POLITICS OF CLIENTELISM AND ELECTION IN ISLAMABAD (2008-2018)

By

Aasia Zahid

M.Phil. Pakistan Studies, National University of Modern Languages, 2021

A THESIS SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE OF MASTER OF PHILOSOPHY

In

PAKISTAN STUDIES

To

FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES,
DEPARTMENT OF PAKISTAN
STUDIES.



National University of Modern Languages, Islamabad 2021



Thesis/ Dissertation Title:

Prof.Dr.Muhammad Safeer Awan

Name of Pro Rector Academics

NATIONAL UNIVERSITY OF MODERN LANGUAGES FACULTY OF SOCIAL SCIENCES

THESIS/DISSERTATION AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FORM

The undersigned certify that they have read the following thesis, examined the defense, are satisfied with the overall exam performance, and recommend the thesis to the Faculty of Social Sciences for acceptance:

THE SOCIO-POLITICAL IMPACTS OF LAND REFORMS IN PAKISTAN
(A CASE STUDY OF DISTRICT SUKKUR 1972-1977)

Submitted By: Aasia Zahid Registration #: NUML-F-18-30513

Master of Philosophy
Pakistan Studies

Dr. Fazal Rabbi
Name of Research Supervisor

Signature of Research Supervisor

Prof Dr. Mustafeez Ahmed Alvi
Name of Dean (FSS)

Signature of Dean (FSS)

August 25, 2021

Signature of Pro Rector Academics

Date

ABSTRACT

Thesis Title: Politics of Clientelism and Election in Islamabad (2008-2018)

Clietelism is a two sided exchange, therefore seeing it as a corrupting conduct delves deep into its meaning. Clientelism or clientelistic practices are still prevalent in Pakistan's democracy, particularly when it comes to electoral procedures. The main goal of this research is to give a detailed analysis of clientelistic politics in Islamabad with orientation to the general elections of 2008 along with 2013 and 2018 general elections. This study's scope is limited to Islamabad. The data is gathered from both secondary and primary resources. The theoretical frame work are covered by secondary data in form of books and periodicals. This study's original contribution is primary data in the form of interviews which examines the voting behavior and clientelistic politics in Islamabad. Qualitative and analytic methods are used in the study. The qualitative data addresses the research questions and test the hypothesis regarding Islamabad's electoral politics. The general election of 2008, 2013 and 2018 hold a special place in Islamabad's electoral history because they all brought about important electoral changes. After the coup d'état of 1999 military takeover the federal government and General Musharraf held the presidency of Pakistan from 2001 until 2008. After the long period of dictatorship, democratic elections were held in 2008 these democratic elections filled the public with the joy. A tragic incident of Benazir's murder was accrued with changed the elections wave. PPP remained successful all over Pakistan while in 2013's general election PML-N won a large mandate especially in Islamabad. However, in the general elections of 2013, a new political party appeared on the political scene. PTI emerged as an enormous and powerful party it won election from all three continuities of Islamabad. All of these elections shifts are significant and should be investigated

TABLE OF CONTENTS

THESI	IS/DISSERTATION AND DEFENSE APPROVAL FOR	kMii
CAND	IDATE DECLARATION FORM	iii
ABSTI	RACT	iv
TABLI	E OF CONTENTS	v
	OWLEDGEMENT	
	OF ACRONYMS	
	OF TABLES	
LIST	JI TABLES	IA
1. INT	RODUCTORY CHAPTER	1
1.1	Introduction	1
1.2	Statement of the Problem	5
1.3	Objective of the study	6
1.4	Research Questions	6
1.5	Theoretical Framework	6
1.6	Theory of party Identification	7
1.7	Literature Review	
1.8	Research Methodology	16
1.9	Delimitation	17
1.10	Justification of the study	17
1.11	Delimitation of the study	17
1.12	Organization of the study	17
	•	
2. ELE	CCTORAL HISTORY OF PAKISTAN	19
	Background study of Political Parties and Electoral History of	
	Major political parties of Pakistan	
	Post independent Pakistan 1947-1985	_
	Indirect elections	
	Election 1970-1985	
	Election 1977	
	Non Party election 1985	
	Election 1988	
	Election 1990 1997	
	Election 2002	
	2 Election 2008.	
	B Election 2013.	

		Election 2018	
3	FIFC	TORAL HISTORY OF ISLAMABAD	35
J.			
		ckground	
		ection in Islamabad (1970)ection in Islamabad (1977)	
		· · ·	
		ection in Islamabad (1988)	
		ection in Islamabad (1990)	
	3.6 Ele	ection in Islamabad (1993)	40
	3.7 Ele	ection in Islamabad (1997)	40
	3.8 Ele	ection in Islamabad (2002)	41
	3.9 Ele	ection in Islamabad (2008)	42
		lection in Islamabad (2013)	
		lection in Islamabad (2018)	
		etailed Election Result of NA-52, NA-53 and NA-54	
		onclusion	
•	5.15 0		
4.	VOTI	NG BEHAVIOR AND CLIENTELISM IN PAKISTAN	
	4.1	Voting Behavior	
	4.2		
		Types of Voting Behavior	
	4.3	Ergonomics in Elections.	56
	4.3 4.4	Ergonomics in Elections	56
	4.3 4.4 4.5	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot.	56 56 57
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting.	56 56 57
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice.	56 57 59 60
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology.	56 57 59 60
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad.	56 57 59 60 61
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism.	56 57 59 60 61 62
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism.	56 56 59 60 61 62 67
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism.	56 57 59 60 61 62 67 67
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism.	56 57 59 60 61 62 67 68 69
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum.	56 57 60 61 62 67 67 68 69
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum. Clientelism and Poverty.	56 57 59 60 61 62 67 68 69 70
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15 4.16	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum. Clientelism and Poverty. Clientelism and Exchange of Goods and Services.	56 57 59 60 61 62 67 68 69 70
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15 4.16 4.17	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum. Clientelism and Poverty. Clientelism and Exchange of Goods and Services. Sponsorship and Vote Buying.	56 57 60 61 62 67 68 69 70 70
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15 4.16 4.17	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum. Clientelism and Poverty. Clientelism and Exchange of Goods and Services. Sponsorship and Vote Buying. Clientelism in Pakistan.	56 57 59 60 61 67 67 68 69 70 70
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15 4.16 4.17 4.18 4.19	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum. Clientelism and Poverty. Clientelism and Exchange of Goods and Services. Sponsorship and Vote Buying. Clientelism in Pakistan. Disadvantage of Patron Politics.	56 56 57 60 61 62 67 68 69 70 70 71
	4.3 4.4 4.5 4.6 4.7 4.8 4.9 4.10 4.11 4.12 4.13 4.14 4.15 4.16 4.17	Ergonomics in Elections. Compelling Impacts. Instruments of emotional impact on casting a Ballot. Emotional effects of Voting. Consequences in Practice. Implications for Technology. Voters' understanding of political structure and politics in Islamabad. Clientelism. Genesis of Clientelism. The Concept of Clientelism. Kinds of Clietelism. Clientelism's Conundrum. Clientelism and Poverty. Clientelism and Exchange of Goods and Services. Sponsorship and Vote Buying. Clientelism in Pakistan.	565759606162676869707173

5. ANALYZING CLIENTELISM THROUGH VOTERS' BEHAVIOR IN ISLAMABA		
5.1 Overview of themes	85	
5.1.1 Ideological voters versus Issue voters	86	
5.1.2 Client voters versus Devoted voters	87	
5.2 Conclusion	90	
5.3 Recommendation	94	
Bibliography	95	

CANDIDATE DECLARATION FORM

(Declaration Form to be filled in by Candidate at the time of Submission of Thesis to the

Supervisor for Internal and External Evaluation. Follow this pattern strictly, and also let the

dotted lines appear on the page)

I Aasia Zahid

Daughter of (Zahid Hussain)

Registration # NUML-F18-30513

Discipline **Pakistan Studies**

Candidate of M.Phil Pakistan Studies at the National University of Modern Languages do hereby

declare that the thesis (Title): POLITICS OF CLIENTELISM AND ELECTION IN

ISLSMSBSD 2008-2018 Submitted by me in partial fulfillment of M.Phil./ PhD degree, is my

original work, and has not been submitted or published earlier. I also solemnly declare that it shall

not, in future, be submitted by me for obtaining any other degree from this or any other university

or institution.

I also understand that if evidence of plagiarism is found in my thesis/dissertation at any stage, even

after the award of a degree, the work may be cancelled and the degree revoked.

August 25, 2021

Date

Signature of Candidate: _____

Aasia Zahid

Name of Candidate

vii

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

First and foremost, I am thankful to Allah Almighty for granting me with patience and knowledge

to accomplish my research work.

I would also like to offer my gratitude to my supervisor, Dr. Fazal Rabbi, who has supported me

throughout my thesis with his motivation and knowledge. His guidance and encouragement have

been invaluable because without his supervision and help I would not have been completed my

research process.

I would like to express my deep gratitude to my parents and family for supporting, prying and

helping me throughout studies. Finally, I also thanks to my friends for their continuous support

during research work.

Aasia Zahid

M.Phil (Pakistan Studies)

viii

LIST OF ACRONYMS

PPP Pakistan People's Party

PMLN Pakistan Muslim League, Nawaz

PTI Pakistan Tehreek-e-Insaaf

PML(C) Pakistan Muslim League Council

PMLQ Pakistan Muslim League Quaid

IJI Islami Jamhori Ittehad

JI Jamat-i-Islami

JUI Jamat-i-Ulamah-i-Islam

PDA Pakistan Democratic Alliance

EBDO Elected Bodies Disqualification Order

ZAB Zulifqar Ali Bhutto

BB Benazir Bhutto

LIST OF TABLES

Table No-1: Affiliation of voters with different political parties during the election of 2008.

Table No-2: Affiliation of voters with different political parties during the election of 2013.

Table No-3: Affiliation of voters with different political parties during the election of 2018.