# TRANSLINGUAL SPACE: AN EXPLORATORY STUDY OF DIGITALLY MEDIATED COMMUNICATION IN PAKISTAN

BY

FATIMA EKRAM



# NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES

## **ISLAMABAD**

February, 2022

# Translingual Space: An Exploratory Study of Digitally Mediated Communication in Pakistan

By

### FATIMA EKRAM

M.A., National University of Modern Languages, 2018

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF

## MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

In **English** 

То

FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES



NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES, ISLAMABAD

© Fatima Ekram, 2022



NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES

FACULTY OF ARTS & HUMANITIES

# THESIS AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defense, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Arts & Humanities.

Submitted By: <u>Fatima Ekram</u>

Registration #: <u>1761 MPhil/Eng Ling/S19</u>

Master of Philosophy Degree name in full

English Linguistics Name of Discipline

Dr. Aziz Ullah Khan Name of Research Supervisor

Dr. Muhammad Uzair Name of Dean (FAH)

<u>Prof. Dr. Aamir Ijaz</u> Name of Pro Rector Academics Signature of Research Supervisor

Signature of Dean (FAH)

Signature of Pro Rector Academics

Date

# **AUTHOR'S DECLARATION**

#### I Fatima Ekram

Daughter of <u>Muhammad Ekram</u>

Registration # 1761 MPhil/Eng Ling/S19

Discipline English Linguistics

Candidate of **Master of Philosophy** at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby declare that the thesis **Translingual Space: An Exploratory Study of Digitally Mediated Communication in Pakistan** submitted by me in partial fulfillment of MPhil degree, is my original work, and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare that it shall not, in future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any other university or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even after the award of a degree, the work may be cancelled and the degree revoked.

Signature of Candidate

Name of Candidate

Date

### ABSTRACT

### Title: Translingual Space: An Exploratory Study of Digitally Mediated Communication in Pakistan

The multilingual world of today is increasingly becoming translingual, which is more evident in digitally-mediated communication. However, in contexts such as Pakistan, monolingual norms are still preferred, proposed, and performed, particularly in the contexts of language teaching and learning. The reality of the world outside the classroom, however, is that languages are being regularly meshed and mixed for online and offline communication. This study, therefore, aimed to explore the translingual strategies that Pakistani digital users employ in digital communication and the salient characteristics of such translanguaging. Using Li Wi's (208) theoretical and analytical lens, this study qualitatively explored Pakistani users' translingual practices on four different digital mediums i.e., Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube. The analysis of the data shows that Pakistani users go both between and beyond languages to communicate online. That is, they not only use different languages but also creatively employ emojis and images to articulate their views and opinions. English and Urdu were found to be the dominant languages meshed and mixed, with a tinge of Arabic, which is indicative of the sociohistorical association of Pakistani users. The findings clearly show that online communication carries translingual characteristics, which has implications for making English language learners translingual competent to be able to communicate in today's world.

# **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

Cha	apter	Page	
ΤН	ESIS A	AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM	ii
AU	THOR	'S DECLARATION	iii
AB	STRA	C <b>T</b>	iv
TA	BLE C	F CONTENTS	v
LIS	ST OF	TABLES	vii
AC	KNOV	VLEDGEMENTS	xi
DE	DICA	ΓΙΟΝ	xii
1.	INTR	ODUCTION	1
	1.1	Background of the study	1
	1.2	Statement of the problem	
	1.3	Objectives of the study	3
	1.4	Research Questions	4
	1.5	Rationale of the Study	4
	1.6	Delimitation of the Study	4
	1.7	Significance of the Study	5
	1.8	Organization of Study	5
2.	LITH	ERATURE REVIEW	6
	2.1	The Digitalized World of Today	6
	2.2	The Concept of Translanguaging	9
	2.3	Research on Translanguaging in general	11
	2.4	Research on Translanguaging in Digital Media	17
	2.5	Research on Translanguaging in Pakistan	22
3.	RESE	EARCH METHODOLOGY	23
	3.1	Research Design	23
	3.2	Theoretical Framework	23
	3.3	Data Collection	24
	3.3.1	Facebook	25

3.3.2	Instagram	
3.3.3	Twitter	27
3.3.4	YouTube	27
3.4	Procedure	

4.	DAT	A ANALYSIS	29
	4.1	Translanguaging for Facilitating Interaction	29
	4.1.1	Celebrity and fans interaction	30
	4.1.2	Promotional interaction	47
	4.1.3	Interest based interaction	62
	4.2	Translanguaging for Creating Social Bonding	73
	4.2.1	Creating Patriotic relationship	73
	4.2.2	Creating Muslim community bonding	84
	4.2.3	Creating Religious Affiliations	91
	4.3	Translanguaging for Negotiating Meaning	. 102
	4.3.1	Negotiating Women's issues	. 102
	4.3.2	Negotiating Religious Beliefs	. 108
	4.3.3	Negotiating Political opinions	.111
5.	CON	CLUSION	122

•	CON	CLUSION	122
	5.1	Findings	. 122
	5.2	Recommendations for Research	. 124
	5.3	Limitations	. 125
	5.4	Conclusion	125

REFERENCES	127
APPENDICES	137

# LIST OF TABLES

Table 3.1: Facebook data
Table 3.2: Instagram Data
Table 3.2: Twitter Data27
Table 3.3: YouTube Data
Table 4.1: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Qawwali
invitation
Table 4.2: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Song Release
Update
Table 4.3: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Singer Page followers
Table 4.4: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistani cricketer
post
Table 4.5: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Friday greetings
post
Table 4.6: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a Casual dancing
video40
Table 4.7: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a celebrity shared    picture
Table 4.8: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a 1M followers
post45
Table 4.9: A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on friends' trip
post
Table 4.10: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Jazz network
offer
Table 4.11: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Song
Table 4.12: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a movie
teaser

Table 4.13: A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a Song Table 4.14: A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a brand promotion Table 4.15: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a silver jewelry Table 4.16: A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a movie Table 4.17: A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on a Kisan card Table 4.18: A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on New Pakistan Table 4.19: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistan cricket Table 4.20: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Cricketer Century post......70 Table 4.21: A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on Crypto Currency trend......73 Table 4.22: A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on an Exam cancellation Trend......74 Table 4.23: A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a Pakistani rap music Table 4.24: A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a Pakistani Table 4.25: A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a Drama Chupke Table 4.26: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistani Army man Table 4.27: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on diplomatic relations 

Table 4.28: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on Pakistan Day Table 4.29: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistan day Table 4.30: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a national song Table 4.31: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Pakistan day Table 4.32: A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a drama Table 4.33: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on Pakistan friendship Table 4.34: A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a Muslim unity Table 4.35: A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on a Muslim Ummah Table 4.36: A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on the Liberation of Al-Aqsa Table 4.37: A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on the Shooting in Al-Aqsa Table 4.38: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Naat video post... Table 4.39: A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a Motto of life Table 4.40: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on an Islamic day Table 4.41: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a praying picture Table 4.42: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a Black dot Table 4.43: A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on Islamic lecture

Table 4.44: A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on a Ramadan
transmission113
Table 4.45: A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on an interview. 114
Table 4.46: A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a woman's respect
post
Table 4.47 A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on a Stand with the PM
trend
Table 4.48: A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on an Aurat March
trend
Table 4.49: A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on a Music video
Table 4.50: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Night of blessings
post
Table 4.51: A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a night of light
Table 4.52: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Reporting style
post127
Table 4.53: A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a government
project
Table 4.54: A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on a stealing vaccine
trend
Table 4.55: A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on a Debate on Ban on
TLP
Table 4.56: A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a speech136
Table 5.1: Translingual strategies used by Pakistani users on social media 138

### ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

All praise and glory to Allah Almighty!

First of all, I would like to thank Allah (SWT) for His countless blessings and mercy upon me throughout my life and in the journey of my work. He gave me enough courage and patience to carry out this thesis, without Him I would not have been able to complete this difficult task.

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Aziz Ullah Khan, for his immense support, guidance and valuable suggestions despite having to read screeds of incoherent sentences. I am grateful for his time and patience and feel indebted for being given an opportunity to learn from a true scholar who saw potential in me and bring out the best. It has been a real honor to be your student.

I would like to take this opportunity to express my sincerest thanks and love to my parents for being unconditionally supportive, loving and caring; to my sister and nieces for trusting my abilities in all my years of academic study; and to my friends for their concern and love showered upon me.

I owe thanks to the Dean of English Studies, Head of the department as well as teachers of the university, for their cooperation in the entire journey. Thanks for offering me the academic and creative space, to bring this thesis to life.

Thank you all

# **DEDICATION**

This thesis is dedicated to my mother and father who supported me, and also my sister helped me turn my dreams into reality and made me what I am today.

#### **CHAPTER 1**

#### INTRODUCTION

We are living in an increasingly multilingual world where children are brought up in an environment where they observe their family and peers employing different languages as well as varieties of languages in different ways, through different mediums, and for different purposes. In other words, generations living in today's world are employing diverse ways of 'languaging regularly (Blommaert, 2013). They are required to consistently (re)formulate and (re)adjust their linguistic codes both within one interaction as well as across different interactions, i.e., at both intra- and inter-discourse levels. In other words, multilinguals' around the world are constantly engaging in 'translanguaging' in communication, a term presented by (Garcia, 2009) as an alternative to the hitherto used term 'codeswitching', which connotes language learning deficiency. This phenomenon of translanguaging seems to be more evident in Digitally Mediated Communication (DMC), especially on digital social media platforms. Multi-linguistic codes are regularly used in DMC for translingual communication in and across diverse communities of practice throughout the world. The case of DMC users in Pakistan (being multilingual and multicultural) is no different. This study, therefore, attempts to explore the extent to which translingual strategies are employed by Pakistani digital communicators across different online platforms, the nature of these translanguaging strategies, and the implications this may have for language teaching and learning.

#### **1.1 Background to the Study**

The rise of multilingualism has drawn the attention of different language researchers to various phenomena related to multilinguals. Multilingualism used to be considered a problem in the traditional monolingual world (Johnson, 2010). Bilingual language practices, such as codeswitching, used to be conceived (and are still conceived in some communities) as negative, especially in the context of language teaching and learning (Garcia, 2016). This notion was mainly influenced by the belief that switching to another language in a conversation is the result of incompetency in the language in which the

utterance was initiated (Reyes, 2004). The postmodern turn in applied linguistics has, however, given a new orientation to this notion in the form of translanguaging.

Translanguaging refers to multilingual speakers' shuttling between languages in a real-time communicative environment (García & Lin, 2017). Multilingual speakers around the world switch from one language/linguistic code to another to assist one another in making meaning, shaping experiences, and gaining deeper understandings and knowledge of the languages in use (Cenoz & Gorter, 2011; Lewis, Jones, & Baker, 2012; Williams, 2002). In other words, translanguaging is an act performed by multilinguals by using various modes of their acquired/learned multilinguistic repertoire in an integrated communication system (Garcia, 2009). It is a systematic, strategic, and sense-making process that is significantly evident in communication in almost all multilingual contexts (Garcia, 2009), especially in multilingual and intercultural interactions on digital media.

Over the past few decades, the internet has become a dynamic platform for global communication. While English held sway over the medium of internet communication for several years (Crystal, 2007), and continues to do so, the latest statistics show that the internet is fast becoming multilingual and multimodal. For instance, a recent study suggests that nearly 77.5% of internet users carry out their communication in languages other than English (Argaez, 2020). This is more so in the case of social media websites where speakers from diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds socially interact with each other. Some studies carried out almost a decade ago found that online texts and other internet activities are becoming more linguistically diverse (Danet & Herring, 2007; Pimienta, Prado, & Blanco, 2009). Internet users are mostly from diverse linguistic and cultural backgrounds; they negotiate meaning by using multiple linguistic resources regularly (Barton & Lee, 2013).Such striking linguistic changes in DMC have contributed to problematizing the traditional perception of English domination on the internet on the one hand and generated considerable interest from researchers in digital translanguaging on the other. Present-day scholars, taking a plurilingual perspective (Blommaert, 2013; Canagarajah, 2013; Garcia, 2018), now recommend analyzing the translingual strategies that multilinguals employ to trans-communicate via DMC. This study, therefore, aims to explore the dynamics of translingual practices that Pakistani digital media users employ for digital communication.

#### **1.2. Statement of the Problem**

In the globalized and multilingual world of today, people are increasingly employing diverse semiotic means including different (varieties of) languages for communication across diverse cultures and communities. In other words, people are translanguaging regularly. Recent scholarship, therefore, takes a 'translingual' stance on the multilingual linguistic competence of a communicator (Canagarajah, 2013; Garcia, 2009; Canagarajah & Ashraf, 2013). In contexts such as Pakistan, monolingual norms are still preferred, proposed, and performed, particularly in the contexts of language teaching and learning. This fact is more evident in the case of digital communication, where multimodal and multilingual communication regularly takes place among communicators sitting around the globe. However, translanguaging in DMC remains an under-researched area across the world; most of the research on translanguaging focuses on teaching and learning contexts rather than the actual performance of languages (Garcia, 2009), particularly in digital modes of communication. There is a particular dearth of research in Pakistan that affords a translanguaging perspective on digital communication. This study, therefore, attempts to explore the translingual strategies that are used by Pakistani digital communicators. The ultimate aim is to establish, in the context of Pakistan, the credence of the theoretical stance proffered by several theorists (e.g., Garcia, 2009, 2013; Canagarajah, 2011; Wei, 2018) that advocates translanguaging as the new mode of language teaching and learning since it is fast becoming the new mode of languaging around the world.

#### **1.3 Objectives of the Study**

The objectives of the study are:

1) To identify the extent of translanguaging strategies which are employed by Pakistani media users on social media websites.

2) To investigate the salient characteristics of the translanguaging strategies used in social media websites.

#### **1.4. Research Questions**

Q1) To what extent do Pakistani digital media users employ translanguaging as a means of digitally mediated communication on social media websites?

Q2) What are the salient characteristics of the translanguaging strategies used in social media websites?

#### **1.5. Rationale for the Study**

The multilingual world of today is increasingly becoming translingual; the use of a single (variety of a) language in communication is being replaced by a meshing of several languages (or varieties of them) together. This mixing and meshing of languages – translanguaging – is more evident in digitally-mediated communication. The research generated in linguistics, however, mostly focuses on monolingual, multilingual, cross-cultural, and intercultural communication, rather than on the creative, innovative, and meaningful use of several languages during one interaction. Research in the context of Pakistan particularly suffers from this insular approach. It is therefore necessary that the dynamics of digitally mediated communication are explored to analyze how translanguaging facilitates communication and interaction.

#### **1.6 Delimitations of the Study**

Foremost, the study is delimited to Wei's (2018) theoretical and empirical interpretation of translanguaging. The primary reason for delimiting the study to Wei's work is his focus on digital multimodal communication, an area that other scholars on translanguaging largely ignore (see, e.g., Canagarajah, 2011; Garcia, 2011). Further, the study is delimited to four out of the five leading social media websites used by Pakistani digital media users (Social Media Stats in Pakistan , 2020). These are Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and YouTube. Pinterest does not make a part of this study since it mainly focuses on pictures and people rarely comment on this platform



#### **1.7 Significance of the Study**

The present study is significant since it attempts to explore an under-researched area, especially in the context of Pakistan. Being a post-colonial country, Pakistan has been following policies that are English- and Urdu-friendly. The same policies have translated into language teaching and learning, where only these two languages mostly remain the focus. The reality of the world outside the classroom, however, is that languages are being regularly meshed and mixed for meaning-making. The study is therefore expected to be helpful for language policymakers to understand the importance of translanguaging in communication. It is also significant for teachers since a plurilingual and translingual approach to learning may offer better opportunities to students not only to understand lesson content but also to be able to digitally socialize through translanguaging once they get their smartphones. It can be significant for multilingual research to support the stance of multilinguals' as creative communicators instead of linguistically deficient.

#### **1.8 Organization of the Thesis**

The present thesis consists of five chapters. The first chapter has an introduction to the topic of the thesis along with research questions and research objectives. A Statement of the problem and significance of the research is also stated. The second chapter reviews past studies related to the research are given along with different discussions related to concepts of the topic translanguaging. The third chapter explains the research methodology of the thesis in detail. The theoretical and analytical framework is also discussed in this chapter. The fourth chapter provides a detailed analysis through the lens of a theoretical framework. The fifth chapter gives important insights into the study along with the conclusion of the study. Limitations of the study and recommendations for future study are also given in the last chapter.

# CHAPTER 2 LITERATURE REVIEW

Throughout history, multilingualism is considered inferior due to power differentials built up during the processes of nation-building and colonial formation. Monolingualism is considered the norm. Bilingualism and multilingualism have gotten the attention of researchers since the middle of the twentieth century. Translanguaging is one of the multilingual strategies which got attention due to it being considered a teaching strategy but now the area of translanguaging is not only restricted to teaching but it has become digitalized. This chapter gives an overview of all the related issues concerning Translanguaging for building a theoretical framework for this research. I start this chapter with a discussion of how the world is becoming slowly and gradually digitalized then I also discuss the concept of translanguaging of various scholars. Then I move toward other general studies of translanguaging which are mainly related to bilingual pedagogy. Then I focused on the studies related to digital translanguaging which is also the focus of this study. In the end, I discussed the lack of research on the translanguaging of digital media in Pakistan which is also the reason behind conducting the present study.

#### 2.1 The Digitized World of Today

The significance of digital communication is strikingly visible in today's world. The internet has become part of people's lives and there is a rapid increase in new media through which people can communicate with each other. Earlier in the 1990s, people have fewer options for media like chat forums, media, and search engines like Google. Now with the expansion of new media social networking sites such as Facebook, Twitter, Instagram, and YouTube, social media users are increasing which was earlier limited to academics, scientists, and governments (Tagg, 2015)

In the contemporary world, social media is used by users belonging to any background. For instance, digital communication helped African farmers to obtain information regarding their farming practices (e.g. Furuholt and Matotay,2011). But not everyone has equal access to the internet. However, it is assumed that slowly and gradually people are getting access to technology, and those who do not get access to it will have more difficulty in getting any sort of information and facilities as the world is becoming

7

more digitalized. In a way, the Internet is not something new for everyone but it is slowly becoming part of life. This phenomenon was observed by American Linguist Susan Herring in 2004 who then predicted that the internet would become part of everyday life (Tagg, 2015).

Still, the Internet is at times treated as something fearful, especially by adults. Linguists explained this situation as a generational issue in which adults think that young people's behavior online is not understandable (Herring, 2008). But the internet is a normal thing for young people and most of them do not know what to do with their lives without the presence of the internet. The adults are not concerned about technology but about their younger generation who are using the internet. Parents are mostly worried about what their children are doing online and this concern will not simply go away with more technology familiarity with the parents. Parents will most likely be going to be concerned about it even in the future (Tagg, 2015).

This fear of technology is not something new. In the old times, the advent of technology for communication purposes like the telegram and typewriter in the 1830s and landline telephone in the 1870s also provoked similar fear and distrust in technology as it is being seen towards new digital technologies. For instance, the telephone created fear in nineteenth-century people initially about their privacy violations and social order. One issue was about how to communicate with someone without seeing them and also it was hard to determine the position of the other person in society without seeing them. In 1928, science fiction writer H.G Wells wrote about not liking radio and its suitability for its broadcast. He preferred older technologies like a gramophone and printed stuff over the radio. He viewed radio to be inferior to the gramophone because the gramophone can provide music at home. Ironically, the gramophone was discouraged to use when it was invented because according to people it was discouraging them to get together and sing. Even printing in earlier days was seen as inferior to handwritten work due to it being less pleasing aesthetically. Similarly, the postcard was considered an insult to the recipient. These concerns related to new technologies and also the incline of one technology after the invention of the new and its effects on the linguistic and social order are even part of present-day complaints related to the internet (Baron, 2000). The pieces of evidence of

people's reactions towards landlines, radio, and other technologies show that people blame technology for problems like social changes.

The relationship of technology with society is much more complex than just a simple cause-and-effect relationship. Both society and technology influence each other. An example of such influence is shown in the popularity of photography in the 1800s. The photograph was helpful not only in the past but in the present time because in a way it facilitates keeping a record. In an era of mobility, where families are separated from each other and also many migrations, Photography played a central role in maintaining personal connections. This same argument can also be used to challenge reservations about the impact of digital media. The thing is that digital technology does not drive social change but it is quickly becoming part of the existing need and also fulfills the existing goals of society and in near future will become an unavoidable part of society (Tagg, 2015).

The development of online sites depends upon what is the need of their users. For example, Evans Williams set up Twitter when he failed to initiate audio blogging. Twitter was what the people wanted so it stayed and did not fail. The title page of Twitter was in starting 'What are you doing?' but later in 2009, it was changed to 'what is happening? 'The reason was that people started to use it for various purposes and was not limited to what was initially envisioned such as commenting and sharing on events. The new sign of hashtag (#) was created and later used as a way of showing the topic of the tweet and also the sign of '@' which is used for mentioning another Tweeter and this trend started after its usage became popular. People used specific sites for specific purposes which then became the reason for their development in a specific way. The way was not the way it was initially envisioned. This highlights the fact that the technologies do not create any outcome but it depends entirely on what ways people are using them as well as how the developers are responding to the users. To a maximum extent, people have the power to decide how can the technology be used, and this feature is called affordance (Gibson, 1986; Lee, 2007).

Affordances are the possibilities of the technologies which are being perceived by the people and these possibilities can be exploited by some individuals. It depends upon their competence related to technology or their experiences when it comes to using similar technologies and their basic purposes. The basic point is that technology inherently does not decide how it would be used. This whole discussion facilitates us to think about human agency and also that the internet is just a tool designed by people and used by the people and its basic purpose is to use it for our facilitation (Tagg, 2015)

Social media platforms like Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube are playing an important role and making our communication easier and more approachable. Social media platforms are now becoming multimodal and users are using them by combining different modes like images, videos, texts, and audio to express their feelings and emotions in a better way. The more social media is becoming multimodal, the more it is becoming difficult to understand the language naturally. It is becoming challenging to understand the textual components of lots of messages shared on social media platforms. Mostly, textual components are understood on social media in combination with other components like the visual or audio context of the message on social media (Lu et al.,2018)

#### 2.2 The concept of translanguaging

Throughout history, most people in the world, in Europe and the Americas, in India, in Africa, and the near and far East, have either spoken more than one named language or have language in ways that do not fit the definition of named languages. But because of power differentials built up during the processes of nation-building and colonial formation, monolingual white elites and their ways of languaging have been considered the norm (Flores &Rosa, 2015; Makoni &Pennycook, 2007; Rosa &Flores, 2017). This has led to a reductive situation where recognition is only accorded in a multilingual repertoire to the use of one, two, or three separate, standardized named language(s). When elite monolinguals develop as bilinguals, they most often do so in school, where they are taught what is labeled as a second language, to be used completely separately from what is called their first language or mother tongue. The study of bilingualism and multilingualism became an important field of study only in the middle of the twentieth century.

Cen Williams and his colleagues were analyzing different strategies of learners to use two different languages in one single lesson. They used the term 'trawsieithu' to describe receptive input in one language and productive output in another language. The term 'trawsieithu' was popularized in English as 'translanguaging' by Colin Baker. Now the term 'translanguaging' is used for multiple language use in various contexts (Lewis, Jones, & Baker, 2012).

Canagarajah (2011) has considered translanguaging as the ability of multilingual to shuttle between languages and treat different languages of their repertoire as an integrated system. Different other scholars have also agreed with this definition of translanguaging (Rossatto, Soria, & Aguirre, 2019; Ilosvay, 2020). Aiken and Propst (2019) have expanded this definition by observing that multilinguals strategically use their languages to decipher and relay the meaning.

In the context of pedagogy, various scholars have focused on the ability of multilinguals to move back and forth in a different language and the process of meaningmaking and shaping experiences through the use of two languages as well as gaining an understanding and knowledge of the two languages (Howlett & Young, 2019; Baker, 2011; Bauer & Harrison, 2015). According to Aghai (2019), translanguaging is the process of utilizing individual linguistic resources for the sense-making process. The individual should have knowledge of multiple languages for the negotiation of sense and meaning in communication.

Translanguaging has a positive impact on the education system (Coulson, Datta, & Sugawara, 2019). Translanguaging is a linguistic theory where students use all their linguistic resources which support their language practices (Deroo, 2020). Carmen, García, and Agulló (2020) referred to translanguaging as the acceptance of both languages of students (L1 and L2) in the classroom. Both languages are equally treated and they will be used for maximum comprehension within the given context. Translanguaging is not just an approach for understanding bilinguals' or multilinguals' language use but it is also a pedagogy that helps multilinguals in their language development and education. Multilinguals conform to the constraints of their languages according to societal created restrictions but they also create new practices which are complex, dynamic and fluid. Their linguistic practices are according to their given context that is they are sensitive to the context (Barbosa, 2020).

Various scholars have defined translanguaging in the area of sociolinguistics (King, 2015; Smith and Iyengar, 2018). According to King (2015), translanguaging is a

sociolinguistic practice in which multilinguals utilize all the multiple linguistic affordances which are available to them in a given social context. Smith and Iyengar (2018) have elaborated this definition by adding that translanguaging is a sociolinguistic process that is made up of morphology (word choice), syntax (grammatical structure), phonology (pronunciation), register, and idiolect. It is a fluid process that is a response to the social and cultural restrictions on language choice (Smith & Iyengar, 2018).

A scholar like Li Wei has focused on translanguaging as a practical theory of language and defined it as going between different linguistic systems and going beyond them. It also includes the full linguistic repertoire of multilingualism for purposes that transcend the combination of different structures, the shift between systems, and the transference of information (Wei, 2011).

#### 2.3 Research on translanguaging in general

Majority of the work that addresses the use of translanguaging in different bilingual contexts focused on translingual practices in bilingual pedagogy. The monolingual instructional strategies are criticized by Garcia (2020) who compared the traditional monolingual perspective of literacy and the translanguaging perspective. The author blamed the monolingual view of literacy for the failure of many bilingual students in Mexico. The translanguaging perspective focuses on the language actions of the bilingual instead of the language of the text. The data which focuses on the actions of three Latinx bilinguals from different standards of the school has helped the author in exploring the leverage provided by translanguaging to the bilingual readers. The author suggested educators enter into the translanguaging space of the bilingual readers in which they act which can facilitate the Latinx readers in successful readers educationally. This can also be beneficial for them socially and politically.

The monolingual pedagogical principle is challenged by Lin & He (2017) in the traditional language classroom and also gave value to translanguaging as pedagogical scaffolding resources and gave opportunities for identity affirmation. Observations of the translanguaging situations in the multicultural and multilingual classroom in their study provided new insights into the nature of translanguaging. These insights rejected the

traditional view that takes language as an isolated system of pre-existing realities and misinterprets translanguaging as speakers' selecting and alternating between separate linguistic systems.

The bilingual teaching strategy such as translanguaging can be interpreted as naturally occurring speech/action events during which participants of multilingual/multicultural backgrounds deploy their multilingual/multicultural resources to contribute to mutual meaning-making (Lin & He, 2017). There is no need for the rigid stipulation of using only one language for instruction or interpersonal communication when translanguaging which is such a dynamic and interconnected view present in multilingual classrooms. It would be recommended to make full use of the home language and other cultural and multilingual resources to enhance communication, help in the development of creative thinking, motivate the art of learning, and guarantee the safety of learners' ethnic and cultural identities. The analysis of the research by Lin & He (2017) demonstrated that there was a willingness to learn each other's language resources in the teacher and students' interaction in the classroom even though they were from different linguistic and cultural backgrounds and it created a type of classroom atmosphere in which both teacher and students are learning from each other and also expanding their multiple resources for communication. Thus, translanguaging created a space for effective learning activities.

The flexible bilingual instructional strategies which include translanguaging are advocated by various scholars (Lin & He, 2017; Creese & Blackledge, 2010; Sayer, 2013). Creese and Blackledge (2010) argued to leave monolingual teaching strategies and advocated for the use of bilingual instructional strategies to teach bilingual children. Their argument is based on the data obtained from Gujrati and Chinese community language schools in the United Kingdom in which teaching is through a translanguaging approach which is also utilized by the students. They analyzed the data by using a language ecology lens which showed the use of translanguaging for identity performance as well as for learning and teaching. The flexible bilingual approach in bilingual teaching allowed the schools to become an avenue for the replication of pedagogic, social, and community values and goals.

The concept of a flexible bilingual approach provided by Creese and Blackledge (2010) is adopted by Sayer (2013) to examine how bilinguals make sense of things through language. For this purpose, the researcher took data from a second-grade classroom in a bilingual education program in a Mexican American community in San Antonio, Texas. The data from the students showed the fluid nature of translingual language practices and it can be helpful for the researchers to understand that the children's bilingualism is not monolingualism two. From the teacher's point of view, translanguaging facilitated her to take out students' linguistic knowledge and engage them through flexible bilingual pedagogy. The study of Velasco & Fialais (2018) also reflected the same insights but the data sample was small and even though the students were from diverse backgrounds, the researchers believe that the study cannot be generalized and the basic purpose of the study was not to reach any conclusion but to describe the implementation of the simultaneous biliterate practices enacted in translanguaging space created by the teacher fluent in two languages.

The purpose of translanguaging is not entirely to be used as a teaching strategy but also can help the emergent bilinguals to self-regulate and also be self-sufficient. The translanguaging strategies used by the small children at the school level in their writings show that dynamic language practices are used by them as bilinguals. Effective language learning can be helpful in effectively using translanguaging strategies in a meaningful context which can also be supportive for processing the linguistic learning and writing demands in today's time. Teachers can play an important part by incorporating translanguaging in their teaching strategies which can give space to the students that can also be helpful for them in learning about writing (Canagarajah, 2011)

Canagarajah (2011) has done research in which he started with 24 writing samples. Out of which eight writing samples were showing translanguaging and among eight, five were selected. The reason for selecting the five was that they were displaying different stages of writing used by the writers of those samples. Translanguaging in writing needs to be analyzed in detail to understand the reason behind other students not fully making use of their linguistic repertoires. The reason could be that language separation is strictly practiced by the language programs which enforced these students who end up not fully using their linguistic repertoire or the students are using some other strategies in their writings. The students who were using translanguaging, become an essential part of their meaning-making process (Garcia, 2009). The writing samples which were analyzed before showed that translanguaging was used for self-regulation and it helped the emergent bilinguals in the study to face any challenge in language understanding and production when they write their text and also allowed them to use their unique voice.

The study of Canagarajah (2011) helped in understanding the role of translanguaging in academic writing. It also reviews the literature on learning and other teaching theories related to translanguaging and also presents its theoretical understanding of bilingual literary development and especially the literature which is focused on the writing of bilingual learners. The reason for the study was to check the planning, drafting, and production stages of writing in the emergent bilingual's writings and also to analyze why and how translanguaging is utilized by the emergent bilinguals and what kind of effect translanguaging has in the development of their voices in writing. Rather than pedagogy for writing, translanguaging is preferred to be utilized as a self-regulating mechanism that is engaging for bilingual learners. The basic focus of the study is not translanguaging but also academic writing. Translanguaging has the most potential even in a monolingual voice in writing.

Kaufold (2018) reveals the result of the empirical study that identified the writing practices in a multilingual classroom of fourth-grade students in a rural area of Kenya. The study was analyzed through the lens of Bakhtin's heteroglossia. The data was the writing samples and other curriculum documents. For this research, these fourth-grade children were given some writing tasks in two languages. First was English which is the language used for instructions and Kiswahili, which is just taught as a subject. The data which was collected from three Kiswahili compositions and six English compositions were related to different topics which were taught to them in their school term. Every student individually wrote the essay within the class in 40 minutes lesson. After which the teachers collected the texts for grading. Teachers were told to allow students to use multilingual spaces so that negative connotations which were attached to African languages can be diffused. Multilingualism should be taken as a power and the full use of repertoire is helpful for the

students. As noted by Cummins (2005), Colonization patterns and inferior treatment of the aboriginal cultures within schools and the whole society lead to educational failure. The educational programs have to challenge this colonial mindset and contemporary discourses which devalues the culture and language of aboriginals. Learners from the rural side of Kenya can only be empowered by positive enforcement of their identity which is through language use and it can help challenge the power relations and teachers should be actively involved to challenge the language hierarchies through their teaching instruction. Teachers can create such an environment in which students can use their identities freely and it can also promote the relation of power. This can only happen when multilingual children can learn naturally. Translanguaging provides open opportunities for translingual writers to voice naturally.

The research of Kaufold (2018) identified that the emergent multilingual used several semiotic resources so that their communicative goals can be achieved and it is possible due to translanguaging. But translanguaging process in writing is not favorable for the students due to language separation and correction. It is a tension-filled process through which the emergent multilingual writers go through to find a balance between the orders from the authorities and the unique voices of the emergent themselves. The author thinks that translanguaging in writing helps give equality to voices and breaks language hierarchies by breaking the boundaries of standard ideologies used in academic writing. Educators are recommended to consider translanguaging, as well as other multilingual resources as legitimate cognitive tools which can be used for communication in schools, and they should also consider allowing authentic voices and inclusive instruction.

Translanguaging has been put forward in the context of multilingual education as a means of including several languages in education. However, teachers often think that translanguaging-based approaches are too vague and idealist. In the research conducted by Duarte (2020), data from two settings are discussed (Luxembourg and Netherlands) in which teachers worked on design-based projects operationalized which helped the concept of translanguaging to include both migrant and minority languages in mainstream education. Examples from each dataset are discussed to show the several functions of translanguaging in the two different settings. Analyses of classroom transcripts provided

insights into how official translanguaging can be used as a pedagogical strategy to acknowledge migrant languages, achieve less language separation in traditional immersion models, and increase content understanding. Based on teachers' reflections on their use of translanguaging and the iterative interpretation of excerpts of the data, the study provides an overview of the functional use of different languages within moments of official translanguaging.

It is quite common to learn more than two or more languages in schools in Europe but languages were isolated from one another The teaching practice is usually against the multilingual speakers' practice in which they use full linguistic repertoire in any social context. This isolation of languages is contested by translingual practices as well as translanguaging teaching strategies. This challenge of translanguaging teaching strategies can allow students who are multilinguals to practice the full use of the resources provided by their linguistic repertoire. The main and specific focus of the research conducted by Leonet et al. (2017) was to investigate translanguaging as a teaching tool in the context where Basque is the main language that is used for instruction but it is still a minority language in society. This article showed the characteristics of teaching intervention which aimed at developing and promoting language awareness and also communicative and academic competencies as well as metalinguistic awareness in Basque, English, and Spanish. The findings of the study show that teaching instructions in translanguaging can help in maintaining and developing a minority language like Basque.

The researcher Jones (2017) conducted a study that focused on translanguaging and language policy in the bilingual context of Welsh and the focus was on English medium education. This is the same place from which the idea of translanguaging was originally developed in the 1980s. Welsh is not a language of the majority but a language of the minority which is officially recognized and even used in education. Jones after analyzing the translanguaging situation in the school nowadays was not good. Jones helped by providing different examples of translingual activities and also tried to differentiate between teacher-directed translanguaging and student-directed translanguaging. Jones also pointed toward the risk that translanguaging can create for a minority language which in that case was Welsh. He explained that even if translanguaging was earlier used for Welsh bilingual education, language separation is still a very part of the classroom context at the school level. He also recommended for the policy safeguard the Welsh language.

The above-mentioned research showed that the majority of the work which is done on translanguaging has been focused on it as a pedagogy practice. The reason can be that the term translanguaging originated in the 1980s to describe a phenomenon of a pedagogical practice in which the information between the teacher and student was exchanged in different languages and it helped to maximize the learner's bilingual ability in learning. Translanguaging as a term has grown and extended with time (Lewis et al. 2012).

#### 2.4 Research on translanguaging in digital media

There are a few research in which translanguaging is explored in social media like Facebook for learning about the identity of social media users. This section will explore the empirical studies that highlight the prevalence of the use of translanguaging in different bilingual contexts than the traditional classroom context.

Kramsch and Whiteside (2007) have examined three fundamental concepts of second language acquisition in multilingual contexts. They analyzed the face-to-face interaction of multilingual immigrants in California. They have concluded that translanguaging practices are very common in the multilingual community in California. The translanguaging practices know no national borders and no standard national language. The researchers have also a case study in which a Spanish farmer who shopped for food in a Vietnamese grocery store talked to the shopkeeper. The interlocutors used translanguaging instead of using one language. The findings showed that it is important for the speakers to effectively communicate with each other instead of being perceived as native speakers by the other speakers. Blackledge and Creese (2017) have studied communicative interaction with a focus on the body as a semiotic repertoire. The research is an ethnographic study of four years that inquired about people's communication in cities with a diverse population in the UK. The researchers have analyzed translanguaging in communication in different contexts. Field notes and observation are used for data collection. Through detailed analysis of different interactions, it showed that translanguaging is creatively used by different semiotic resources.

Translanguaging has created a debate about a threat or opportunity in linguistics. <u>Cenoz</u> and Gorter (2017) have focused on translanguaging in the context of minority languages. They have analyzed the Basque language in different contexts. Their study showed that translanguaging can protect and promote the minority language but at the same time it can be a threat to their survival. It can also take away the opportunity for the development of the minority language. McCaffrey and Taha (2019) have examined smartphone use among Middle Eastern refugee families who settled in Northern New Jersey. The result revealed that a smartphone is a tool used for translanguaging which is a creatively used strategy for communication. The participants used the smartphone for breaking the language barriers and smartphones were also helpful for them for multimodal effective communication.

Multilingual writing practices are also studied in the context of translanguaging. Schreiber (2015) has explored multilingual writing practices in digital communication. She has taken Serbian university students as participants on Facebook. This case study was conducted to examine the multilingual identities of the participants through their Facebook interactions. She observed that the students are using diverse varieties of languages along with images and videos. She has concluded that the subjects of her study have displayed a high level of linguistic creativity through translanguaging. They have used all the linguistic and semiotic resources available to them in their digital texts. Oliver and Nguyen (2017) investigated the translingual practices of seven university students on Facebook over eighteen months. Their posts were analyzed. The findings of the research showed that Facebook has provided the participants the opportunity to use translingual practices which helped them to creatively use the multiple linguistic repertoire and construction of identity along with exclusion and inclusion of others in the interaction. The researchers also observed that the participants developed proficiency in a language that was not their dominant language. Facebook has developed their linguistic competence and also encouraged them to use all the language resources at their disposal.

Translanguaging in the trilingual context has been studied by Kirsch (2017). She has examined the situations and ways in which preschoolers did translanguaging in the trilingual context during collaborative storytelling activity on iTEO. it is an application on

which oral language can be recorded and edited. At the time of the research, 62.4% of children could not speak Luxembourgish on their school admission. Language policies of the school focus on learning Luxembourgish. The longitudinal study on five children in school showed that children were using translanguaging for various purposes. The practice of translanguaging depended upon the individual and contextual factors of the children. Storytelling on it helped them to open up and communicate in translanguaging which also helped them for learning purposes.

Kwangok Song has done a qualitative study to explore translanguaging practices in the home literacy context. He has taken four Korean children and their families as participants. He has used video recordings, field notes, and observation to collect the data. The data analysis focused on the types of language use. The results of the study showed that the children and their families used both languages creatively and strategically for the meaning-making process in their communication (Song, 2016).

Jungmin Kwon has examined the translanguaging strategies used by immigrant children and their parents in museums during their temporary visits to their homeland, South Korea. Audio recordings of their interactions, field notes, and documents related to their visit were taken as data. The result illustrates that Korean immigrant parents have substantial knowledge of their culture and they engage uniquely with their children by using the multilingual repertoire. The study also illuminates immigrant children's active learning by making full use of their communicative resources in a strategic way. The study highlighted the importance of allowing immigrants to use translanguaging practices that are supported by transnational knowledge and multimodal tools (Kwon, 2019).

Kim (2018) conducted a case study in the article "It was kind of a given that we were all multilingual": Transnational youth identity work in digital translanguaging." The study aimed to explore the identity spectrum of the case study by using digital translanguaging. The study highlighted that transnational youth did translanguaging across multimodal resources in digital communication. The translanguaging framework has enabled access to the case study's entire linguistic repertoire. The analysis demonstrates that the youth agentive use of translanguaging scope across different digital spaces and has

expanded to different other contexts like the classroom, transnational family, and multilingual youth communication.

Translanguaging is used in different online discussion forums therefore; Jaworska (2014) has examined in her paper the translanguaging practices in an online discussion forum that was used by English Speakers from Germany living in Britain. She has used a qualitative approach to examine the linguistic and semiotic practices of bilinguals on the forum. Their performances were analyzed on three levels. The three levels were form, meaning, and frames. The findings showed that participants mixed German and English while communicating with each other on each of the three levels. Ng and Lee (2019) conducted a study to explore multilinguals and their multilanguage skills in digital media. The study aimed to examine the translanguaging practices of Malaysian university graduates in digital media. The study focused on the postings of a group of university emails. The result showed that translanguaging practices influence identity construction. Albawardi (2018) has examined the way Saudi women use linguistic and other communicative resources in their digital interactions. The study is inspired by the debate on digital media's impact on people in the way they use the language especially Arabic in Saudi Arabia. The research was conducted at Women's University in Saudi Arabia. A descriptive analysis of the WhatsApp interactions of the participants was done. The study concluded that translanguaging is mostly used by women in their conversations on WhatsApp.

Students use digital resources for various purposes. Darvin (2019) has conducted a study to find out how high school students from the Philippines use their linguistic and digital resources to retell the story they have watched on YouTube video in the comments of the YouTube video. For this purpose, he used a YouTube video about Filipino immigrants which was based on a literature textbook. The findings of the study showed that students have creatively used translanguaging to assert their voices in the discourse of globalization.

Translanguaging practices are studied in the Chinese pedagogy context. Zhao and Flewitt (2019) focused on the prevailing translanguaging practices of Chinese immigrant students. Their translanguaging practices were investigated on WeChat which is the

popular Chinese social media platform that is widely used by Chinese young people. Nine immigrant families in southeast London were taken as participants. The results of the study showed that social media can give more opportunities for translanguaging practices to young immigrants along with helping them in improving their language learning. Han (2018) has explored the language practices of Chinese visiting scholars on WeChat. She has used an ethnographic approach with systematic observation to examine the representational meanings of their translanguaging practices. WeChat screenshots and interviews of Chinese visiting scholars are used as data. The findings showed that the Chinese visiting scholars have used translanguaging practices in their host country for the intertextuality of the local people, projecting themselves as global citizens and their responsibility as ethnic messengers.

Wei (2011) has explored the translanguaging practices of three Chinese youngsters and observed the multilingual practices and metalanguage commentaries of three Chinese youngsters in Britain. The study has examined the translanguaging practices of the three youths through a moment analysis. He has also examined the new Chinglish which is created and followed by the new generation of Chinese speakers of ELF in China. Chinglish is the new form of English which has many characteristics of the Chinese language. It helps in various social, communicative, and political purposes in the postmultilingual challenges faced by China. Li Wei has examined Chinglish with the perceptive of translanguaging for checking the validity of conventional language use and also for understanding problems of post-multilingualism (Wei, 2016). Konglish as embodied in Konglish Daily has been studied as a 'new variety of Hong Kong English' and approached from a translanguaging perspective, seeing it as a social practice and the meanings of the signs are open to interpretation, depending on the reader's own experience, knowledge, and ideology. Followers, contributors as well as editors of Konglish Daily all play a part in the dynamic translanguaging process (Wei et al,2020).

The above-mentioned studies except the last two showed that even after the translanguaging concept started to be researched in digital media. The focus remained on the pedagogy practices or identity of the students. Even early research of the scholars like Li Wei focused on the same aspect but the research in 2016 (mentioned above) by Li Wei

has shown that the focus has shifted to the phenomenon of translanguaging as a process than just a product. Then Li Wei (2018) gave the practical theory of language that is translanguaging in which multilingual fluid and dynamic practices were discussed and two arguments were put forward that Multilingual languages users do not think in a politically named linguistic entity unilingually and also that they think beyond language. A glimpse of its practicality can be seen in his Konglish daily research (Wei et al,2020).

#### 2.5 Research on translanguaging in Pakistan

The area of translanguaging is studied in the context of pedagogy in Pakistan. Canagarajah and Ashraf (2013) focused on multilingual educational policies in both Pakistan and India. Their study mainly focused on the challenges in everyday communicative practices which are faced by the students due to the multilingual educational policies of both countries. Other than this study; there is a lack of research on translanguaging in the Pakistani context, especially in the case of digital communication. According to a global digital report in 2018, 35 million Pakistanis use social media actively. It means that 18% Pakistani population is using social media actively (Anwar, 2019). But still, the area of digital communication in Pakistan is understudied. There is a need for research on translanguaging in digital communication so that diverse multilingual practices can be understood and given the status of equality to monolingual practice. The research on translanguaging according to the concept of Li Wei (2018) is important because it discusses the issue of bilingual and multilingual research when it comes to an open mind state, or bilingual mode (Grosjean, 2011) in which constantly switching between named languages as well as beyond languages are taking place. It also considers multilingual language users' practices in translingual space as creative, fluid, and dynamic and also advocates translanguaging pedagogy.

# CHAPTER 3 RESEARCH METHODOLOGY

This study is qualitatively exploring the phenomenon of Translanguaging on social media platforms by Pakistani social media users. I start this chapter by discussing the research design of this thesis. I then explain the theoretical framework of the study. I then gave detail of data collection and then conclude this chapter by providing the data analysis procedure.

#### **3.1 Research Design**

The research is exploratory (Walliman, 2011) in nature, underpinned by an epistemologically constructionist (Lincoln & Guba, 2011) and methodologically qualitative (Creswell, 2011) research design. Rather than attempting to provide conclusive evidence, exploratory research helps in a better understanding of the research problem (Dudovskiy, 2018), an aim that is consistent with the aim of this study. The theoretical and analytical framework for guiding the study is based on Wei's (2018) interpretation of translanguaging. The study aims to qualitatively explore the phenomenon of translanguaging in DMC to get a deeper insight into the dynamics of translanguaging among the Pakistani digital community.

#### **3.2 Theoretical Framework**

The theoretical framework of this study is based on the concept of translanguaging as given by Wei (2018). Although several scholars including Garcia (2009) and Canagarajah (2011) have described translanguaging whereas Wei (2018) takes into account the online space as a translingual space which is the main reason behind selecting his work as the theoretical framework. According to Wei (2018), "Translanguaging reconceptualizes language as a multilingual, multisemiotic, multisensory, and multimodal resource for sense- and meaning-making (Wei, 2018, p.14). Translanguaging is going between different linguistic structures. semiotic systems and modalities and also going beyond them (Wei, 2018).

"Translanguaging underscores multilinguals' creativity—their abilities to push and break boundaries between named language and between language varieties, and to flout
norms of behavior including linguistic behavior, and criticality—the ability to use evidence to question, problematize, and articulate views' (Wei, 2018, p.15). Multilingualism in the case of translanguaging is a rich source of creativity and criticality, and it becomes more in the case of digitally mediated communication. As reported by Wei (2018), "A Translanguaging Space allows language users to integrate social spaces (and thus 'linguistic codes') that have been formerly separated through different practices in different places'' (Wei, 2018, p.15). Increased communication between people of various backgrounds and cultures provides contemporary opportunities for change and creativity. Multilinguals' are capable of critically responding to old and present situations. They consciously make and regularly modify their sociocultural

identities and principles through social practices such as translanguaging (Wei, 2018).

According to Wei (2018), 'Translanguaging instinct drives humans to go beyond narrowly defined linguistic cues and transcend culturally defined language boundaries to achieve effective communication' (Wei, 2018, p.17). Human beings have a natural drive to draw on as many different sensory, modal, cognitive, and semiotic resources as they are available to them to interpret the meaning intentions whilst assessing the relative relevance and significance of the different cues when cues complement and compensate each other (Wei, 2018). The translanguaging instinct highlights the gaps between meaning, what is connected to forms of the language and other signs, and message, what is inferred by hearers and readers (Wei, 2018). It is therefore considered that the theoretical lens of Wei (2018) is helpful for the researcher to explore translingual online space.

#### **3.3 Data Collection**

Digital social media is mainly driven by four different social media platforms, all of which are the focus of this study. These include Twitter, YouTube, Instagram, and Facebook. These four social media websites are chosen after taking into consideration statistics from Statscounter, an online visitor statistics tool. According to Statscounter, there were 94.78% of Facebook users, 2.39% of Twitter users 0.79% of Instagram users, and 0.73% of YouTube users in Pakistan during the month of February 2020 (Social Media Stats in Pakistan , 2020). The researcher did not use Pinterest for data collection since most pictures are uploaded there, with very little real-time interaction. The data collection is not age or gender or topic restricted. People having Pakistani flags attached to themselves in

profile pictures are given priority and comments having *love from other countries* are not selected in the study. For omitting the names of the commenters due to research ethics, black paint marker is used on the names in the screenshots. The time span for Facebook and Instagram is longer than 2 months because the top pages or accounts do not post frequently which leads to less communication in real-time as compared to trending topics or videos on Twitter and YouTube.

## 3.3.1 Facebook

The researcher took comments from the top 20 most followed Pakistani pages on Facebook. The pages were selected according to statistics from the website Socialbakers (Facebook Pages Stats in Pakistan, 2021). The time span of the study was January, February, and March 2021. The number of posts is different for every page because it depended upon the posts posted by the admins during the time span of the study. If all posts from one page are coming under one theme, then only one post is selected. The details are given below in Table 3.1.

#### Table 3.1

Facebook data

Platform	Page Title	No	Post Taken	No Of
		Of	From	Posts
		Posts		
	Pakistan Defence	3	Somia Khan	1
Facebook			Singer	
	Rahat Fateh Ali Khan	1	Masala Tv	1
	Atif Aslam	1	Jazz	1
	Imran Khan	1	Ali Zafar	1
	Coke Studio	1	I Love Shahid	1
			Afridi	
	Pakistan Cricket Team	2	Fahad Mustafa	1
	Shahid Afridi	1	Mahira Khan	1
	Gul Panra	1	Wasim Akram	1
	Afshan Zaibe	1	Saqib Iqbal	1

## 3.3.2 Instagram

From Instagram, the researcher took 10 Pakistani influencers and comments on their posts. Ten Pakistani influencers are selected according to 10 Pakistani influencers' statistics (Top 10 Instagram influencers in Pakistan, 2021). The time span of the study was January, February, and March 2021. The number of posts is different for every page because it depended upon the posts posted by the Instagram influencers during the time span of the study. If all posts from one page are coming under one theme, then only one post is selected. The details are given below in table 3.2.

## Table 3.2

Instagram	Data
-----------	------

Platform	Post Taken	No of	Post Taken	No Of
	From	Posts	From	Posts
	Zaid Ali	1	Zara Noor	1
	Hania Amir	2	Sajal Ali	1
Instagram	Feroze A Khan	2	Shahveerjay	2
	Mahira Khan	2	Dananeer	3
	Tariq Jameel	2	Rabecca Khan	1

## 3.3.3 Twitter

From Twitter, the researcher took the top 10 comments on Pakistani trending topics. Twitter trends were selected from the website trends24 Pakistan (Top Twitter Trends For Pakistan, 2021). The time span is April and May 2021. Translingual Twitter trends were taken for the study. Details are given below in table 3.2.

### Table 3.2

Twitter Data

Platform	Trends	No Of	Trends Taken	No Of
	Taken	Com		Com
	VaccineChor		KhilafahLiberates	
Twitter	Hakoomat	10	AlAqsa	10
	Exams CancelKaro	10	MasjideAqsaIs	10
			Bleeding	
	#Stand_with_PM_		CryptokoRegulate	10
	HayaMovement	10	Karo	
	Aurat March	10	EmergingNaya	10
			Pakistan	
	Muslim Ummah	10	Kisan Card	10

# 3.3.4 YouTube

The researcher took comments from trending videos as data from YouTube. Top trending YouTube videos were taken from the website YoutubeTrends Pakistan (Pakistan Youtube Trends, 2021). Only Pakistani videos were selected for the study. The time span is April and May 2021 further details are given below in Table 3.3.

3.3

YouTube Data				
Platform	Focus	No	of	Trending
		videos		
YouTube	Trending Videos	12		

## **3.4 Procedure**

The objectives of the study are to explore the specific translingual strategies that Pakistani digital media users employ during digital communication. For achieving these objectives, data are analyzed keeping in view the translingual strategies identified in Wei's (2018) interpretation of translanguaging. The primary reason for this is the fact that Wei

28

identifies multimodal strategies in translanguaging, which scholars such as Garcia (2009) and Canagarajah (2013) failed to consider. One reason for this could be that the digital world even a decade ago was less translingual than it is today, mainly because of the dominance of English. It is therefore considered appropriate to explore the translingual strategies using Wei's (2018) analytical lens.

According to Braun and Clarke (2006), thematic analysis is a method used for identifying, analyzing, and reporting patterns (themes) within data and it involves six phases. These phases were followed in the study to identify themes. In the first phase, data was read and reread to get familiarized with it. In the second phase, Initial codes were generated which facilitated the third phase of searching for themes. Then themes were reviewed and defined as the fourth and fifth phases. Screenshots of each translingual text are taken and inserted into different themes generated by Li Wei (2018)'s research work. Then those major themes are divided into subthemes which are generated through the data obtained by all four mediums. Translingual Texts are broken down according to different multilingual and multimodal resources including written languages, emoticons, and images. Then an argument is constructed to give evidence of the explored translingual strategies on different social media websites in the final phase by relating it to research questions and literature.

# **CHAPTER 4**

# **DATA ANALYSIS**

The data analysis has been assorted according to different multisemiotic and multimodal resources including written languages, emoticons, gifs, and images in the translingual text on four different platforms i.e., Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube. Translingual texts are examined through the lens of translanguaging interpreted by Wei's (2018) research work. Data collected from four different digital mediums in January, February, March, April, and May of the year 2021 are taken as screenshots. Then the translingual text screenshots are categorized into three major themes i.e., Translanguaging for facilitating interaction, Translanguaging for creating social bonding, and Translanguaging for negotiating meaning provided by Li Wei's (2016, 2018, 2020) view of translanguaging. The three major themes are further divided into three subthemes. The subthemes of Translanguaging for facilitating interaction are Celebrity fan interaction, Promotional interaction, and Interest-based interaction. Subthemes of Translanguaging for creating social bonding are Creating patriotic relationship, Creating Muslim community bonding, and creating religious affiliations. The subthemes of the major theme of Translanguaging for negotiating meaning are Negotiating women's issues, negotiating religious beliefs, and negotiating political opinions. These subthemes are generated by the type of data obtained from social media applications.

The focus of the analysis is on the different translingual strategies used by social media users in the Pakistani context. The study has also focused on the preferred linguistic characteristics employed in the translingual strategies of Pakistani social media users instead of the traditional monolingual dominant way of communication on social media. The sampled data has been examined to provide evidence of translanguaging, particularly in the digital mode of communication, and how it ensures meaningful communication.

# 4.1 Translanguaging for Facilitating interaction

Li Wei discussed the role of translanguaging space which facilitates language users

in combining social spaces which were separated before through various practices in different places (Wei, 2018). In other words, translanguaging facilitates interaction.

## **4.1.1 Celebrity and Fans Interaction**

Before social media, Celebrities could not communicate directly with their fans but now social media has provided a platform for celebrities to interact with their fans (Minseong &Kim, 2020). Translingual spaces are provided by different social media applications for the interaction of the celebrity with fans. Translingual data from different mediums will be examined below.

Facebook data reveals several instances where translingual communication facilitated interaction between celebrities and their fans in a certain thread. One such example comes from the official page of Rahat Fateh Ali Khan. The main post and the comments are given below in Table 4.1.

# Table 4.1

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Qawwali invitation

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Langua	ge		Visual		Multi	
r ost/Comments	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Rahat Fateh Ali Khan 🕈	✓	✓	✓				
#qawvali is what our #gharana is all about. Inshallah soon announcing #dates for our #qawvalimehfils in Pakistan & #abroad.							
MashaAllah 👷			✓	~			
2) Great istad g	$\checkmark$	√					
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Bad idea corona will ruin your mehfil instead plan something online							



In the main post, Rahat Fateh Ali khan has given the news to his fans about his next gawwali mehfil. Qawwali mehfil is the performance of gawwali in an intimate setting and people in Pakistan who are interested in music are aware of this term. He has used the word 'Gharana' in his post. Gharana means household but in this post, he tried to emphasize his qawwali as a family heritage The admin has used these Urdu terms in English sentences. The translanguaging strategy is in the main post itself where the admin has gone between the languages instead of sticking to one language but this phenomenon is also indicated in the comments of many of the commenters on this post who have also used Urdu and especially Arabic terms but not as a sentence instead added emoticon with the term like Masha Allah term with emoticons in comments 1,7,8,10. Even by using sentences, users have incorporated Urdu or Arabic terms in English sentences like in comments 3 and 4. Users are employing two types of translanguaging strategies which are going between the languages as well as going beyond the boundaries of written languages. The use of the word *Qawali* in the translingual main post has facilitated the communication because in response the users have used the word, Masha Allah, for blessing the Pakistani singer Rahat Fateh Ali khan for his *Qawali* functions which also indicated that users have a sociohistorical association with the main post and usage of terms like *ustad*, *g*, *sahab* in comments 2,5 and 9 show the respect for the celebrity Rahat Fateh Ali khan Through translanguaging, the commenters have clearly understood the message of the Pakistani singer Rahat Fateh Ali Khan and blessed him for his future maneuver.

The next post is taken from the official Facebook page of Pakistani Pashto folk singer Gul Panra. She interacted with her fans by giving them news about her upcoming song based on Tappa, which is a popular genre in Pashto poetry. Her post has gotten the attention of the people following her page. They have given various comments on her post which are given below along with those comments in table 4.2.

#### Table 4.2

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Song Release Update

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language		Visual			Multimodal	
Gul Panra O	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image		
And here's something special for #Tappy lovers J 1 My upcoming Tappy Song releasing tomorrow on my official #youtubechannel #Gulpanaofficial Stay tuned for more updates est a							
GUL PANRA MUSIC PRESENTS	✓		✓	✓	√		
	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
2) Masha Allah nice look beautiful	✓		$\checkmark$				
3) tapay is pahari word u know	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
4)					✓		
5) Wah Gul Kia bat h aaj Kal tou shai hoi ho itne sare song aur I think ye tou is sal ka best hoga	✓	✓					
6) V Nice V	✓			✓			



This thread revealed that the admin has used the translanguaging strategy of going between the languages as well as beyond the languages which facilitated the interaction in such a way that music emoji, an image of herself with a mic, and a hashtag of #tappy have created an environment for interaction. In response to it, Commenters have used different language terms with emoticons or a phrase even in a sentence, to convey views related to the picture of the singer or her music. For instance, the fifth commenter used the going between the languages to praise the singer and expected that the song would be the best song of the year and the sixth and seventh commenters agree but they used English terms with emoticons and images which is a translanguaging strategy of going beyond the languages. Similarly, the commenters have used the translanguaging strategy of going between the languages by using Arabic and Punjabi terms with English words to show love and praise for the singer. The use of several languages, Images, emoticons, and the use of letters to represent the whole word showed that the participants are well aware of language boundaries and created different signs to communicate their views.

The following post is from the official Facebook page of Pakistani singer Afshan Zaibe. In the post, she has given a message to her page followers that soon the page will cross seven million followers. The message is conveyed by using two translanguaging strategies which are going between the languages and going beyond the languages. The main post and comments on the post are given below in table 4.3.

#### Table 4.3

		Use of modes						
	Language			Visual				
English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal			
✓	√		✓					
✓	✓							
√	✓							
√	✓							
$\checkmark$	√							
✓	√							
✓	√							
✓	$\checkmark$							
✓	√							
✓	✓							

# A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Singer Page followers

Rhushaab k logon nay waqai nihayat achay andaaz main welcome kia aap ko afshan zaibi

~

 $\checkmark$ 

10)

The admin has used English terms like *followers* and *follow* in Urdu sentences with smiling and heart-eyed emoticons which indicates that she is sharing happy news with her fans. In response to it, a similar pattern of translanguaging can be seen in comments where commenters have used English terms in Urdu sentences except in comment 1 where the commenter Used two sentences one in Urdu text and the other in English text. Translanguaging in the main post has facilitated the interaction between the celebrity and fans in such a way that commenters expressed the reason to *follow* the fan page and they have employed the translingual strategy of going between the languages.

The next example is also from Facebook where the official page of famous Pakistani cricketer Wasim Akram shared a post with his image of wearing a jumper on the golf ground and talked about the reason behind wearing a jumper by talking about the chilling weather of Karachi, Pakistan. It is out of the ordinary thing for the people of Karachi to wear jackets because the weather in Karachi is not usually so chilly that people have to wear jackets. The main post and the comments are shared below in table 4.4.

## Table 4.4

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistani cricketer post

	Use of modes						
	Languag	e		Visual			
Post/Comments	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multimodal	

 $\checkmark \quad \checkmark \quad \checkmark \quad \checkmark \quad \checkmark \quad \checkmark \quad \checkmark$ 





The cricketer has used numerous emoticons to express his emotions i.e.; the translingual strategy of going beyond the language and before each emoticon, he has used the word which is expressed by that emoticon most likely to avoid any confusion related to the emoticon. At the same time, the translingual strategy of going between languages is also used because the whole post is in the English written language except for a few words like *salaam* and *gyaan* which are from the Arabic and Hindi languages respectively. In response, the commenters on this thread have immensely utilized the strategy of going between the languages and at times used the strategy of going beyond languages by using emoticons in Urdu and English languages. Most of the comments are in English sentences mixed with terms from Arabic, Urdu, and Hindi or emoticons like in comments 3,4,5,6, and 8. First, ninth and tenth commenters have used an English phrase, clause, and sentence with an Urdu sentence. The written text with emoticons has provided context to the image which facilitated the interaction with the fans who have either praised his looks or made fun of him wearing the jacket in Karachi.

The last post from Facebook is given in table 4.5 along with comments and it is taken from the official Facebook page of Pakistani female singer Somia khan. In her post, she greeted her friends with the Arabic term *Assalamualaikum* which is used by Muslims to greet one another. She also included the term *Jummah Mubarak* in her post which means blessed Friday. She has also shared a video in which she is posing in her car while an Indian song *Aise Mujhe Na Dekho* is being played in the background.

#### Table 4.5

Post/Comments	Use of modes					
	Language			Vis		
						Multi
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Friday greetings post

Somia Khan Singer 🔹 🚥 🚥 🗤	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
1)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Walaakum salam and jumma mobarak too somia khan very nice looking friend					
2)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Na sir par doopata our song ke sath kiya jumma mubarak ho sakta he. Mere khayal me iss mubarak din ka toheen he					
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
Walikum assalam jumma mubarak to you 😫 💜					
4)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Thora normal ho k pic ya video bnaya kren dnt mimd plz					
5)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Cover ur hair haram					
6)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Juma mubarak k liye b song had afsos ap pe					
7)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Cute apka lhr ka show bohat kmal ka tha royal wala					
8)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Agr kisi bura na Igy to jomy ko song ni nat honi chiy					
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Semen stando Aesi pic or gana rakh kelljumma Mubarak kehti ho lanat ho tum par					
10)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
If you dislike just ignore. What does mean by lanat. Is it a muslim common practice. With a simple pic your belief is shaken, but what does mullan do in mosque with child, no issue.					

Both written text and video have facilitated the interaction in such a way that commenters who have focused only on written text have commented '*Walikul aasalam*' *which is an Arabic term in reply to the greeting in the main post while the* majority of the commenters who have also seen the video have criticized the dressing of the singer as well as the song in the video like comments 2,4,5, and 6. Comments have majorly used English terms within Urdu sentences which is the strategy of translanguaging of going between languages employed to question the celebrity and for this, even the swear word *Lanat* is used in comment 9 for criticizing the celebrity. The tenth commenter has suggested the ninth commenter ignore the post if the person has a problem with it but the person should not use a swearing word. Unlike the above threads in which celebrities have been shown respect and love, this thread indicates that facilitation of interaction can also make fans criticize the celebrity.

Instagram data similar to Facebook data demonstrate the facilitation of interaction through translanguaging between the celebrity and fans. The first example from Instagram taken for this purpose is from the official account of Pakistani actress Hania Aamir. The video is shared by the actress in which she was dancing with her friend to a background song while waiting for her food on a trip to the United States of America (USA). The video has a translingual caption in which she has used the English words casual dancing in the Urdu sentence. The post and the comments are in table 4.6 below.

#### Table 4.6

	Language	9	Vis	sual	
Post/Comments	English Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multimodal

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a Casual dancing video

Image: Section of the sec	haniaheheofficial @ bohat he casual dancing khanay ka intezaar karte hue with @maidaazmat	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
Yare bach his bis book watch his bis of yourse his bis of the watch has been watch his bis of the watch has been watch his bis of the watch has been watch has b					
Find by the bar bar with the bar has been with the bar has been determined by the	hania apki but shakal ki waja sy cover	√	✓		
3) ·   4)   bit	kar di ha ya islamic country ma rha rhi	✓	$\checkmark$		
4) •   f) •	3) Muslim family se belong krti hn ap khwateen aesay behooda libas	√	✓		
5) ✓   Khane ka wait aap ki traf aise   6)   ✓   G)   ✓   F   Ø)   ✓   ✓   Ø)   ✓   Ø)   ✓   ✓   Ø)   Ø)  <	4) bhi bohat achi hai and we r in love with	√	$\checkmark$		
6)✓✓Sharam bhi nahi ati aur dance7)✓✓ </td <td>5) Khane ka wait aan ki traf aise</td> <td><math>\checkmark</math></td> <td><math>\checkmark</math></td> <td>✓</td> <td></td>	5) Khane ka wait aan ki traf aise	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓	
7)       ✓       ✓         When you try to be "Gora"       ✓       ✓         8)       ✓       ✓       ✓         Tood kharab kr dia mt karo rehne do       ✓       ✓         9)       ✓       ✓       ✓         Having begherti in las vegas. Remember ur muslim and cover ur bely.       ✓       ✓       ✓         10)       ✓       ✓       ✓       ✓	6) Sharam bhi nahi ati aur dance	√	$\checkmark$		
8)       ✓       ✓       ✓         Import tauba tauba tauba sara mood kharab kr dia mt karo rehne do       ✓       ✓         9)       ✓       ✓       ✓         9)       ✓       ✓       ✓         Import tauba tauba tauba sara mood kharab kr dia mt karo rehne do       ✓       ✓         9)       ✓       ✓       ✓         10)       ✓       ✓       ✓	7)	√	$\checkmark$		
mood kharab kr dia mt karo rehne do         9)       ✓         9)       ✓         Image: Having begherti in las vegas. Remember ur muslim and cover ur belly.         10)       ✓	8)	$\checkmark$	✓	√	
Having begherti in las vegas. Remember ur muslim and cover ur belly. 10) $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$ $\checkmark$	mood kharab kr dia mt karo rehne do 😅 😂 😂	1			
10) 🗸 🗸 🗸	Having begherti in las vegas. Remember ur muslim and cover	V	v		
ve step new create kiya	,	√	✓	$\checkmark$	

The video in the post has facilitated communicators on the post to interact with the post maker by communicating their thoughts related to the video. Commenters have criticized the video for employing the translingual strategy of going between languages i.e.; using Urdu phrases like Taubaa besharmi, behooda libas, sharam bhi nahi ati, tauba tauba, and begherti like in comments 2,3,6,8 and 9. The word 'Tauba' is frequently used in comments 2 and 8 which have different meanings in different contexts but here it is used for the expression of disappointment. Some commenters have liked the video like the fourth commenter who has used the same words 'casual dancing' as the main post to show their love for Hania Aamir's dancing. Few commenters have innovatively put forward their views, for instance, the fifth commenter asked the actress why people like her wait for food like this and used a laughing emoticon with the statement and the seventh commenter indicated that the actress tried to be *Gora*' which is the term used for white foreigners and the comment ended on the word 'but' which means that the commenter has left the comparison to the imagination of the readers of the comment. The video in the post has facilitated the interaction of the post maker as well as the commenters on the Instagram post.

Another post from Instagram which revealed the facilitation of the interaction between the celebrity and fans is taken from the official Instagram account of Pakistani actor Feroze khan. He shared a picture with a caption asking what your scene is. In place of writing the word scene, he used the Urdu alphabet which has a similar pronunciation to the English word scene. The main post and the comments are presented below in table 4.7.

#### Table 4.7

Language	Vi	Visual		
English Ur	du Others Ei	mojis Image	Multi modal	
		Language V		

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a celebrity shared picture

	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
ferozekhan 🔮 - what's your س then ? #tourdefrance #dogmaf10				
1)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
Shahzada Bhai Hero 😂 😒 🔶 Kamal				
2)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
is so simple I'm سis so simple I'm browsing ur Instagram 🈂 👌				
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
pic m 😂				
4)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
koi app se sikhe 📥 👌 📥 📥				
5)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
shok hai lekin mere pass itni achi cycle Nahi hai				
6)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
bhai ap seat pr nai bethay				
7)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
hen mahi ki city me woooow amazing!!! LOVE YOU feroz khan # FK 🤨 🏵 🎔 🗣				
8)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Angle theek nhi lagraha.				
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
mujhy dy do bht acha Igta ha mujhy plz				
10)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
ම මේ මේ මේ				

This thread has the translingual strategy of going between the language as well as going beyond the language. The commenters have creatively interacted with the actor. The second commenter used the Urdu word '*seen*' like the main post which indicated that the commenter understood the question of the actor in the main post and the fourth commenter praised the ability of the actor to use Urdu in the caption innovatively which also indicates that the translanguaging of the actor's main post has facilitated the interaction. The seventh commenter used the name '*Farhad*' which also facilitated the interaction in such a way the actor Feroze khan's character name in the Pakistani drama Khuda Aur Mohabbat 3 is Farhad so it means that the commenter is Feroze khan's fan. The strategically different languages used by the actor have positively facilitated the interaction.

The following post is taken from the Instagram official account of Pakistani content creator Dananeer Mobeen who got famous due to her viral video in which she pronounced the word 'Party' as 'Pawri'. In the main post, she shared a video enjoying the 1 million followers on Instagram with her friends and family and in the caption of the video, she thanked her Instagram followers and used mixed English and Urdu sentences to convey her point. The post and comments are displayed below in table 4.8.

### Table 4.8

			Use o	f modes		
Post/Comments	Language			Vis		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal
dananeerr • 1 million pawril This post is dedicated to you, my beautiful Instagram family. here on this virtual platform and beyond. Alfaaz khatam hou chukay hen mere paas. dil kee gehraiyon say shukriya.	✓	$\checkmark$		✓		~
patore						

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a 1M followers post

1)	✓		$\checkmark$
Power Of " Pawri " 🎔 🤤 😂			
2)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$ $\checkmark$	
follow you because of talent ? But i guess people folloing you because of your "gori chamri", ultimately because of "tharak", in Pakistan its easy to get followers just you showed up gori chamri and got the attention			
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
sakta hai 🤣			
4)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
#pawrihoraihai @dananeerr ma'am sketch on my page everyone # @ 6			
5)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
bahtren edits & song choice			
6)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
bohot din din sy is video ka intzar me the			
7)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
kai log are the most hospitable ppl everrr			
8)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
hain ais ka ye mtlb to nahi hai k ap hain ais ka ye mtlb to nahi hai k ap humain draane lag jayn 😂 😂 😂			
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
This way last line 🕫 😵 Waha wah last line 🕫			
said "I am too focused to do CSS" Did she really mean it? I don't think so she would be able to crack it after all this fame.crack to door ki btattempt hi na 10)	√	*	

The followers of her Instagram account have praised as well as questioned her life choices by employing the translingual strategy of going beyond languages. The use of heart and heart eyes emoticons is by the commenters who have praised her like the first, third, fifth, and ninth commenters. The sixth commenter congratulated the content creator. The second commenter criticized the girl for not being talented and just fair-skinned. The term 'Gori chamri' is used by the commenter which means fair-skinned. The ninth commenter questioned her based on her interview reply and gave a view based on her understanding of the situation. The facilitation of interaction has taken place between the celebrity and fans, especially through the word '*Pawri*' created by the admin which enabled fans to express their likeness or disinterest toward the content creator Dananeer.

One such instance of translanguaging for the facilitation of interaction is taken from the official account of Pakistani content creator Shahveer Jafry. In the main post, he shared a picture of himself with his friends with the hashtag #humsaathsaathhainmoment and a caption related to a limousine ride for a domestic flight. Table 4.9 below shows the main post and the comments.

#### Table 4.9

A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on friends' trip post

			Use of	f modes		
	Languag	ge		Visual		
Post/Comments	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi
						modal
shahveerjay Streemely over the top! Took a limousine to a domestic flight! #HumSaathSaathHainMomemt	✓	✓			√	
1) case kesy hoskta hy⊜	√	✓		✓		

2) where's sundas?? mein  $\checkmark$  $\checkmark$ wait kr rhi thi turkey ki sarkon pr bethy huy Honest hour podcast ka 😣 😣 3) Luv u bhai... Plz vlawg bna de ... ~  $\checkmark$ Missing badly with wolfcrew 🥴 🥴 🤎 4) Hashir bechara pic le raha he 5) @saimaaakhan aisay tour jana ha yr plan kro 😂 6)  $\checkmark$ 🛢 Is me bathroom hy 🤣 🤣 7)  $\checkmark$ 1 @hammad.urrehman.0927 sundas family doesn't allow her to leave the house after maghrib namaz, she must come back come before maghrib namaz so she can't go to any trip 8)  $\checkmark$  $\checkmark$ @arsa\_nizamani with out sundus this kitna suhna suhna lag RAHa hai 📵 📵 😳 9)  $\checkmark$ @itsmasirah she need to come back home before maghrib 😂  $\checkmark$ 10)~ More like Hum sath aaaath hain!

The comment section is filled with creative and funny takes on the Instagram influencer's picture of the trip with his friends. The translingual strategy of going beyond languages is majorly utilized by the commenters. The first commenter noticed that the girl in the group has the smallest suitcase in the group picture. The use of the laughing emoticon is to indicate the funny observation of the commenter. Commenters 2,7,8 and 9 seem to be the old followers of the Instagram influencer because they have pointed out that the girl

Sundus is missing who is part of their group. They have also used sad face emoticons for her not being in the group picture. The ninth commenter has a witty reply for the people who are missing Sundus that Sundus needs to go back home before Maghrib which indicates that Sundus' parents are strict. The funny emoticons are used by many commenters to show that comments are in a little mood like in comments 1,3,5,6 and 9. The mode of translanguaging, in this case, is emoticons which facilitated the communication in such a way that they indicated that the comments are funny and meant to be taken as light instead of serious about them but the initiation of interaction started due to an image whose context is provided by the caption.

Data collected from Twitter and YouTube do not contain any celebrity and fan interaction. This is the reason why no data from Twitter and YouTube is included in this subtheme.

#### **4.1.2.** Promotional interaction

Before social media, Radio spot advertisements were used which did very well in the past era of the marketing world. Television advertisements were also used for the same purpose. But now after the popularity of social media, it is used as a tool for promotion. Through social media, users can easily participate, share, and create any content such as banners, posters, videos, and advertisements Many companies use these social media as a tool to promote their products and make customers aware of their brand (Tritama & Tarigan, 2016).

The first post from Facebook shows the facilitation of interaction for the promotion of a brand which is taken from the official page of Jazz - a Pakistani mobile network. The post is giving information related to the offer of Jazz to watch PSL matches on mobile. The information is given by using the translanguaging strategies of going between the languages and going beyond languages in the post. The main post and the comments are displayed below in table 4.10.

#### **Table 4.10**

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Jazz network offer

	Ose of modes						
	Ī	anguag	ge	Vis	ual		
Post/Comments	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal	
Jazz ⊘ February 19 • ℚ • ✿ PSL aa raha hai live aap ki phone screens per! 🏏	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Stream live matches anywhere anytime only on Jazz TV: 1) Yara tum log phly Internet ka pakage bht ala tha Ab to sirf time pass wali bat ha	$\checkmark$	✓					
2) Jazz tv is please request geo super free karo	✓	✓					
3) Ya ptv sport or ptv nations free karo	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
4) Mr jazz ek bar ookla walon ko bula k public k samne zong ke speed k sath compare karo tumhen lag pata jai ga speed kise kehte hain jhoote logo tum per lanat tumhari speed zong k age ate main namak baraber bhe nahin r ookla per meri taraf se special lanat	✓	✓					
) Jazz other network call package 1 day btadain	$\checkmark$	✓					
6) have been using Mobilink since 2002 and never changed my network and always loved my 0300 number but now seriously im compelled to say that Mobilink sucks!! AND IS ONE OF THE BIGGEST CHOR NETWORK!!!	✓	✓		✓			
7) I love jazz 🧡	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$			
8)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
HD quality q nhe aa rhy ab PSL mn ki sy msia hy	$\checkmark$	✓					
10) Mobilink ka sabsay sasta 3g package kia hay weekly wala ? And isko speed slow kyon hoti hay even in islamabad	✓	$\checkmark$					

Use of modes

The analysis of this thread indicates that the use of an emoticon of bat and ball with the English word 'Phone screen' and an Urdu sentence starting from the word PSL facilitated the interaction for the promotion of Jazz tv. In such a way that the translingual strategy of going between languages is utilized by the commenters to convey their views related to Jazz Network. This pattern is also visible in the main post. Commenters have requested as well as complained about the Jazz network which has given the news about its live-streaming offer. The second and third commenters have used the term '*free karo*' in which *free* is an English word and *Karo* is an Urdu word for requesting free online streaming of sports channel. It also facilitated the interaction because the more the same type of requests are conveyed to the network, the more it will work for making the system work better. The fourth and sixth commenters have a complaint about the Jazz network by using Urdu sentences like *namak baraber bhi nahi* and the Urdu word *Chor* (Thief) with English, and Emoticon which indicated that a similar message is being conveyed by using two different translanguaging strategies like going between the language and beyond the language.

One such instance is also seen on the official page of Atif Aslam. The post is given in table 4.11 along with the comments.

## **Table 4.11**

		Use of	modes		
I	Languag	e	Vis	ual	
English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal
✓	✓		~		
✓		$\checkmark$			
✓	✓		✓		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		✓		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
✓	✓		✓		
			Language	Language Vis	Language Visual

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Song



For the promotion of the song, the celebrity used only the title of the music video 'Raat' (Night) in Urdu, expressed the emotion attached to the word, and, also used his image. This strategy of going between languages as well as beyond languages facilitated the interaction in such a way that commenters have also expressed their feelings related to night. Few of them are employing the translingual strategy of going between languages like comments 1,3,4,5 and 10 associating night to Atif Aslam songs in the main post raat or his other famous songs like *aadat, who lamhe,tere bin,tu jaane na, meri kahani,tere sang yaara*. All of these famous songs have titles in the Urdu language. The majority of the commenters have talked about a night with the translingual strategy of going beyond languages by inserting different emoticons. The main post and the other communicators on the post have associated the concept of night differently but it is all centered on the songs of the singer Atif Aslam.

The following post which depicts the facilitation of interaction through translingual communication is from the official page of Pakistani actress Mahira khan. She has shared the link to the movie poster teaser produced by her along with the visual poster of the movie with her Facebook page followers. In the main post, she utilized both translingual strategies like above the given link, she interacted with her followers by mentioning that the actors in the poster are all her champions and also used 12 emoticons of medals for her champions. She has also words like *Barwaan khiladi* which means twelfth sportsman and it is also the title of the movie. *Inshaa Allah* is an Arabic phrase that means 'as God will'. The phrase was used for indicating the surety that the proper teaser would come later at 8 pm. The post and the comments are given below in table 4.12.

	Use of modes							
	L	anguag	e	Vis				
Post/Comments	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal		
Mahira Khan Churay 10 Chur	✓	✓	✓	✓	√	✓		
Ye sastay actors BABAR AZAM bannay ki Koshish Q $1$ kartay hai.	√ √	✓		√				
2) <sup>shahveer</sup> jafry 🔮 3)	✓			✓				
You are great multitalented superstar 😳 😳 😲 🔮 🧕								
You can do it						✓		
) Mashallah 😫			$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
) 	✓	✓						
Barwaan to Spare hota hai 11 khailtay hain 7) Barween khiladi next. Hanji Mahira!	<b>√</b>	✓						
8) Woow intersting ở ở	V			$\checkmark$				
	✓	$\checkmark$						
Kya Ap Ko bhi Circket ka shok he 10)	✓	$\checkmark$						
Can't wait for Bharwa Khiladi !								

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a movie teaser

the term is used in various comments such as comments 6,7 and 10. By seeing the poster, some commenters have also used the translingual strategy of going beyond the languages,

for instance, the first commenter has seen a similarity between Babar Azam who is captain of the present Pakistani cricket team. The person has expressed displeasure by using the term '*sastay*' (cheap) for the actors in the poster and the second commenter has shown love for one of the actors in the movie by mentioning his name next to the emoticon with heart eyes. Commenters on the thread employed the translingual strategy of going between languages by using English and Arabic terms to express their excitement like *MashaAllah* by comment 5, wow interesting by comment 8, and can't wait by comment 10. The third and fourth commenter shared their love for the actress Mahira khan by using an emoticon with an English praising sentence and Gif in which the girl is showing her muscular strength with the caption 'You can do it. It showed the facilitation of interaction was not only based on the popularity of the actress but the translingual strategy of using an Urdu term with the poster has helped the users to interact and convey their feelings attached to the movie poster.

Translingual communication is also indicated in the Instagram data which facilitated the interaction. The first example from Instagram which revealed the facilitation of the interaction is taken from the post of Pakistani TikToker Rabecca khan. In the main post, she promoted her song 'Party wali night'. The song title is itself translingual with a mix of Urdu and English. The main post and the comments are in table 4.13.

#### **Table 4.13**

Post/Comments	Ī	anguag	e	Vis	ual		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal	
with "Party Wali Night" ♥ ● first time in PArty Wali Night" ♥ ● first time in PAKISTAN Comment your excitement level for the song guys! Are you ready for 23rd February? Singer: @rabeecakhan Releasing on Rabeeca's Youtube Channel!♥	✓	✓		$\checkmark$			
Cocomo ki add jaisa	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
1) gaana banaaya ha							
again fan to hote pagal hai nasir khan jan ke hy dekho bura karte hai tabhy millions like hai eslye log sirf fun me 2 gana sun rahe hai awaz se leker lyrics sory buhot ghatya hai	✓	✓					

Use of modes

A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a Song Promotion

main sau bar sunayen my favourite bro	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
4) singer SAB FAKE	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
singer p lanat. Has has k halat buri 5)hogai 😂 😂 😂	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
6) 😌	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
7)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
suna btw 😂 🖤	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
9) anthem hai	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
10) Kammmili ka song 😚 😚 👷	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓	

The analysis of the thread shows that comments are following a similar pattern of mixing Urdu and English languages like the main post which is going between the languages. The admin has also used going beyond the language strategy but it is the going between the language which facilitated the interaction. The main post is about the promotion of the song so the commenters have expressed their like and dislike for the song by using translanguaging. The first commenter has found similarities between the biscuit Cocomo's advertisement with the song. It also creates facilitation in such a way that the person who has seen the advertisement of the product Cocomo can understand that the commenter has liked or disliked the song. The commenter indirectly mocked the song to be childish because the product Cocomo's basic target is children. The usage of the words bura (Bad), ghatya (Cheap), fake, and lanat (Swear word for damn) in comments 2,4,5 and 8 have facilitated the interaction in such a way that it made the others aware that the commenters have not liked the song which is being promoted by the Tiktoker Rabecca khan. Similarly, some commenters have used the words *favorite* and *kamal* (Perfection) in comments 3 and 10 which indicate their likeness to the song. The Sixth and seventh commenters have used the word 'Pawri' in place of the party word used by the Tiktoker Rabecca which also facilitated the communication because it is a famous video meme even though both comments are mocking the singer but different emoticons are used to express mocking. The ninth commenter has compared the song with Pakistan super league (PSL) 6 anthem. The comparison has created the facilitation of communication because PSL 6 anthem is criticized by the people and if it is better than the promoted song then it means

that the promoted song is not liked by the commenter at all. The commenters have used going between the strategy for conveying their reaction but at the same time going beyond language strategy is also used mainly for emphasizing their views.

The next Instagram post which demonstrated the facilitation of interaction is taken from the official account of Pakistani celebrity Sajal Ali who has shared her picture with the Urdu written caption *'cross stitch'*. Cross stitch is a Pakistan Women's clothing brand that is promoted by the clothes worn by the actress in the picture. The main post and the comments are in table 4.14 below.

#### **Table 4.14**

Post/Comments	Use of modes							
	I	Languag	je	Vis				
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal		
sajalaly کروسس سنج که sajalaly کروسس سنج که ۲۵۰۰ ۱2w	✓	✓		✓	✓			
1) You know that the most	✓	√						
beautiful and the best of all the acting roles, the act of being a "تواسي" to you looks beautiful on you. 2)	$\checkmark$	✓	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
MashaAllah 3)	$\checkmark$	√		$\checkmark$				
Jan Y Y Cute Iag rahi ho 4) Sajal ap zada zda pictures post kiya Karyn me meri sari dps khatam ho gain hain main sari Iaga	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
li hain apki pics. Plzzzzzzzzzzzzzzzzz grant my request 5) Comparison () ya kya tha actors hain	√	✓		✓				
jin ban k b pyra lgta 😂 😂 6) @ghanwamalik02_react	<b>√</b>	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
krty hwy ap e ja khyal aya thabut ap l react us sy b pehly aya hwa tha 🔮 🌳 7)	<b>√</b>	✓		$\checkmark$				
un do hoʻgaye hain. Lovely picturë though as always 8) urdu ka cross mein aik urdu ka cross mein aik	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						

A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a brand promotion post

9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
kb dein gi sajal ? I really want to s your couple in any interview		
10)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
chlye apka	ma ana	

The use of a picture along with the caption helped facilitate the interaction in a way that the strategy of translanguaging which is going beyond languages in the form of the use of emoticons with the English and Urdu languages utilized like the heart and heart eyes used by various commenters like 2,3,6 and 7 indicate their love for the Pakistani celebrity. The words like *Phool, Masha Allah, cute, pyara,* and *lovely picture* used for complimenting the actress in comments 2,3,5, and 7 also show the use of the translingual strategy of going between languages. The brand received attention from commenters due to the picture of the celebrity wearing the clothing brand.

Instagram data also shows a similar strategy of translanguaging in the post which is taken from Zara Noor Abbas' official Instagram account. Zara Noor is a famous Pakistani actress who has shared her picture in which she is wearing silver jewelry with the caption asking about the right time for wearing Chaandi (silver) jewelry again and she answered Always and tagged the Jewelry designer Samreen Vance. The Instagram post along with the comments on the thread is displayed in Table 4.15.

#### **Table 4.15**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	]	Languag	je	Vis			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal	
Zaranoorabbas.official ♀ Is it time to wear Chaandi jewellery yet again? ALWAYS!! ♥ @samreenvance	√	✓		✓	✓		
	,	<i>,</i>					
1) eids picture Shukr hai, you posted $_{\odot}$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
pehen ke pic leti to qayamat lagti but ajase mein kuch Accha nhi lag rha hai mam buy the way looking ossm 🍝 a	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a silver jewelry post

Without make up ap bht cute lagte hainbut ab bht ajeeb lag rahe ho etni over make up na kiya kro 3) dear.	√	$\checkmark$		
4)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
effects				
5)	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
Mashallah My Haseena!				
6)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
<b>Galify (Galify Control</b> ) Itny qareeb sy pic. Dara deya. Aitbar uth geya aj sy <b>⊜</b> ⊜				
7)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Chhh ye kia bna dia he ap ne khud se not looking good yaar				
8)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
Eyebrow krwa lati 🙄 💍				
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
ka aap ka plan hai kya 🔉 🙊				
10) 🕫 😌 😇 lakin ya pic ni achi aye but in real you are gorgeous 😴 🍯 👌	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$

The comments on the thread are related to the picture shared by the Instagram influencer. The commenters have used the translingual strategy of going beyond languages i.e.; different emoticons to convey their thoughts associated with the post. The emoticons of fire, ok gesture, laughing, eyes up, see no evil monkey, and heart eyes are used by commenters 2,6,8,9, and 10. The second commenter gave a compliment to the actress and thinks that the actress should have just used the jewelry for looking good. The Hindi word 'Kewal' which means 'just' is also used by the same user along with 'ok gesture' and the fire emoticon. The sixth commenter used laugh emoticons to mock the way the actress has taken the picture. The eighth commenter thinks that the actress should have done her eyebrows and the same user has used the eyes up emotion which has various meanings like disdain, playful, resentful, and disapproval but here most likely it is used for showing disapproval of the picture shared by the influencer. The ninth commenter creatively used the mixed Urdu and English sentence with seeing no evil monkey emoticon. The comment can be taken as a sarcastic take on the picture or can be taken as a compliment to the actress. The tenth commenter praised the actress for her looks but also conveyed that the picture of the actress has not come out well. The fire and heart-eyed emoticons are used by the user to show love for the actress. Some commenters complimented the actress by using the translingual strategy of going between languages like cute, Mashaa Allah, and haseena words used in comments 3 and 5. The translingual strategy of the post maker i.e.; sharing the picture with a caption has helped commenters to articulate their views related to the

actress' picture. All the compliments and criticism helped in the promotion of the jewelry brand.

The following post is taken from the official account of famous Pakistani celebrity Mahira khan who is a producer of the movie Baarwan Khiladi. The main post is the promotion of the movie with the poster which has two actors in sports uniforms. A similar post was shared by her on Facebook but the difference is that she used a different poster and emoticons in this post than in the previous post. The post and the comments are given below in table 4.16.

#### **Table 4.16**

Post/Comments	L	anguag	ge in the second s	Vis		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal
mahirahkhan 🗢 Introducing the khilaris of BK 🚳	,	,		,	,	
Danyal Zafar	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
Realized and the second						
1) ye shahveer varun	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
dhawan ki sasiti copy ise acting ka A bh nh aata hy, dont know pakistan m why looks so important k bs kuch bh, ise chance cheena jarha hy, atleast you shouldnt promote nepo things, ya bs bahir ki nationality ki wja se hum itne gir gae hen, this is such a short cut for not living in pakistan and i can have any pr for my son as well, but this is such a loser act if i il ever ty that.	✓	✓				
3)						
khilari with an R. If this isn't an Indian production, why is it trying to spell it khiladi with a D??	$\checkmark$	✓				
4)						
I was wondering barwaan kya chez hai.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
5)						
famous 👎						
6)						
Caption m "Khilari" likha bcz "khiladi" is not our wordMy comment might seem unimportant to u but trust meit language matters alot	√	~		✓		
7)						
tumhary crush ki debut film ari	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				

A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a movie poster

Aacha teaser he per kys faida se i am from India or aap log Pakistan ki movie kahi per bhi upicad kaha kert te ho se Maama ap to bohot bada naam ho Urdu Film Industry ka aap ki zimmedaari he ki Urdu film industry puri Duniya me ki Urdu film industry puri Duniya me ki Urdu film andustry puri Duniya me ker ne se bohot bada faida hoga Urdu film industry ko ma'am India me jese log Urdu Darama ko kitna pasand ker te karenge aap log upioad to karo movie theatre Mein release hone ke 1 Ya 2 mointe May You Tube per upioad kar dia the piease ma'am i am big FAN of moviese piease aap ker sakte ho se piease	✓	~	•	~	
goor kerna please 🎝 ma'am aager aap 9) ker sako to kerna please	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
10) khandaan actor r hum 😌 😂	~	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	

The translingual strategy of going beyond languages is used in this thread in which different emoticons are used by commenters to convey their thoughts related to the poster like in comments 1,4,5,6,8,9 and 10. The first commenter talked about the similarity between the actor in the poster with his famous brother in the Pakistani industry. The usage of a funny emoticon indicates that the comment is for comic relief. The fourth commenter used the facepalm emoticon for having confusion related to the title of the movie and the tenth commenter expresses sadness by using a sad emoticon on the nepotism in the industry. The translingual strategy has facilitated commenters in conveying their views and in return, comments helped the admin to understand the type of feedback the movie will receive upon its release.

The facilitation of the interaction is also evident on Twitter. A few such examples are found in the Twitter trend of the Kisan (Farmer) card which is a scheme initiated by the Prime minister of Pakistan Imran khan and this farmer scheme trended on Twitter in Pakistan on 26<sup>th</sup> April 2021. The people gave views as well as promoted this scheme in the tweets which facilitated interaction in such a way that the information, as well as response to the scheme of the farmer card, was conveyed. The translingual tweets and the trended topic are displayed in table 4.17 below.

#### **Table 4.17**

A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on a Kisan card trend

		Use of modes				
	I	Languag	e	Vis	ual	
<b>Trend/Comments</b>	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi

Kisan Card	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
1)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
so then who saved <b>Pakistan</b> from bankruptcy, covid? who gave befitting reply to Indian attack, and also diplomatically. Who is running Ehsas program, panahgaah? Who is building 2 biggest dam in last 60 years? who gave health <b>card, kisan card</b> ? who is bringing agriculture reform?					
2)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
@ImranKhanPTI @Hammad_Azhar @MuradSaeedPTI kisan card,ahsas kafalt, apni car, ye 3 scheme jo di gai pichly kch din mei. Ye <b>pakistan</b> ki iareekh ki behtreen schemes hain. Ap chk kijy jis din kisan card launch kia us rat media pe tareen ko SMQ ne kya kaha is pr progrm ho rhy thy 💄					
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
@PakPMO Kia pakistan main sirf 2hi province hain jaha pe har cheez waqat se pahele mil jati hai sehat card bhi waha diya kisan card bhi waha dia metro bus metro train langar khane. Bhai sindh or balochistan bhi to pakistan main hain.					
r / Sir . Agar dekha jaye to Ppp nay logo ko faqeer banany ki bharpoor koshiah ki	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
hai. Jeaya k bin income support c . Kisan Ioan . Zakat card. And now they saying about Kisan card. Rc. etc. Pieze doort think your self only think about <b>Pakistan</b>	·				
Sir shebaz sharif don't have ideal team either as compared to Usman buzdar but I guess couple of his steps will give them different results <b>Kisan card</b> which will target @ more than 65% more or less.Incaf <b>card</b> and naya () <b>Pakistan</b> housing will pay IK back big time mark it.Sir thanks	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf Government's Initiative of Kisan Card will transform Pakistan. موست_حومت	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
RVoteDaKaptaan     At the behest of the Prime Minister, the present provincial government is     taking various measures for the betterment of the poor, including schemes     like Health Card Plus and Kisan Card.     @FrontlinersFK	✓	✓			
Kisan (farmer) Card is a step in moving towards modern agriculture and					
would "transform and change" <b>Pakistan</b> . #کسان_دوست_حکومت	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
) ncredible numbers for Sehat <b>Card</b> in KP. Ehsaas, Housing \$	Scł 🗸	1			
<b>Gisan Card</b> are, and will be programs with remarkable resul When we hear Imran Khan did nothing, then we should also		·			
hese massive changes.					
#PMIK_MultanPackage					
rom Ehsaas for weaker segments of society to Kamyab Jawan for young entrepreneurs, we now move to <b>Kisan Card</b> for farmers. These initiatives have the potential to transform <b>Pakistan</b> . They will go a long way in mplementing PM's vision of Naya <b>Pakistan</b> .	✓	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
And the second s					
A closer analysis of the tweets shows that the trending topic is itself translingual and Urdu and English are used as the mode of translanguaging by the tweeters through which the *Kisan card* is praised and promoted by Pakistani Twitter users. The innovative way of using translanguaging strategy, especially going between languages to facilitate interaction is shown by the first tweet in which the tweeter has used questions related to all government schemes, which indirectly points out that the government has taken good initiatives and the second tweet has endorsed the same thing. The tenth tweet used an image of a Kisan card along with mentioning other government relief schemes. Other tweeters have also promoted the government's public relief schemes like the *Sehat card, and Ehsas program* in tweets 6,7,8, and 9 through a translingual strategy of going between languages which shows that the Twitter trend has created facilitation of interaction.

A similar instance can be seen in the trend #EmergingNayaPakistan started on Twitter on 25<sup>th</sup> May 2021. The trend is related to the performance of the government of Pakistan which is given below along with tweets in table 4.18.

#### **Table 4.18**

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
#EmergingNayaPakistan	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
1) The volume of trade in Karachi stock exchange is at its highest ever in the history of Pakistan today. This is Naya Pakistan <b>(2</b> Alhamdulillah. <b>#EmergingNayaPakistan</b>	✓	✓		✓				
No one Sklastaltaut nght now Øklastaltaut nght now #PMIK.Lsyyathackage //EmergingNayaPakistan	~					✓		

A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on New Pakistan Trend



The tweeters have majorly employed the translingual strategy of going beyond languages in the form of emoticons as well as images and gifs to highlight the performance of Pakistan's ruling party Pakistan Tehreek I Insaf (PTI). The usage of the Pakistani flag emoticon has facilitated the interaction based upon positive results of the government's efforts like in ttweets1,3,4,7 and 8. The tweeters have used Prime minister Imran khan's pictures as well as his posters for the facilitation of conveying their thoughts to others who share similarly positive views of the Prime minister such as in tweets 3,6 and 9. Policies of the government are discussed by using government planning posters and the product form of the planning of government for instance tweets 9 and 10. The second tweeter used the gif of the character felonious Gru from the animated movie Despicable me, in which the character is doing a celebratory dance, and also tagged the Pakistani journalist Rauf Klasra who has predicted good governance of Prime minister Imran khan. The thread indicated that the use of emoticons, gifs, and images facilitated the interaction between the commenters who have positive views related to the Prime minister of Pakistan and his political party governance.

No YouTube data related to this subtheme was trending during the research. Therefore, no data from YouTube was added to this section.

#### **4.1.3 Interest-based interaction**

Social networking websites allow their users to perform interactive activities which were earlier done by people physically meeting each other. One of the fundamental features of these sites is that it helps users which have similar interest (Wang,2013)

Facebook data give evidence that translanguaging facilitates interaction between people having similar interests. The first example of it is taken from the Facebook page 'Pakistan cricket team' which is shown below in Table 4.19.

#### **Table 4.19**

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistan cricket post

Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi

Use of modes

#### modal



In the main post, the admin used the strategy of going beyond language by using the emoticons of Pakistani and England flags to talk about the Pakistan and England match and also used pictures to highlight which match they were talking about which facilitated the interaction of the admin with the commenters. The commenters on the post have used different visuals to communicate their thoughts about this big moment in Pakistan cricket. They have mostly utilized the strategy of going beyond the languages but at times have also used the going between languages strategy. Laughing emoticons and gifs are used in comments 3,5, and 6 which facilitated the interaction because the Pakistani cricket team is known for making every match thrilling and they are amazed that the Pakistani cricket team was like that even back in 1 984. Again, in comment 8 emoticon is used to convey the same thing. The ninth commenter shared the meme of Sarfaraz Ahmed who was the captain of the Pakistani team in the 2019 world cup and his yawning moment in the match became a famous meme.

The commenter facilitated the interaction because it showed that Pakistani cricketers are not fit physically that's why they lose. In reply to this comment, the other commenter has used the gif of the Pakistani flag which means that the commenter loves Pakistan no matter how the team performs. The thread showed that commenters, as well as admin, have a similar interest in cricket and the usage of different modes of translanguaging like emoticons, images, and Gif facilitated the interaction between them.

The second example from Facebook is taken from the same Facebook page 'Pakistan cricket team'. The page operator has given the link to the Pakistan and South Africa match in which Fawad Alam scored 100 which is indicated by the 100 number emoticon along with the Urdu sentence '*Har haal main cricket*' as a hashtag. Table 4.20 has shown the main post and the comments on the post.

#### **Table 4.20**

			Use of	modes		
Post/Comments	L	Language			Visual	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
Pakistan Cricket Team O	1				/	
SIXIII Fawad Alam brings up his 100 h	v	V			V	

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Cricketer Century post

✓		

~



Congratulations to Fawad Alam for completing century, this is slap on those who were not allowing him to play, 1) now Fawad can proudly say to them "Kaisa Dia"? "

### 2)

9) diye

Fawwad Alam be like yeh mera city hai or main yahan ka Jaikaant Shikray. Well deserved century by Fawwad Alam in extreme pressure condition. #TeamPakistan #PakVsSA #FawwadAlam Well played Fawad Alam, job half done carry on to help Pakistan get a good lead so that we can put SA under pressure in 2nd innings to win this test Insha Allah. 4)

# This is Pakistan deserving palyers not playing parchi aur friends players like Shan Masood Abid Ali haris Sohail are playing without any big performance since years and years and getting eraned to many money and also sharing to their supporter who support them in team and PCB chairman and official and management are involved in this type of thing peoples of cricket loving Pakistan must came out to digout those official and management who support them and so again like this palyers other should not do same kind of treatment like fawad did any failure aur Prachi players must has to described so that they forced to dropped Prachi players. 5)

After scoring another ton Fawad be like 😋 EMES and the ACHAR BANA LO TECHNIQUE KA

## Pcb shame on you wasted his 8years and now he is able

6) to say kesa dia?

<b>WING</b>	
	· ·
7)	ļ
The kinda temperament & JOSH he shows for his country is remarkable His salute after scoring 100 is actually a tight slap on selectors & PCB who ignored such a gem for decades Hats off to you man	y 🗸

~ ~

~

~

- √  $\checkmark$
- ~
- 1

- Misbah and pcb per lanet... Player ke 10 saal waste Kar
- Well-done pcb and management who destroyed his career now Alhamdulillah he is performing on his behalf

The comments on the thread of the post have used memes, emoticons, and images along with Urdu and English terms related to cricket to interact and express their views based on the Video of the live match link. Commenters used both translingual strategies i.e.; the strategy of going between languages and going beyond languages. People on the thread have commented on the lack of attention given to the player by the Pakistan cricket board (PCB) in comments 1,2,6,8,9 and 10. Commenters 1 and 6 have used Urdu sentences like *Kaisa dia* which is a meme in Pakistan based on Aamir Liaquat who is a Pakistani host and politician. The fifth commenter has used an image mocking the haters of Fawad Alam who used to find faults in his batting technique and the second commenter has used the dialogue of Singham for Fawad Alam with a few changes like in place of 'village', City is used. Few cricket lovers on the post have used the term '*Parchi*' for other players which means chit of paper in Urdu but in Pakistani cricket, it is the word that is associated with cricket players who are selected based on nepotism like in comment 4. Translanguaging has helped cricket fans to interact in the context of which is provided by the picture and emoticons used for showing excitement for the cricketer Fawad Alam.

Instagram data related to this subtheme was not available but Twitter provides people to interact based on similar interests. Such an example is taken from the trend #CryptoKoRegulateKaro started on 22<sup>nd</sup> May 2021 on Twitter after Pakistani television host and activist Waqar Zaka claimed in his tweet that Pakistan needs cryptocurrency. The tweets on the trend facilitated the tweeters to interact with the Waqar Zaka and understand cryptocurrency which is given in table 4.21 below.

#### **Table 4.21**

Trend/Comments	Use of modes								
	Language			Vis					
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal			
#CryptoKoRegulateKaro	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$							
#CryptokoRegulateKaro Mr. @2akaWagar just 1 question imare crypto currencies halal? And how can we use such imaginary thing as currency whose value depends pupons tweets of billionaries?? But point of Halal and Haran is most important	✓		✓						

A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on the Crypto Currency trend

Bank se deposit withdraw do ~ Give A Chance to @ZakaWaqar. @FinMinistryPak @ImranKhanPTI #CryptoKoRegulateKaro 2) 3) Karo yar regulate, this is really important source of finance for the economy, Pakistan is missing out and will regret in future. #CryptoKoRegulateKaro #PakistanRegulateCrypto #Cryptokoregulatekaro @StateRank Pak @FinMinistryPak @ZakaWaga Allow buying and selling of crypto from local bank of Pakistan to earn #halalmoney. Because government has failed to give us jobs and all basics 4) need so let us earn by our on using technology. We are with you sir @ZakaWagar insha Allah one soon we will achieve for what you scarify alot. You are real hero and teacher for this nation. Sir 5) @ImranKhanPTI kindly idhr be nigahe karam #cryptoKoRegulateKaro 6) Listen To Waqar what he is saying 7) I think our banks and all those who wants to ban cryptocurrency love this SUUDI NIZAM thats why they want this spoiled system reather then Suud free system ranKhanPTI @FinMinistryPak #CryptoKoRegulateKaro 8) ~ #CryptoKoRegulateKaro @ImranKhanPTI we need money to save Muslim ummah We are crypto traders and earning a good amount, so government should pport us to bring Lakshmi/Paisa in Pak. So @ImranKhanPTI plz ispe thori 9) nazarsaani karen aur bank se crypto purchasing Allow karwanden. 't have any plan. Please do listen to @ZakaV

10)

The Twitter trend is itself translingual and the Pakistani tweeters have innovatively used the topic of the trend to facilitate interaction. The mode of translanguaging is not just two languages Urdu and English but the tweeters have also used Arabic terms to communicate with other tweeters. For instance, the first tweet shows the usage of the terms *halal* (Permissible) or *haram* (Forbidden), and the fourth tweeter also used the term *halal* which facilitated the interaction because both of them are related to the Islamic banking system of Pakistan. One tweeter has also employed the translingual strategy of going beyond languages by using an image from an Indian movie *Hera Pheri* where the main leads were talking about money issues. Terms like *halal*, *suudi nizam(administrated interest)*, *Inshaa Allah*, and *Muslim ummah* are used by Pakistani tweeters to interact with the

Islamic banking system. So translanguaging facilitated their interaction and it also reveals their interest in knowing about cryptocurrency.

Translanguaging is also observed in the topic #ExamsCancelKaro which trended on 6<sup>th</sup> April 2021 on Twitter in Pakistan in which students protested for giving exams. The tweets are mixing English and Urdu languages to express their views about exam cancelation. The trended topic and tweets are displayed in table 4.22 below.

#### **Table 4.22**

 $\label{eq:approx} A \ thread \ from \ Twitter \ showing \ translanguaging \ on \ an \ Exam \ cancellation \ Trend$ 

	Use of modes							
Trend/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis				
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	Multi modal		
#ExamsCancelKaro	✓	✓						
I strongly condemn students' un-necessary demand of #ExamsCancelKaro However they can demand #ExampDeprovement	√	√						
Isupport     Isupport     StayStrongShafqatMehmood Bs govt ko blame kro hr baat k liye. Daily bazaron main sb se zyada youth corona SOPs violate kr hew phr rhe hote hain & when it comes to their exams, sb ko corona yad ajata hai     @Shafqat_Mahmood     #examscancelkaro #ExamCancelHoga #CancelExamsSaveStudents	✓	✓						
2) #CANCEL12THBOARDDXAM2021 #ExamsCancelKaro #waxy b apko ko karona hai#uncte Shafqat Mahmood © : @Shafqat_Mahmood	✓	✓						
<ul> <li>a) In ave tested positive for coronavirus. I feel fine with mild symptoms. InshAllah will get well soon.</li> <li>a) 4)</li> <li>b) 4)</li> <li>c) 4)</li> </ul>	V	√						
© Shafqat_Mahmaad sir humara Lia maslah cavid-19 nahi hai Humara Lia maslah humari tayari hai humara caurse hai jo na camplete hai or na humari tayari You wili no ge weli sooi inshaha @Shafqat Mahmod tum na jo sudents kay sah kiya hai tumbay Allah puchay ga abhi bhi time hai cancel kardo exams plz @CancelEramSaveStudents @cancelBoardecams #ExamitatioNvershall #CancelStares	✓	√						
5) **ExamiHuaTohVoteNahi #ExamsCancelKaro         Shafqat Uncle agr ap ko Corona ho sakta ha to hum bacho ki life ka saath q khel rahay ho??         Sir G kuch to khayal karay %         6) Pit #ExamsCancelKaro @	√	✓		✓				
@Shafgat, Mahmood puttin our lives on risk and khud innay sops k baad bhi           corona horge haster         #ExamsCancelKaro           #ShafgatMahmood         #ShafgatMahmood           #McOConceleram         #McOConceleram	$\checkmark$	√		$\checkmark$				



Tweets are mostly tagging the Federal minister of education of Pakistan, Shafqat Mehmood who also tested positive during the trend of cancelation of exams on Twitter. The tweets directed towards Shafqat Mehmood highlighted the fact that if he can get corona so can the students. Different images are used to convey views on exam-related issues. The eighth tweeter used a sad dog image in which the reflection of the dog is smirking with the caption wishing Shafqat Mehmood all the best of luck for his health and also wrote that the tweeter is sad after hearing the news but the image has expressed that the person is lying, in fact, the person is happy to hear the news because Shafqat Mehmood was not canceling the exams. The ninth tweeter has used the animated picture in which words no exam is written with animated people pictures. The tweeter has given his stance on the trended topic by using the image. The third tweeter used a famous meme from the Indian movie Hungama to talk about the situation of the students and the caption indicates that the tweeter is also a student. The first tweet has a different opinion of the trended hashtag and gave suggestions to the students trended in support of the trended topic to use #Delaykaro as a hashtag instead of #Cancelkaro. The second tweet is against the cancelation of the exams and gives the reason that students are using corona as an excuse to avoid exams. So, two types of interest are shown by using translanguaging; one is the cancelation of exams and the other is the delaying of the exams.

Translanguaging is also visible in the YouTube data. One such display is seen in the YouTube video trended on 3<sup>rd</sup> April 2021. It is a music video that is sung by Asim

Azhar, Talha Anjum and Talhah Yunus. It is Pakistani rap music with mixed Urdu and English rap. Table 4.23 shows the main post and comments.

#### **Table 4.23**

A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a Pakistani rap music

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	L	anguage	9	Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
Had been Table from Table from (Pitric) from (14)	•	v				✓		
YAAD - Asim Azhar   Talha Anjum   Talhah Yunus (Official Music Video)								
<ol> <li>"Tere Bin Eid nai Eid, Chehra nai Qaabli e deed"</li> <li>"Chehray pe fikar hai wazeh, tu chehray ko parhna tou seekh" My Man Anjum never Goes Easy new filter</li> </ol>	✓	✓		✓				
2)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
Gawah mera Asim hai duniya se azeez 🗭 Lines are just next level								
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
"You played me han theek hay , ill be over you by the weekend" this line is strongest and more meaningful after that " baal baah bach gya" by asim <b>@ @ @ @ # Reamasim X @</b>								
4) Ek number 👌 GoodJob Guys 🌖	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
5) Level <b># 6</b>	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$				
Baal baal bach gaye இ இ 6) Such a magical voice ♥♥	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
Gaze's combo of you three guy's, love this song, nice combination 🌒 please make more sons to 7) gather. Awsome lyncs and I'm playing this song every night mis someone	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
8) Asim ki acting, Anjum ki bars aur Yunus ka flow. This is a fuckin masterpiece 🕴	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
<ul> <li>(9) 'Gumaan' and 'Yaad' ! Cant get over these two master pieces</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
10) Talha Anjum's screen presence is 💯	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$				

The commenters have used the translingual strategy of going beyond languages by mentioning different lyrics of the song they have liked and using different emoticons of hands up,100, heart rings, hearts, laughing, and heart eyes like in comments 1,2, 3, and 6. Emoticons are used to express their feeling of joy, likeness, and love for the music video lyrics. Fans have shown their love for the three musicians by using emoticons of fire,

clapping,100, wow, and heart for instance in comments 4,5,7, and 8. The ninth commenter also mentioned another song 'Gumaan' by the singers Talha Anjum and Talha Yunus and called the trending song as well as a masterpiece and used the heart emoticon for expressing love for the song. Facilitation of interaction between people having a similar taste in music is provided by the translingual space of YouTube.

The next YouTube trended video which showed the facilitation of interaction was trended on 12<sup>th</sup> April 2021 in Pakistan. It was the Pakistani drama Dil Na Ummed Toh Nahi episode 13. The episode revolves around different characters in the drama who are facing societal problems, especially the problems faced by little children. The main post and comments are given in table 4.24 below.

#### **Table 4.24**

A thread	from Y	ouTube	showing	translan	ounging	on a P	akistani drama
II micuu		0111000	Showing	i answir,	Suasing	onul	anisiani arana

	Use of modes						
<b>Post/Comments</b>	L	anguag	e	Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
A submed to hahi   Episode 13   Ty One Dramas	✓	✓				~	
1) is drama ko award miliny chaheye. Litterly 1 wept very much Allah sab ki betio ki hifazt firmaye	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Every single character is playing its best You don't even want to skip anyone's part This is the turning point for the Pakistani drama industry Iska phal mile ga 2) I can see it being a recommendation to pass on several generations!! ♥ ♥ ♥	$\checkmark$	√		$\checkmark$			
3) Yaar Yumna, Nauman ko award dedo 😧 😧 😭	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Sawera baji bht axhi hn. She is so nice . She is so strong and brave how can a person 4) endangered her life for others.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
5)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Larkion k liye qabristan bun saktey hain per playground nahiomg this drama is dealing wid so many society dilemma in one story							
5) Sumbal hr episode k end mn bhaag jti hai or nxt episode k starting mn pakri jti h ) &	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Noman ijaz talking to Jamshed made me cry. How he's trying to coax jamshed, getting him to open up, jamshed hesitating because ab tak usko dhoka hi mila hai. Heart wrenching but Amazing: Jamshed ke ab achay din shuru hopefully	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
8)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					

Yeh wo phla drma jiska hr scene dekhny ko dil krta interesting 🕲 🔮 fabulous drma ever 🔮 99) castel must say that guys you're doing fantastic job 🔮 🚱	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
This drama is far close to reality and better than much hyped khuda aur muhabbat season	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	

The YouTube platform has provided viewers to talk about the characters in the drama as well as the story of the drama. The viewers have shown love for the drama by using the translingual strategy of going between languages by words like an *award, best, amazing and interesting* such as in comments 1,2,3,8, and 9, and also utilized the translingual strategy of going beyond languages by using emoticons like *heart, heart eyes, and crying* are used for the same purpose. The fourth and seventh commenters praised the characters of the drama and the fifth commenter appreciated the drama dialogues due to their relevance to societal issues. The use of a laughing emoticon by the sixth commenter while explaining the situation that happened in drama, again and again, indicated that the commenter has found the situation hilarious. YouTube video has helped in engaging viewers having a similar interest in societal issues drama

The last post from YouTube is the drama that trended on 14<sup>th</sup> May 2021 in Pakistan Chupke. The main post and comments are given below in Table 4.25.

#### **Table 4.25**

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
Chupke Chupke [Last Episode - Ed Special] Digitally Presented by Mezan & Powered by Master Paints	✓	✓				✓		
Hadi ki acting sb se best hai Hadi k funny dialog (2) 1) He is a good boy	~	✓		✓				
Hadi to Waleed: Yeh apne munh jitne siza wala joota tu leke aaya hai mere lye 2) Too funny 🛇 🎯	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				

A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a Drama Chupke Chupke

3) 20.56 Amma's dance 🛔 🕘 🕲 🕲 🖗 🗛 and bebe's looks 🕒 🕒 🛔	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
$4)^{\operatorname{Class}$ ki story ar sb ki acting h yr I'm a big fan of this drama 🎯 V 💧	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
Haye AllAH khatam ho gaya aa 🖗 🖗 daduut miss karungi such mein season 2 bara do 5) please 🛦	$\checkmark$	✓	$\checkmark$
Ending to bahut happy hui 🎙 but drama khtm hone ka dukh rahega ache drama itni jaldi 6) khtm ho jate ha a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a a	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
7) Kis kis ko lagta hai k Cupky Chupky Season 2 hona Chahiye ??? 🏶 🎔	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
I love this drama and waiting for season 2 Uneed h k jald se jald season 2 asaga but character yehi ho $8$ Meenu and faazi to yehi hone chahiye ayeza khan and osman khalid bhutt	$\checkmark$	✓	
Bohat mazay ka drama tha, per 30 episode thy itri jald end hogya hope k season 2 b aye $(9)$ jols	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
10) feeling sad k ab ya drama end hogya but happy ending maza aya Thank you Hum TV	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	

The commenters have employed the translingual strategy of going beyond languages along with the translingual strategy of going between languages. They have used funny emoticons to highlight the humor of the drama dialogues and scenes. The commenters have used specific scenes, dialogues, and characters for the facilitation of interaction like comments 1,2,3. Commenters have used the emoticons of heart, smile, and folded hands have facilitated the commenters to show their mutual love for the drama chupke chupke like in comments 4,5, and 7. Translingual communication by going between the language is employed for instance the usage of terms like *season 2 area, bohat mazay, and maza aya.* has expressed that the viewers of the drama who have commented on the show have loved it and wanted to have another season of the show. Using these terms, again and again, reveals the similarity of interest in this funny genre drama.

### 4.2 Translanguaging for creating social bonding

The second major theme is taken from Li Wei's research work (2016, 2018, 2020) in which he considers that translanguaging enhances contact between people belonging to diverse backgrounds and traditions. In this section, the Translanguaging lens is used for analyzing the creation of social bonding The examples are taken from different social mediums.

#### **4.2.1 Creating a Patriotic Relationship**

Print media was used earlier to spread the idea from the few to many but now the internet is used to connect many people at once. Social media websites give a platform for emotionally driven connectivity, especially between political communities- nations, and regions (Fuchs, 2018)

The Facebook data exhibited that translingual strategies create social bonding between patriotic people. The Facebook post which shows the creation of social bonding is taken from the Pakistan defence page. The main post and the comments are given below in table 4.26.

#### **Table 4.26**

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	I	Language	9	Vis				
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	<ul> <li>Multi modal</li> </ul>		
Pakistan Defence is with Muneeb Hussain and 4 others.     March 10 -      One Nation, One Destination.	,							
#PakistanZindabad	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
	<b>v</b>	×	<u>,</u>					
Mah Sha Allah ALLAH Bless you Sardar gee you are the 1) real Hero of the Nation.	•	•	•					
2)	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
Long live Pak army our diversity is our strength love and respect to minorities.								
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
Bhai edited photo lag rahe hai kasam se								
4)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
True colours of Pakistan. Looking great Sardar Jee.								
Absolutely	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$				
5) United under one flag 🖪	1		1					
6) Pa je tussi great lag ryo uniform wich.	÷		-					
Pa je tussi great lag ryo uniform wich. Pak fuoj zinda bad 7) Pakistan painda bad	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓					

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Pakistani Army man post

9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
Stay blessed. Pakistan 💽 Army zindaabad			
Great sardar G 😫	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
پاک فوج کی محبت کو عوام کے دلوں سے نکالنا مشکل ہی نہیں			
بلکہ			
نا ممکن ہ <b>ے ♥♥♥♥♥</b> (10			

The main post has an image of a person wearing a Pakistan army uniform. The person has a beard and turban which indicates that the person is Sikh and the image has the caption one nation, one destination with a Pakistan flag emoticon and hashtag #PakistanZindabad. The post is showing the patriotism of the minorities of Pakistan by using the translingual strategy of going beyond languages. The translingual replies to the post demonstrate the social bonding of Pakistanis with each other by majorly employing the same strategy but at times the strategy of going between languages is also utilized. The second comment used the gif for showing respect for minorities and comments 1,4,8,10 have used the term Sardar with jee. The term Sardar is used for Sikh males and the addition of the Urdu word jee (or G) is used for giving respect. Paa jee is a Punjabi term for brother which is used in comments 6 and 7. The Urdu word like *zindabad* in comments 8 and 10 is for praising the army and the country Pakistan. Comments 5 used the emoticon of the Pakistani flag for applauding the Sikh army man. This shows that translanguaging created social bonding between people belonging to the same country.

Another post from Facebook is taken from the official page of the Prime minister of Pakistan, Imran khan. In the post, an image has been shared to celebrate the 70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the establishment of diplomatic relations between China and Pakistan. The Image and the comments posted in response are shown in table 4.27 below.

#### **Table 4.27**

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on diplomatic relations post

Post/Comments		Use of modes							
	L	anguag	je	Vis					
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	- Multi modal			
March 6 at 3:59 PM - @	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				

Use of modes



In the image, the more prominent part is how the number 70 is written. The number '7' is in Chinese flag color and the number '0' is written like a crescent moon and star like the Pakistan flag and it's in green color. Below the number '70', there are words written in Urdu and Chinese language and the sentence in the last is in English which says '70<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the establishment of diplomatic relations between China and Pakistan'. It showed that both translingual strategies are employed in the main post. In the comment section of this post, many commenters have used the flags of Pakistan and China with different other emoticons like heart, handshake, and salute. So, mainly the strategy of going beyond languages is utilized and it is visible in comments 1,4,9, and 10 which indicate the social bonding between Pakistan and China. One person in comment 3 has creatively used the Urdu word *zabardast*. The 'das' part is phonetically similar to the number '10' so instead of using the word zabardast, the person has used Zabar'10'. The second commenter

has mixed terms of English 'friendship' and Urdu 'zindabad'. Comments 7 and 10 praised the Prime minister of Pakistan for the Pakistan and China friendship. There are two exceptional cases comments 5 and 6 in which the users have expressed differences of opinion on the social bonding between Pakistan and China. They have used Urdu terms like *machboori* (compromise) and *Majid* (Mosque) for giving evidence of their disagreement. Overall translanguaging helped in creating social bonding between different people having a similar stance regarding Pakistan and China's diplomatic relations.

The next post is from the official page of a famous Pakistani cricketer Shahid Afridi which shows the social bonding of the people through translanguaging. The page owner has written a celebratory note on Pakistan resolution day. It is Pakistan's national day which is celebrated due to the resolution passed on the 23<sup>rd</sup> of March which is the foundation of the independence of Pakistan. Mainly the translingual strategy of going beyond languages is utilized but the strategy of translanguaging of going between languages has been used to highlight the emotion attached to the image. The whole Englishwritten post ended on Pakistan with the Urdu word '*zindabad*' which means long live attached with a Pakistani flag emoticon. The image shared has the Pakistan flag as the background and Minar e Pakistan at the front which is a monument built on the place where the resolution of Pakistan has passed. The image has 'Pakistan resolution day' written at the top and the bottom date '23<sup>rd</sup> march, 2021' is written. The whole post and the comments are given below in table 4.28.

#### **Table 4.28**

			Use of	modes		
<b>Post/Comments</b>	L	anguag	e	Vis	ual	Multi
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on Pakistan Day post



Like the previous threads in this section, the mode of translanguaging is mainly emoticons, images, and gifs i.e.; the translingual strategy of going beyond languages. The translingual comments on the thread on the main post have demonstrated the social bonding of Pakistani with one another. Several commenters have used the Pakistani flag in the main post like comments 2,5,8,9 and 10 which are also used for showing the unity of Pakistan. Comments 1 and 8 have used the Pakistani flag but not as an emoticon. Both are in form of images that have 23<sup>rd</sup> march written on them. Commenters 4 and 9 have used the images of Quaid e Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah with his quote related to Pakistan. Comment 7 displayed the image of the Prime minister of Pakistan, Imran khan with Minar e Pakistan with the 23<sup>rd</sup> march written on it. Words like *'Pakistan zindabad'* (long live Pakistan) and *Youm e Pakistan* (Pakistan day) are used in comments 2,3,5,6,7 and 10 to express the patriotism and unity of the Pakistani people.

Another such example is taken from the page Coke studio. The page features Pakistani music by bringing together different musicians. The main post and the comments which are considered data for the research are given below in Table 4.29.

Use of modes

#### **Table 4.29**

A thread from H	Facebook showing	translanguaging	on a Pakistan	dav special

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language			Visual		Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Coke Studio O March 19 - O							
81 years since Qarardad-e-Pakistan. #AoEhadKarain #CokeStudio #PakistanDay	✓	$\checkmark$				$\checkmark$	
#AGEPindRamin							
So honcured to be singing the same lines as THE Nayyara Noor sahiba who immortalised 'Watan Ki Mitti'. We're all absolutely estatic that you guys are loving this incredible project. Shoutout to all the amazing artists and team involved! ♥ Thank you 😜	√	✓		✓			
2) Do full version of apni quwat apni Jan with Iqbal's poetry.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Which Mili Naghma is being played by Army Band at 2:13??	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
I'm Honoured to be part of this masterpiece, Thank you Ali Hamza sir for the opportunity #AoEhadKarain #Jaagrahahajpakistan	$\checkmark$	✓		✓			
As always Coke studio reveal soulful music, that's the 5) legacy of coke studio, Pakistan zindabad V	√	✓		$\checkmark$			
This is genuinely beautiful. Although nobody can sing 'Gawah rehna' better than Nayarra Noor or 'Mera Paigham Pakistan' better than Nusrat sahab but it's really well made.	$\checkmark$	✓					
Ali's voice. She did a great job ♥	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			



The main post is the video in which different national songs of Pakistan are mixed for Pakistan's national day. The video is posted by the page manager along with the caption 81 years since Qarardad-e-Pakistan (Which means Pakistan resolution). The post has promoted social bonding by using a Patriotic video and caption. The listeners of the video have shown social bonding by employing the translingual strategy of going between languages by using terms like *Watan ki mitti* like in comments 1 and 7. Few commenters like comments 4,6 and 10 have used terms that are in the video like *jag raha hai Pakistan, gawah rehna, mera paigham, and meri pehchan Pakistan*. All these terms are in the Urdu language and titles of famous Pakistani national songs. The eighth commenter has used the Urdu term *Pakistan zindabad* which means long live Pakistan. The ninth commenter used the Arabic phrase *Allaho Akbar* which means Allah is great. In this case, it is used for the celebration of Muslim unity. Mainly the strategy of going beyond languages is utilized by using emoticons of heart and the Pakistani flag in comments 4,5,7,8,9 and 10 which created social bonding between patriotic Pakistanis.

The next example is a Facebook post from the official page of Pakistani singer Ali Zafar. The page manager has given a YouTube link to a music video titled *Aik qoum Aik manzil* (One nation, one destination) produced by ISPR and the same national song is also shared in the post. The singers in the music video are standing in front of Minar e Pakistan and people belonging to various professions and provinces are shown in the video. The screenshot of the main post along with the comments on the thread is displayed in table 4.30 below.

#### **Table 4.30**

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a national song post

Use of modes

Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis	Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
Provide State Control	~	✓				✓
Sorry to Ye Qoum kabi aik ti he nai or na ho gi agar aik hoti tu aaj Balochistan or Fata k log aese darpadar nai hote maaye roado pay bet Kar apne bete k lapata hone par ghumjan hy or tum log yaha LSPK k pato ban Kar 1) song pay song daram pay drama bana raha ho 2 2		✓		✓		
To Be Honest, Na aik gourn hai na aik Manzil hai Manzil majority of the gourn ki aik hi hai woh hai "Corruption", chahey woh politicians houn, aik rehri wala hoh: betroi pump wala ho. Civilized toh kahi se hain hi Manzil These type of songs doesn't proves anything, action DOES :	$\checkmark$	✓		$\checkmark$		
When their is "ek qoum* u dont neee to prove them with 3) making songs.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
4) Ali bhai ko views lene ki ninja technique pta chal gae hai.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
Pakistan main koi aur female singers nahi rahi kya kyun new talent ko promote nahi kiya jata jo mil jay bus usi ko sun sun kr kan pak jate hai phir wo screen se aese gyb 5) huta hai jaisa tha he nahi	~	✓				
6) Bahi sb kia watt lagai hai song kee	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
Wesy Ek hai qoum Ek manzil 7) Third class lyrics and singing	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
our only manzil is to become a civilized nation. Bloody 8) clowns can't use our money and us anymore.	$\checkmark$	✓				
Aima baig Kya kehna chahti ho Mujhe song Zara smjh nh Aya upar se guzar gaya jesy Urdu ke Nam pe dhoka de Diya gaya ho	✓	✓		✓		
Third class songthird class singingali zafar jalse gaane walo ko bollywood me chorus me bhi jagah nahi milli aur waha pakistan me ye star banne ki soft technique azma raha hai.bas apan mota awaz leke national song bana do ek khubsoorat ladki ko lekethra asaan nahi bhai 100) Isse acha gaana indina advertisement ke das second ke gaane ki rhythm me hoti hai	✓	✓				

The commenters on the thread have shared their argument based on the title '*Aik Quom Aik Manzil*'. Few commenters have incorporated the translingual strategy of going beyond languages like the first commenter has shown disappointment by using the facepalm emoticon and the word sorry in the overall Urdu comment. The use of the '*aik quom*' (one nation) phrase is not only in the main post but is also used by other commenters such as 1,2,3 and 7. Most of the comments are using the translingual strategy of going between languages by mixing Urdu and English languages as can be seen in table 4.35. Comments 5,7,9 and 10 are the ones who do not like the song and expressed their feeling by calling it '*third class*' which means that the song was of cheap quality according to them. The comments, as well as the main post, are related to the concept of one nation and

one destination but the response to this patriotic song was completely different from the above thread. Here, commenters have criticized instead of praising or connecting based on the patriotic spirit.

The last post which demonstrates social bonding through translanguaging is from the official Facebook page of the Pakistani food channel Masala tv in which the page admin has shared a video having different channel chefs expressing happiness on Pakistan day. The main post along with comments is given below in table 4.31.

#### **Table 4.31**

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
Manual VP 0 More than the open or a home, but identity and freedom. Thank you Plastitan. We over you traj lices: #mater inform for information	$\checkmark$	✓				✓		
						✓		
						v		
1) medial.tenol.coHome Pakist	1	1						
2) Bohat behetreen.Add	•	•						
<sup>23march</sup> ap logo ny buhat pyra manaya hoga enjoy your <sup>day</sup>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
Brilliant Work. True, Apna Ghar Apna hota hai, I am living 4) in Middle East, but apna Ghar jaisa koi jagha nae	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
Azadi Ka Asli Meaning Hai K Sab Kuch Ikhtiyar Hotay Howey Bhi Allah K Hukam Per Chalo ALLAH K Hukum K Khilaf Chalo Gay	$\checkmark$	✓						
5) Azad Raho Gay Magar Azadi Na Paa Sako Gay				$\checkmark$				
6)								
OK!9						$\checkmark$		
7)	,	,						
#HumMasala TV On the day of 23rd Much1 was watching Hum Masala TV lock at main sign what they have written instead of 23rd Much1 its merilicent 23rH Much plasse Hummasla TV show director to plasse check these before go on air	$\checkmark$	✓						
Long live Pakistan Pakistan 9) zindabad amen	$\checkmark$	✓						

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Pakistan day message

The followers of the page have expressed their emotions related to Pakistan day through their translingual comments by using both translingual strategies. Some have used the translingual strategy of going beyond languages. The first, sixth, and seventh comments have used a gif, an emoticon, and an image respectively in which comment 1 has a gif of the Pakistani flag with I love my home Pakistan written in English language and comment 6 has a heart with falcon emoticons which indicate love for Pakistan. The heart is a sign of love and the falcon is the bird used as a metaphor for Pakistan. The seventh commenter has used an image of an animated character with the word 'ok'. Many of the commenters have employed the translingual strategy of going between languages like comments 2,3,4 and 10 praised the channel for their work and congratulated them on Pakistan day. The eighth commenter has advised the director to pay attention to the television broadcast. The ninth comment has wished Pakistan on Pakistan day. The translanguaging has shown the social bonding of the commenters based upon their love for the country Pakistan.

 $\checkmark$ 

✓

No data related to creating patriotic relationship was obtained from Twitter but YouTube has an example of translingual comments which are taken from the trending video of drama Pardes on 24<sup>th</sup> May 2021 which is given below in table 4.32.

#### **Table 4.32**

10)

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	I	anguag	e	Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
	✓	~				✓		
Pardes Episode 1 & 2 - Part 1 [Subtitle Eng] 17th May 2021   ARY Digital Drama	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
I know several people who went out of country to make money for their families but remained there for years scartifying everything but their families do not realize their efforts and sacrifice. Some have crossed their youth without getting married, some are waiting for good times but for their back home families they are just more making machines. Their families don't bother their sacrifice. Allah muaf kry, Allay in sub foreign workers ko himmat de keh woh is imitihan main poore utrain. Ameen.								

A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging on a drama Pardes

$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		

The mode of translanguaging is dominated by the two languages Urdu and English i.e.; the strategy of going between languages is employed. The sentences like *himmat de* (give strength), *Asaan kare* (Make it easy), *ye hi hota hai* (The same thing happens), *Bohat Mushkil Hota hai* (It is very difficult), and *apne hifazat mein rakh* (Keep you safe) are used in the comments given in table 4.37. Sixth and seventh commenters have used the sentences *Rona aa gaya* and *rula diya* to show sad feelings. These translingual sentences have shown the patriotic spirit of commenters and their feelings of attachment to Pakistan and their loved ones living in Pakistan.

#### 4.2.2 Creating Muslim Community bonding

Muslim communities used to meet in mosques to create bonding but now social media plays an important role in establishing relationships between different Muslim communities (Islam, 2019).

Facebook demonstrates such an example from the page 'Pakistan defence' where the translanguaging created bonding in a Muslim community which is shown in Table 4.33 below.

#### **Table 4.33**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
We have a series of the series	✓			✓	✓		
ہمارے دل دھڑکتے ہیں آپ کے ساتھ From Pakistan 🖿 islambad 🙆	$\checkmark$	~		√			
Alhamdulillah we are one 💙	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
) you dear ones 3 countries 1 nation 1 Long live our brotherhood 1 Muslim umah ta qayamat zinda abad	$\checkmark$	✓	✓				
Brothers by Islam Allah o Akbar 🍎 📿 👺 2	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Pakistan Zindabad Representative of Muslim Ummaah ) Love for Palestine	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
7) Azerbaijani soldier and three brotherly flags 👞 😰 👿 🙏	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$			
3) Zindabad Pakistan.		$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Azerbaijan 👞 Zindabad Pakistan Turkey 🔯 Zindabad		$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
10) Muslim Ummahplease tie togatheras many as	$\checkmark$		✓				

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on Pakistan friendship post

The image shared by the admin is showing an army person who is smiling at the camera and behind him are three flags. Three flags are Pakistan, Azerbaijan, and Turkey. On top of the post, it is written from Azerbaijan (use of flag emoticon for it) to Pakistan (use of flag emoticon for it) with love. The admin has creatively shown the social bonding between Pakistan and Azerbaijan by employing the translingual strategy of going beyond languages. The majority of comments on the post have also employed the same translingual strategy. Comments 1,7 and 9 have used the emoticons of flags like the admin to convey their friendly feelings towards Azerbaijan. They have also used the flag of turkey like in the image shared by the admin. Pakistan, Turkey, and Azerbaijan are considered Muslim countries, and Pakistanis share brotherly feelings towards other Muslim countries which

are creatively shown by comments 2,4,6, and 10 through the words like Muslim Ummah, Allah o Akbar which are terms from the Arabic language, and shows Pakistanis emotions for the Muslim countries. The strategy of translanguaging of going beyond languages by emoticons, and images with Urdu, English, and Arabic languages helped in creating social bonding between the Pakistani Muslim community based on their connection with other Muslim countries.

Instagram data also reveals the role of translanguaging in creating a social bond. One such Instagram post is taken from the official account of Pakistani Islamic preacher Tariq Jamil. In the main post, a short video clip of Tariq Jamil's lecture is shared with the caption *unity of ummah* (Unity of the Muslim community). The main post and the comments are given in table 4.34.

#### **Table 4.34**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	L	Language			Visual		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
tariqjamilofficial O Unity of Ummah.							
Short video clip by Maulana Tariq Jamil. - With English Subtitles.	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$	
molana sahab >>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
<ul> <li>Allah lambi sehat wali zindgi dy apko Molana! You are such a great</li> <li>preacher.</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	✓					
Haven't seen a personality like Maulana Sahib in my entire life, May Allah الحروجل bless him with afiyah in this	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓				
<ol> <li>world and the next, ameen</li> <li>Moulana sahab agar breivi bhi haq pe hain to batao galat koun hai, ye breivi jinhon ne mazaron ko apna business bana rakha jo qabr walon ko sajda karte hain unhe se mangte hai ye log haq pe kaise ho sakte ye log to gumrah hain aur dusron ko bhi gumrah karte hain in se milne wala to gumrah hen oga, haq pe sirf ek he jamat hai jo sirg Quran o hadees pe amat kare</li> </ol>	√	✓					
byaan . mulana sahab.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
6) baten I Love you soo mch	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	~	$\checkmark$			

A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a Muslim unity video

Molana tariq jamil shah allah hum sab par aap ka saya kayam rak key. Ameen toh bolu dosto.	$\checkmark$	~	$\checkmark$	✓
he live long and healthy ameen yah rab	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
Assalamualalaykum ee ekisi k paas molana sahab ka number haiii to 9) please mjh dediye mjh chahiy	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	~
are great dada ji v v Allah tala apko salamat rakhe ameen ya rabbul alameen	$\checkmark$	✓	~	$\checkmark$

The main post has used the Arabic term' *ummah* ' which means Muslim community. Some commenters have employed the translingual strategy of going between languages by using Arabic words to indicate the Muslim bonding like *Mashaa Allah, afiyah, Assalamualalaykum, Ameen, and Rabbul alameen* in comments 1,3,5,6,7,8 and 10. The commenters have frequently used the term Moulana sahib' which is used for showing respect to a Muslim religious leader such as in comments 1,2,3,4,5,6,7 and 9. Mainly the commenters have used the translingual strategy of going beyond languages, for instance, various emoticons like clapping, heart kiss, heart eyes, and hearts are used for showing love and respect for the religious leader Tariq Jamil such as in comments 1,5,6,7,8,9 and 10. The translingual communication created a bonding among the Muslim community who follow the religious scholar Tariq Jamil.

Translanguaging is also observed on Twitter in the trending topic of *Muslim Ummah* which trended on Twitter on 13<sup>th</sup> April 2021. Tweets are given in table 4.35 below.

#### **Table 4.35**

Trend/Comments	Use of modes						
	Language			Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Muslim Ummah	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
Ap seystat ko ak tide or rith kr kbi kais gareeb ka gar to ja k dekha .ak time ke roli ha to ak time bhook lalay. Gareeb is wat m ky va log har rozz gurbat ke výa sa apni jano sa hath dho blatha ha. 1) Ng royv (or <b>Pakistan</b> Army, <b>Pekistan</b> zínda abad.	~	✓	✓				
2) Today we Muslims are divided and our so called Muslims leaders are agents of the west. It's time to unite <b>Muslim ummah</b> under one Islamic state "The KHLLAFAH" and establish the laws of Allah SWT #LetsUniteMuslim/ummah	$\checkmark$		✓				



The examination of the tweets on the trending topic shows that the translanguaging created social bonding between the Muslim community in different issues related to Muslims are discussed along with solutions like tweets 1 and 7 and it is expressed by using words like *gareeb* and *ghairat*. The solution to the Muslim problem is the unity of the Muslim ummah according to tweets 2,3,5 and 8. The terms like *Khalifah* and *towheed* are used in tweets 2 and 5 to create bonding between Muslims. Some tweets utilized the strategy of going beyond languages. For instance, the ninth tweeter used an image of two flags in form of hands holding each other. The flags are of Pakistan and Palestine. The written text is Pakistan 4 (which has pronunciation similar to for) Palestine and the next tweeter has pointed out the wish of Muslim ummah as a whole. The mixture of Urdu, and

Arabic terms with English and even image i.e.; the strategy of going between the languages as well as the strategy of going beyond languages has created social bonding between the Muslims.

The following trend took place when the Israeli attacked mosque Al Aqsa in Palestine. The incident triggered many Twitter trends, especially in Pakistan. Among the trends, two translingual trends #KhilafahLiberatesAlAqsa and #MasjideAqsaIsBleeding on 9<sup>th</sup> and 10<sup>th</sup> May respectively are in focus to analyze the creation of social bonding through translanguaging. Table 4.36 shows the trending topic #KhilafahLiberatesAlAqsa and the tweets related to it. Khalifah is the religious ruler of the Muslim state and tweeters show their bonding by asking for Khalifah not just for one Muslim state but for all Muslim states.

#### **Table 4.36**

	Use of modes						
Trend/Comments	L	anguag	je	Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
#KhilafahLiberatesAlAqsa	✓		√				
#HiredFacilitators will never be sincere to #ummah	✓		✓				
Only #Rhilfsfhilberatesalagsa, ensure #Liberation of #Kashmir , and end presence of #USA in the Region , especially #Afghanistan We can't just make dua and donate and that's all. We need system that can implement all of the Syariah.We need The Khilafah. #khilafahprotectsmuslims #khilafah_myguardian_myshield	~		✓				
2) #khilafahilberatesalaqsa     Never a minute's silence     Never appeals to the United Nations     Never comvincing the West with love and affection     The protector of the sanctity of Holy Prophet and lives and property of     Muslims around the world is only Khilafah     #KhilafahilberatesAlAqsa	$\checkmark$		✓				
<ul> <li>#AqsaCallsPatcArmy as the unmah in pakistan feels the pain and knows the solution for it</li> <li>#AqsaCallsArmies of other muslim countries as well, but not under nationalistic divide, rather only</li> <li>#KhalsAthliberatesAlAgaa</li> <li>O sincere officers! Ummah looking towards you</li> </ul>	✓		√				
They have set the game. No matter how well you play They will ubmetely be the victors Or wickoys it by changing the game and that is possible by endicating this rotent Democratic system and establishing Unlitch upon mining e nabuwat #Unlitchink UncertainAllagea 5) #AppCollisAmmes	$\checkmark$		✓				

A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on the Liberation of Al-Aqsa trend



The analysis of the Twitter trend shows that only Arabic and English languages are used dominantly i.e.; the strategy of going between the languages as a mode of translanguaging. The tweeters have frequently used terms *like ummah*, *Khalifah*, *syariah* (Shariat) and *akhira* which can be seen in all the tweets mentioned in Table 4.41 above and these terms have created social bonding between the Muslims because they are closely associated with these terms. The strategy of beyond languages is also utilized in tweets 9 and 10 to encourage the armies of Muslim states to unite and save Muslim communities from destruction which in turn also created bonding between the tweeters. Therefore, both types of translingual strategies have created social bonding among Muslims.

The next trend #MasjideAqsaIsBleeding related to the subtheme is shown below in table 4.37 along with tweets.

#### **Table 4.37**

A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on the Shooting in Al-Aqsa trend

		Use of modes					
<b>Trend/Comments</b>	Language			Vis	ual	Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	

#MasjideAqsaIsBleeding	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
I knew it, I knew it. Israel can't keep their asses in control, not for even a single Day, yeh jo agg inko lagi houi haie isi maim jaal jaal ke rakh bhaingy yeh. #FreePalestine #Shameonisrael	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
#MasjideAqsalsBleeding     Kuch kernay say hi kuch hoga. You can start the economic Boycott of Israel     companies and products. Be a becon of hope for Muslims.     #BoycottisraeliProducts #Boycottisraelipoods #GazaUnderAttack     #FreePatestine #MasjideAqsalsBleeding	✓	$\checkmark$		
Israeli occupation forces have stormed the Magjid al-Agsa compound now and are firing upon worshippers once again on the blessed day of Jummah. Inna illiahi wa ina elayhee rajioon #MasjidAAgsa #IsraelTerrorists #AlAgsaMosque #IsraelTerrorism <b>3 #MasjidAAqsaisBleeding</b>	√	✓	~	
Israel has weapon . Palestine has Dua Indeed Dua is the most powerful Weapon #FreePalestine #IndiaStandWithIsrael #GazaUnderAttackk #MasjideAqsalsBleeding	✓		~	~
I saw the Masjid al-Aqsa in my dreams Take my salam to the Muslim, he was saying, I can not stand this separation. Islam embrace me, he was saying • MakajidAkajar <b>MasjideAqsalsBleeding</b> #MasjidAkaqsa	✓	$\checkmark$	√	
The kind of Iman that people of palatine have is different level May Allah help the	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
6) #FreePalestine #IStandWithPalestine # <b>MasjideAqsalsBleeding</b>				
If you are muslim and you still remain silent about this issue. please remember that majid al agas is one of our aqidah. #ISRAESTARTSHEATTACK #ISRAELBREAKSTHETRUCE #MasjideAqsalsBleeding	✓	$\checkmark$		
If speeches in UN were to bore any fruit, the fruit would have been visible till now through the case of kastmir, but it ain't So how can u even think it's gorna work for Palestine. Save our first gible 🔮 a firmagildeaspatibleeding Palestine.	✓		√	✓
Israeli forces once again stormed Masjid-e-Aqsa . Ceasefire already violated 9 Freed-Benstine = HisraelTerrorists #MasjideAqsalsBleeding	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Israeli Force attacks Mosque al Aqsa again Shelling on Namazio atter Zuma's Namaz It's violation Ceasefire agreement	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
10) #MasjidilAqshaunderattack #MasjideAqsalsBleeding #Ghaza_under_attack				

The focus of the trend is on the tweeters expressing their concern related to the attack on Mosque Al Aqsa. The tweeters have created solidarity with Palestine by calling out Israel which is shown by all the tweets in Table 4.42. The mode of translanguaging used by the tweeters is Urdu, English, and Arabic, i.e.; the strategy of going between multiple languages, unlike the above thread where the strategy of going between two languages was utilized. The terms like *dua*, *Iman*, *salam*, *aqidah* (Faith), *Jummah*, and *qibla* are used to indicate unity with Palestine such as in tweets 3,4,5,6,7, and 8 which also show the bonding between the Muslim community.

## 4.2.3 Creating Religious Affiliations

Nowadays, People use social media to promote religious messages because it provides the opportunity to communicate with like-minded people (Trysnes & Synnes, 2022).

Translanguaging helps in creating bonding over religious affiliation. The first example is taken from the official Facebook page of Pakistani singer Sara Raza Khan which is given along with comments in table 4.38 below. Sara Raza Khan has shared the video reciting Naat which is poetry praising Muhammad (SAW). She has also written a message with terms like *shab e burrat* which means the night of forgiveness and *PunjTan* which means five people including Muhammad (SAW),Hazrat Ali, Hazrat Fatima, Hazrat Hassan, and Hazrat Hussain. These terms are associated with the belief of many Muslim communities.

#### **Table 4.38**

A thread from	Facebook de	picting t	ranslanguaging	on a Naat video p	ost
11 1111 00000 91 0111				on a react react p	0.01

Post/Comments	Use of modes							
	Language			Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
Same Rate Kinn * Market Save Rose Save Rate Kinn * Rate Save Ry Save Rate Rate Save Save Save Save Save Save Save Sav	✓	✓	✓			✓		
PIZ DONT WRITE SAW.SAW MEANS SHARP KNIFE SAW ma likha karen SAW ka matlab hy AARI GJ PIZ write sa.w.w Piz spicad this awarenes Piz spicad this awarenes Ye bast mazeed aage phallaen.	✓	✓						
2) Mashallah ak din apse zaror milnga milngy inshallah i ambig fan	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
3) Barsati medak ki tarha ho jb Ramadan ata hain to musalman ban k naat perhti h or pura saal hindo ko copy kr k un k song gati ho lanat ha double policy p tumhara	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
4) Nice mashalla allah sehat salamat khosh rakhay	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
5) Ma Shah ALLAH , subhan ALLAH beautiful kalam	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$					
6) Behn nail polish tw ni lagati mehfil me	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
7) Naiis tu katti leti or naii polish k sath tu wuzu bhe nai hota nail polish haram haii	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
$8)^{Paisakamanaka}_{SONG}$ song	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
10) Kia baat h pyari awaz h I love you	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						

The comments have majorly used the translingual strategy of going between languages like the usage of the Arabic term *Mashaa Allah* for praising the reciting of Naat by the singer like in comments 2,4 and 5. Some commenters have criticized the singer by using English terms *fashion, nails, and nail polish* such as commenters 6,7, and 9 in overall Urdu sentences. The third commenter has mixed Urdu and English languages in the comment for mocking the singer for reciting Naat on holy days but otherwise singing Indian songs. The first commenter has given information on how to write a holy prophet (PBUH). Comments are showing the religious affiliation of the people even negative comments are due to the religious beliefs of people.

Similarly, Instagram data also reveals that translanguaging creates social bonding based on religious affiliation. The first example from Instagram is taken from the official account of Tariq Jamil who is a famous Pakistani Islamic preacher. In the main post, he expressed his motto of life which is love and giving. He wishes that Allah give us *tawfiq* to live by that. Tawfiq is an Arabic that means the ability to achieve success. So, the translanguaging strategy which is employed by the main post writer is going between languages. Table 4.39 displays the main post and comments on the Tariq Jamil official account.

#### **Table 4.39**

Post/Comments	Use of modes							
	L	e	Visual		Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
tariqjamilofficial Our motto in life is love and giving, May Allah give us tawfīq to live by that.	$\checkmark$		✓					
aur duaa ki dharkwast plz duaa for	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
(indly share your bayaan about today's night SHAB E MAERAJ	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						
3)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				

A thread from Instagram depicting translanguaging on a Motto of life post

jameel sab ap apni har vedio me Allah tariq pak ka farman sunate k maaf karjao seh jao par koi jab apko ittna satae galiya de maa baap ko galiya de jab saas tab kya kare banda bol to sakta nahi q ke husband ka dar hota aur izat ka warna banda jwab de zaroor par gusa ata bht andar hi andar phr maaaf b kardeti magar phr jab galiya nikalti wo mje phr		✓	✓	
5) namaz InshALLAH	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
hamesha salamat Rakhe big fan of your 6) 🎯 🖤 🏠	✓	~	~	~
7) Dua for you 💗	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
8) u happiness and shifa Ameen	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
9) ullumaa 🌳 🌳 pray for me plz 🌳	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
10) rakhe.ameen	✓	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	

The analysis of the thread shows that the mode of translanguaging used by the commenters is Urdu, English, and Arabic to show respect for the Islamic preacher Tariq Jamil. The social bonding is evident by the use of Arabic terms like Mashaa Allah, Inshaa Allah, and dua which indicate the association of the commenters such as in comments 1,3,5,6, and 7. Few emoticons like heart, heart eyes, and take a bow are used for showing respect and love for the Islamic preacher. It indicates the connection of the people due to similar religious beliefs for which both types of translanguaging strategies are employed by the commenters which are going between multiple languages as well as going beyond the languages.

The next post from Instagram is taken from the official account of Pakistani actor Feroze Khan in which he wished the Shab e Barat (Night of forgiveness) to his followers and shared a quote written in English as well as Arabic. The main post utilizes both going between multiple languages as well as going beyond languages but the part which created bonding is going between multiple languages. The whole post and the comments are given below in table 4.40.

#### **Table 4.40**

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on an Islamic day post

Use of modes

Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Vis	ual	Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Ferozekhan • - Shab e Barat Mubarak Let positivity take over.	✓	✓	√		√		
"Perhaps the misfortune that you do not like, leads you to a beautiful destiny that you never dreamed of." لملَّ البلاد، الذي لا تُحبَّه، يقورك إلى قدر جميل لم تكُن تحلُّم به							
س البرد، الذي و تعيد يعن درس هو جنين ام من تعلم به 1)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
hae yaa شب برات hae yaa شب برات kl ki raaaaat? Anyone with authentic source?							
you too !!! • • • I I I	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Mubarak to you too! Keep us in your 3) dua's!	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
(a) Comparison (1) Compared to the first of the first	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
<ul> <li>Figure 1 (1)</li> <li>Khair Mubarak (1)</li> <li>Khair Mubarak (2)</li> <li>Khair Mubarak (2)</li></ul>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
6) Wisely♥@ferozekhan	✓	✓		$\checkmark$			
<ul> <li>Comparison of the second second</li></ul>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
mubarak Aapko b mubarak 9 9 9 9 9god bless 9 you FK 1 1 1	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
<ul> <li>A state of the st</li></ul>	✓	✓	✓	✓			
Assalamualaikum Shab E Barat Mubarak to you and your family Dua mein yaad rakhan Stay Bleased and Happy And Keep Smiling Hamesha I Love youuuuu 0 @ferozekhan 🔷 🧉	✓	√	✓	$\checkmark$			

The commenters used a similar pattern to the main post in their comments, for instance, the commenters have used the same term '*Shab e Barat Mubarak*' as the main post. The mode of translanguaging in this post is the use of several languages not just limited to Urdu and English languages so the strategy of going between multiple languages is majorly employed. The social bond is which is created by the Instagram followers of this account because of their association with the term Shab e Barat by replying with the term '*Khair Mubarak*'. Examples of such comments are 2,3,4,5,6,7,8,9 and 10 in which the commenters are associated themselves with the religious group which celebrates the night of forgiveness. In the thread, Emoticons like heart and starry night are also used to highlight the happiness related to the terms '*Shab e Mubarak*' and '*Khair Mubarak*' therefore strategy of going beyond the language is utilized only for highlighting the aspects of communication whereas the strategy of going between languages are used for the bonding purpose.
Instagram data also indicates that translanguaging creates bonding between people having similar religious affiliations. One such example from Instagram is the post from the official account of the Pakistani actress Hania Aamir. In the main post, she shared a picture with her mother with the caption wishing Shab e Barat Mubarak and asked people to use the Palms up together emoji which depicts the way Muslim pray from Allah. The reason for using the emoji is to not get bothered by shaitans (Devils). She has also used the hijab girl emoticon while talking about the picture which was taken when she and her mother were going to their rooms. It shows that the main post has employed both translingual strategies. The main post and the comments are displayed below in Table 4.41.

#### **Table 4.41**

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a praying picture

			Use of	f modes		
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Visual		Multi
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
<ul> <li>haniaheheofficial          <ul> <li>As promised.</li> <li>Shab e Barat Mubarak.</li> <li>And as discussed drop a</li></ul></li></ul>	*	1	*	*	*	
You looking beautiful in 1) shalwarkameez 20 7	$\checkmark$	✓		√		
2) everyone	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Similing with out any worries and with peace ameen may Allah accept our prayers and every little ibadaat ameen	$\checkmark$	✓	√	√		
shaitan leaves and let you focus on a 4) having a good day 66	✓	✓		✓		
Ab hmri awam ne is bt pe bi koi issue bna laina hai 🌚 BTW 🗲 y girls stay blessed & keep smiling	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
6)   Khyr mubarak my love	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
7) before every fajrr prayer	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
<ul> <li>Love this pics ALLAh</li> <li>pak apke ibadat ko qabool farmay or</li> <li>shetain apko seedy raasty s na bhatkay</li> <li>ameen sumameen boht noor ha ap k</li> <li>face per to the set of t</li></ul>	$\checkmark$	✓	✓	✓		

9) by shaitan should be done	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
from stopping you to do good deeds	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$

The analysis shows that the strategy of going beyond languages is majorly used by the commenters. Many commenters have used the palms up together emoticon as per the main post's instructions like in comments 3,4,9 and 10. Commenters have also used the word '*Shaitan*' (Devil) like the main post in comments 4,8,9 and 10 and different types of heart emoticons are used by various commenters to wish the actress such as in comments 1,2,3,5,6 and 8. The first commenter gave a compliment to the actress. The second and fifth commenters have wished the Instagram influencer by using the word '*Mubarak*'. The post and commenters have bonded by using different Islamic-related terms and palms up together emoticons like praying gestures of Muslims along with heart emoticons.

The next Instagram post is taken from the official account of Pakistani actor Feroze khan who has shared his picture with a black dot on his neck. The caption with the picture points out that the kalak (Black dot) was applied by his mother to keep him away from Nazar (evil eye). *Nazar* is a term that is used for a common belief that a person faces problems in life due to jealousy of another person. The post along with comments is given below in table 4.42.

#### **Table 4.42**

	Use of modes							
Post/Comments	I	anguag	ge	Vis	Multi			
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal		
ferozekhan © - that kalak on my neck is my mums way to keep me away from nazar I Now you know Kthankbye ©	✓	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Pyara bachcha také caré boyé kabhi kisi ki nazar na lagé lots of duayan 🌮 🍯	✓	V		V				
2) milna chahe apko feroziii	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$						

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a Black dot post

when mum i sliveys love that moment when mum puts a little kalak to keep away from shit qevs it's like walking inside a glass shelid That's keeps you away from barks 😻 😂 📽	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
do not save you from nazar. Only Allah 4) can protect	✓	$\checkmark$		
5)Am I a joke to you? 😊	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
Bhai Mosquito bite lag ra ha 6) tbh	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
way to stay protected from nazar,Learn about it from Islam.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
S like krti hun ७ ७ ७ ७ ७ ७ ७ ♥♥♥♥	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
9) raha hai welding karke aye ho 😂 😂	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
Muslims we shouldn't believe in such things. Her Duas should be enough 10)Insha allah	$\checkmark$	✓	✓	

The translingual comments on the post used the terms kalak and Nazar like the main post such as comments 1,3,4,5 and 7. Heart eyes and heart emoticons are used to describe love for the physical appearance of Feroze khan in the picture as in comments 1 and 8. The third commenter humorously described with a laughing emoticon how it feels when the *kalak* (black dot) is applied to the neck by the mother. The ninth commenter has also used the laughing emoticon to express an opinion related to the picture of Feroze khan. Some commenters have found the applying of a black dot a superstitious practice like the fourth, seventh, and tenth commenters. Commenters have mainly used the translingual strategy of going beyond languages but also used the translingual strategy of going between languages. The use of emoticons and different languages has created bonding between people having views related to the black dot in which they shared their experiences and opinions related to the black dot.

No Twitter data related to this subtheme was obtained but YouTube displays many instances in which translanguaging is used for creating bonding between people having a similar religious affiliation. One such example is taken from the trending YouTube video of Molana Tariq Jameel on 2<sup>nd</sup> April 2021 in Pakistan. The main post and comments are given below in table 4.43.

#### **Table 4.43**

A thread from YouTube showing translanguaging in an Islamic lecture

Post/Comments	Language			Vis	Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
عمر المعلم المحالي 202 مراحت براحت المعلم المعلم المحالي مح محالي المحالي ا	~	✓	✓			√
forgiveness 1) (In not really a molil person most of them are extremists but i always find relief by listening to Moulana Tariq. Jamel	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
<ol> <li>This is the first time I am seeing the Islamic content on #1 trending. MaaShaAllah. Finally</li> </ol>	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
3) Pray for me and entire ummah!!	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Who is watching this great speech on the day, n8 of	✓	✓	√	√		
$5 ight)$ Allah apko khush rakh $\heartsuit$ ap lambi umer de moulana $ullet$ your the best	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
6) Masha Allah number 1 on trending ALLAH Maula sahb ko apne hifz-o-aman ma rakhy or humesha kush rhy 📢	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Massha-Alah @May Almighty Allah swit bless you with happiness, health, prosperity and peace" 7) Allah aspito lambi umar ata farmaye.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓		
8) Its greatest to see this video at trending 1 MashaAllah 🐈	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
9) Whenever I got confusedI watch Moulana Tariq, Jameel sahab's bayan Mashallah satisfying	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
10)	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$		

Use of modes

Analysis of the thread shows that the mode of translanguaging which is used by the YouTube users on the thread is Urdu, English, and Arabic. This going between multiple languages translingual strategy has helped in conveying the emotions of the commenters effectively like the first commenter has used the term *molvi person*. It is the term created by the commenter to show that the commenter is not religious. The facilitation of interaction is taken place through the usage of Arabic words like *Ummah* and *MaaShaaAllah* by the second and third commenters. It shows that both commenters are associated with the same community of religion due to which they are happy to see the Islamic video trending and also pray for their community. Emoticons are also used in the translingual comments to highlight the expression so the going beyond language strategy is also used but it is the going between language strategy which facilitated the interaction.

Translanguaging has also taken place in the trending video in Pakistan on 2<sup>nd</sup> May 2021 which is the segment of special transmission of the ARY Digital television show Shan

e Iftar. The segment has the host Waseem Badami talking with the children present on the show. The post and comments are given in table 4.44.

## **Table 4.44**

A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on a Ramadan transmission

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Visual		Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
	✓	~				*	
Shan-e-iftar - Segment Roza Kushai - 2nd May 2021 - Waseem Badami & Ahmed shah	,		,				
♦ aj to segment main 4 chand laga diye apne junaid jamshed ke bety pehlaj hur and 1) waleeha aur ahmed shahsabhi satry aik sath masha allah ♥ ♥ ♣ ▲	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
2) Baccha party much loveAhmed is a gem♥♥♥isha is so adorable.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Junid bhai miss you lots Allah ap ki magfirat fermaye 3) Ameen 😒 😒	✓	✓	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
4) Waliha ki Awaz bhut khubsurat hai. Ma sha Allah sab bache bhut talented hain 🎈	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
<ul> <li>Aj to sb se best segment hogya ♥♥</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
Kisi ne notice kiya jab waseem bhai bol rahe the tab umar or abubakr. ki cute wali fighting           b)         ho rahi thi harbo se meri to hassi hi nhi nuk rahi thi         Image: I	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
7) Main Ramadan k baad is segment ko boht miss karun ge	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
As a master of snack video I will spread positivity by my videos by content () Xaa Allah is ad se hm sb ko bchaa ()	✓	✓		✓			
<ul> <li>Ma sha Allah Pyaray Bachay Aur World Best Segment VVV</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Thave no words Masha Allah in teeno ko hamesha khush rakhe aur Allah apne hifzo iman mai rakhe ameen	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				

The viewers loved the interaction of the host with the children and expressed their views through the translingual strategy of going beyond languages by using the term Mashaa Allah and also heart emoticons like comments 1,2,4,5,9 and 10. The child of famous television personality and preacher Junaid Jamshed was also present on the show. The viewers have missed the presence of Junaid Jamshed (Who is no more in this world) on the show in comments 1 and 3. The Ramadan transmission has created a bonding of

viewers who love Islamic content which is evident in comments 2,4,9 and 10 by the usage of the term Mashaa Allah.

The last post from YouTube trended on 6th May 2021 in Pakistan. It also demonstrated that translanguaging created social bonding. The video is the interview of Hafiz Usaid Zahid on ARY news who recited Allah hu Allah which became viral. The translingual comments are shown in table 4.45.

#### **Table 4.45**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language			Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
تلری دحید ظفر کی طرز پر اللہ حو پڑھنے کر جر ان کر دینے والے حافظ اسیر زہدے خصوصی گفتگو ان محمد محمد محمد محمد محمد محمد محمد محم	*	•				√	
Watch Exclusive Interview with Hafiz Usaid Zahid about reciting Allah Hu Allah in viral video Mashallah♥yeh hota hai k allah jisay chahye izzath deyNa k pawri wali girls or nimra ali 1) jiaisay logo ko famous kar k bola jaye Allah jisay chahye izzath dey,	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓	✓			
2) Mashallah mind blowing voice allah inhe age bhi kaim rakhe mehfil.E.Naat sajane ki	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
3) MaShaAllah BarakAllah bohat zabardast andaaz 💜 excellent voice 🥚	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
MashaAllah subhanAllah bohat piyari awaz hai Allah dono jahano mei kamiyabe ata kare. Aameen. Or hamare ary news kay host ko hidayat ata kare ramzan kay mahine or naat <b>4</b> ) sunne par sir par dupatta to Iy liya kare itni sharam to ani chaiye.	~	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
<ul> <li>Mashallah Ø aap bohut femous ho gya ek naat podne ke lia I am so proud</li> </ul>	√	✓	✓	$\checkmark$			
Aoa I would like that hafiz osaid make a full naat video and he make an album soon may 6) Allah swt give him Noor and blessing to	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
7) Masha Allah 🎔 bohat piyari voice he	√	$\checkmark$	✓	$\checkmark$			
Ye naat puri apni awaz main upload kardain beta. Want to listen it again n again. 8) JAZAKALLAH.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
Ye bacha Usman public school ka student tha Aik dafa jb is KO Mairi Ami pressay likhny KO kah gya tu is ny likha k Mairi Ami Ki kwahish ha k mai Haram shareef mai azan do 9) A very proud student for teachers Allah bless you	✓	✓	$\checkmark$				
$10)^{\rm Bht}$ khushi ho ri ha k young larky naat khuwani me agy arahy ha Allah apko kamyab kry $10)^{\rm amen}$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				

A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on an interview

Commenters have frequently used the translingual strategy of going beyond multiple languages, especially by using the term *Masha Allah* to display the likeness of the voice of Hafiz Usaid Zahid especially for reciting the Naat and kalam like in comments 1,2,3,4,5 and 7. Few commenters have also employed the translingual strategy of going beyond languages, for example, praising is also indicated by the use of the heart emoticon in comments 1,3,5, and 7. The likeness is based on the religious connection of the people with the holy recitation so commenters bonded over their religious connection with the help of translanguaging.

## 4.3 Translanguaging for negotiating meaning

The third major theme is generated by taking into view the discussion by Li Wei that language users construct and modify their sociocultural identities and values through translanguaging (Wei, 2018). Data taken from four different digital mediums are analyzed in which the language users have negotiated meaning. The data is examined from four different digital mediums

# 4.3.1 Negotiating Women's issues

Social media is a tool of communication across the globe. With the help of social media, People can debate different social issues like women's issues (Mandal,2022).

Social media like Instagram indicated that translanguaging is used for negotiating the meaning related to women's issues. One such example is taken from the account of a famous Pakistani comedian Zaid Ali who has shared his thoughts on what is the most precious thing for a woman. According to him, a woman needs to be respected more than gifts and for respect, he has used the Urdu word, Izzat. Table 4.46 below has demonstrated the post and the comments on it.

#### **Table 4.46**

A thread from Instagram showing translanguaging on a woman's respect post

	Use o	of modes	
Post/Comments	Language	Visual	Multi

	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
Zaidalit ♥ The most precious thing you can give a woman is Izzat. More than gifts, more than love, a woman needs respect. ♥	✓	✓		✓		
relationship till qayamet .Allah bure $\heartsuit$ 1) nazr sae bachi ammen	✓	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
2) with roti,kapray,daily routine things	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
3) hy aik lady k lye	✓	$\checkmark$				
appYumna bhabhi is so lucky to have youand you are the luckiest to have her @@aaidalit	$\checkmark$	✓		✓		
<ul> <li>(a) A constraint of the analysis of the analysis</li></ul>	$\checkmark$	✓	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
6) admi ise smjhai	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
7) say valentine gift sab ka izzat hai $^{\circ}$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
8) Sha Allah Sha Allah Ma Sha Allah Ma Sha Allah sending lots of love & dua's for you guys and lil munchkin of the state	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Someone is most precious more than 9) love	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
face: tum zara ghar poncho tumhara ilaj karti hun 😄	$\checkmark$	✓				

The Instagram users on this post have creatively expressed their opinions related to the view of Zaid Ali by mixing different languages in their comments. Several languages are used as the mode of translanguaging i.e.; the translingual strategy of going between multiple languages. Some commenters have used the word *izzat* like the main post like in comments 3,7 and 9. The second commenter shares the same opinion as the main post and the Urdu words like *roti* and *kapray* (Clothes) are used by the user. Comments 3,4, 6, and 9 also share the same opinion as the influencer. The tenth commenter has humorously told the situation in which the guy has no gift for the woman and just respects then the look on her face would not be good for the guy. The topic of the most precious thing is respect for the woman is the main focus of the discussion of the post and the responses and negotiating of meaning take place on the stance of what is considered respect for the woman.

Translanguaging for negotiating meaning is also evident in Twitter data. One such instance is *#Stand\_With\_PM\_HayaMovement* which trended on 10<sup>th</sup> April 2021 on Twitter Pakistan after the controversial interview of the Prime minister of Pakistan, Imran Khan in

which he said that obscenity leads to rape. Table 4.47 demonstrated the tweets and the trending topic.

# **Table 4.47**

A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on a Stand with the PM trend

Trend/Comments	L	anguag	je	Visual		Multi
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
#Stand_With_PM_HayaMovement	$\checkmark$		✓			
Ansate the proceeds who are against them down and wheth the interval the interval of the inter	✓		✓		√	
Arrithment Scholar Multi Tagi Damani     Arrithment     Arrithment Scholar Multi Tagi Damani     Arrithment     Arrithmen	✓	~	✓		✓	
<ul> <li>khan's Point is that what Allah says in Quran Majeed.</li> <li>And Those Critics are affiaid of their Role in the society Such liberal peoples know what will happen to them if stamic law are imposed in Pakistan.</li> <li>Mistand With, PM, HapaNovement</li> </ul>	✓		✓			
I stand with PM IX, His current statement regarding fishashi and behayai is totally justified. Storagity condemn the propagandia drive initiated by so-called human rights activitis against PM IX PStand (With, PM, Hayadavement	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
A women's beauty is not in her features, the shade of her skin, or her possession. True beauty is in her heart, her Eman, her Taqwa and Love for her Deen. 5) #Stand_With_PM_HayaMovement	$\checkmark$		✓			
I Support Prime Minister Imran Khan Statement He exactly said what Riyast_e_Madina demands. <b>#Stand_With_PM_HayaMovement</b> 6) @MAJOfficial_	~		√			
For those, who don't support #Stand With, PM, Hayahdovement //	✓		✓		✓	
<text><text><text></text></text></text>	✓		✓		✓	



The analysis of the trending topic showed that more than two languages are used as the mode of translanguaging by tweeters. i.e; the translingual strategy of going between multiple languages is being employed through which people have a similar stance negotiating on Prime Minister Imran khan's interview. The reason for supporting the point of view is given by quoting different personalities like Islamic scholar Mufti Tai Usmani and Bollywood actor Aamir khan. The use of terms like Taqwa, Deen, Eman, fahashi, Quran Majeed, Riyast e Madina and Behayai indicated the religious stance related to the interview such as in tweets 3,4,5 and 6. The translingual strategy of going beyond languages is used by tweeters to negotiate the meaning of the term Haya. The seventh tweeter expressed anger at the people who do not support the point of view of Prime Minister Imran khan related to obscenity leading to rape. The use of the image of Goku, the powerful main character of the anime dragon ball attacking the opponent showed anger as well as a strong stance of not bulging from the position of the tweeter. The eighth tweeter showed a similar stance to the other tweeter but with more calmness and reasoning like the use of the first lady of Pakistan in '*hijab*' with the Prime minister of Pakistan with the caption about pride in wearing hijab. The ninth and tenth tweets showed a sarcastic take on the stance of Prime Minister Imran khan. The tweeters have sarcastically tried to point out the hypocrisy of Prime Minister Imran khan. Tweeters used old pictures of Imran khan attending parties and wearing western clothes and used captions related to haya (modesty) which indicated that the tweeters do not agree with the stance of Prime Minister Imran khan.

A piece of similar evidence is given below in table 4.48 where translanguaging took place for negotiating meaning in the topic of the *Aurat march* which trended on Twitter on 13<sup>th</sup> April 2021 in Pakistan.

# **Table 4.48**

A thread from Twitter depicting translanguaging on an Aurat March trend

Use of modes						
L	anguag	je	Vis	Multi		
English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
$\checkmark$	√					
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
$\checkmark$	✓	✓				
$\checkmark$	✓					
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
✓	√					
$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
✓	~			√		
		English Urdu	Language English Urdu Others	LanguageVisEnglishUrduOthersEmojis	EnglishUrduOthersEmojisImage✓✓	

The tweeters have used different terms to express their point of view related to the Aurat march. The words like 'fahasi' and 'dupatta used in tweets indicate that the Aurat march is against the concept of Islam such as in tweets 6 and 7. The tweets which are in favor of the Aurat march have used different examples to highlight that women are blamed in every condition in Pakistan for instance tweets 5 and 8. The tenth tweet is the only one that has used an image to convey their hatred for the Aurat march. The image is of the man who did a controversial act on a plane with his wife and received criticism from Pakistani people due to it. The ninth tweet has creatively given the stance on the trended topic by using the Aurat march slogan 'aao khan mil Kar banayein' (let's make food together) which also indicates that the tweeter wants equality of genders. So, negotiation of meaning has taken place on the topic of the Aurat March in which the translingual strategy of going between the languages is dominantly used by the tweeter.

YouTube data has also shown that negotiating meaning over women's issues has taken place through translanguaging. YouTube video which trended on 15<sup>th</sup> May 2021 in Pakistan is a music video Badnamiyan that is sung by singer Sahir Ali Bagga and Alizeh Shah which is given below along with comments in table 4.49.

#### **Table 4.49**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language			Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Badnamiyan (Sahir Ali Bagga (Alizeh Shah (Official Music Video   A Presentation by SAB Records	1	✓				✓	
$\left.1 ight)^{\mathrm{sarii}}$ mehnat welding walee ke hai jis ne changariyaan nikalee hain	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Song is Awesome <b>W</b> . Bit is wija se isy hate mily k alizeh Shah ki dressing ap logon ko nai 2) prod that's Not Right	$\checkmark$	✓		√			
In Ehd de Wafa Alizeh: Dupatta And A Doctor Lel In Real Life :, 3) "Teri Bandnamiya"	✓	✓					
She is only wearing tank top nothing cheap for that so many people are commenting bad, like really? Saree phene to thik hai jisme back or tummy dono dikke to chalta hai ? Yaha to 4) usne covered top pheni hai what kind of mentality you have .	✓	✓					

A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on a Music video

Shukr h trending ki wajah se mujhy pta chl gya k ye gana h Warna mujhy lga alizey 5) wrestling kr rhi h	✓	✓		
Sahir bagga should seriously come out of coke studio mindset and also, malang theme. 6) Hogaya age barhao be creative	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
7) 55k ka dislikes karna walo ko Salam 😂 😂 😂	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$
8) Kis kis ko lagta hai Ye Lyrics Alizey shah Pe Bilkul Jajte han??? 😂 🚇	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
56k Dislikes, Geo Pakistanio salute hai apko. Agr aisy hi chalta raha to Alizay zror prda kr ly gi 🎯 😂 😂 😂				
10) Alize shah ne song ke title ko dil pe hi le liya 🍪 🧐	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$

The music video was not related to women but it generated many comments related to female singer Alizeh Shah's dress in the music video. The commenters have criticized the singer by using mainly the translingual strategy of going beyond language comparing her dress with the wrestling clothing and also pointing out that the title of the song Badnamiyan (defamation) is for her and making fun of dislikes on the video in comments 5,8,9,10 mostly by using laughing emoticons. The second and fifth commenters are against dislike and criticism of the music video as well as the dress of the female singer Alizeh Shah. Commenters have a similar stance when it comes to women dressing and they expressed it by using both translingual strategies.

## **4.3.2 Negotiating Religious Beliefs**

Digital platforms have empowered individuals and communities to negotiate notions of religion and authority. They have helped engage people who belong to different mindsets related to one religious' issue (Zaid et al., 2022).

Facebook post which used translanguaging for the negotiation of meaning is from the official page of Shaykh Saqib Iqbal. His page header says that he is the founder of Kanz ul Huda International, a world-renowned Islamic research scholar, and spiritual guide. The main post talks about his written booklet and also says that a special prayer would be conducted by the scholar who owns the page. The post has employed the strategy of going between multiple languages like it is written in English and a few words in Arabic and Urdu are used as well. Laila tul Bara'ah is an Arabic term for the night of blessing which is celebrated by many Muslim communities and the Urdu word '*Ibadat*' means to worship, both of these terms are used by the writer of the post. The main post is given below in table 4.50 along with the comments.

## **Table 4.50**

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a Night of blessings post

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language			Visual		Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Saqib Iqbal March 28 • Better quality, larger font and easily readable booklet for Laila tul Bara'ah preparation and Special Ibadaat tonight by Shaykh Saqib Hh.	$\checkmark$	✓	√				
Assalamu alaikum shaykh sahab im a true follower of yours allah aapko acchi sehat ata farmaien aameen	✓	✓	√				
Bhai namz kon se rat mea hai Ajj ya kal Jara 2) batayenge Confused kar dia hame??	$\checkmark$	✓					
3) it's biddah	✓		✓				
Stop promoting Bidah in islam. It is because of sheikhs 1) like you bidah is still prevalent in islam	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
5)					√		
Bidha people, prophet Muhammad saw never said any 6) thing like this	✓		✓				
Sir pls send in Urdu about we pray in shabe baraat night	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
All the worships & supplications of shab-e-barat excellently expressed.	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
Pls sir benefit us with the verse of Qur'an or an Hadith from our noble Prophet that encourage us to be doing this act Ibaadah.	√		✓				
10) JazakAllah 🤟			$\checkmark$	✓			

The comment section of this post used the strategy of going between multiple languages and at times has also used the going beyond language strategy to emphasize the emotion expressed in the comments. The negotiation of meaning in this case, is around the concept of the night of blessing. Some commenters are in favor of this concept of the night of blessings and some are against it. The commenters have shown their disagreement by using the Arabic term '*Bidaah*' in their otherwise English sentence such as comments 3, 4, and 6. Some users have used the Persian term *Shab e Barat* which also means a night of blessings. They are the commenters who celebrate the night of blessings.

The next post is similar to the above post in such a way that it revolves around the same concept of the Night of blessings. The current post is given below in table 4.51 along with the multilingual comments from the official page of Pakistani celebrity Fahad Mustafa. The term used for this night is *Shab e Barat* in the main post. '*Shab* is a Persian word that means night and *Barat* is an Arabic term for forgiveness. The main post has also used the Urdu word *Mubarak* which means congratulations other than that the whole post is in the English language so the main post is employing the translingual strategy of going between multiple languages.

#### **Table 4.51**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language			Visual		Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
Fahad Mustafa • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	✓		✓		
THE NIGHT OF FORGIVENESS							
Beshak 1) SubhanAllah		✓	✓				
On this night of forgiveness and mercifulness Please remember me, my mother and my Late Father Mr.Naseem Ahmed in your prayers. 2) JazakAllah.	✓		√				
3) Aap ko bhi bhai BOHT mubarak ho with love	$\checkmark$	✓					
4) May Allah SWT pardon to all of us & guide the right path! (Aameen)	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				

A thread from Facebook showing translanguaging on a night of light



The analysis shows that the mode of translanguaging of the present thread is similar to the above thread i.e.; the translingual strategy of going between multiple languages. The discussion in the comment section is centered on the belief in a night of forgiveness. The translingual comments of the followers of the page have used terms from Urdu and Arabic languages in the overall English sentences. But there are comments like comment 3 which have used Urdu dominantly in the sentence and added English phrases to completely express themselves. The commenters who agree with celebrating the night of blessings have used Arabic terms such as *Subhan Allah*, *JazakAllah*, and *Ameen* in comments 1,2, and 4. The commenters showed their disagreement by using terms like *hadith* and *biddah* in comments 6 and 7.

No data from Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube is obtained related to this subtheme. Therefore, this subtheme only included examples from Facebook.

## **4.3.3 Negotiating Political Opinions**

Social media applications provide a platform for people to convey opinions, interests, and activities related to political discourse. A source of information related to politics can generate different types of reactions from people (Hampton et al., 2017).

Facebook data reveals several examples in which the negotiation of meaning takes place through translanguaging. The first such post from Facebook is taken from the page Pakistan defence, in which the admin of the page has used different modes to compare different reporting styles of the Pakistani reporter Umar Cheema. The main post and the top ten comments on the post are shown in table 4.52.

## **Table 4.52**

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a Reporting style post

	Use of modes					
Post/Comments	L	Language			Visual	
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal
Pakistan Defence is with Umair Akhtar and 8 others. January 3 • &						
📷 Professional Journalist 🐚 Liffafa Journalist	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
Civil military leadership appears to be at the same page.Whether they're at the same line or not remains to be seen.						
12:50 FPM - 2016-01-18 - Twitter for Andreas						
Umer Cheems • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • •						
Translate Tweet 11:15 - 02 Jan 21 from بيجاب, پاکستان Twitter for Android						
<ul> <li>mitiary area ahead only authorized persons are allowed.</li> <li>Army hamain kuch samjhti hi nhi state within state banai hoi hai.</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	✓		$\checkmark$		
<ul> <li>My grand father died</li> <li>kal bhi bhutto zinda tha aaj bhi bhutto zinda h.</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	✓		✓		
<ul> <li>a) will join army</li> <li>3) W: DHA mai plot bnau ga</li> </ul>	$\checkmark$	✓		✓		
Professional Journalist     Munafiq Journalist	✓	✓		✓		
4)						
if you ignore mach (hazara) incident you are non lifafa, if 5) you highlight the same incident then you are lafafa.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
6) It reminds me another lifafi named saleem lifafi ()	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$		
Make out a list of your " professional " journalist and " ) lifafa " journalists and reveal who pay them.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
Liffafa Journalist chahtey hien ke pakistan hamesha khalfshar aur Division mien rahe kionke aik Page pe hoye 8) tu mulak Progress kertay Hai wo Inn ko hazzam nahi	✓	✓				
9) Lifafa sahafat is at peak in Pakistan,	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				

I think k government aur fouj ki aik hi page per hona bhi chahiyay... Government of American n Fbi , indian government n RAW are always on the same page .... 10) Why do people have problem with Pakistan

The admin has used the word professional journalist for the reporting style of Umar Cheema in the English language which is indicated by an American flag and 'Liffafa' for Umar Cheema's reporting style in the Urdu language which is indicated by the Pakistani flag. The word *Liffafa's* literal meaning is envelope but 'Liffafa' is also used for journalists who take money to promote a political party or personality etc. It appears that the page manager is aware of the political entities of the Urdu language therefore the word Liffafa is used and the evidence is given by showing the different tones of the tweets of the reporter in Urdu and English language. The tweets are taken from different dates and during the time period of different political parties in the government. The tweet in English was from 2016 in which Umar Cheema talked about civil-military leadership on the same page and emphasized it on the same page by bolding the word 'same page' while the tweet in Urdu from 2021 discussed the bad impact of civil-military leadership on the same page. So, the main post has creatively employed not only the translingual strategy of going beyond languages but also the translingual strategy of going beyond languages.

✓

The top four commenters have followed the pattern of the post admin i.e; they have used both translingual strategies by writing the first sentence or phrase in English which is indicating American people's attitudes and the second sentence in Urdu which is indicating Pakistani people's attitudes. The pattern of the four comments is the same but there is a change of domain. The first comment is related to people's attitudes towards military areas in America versus Pakistan. The second comment refers to the Pakistani political party (PPP)'s slogan in a mocking way. The third comment is mocking Pakistanis' goal of joining the army. The fourth comment is similar to the main post but instead of using 'liffafa', the commenter has used the word 'munafiq' which means hypocrite.

The fifth commenter creatively used the word 'Non-Lifafa' instead of using a professional journalist word like the post admin. Non is the expression of negation in

English and Lifafa is the Urdu word.' Nonlifafa' word is created by the commenter as the opposite of 'Liffafa' and then the commenter has also used the lafafa word as a noun instead of Lifafa as an adjective and Journalist as a noun. The sixth commenter has used the word 'lifafi' as a noun as well as the last name of the journalist mockingly. The last name of the journalist is 'Safi' which is close to the Urdu word 'sahafi' which means Journalist. The commenter has used Lifafi instead of 'Safi' which shows the ability of the commenter to push and break boundaries between Urdu and the English language. The eighth and the tenth commenter have used 'aik' page' like Umar Cheema's Urdu tweet in the main post. 'Aik' means one and combining it with the word page gives a similar meaning to the same page. Their comments refer to the civil-military leadership on the same page in other countries like India and America and complained about the different attitudes of people if the same thing implies in Pakistan. All these comments show that mainly the translingual strategy of going beyond languages is utilized. By using similar Pakistani and American flags emoticons and words like lifafa the admin of the page and the commenters negotiated the meaning of the professional journalist in the Pakistani context and abroad.

The following post is taken from the Facebook page of the political party Pakistan Tehreek i Insaf (PTI). The video shows Prime minister Imran khan giving a speech related to his Ehsaas project and saying that the project is proof of the welfare state that Pakistan has become now. The page operator has used the term *Riyasat e Madina* to indicate the welfare state of Pakistan under the command of the Prime minister of Pakistan Imran khan. The main post of the page along with the comments are given below in table 4.53.

#### **Table 4.53**

		Use of modes
Post/Comments	Language	Visual Multi
	English Urdu C	Others Emojis Image modal

A thread from Facebook depicting translanguaging on a government project

115

Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaf					
Khan to make Pakistan a welfare state on the pattern of Riasat-e- Madina.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			$\checkmark$
#PMIK_2020initiatives					
drw					
+	,	,		,	
Sir hum thak gaye he. Sorry 😦 ap apne waadon p poore	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
) nh utre.					
Sir what happened to the justice of Riasate Medina? why	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
a hard core convicted criminal Maryam Safdar free? She					
got 7 year jail term. If you going to set her free then set all female prisoners free from Pakistani jails.					
BankiBali	1	1			
Dear Khan sahib hzara people are also in riyasat e madina kindly save the toooooo. Innocent people are	•	•			
killed by terrorist take action against this terrorism					
leuniteen:	/			/	
Allah maaf kre aise falahi riyasat se see labourers of muchh, balochistan , slaughtered with	✓	✓		✓	
hands and feet tied 😜 🍋 🍋 🍋 🍋 🍋 riyasat e Madina					
Shohert Abrah	/	/			
Culture of business not culture of beggars, benazir ahsas	✓	✓			
program, Langer,tandoor, sastay bazar, subsidies, Panagah , people will not work, they will think charity					
which is 90% fake!					
	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
That's what we need, keep this up, that's our basic requirement to bring prosperity to the nation, our way to	•				
great future and getting rid of the Kashkol.					
Please cut imports of any non essential items					
Kash imram Khan just police tehk Kar la to ma apko man	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
jaon kuenka jab Tak is mulk ki police tehk nhi hoti ya mulk tariqi nhi Kar sakta					
	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$			
My dear God bless you sir And you beautiful children's	•				
Hero prime minister imran Khan is hero and Great Leader and zindabad pti government zindabad					
	./				
Mishal Khan Masha Allah! What a blessing from Allah swt.	v	v	v		
ShukriyaPMIK <b>#Panahgah</b>					
Whoever is at the helm of the affairs! I have a question.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$	
For how long a person is allowed to stay in a Panagah? Moreover if there are 4 Panagahs for men, there should					
(0) be 1 for Women. All guarded by police. For destitute women, who are insecure and have nowhere to go.					

Facebook users have written different remarks related to Pakistan as Riyasat e Madina (welfare state). Commenters have talked about various problems faced by the Pakistani people by using the translingual strategy of going between languages. For that few of them mocked the state by using the term *Riyasat e Madina* like the comments 2,3 and 4. The fourth commenter has also used the clapping emoticon for mocking the government's use of the term *Riyasat Madina*. There were some translingual multilingual commenters has shown disappointment in government performance by using a sad emoticon. Some commenters expressed their happiness with the performance of the government and for this, they creatively used the *shukriya* (Thank you) and *government* 

*zindabad* among the whole English sentences like in comment 9. The ninth commenter also added the Arabic phrase, *Masha Allah*, for complimenting Prime minister Imran Khan. Comment 6 has cleverly used the term *'Kashkol'* which means Bowl but in a political context in Pakistan, it is seen as the bowl used by the beggars for asking for money. Whenever the government asks for loans from the international monetary fund (IMF) or some other country. It is considered as begging or in other words kashkol by the opposition party but comment 6 has used it in the hope of the government not repeating the mistake done by the past governments and handling the finances in a better way. This thread indicates the negotiation of meaning around the concept of Riyasat Madina used by the Government of Pakistan.

Instagram data related to this subtheme was not obtained so Instagram data is not included in this section. But like Facebook, Twitter data also indicated that translingual communication helps in the negotiation of meaning. Such an instance can be observed in the trending topic *VaccineChorHakoomat* trended on 1<sup>st</sup> April 2021 on Twitter in Pakistan. The trended topic and tweets are given below in table 4.54.

#### **Table 4.54**

	Use of modes						
Trend/Comments	Language			Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
VaccineChorHakoomat	√	✓					
If you want to stay alive in Naya Pakistan, you better be rich. 1) <sup>#VaccineChorHakoomat</sup>	✓	~					
#This government is vaccin chorr lkh laant niazi 2) #VaccineChorHakoomat	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
apka chor mera chor hm sbka chor 3) #vaccinechorHakoomat	√	✓					
After Atta chor, Cheeni chor, Medicine roher in the cap, "vaccine chor", PTI government has become habitual of theft, from vote theft to now vaccine theft	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
4) #VaccineChorHakoomat							
Shame on IK. Earlier door to door Bheek for his kitchen expenses and ayashi and now for vote <b>@ @ @</b> Mungta hee reha humeshal! 5) <b>#VaccineChorHakoomat</b>	$\checkmark$	✓		$\checkmark$			

A thread from Twitter showing translanguaging on a stealing vaccine trend



The tweets on the controversial topic in which the government is accused of stealing vaccines are discussed in the trend '*VaccineChorHakoomat*'. The mode of translanguaging is Urdu and English languages i.e; going between languages strategy. The word '*chor*' which means thief is frequently used in tweets and this word is also present in the trended topic. It is also the word which is negotiated by the tweeters in such a way that the term '*chor*' is not only used with the word 'vaccine' like the trend but also used with other daily used items like *atta* (Flour) and *cheeni* (Sugar). The first tweeter sarcastically commented on the trended topic and claimed that the person should be rich to live in *Naya* (New) Pakistan. Naya Pakistan is an ideology promoted by the ruling party of Pakistan that is the belief that a new government will be better than previous governments and corruption will not be tolerated during the ruling party's governing period. The tweet is showing irony in the way that the government claimed to treat all citizens equally but according to tweet 1, only the rich can live in this Naya Pakistan.

Many tweets used Images and videos which indicates that the strategy of going beyond languages is also employed. The sixth tweeter showed the image shared by a Twitter user in which Prime Minister of Pakistan Imran khan's picture is used in the word 'Chor' (Thief) to indicate agreement with the trended topic. The seventh tweeter has used a flowchart to show how PTI finance ministers blame each other for the bad condition of the economy. The eighth tweeter has tried to calm down the people who are criticizing the government on the trended topic by saying that elites getting vaccines before the others have made them lab rats so other people should take a chill pill. The ninth tweeter shared a video clip from the Pakistan News channel 'Geo' which reported that vaccines that arrived first are given to the elites and the tenth tweet shared a 1-minute Political satire song on Prime Minister Imran Khan's famous speech dialogue *Aap ne ghabrana nahi hai* (You don't need to worry). Both translingual strategies are employed by tweeters to negotiate over the topic of vaccine stealing.

YouTube data also shows that translanguaging helped in negotiating meaning. One such instance is the trended video on 16<sup>th</sup> April 2021 in Pakistan from the session of the National assembly of Pakistan which is given along with comments in table 4.55 below.

Use of modes

#### **Table 4.55**

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	Language			Vis	Multi		
	English	Urdu	Others	Emojis	Image	modal	
اسمبلی میں بیٹھے ہوئے لوگ دہشت گرد ہیں تر کم کی لیک ٹیس! یہاں بیٹا برقش ٹی پاک مان بی مان پر مان پر مان تر ان کرنے کے لیے تاریج میں بیٹا برقش ٹی پاک مان پر مان پر مان تر ان کرنے کے لیے تاریج میں بیٹا برقش کی بیٹر میں مان میں میں مان میں	✓	✓				✓	
Assembly Is this really senate? Fighting for assige rasool, what a low level senate instead talking 1) progressive discussing conservativenes	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
2) Must noticed 04:45, he's saying himself ashiq+rasool. But he can't recite darood-pak.	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$				
3) Znda bad great speech ♥।	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			
4) Allah ayse log b assembly main bethy hn 😕 😕	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$			

A thread from YouTube depicting translanguaging on a Debate on Ban on TLP

Boht aalaw 👌 lekin moulana sahab ye hukoomat aashiq e rasool nh yahoodio k agents hn 5) 90	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		$\checkmark$
6) MashAllah love u sir Allah apko zindagi dy Salahuddin sb	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
7) (((SALLALLAHU ALAE HE WASALLAM ))) janab speaker durood pak to pamha seekh lo	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
8) well done sir allha ap ko salamt rakhy ameen	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	
9) Huzoor pak(SAW) sey muhabbat show krny k liye TLP join krna zaruri nai ! Ye molwi log fasad phela rhy.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
10)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$		
Pti dehshat gard parti hai confirm pti mein total hukmaran yahodi agent hain ALLAH PAK is parti ko nistunabood kray				

The debate is related to the ban on the political party of Pakistan Tehreek e labbaik Pakistan (TLP). Maulana Salahuddin Ayubi from the political party Jamiat ulema e Islam F (JUI F) is of the view that TLP should not be banned. There is a need for negotiation between the government and the TLP and Ali Muhammad Khan from the ruling party, Pakistan Tehreek I Insaf told the assembly that the government tried to negotiate with TLP but they did not want to listen to the government and no one is allowed to pressurize the government to take any decision with force. The viewers of the video have given different reactions to the video by using the translingual strategy of going between multiple languages. For instance, the use of the term Aashiq e Rasool to express different viewers like the first commenter has used it to criticize the national assembly for discussing the conservative topic and the second commenter has pointed out the claim of the JUI-F member who cannot recite Darood Pak which shows that the member is not real 'Aashiq e Rasool and the fifth commenter praised the same member and used the term' aashiq e rasool for him and called PTI as Yahodi agents (Agents of Jews). The viewers who agree with JUI-F members' views have used terms like Mashaa Allah, subhan Allah, well done, and great such as in comments 3,6,7, and 8. Few commenters like the fourth commenter have incorporated the translingual strategy of going beyond languages by using emotions like a confused emoticon to ask a question that these types of people are sitting in the assembly. The comments revolved around the topic of a ban on the political party TLP, the people who agreed to it used affirmative terms and the people in disagreement modified the topic and expressed their views.

The Last post is taken from the trending YouTube video of Mufti Abdul Shakoor's speech from the session of the national assembly of Pakistan on YouTube. Comments are given below in table 4.56.

### **Table 4.56**

A .1 1/		1 .	. 1 .	• 1
A thread t	trom YouTube	showing	translanguaging	in a sneech
11 milliona j	10111 10111 1100	Showing	" anstanguaging	in a specen

	Use of modes						
Post/Comments	L	anguag	e	Visual		Multi	
	English	Urdu	Others	<u>Emojis</u>	Image	modal	
فرانس یا ماشق رسول؟؟ تکومت فیما کر کے بے وزیر داخلر قائل !! 	✓	✓	✓			√	
France Or Ashiq Rasool (SAW) Govt Chose One Of Them!! Mufti Abdul Shakoor Emotional Speech							
1 ight)Great Dil jeet Liya Sir apne Allah apko izzat dy aur Yai PTI k Din ab pory hoye	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
2) great sir ALLAH APKO AUR IZAT DAY	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Good allah pak din aur duniya ma hamaray pyara aga hazrat muhammad s.a.w ka sadqay kamyabi ata farmay aur hamay aur ap ko hazoor s.a.w ki gulami ma zindagi bsar karnay ko tofig dy ameen 3) Labail labaik ya rasoolallah (s.a.w)	✓	✓	✓				
<ol> <li>Allah talah hum sab muslims ko paka or sacha namazi banaye sunnat per chalne wala banaye and sacha ashiq e rasool banaye ameen.</li> </ol>	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
5)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
6)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
salute to you Sir your words were absolutely rightkhuda salamt rakhe Ashiq e Rasool ko.							
Waaah Subhan Allah Abdul Shakor Sahab you r great agr ab b ye na samijhain hon to Afsoos 7) hy in py.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$					
Imran Niazi Aaj Ka YAZEED Hay. Allah Ka Qahir Nazil HO Mr. Niazi Imran per. Speaker is 8) playing the role of Ibn i Ziad. He will be punished from Allah Ta'ala soon.	$\checkmark$	✓					
9)	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				
Zabardast khan sahab yakenan ALLAH subhantallah, aap sey khush huay hongey aap ney nabi ke hurmat ka difah bharpoor andaz main kia, GOD bless u.	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$	$\checkmark$				

The mode of translanguaging used by the commenters is Urdu and English and in some cases Arabic. i.e; the strategy of going between languages is dominantly utilized. For instance, the commenters have used the terms like *Allah*, *Hazrat Muhammad (SAW) ka* sadqay, Sunnat, and Aashiq e Rasool which indicates their agreement with Mufti Abdul Shakoor's view which is related to the perception of Islam. Great sir phrase is used by the first and second commenters which means that they agreed with the stance of Mufti Abdul Shakoor and have a similar stance. The eighth commenter has used the term 'Yazeed' for

Prime minister Imran khan and called the speaker of the national assembly of Pakistan 'Ibn i Ziad'. The commenter displayed disagreement with the government's decision by using these names for the people governing the country Pakistan who are considered bad people in Islam. Overall translanguaging is used to express the stance of commenters related to the speech in the national assembly.

# CHAPTER 5 CONCLUSION

This study explores the translanguaging strategies used by Pakistani social media users on four digital mediums i.e., Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube. I start the chapter with findings and discussion about each research question then in the light of the literature review. I gave recommendations for future researchers. In the end, I discuss the limitations of the thesis and ended the chapter with concluded remarks.

# **5.1 Findings**

To gain an overall picture of the usage of different translingual strategies by Pakistani users. The total number of posts along with comments and different translingual strategies on four mediums are calculated in Table 5.1.

#### Table 5.1

			Translingual Strategies		
Themes	Mediums	Total No of Posts/Comments	Between Languages	Beyond Languages	Both
Translanguaging	Facebook	110	65	23	22
for Facilitating	Instagram	88	34	1	53
Interaction	Twitter	44	27	5	12
	YouTube	33	9	3	21
Translanguaging	Facebook	88	44	19	25
for Creating					
Social Bonding	Instagram	55	16	0	39
	Twitter	33	23	0	10
	YouTube	33	10	1	22
	Facebook	44	30	2	12
	Instagram	11	8	0	3

Translingual Strategies Used by Pakistani Users on Social Media

Translanguaging	Twitter	33	20	0	13
for Negotiating	YouTube	33	22	0	11
Meaning					

The first research question was focused on the extent of translanguaging strategies employed by Pakistani Digital medium users on social media. It was used to identify the extent of translanguaging strategies employed by Pakistani users. As seen in Table 5.1, digital mediums like Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube are used as translingual spaces by Pakistani media users which allowed them to go between the different linguistic structures as well as go beyond the named languages and even do both. The data from four different mediums revealed the dominance of translingual communication especially when the boundaries between named languages are broken down. It indicates that Pakistani users have the creative ability to push and break boundaries between named languages to facilitate interaction, create social bonding, and negotiate meaning. Both translingual strategies are preferred to be used instead of using one translingual strategy of going beyond languages. The reason can be that the translingual space provides a platform for users to use different resources to articulate their views instead of restricting them to using traditional practices. Facebook users have employed translanguaging strategies more than the other three mediums (Instagram, Twitter, and YouTube) users. The reason can be that Facebook provides more affordance than other mediums which have restrictions like word limits.

The second research question attempted to investigate the salient characteristics of the translanguaging strategies employed by Pakistani media users. Different named languages are used in the translingual strategy of going between languages in which English and Urdu languages are dominantly used. In the case of translanguaging between multiple named languages, Arabic languages especially the terms like Masha Allah, Assalamualaikum, and Ameen are frequently used by Pakistani users. A few Persian words like Khair and shab are also used by Pakistani users but these words are always accompanied by the Urdu words like Mubarak. A few Punjabi and Pashto words are also used by Pakistani users in response to the admin of the page who has also used the same term in the main post. Usage of all these linguistic characteristics in communication shows the socio-historical connection of Pakistani users. Pakistani users have preferred to use emoticons over images or gifs, or videos beyond translingual strategy, and even in the case of using both translingual strategies. The reason can be that emoticons are part of keywords used for writing on social media platforms and the emoticons can express emotions without using many words.

Translanguaging used by Pakistani users is similar to the translanguaging employed by the Facebook page Kongish daily admins and commenters analyzed by Li Wei (2020). The translanguaging in digital communication in both cases used the writing scripts of different named languages and stylized signs and symbols like emoticons. The only difference between the translanguaging strategies is the named languages are different in both cases.

Translingual space in the present study has shown that it has transformative power because it combined and generated different practices as pointed out by Li Wei (2011) in the form of creativity and criticality. Creativity is embraced by following and flouting norms of language use in the translingual space. Criticality is evident, especially in the theme of negotiating the meaning revolving around women's issues, religious beliefs, and political opinions. In the theme, Pakistani users have employed the translingual strategy of going between languages to question and problematize the view expressed in the main post.

Transcending defined language boundaries did not create any hurdle in the facilitation of interaction, creating social bonding, or negotiating meaning which indicates that Pakistani users have interpreted main posts by reading the multiple cues in a coordinated manner. This act is considered to be a translanguaging instinct by Li Wei (2018) which also indicates that communicators have a single linguistic repertoire from which they select features strategically to communicate effectively and it coincides with Garcia's research work (2009).

## **5.2 Recommendations for Research**

The study aimed to identify and investigate the translanguaging strategies employed by Pakistani social media users. There is still a lack of research related to translanguaging in digitally mediated communication. Therefore, there is a need to do further research in this area.

The following are the recommendations for the future researcher:

- 1. Future research can be conducted on the usage of regional languages in the translingual digital media communication of Pakistani users.
- Future research based on translanguaging on other social media platforms like WhatsApp and TikTok which are frequently used by Pakistani users can also be of significant interest.
- Time span of the social media application can be increased for future research to have a more in-depth and detailed analysis of the translingual strategies employed by Pakistani social media users.
- 4. The focus of future research can be on one specific social media unlike the four social media platforms taken by the present study so that the translingual strategies employed by Pakistani social media users on specific media platforms can be studied in depth.

## 5.3 Limitations

The focus of the study was limited to the top ten trends/influencers and twenty pages on four social media platforms. Top Pakistani Facebook pages are taken as data but the pages which have Urdu-written posts are not selected as the data for the study. The reason is that the research is under the discipline of English linguistics so English-written posts are selected as the data for the study. The top ten translingual comments are taken into account from each main post of all four social media applications. A time span of research on the four social media platforms is for two to three months which may be not sufficient for a more detailed and in-depth understanding of the translingual strategies used by Pakistani social media users.

## **5.4 Conclusion**

In multilingual societies like Pakistan, languages are regularly meshed and mixed for meaning-making, especially on social media but still, it is an under-researched area. The present study is significant due to its focus on identifying multilinguals' practice of using translingual strategies and their linguistic characteristics in digital mediums. Digital media communication is important to study multilingual language usage. The reason is the vast usage of these platforms for communication and no restriction to perform only monolingual practices. The study is therefore expected to be helpful for language policymakers to understand the importance of translanguaging in communication. It is also significant for teachers indicated by Garcia's view (2009) that translingual teaching practices can provide a better way of teaching as well as testing the children. It is also significant for supporting the stance that multilinguals are creative communicators instead of linguistically deficient in multilingual research and that multilingual practices should be given equal status to monolingual practices.

# REFERENCES

- Aghai, L. (2019). What teachers need to know about English language learners' translanguaging in the classroom. In J. Keengwe & G. Onchwari (Eds.). Handbook of research on assessment practices and pedagogical models for immigrant students (pp. 109-126). IGI Global.
- Aiken, C., & Propst, R. (2019). Applied empathetic instruction for limited-level
  English learners with weekly grade-level CSOs. In C.A. Lenkaitis & M.S.
  Hilliker (Eds.). *Engaging teacher candidates and language learners with authentic practice* (pp. 288-308). IGI Global.
- Albawardi, A. (2018). The translingual digital practices of Saudi females on WhatsApp. *Discourse, Context & Media*, 25, 68-77.
- Alsaawi, A. (2019). Translanguaging in the case of bilingual university students. International Journal of English Linguistics, 9(6).
- Anwar, S. (2019, June 19). *Social media, what are you doing to me?* Retrieved from Daily Times: https://dailytimes.com.pk/414300/social-media-what-are-you-doing-to-me/
- Argaez, E. d. (2020). *Internet world users by language*. Retrieved April 26, 2020, fromInternet world stats: https://www.internetworldstats.com/stats7.htm
- Baker, C. (2011). Foundations of bilingual education and bilingualism. Multilingual Matters.
- Barbosa, M. R. (2020). Moving towards translanguaging. In A.Slapac & S.A. Coppersmith (Eds.). *Beyond language learning instruction* (pp. 208-232). IGI Global.

- Barton, D., & Lee, C. (2013). Language online: Investigating digital texts and practices. Routledge.
- Bauer, E. B., & Harrison, D. (2015). Handbook of research on cross-cultural approachesto language and literacy development. IGI global.
- Blackledge, A. & Creese, A. (2017). Translanguaging and the body. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 14(3), 250-268.
- Blommaert, J. (2013). Language and the study of diversity. *Tilburg Papers in CultureStudies*, 74, 1-14.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, *3*(2), 77-101.
- Canagarajah, S. (2011). Codemeshing in academic writing: Identifying teachable strategies of translanguaging. *The Modern Language Journal*, 95(3), 401-417.
- Canagarajah, S. & Ashraf, H. (2013). Multilingualism and education in South Asia: Resolving policy/practice dilemmas. *Annual Review of Applied Linguistics*, 33,258-285.
- Carmen, M. D., García, M., & Agulló, G. L. (2020). Researching English as a medium of instruction in university lecturers' teaching methodology. In M.P. Sánchez (Eds.). *Teacher training for English-medium instruction in higher education* (pp. 205- 231). IGI Global.
- Cenoz, J. & Gorter, D. (2011). Focus on multilingualism. *The Modern Language Journal*, 95(3), 356-369.
- Cenoz, J. & Gorter, D. (2017). Minority languages and sustainable translanguaging: Threat or opportunity? *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural*

Development, 38(10), 901-91

Childs, M. (2016). Reflecting on translanguaging in multilingual classrooms:

Harnessing the power of poetry and photography. *Educational Research for Social Change*, *5*(1), 22-40.

Coulson, D. G., Datta, S., & Sugawara, M. (2019). Local implementation

of international baccalaureate in the Japanese secondary school system. In C. Denman & R. Al- Mahrooqi (Eds.). *Handbook of research on curriculum reform initiatives in English education* (pp. 36-51). IGI Global.

- Csillik, E., & Golubeva, I. (2020). Dealing with language gap in a Hungarian-English early childhood classroom. In M.E. Gómez & C.A. Huertas. *International approaches to bridging the language gap* (pp. 168-194). IGI Global.
- Danet, B., & Herring, S. C. (2007). *The multilingual Internet: Language, culture, and communication online*. Oxford University Press on Demand.
- Daniel, S. M., & Pacheco, M. B. (2016). Translanguaging practices and perspectives of four multilingual teens. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy*, 59(6), 653-663.
- Darvin, R. (2019). Creativity and criticality: Reimagining narratives through translanguaging and transmediation. *Applied Linguistics Review* .
- Deroo, M. R. (2020). Translanguaging pedagogy to support bi/multilingual students' language learning in social studies. In A. Slapac & S.A. Coppersmith (Eds.). Beyond language learning instruction. 233-261: IGI Global.

Duarte, J. (2018). Translanguaging in the context of mainstream multilingual

education. International Journal of Multilingualism, 1-16.

Dudovskiy, J. (2018). The ultimate guide to writing a dissertation in business studies: Astep-by-step Assistance. USA.

Facebook Pages Stats in Pakistan. (2008, October). Retrieved April 27, 2020,

From Socialbakers:https://www.socialbakers.com/statistics/facebook/ pages/ total/pakistan

Fuchs, C. (2018). Nationalism 2.0: The making of Brexit on social media.

- Garcia, O. (2011). *Bilingual education in the 21st century: A global perspective.* JohnWiley & Sons.
- Garcia, O. (2009). Education, multilingualism and translanguaging in the 21st
  Century. In T.S. Kangas, R. Phillipson, A.K. Mohanty, & M. Panda (Eds.).
  Social justice through multilingual education (pp. 140-158). USA: British
  Library.
- García, O. (2020). Translanguaging and Latinx Bilingual Readers. *The Reading Teacher*, 73(5), 557-562.
- García, O. & Lin, A. M. (2017). Translanguaging in bilingual education. *Bilingual andMultilingual Education*, 117-130.
- Gay, L. R., Mills, G. E., & Airasian, P. W. (1976). *Educational research: Competenciesfor analysis and application*. Columbus: OH: Merrill.
- Hampton, K. N., Shin, I., & Lu, W. (2017). Social media and political discussion: when online presence silences offline conversation. *Information, Communication & Society*, 20(7), 1090-1107.

Han, Y. (2018). Translanguaging as transnational spaces: Chinese visiting scholars'

language practices on WeChat. International Journal of Multilingualism, 1-22.

- Holliday, A. (2015). Chapter three Qualitative Research and Analysis. In B.
  Paltridge, & A. Phakiti. (Eds.). *Research methods in applied linguistics: A practical resource* (pp. 53-54). Bloomsbury Publishing.
- Howlett, K. M., & Young, H. D. (2019). Preparing teachers to effectively engage with young English language learners and immigrant families. In J. Keengwe & G. Onchwari (Eds.). *Handbook of research on engaging immigrant families and promoting academic success for English language learners* (pp. 20-45). IGI Global.
- Ilosvay, K. (2020). Dynamics of translanguaging practices. In A.Slapac & S.A. Coppersmith (Eds.). *Beyond language learning instruction* (pp. 262-280). IGIGlobal.
- Islam, M. T. (2019). The impact of social media on muslim society: From islamic perspective. *International Journal of Social and Humanities Sciences*, 3(3), 95-114.
- Jaworska, S. (2014). Playful language alternation in an online discussion forum: The example of digital code plays. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 56-68.
- Johnson, D. C. (2010). Implementational and ideological spaces in bilingual education language policy. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 13(1), 61-79.
- Jonsson, C. (2013). Translanguaging and multilingual literacies: Diary-based case studies of adolescents in an international school. *International Journal of the Sociology ofLanguage*, 2013(224), 85-117.
- Karnes, E. H., & Hansen-Thomas, H. (2020). Emergent bilinguals in rural schools.
  In A.Slapac & S.A.Coppersmith (Eds.). *Beyond language learning instruction* (pp.332-361). IGI Global.
- Kim, M., & Kim, J. (2020). How does a celebrity make fans happy? Interaction Between celebrities and fans in the social media context. *Computers in Human Behavior*, 111, 106419.
- Kim, S. (2018). "It was kind of a given that we were all multilingual": Transnational youth identity work in digital translanguaging. *Linguistics and Education*, 39-52.
- King, J. R. (2015). Sociolinguistic and educational perspectives on code switching in classrooms. In P. Smith (Ed.). *Handbook of research on cross-cultural approaches to language and literacy development* (pp. 345-366). IGI Global.
- Kirsch, C. (2017). Translanguaging practices during storytelling with the app iTEO in preschools. *Translation and Translanguaging in Multilingual Contexts*, 145-166.
- Kramsch, C., & Whiteside, A. (2007). Three fundamental concepts in second languageacquisition and their relevance in multilingual contexts. *The Modern LanguageJournal*, 91, 907-922.
- Kwon, J. (2019). Parent-Child translanguaging among transnational immigrant families in museums. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 1-16.
- Lewis, G., Jones, B., & Baker, C. (2012). Translanguaging. *Educational Research* andEvaluation, 18(7), 641-654.

Lu, D., Neves, L., Carvalho, V., Zhang, N., & Ji, H. (2018, July). Visual attention model for name tagging in multimodal social media. In *Proceedings of the* 56th Annual Meeting of the Association for Computational Linguistics (Volume 1: Long Papers) (pp.1990-1999).

Mandal, A. K. (2022). A study on impact of social media on women empowerment

in India. EPRA International Journal of Multidisciplinary Research (IJMR), 8(2), 168-170.

- Mazak, C., & Donoso, C. H. (2015). Translanguaging practices at a bilingual university: A case study of a science classroom. *International Journal of Bilingual Educationand Bilingualism*, 18(6), 698-714.
- McCaffrey, K. T., & Taha, M. C. (2019). Rethinking the digital divide: Smartphones as translanguaging tools among middle eastern refugees in New Jersey. *Annals of Anthropological Practice*, 26-38.
- McCracken, M. (2017). Translanguaging as a tool to preserve L1 languages and promotemultilingualism. *Universiteit Leiden*, 20-38.
- Ng, L. L., & Lee, S. (2019). Translanguaging practices and identity construction of multilingual Malaysian university graduates in digital media. *English Teaching &Learning*, 105-123.
- Oliver, R., & Nguyen, B. (2017). Translanguaging on Facebook: Exploring Australian aboriginal multilingual competence in technology-enhanced environments and its pedagogical implications. *Canadian Modern Language Review*, 463-487.

Pakistan Youtube Trends. (2021). Retrieved from YoutubeTrends-Pakistan:

https://yt-trends.iamrohit.in/Pakistan

- Pimienta, D., Prado, D., & Blanco, Á. (2009). Twelve years of measuring linguistic diversity in the Internet: balance and perspectives.
- Pontier, R., & Gort, M. (2016). Coordinated translanguaging pedagogy as distributed cognition: A case study of two dual language bilingual education preschool Coteachers' languaging practices during shared book readings. *International Multilingual Research Journal*, 10(2), 89-106.
- Pyles, D. G., Rish, R. M., & Warner, J. (2019). Negotiating place and space through digital literacies: Research and practice (digital media and learning). Information Age Publishing.
- Quental, C., & Gouveia, L. B. (2018). Participation sphere. In S. Chhabra (Ed.). Handbook of research on civic engagement and social change in contemporarysociety (pp. 16-39). IGI Global.
- Reyes, I. (2004). Functions of code switching in schoolchildren's conversations. BilingualResearch Journal, 28(1), 77-98.
- Rossatto, C. A., Soria, B. G., & Aguirre, J. (2019). The transborderization of neoliberalism. In J. Keengwe & G. Onchwari (Eds.). *Handbook of research onassessment practices and pedagogical models for immigrant students* (pp. 355-366). IGI Global.
- Schreiber, B. R. (2015). Multilingual identity and digital translanguaging. *Language Learning & Technology*, 69-87.
- Shah, M. Pillai, S., & Sinayah, M. (2019). Translanguaging in an academic setting. *Lingua*, 225, 16-31.
- Smith, H. L. & Iyengar, K. M. (2018). Mi Familia. In Keengwe & G. Onchwari

(Eds.).*Handbook of research on pedagogies and cultural considerations for young English language learners* (pp. 169-191). IGI Global.

- Social Media Stats in Pakistan . (2020, February). Retrieved March 15, 2020, from StatCounter GlobalStats: https://gs.statcounter.com/social-mediastats/all/pakistan
- Song, K. (2016). "Okay, I will say in Korean and then in American": Translanguaging practices in bilingual homes. Journal of Early Childhood Literacy, 16(1), 84-106.
- Top 10 Instagram influencers in Pakistan . (2016). Retrieved April 27, 2020, from

Heepsy: https://<u>www.heepsy.com/ranking/top-instagram-influencers-in-</u> pakistan

- Tritama, H. B., & Tarigan, R. E. (2016). The effect of social media to the brand awareness of a product of a company. *CommIT (Communication and Information Technology) Journal*, 10(1), 9-14.
- Trysnes, I., & Synnes, R. M. (2022). The role of religion in young Muslims' and Christians' self-presentation on social media. *YOUNG*, *30*(3), 281-296.
- Tsuchiya, K. (2017). Co-constructing a translanguaging space: Analysing a Japanese/ELF group discussion in a CLIL classroom at university. *Translation and Translanguaging in Multilingual Contexts*, *3*(2), 229-253.
- *Top Twitter Trends For Pakistan.* (2021). Retrieved from Trends24 Pakistan: https://trends24.in/pakistan/
- Velasco, P., & Fialais, V. (2018). Moments of metalinguistic awareness in a Kindergartenclass: Translanguaging for simultaneous biliterate development.
   *International Journal of Bilingual Education and Bilingualism*, 21(6), 760-

- Velasco, P., & García, O. (2014). Translanguaging and the writing of bilingual learners. *Bilingual Research Journal*, 37(1), 6-23.
- Wang, X. (2013). Connecting users with similar interests for group understanding.Arizona State University.
- Wei, L. (2011). Moment analysis and translanguaging space: Discursive construction of identities by multilingual Chinese youth in Britain. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 43(5),1222-1235.
- Wei, L. (2016). New Chinglish and the post-multilingualism challenge: TranslanguagingELF in China. *Journal of English as a Lingua Franca*, 5(1), 1-25.
- Wei, L. (2018). Translanguaging as a practical theory of language. Applied linguistics, 39(1), 9-30.
- Wei, L., Tsang, A., Wong, N., & Lok, P. (2020). Kongish Daily: Researching translanguaging creativity and subversiveness. *International Journal of Multilingualism*, 17(3), 309-335.
- Williams, C. (2002). A language gained: A study of language immersion at 11-16 yearsof age. Bangor: School of Education.
- Zaid, B., Fedtke, J., Shin, D. D., El Kadoussi, A., & Ibahrine, M. (2022). Digital Islam and Muslim millennials: How social media influencers reimagine religious authority and islamic practices. *Religions*, 13(4), 335
- Zhao, S., & Flewitt, R. (2019). Young Chinese immigrant children's language and literacypractices on social media: A translanguaging perspective. *Language* and Education, 1-19

## APPENDICES

## Appendix A: Facebook Translingual posts

<b>-</b> th			
5 <sup>th</sup>	Rahat Fateh	1 BILLION+ views for #ZarooriTha,	1) Always Love
Januar	AliKhan	Aapka pyaar humein tab bhi	Y
y ,2021	AllKlidli	zaroori tha aur aaj bhi. Thank you	ouUstad Jee
,2021		all for loving this song and taking	
		this songup to such a level of	PEN
		greatness! 🧡	SUI
		Keep listening and	2)
		sharing.Shamir Tandon	3) Love u very
		#khalilurrehmanqamarofficia	Rahat Sir
		lSahir ali bagga	
			4) Congratulations Ustad
		#ustadrahatfatehalikhan	
		#salmanahmed	
		L love	
		veryverymicht	5)
			/
			6) Congratulations king of
			theSufi music my
			inspiration
			7) This song and you
			deservemore than this
			record
			and
			Insha'Allah you will achieve it
			8) Thank you for giving us a
			soultouching song
			#UstadRFAKhan
			9) Well Deserved For This
			SongRFAK Jee
			10) sir congratulation right
			nowsir your Sufi music all
			world
			inspiration

20 <sup>th</sup> Februar y,2021	Atif Aslam	Hope you guys enjoyed Aadat, Zindagi& Bheegi Yaadein at the PSL opening ceremony! Good luck to all the teams. Let's seewho wins the trophy!	1) Love your performance Atif Aslam you are rockstar mashallah. Allah Pak apko aor kamiyabi ata kry (Ameen) I'm super obsessed with your voice I was just dancing and fluttering like daffodils when I watch ur psl opening
			<ul> <li>performance love it</li> <li>2) Sir, you are really a rockstar. You remind the memories of jaal pari album.</li> <li>It was the golden time of my life</li> <li>3) Thizzzz version of adat</li> <li>4) That ooo in aadat was amazingand record breaking</li> <li>5) Bro agr ye sab live or originalho jata to kamaal ki ceremony honi thi but unfortunately All is Fake and</li> </ul>
			Animated ceremony 6) Hum zyada khush hote agar ye performance Pakistan mainhoti
			But still your performance wasgood 7) Poori ceremony ma yae to acha tha baaki I'm still searchingwhat is groove
			9) Enjoyed it like crazzzyyyyyyyUstaad Atif Aslam jiiiiii <b>2000 57 57 57</b> That " Alaap " in Aadat !!!Whuuuuufffff

			10) Woh lamhey And adat areall tym fav one love you bhai
15 <sup>th</sup> march, 2021	Pakistan cricket team	<ul> <li>First Pakistani to score 1000</li> <li>runsin Tests in a calendar year.</li> <li>Hero of Pakistan's first Test win atLord's.</li> <li>One of the finest openingbatsmen of Pakistan.</li> <li>Happy Birthday Moshin Khan!</li> </ul>	<ol> <li>Happy birthday</li> <li>Mohsinbhai</li> <li>I his batting.</li> <li>Looks those are saying that baber, kholi, and others recent players are stars, but I would sayjust look his bat aesi 3rd class bat say ham tennis cricket nhi kehlty.</li> <li>Pakistan team was doinggood when he was coach. ALLAH HEMESHA</li> <li>KHUSH REKHY AAMEEN</li> <li>Iambi umar kary</li> <li>Mohsin khan mohib-e- wataninsan hy praud to pakistan 6)</li> <li>ZabardastHappy birthday</li> <li>Great day Mohsin Sir,,</li> <li>Pakistan ZindaAbad \$ 8) Happy birthday to mohsin bhai</li> </ol>

			9) Happy birthday sarkarThe matches become extraordinary and hipop whenyou were playing <b>Makistan</b> cricket team fan 10) Happy Birthday sir
28 <sup>th</sup> Februar y, 2021	Pakista ncricket team	139 Sin 2006 Head coach of Balochistan and former Test batsman Faisal Iqbal having a trip down memory lane ashe poses with the NSK Honours Board.	<ul> <li>1) Allhumdullah indeed a proudcherished mori initiation thank you PCB initiation thank you PCB initiation thank you PCB initiation thank you PCB initiation thanks you PCB initiation that you point that you pCB initiation that you point you point that you point that you</li></ul>

	<ul> <li>7) khud ko bat pakrna nhn ata aur bana balochistan ka coach</li> <li>8) farigh player ta or ab khamkha register copy hath me ly k dugout me show maarta hy</li> <li>9) Image: Comparison of the second s</li></ul>
	mary thy faisal ny

## Appendix B: Instagram Translingual posts

14 <sup>th</sup> March, 2021	Haniahehh official	<image/>	<ul> <li>Jaise asim ko chora tha waise hi passport ko chor do gi </li> <li> Ghreb log Same passport thing Should instead use iPhone to flex beccauzs most of us can't afford that </li> <li> Ghreb log Same passport thing Should instead use iPhone to flex beccauzs most of us can't afford that </li> <li> Ghreb log Same passport hat man and the enhe actress kis n banadya</li> <li> Asim azhar nay apna name PASSPORT kab rakha? Xd </li> <li> One sided </li> <li> One sided </li> <li> Aur yeh green polo cap bhi &lt;4</li> <li> Aur yeh green polo cap bhi &lt;4</li> <li> Chichori of the year</li> </ul>
12 <sup>th</sup> January, 2021	Ferozekhan	ferozekhan ♥ - aik Chandi ki Deewar torna shayad aik pyar say bharay dil ko tornay say ziada mushkil hota hai bringing you the fourth teaser of #KHUDAAURMOHABBAT3, like I said changing the game inshAllah !! Behind the show big round of applause to the maestros @abdullah.kadwani @asadaqureshi directed by the supremely talented	Multan ma shooting kriii but i wasn't there is to btw lots of love images (aferozekhan) Boht zabardast actor ho aap



## **Appendix C: Twitter Translingual posts**

1 <sup>st</sup> april,202	LEHJA OUT TOMORROW	#faisusquad ke mehnat aur @Mr_Faisal_S07 ke fan ki mehnat se aaj humne target to pura kar leya but hume aaj kisi bhi halat me 60k tweets karna hn so jaldi jaldi tweets karo .
1		LEHJA OUT TOMORROW
		A sweet friendship like fainat refreshes the soul $\heartsuit$
		LEHJA OUT TOMORROW
		LEHJA OUT TOMORROW
		These is one word
		MashAllah
		Guys pls jaldi se jao aur tweet karo pls <b>LEHJA OUT TOMORROW</b> Ab Trending Nhi Kar Raha Hai pls @Jannatzubairfc1
		If you work just for money, you'll never make it. But if you love what you are doing, and always put people first, success will be yours. LEHJA OUT TOMORROW @Mr_Faisal_S07
		@blivemusic_in pls Lehja       Song Ko Abhi Release Kardo Mein Abhi Aur Wait         Nhi Kar Sakta!!!!       LEHJA OUT TOMORROW         guys 14 se 12 pe aa gya he fir se keep going!!!       LEHJA OUT TOMORROW
	#studentskadushmanimrankha	
	n	



**Appendix D: YouTube Translingual posts** 

19 <sup>th</sup> april,20 21	Lahore Mazhabi Jamat ke Muzahiree n ka General hospital ki Emergenc yke Samne Police Par tashadud	Dono party hukoomat aur protester peaceful solution ke taraf dyan dena chahiye Allah thla garat kry es media ki Jo jhoy bol kr just ek trf ka nqsha dikha rhy Uloo k pathio Ghtia chenal Dono trf sy khbrain di kro Shame on You Yeh sare Halaat Govt ne khud hi kiye hai. Allah hmay aese leaders se nijaat dila jo har traf se Awam ko Maar rahe hai. Ameen. Same thing happening in Bangladesh too, the ummah will torn into pieces because of our stupidity Is Mediaa Ko Abi Paisy Do Or Apni Marzi News Lagwaaao Lahnaati Chor Media Police K pass guns Q Nahi Hai ??? Esi time use krni chahiye thy Kab use krogy guns 😡 🚱 I am so happy police wale ke sath as he ho na chya hai (Jahalat )but good thing is that tlp ban media walooon kuch haya karooo tm logo par b Allah kah azab aya gah INSHAHALLAH
5 <sup>th</sup> may,2021	Ertugrul Ghazi Urdu Episode 1  Season4	Season 2 ki starting bht sad thi aur ab season 4 ki starting bht emotional. Aaj realise ho raha hai aik azeem sultanat k kayaam k liye kis tarha apni jaanon ki gurbaani deni parti hai. Allah tamam shaheedon k darjaat buland kary! ● "Haq Hai Allah" "Sach Hai Wallah" Love these words● I feel like am a part of kayi kabila even i cried jab ham log ertugrul se itna impressed hai, socho dosto hamare nabi ki kya shakhsiat hogi soch se bhi aage mere to Allah ham sab pe apni rahmat barsa ameen I know Ertugrul isnt gonna die in the series but dundar ke rone se ruladiya Exercise the set of the series but dundar ke rone se ruladiya Exercise the set of the series but dundar ke rone se ruladiya Exercise the set of the series but dundar ke rone se ruladiya Exercise the series but be base the series but be series to be like Agaya Gaadar  age Bamsi is so brave and strongest Jangju of Kai tribe and i proud upon him Season 4 ke 1st episode me hi kitni takleef aur kitna drd dikhaya hai @ @ @ ya Allah kitni mushkilat jheli hai inn logo ne sirf musalmano ke aur apno ke mustaqbil ke liye @ @ @