends and in other Casual setting**

His response to this question suggests that friends frequently use hybrid languages; as a result, he preferred to converse with them in any language when they were around. Students improve their language abilities, comprehension, and awareness of their environment as a result and are better able to use language to express new experiences. Also, they continue to communicate, which aids in their understanding of how to concurrently improve their ability to communicate in other languages. It was also stated that translanguaging,

which characterizes most contacts between bilinguals, shows that there is a substantial amount of overlap among the languages of different ethnolinguistic groups. His colleagues, who each had a different linguistic profile, were using languages imaginatively to enhance their understandings and increase their conceptual and linguistic skills, even though they regularly violated linguistic standards and worked as a team.

### 4.1.1.3 Switching from one language to another

He has found that switching between languages is not only a practical tool but also a way to develop and broaden his multilingual communication knowledge. He regularly engages in it unconsciously when communicating. It is true that multilingual speakers may move between languages with ease and develop an integrated communication repertoire by finding a way to handle the many languages. He never showed any hesitancy while transitioning between languages; this can be asserted with certainty. To maintain a range of communication possibilities, he wanted to speak with his peers in all three languages.

### 4.1.1.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique

To prevent any misconceptions, the interviewee made the decision to express the speaker's intended objective. Garcia (2009 b) presented further instances to better clarify the notion that learners transcend linguistic boundaries since they must utilize the variety of languages, understandings, and learning methods that they possess. He described it in the following words:

"It's a good idea to have a backup plan in case something goes wrong, but it's also a good idea to have a backup plan in case something does go wrong. I keep my focus on the listener to convey my ideas in a straightforward and intelligible way so that he may grasp the sincere and intended meaning of my message".

According to the research subject himself, depending on the situation and the listener, introducing a reference in a foreign language may improve communication by allowing individuals to understand one another better. Another defense is that foreign language learners occasionally feel obliged to use their mother tongue. Learners must speak two or more languages simultaneously in order to convey information through many channels of communication.

**4.1.1.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

He stressed his point of view and said that it was crucial to establish a rapport for the responsible use of other languages and to let the students speak many languages at once in order to promote the translanguaging practices of the students in classroom practices and learning-oriented activities. It was acknowledged that moving between languages in a classroom with a range of linguistic origins was natural and that it also helped pupils learn information more effectively in a manner that was intelligible and comprehendable. Positive outcomes were also obtained.

According to the interviewee, increased globalization has caused a closer relationship between people and made it easier to establish stronger connections on a global scale via translanguaging practices. Thus, educational institutions all over the world rarely acknowledge the use of multiple languages. In order to improve classroom outcomes, he supports translanguaging as a beneficial tool for students from various linguistic backgrounds to easily grasp the material conveyed.

**4.1.1.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

Language learners like to utilize different languages in addition to their major language, which gives them a solid knowledge of their language comprehension abilities since it broadens their viewpoints. For this individual, deeper learning encompassed the development of their linguistic, cognitive, and topic knowledge as well as practical assistance in situations where a particular language agenda is associated with certain cultural foundations.

Furthermore, Garcia (2011) demonstrated that translanguaging strengthens the potential of bilingual and multilingual speakers to create less formal relationships between languages as a result of translanguaging practices, in order to maximize the overlap in learning processes rather than being prevented from doing so by uninvited monolingual assumptions and practices. As a result, it acts as the starting point for learning a foreign language and has been shown to be quite effective in language learning courses. When pupils are having trouble understanding what is being said in one language, the instructor may switch to another that is much more suited to their needs.

**4.1.1.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

He said that translanguaging procedures were effective because they allowed people to develop their own philosophies, which would not have been possible without translanguaging. He argues that the employment of translanguaging tools in the classroom is both beneficial and essential.

"Students' abilities vary, and some may have trouble with speaking patterns. They are not permitted to participate in the class discussion because of their weak command of the target language. This translation is a useful tool to guarantee their participation. The ability to communicate in a variety of languages must be given to the students in order for their education to be effective".

Translanguaging may have improved class participation for students who had difficulty with the target language. As a result, it has been discovered that the connection between the instructor and student must be based on mutual respect and goodwill in order for language acquisition to be successful. The process would be the least effective if the student did not believe in his capacity to learn a new language, as shown by the teacher's focus on building connections with the pupils. As he said at the opening of the interview, practicing with translanguaging is a crucial element in helping students develop competency. As a result, it has helped people learn new languages.

**4.1.1.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**.

After coming to notice the real need for translanguaging practices in today's classroom activities, he defended the use of additional languages and promoted their use in multiple classroom practices and drills.

"According to my observations, translanguaging is not widely employed all that often in educational settings during academic activities in classrooms. I advocate for the equitable use of translanguaging so that students may contribute to developing communicative proficiency in the target language and also raise their interest in learning processes. These days, having many languages is crucial. Translanguaging won't have an effect on our target language. It is an effective and widely accepted and practiced technique for fast learning a foreign language worldwide." Additionally, it was discovered that the participant had essentially mastered the common languages and could switch between them effortlessly. As a result, it was shown that performing

translanguaging is not only useful for improving comprehension but also motivates students to retain a new style of communication for information sharing and boosts their confidence in easily taking up any foreign language.

**4.1.2 Discussion and analysis of the second participant of the interview**

This participant was from the Pushto-speaking community and had spent the preceding 20 years living with the Saraiki-speaking group since her father had been stationed there for a considerable amount of time. She finished her early elementary schooling at an Urdu-language institution before switching to an English-language institution in the sixth grade. Her mother tongue was Pushto. She had acquired balanced communication competency in Saraiki in addition to English, Urdu, and her native language. She demonstrated excellent levels of inventiveness and intellect through her active participation in the understudy, demonstrating that she was a multilingual person. She was pleased to disclose that, despite Pushto being her native tongue and the favored language at home, she sometimes talks Urdu with her siblings due to their family's educational background. This was a reasonable answer since her family had a history of migrating around in order to pursue education.

**4.1.2.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

She elaborated on the notion that learners should not merely be kept restricted to one language after appreciating the value of languages in a multilingual classroom where students encounter several hurdles throughout their academic lives. It was shown that multilingualism cannot be discounted since it is seen as the standard across the world, regardless of the learner's particular language profile. Additionally, it was argued that learners' involvement in the use of other languages in educational contexts has been widely acknowledged.

"The intelligence levels and linguistic and cultural backgrounds of our classmates are diverse. Some of the students in our class speak English only very imperfectly. Their dialects are quite different from one another. They have trouble communicating because they have poor English language and comprehension skills."

As it was mentioned earlier by the participant in the paragraph above, language and literacy are vital as both means and goals in the process, in which learners from more diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds seem to be

actively participating to engage themselves in activities. She argued for the use of Urdu, which is both the national language and a language that novices can comprehend.

**4.1.2.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

The participant said that there is no rigid rule or regulation dictating that friends must speak the same language. She contends that maintaining communication in multilingual societies is difficult if one adheres to the presupposition of monolingual practice without translanguaging. She advocates for the use of several languages and opposes the usage of a single language both within and outside of the classroom.

"It depends on the circumstances and my circle of friends. I will choose to talk in my mother tongue there since they speak my language, and I will treat it with the respect it merits if I find myself or am seated among other individuals who speak my mother tongue. If the circumstances were different, I would like to communicate in Urdu, which is our native tongue. We would feel at ease using this medium since it would allow us to have fun and discover the many facets of communication".

The extract above made it apparent that the use of other languages relied on the interlocutors; however, she would want to speak Urdu if the chance ever presented itself. She continued to make the case that switching between languages was a smart move since it was practical for her to do so and would help her retain her social position within her friends' group.

**4.1.2.3 Language shift**

She was quite open and supported language hopping by stating, "I do make a language shift from one language to another if I perceive any hindrance in speaking freely, as my primary attention is just to communicate. For instance, during an English conversation, I may switch to Urdu to make a point and express my communication need or idea to the other person."

She underlined the idea that since they enhance learners' cognitive capacities and make the message's contents clearer, other languages are crucial and cannot be undervalued. She continued by saying that using multiple languages or switching between them requires users to display the full range of linguistic performances that go beyond the combination of structures, and that switching between systems is a sign of the transformation of ideas and the

representation of values, identities, and relationships. According to others, it creates a social space for multilingual speakers by providing many facets of human experience and surroundings, attitudes, ideas, and ideologies, as well as significant performance.

**4.1.2.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

She stressed the need for translanguaging to assist bilingual speakers in filling the conversational gap. In order to expand their linguistic repertory, pupils may thus depend on speaking many languages simultaneously, at least for communication purposes. Her well-regarded interpretation of translanguaging showed how a bilingual society with two languages serving different functions had emerged. She also underlined the value of translanguaging, underscoring how it helps to both develop the weaker language and assist in subject matter understanding.

"Yes, it is obvious that my friends communicate with one another in a variety of languages to meet their needs or preferences. Keeping in touch with them while I've been in this city has been my aim. They often ask me to share a few words of my own speech with them, showing that they share our goal of helping them learn our languages. The concern in my friends' eyes shows how anxious they are to pick up my original tongue so they can converse with one another in it. It also helps them acquire equivalent conversational proficiency in a second language."

**4.1.2.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

She vehemently argued in favor of the reasonable use of translanguaging in the classroom. According to Canagarajah (2011), who explores the beginning of translanguaging as a pedagogic practice and learning strategy for learners later, we still have a long way to go in constructing teaching methods out of these generally defined models of translanguaging. She stated:

"The importance of it in the classroom is underscored by the fact that many of my students only possess rudimentary knowledge of the English language. They struggle to understand this foreign tongue, English. These translanguaging strategies must be used by teachers as well in order to establish a reliable communication system. Both instructors and students will gain from it."

She also expanded on the idea that English language learners who have less skill often experience acute linguistic unease and uncertainty. She clearly believed that using two languages simultaneously is important and that if it is not carefully enforced in the classroom, communication would suffer and instruction would be haphazard. She had advised the instructors to develop a clear plan for when and how to utilize different languages, one in which the students themselves could depend on the flexible use of their complete linguistic arsenal. As learners develop their capacity to mediate understandings, to co-construct meaning, and to include others, translanguaging is seen as the appropriate use of language.

**4.1.2.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

She first came across as a passionate supporter of translanguaging to have rapid access to knowledge and information. It was acknowledged that translanguaging is a method through which bilinguals have access to a variety of linguistic components and modes in order to enhance communication and comprehend their surroundings.

She said that "translanguaging is an excellent method to help students learn a foreign language (English) in order to obtain a greater degree of communicative competency in the target language." She mentioned this so that we might clarify our comprehension by using Urdu or another regional language as a reference. Another time, in answer to the same query, it was noted that translanguaging provides students with the opportunity to advance not only in terms of material comprehension but also in terms of cognitive growth, which controls the amount of communicative space filled in oral exercises. The teachers' restriction to monolingual exercises is seen as a deficiency in good language use. It may be argued that the initial goal of translanguaging was to make use of all linguistic resources available to improve learners' performance and knowledge.

She emphasized this incidence and application of translanguaging with the words, "It also makes it easier for us to learn other unique languages. Additionally, it will close any gaps in oral hygiene practices. Language-fluent teachers are well liked by both the pupils and the students themselves. It improves our ability to think critically and to understand complex concepts."

**4.1.2.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

The participant said that when L1 learners switch from their family's context to the target language group and relocate, they pick up new language abilities. She advocated for giving students full rein to express their thoughts in class using the literate language they bring with them and giving them access to academic resources via their communicative repertoire.

Their stress levels would skyrocket as a result of its carelessness, which would also affect how well they could communicate in English. She continued, it does not obstruct learning a target language. She sent the following messages to those in charge of setting educational policy:

"Since it doesn't affect one's proficiency in the target language and opens up new vistas and aspects of other languages, I fervently urge educational policymakers to promote the strategic use of other languages. It should be broadened, and more than one language should be taught in the school."

**4.1.2.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**.

According to this participant, translanguaging effectively encourages the usage of hybrid languages and acknowledges the variety of uses and objectives for such languages. Despite being used as a teaching tool, translanguaging has been an unintentional tendency among students.

"Switching between languages is an unconscious event when we construct a language series to hone our linguistic skills; instead, we concentrate largely on producing a straightforward and understandable sentence. It is remarkably organic. We concentrate on the message itself rather than taking the medium into consideration."

**4.1.3 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

This male volunteer was an interested and enthusiastic learner who was from the area where the actual research was conducted. He was a native speaker of Saraiki. He was friendly enough to speak English, Urdu, and Punjabi and had a working understanding of Pushto in addition to Saraiki. He boasted that he could speak many languages. Even though Saraiki is spoken at home, he sometimes wishes to chat with neighboring Pushto speakers.

An evaluation of his interview based on the themes that stood out is provided below.

**4.1.3.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

This participant opposed the idea of a one-language rule in academic settings when both teachers and students are attempting to become fluent in the target language without making effective use of regional languages. He thought that in order for learners to develop communicative proficiency in the target language, circumstances where one must execute their newly acquired linguistic competence must be created.

Given the importance of languages, it has been determined that Urdu should be used as a teaching tool since it is understandable and the only language that enables students from a variety of linguistic backgrounds to contextualize the core content and finish any academic course. He said that there was much to be accomplished in language schools and that it was crucial to develop scenarios that were representative of everyday life since employing the target language in these circumstances would only confuse the pupils. This is consistent with Van Liers' (2008) ecological technique, which highlights the need to use current languages in the development of new ones.

"We are required to communicate in the target language, or we are prohibited from doing so, but this has little to do with real-world scenarios in which one would need to be able to do so. I like to utilize Urdu in the classroom since it is our native language and most people can understand it. If our mother languages are not familiar to one another, we may use this neutral language as a transformative tool."

The passage above offers insight into how his opposition benefited students' academic endeavors and how the prohibition on the use of monolingual assumptions is unequivocally rejected in favor of the development of good communication abilities. He included instances to back up his claim that if students are serious about succeeding, they should be permitted to speak in whichever language they are comfortable with. To be understood, they communicate across linguistic boundaries. What matters most is that people feel they can actively contribute to having access to contribute. Urdu may be used as an L1 since the whole class is proficient enough to understand any reference in this language.

**4.1.3.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

This study's topic was found to be in favor of maintaining a range of communication preferences among friends. He was able to speak his mind in a way that was suitable for the circumstances. He never stopped using the many ways that languages may be used and doing different tasks by experimenting with them. He relied on the use of other regional languages in addition to the target language to comprehend the true nature of the language that is most suited to maintaining good communication. This removed any ambiguity.

"It depends on the folks in your network. I shall make use of my Pushto language skills if I find myself among Pushto speakers. On the other hand, I prefer to speak Urdu if I ever fail and see a gap in my communication techniques. I like to talk Saraiki when I'm with Saraiki speakers".

**4.1.3.3 Language shift**

This participant stressed the need to switch between languages simultaneously to avoid any miscommunications while speaking to a receiver. As a consequence of these many translingual practices, the speakers were often obliged to choose a holistic concept, such as "polylanguaging" and "poly-lingual languaging" (Otsuji & Pennycook, 2011).

"I often flip between languages to make sure that any mother tongue speaker can understand. If I am not making my point in both languages, I move between them. I change the medium while keeping the audience in mind."

His statements above suggest that language switching is done to make it simpler for the listener to meet their needs through the use of interactional strategies throughout the conversation. Although these several languages continue to coexist in the same region, they no longer have separate zones or hierarchies.

**4.1.3.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

The participant argues that multilingual is now better equipped to aid others in understanding and encourage the formation of conceptual and linguistic knowledge, even if it may be challenging to discern amongst language learners with various linguistic profiles. One may argue that this strengthens their bilingualism since pupils are mostly lectured in their native tongues while picking up new vocabulary and concepts in a foreign language.

"Yes, I have often seen such students employing translanguaging or other languages. It is solely used by students to get a fundamental understanding of the ideas. Translanguaging gives learners the capacity to express themselves verbally."

It is possible to argue that he sought to communicate in order to examine the many features of the language repertoire in all forms of transmission. Second, they employ these modalities to make their message more memorable and convincing.

**4.1.3.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

According to the participant, research on the use of translanguaging has shown how to utilize languages to maximize knowledge and performance while minimizing hurdles to learning a foreign language. According to the participant, using well-planned translanguaging techniques can help students and teachers alike improve language skills and "clarify or reinforce lesson material" (Garcia, 2009, p. 299).

"Yes, the use of translanguaging in the classroom is both urgently required and necessary."

He stressed that using different languages has become a cry of the time in the current, globalized world to meet the needs of communication. He realized that schools needed to support translanguaging. This participant expressed his wish to create a strategy to reduce the increased linguistic complexity brought on by the flow of people and information. He believes that children utilize their home linguistic literacy to continue learning new languages in the classroom since they come from a variety of linguistic backgrounds at home. Translanguaging, which provides a diversity of communication and instructional possibilities, is therefore a beneficial communication tool in these situations.

**4.1.3.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

He said that translanguaging was focused on the development of communication abilities. This person wholeheartedly agreed that translanguaging helped people learn other languages and contributed to that process. Translanguaging helps Students Bridge the content by creating a relationship using a biliteracy lens. Thus, in his opinion, the word

"translanguaging" as a term for scaffolding refers to the exploration of new ways for learners to participate in the learning process.

"Yes, this capacity to learn goes above and beyond to make learning easier. It will help us find out more. To master our own language, we must go a long way."

**4.1.3.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

In response to this problem, he spoke strongly about the effect of translanguaging on communication capacity and said that hybrid language practices allow pupils to think about the appropriate use of other languages. Translanguaging, according to Shohamy (2006), aids students in comprehending the multilingual society in which they live. It seemed difficult to have a thorough comprehension of the world without merging all the languages we come across.

"To improve student understanding, translanguaging strategies need to be emphasized in the classroom. Each student ought to have the option of using the medium of their choice to express themselves."

Translanguaging never hinders learners' capacity to achieve a high proficiency, as he demonstrated in his explanation of how it affects communicative competence. Minority students frequently remain silent in class and are unable to improve their communication abilities if they are not exposed to practices of other languages. Minority students typically feel very uncomfortable and uneasy in their home tongues. The participant expressed their position as follows:

"There is no question that it aids in developing linguistic proficiency in the target language. In the classroom, translanguaging must be used appropriately. An increase in translanguaging does not signify that either the teacher or the student lack competency".

**4.1.3.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**

He claimed that translanguaging, when utilized as a technique, enhances pupils' understanding of and capacity for conceptualizing difficult concepts. Furthermore, he asserted that language switching is a natural and unconscious process. In educational contexts and outside of the classroom, several languages may be practiced with little to no physical or mental exertion.

"No, it occurs unintentionally. To build a coherent communication system, we often transition between languages. Our capacity for learning is enhanced."

**4.1.4 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

This participant was a Pushto-speaking community member who completed class 10 at an Urdu-medium school. He kept going to schools where English was taught as a second language. His consistently good marks throughout his scholastic career were proof of his remarkable intellectual standing among his classmates and peers. He was a native speaker of Pushto. In addition, he was fluent in English and Urdu.

He further claims that, despite studying in a Saraiki-speaking community, he only possessed rudimentary conversational proficiency in Saraiki. Due to his family's educational background, they utilized Pushto at home in addition to code-switching between Urdu and English during family interactions.

Here, a comprehensive analysis of his interview is given in line with the prepared subjects for the understudy.

**4.1.4.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

This respondent made it obvious that he likes to conceptualize the true nature of difficult ideas and concepts using his own linguistic abilities. He continued by saying that he preferred to use a combination of the target language and the regional and national languages. His preference for speaking languages other than English highlighted the potential advantage of translanguaging, which might help children develop their oral and written literacy in their less-strong language. It was evident that translanguaging enhances a learner's cognitive ability to fully comprehend a subject. According to Baker (2011), by having students repeat what they have learned in one language in another, translanguaging broadens, expands, and intensifies the learning process. This is how the participant reported it:

"English is the sole language that may be used for teaching and communication. I would prefer to use Urdu, Saraiki, or possibly Pushto if I decide to use a language other than English. Since Urdu is our official language, its use is authorized. The main argument in favor of using other languages is that they will close any gaps in your learning."

Another time, he underlined the need to employ several languages in the classroom since it enhances students' ability to think, understand, and internalize information in two languages. Using a personal detail that was heard in one language and providing the essence of it in another, he advised. Speakers of two or more languages have the opportunity to mediate understandings across language groups, give up their time so that others may participate in discussions, and generate understandings via translanguaging.

"Learning in various languages is more practical and increases our knowledge. It offers us the ability to grasp things better, which surely enhances our cognitive capacities. It should be used to go around challenges that students have throughout the learning process and to easily attain communicative capability."

The aforementioned extract may be used to examine how translanguaging enables pupils to overcome communication barriers to a greater extent. One may completely profit if they make use of the wide range of communication across several linguistic barriers to do certain tasks that require proficiency in both languages.

**4.1.4.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

The subject of the interview was partially in agreement with the notion that in casual contexts, one is restricted to making monolingual assumptions. He seems to be a supporter of the idea that languages shouldn't be kept separate since translanguaging celebrates the versatility of language use and permeates learning across two or more languages.

"I use Urdu to converse the most of the time. Since we are fluent in English, we also use it. I like to use all of the languages throughout our conversation since my aim is to express my point without creating a complicated structure that is difficult for my audience to understand."

He admired the speaker's linguistic ability and showed it by favoring languages other than English. In his opinion, the choice of whatever language to study should be based not only on the results of bilingual education but also on the underlying characteristics of how a bilingual thinks, understands, and develops communicative competence.

### 4.1.4.3 Language shift

It is an interesting finding because the respondent admitted switching between languages and said that it was an automated process that required no effort. The answer was also claimed to be well aware of the advantages of translanguaging, which allows students to freely deliver material in a formal register to a group of language speakers.

"Language switching is a common phenomenon. There is no need to employ force to switch from one language to another. I go back and forth between languages, mostly to enhance my communication."

### 4.1.4.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique

He emphasized that translanguaging—the practice of learning in one language and reporting on it in another—is a legitimate method for exchanging ideas and understanding the attitudes and viewpoints of learners. By encouraging a positive outlook towards learning about different languages and cultures, translanguaging aids pupils in acquiring new languages through a second approach.

"I spend the most of my time with my friends in the classroom and in the hostel; almost all of them are multilingual. We communicate in a variety of tongues only for educational or informational purposes."

It may be argued that translanguaging can enhance learners' ability to move between languages with confidence and ease for a variety of purposes, which is utilized to meet the communicative needs of speakers with different linguistic profiles. Translanguaging is simply the capacity to communicate by mixing and borrowing certain linguistic components from other languages.

### 4.1.4.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom

He was in favor of using a translanguaging strategy in language classes, particularly when it enhances the ability to mimic real-world scenarios. He continued to explain his perspective by stating that translanguaging techniques need to be used since they aid in student learning. Here, it is possible to argue that linguistic varieties—rather than specific languages—are mixing. Translanguaging has been successful and has been connected to better academic achievement as a naturally occurring activity. Additionally, he showed

"Translanguaging helps students broaden their language horizons and enhance their linguistic skills so they may create their own kinds of

communication. Translanguaging must be used in the classroom because students from different linguistic backgrounds need access to local language resources. Additionally, in order to operate in daily settings, we must significantly advance our linguistic skills."

In a society that is getting more and more multilingual, it is plainly obvious from the following extract from his interview script that translanguaging has become the most important tool for communication. The participant went on to remark that if students were only permitted to speak one language, there would be a great deal of linguistic uneasiness because students of minority languages would feel humiliated, and this anxiety would often exhibit itself in the form of silence in the classroom. He said the following in describing the circumstances:

"It helps the learner adjust to the learning process. If we can only utilize one language, a lot of students miss out since they don't know the language well enough to participate."

### 4.1.4.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language

According to the participant in the first half of the interview, translanguaging is a genuine facilitator and a major factor in learning foreign languages. It may be argued that students always modify the language used in class to aid in their understanding of the subject matter. Additionally, he stressed that translanguaging gives learners the ability to come up with their own unique ways of communicating in the dominant language in addition to opening up new opportunities for fully grasping the topic.

"Learning a second language by translanguaging is a helpful strategy. Many difficult concepts may be made simpler while still improving one's proficiency in the target language. It enhances our linguistic ability. It allows for a deeper understanding of a foreign language. The difficult words or ideas may be translated into our native languages to provide us with a basis for correctly learning any other language. Using this, we can learn it really well."

### 4.1.4.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners

He reiterated his belief that the goal of translanguaging is to use and enhance both languages. People who are aware of the advantages of translanguaging encourage students to use a range of linguistic settings to express themselves internally and to think critically, according to Garcia &

Kleifgen (2010). It was also suggested that translanguaging has nothing to do with a fall in communicative proficiency; rather, a focus is made on an increase to optimize learning and generate disciplined communicative proficiency. This participant gave the following description:

"I shouldn't blame translanguaging for making learning a foreign language difficult or difficult to learn. It doesn't lessen our proficiency with the intended language. Learners should be free to utilize their background in other languages to become fluent in the target language."

**4.1.4.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of Translanguaging in pedagogy**

Expanding one's linguistic skills and learning new languages often come naturally and instinctively. This participant acknowledged that building a language repertory did not call for particular effort but rather a steady and growing awareness of the languages that are simultaneously spoken around him.

"Like I stated, it doesn't need much effort, but it creates a way to look into the variety of languages. I argue that it is an unconscious phenomenon as a result."

Translanguaging is an unconscious phenomenon, according to the respondent, who was extremely contemptuous of the concept of encouraging pupils to use it as a tool in the classroom.

**4.1.5 Discussion and analysis of the fifth participant of the interview**

The fifth participant belongs to the Saraiki area belt and is a native speaker of Saraiki and a proficient user of Urdu. Along with these two languages, she can speak English very well and also Arabic a little bit. But she claimed that Saraiki is her mother tongue, as her family members used to speak Saraiki at home. She has been instructing at a BS-level institute and addressing students in a classroom environment.

**4.1.5.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

The participant claimed to address people in Urdu at her workplace. But as for the classroom effectiveness and the compatibility of the students to understand the language processing, she supported the translanguaging skills to address students in a better way. She said;

"It's codeswitching Urdu and English because students belong to different backgrounds."

It supports the idea that the participant in the interview is accepting that classroom communication techniques are based on the communication between English and Urdu. She even tried to use the translanguaging technique while addressing one of the researcher's questions about the number of languages spoken at home. She responded:

"Dou, Two it's Saraiki and Urdu"

The use of the word "Dou" means two in Urdu, and she used to switch between the languages while responding to the questions, which shows that she is widely using translanguaging techniques.

**4.1.5.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

The participant only responded with the one-word answer "Urdu." Which shows that the participant is totally clear and confident in responding to the particular question of dominance of language among friends. And it also shows that the participant claimed not to be switching between languages while having a discussion with friends.

**4.1.5.3 Language shift**

In response to this question, she again mentioned confidently that she rarely switches between languages while having a conversation with friends, but initially she accepted the use of translanguaging in classroom activities but not in friends' circles. She answered:

"Rarely, because I prefer to use only Urdu.'

It clarifies that the participant is an Urdu-oriented user of the language in her workplace and also with her colleagues and friends, but she only switches to Saraiki while she is having a conversation at home.

**4.1.5.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

The participant shared her views that translanguaging is basically used to impart knowledge in a better way. When we switch between the languages, the intention behind these switching techniques is only to impart the information in an effective way that is really helpful both for the students and the teachers to create a better learning environment in the class. She said:

"Obviously, we used the translanguaging technique to support our arguments in a better way that is helpful for the students too because of their affiliation with the particular language."

**4.1.5.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

The participant was clearly and bluntly in favor of using translanguaging techniques in the classroom, as she linked it with the cultural differences and their social values along with the language differences. She emphasized the necessity of shifting between multiple languages during classroom activities and drills. It can have a positive outcome in their results, and it may also enhance their language learning capabilities.

"Translanguaging should be used in the class because students belong to different backgrounds; if we speak in their language, one or two words, they feel affiliations, and it increases or enhances their learning abilities."

The aforementioned excerpt concludes the participants response towards translanguaging skills; she used the "should" to put an emphasis on the use of translanguaging aspects in classrooms and also justified it with the arguments of cultural differences. It results in pedagogical improvements, too.

**4.1.5.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

As for the learning of foreign languages, she again focused on the frequent use of translanguaging skills by responding:

"It should be used more frequently"

She identifies that by using translanguaging techniques, language learning processes can be enhanced to help students learn languages.

**4.1.5.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

The participant was of the view that translanguaging skills can have an effect on the language proficiency of the learners when someone who does not belong to the same language background is not understanding the concepts that are being delivered to them. This will obviously have an impact on language learning. When the instructor of the particular language is helping students obtain knowledge in their own mother tongue or national language, it will have an impact on their proficiency level.

**4.1.5.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of Translanguaging in pedagogy**

The participant opined that the instructor in classroom settings switches to other languages that can be their nation's or regional languages. Translanguaging is committed through unconscious phenomena in pedagogical classroom activities to facilitate the understanding of the language learning process.

**4.1.6 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

The sixth participant in the interview was a first-language user of Urdu and can also speak more than two languages. She often switches between English and Urdu. As with the last participant, she switched the language and used translanguaging techniques while addressing the researcher in an answer to one of the questions. She accepted it, mainly because she mixed up the languages while teaching in class.

**4.1.6.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

The participant preferred to use English in the classroom, but she also pointed out the translanguaging, code switching, and code mixing language techniques to highlight this factor by saying,

"My first preference is English, but obviously we have to code switch for grooming."

It shows that the instructor tries to focus on using the English language, but she also uses translanguaging techniques in classroom activities.

**4.1.6.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

She preferred to use Urdu after class, while interacting with friends, or at home. She prefers to use her mother tongue, which is the Urdu language. She only used English in the classroom setting, but after class she preferred to use Urdu. As far as language dominance among friends' circles is concerned, she was more inclined towards the use of her mother tongue.

**4.1.6.3 Language shift**

She was of the opinion that she used to switch between the languages while communicating with students, friends, and family members by responding that

"Yes, we switch the language."

It facilitates the researcher's point of view too that most of the teachers in institutions prefer to switch classroom teaching practices.

**4.1.6.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

She responded that imparting information and knowledge in the regional or national languages helps students actively participate in classroom activities because, when a student is unable to understand some of the concepts in the official language, the use of some words or grammar translation skills can increase their understanding of the subjects or agenda.

**4.1.6.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

The participant herself used the translanguaging technique while answering the effectiveness of the skill in classroom settings; she switched from English to Urdu and responded to the question subjectively. She answered as follows:

"Again ye mera apna personal opinion hay kay hm code mixing k zariye hi chalein gay."

English Transcription: "Again, it's my opinion that we will continue with the code mixing."

This excerpt clearly states that she supported the use of translanguaging techniques in classroom activities and placed emphasis on switching between languages to get a positive response from the students.

**4.1.6.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

As far as foreign languages are concerned, trans languages help students in multiple ways. At the start of a new language, the students are not very well aware of the language. Teachers have to use translanguaging techniques to provide better concepts of the language by using regional languages. She responded, like:

"Yes, obviously, teachers have to use these types of tactics to increase students's understanding of foreign languages."

**4.1.6.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

The participant wishes to use implementation translanguaging more in the classroom activities. She supported her arguments by stating that "teachers must cooperate with the student by translating, code mixing, and switching while teaching in the classroom. Initially, it facilitates the learner to comprehend the basics of the language, but later on, they will have a proficient level of the language when they learn many more concepts of the language."

This discussion identifies the language techniques being used by the instructors to facilitate the students learning of the basic level of understanding through translation and other translanguaging elements.

**4.1.6.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**

The participant pointed out her unconscious use of translanguaging skills in this interview. She mentioned that in the same way, when the instructor itself is taking part in classroom drills, he or she switches unconsciously

between the languages. Sometimes we do it deliberately when we are running out of better examples in the native or English language. We create an association with the regional culture through regional languages.

**4.1.7 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

The seventh participant in the interview claims to speak several languages as she is multilingual; she pointed out three languages at the moment, such as English, Urdu, and Saraiki. She is the native language user of Saraiki and is also a proficient speaker of Urdu and English. When it comes to the question of classroom settings, she also suggested using translanguaging techniques because of the diversified cultures and languages of the students. Although she was the first participant to say that while interacting with a friend's circle, it depends on the situation if a friend is conversing in Urdu or Saraiki. She responded back in the same language as the speaker did. But she claimed to use only one language with her friends, although she switches languages in the classroom environment.

**4.1.7.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

"I usually prefer speaking Urdu language at my workplace."

"It depends on the students. I think we should show the students that they can understand English, Urdu, or Saraiki."

**4.1.7.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

"Also, it depends on my friend; if he or she is the Saraiki speaker, I speak Saraiki. If he or she is the Urdu speaker, I speak Urdu."

**4.1.7.3 Language shift**

No, I don't switch, I choose only one language. Yes, when I am in class, at that time I can switch from one language to another according to the situation."

**4.1.7.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

"Yes, obviously, translanguaging can be used to impart the various domains of knowledge to the students in a better way."

**4.1.7.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

"Translanguaging has already proven to be an important element of the classroom because if we consider only one language, it would not be ethical for the teacher as his responsibility is to make things clear, not difficult."

**4.1.7.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

"Yes, as stated earlier, trans language can help students meet their classroom objectives. If one wants to learn a foreign language, obviously teachers and students have to use multiple languages."

**4.1.7.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

If someone is unable to understand a second or foreign language in the target language, how will he be able to acquire proficiency in the language? It is only possible through the use of translanguaging translation skills or language mixing and switching.

**4.1.7.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**

The respondent shared her own teaching experience, as she thought that whenever she teaches in the classroom, it is an unconscious phenomenon, so I use translanguaging techniques to make my lectures and teaching skills more prominent and easier for the students, as my sole purpose is to make them clear. I switch between languages, mixing the vocabulary of three different languages in the classroom discourse.

**4.1.8 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

The eighth participant in the interview was a native speaker of Balochi and had lived in Dera Ghazi Khan for the past 20 years. He is a proficient speaker of both Urdu and Saraiki. Although Saraiki is not his mother tongue, he has acquired it naturally through interaction with his surroundings. The participant was strongly in favour of using translanguaging techniques to teach students in a better learning environment. Because many students are not able to understand the concepts in direct English, there is always a need to use another language to support the student-teacher learning environment.

**4.1.8.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

The participant is more inclined towards using English in the classroom, although he speaks Urdu and Balochi, both languages in the classroom through translanguaging techniques. The participant was of the view:

"Yes, I use Urdu and Balochi languages other than English in the classroom, but it depends on the situation. If I am addressing a particular student who knows to speak Balochi language. I prefer to speak Balochi with him. If I am addressing the whole class, I use Urdu language."

The aforementioned transcription shows that the participant uses translanguaging in classroom settings, but he is a speaker-oriented language user, according to the situation.

**4.1.8.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

The participant was of the view that the use of language among friends depends on where and with whom the conversation is taking place. He has a vast circle of friends; for example, while having a conversation with friends in Balochistan, he used to speak Balochi, but when he was interacting with his friends in Dera Ghazi Khan, he used to speak Saraiki.

"I use Balochi with my friends in my hometown and Saraiki with the friends who belong to the Saraiki area."

**4.1.8.3 Language shift**

As far as the classroom setting is concerned, the respondent believed that he uses English, but when it is necessary to give some examples from the regional languages and students are not getting the point, then a language shift takes place. But with friends, I often switch from one language to another.

"Yes, I switch from Urdu to Saraiki or Balochi while having conversations with friends in the classroom. I prefer English until and unless it is required to switch to another language."

**4.1.8.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

The respondent supported the translanguaging technique to impart information and deliver concepts to the students.

"Yes, we can impart fruitful information through translanguaging skills."

**4.1.8.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

The respondent emphasizes the importance of translanguaging skills in the classroom because students are always interested in learning their regional languages and because it's a fruitful technique to teach students. But he argued that whenever we are in language teaching classes, the teacher must speak the target language, as it is aimed at teaching them that particular language. Translanguaging can also play an important role in language learning classes, but it must not be strongly appreciated to teach a targeted language through another particular regional language.

"We must discourage the full use of translanguaging skills in language classes, but it is also an important factor in language classes. Teaching a target language by using the target language must only be the aim."

**4.1.8.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

The respondent was not much interested in translanguaging techniques in language teaching processes. He was of the view that whenever we are learning a foreign language, initially we can have an understanding of the particular language through translation techniques, but they must not be used throughout the process. We must appreciate the use of foreign languages if we want to teach or learn them.

"Again, learning a foreign language must be in the foreign language, but we can take a little bit of help from the regional languages to understand the basic understanding of the particular foreign language."

**4.1.8.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

The respondent had contrary views depending on the situation because of his diverse cultural and linguistic background. Many of the students are average learners. We can support them by using translingual skills to boost their understanding. It can have an effect on language learning processes, but for good language learners, we must focus on the target language to make them proficient speakers of that language.

**4.1.8.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**

The participant strongly pointed out that the pedagogical domain must be a conscious teaching phenomenon because we must be aware of our teaching environment, topic, language being taught, background of the students, etc. So the teacher must perform accordingly, according to the needs of the students. Sometimes we can link it with an unconscious phenomenon too, like answering the questions posed by the students. Teachers can use translanguaging skills to facilitate themselves and the students.

**4.1.9 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

The ninth participant in the interview can speak only two languages: Urdu and English. Her mother tongue was Urdu, and she learned English as her second language. She claimed that she could easily understand Saraiki and Punjabi but could not speak. She clearly mentions that translanguaging techniques in the classroom are really important for the students, as they really

help her to clarify their concepts. She said that she usually starts code mixing and switching in the classroom, with friends, and also at home.

**4.1.9.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

The participant said that her aim is to deliver the concept to the students and solve their problems in an authentic way. The language does not matter from her point of view. Although she prefers the use of Urdu in classroom settings.

"Yes, I do prefer Urdu language in the classroom because my students feel it is easy to learn."

**4.1.9.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

The participant opined that most of her friends belong to the Saraiki community, and when they are interacting in a group, she can easily understand their language, but she replies to them in Urdu. And the same happens with them when they interact only with me; they switch to the Urdu language.

"Most of my friends speak the Saraiki language, but with me, they convert to Urdu."

**4.1.9.3 Language shift**

The participant opined that language shift only takes place in classroom activities, as it suits her and the students to use translanguaging technologies in the classroom setting. She switches between Urdu and English language. But when it comes to the discussion with the friend, mixing English and Urdu plays an important conversational role.

"I prefer to shift languages from English to Urdu or Urdu to English in classroom teaching, but in conversation with friends, I use a mix-up vocabulary of both languages."

**4.1.9.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique**

He stated that imparting knowledge through the translanguaging technique would be a better technique, and it also proved to be beneficial in her experience. She was of the opinion that translanguaging has already proven to be a fruitful teaching technique in academic research. And the way students responded to these techniques was satisfactory. The researchers also supported these techniques.

"Yes, you know trans-language proved to be fruitful for the students, and there are also multiple researchers who have also supported the use of translanguaging techniques in a pedagogical learning to get a positive results."

**4.1.9.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom**

She responded, "This is what I am emphasizing; the use of translanguaging techniques in class must be imposed on a wider level. My classroom techniques are totally based on my translanguaging skills. I appreciate the same response (translanguaging) from the students too."

This participant was totally in favour of the translanguaging techniques in class. She supported her arguments by mentioning researchers and even demanded others utilize this skill, as it was fruitful for her.

**4.1.9.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language**

She responded the same way: "Translation is always an important element in classroom learning, and if it is a language learning case, then it must be certain because of the students' ignorance of the foreign languages. They will learn foreign languages through translation techniques. She was of the view:

"When we are dealing with foreign language learning processes, teachers must ensure the use of translanguaging skills because of the unawareness of the students to the particular language and its meaning making processes. Translanguaging is the only source of learning in this situation."

**4.1.9.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners**

Language proficiency can be enhanced by providing extra information to the language students through translation. When a student gets help from the regional languages to understand different languages, it will obviously affect his or her language proficiency. Learning a foreign language has never been an easy process. Students pass through different stages of language learning. Each step helps to enhance proficiency in the language.

**4.1.9.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**

She was of the opinion that "yes, the translanguaging phenomenon in the pedagogical domain is unconsciously followed, but sometimes the teachers use it consciously too to use supportive language to provide extra clear information to the students to make themselves clear understandings of the discussions."

**4.1.10 Discussion and analysis of the third participant of the interview**

The last participant in the interview belongs to Sindh and has been residing in Dera Ghazi Khan for the last five years. Sindhi is his first language, but he can speak Urdu, Saraiki, and English as well. Saraiki and Sindhi have a little bit of the same tone and vocabulary items, so it was not a difficult task for him to understand and learn Saraiki. He also supported translanguaging in classroom settings, although he was more inclined towards the use of the English language. He used to do a little bit of code switching and code mixing during his classes.

**4.1.10.1 Language preference in classroom other than English**

"I only prefer English language in classroom because my teaching subject is in English, but whenever I feel that a student is unable to understand something in English, I use code switching and code mixing to make them aware of the agenda being discussed."

The participant was a target language user in the classroom until and unless it was required by the learners. He supported the translanguaging techniques.

**4.1.10.2 Language dominance in friend's circle**

The participant widely uses his mother tongue vocabulary in conversation with his friends while interacting with them in Saraiki. He responded in this way:

"Most of my friends in Dera Ghazi Khan are Saraiki speakers due to the regional language prevalence, but when I interact with them, I try to speak Saraiki with them, but due to my first language dominance, I mostly use Sindhi language vocabulary that is easily comprehendible by my friends."

**4.1.10.3 Language shift**

"Sometimes a language shift takes place in the classroom when students are totally unable to understand the topic being delivered to them. I shift from English to Urdu and give them proper understanding. But when I am addressing my friends, language shifting is a normal activity."

The participant uses language shift as per requirements in the classroom, but with the friends circle, he often shifts from one language to another.

### 4.1.10.4 Imparting informational translanguaging technique

The participant responded in a way that depends on the student's capability to learn the language. He responded in the way, "Yes, you can impart knowledge through translanguaging, but it depends on the students too. "If students are proficient in the target language, then translanguaging will not have a significant contribution, but when it is the need of the students, then it will prove to be a blessing for them."

### 4.1.10.5 Importance of translanguaging in classroom

The participant was truly happy with the use of the translanguaging skills and was clear about their importance, but he was of the view that they must be applicable where they are required. He neglected the use of translanguaging in every setting.

"Again, it depends on the students. If they understand the concepts in the language in which they are being taught, then it does not have significant importance, but if a student is unable to comprehend the language, it will have a significant contribution to their understanding of the knowledge being taught."

### 4.1.10.6 Translanguaging support to learn foreign language

The participant linked the language learning processes with the tough tasks that required a lot of time and effort. He has given his opinion that foreign languages cannot be learned quickly. It takes some effort; initially, we can support students through translanguaging, but if one wants to be proficient, he or she must acquire it in the targeted language. He responded:

"Foreign languages are not to be learned as soon as possible; it is basically a full-fledged process that is needed to be followed throughout the learning process. But yes, translanguaging has its own importance in learning a foreign language. It will be beneficial in learning process."

### 4.1.10.7 Translanguaging effecting the language proficiency of the learners

The participant made a connection between the difficult activities that demanded a lot of time and effort and the language learning procedures. He has expressed the view that learning a foreign language takes time. It takes work; at first, we can assist pupils by translanguaging, but if one wants to become competent, he or she must learn it in the intended language. He answered:

"We cannot say that only translanguaging can make someone proficient in a language." Translanguaging can only help some at the initial level of learning. One must use the target language."

**4.1.10.8 Unconscious Phenomenon of translanguaging in pedagogy**.

The respondent didn't believe that it's an unconscious phenomenon in pedagogy; rather, he called it a situation-based approach of the teacher according to the needs of the hour.

"No, we can not only call it a totally unconscious phenomenon of language learning. It depends on the situation; sometimes we commit it consciously and sometimes unconsciously."

## 4.2 Classroom Observations

The researchers have also analyzed the classroom observations, which are the second tool of the study. Classrooms are a continuous flow of study, so the audio recorder was used to record the happenings of learning activities in the classroom. It helped the researchers organize the data, record classroom activities, and analyze the data. Code switching, code mixing, language mixing, and language shifting were analyzed, as these are the main aspects of the translanguaging technique.

In this section of the data collection, the researcher himself participated in the classroom activities for one month to collect the data. He attended eight classes to observe the learners participation in activities and how they responded to translanguaging techniques. For this purpose, five themes of classroom observations, such as clearing concepts and ideas, discussing ideas for effective learning, multicultural practices, assessing classroom practices, and socializing, were made and analyzed accordingly. These five classroom observations were analyzed by transcribing the recorded data of the study to check whether translanguaging practices are taking place in the classroom and how teachers and students are practicing these translanguaging techniques.

**4.2.1 Classroom 1**

This transcription mentions the discussion that occurred in poetry class after students were assigned a poem to critically analyze. The whole class took place for 50 minutes.

The duration of this in-class observation was about half an hour. The researcher took part in the lesson's observation and audio recording firsthand. The audio recordings were turned into text after listening to them multiple times. A transcription of the classroom is attached.

In this class, the instructor provided the students with detailed directions on how to perform each step of the task. This class had a total enrollment of 40 students. Eight groups with a total of five people each were formed to work on the given task.

Likewise, the discussion was scheduled for 20 minutes. Everyone in the class was really excited to participate in the group discussion. The understudy participants were split up into one group, where they conversed in the target language with no restrictions. Additionally, the participant interviews made it evident. They constantly show how effective and useful translanguaging procedures are.

Important to note is that the observation sheets thematic categorization was used to investigate each category of the five mentioned themes individually. The results unmistakably showed that language learners had a propensity to exercise many languages at once. The improvement of communication and learning effectiveness is always prioritized above language use. It depicts how translanguaging was used in English language training for a number of different objectives.

Teachers and students were using translanguaging techniques in classroom activities to clarify the discussion, and it proved to be effective in understanding classroom discourse. A total of 52 times, the translanguaging technique has been implemented in multiple ways, which clearly identifies the importance of translanguaging in the language learning process of second language learners. Teachers and students both used translanguaging while interacting during the class; they mainly shifted from English, Urdu, and Saraiki. The constant use of translanguaging aspects in the classroom shows the prevalent use of this technique to maintain the essence of classroom learning.

Some of the extracts from the classroom discourse have been taken to analyze aspects of translanguaging skills.

**Extracts from transcript 1**

**Teacher Sentence 1:** *Today we will be discussing a sonnet "Death, be not proud". Apko is ko parhein phr hm analysis krtay hein.*

**Student 1, sentence 2:** *Han jee Bilkul, It is all about death jahan writer "Death" k baray me bayan krta hy k actually "Mout" powerless hai.*

By being able to transition between languages, as seen in the aforementioned samples, learners were obviously motivated and engaged in making learning effective; this strongly indicated that learning took place without any barriers through the translanguaging technique. The student used the first word alone to explain the notion after silently reading the poem "Han Jee Bilkul" (yes, exactly). He composed a statement in Urdu to start the discussion before mixing English clauses to make the language more approachable and to clarify the title of the poem.

It was noted that the bilingualism of the text was what enabled good learning and that employing two languages at once was important to cope with contradictory interpretations, and the students in the classroom actively participated in the discussion by maintaining the essence of their regional and religious point of view through the multiple use of English, Urdu, and Saraiki. Meaning cannot be negotiated without connections across languages; otherwise, two languages must be utilized.

**Teacher sentence 2:** *Han tu ab ap isko apni socioety sy kesay link krein gay? (Yes, now how will you link it to our society?*

As can be seen from the snippet above taken from transcription No. 1, the teacher is moving between languages as a signal to attract diverse learners. Those who cannot understand English properly can also participate by using their regional languages. The learners see language in that social act of communicative engagement used in order to negotiate alternative meanings that included as many group members as possible. Combining the use of many languages with a multilingual integrated system showed how well the language indexes may be used to handle the linguistic complexity of the community. The teacher tried to know the student's perspective by linking it with their cultural and societal perspectives, which led to the use of Saraiki language to support the argument of another student.

**Student 2, sentence 1:** *Yes, Ma'am, magar hmari society me tu log death sy boht darty that is totally contrary to the idea of the poet.*

The extract shows that it was in response to the teacher's question. As a teacher herself, she has used language mixing by using English vocabulary in Urdu sentences. Same goes for the student, who has also used tarnish language in his sentence to give her exactly what she wanted.

**Student 3, responding to students 2:** *Sada ty wal Deen Emaan v Iyoh Naseehat krenday taan (Saraiki)*

**English (Our religion also propagates us the same way)**

This aforementioned extract mentions the multicultural aspects of the translanguage where a student is answering in Saraiki, irrespective of the fact that student two was using a mix of English and Urdu, but the third student responded in another language. The above-mentioned response to the query follows the primary objective of translanguaging practices. Second, it was claimed that translanguaging boosted students' talents and was crucial for aiding in their academic progress because of the use of multiple languages. The learner's constant language switching highlights the need for and intentionality of translanguaging and challenges the idea of monolingual presumptions. It was shown that because of their linguistic repertoire, learners felt confident in their abilities to avoid issues during engagement.

**4.2.2 Classroom 2**

The students of English as a Second Language were given a topic to discuss by the TESOEL (Teaching English to Speakers of Other Languages) teacher in order to provide them the opportunity to develop and have their speaking skills assessed. A half hour was spent observing this class through one-on-one participation in classroom practices. The topic of discussion in this session was "Tourism and its Impact on Other Communities." In order for the student to understand the true meaning of the topic, the teacher, like the others, transliterated when he provided the identical instructions in Urdu and translated them as well, with additional emphasis in Saraiki too. It was observed that students had a variety of discussion topics to choose from to help energize the class conversation. This class also touched on the importance of translanguaging in aiding students in increasing their vocabulary and language competence. The kids understood the challenge and started conversing in a

variety of languages to create a clear channel of communication. As a consequence, they were also able to facilitate learning by implementing translingual techniques in classroom settings.

Before moving to the analysis section of the observation of the classroom practices, read some of the extracts driven out of the classroom data.

**Extracts from transcript 2**

**Teacher sentence 1:** *Chalen abhi aik discussion shuro krty hein, ap sub apny views share kren gay. Tou phr today's discussion topic is "Tourism and its impact on other community".*

**Student 1:** *Sir isko thora explain kr dein phly (Urdu)*

**Teacher sentence 2:** *G me isko explain krta hn aur Ap khud b ispy ghour kren. (Urdu)*

**Teacher sentence 3:** *Acha kharo main ap dasendan (saraiki)*

*English: (Okay wait, let me tell you)*

**Teacher clearifying the concepts of the students;** *while tourism is significant in many parts of the world, it may also have both positive and negative effects. Let's start by discussing the benefits. Ab ap me say kn iskay faiday aur nuqsan btay ga?*

*Student 1 sentence 2:* **"tourism day faiday tay nuqsan dasnrin" (Saraiki)**

**English: (We need to tell advantages and disadvantages of tourism."**

Students occasionally used different languages to help clarify the subject, like in the example above when student 1 translated the teacher's instructions in Siraiki by stating that "tourism day faiday tay nuqsan dasnrin," which clearly identified the use of regional discourse too. It was meant to clarify the subject and improve comprehension of communication during the classroom interaction. They were able to hone their speaking abilities as a result. It was evident when the student translated it into the target language, where it had to be put to use in order to understand the topic in a better way. The employment of three languages—English, Urdu, and Saraiki—by students and the teacher resulted in a clear understanding of the subject being discussed.

The study's participants also skillfully negotiated different meanings by including other students in the conversation and making use of their multilingualism on a wider note instead of focusing on their main aim of learning the English language. The trainees' constant language switching helped

them increase the scope of their linguistic understanding and proficiency. In light of the foregoing discussion, it can be argued that the learners' use of translanguaging techniques was also a result of their own inadequacy or lack of confidence, which led them to switch between languages even when they were truly aware of the classroom objectives for enrolling in the English language learning classes. Irrespective of meeting their objectives, they were continuously using translanguaging skills.

### 4.2.3 Classroom 3

For your perusal, here is a portion of the discussion between the students on "the role of private institutions in the development of the area" from Transcription No. 3. Every kid in the class took part in the task since they can all independently produce, reproduce, and communicate their own thoughts and views freely. They were allowed to answer according to their own points of view without any restriction. The researcher had only recorded the participants' voluntary remarks to support the study's goals and did not interrupt the classroom discussion. The researcher was a silent listener in this class. It is essential to emphasize that learners should switch between languages to deal with a variety of meanings and to speed up the learning process rather than depending heavily on the usage of a single language. Their language skills improved, but more importantly, their communication skills improved.

**Extracts from transcript 3**

**Teacher:** *We are going to have a distinction on the role of private institutions in the development of the area. Ap log apas me discuss kr lein, 5 minutes mein hm discuss krtay hen.*

Transcription of Urdu sentence: You can discuss it with each other; we will be starting it in 5 minutes.

Basically, the teacher used the active interactive teaching methodology in the classroom, where he gave a topic to the students and asked them to discuss it with each other. Later on, he also participated in the discussion by giving his opinion and raising some questions. Students in this class also used the transliteration skill. The teacher only used two languages, English and Urdu, but students were also involved in Saraiki.

**Student:** *Sir, Main btaon?*

**Teacher:** *Yes*

**Student 1:** *Sir Private Institutions play an important role in the development of an area where they are located like jo bachay private schools me prhtay hen wo zayada responsible citizen hoty because private institutions study k sth sth personal development b krty hen.*

**Student 2***: while interupting student 1: Enday bad medi wari ey (saraiki)*

**English: Now, it will be my turn.**

**Student 2:** *Yes sir, I am agree with the student 1 because private schools study k sth sth personal developments jesa k activities, speeches, contests k through confidence development krty hen but in govt schools many of the students are of less confidents.*

**Student 3***: asking a question from student 2: Tu v tan sarkari school parhein pichen teday ich confident's keni wal?*

**Student *2* replying student 2:** *main comparatively gaal kiti mi*

**Teacher interrupting students:** *Okay is there any role of private school in the development of the area.*

The aforementioned pieces of the interaction supported the use of multilingual practices in classroom situations by maintaining the different functions of native language, such as code mixing, switching, and language shifting. The abrupt language shifting also helped the learners identify the cause, understand the meanings, and create an easy learning environment as people felt affiliation with the regional languages.

**4.2.4 Classroom 4**

Because the teacher placed restrictions on or required that the students exclusively speak the target language, there were very few translanguaging practices seen in this class throughout the two inspections. Students utilized translanguaging while addressing or answering questions in the classroom, and the teacher also responded to them with a positive response through translanguaging techniques. The instructor and the students were having a conversation about Charles Dickens' novel "Tale of Two Cities.". The students have already learned the novel, but they were revising it in the classroom after completing it. Students were directed to use only one target language, which was "English," but they, along with the teacher, used the translanguaging technique of code switching and code mixing to complete their communication.

Second, the participants never felt self-conscious since their primary goal was to develop a clear communication strategy in the target language.

**Extracts from transcript 4**

**Teacher:** *Who is going to summarize the story of novel, "A Tale of Two Cities."?*

**Student 1:** *Well, "A Tale of Two Cities" discusses about the French Revolution. The story explores themes of love, sacrifice, and the turmoil of the era where people are sacrificing their lives to get the freedom.*

**Teacher:** *Who can remind us about the significant characters and how did they act in novel?*

**Student 2:** *Ehm kirdaron me say one characters is Lucie Manette, a beautiful young woman who is representing hope and love through her character. She is the daughter of Dr. Alexandre Manette, who has recetly been set out of unjust imprisonment and becomes a prominent figure of the story. Is k ilawa baqi characters jesa k Miss Pross, Lucie's loyal and protective servant, and Monsieur and Madame Defarge, who are also fighting for justice and playing an active key role in the development of the storry.*

**Teacher:** *Boht khoob. Now, who is going to share themes and symbols of the novel? Example bhi sath btani hay.*

**Student 3:** *We can notice one of the prominent theme of sacrifice and resurrection in one of the main characters of sydeny carton who also sacrificed his life for the happiness of others.*

This aforementioned classroom discussion on the novel A Tale of Two Cities also mentions some of the translating practices of the students and teachers. Although they set rules to be focused only on the target language, somehow they managed to shift from one language to another in their discussions, such as by the student *2. Ehm kirdaron me say one character is Lucie Manette and Is k ilawa baqi characters jesa k...* has used the English language to support his answer while he was responding to one of the questions.

The teacher himself responded to the student by inserting Urdu phrases like *"Boht khoob and Example bhi sath btani hay,"* which shows the teacher himself took advantage of the academic advantages of practicing translanguaging in classrooms. But mainly the classroom discussions were in the target language, which also depicts that when clear instructions for using the

target language are imposed in the class, the students tend to use that language, but we can have a lower contribution on the student level, as was noticed in this classroom too.

**4.2.5 Classroom 5**

The following is an extract from transcription number 5, when "What should be the medium of instruction at school?" was being discussed. The given exercise was meant to be discussed with the students, and the linguist was actively involved in the lesson and was observing the use of language, shift of language, etc. The pupils' conversations and interactions lasted for 28 minutes. Similar to the previously recorded sessions, the researcher attended and recorded the class activities. The group discussion was given 20 minutes. Where a teacher was asking students about what they thought the medium of instruction at the school level should be and what their views were about the medium in which they studied.

**Extracts from transcript 5**

**Teacher:** *Okay now you can share your point of views that what should be the medium of an instruction at school level? Ap jb school me thy tu kn si zuban me apko prhaya jata tha aur kia ap us zuban sy mutmain hen?*

**Student 1:** *Sir I belong to the area of Sakhi sarwar jahan hr koi Balochi bolta hy aur wahan py hmen Urdu me prhaya jata tha aur hmri books English me hoti thi. Lekin mghytu dono e mushkil lgti thi aur jb hm idhr ay tu kuch smjh ai hy*

**Teacher pointing to other students:** *Yes what would you like to say about this issue?*

**Student 2:** *Sir I was studying at Urdu medium schools lekin wahan hmen saraiki as a subject prhaya gya tha hmen. I was really happy with that medium of an instruction because hmry elaqaay me sub yhi bolty thay even our teachers used to speak Saraiki with us at schools until and unless they read something from the Urdu or English book.*

From the above discussion, it is concluded that translanguaging practices in the classroom clearly encourage students to acquire and utilize knowledge in a natural way, irrespective of their cultural differences. When students gain knowledge of their regional and widely accepted languages, it increases their understanding and classroom performance. Translanguage

behaves as a supporter and a facilitator for the language learner to understand the meaning-making processes that are the core purpose of language learning classrooms. L1 use of the first language will always provide background support for the language learners in the understanding and comprehension of the second language discourse, which is actually based on translanguaging.

**4.2.6 Classroom 6**

Numerous instances of translanguaging were found in transcription number 6 below, when the students were involved in the department's weekly teaching session.

The main goals of this class are to boost students' self-confidence and improve their public speaking abilities through active participation in the weekly session. The meeting must be attended by all pupils. The students all nodded as the professor began to describe the "benefits and drawbacks of the use of social media," which showed their keen interest in the weekly session.

To complete specific tasks, learners often switched between languages (official, national, and sometimes regional), either to clarify concepts or to negotiate meaning in various circumstances and the happening of an event. It was challenging to distinguish between translanguaging and the learners' active communicative performance since translanguaging often spans the whole spectrum of linguistic expressions used by multilinguals and transcends various language borders and systems.

In order to guarantee their involvement in the speaking skill practice, learners were actively participating in the activities that were assigned to them. They used their transliteration skills to give contextualized knowledge of the particular information. It was linked with the societal and cultural background too.

**Extracts from transcript 5**

**Teacher:** *Discuss some pros and cons of the use of social media accounts.*

**Student 1:** *there are a lot of advantages of the social media because of these platforms the world now a days is connected like a bond. We can share our messages, informations and receive it too within no times.*

**Student 2:** *Bilkul sahi kaha apny but don't you think that now a days, social media is just kidnapping us with its strongest ties agr hm bat aj kal hr banda social media py chimta howa hy aur apny ird gird ki khabar e ni hoti.*

**Student 3:** *Sahi ahdan pai (You are very right) lekin hm us ki afadiyat sy bhi tu inkar nhi kr sakty. Each and everything can have advantages and disadvantages of the things. It depends on the person jo uska shi ya ghalat istemal karta hy.*

The extract from the conversation talks about the transformative nature of the translanguaging aspects of the classroom to make sense of linguistic development and meaning-making in communication skills. In this extract, the language learners are using language flexibly to support their discussion on the use of social media by using multiple languages at a time. That may persuade others to take an active part in the discussion because students are more comfortable using their native and regional languages instead of official languages. But the use of multiple languages is not a separate matter; it was used to support the arguments or the discussion taking place.

**4.2.7 Classroom 7**

This classroom was an organized presentation class where students from other classrooms were presenting their assigned topics in front of the class, and the teacher was also observing the classroom along with the researcher. The classroom presentation was being presented on the topic of literary criticism, where students were directed to criticize any piece of literature with the help of literary theories.

Some of the lines from one of the extracts are being transcribed here by the author, who has applied feminist theory to Maya Angelou's poem "Still I Rise," which is about strength and women's empowerment.

*This poem lies on the theme of women empowerment, self-assertion, equal rights and regaining their identity wich clearly states that the poet is not going refused others to define her identity through imposing expectations and the stereotypical rules. She wants to rise metaphorically like dust, air and an unstoppable force instead of being supressed, silenced, and violenced as she fights for the idedntity and equal rights.*

*Kuch lines jesay kay "Does my sassiness upset you?" aur "Does my sexiness upset you?" Muasharti rawaiyon py tanqeed krti hain k how they are controlling women expressions. Tu is nazm mein khawateen apni bodies, voices, sexuality, strength aur aazadi ky liye jidojahid krti nazr ati hain.*

*Overall, "Still I Rise" khawateen k naqabil e taskheer jazbay ko ujagar krti h, and also it rejects oprressive forces, and asks to reclaim the women's dignity.*

This extract is taken from the student's classroom presentation, where the student is using translanguaging skills. He had not used any of the Urdu language in his first paragraph, but later on he switched to it and used it mainly to deliver the intended message. He had prepared his presentation in English as he placed the written draft in front of him, and while addressing the class, he shifted to Urdu and started to use mixed language. The student was looking uncomfortable while speaking English sentences, but when he shifted the language, he regained his confidence and tried to clarify the concepts of the topic.

**4.2.8 Classroom 8**

This classroom was properly organized, and a teacher was using multimedia to show the students how language acquisition takes place. These videos were downloaded from YouTube to present every stage of language acquisition in front of the students so they could have a proper visual understanding too. All of these videos were in the target language, "English," and the speakers in the audios were not using translanguaging techniques. The students were watching videos as active listeners to comprehend the message being delivered to them, but later on, when they were discussing those videos verbally, the teacher and students used multiple languages to create linguistic cooperation.

Some of the extracts from the teacher's discussion clarifying the content in multiple languages were originally shown in English.

**Teacher:** *Jesa k ap ny video mein b dekha kay babies acquire their first language from the environment but the second language is taugh at school. Is lihaz say apny Jo language ghr ya society sy naturally acquire ki hay wo apki first language ya mother tongue kehlati hay aur jo language ap yhn university mein sekhty ho for example English ye apki 2nd language kehlaye gi. Theek hai G???*

**Teacher:** *There are multiple stages where from a child passes to acquire language at the different stages of their early days of life. Jis main cooing,*

*babbling, one word stae, holophrastic aur ttelegraphic stage ati hy. Smajh V andi pai ya Kaina??*

**Teacher:** *umeed ey Jo tuhakon smjh aa gai hosi, kal asan language acquisition theories parhson ty saray gharo hik hik dafa parh ty awahay.*

The given extracts are taken from the classroom where a teacher was clarifying the concepts of the students through the use of English, Urdu, and Saraiki in the class. Some of the videos about babies' language acquisition were being transcribed in the regional languages to make their concept clear. The teacher belonged to the Saraiki area, and most of the students were also from the same region. The use of Saraiki was prevalent instead of any other language. Instruction, questions, and answers were also conducted in Saraiki, but as far as the written pieces of tasks are concerned, they were written in English. Where it is required by the teacher to denote or name some visual, he pointed to or wrote it in Urdu. It clearly shows that students and teachers are both interested in the prevalent use of regional languages in their classrooms.

**Questionnaire**

Read the statements given below and tick ( ) the answers accordingly.

| No | Item description | Strongly Disagree | Disagree | Don't know | Agree | Strongly Agree |
|----|------------------|-------------------|----------|------------|-------|----------------|
| 01 | For students benefits the course should be taught in many languages. | 2% | 19% | 3% | 68% | 8% |
| 02 | When a teacher moves from one language to another, it confuses me. | 12% | 54% | 0% | 18% | 16% |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 03 | Understanding is naturally improved by learning the course in regional languages. | 3% | 10% | 3% | 36% | 48% |
| 04 | My chances of learning and understanding i n Process are increased by learning it in English, Urdu, or in any other regional language. | 0% | 8% | 0% | 42% | 50% |
| 05 | When communicating in Urdu, English, or any other regional language, the instructor is quite clear. | 8% | 11% | 7% | 52% | 22% |
| 06 | When he moves between English and regional languages, the instructor stays Brief and to the point. | 3% | 6% | O% | 31% | 60% |

| | | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| 07 | When the teacher conveys a concept in Urdu or another regional language, it is quite understandable. | 0% | 0% | 0% | 41% | 59% |
| 08 | Even when he shifts from one language to another, the instructor still seems to be relevant. | 4% | 5% | 6% | 39% | 46% |
| 09 | The instructor provides adequate evidence (Facts) when He/She switches from one language to another. | 2% | 2% | 2% | 41% | 53% |
| 10 | When switching from one language to another, the instructor gives students enough | 5% | 6% | 0% | 35% | 54% |

| | information about the course and also maintains the order. | | | | | |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| | | | | | | |

This questionnaire was formulated by the researcher and filled out by 100 students of the English department of Ghazi University, Dera Ghazi Khan. Students were first briefed about the research study and its significance. The topic of the study was presented in front of them so they could get an idea of what the study was about and what they were going to answer in these questionnaire sections. Students' responses to the questionnaire are closely linked to other parts of our research study, such as teacher interviews and classroom observations.

68% of the students were in favour of the translation practices in classrooms, and 8% of the students strongly agreed that the courses must be taught in multiple languages because it will facilitate their understanding. 19% of the students disagreed with the use of multiple languages in the teaching practices of the classroom courses; 2% strongly disagreed with the question; and 3% were of the view that they didn't know about this question, whether the course must be taught in various languages or not. A larger number of students were clearly in favour of translanguaging techniques in academic activities.

54% of students were against the point that when a teacher uses translanguaging or shifts from one language to another while teaching a topic, it does not confuse them. 12% of the students strongly disagreed with the statement, but it caused some confusion for the 18% of students who agreed with the statement. And also, 16% of students strongly agreed that when an instructor switches languages, it causes a disturbance in their understanding of the delivered message.

Although, when it comes to the point of natural understanding of the lectures or texts in academic domains, 36% of the students agreed that the use of regional languages supports the comprehension of the subjects or topics, 48% of the students strongly agreed with the statement and supported the use of regional languages in classrooms to enhance the learning environment of the

classroom. 10% of the students disagreed with the statement, and 3% strongly disagreed. 3% of the students remained neutral by checking the "don't know" option. But most of the students were of the view that the use of regional languages always facilitates their cognitive abilities, as they are fluent in those languages and can better comprehend information. Because in the next question, 50% of the students strongly agreed that chances of learning and understanding processes are increased by learning them in English, Urdu, or any other regional language, 42% of the students agreed with the statement too, but only 8% of the students disagreed because they were mostly in favour of using the target language in academic settings.

52% of the respondents opined that when an instructor switches between languages such as English, Urdu, or any other regional language, he remains clear about the discussed topic, and 22% strongly agreed with the clarity of the subject while using translanguaging skills. 11% of the students disagreed with the point of clarity in the subject, while 8% strongly disagreed that the instructor does not remain quite clear while using multiple languages. 7% of the respondents did not know about the clarity of the subject or the idea; they were reluctant to answer or remained uninterested during the classroom, but many of the numbers of students were quite clear. It was also supported in the very next question, where 60% of the respondents strongly agreed that when a teacher responds by using multiple languages in the classroom activities, he remains on the topic, addresses the issue briefly, and remains to the point. 31% of the students also agreed with the statement. Only 6% of the students disagreed with the statement, while 3% strongly disagreed that the instructor does not remain on the topic; he or she switches between the topics too. Overall, a huge number of students were in favour of the brief and to-the-point discussion. 59% of the students strongly agree that when a teacher conveys concepts in Urdu or any other regional language, it is easy for them to understand the concept or the topic being discussed during the class. 41% of the students agreed with the statement; they agreed that the Urdu language facilitates their learning processes and makes them able to understand their topics easily. None of them was against the statement about the influence of regional languages on the learning process. It shows that the students themselves were really aware of the importance of the translanguaging techniques.

As far as the question of relevancy to the topic is concerned, 46% of the respondents strongly agreed that when an instructor uses multiple languages in the classroom, he remains relevant to the said topic or agenda while translating or shifting from one language to another. 39% of the respondents only agreed with the given statement of relevance to the topic. 5% of the students disagreed, and 4% strongly disagreed with the statement. While 6% of them remained silent on the said problem of relevancy while translanguaging, But on the other hand, a vast majority of the respondents (53% strongly agreed) and 41% agreed that teachers provide adequate evidence and examples when they switch from one language to another. Teachers used to provide examples from the regional and cultural backgrounds of the audience to enhance their learning. 2% of them strongly disagreed, 2% strongly disagreed, and 2% of them were not of any view as they ticked the "don't know" option.

54% of the students strongly agreed that when switching from one language to another, the instructor gives students enough information about the course and also maintains the order. 35% of the respondents agreed with the statement because the teacher uses translation to convey the same information in another language but always tries to stick with the main agenda of the topic. They do not switch the whole topic, but just the language. 6% of the students disagreed with the statement, while 5% of them strongly disagreed. Although a wider audience was in favour of the statement.

All the modes of data collection—teacher interviews, classroom observations, and questionnaires—aligned with each other and supported the translanguaging techniques in the classroom. A large portion of the sample was in favour of the use of multiple languages in the classroom.

When three various research instruments are applied, such as the completion of teacher interviews, classroom observations, and questionnaires from students' sides, conducting triangulation is vital for consolidating these diverse results and validating their reliability. Teacher interviews yielded beneficial information regarding the attitudes educators had toward translanguaging practices, as they were aware of both the benefits and complications associated with using several languages in class. Classroom observations gave a clear view of translanguaging in action and how students' as well as teachers automatically moved around the language during academic

discussions. The questionnaire, taken by a vast body of students, was the quantitative instrument that fixed in time the overall reactions and opinions shared among learners about multilingual practices at school. The meeting of results between data collection through these varying modes raises credibility levels, providing a big picture of how translanguaging acts in an academic's setup and if it has been effective.

# CHAPTER 5

# RECOMMENDATIONS AND CONCLUSION

## Objectives:

- To discuss the outcome of the present study
- To find out the relevance and necessity of translanguaging in today's classroom.
- To provide other recommendation for further research
- To give a brief conclusion

## 5.1 Summary

The main goals of this study were to examine the purposes of translanguaging techniques and evaluate the efficacy of translanguaging as the primary focus in a multilingual classroom.

The data analysis from the interviews showed that learners were more interested in creating and participating in translanguaging activities when they had an urgent need to access other languages. The participants also demonstrated a growing propensity to agree that appropriate translanguaging practice adaptation is essential in the classroom. On the one hand, they argued against the idea that communicative ability would decline, and on the other, they promoted the efficient use of many languages at once. It was shown that the participants favored using L1 as a foreign language learning aid.

The students embraced translanguaging for a variety of reasons, according to the observations made in the classroom. Translanguaging was primarily utilized by learners to express their identities and develop their linguistic repertoire. The present study results also show that translanguaging procedures do not lessen linguistic competency; rather, they serve a variety of purposes in enhancing the effectiveness of the learning process by supporting and enabling the learner. These findings support the claim that translanguaging techniques enable speakers to negotiate meanings when speaking in multiple languages. It was observed that many languages were regularly employed to attain communicative skills both within and outside of the classroom.

## 5.2 Results and findings

The results and findings prove the argument that translanguaging encompasses the same route through which learners develop their other languages. It marked evidence that translanguaging is an effective tool to impart information to speakers of other languages. Hence, the translanguaging practice facilitates the learners in using several languages for maintaining their communicative repertoire, which is developed through language repertoire. The need for translanguaging practices was realized by the learners, and they emphasized the importance of increasing the use of translanguaging in classrooms.

Likewise, it was also pointed out that translanguaging should not be overlooked by simply neglecting its role; rather, it should be seen as a facilitator and an aid in assisting the learners to achieve communicative proficiency. The results clearly showed that the learners felt difficulty in communication when translanguaging was not allowed. It was proved from the responses of the interviewees as well that translanguaging was an unconscious phenomenon and natural, which supported them significantly in communicating in English effectively.

The present study showed that translanguaging was mainly used to clarify an idea, which highlights the transformative nature of translanguaging. This role is important because it facilitates the learners' access to existing linguistic skills on the spot it was acknowledged that participants were engaged in flexible bilingualism when moving between languages became permeable because it never required any effort to shuttle between languages.

Similarly, translanguaging was considered useful when learners possessed a limited vocabulary in the target language, and then gaining access to other integrated systems of languages sustained the learning effectiveness. The participants acknowledged the use of translanguaging in the classroom and recommended it as an effective tool. They emphasized that, when used in a well-planned and consistent way, it plays a crucial role in enhancing the effectiveness of the learning process. It was also contended that the use of two languages was needed simultaneously to negotiate different meanings. The bilingualism of the text was considered crucial for making learning effective.

Moreover, learners were advocating for the use of other regional or national varieties of the languages. This practice increases their linguistic competence and language repertoire, which extends their understanding and displays their overall performance, which they attain through translanguaging. It was also noticed that translanguaging created an urge in the learners to raise different questions to make sure of their academic achievements. In addition to that, the use of different languages demonstrated that learners displayed the usual and normal practices that inspire them and create a thirst in them for the learning process. In order to support this notion, Garcia (2007) used a term when different languages are used altogether separately, as languages are not "hermetically sealed units" (p. 12). It was evident from the results that languages never appeared separate for learners in this social act but rather a source to negotiate meanings and to provide an opportunity for others to participate.

To sum up, translanguaging appeared to be beneficial in accomplishing the task of understanding lessons well. It also served as a potential to make meaning, transmit information, perform different identities, develop linguistic competence, and achieve communicative proficiency. In the present study, we also found many examples of the use of both languages, for drawing knowledge across languages. This practice adds value and serves as a resource, enhancing bilingualism's contribution to identity performance, lesson accomplishment, and participant confidence.

The data and outcomes support the claim that students learned other languages using the same process as they did when translanguaging; they do learn the languages by using several languages to become proficient in the target language. This study adequately demonstrated the efficacy of translanguaging as a tool for teaching language learners, and it also demonstrated its efficacy for language learning classes. Therefore, translanguaging practice aids students in maintaining their communicative repertoire, which is developed via linguistic repertoire, and the use of translanguaging techniques in the classroom increased the students' interest in language learning settings. The study process is accelerated by language learning in regional dialects.

It was also noted that translanguaging should not be simply dismissed; rather, it should be seen as a facilitator that assists children in enhancing their communication skills. It only needs to be taken as a supporting element in the language learning process, comprehension, and production. The findings unmistakably demonstrated that when translanguaging was not permitted, students had communication issues, were not able to understand the concepts being delivered, and missed a lot of information. The respondents' interviews and classroom observations significantly noticed that the unconscious phenomenon of translanguaging technique significantly improved their language learning ability and their performance in classroom practices.

The findings and results support the concept that translanguaging follows the same steps as students' other language acquisition, or the practice of multiple languages at once. It provided clear evidence that translanguaging is an effective method for instructing speakers of different languages. It also highlighted the importance of understanding these multiple languages because combining languages without consideration for their cultural and regional significance will not have a significant effect. Translanguaging practices through the use of many languages aid learners in maintaining their communicative repertoire, which is developed through the linguistic competence of the context. Consequently, the students place a great emphasis on enhancing the use of translanguaging techniques in the classroom to support their comprehension and learning of the classroom activities, which undoubtedly produces favorable consequences.

The use of translanguaging in English language courses allows students to utilize their home language to better grasp English concepts and instructions while decreasing ambiguity and misunderstanding. Translanguaging in English language classes allows students to express themselves more confidently by drawing on their whole linguistic repertoire, resulting in enhanced involvement and interest in class activities. It promotes students' confidence in expressing themselves, as well as their participation and interest in classroom activities.

The study demonstrated that integrating students' home languages with English education respects and supports their cultural origins, producing a more inclusive learning environment. It also aids in understanding complicated English topics by relating them to familiar concepts in their original language,

enabling greater comprehension and retention. This study confirmed that translanguaging encourages students to become flexible in utilizing several languages for communication, which is an important ability in today's multicultural and multilingual cultures. Rather than perceiving languages as distinct things, translanguaging highlights their interconnectivity, which can aid in the transfer of skills and information between languages and boost overall language development. Translanguaging has been shown to improve communication between teachers and students, particularly in instances where students' English competence is limited. It also allows for the use of tailored education. Teachers can tailor education to match students' different linguistic demands, offering individualized support and scaffolding depending on their language ability.

Translanguaging should be seen as a facilitator and aid in helping the kids improve their communication and language learning abilities while studying in class. It also plays a crucial role in daily conversations due to the linguistic diversity of languages. It is common to use both language mixing and shifting in and outside of the classroom. The results definitely showed that wherever translanguaging was strictly prohibited, learners experienced communication problems and somehow tried to use multiple languages through mixing and shifting. The remarks from the respondents further showed that translanguaging was a regular and unconscious occurrence that substantially benefited their capacity for effective English communication.

The outcomes of this study demonstrated that translanguaging was mostly employed in order to emphasize the beneficial nature of a concept and provide clarification. This feature is essential as it allows students to employ their current language skills right away. Participants were acknowledged to be engaging in flexible bilingualism if language switching became effortless, required no extra effort, and proved to be fruitful in the academic domain.

Similar to this, translanguaging was deemed advantageous when students were running out of vocabulary items that needed to be used in their interactions during class. Thoughtful and consistent use of language skills is considered the language tool that facilitates conversations. Thus, it successfully supports the learning process. The study also concluded that multilingualism is essential for

negotiating different interpretations and is crucial for helping users of different languages acquire linguistic proficiency.

Moreover, students promoted the use of other regional or national languages to broaden their linguistic knowledge and comprehension of the language, as well as to improve their linguistic competence and repertoire through translanguaging. This improves their understanding and shows how well they performed overall in language processing, production, and comprehension. In order to assure their academic achievement, it was also seen that translanguaging motivated pupils to ask a range of inquiries that clearly depict that students feel comfortable using multiple languages, so they can shift to another language while feeling difficulty in one.

Additionally, the utilization of a variety of languages showed that pupils were very interested in their education, which inspires the classroom's quiet students. Garcia (2007) used the term "hermetically sealed units" to represent the notion of the use of multiple languages independently (p. 12). The research demonstrated that, for learners participating in this social act, languages never appeared to be different from one another. Instead, they functioned as a means of negotiating meanings and allowing others to participate through cooperative meaning-making processes that support linguistic competence and a mindful communication strategy.

Additionally, it offered the chance to express ideas, convey knowledge, process information through language, adopt several identities, develop language skills, enhance linguistic capabilities, and master communication. Through the analysis of research data from teacher interviews, classroom observations, and questionnaires, the study explored the use of cross-linguistic knowledge. It also delved into the advantages and resources that bilingualism brings to participants, aiding them in communicating confidently, finishing lessons, and performing identification tasks. The current study provided extensive evidence in support of speaking multiple languages.

## 5.3 Recommendations

This study suggests some recommendations for future researchers to add some knowledge by conducting research in the current field of "translanguaging

research." It also contains some recommendations for students and teachers to practice translanguaging techniques in the classroom.

• As speaking multiple languages aids in thinking, production, comprehension, and achievement, translanguaging should be encouraged among students to facilitate the learning processes. Translanguaging serves as both a conceptualization of the new philosophy and a depiction of a shift in how we see bilingualism and bilingual education.

• This study also recommends future researchers investigate the psycho- and sociolinguistic perspectives of translanguaging techniques.

• The population of the study can be changed or increased to obtain a more representative, result-oriented academic study.

**Recommendation for Teachers**

Below are presented recommendations, suggestions, and future directives for practitioners, teachers, and, most importantly, learners. In this section, a few recommendations are forwarded to the teacher as a stakeholder in the understudy.

• The task for multilingual education in the 21st century will not only be to add more languages, but to recognize the multiple language practices that heterogeneous populations increasingly bring, which should have the potential to liberate.

• Teachers must appreciate the interaction of the students in their regional languages, as these are the languages in which they are proficient and can speak well. Imposing the teacher's ideology of using one language will stop them from taking an active part. Just a tiny percentage of the learners can participate in the target language.

• Teachers should not impose or implement learning processes in one language. Translanguaging helps students maintain classroom activities efficiently. The use of multiple languages enhances their capabilities to learn, understand, and perform in a better way.

• Academic discourse continues to be monoglossic, even in multilingual yet those of us who carefully observe language practices within multilingual classrooms make a sense of content. The challenge for educators in the 21st century is to acknowledge that monolingual, and even monoglossic, bilingual practices are not sufficient. In an increasingly heterogeneous world where

learners in the classroom come from diverse linguistic backgrounds, the only way to build equitable educational systems is to develop multiple multilingual programs. These programs should acknowledge translanguaging as a resource for engaging cognitively and socially, while also developing standard ways of communicating in dominant languages.

• Moreover, why should we not develop teaching practices from the strategies learners themselves use and possess? Multilingual students bring from their homes and communities vast knowledge that is valuable for themselves and others. It is important for teachers to learn from them rather than impose their own views on how translanguaging works. Additionally, we cannot generalize for all students and impose a one-size-fits-all pedagogy.

• Educators should develop and co-construct a teaching practice that helps to improve students' pedagogical both bilingual and monolingual teachers can carry out translanguaging strategies as powerful ways for ESL students to use their home language as a resource to maximize their comprehension potential. It is suggested that translanguaging strategies can be carried out by different educators in many different classroom contexts, such as monolingual general education classrooms, bilingual classrooms, English as a second language classrooms, and even foreign language classrooms. Implementing the language policy and proficiently incorporating translanguaging will make content instruction comprehensible.

• Last but not least, it is also important for teachers to provide safe spaces in classrooms and schools for students to practice translanguaging. Learners acknowledged that the freedom provided to them in the class enabled them to "play" with speaking and adopt creative and bold strategies of experimentation.

**Recommendation for Learners**

• Keeping in mind that bilingualism is essentially the norm across the educational context, it is also possible for learners to effectively appropriate unfavorable conventions and policies for translanguaging in the classroom, with suitable negotiation strategies. This is not a haphazard process. Learners have to take the dominant conventions seriously and negotiate critically and creatively to find suitable means of translanguaging.

• Multiple multilingual educations shall be based on the translanguaging

practices of the learners. In doing so, learners will develop the linguistic security and identity investment that they need to learn and be successful.

• Translanguaging shall be promoted for learners as the use of two (or more) languages develops thinking, understanding, and achievement. In this regard, translanguaging is simultaneously symbolic of a change in ideology about bilingualism and bilingual education and, in itself, provides a conceptualization that promotes that new ideology.

• Learners are committed to improving educational practice and seek to harness pedagogy to foster all students' learning and academic achievement.

## 5.4 Discussion

### 1. Role of Translanguaging in Language Education

The literature review emphasized the potential of translanguaging as a pedagogical tool, challenging traditional monolingual approaches. The findings of the study support the idea that allowing students to draw upon their entire linguistic repertoire enhances their learning experience. As observed in bilingual classrooms, the application of translanguaging strategies positively influences students' overall literacy skills.

### 2. Bilingualism and Multilingualism

The study's findings align with the literature's perspective on the prevalence of multilingualism worldwide. The research further contributes by shedding light on the challenges and benefits of multilingualism in the specific context of Pakistani ESL learners. The concept of plurilingualism is reflected in the students' capacity to engage in hybrid language activities, emphasizing the dynamic nature of language use.

### 3. Code Switching and Translanguaging

The literature review discussed the distinctions between code-switching and translanguaging. The study findings support the idea that translanguaging goes beyond mere code-switching; it involves a deliberate integration of linguistic resources to achieve learning goals. This challenges traditional language education practices and encourages a more inclusive and flexible approach.

**4. Application of Translanguaging in Pakistani ESL Context**

The study's application of translanguaging in the Pakistani ESL context resonates with the literature's call for a shift in language teaching methodologies. The findings suggest that a simultaneous and systematic use of learners' native tongue and English can enhance ESL abilities, providing a more holistic language learning experience.

**5. Identifying Teachable Strategies through Translanguaging**

The research supports the literature's proposition regarding the effectiveness of translanguaging in teacher training programs. The findings demonstrate that a translanguaging intervention positively influences students' emotional and social growth, providing evidence for the teachability and practical implementation of translanguaging strategies.

**6. Challenges to Monolingualism**

The study's insights contribute to the discussion on the challenges associated with monolingualism, particularly in the context of ESL learners. By recognizing and embracing students' multilingual repertoires, educators can foster a more inclusive and effective learning environment.

**7. Translanguaging and Its Pedagogical Implications**

By contextualizing the study within a literacy classroom, it further strengthens its correlation with the literature statement on translanguaging and the pureness of this phenomenon. The results also point to the trans-linguaging strategies employed by students in constructing meaning, thereby supporting arguments for using multiple linguistic resources as part of literacy instruction. It relates to the concept of how translanguaging enhances general learning and deepens one's understanding of concepts in literacy.

**9. Translanguaging in Today's Classroom**

The analysis of translanguaging through the biliteracy lens is in accordance with modern trends. The literature review focused on the changing ideals of bilingualism and multilingualism, but this study continues this discussion by introducing translanguaging as a fluid process much more often involved in meaning-making. The results of the study align with the concept that translanguaging, when considered from a biliteracy perspective, helps to develop lingual skills in both languages and ensures biliteracy, as study classrooms today are already diverse.

**10. Teachers' Perception towards Translanguaging**

Thus, on the importance of recognizing teachers' perceptions towards translanguaging as cited in literature, this study addresses it squarely. Through the analysis of teachers' perceptions, this study helps to understand which level is regarded as acceptable and practical with regards to the implementation of translanguaging in class. The results prove to educators how important translanguaging is and thus encourage its deployment in pedagogical applications. And this is in line with the demand for teachers' professional development programs that integrate translanguaging as a valid and efficient instructional method.

## 5.5 Conclusion

The translanguaging talent and code switching and mixing are sufficiently different from one another, according to this study's conclusion. The major purpose of the term "translanguaging" was to engage students in tasks other than switching between different languages and translating. Education in translanguaging must be accessible outside of the classroom, contain context in addition to facts, and involve the brain rather than just focusing on linguistic code. Even translanguaging is used outside of the classroom, and an obvious cultural background has its own impact. Translanguaging is a relatively new concept in education, and it is widely used in classroom discussions to help students understand concepts and to create a better academic environment among them.

Similar to this, in order to comprehend translanguaging among academics and educators, it is required to explain its historical progression, and future advances will keep this development updated, made clearer, expanded upon, and promoted in a way that will be more suitable and fruitful to the classroom practices and the production and comprehension skills of the students to enhance the linguist's capabilities. Another academic term, such as "multidisciplinary" and "interdisciplinary," is being used to capture the essence of the translanguaging. There have been significant discoveries in the fields of cognition and neuroscience as a result of the shift from a language that was used in a certain educational environment to one that is more appropriate for informal conversation. Translanguaging skills are still crucial in English-speaking

countries, where students in classrooms practice their regional languages while interacting with other students or teachers, which demonstrates the ideological perspective on translanguaging. This expression reflects a change in ideology from one that emphasized the negative effects of subtractive bilingualism to one that expresses the positive outcomes of additive bilingualism, where languages act concurrently rather than sequentially in the community, classroom, and brain, with effective integration rather than separation.

Translanguaging was first demonstrated in a classroom context, but it also has a significant contribution in terms of linguistic repertoire outside of the classroom. Translanguaging in the classroom has its own significance. It has to do with a certain pedagogical philosophy and practice that makes use of dual language processing and attempts to purposefully alter the input and output languages while assisting the speaker and receiver in the production and comprehension processes. A course may begin in one language before moving to another, since deeper learning may take place when both languages are allowed. Languages deal with deeper learning, which is related to cognitive and linguistic development as well as subjective knowledge. The pedagogical notion of translanguaging challenges the traditional educational paradigm of language separation in bilingual education. Because it focuses on multilingual learning processes rather than just bilingual outputs, translanguaging is a successful technique for bilingual education. These multilingual practices in the classroom are accepted worldwide because of their positive results in terms of students' confidence, participation, and effective learning.

This suggests that translanguaging has given the kids the chance to engage with classmates from various cultural and linguistic origins, to create their own language concepts, and to participate in multilingual activities. Although their retrospective reflections show that the language ideologies they grasped when they first enrolled in the university were comparable to those of the first-year students in this investigation, the four study participants appear to have transitioned from separate multilingualism to flexible multilingualism.

Due to the fact that translanguaging is still a relatively unexplored field in academic settings, interdisciplinary and multidisciplinary research should be done to handle the mental processes of language, such as thinking, speaking, reading, and understanding the conveyed message. As a response to fractional

bilingualism, two solitudes, and the ideology of language separation, the history of translanguaging in the beginning stages of advancement, dual language schooling, and diglossic language planning serves as a reminder that translanguaging is also a valued perspective of bilinguals with implications for policy, planning, and politics at home and school, regionally, and internationally. This remains true even if the study is multi-method, multi-lingual, qualitative, and quantitative.

The desire for standardized language practices in the current study shows the critical need for translanguaging approaches. These approaches aim to fit students with various cultural and linguistic backgrounds in a classroom where many languages are spoken and English is primarily taught as a second or foreign language. Students employ a range of languages when translanguaging, which significantly improves their communication abilities and speeds up their acquisition of the target language.

# REFERENCES

Adeoye-Olatunde, O. A., & Olenik, N. L. (2021). Research and scholarly methods: Semi-structured interviews. *Journal of the american college of clinical pharmacy*, *4*(10), 1358-1367. *https://doi.org/10.1002/jac5.1441*

Adler, P. A., & Adler, P. (1994). *Constructions of deviance: Social power, context, and interaction*.

Auer, P., & Wei, L. (2008). Introduction: Multilingualism as a problem? Monolingualism as a problem?. *Handbook of multilingualism and multilingual communication*, 1-12.

Baker, C. (2011). *Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism*. Multilingual matters.

Beare, K. (2020). How many people learn English. *ThoughtCo, Feb*, *11*.

Beiler, I. R. (2020). Negotiating multilingual resources in English writing instruction for recent immigrants to Norway. *TESOL quarterly*, *54*(1), 5-29.

Bhatia, T. K., & Ritchie, W. C. (2004). Bilingualism in South Asia. *The handbook of bilingualism*, 780-807.

Blommaert, J. (2008). *Grassroots literacy: Writing, identity and voice in Central Africa*. Routledge.

Bogdan, R., & Biklen, S. K. (1997). *Qualitative research for education*. Boston, MA: Allyn & Bacon.

Borg, W. R., & Gall, M. D. (1984). Educational research: An introduction. *British Journal of Educational Studies*, *32*(3).

Bransford, J. D., Brown, A. L., & Cocking, R. R. (2000). *How people learn* (Vol. 11). Washington, DC: National academy press.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, *3*(2), 77-101.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, *3*(2), 77-101.

Burner, T., Carlsen, C., & Kverndokken, K. (2019). Communicative competence in the English classroom. *T. Burner, C. Carlsen, & K. Kverndokken (Eds.), 101*, 15-35.

Canagarajah, A. S. (2006). Toward a writing pedagogy of shuttling between languages: Learning from multilingual writers. *College English*, *68*(6), 589-604.

Canagarajah, A. S. (Ed.). (2013). *Literacy as translingual practice: Between communities and classrooms*. Routledge.

Canagarajah, S. (2007). Language policies and TESOL: Perspectives from practice. *TESOL QUARTERLY*, *41*(3), 443-444.

Canagarajah, S. (2011). Codemeshing in academic writing: Identifying teachable strategies of translanguaging. *The modern language journal*, *95*(3), 401-417.

Celic, C. M., & Seltzer, K. (2013). *Translanguaging [: A CUNY-NYSIEB Guide for Educators*. New York: Cuny-Nysieb.

Cenoz, J. (2017). Translanguaging in school contexts: International perspectives. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, *16*(4), 193-198.

Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2011). A holistic approach to multilingual education: Introduction. *The Modern Language Journal*, *95*(3), 339-343.

Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2011). Focus on multilingualism: A study of trilingual writing. *The Modern Language Journal*, *95*(3), 356-369.

Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2017). Minority languages and sustainable translanguaging: Threat or opportunity?. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural development*, *38*(10), 901-912.

Cenoz, J., & Gorter, D. (2020). Pedagogical translanguaging: An introduction. *System*, *92*, 102269.

Channa, L. A., Manan, S. A., & David, M. K. (2021). Global aspirations versus local resources: planning a sustainable English teaching policy in Pakistan. *Asian Englishes*, *23*(3), 294-312.

Conteh, J. (2018). Translanguaging as pedagogy–a critical review. *The Routledge handbook of language and superdiversity*, 473-487.

Cook, V. (2001). Using the first language in the classroom. *Canadian modern language review*, *57*(3), 402-423.

COWGER, C. D., & MENON, G. (2001). CHAPTER TWENTY-EIGHT. *The Handbook of Social Work Research Methods*, 473.

Creese, A., & Blackledge, A. (2010). Translanguaging in the bilingual classroom: A pedagogy for learning and teaching?. *The modern language journal*, *94*(1), 103-115.

Cummins, J. (2001). Bilingual children's mother tongue: Why is it important for education.

Cummins, J. (2001). Negotiating identities: Education for empowerment in a diverse society. *(No Title)*.

Cummins, J. (2005). A proposal for action: Strategies for recognizing heritage language competence as a learning resource within the mainstream classroom. *Modern Language Journal*, 585-592.

Cummins, J., & Corson, D. (1997). Bilingual Education in Friesland. *Bilingual Education*, *5*.

Cunningham, T. H., & Graham, C. (2000). Increasing native English vocabulary recognition through Spanish immersion: Cognate transfer from foreign to first language. *Journal of Educational Psychology*, *92*(1), 37.

De Houwer, A., & Wilton, A. (Eds.). (2011). *English in Europe today: Sociocultural and educational perspectives* (Vol. 8). John Benjamins Publishing.

Devers, K. J., & Frankel, R. M. (2000). Study design in qualitative research—2: Sampling and data collection strategies. *Education for health*, *13*(2), 263-271.

Dewaele, J. M., & Stavans, A. (2014). The effect of immigration, acculturation and multicompetence on personality profiles of Israeli multilinguals. *International Journal of Bilingualism*, *18*(3), 203-221.

Dolsa, G. M. (2020). *Discourses of Coloniality in the Understanding and Practices of Translanguaging Pedagogy* (Doctoral dissertation, The University of Texas at El Paso).

Duke, N. K., & Pearson, P. D. (2009). Effective practices for developing reading comprehension. *Journal of education*, *189*(1-2), 107-122.

Eisner, E. (1992). Objectivity in educational research. *Curriculum inquiry*, *22*(1), 9-15.

Esser, H. (2006). *Migration, language and integration*. Berlin: WZB.

Flick, U., Von Kardorff, E., & Steinke, I. (2004). What is qualitative research? An introduction to the field. *A companion to qualitative research*, *1*, 3-11.

Frankel, R. M., & Devers, K. J. (2000). Study design in qualitative research—1: Developing questions and assessing resource needs. *Education for health*, *13*(2), 251-261.

Gall, M. D., Borg, W. R., & Gall, J. P. (1996). *Educational research: An introduction*. Longman Publishing.

Galloway, A. (2005). Non-probability sampling.

García, O. (2009). *Bilingual education in the 21st century: A global perspective*. John Wiley & Sons.

García, O., & Kleifgen, J. A. (2010). *Educating emergent bilinguals: Policies, programs, and practices for English language learners*. Teachers College Press.

García, O., & Kleyn, T. (2016). Translanguaging theory in education. In *Translanguaging with multilingual students* (pp. 9-33). Routledge.

García, O., & Lin, A. M. (2016). Translanguaging in bilingual education. *Bilingual and multilingual education*, 117-130.

García, O., & Lin, A. M. Y. (2014). Translanguaging in Bilingual Education. In *Bilingual and Multilingual Education* (pp. 187). doi:10.1007/978-3-319-02258-1_9

García, O., Flores, N., Seltzer, K., Wei, L., Otheguy, R., & Rosa, J. (2021). Rejecting abyssal thinking in the language and education of racialized bilinguals: A manifesto. *Critical inquiry in language studies*, *18*(3), 203-228.

García, O., Johnson, S. I., Seltzer, K., & Valdés, G. (2017). *The translanguaging classroom: Leveraging student bilingualism for learning* (pp. v-xix). Philadelphia, PA: Caslon.

García, O., Lin, M. Y., & May, S. (2017). Bilingual and multilingual. *Springer International Publishing*, *10*, 978-3.

García, O., Wei, L., García, O., & Wei, L. (2014). *Language, bilingualism and education* (pp. 46-62). Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Gay-Balmaz, F., & Ratiu, T. S. (2008). Reduced Lagrangian and Hamiltonian formulations of Euler-Yang-Mills fluids. *Journal of Symplectic Geometry*, *6*(2), 189-237.

Giddens, A. (1990). The Consequences of Modernity (Cambridge, UK, Polity). *GiddensThe Consequences of Modernity1990*.

Grimes, B. F. (2000). *Ethnologue: maps and indexes* (Vol. 2). Dallas, Tex.: SIL International.

Grinnell, R. M., Williams, M., & Unrau, Y. A. (2008). *Research methods for social workers: A generalist approach for BSW students*. Eddie Bowers Publishing Company.

Hall, G., & Cook, G. (2012). Own-language use in language teaching and learning. *Language teaching*, *45*(3), 271-308.

Haque, A. R. (1982). The position and status of English in Pakistan. *World Englishes*, *2*(1), 6-9.

Heap, J. L. (1982). Understanding classroom events: A critique of Durkin, with an alternative. *Journal of Reading Behavior*, *14*(4), 391-411.

Heller, M. (2007). Bilingualism as ideology and practice. In *Bilingualism: A social approach* (pp. 1-22). London: Palgrave Macmillan UK.

Hélot, C., & De Mejía, A. M. (Eds.). (2008). *Forging multilingual spaces: Integrated perspectives on majority and minority bilingual education* (Vol. 68). Multilingual Matters.

Henshaw, F. (2022). Some Observations on Class Observations: Why, What, and How Are We Observing?. *Hispania*, *105*(3), 339-342.

Higby, E., Kim, J., & Obler, L. K. (2013). Multilingualism and the brain. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, *33*, 68-101.

Hornberger, N. H. (1990). Bilingual education and English-only: A language-planning framework. *The Annals of the American Academy of Political and Social Science*, *508*(1), 12-26.

Hornberger, N. H. (Ed.). (2003). *Continua of biliteracy: An ecological framework for educational policy, research, and practice in multilingual settings* (Vol. 41). Multilingual Matters.

Hornberger, N. H., & Link, H. (2012). Translanguaging and transnational literacies in multilingual classrooms: A biliteracy lens. *International journal of bilingual education and bilingualism*, *15*(3), 261-278.

Hornberger, N. H., & Skilton-Sylvester, E. (2000). Revisiting the continua of biliteracy: International and critical perspectives. *Language and education*, *14*(2), 96-122.

Hungwe, V. (2019). Using a translanguaging approach in teaching paraphrasing to enhance reading comprehension in first-year students. *Reading & Writing-Journal of the Reading Association of South Africa*, *10*(1), 1-9.

Hussain, S., & Khan, H. K. (2021). Translanguaging in Pakistani higher education: a neglected perspective!. *Journal of Educational Research and Social Sciences Review (JERSSR)*, *1*(3), 16-24

Jiménez, R. T., David, S., Fagan, K., Risko, V. J., Pacheco, M., Pray, L., & Gonzales, M. (2015). Using translation to drive conceptual development for students becoming literate in English as an additional language. *Research in the Teaching of English*, *49*(3), 248-271.

Kabuto, B. (2017). A socio-psycholinguistic perspective on biliteracy: The use of miscue analysis as a culturally relevant assessment tool. *Reading Horizons: A Journal of Literacy and Language Arts*, *56*(1), 2.

Kramsch, C., & Hua, Z. (2016). Language and culture in ELT. In *The Routledge handbook of English language teaching* (pp. 38-50). Routledge.

Lam, W. S. E. (2004). Second language socialization in a bilingual chat room: Global and local considerations.

Lavrakas, P. J. (2008). *Encyclopedia of survey research methods*. Sage publications.

Leung, C., & Valdés, G. (2019). Translanguaging and the transdisciplinary framework for language teaching and learning in a multilingual world. *The Modern Language Journal*, *103*(2), 348-370.

Lewis, G., Jones, B., & Baker, C. (2012). Translanguaging: Developing its conceptualisation and contextualisation. *Educational research and evaluation*, *18*(7), 655-670.

Lubliner, S., & Grisham, D. L. (2017). *Translanguaging: The key to comprehension for Spanish-speaking students and their peers*. Rowman & Littlefield.

Lucas, T., & Katz, A. (1994). Reframing the debate: The roles of native languages in English-only programs for language minority students. *Tesol Quarterly*, *28*(3), 537-561.

Magilvy, J. K., & Thomas, E. (2009). A first qualitative project: Qualitative descriptive design for novice researchers. *Journal for Specialists in Pediatric nursing*, *14*(4), 298-300.

Makalela, L. (2014). 6 Teaching indigenous african languages to speakers of other African languages: The effects of translanguaging for multilingual development. *Multilingual universities in South Africa: Reflecting society in higher education*, *97*, 88-104.

Makoni, S., & Pennycook, A. (2005). *Disinviting and (re) constituting languages. Critical Inquiry in Language Studies: An International Journal, 2(3),* 137-156.

Makoni, S., & Pennycook, A. (Eds.). (2007). *Disinviting and reconstituting languages (Vol. 62). Multilingual Matters.*

Manan, S. A., David, M. K., & Channa, L. A. (2019). Opening Ideological and implementational spaces for multilingual/plurilingual policies and practices in education: a snapshot of scholarly activism in Pakistan. *Current Issues in Language Planning*, *20*(5), 521-543.

Mann, P. S. (1995). *Statistics for business and economics. (No Title)*

May, S. (Ed.). (2013). *The multilingual turn: Implications for SLA, TESOL, and bilingual education*. Routledge.

Mazak, C. M., Mendoza, F., & Mangonéz, L. P. (2017). Professors translanguaging in practice: Three cases from a bilingual university. *Translanguaging in higher education: Beyond monolingual ideologies*, 70-90.

McKechnie, L. E. (2008). Observational research. *The Sage encyclopedia of qualitative research methods*, *1*, 573-575.

McLeod, S. (2018). Questionnaire: Definition, examples, design and types. *Simply psychology*, *78*, 350-365.

Menken, K., & Solorza, C. (2015). Principals as linchpins in bilingual education: The need for prepared school leaders. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, *18*(6), 676-697.

Michael-Luna, S., & Canagarajah, A. S. (2007). Multilingual academic literacies: pedagogical foundations for code meshing in primary and higher education. *Journal of Applied Linguistics*, *4*(1).

Morton, J. B., & Harper, S. N. (2007). What did Simon say? Revisiting the bilingual advantage. *Developmental science*, *10*(6), 719-726.

Motha, S. (2014). *Race, empire, and English language teaching: Creating responsible and ethical anti-racist practice*. Teachers College Press.

Muysken, P. (2000). The study of code-mixing. *Bilingual Speech: A Typology of Code-Mixing*, *110*.

Otheguy, R., García, O., & Reid, W. (2015). Clarifying translanguaging and deconstructing named languages: A perspective from linguistics. *Applied linguistics review*, *6*(3), 281-307.

Padgett, D. K. (1998). Does the glove really fit? Qualitative research and clinical social work practice. *Social Work*, *43*(4), 373-381.

Palmer, D. K., & Martínez, R. A. (2016). Developing biliteracy: What do teachers really need to know about language?. *Language Arts*, *93*(5), 379.

Pennycook, A. (2010). *Language as a local practice*. Routledge.

Pennycook, A., & Makoni, S. (2005). The modern mission: The language effects of Christianity. *Journal of Language, Identity & Education*, *4*(2), 137-155.

Piccardo, E. (2018). Plurilingualism: Vision, conceptualization, and practices. *Handbook of research and practice in heritage language education*, *207*, 225.

Porter, R. (1990). *Forked tongue: The politics of bilingual education*. Routledge.

Prada, J., & Turnbull, B. (2018). The role of translanguaging in the multilingual turn: Driving philosophical and conceptual renewal in language education.

Qadir, S. A. (1996). *Introducing Study Skills at the intermediate level in Pakistan* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Lancaster).

Rahman, T. (2002). Language, ideology and power: Language-learning among the Muslims of Pakistan and North India. *(No Title)*.

Rahman, T. (2006). Language policy, multilingualism and language vitality in Pakistan. *Trends in linguistics studies and monographs*, *175*, 73.

Rebelo, H., Christodoulou, P., Payan-Carreira, R., Dumitru, D., Mäkiö, E., Mäkiö, J., & Pnevmatikos, D. (2023). University–Business

Collaboration for the Design, Development, and Delivery of Critical Thinking Blended Apprenticeships Curricula: Lessons Learned from a Three-Year Project. *Education Sciences*, *13*(10), 1041.

Reyes, I. (2004). Functions of code switching in schoolchildren's conversations. *Bilingual research journal*, *28*(1), 77-98.

Rizvi, F. (2007). Postcolonialism and globalization in education. *Cultural Studies? Critical Methodologies*, *7*(3), 256-263.

Rizvi, K. (2007). *Pakistani Zubanain*: (n.p.).

Rodríguez, A. D., & Musanti, S. I. (2014). Preparing Latina/o bilingual teachers to teach content in Spanish to emergent bilingual students on the US–Mexico border. In *Research on preparing preservice teachers to work effectively with emergent bilinguals* (pp. 201-232). Emerald Group Publishing Limited.

Sanchez, S. V., Rodriguez, B. J., Soto-Huerta, M. E., Villarreal, F. C., Guerra, N. S., & Flores, B. B. (2013). A case for multidimensional bilingual assessment. *Language Assessment Quarterly*, *10*(2), 160-177.

Sayer, P. (2013). Translanguaging, TexMex, and bilingual pedagogy: Emergent bilinguals learning through the vernacular. *TESOL quarterly*, *47*(1), 63-88.

Seals, C. A. (2021). Classroom translanguaging through the linguistic landscape. In *Language teaching in the linguistic landscape: Mobilizing pedagogy in public space* (pp. 119-141). Cham: Springer International Publishing.

Seliger, H. W., & Shohamy, E. (1995). Data and data collection procedures. *Second Language Research Methods. New York: Oxford University Press*.

Serai, S. (2022). *Translanguaging in Algerian university EFL classrooms: practices and attitudes* (Doctoral dissertation, University of Portsmouth).

Shkedi, A. (2005). *Multiple case narrative: A qualitative approach to studying multiple populations (Vol. 7).* John Benjamins Publishing.

Shohamy, E. (2011). Assessing multilingual competencies: Adopting construct valid assessment policies. *The Modern Language Journal*, *95*(3), 418-429.

Swales, J. M. (2014). 1990. Genre analysis: English in academic and research settings. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, selected 45–47, 52–60. In *The Discourse Studies Reader* (pp. 306-316). John Benjamins.

Talat, M. (2002). *The forms and function of English in Pakistan*. Doctoral thesis submitted in the Department of English Bahauddin Zikariya University Multan.

Tashakkori, A., & Creswell, J. W. (2007). The new era of mixed methods. *Journal of mixed methods research*, *1*(1), 3-7.

Ticheloven, A., Blom, E., Leseman, P., & McMonagle, S. (2021). Translanguaging challenges in multilingual classrooms: scholar, teacher and student perspectives. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, *18*(3), 491-514.

Tollefson, J. W. (2006). Critical theory in language policy. *An introduction to language policy: Theory and method*, *1*, 42-59.

Vaismoradi, M., Turunen, H., & Bondas, T. (2013). Content analysis and thematic analysis: Implications for conducting a qualitative descriptive study. *Nursing & health sciences*, *15*(3), 398-405.

Van Lier, L. (1988). The classroom and the language learner: Ethnography and second-language classroom research. *(No Title)*.

Vogel, S., Ascenzi-Moreno, L., & García, O. (2018). An expanded view of translanguaging: Leveraging the dynamic interactions between a young multilingual writer and machine translation software. In *Plurilingualism in teaching and learning* (pp. 89-106). Routledge.

Wardhaugh, Tonald (1998) *An Introduction to Sociolinguistics. 3rd ed. Massachutes*:  Blackwell Publishers.

Wei, L. (2011). Moment analysis and translanguaging space: Discursive construction of identities by multilingual Chinese youth in Britain. *Journal of pragmatics*, *43*(5), 1222-1235.

Wei, L., Dewaele, J. M., & Housen, A. (2002). Introduction: Opportunities and challenges of bilingualism.

Williams, C. (2002). *Extending bilingualism in the education system. Education and lifelong learning committee* ELL-06-02. Retrieved from http://www.assemblywales.org/3c91c7af00023d820000595000000000.pdf

Wragg, E. C. (1999). An introduction to Classroom Observation (London and New York: Routledge Falmer, Taylor & Francis Group).

Wu, C. S., Hoi, S., Socher, R., & Xiong, C. (2020). TOD-BERT: Pre-trained natural language understanding for task-oriented dialogue. *arXiv preprint arXiv:2004.06871*.

Yegidis, B. L., & Weinbach, R. W. (2002). Research methods for social workers. *(No Title)*.

Yuvayapan, F. (2019). Translanguaging in EFL classrooms: Teachers' perceptions and practices. *Journal of Language and Linguistic Studies*, *15*(2), 678-694.

Zapata, A., & Laman, T. T. (2016). " I write to show how beautiful my languages are": Translingual Writing Instruction in English-Dominant Classrooms. *Language Arts*, *93*(5), 366-378.

Zentella, A. C. (1997). *Growing up bilingual: Puerto rican children in New York*. Blackwell.